

World Bank Proposed Country Partnership Framework Consultations

July 8 & 11, 2024 | Islamabad, ICT

GOVERNMENT & DONORS

THEMATIC AREA	DISCUSSION POINTS
REDUCING STUNTING	- Despite the long-standing focus on Water, Sanitation and Hygiene , stunting has still seen a rise, thereby affecting progress on the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). There is a need to look deeper into the causes.
REDUCING LEARNING POVERTY	- Reforming the Education System: There is little trust in the public education system and reforming it is a highly sensitive area. - Back to Basics: The CPF proposes to work on foundational learning whereas reforms are needed at the top to improve quality of higher education, especially through digitization. While the World Bank Group focuses on foundational learning, other development partners may step in to support this area. - Retention of Staff: In a sector plagued by scarcity of trained staff, retaining teachers in schools and nurses in hospitals is a big issue in need of immediate attention from donors and authorities.
RESILIENCE TO CLIMATE CHANGE	- Investment in Climate Change Resilience and Recovery should not happen at the cost of other development priorities. The funds for climate change resilience should be separate - over and above those earmarked for the rest of the development agenda. - Irrigation and Rehabilitation of barren land should be a focus under agriculture-related interventions. - Despite the introduction of new technologies in the agriculture sector, they have yet to be taken to scale. - Nature-based Solutions should be adopted to stop hill torrents under flood management plans. There is a need for financing and capacity building, to operationalize such solutions. - Inter-Sectoral Opportunities for Expanding Hydro-Power Projects should be explored, especially in places where they have already been successfully implemented at a small scale.
GENDER	- Gender Parity Decreasing: There needs to be greater focus on gender as latest statistics show further regression in this area. Support from other players working in this field such as UN Women would be of great value.
DECARBONIZATION OF THE ECONOMY	- Focus on Developing Railways: In the National Transport Policy, there is a focus on developing railways through extensive reforms, leveraging technology and investment from the private sector. Decarbonization strategies should actively consider promoting railways as a mode of transport. - Decarbonization of Social and Administrative Services and infrastructure must be implemented across the board. - Technical Support: To institute and ensure European Union (EU) decarbonization standards on exports, technical knowhow and capacity is

	needed. - Electric vehicles should be promoted in the country to transition to safe and clean energy sources.
PUBLIC-PRIVATE PARTNERSHIPS	- Highways Investment: Long term finance is needed for the development of highways because it is difficult to attract private partnerships (PPPs) in this sector. - Public Sector Projects and Public-Private Partnerships: There is a need for greater policy shift and push to engage the private sector in implementation of public sector projects.
OTHER PRIORITIES	- There is less Focus on Reform and Governance although these are crucial to all the themes outlined in the CPF. - Need for Greater Coordination between the government, the development sector and implementing authorities on national priorities. - Greater Financing for Women led Businesses is hard to come by. Unlocking the banking sector for this to provide venture capital is important. - Aligning CPF with the Government's Strategy: While the CPF reflects the government's priorities, there is a need for it to be flexible so it can adapt to shifting needs. - Re-engaging the Voluntary Sector: The role of philanthropy in providing services and resources to those in need was significant in the 1990s. Efforts should be made to re-engage the philanthropic sector. - Support for areas that the World Bank is exiting from is sought from other multilateral financial institutions, UN agencies and donors.

ACADEMIA & CIVIL SOCIETY

THEMATIC AREA	DISCUSSION POINTS
REDUCING STUNTING	- Looking Beyond Sanitation: Given the country had good sanitation in the 90s but stunting was still prevalent, it is imperative to investigate other contributing factors. - Safe, Clean Water: Clean water does not necessarily mean safe. Clean safe water must be the priority under the water, sanitation, and hygiene (WASH) agenda. Safe drinking water should be free for all as a natural right. - Empowering Gender in matters of family planning, education and economic decision making, to address large family size has a bearing on stunting.
POPULATION GROWTH	- Human Resource Development and Gender: Given the unsustainable population growth that has a knock-on effect on every other development goal, human resource development (HRD), gender equality and women empowerment are crucial to planning and development in the country. - Small Provincial Budget: The provincial budget for HRD is generally limited. Matching funds from World Bank would likely not make a huge difference. In addition to this, poor service delivery even when the share of provincial resources to improve socio-economic indicators has increased since the 18th Amendment has retarded progress on development goals.
REDUCING LEARNING POVERTY	- The Scale of School Dropouts is high because schools do not have toilet facilities, especially for girls. Where available, they are broken and out of order.

	- Digital Technology such as geo-tagging and geo-fencing should be used to increase enrollment and bring back out-of-school children to classrooms.
RESILIENCE TO CLIMATE CHANGE	- Disaster risk management should focus on preparedness to help authorities and communities plan well ahead of a crisis. - Preserving Groundwater in cities like Quetta, where it has been depleting at an alarming rate, must be prioritized. - Absence of Data/Research on the Impact of Climate Change on the Cryosphere: Pakistan has a significant area under the cryosphere, vulnerable to climate change shocks. While no data is available on how it is impacted by climate change, little work is done on preserving the permafrost and on the impact of black carbon on mountain glaciers and the cryosphere, given the latter's impact on snow cover and glacier melt that leads to positive climate forcing. - Learning from Civil Society: Community based organizations engaged by the Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund (PPAF) have been at the forefront of rural uplift and development, including climate change interventions. They have decades of experience of working with the public sector. The World Bank Group must devise a strategy to engage PPAF and other experienced NGOs on all CPF themes. - Water-Pipe Networks: Water in the urban and rural areas is mainly provided through pipes. These are often old, worn out and damaged, and the water is exposed to contamination. These require an overhaul and upgradation on an immediate basis, especially in neighborhoods impacted by floods. - Policy Nexus: Climate change, water and agriculture policies need to be integrated because these are inter-connected. - Foreign Debts: How is Pakistan expected to overcome challenges related to climate change and development with all the debts it owes to the International Financial Institutions? The debt burden is at the root of most of its economic woes. - Climate Change and the Indus Delta: Climate change is affecting communities living along the Indus delta more than any other factor. They should be engaged in identifying solutions and their needs factored into CPF interventions. - Defiled Rivers: Household and industrial discharges have reduced the two rivers in Malir and Liyari to sewerage drains. Efforts should be made to clean and protect them from effluents. - Formalizing the Non-Formal: Many non-formal sector workers engaged in the mines and mineral industry are accruing profits but are not formalized. They need to be made part of the formal economy.
DECARBONIZATION OF THE ECONOMY	- Loans for Solarization: While available, they are low priority for banks. To make solar energy cheap and accessible, the government should encourage competition in the field, while subsidizing the cost. As much as it is about decarbonization, it is also about energy justice since large swathes of the country remain without electricity.
GENDER	- Gender Parity in Jobs: For a more inclusive job market, ensuring gender parity should be a paramount concern. With half of the country's population being women, and youth comprising 60 percent of the entire population, nearly half of the young people are women and girls.

	- Digital Connectivity and Gender should be cross-cutting strands across the CPF. Digital safety and personal data protection is also a big concern. Any digitization initiative should be mindful of the digital divide affecting gender and minorities. It should involve civil society working on digital rights to design equitable policy regimes.
PRIVATE SECTOR	- Removing Gaps and Disconnects: Private sector is kept out of the development and corporate national agenda – the World Bank must ensure its engagement through the CPF focus areas. - Power Dynamics and the Business Agenda: Power dynamics influence business decisions like who to work with. Those who hold the reins of power influence the equation of Public Private Partnerships.
OTHER PRIORITIES	- Benazir Income Support Program Exit Strategy: Solutions needed to graduate families who have overcome poverty, out of the Benazir Income Support Programme (BISP). It is crucial to make opportunity and space for other deserving people. While plans to do this exist, their implementation has been weak. - Need to support Small-Medium Enterprises with access to funding as well as obtaining Letters of Credit. - Prioritizing Small-Medium Enterprises in Power Distribution Projects to bring electricity to millions of people who have no access. - Data Gathering: All government services should be online. Digital technologies should be adopted for data gathering to compare development indicators for districts and interventions. - Rules of Engagement: The World Bank Group must engage with the civil society more frequently, especially on matters related to energy, climate change, and human development.