How Can Financial Inclusion Help Women and the Poor?

Leora Klapper

Finance and Private Sector Development Team
Development Research Group
World Bank
How Can Financial Inclusion Raise Income?

- Financial inclusion means that households have access and can effectively use appropriate financial services. Such services must be provided responsibly and sustainably in a well regulated environment.

- Financial inclusion can help reduce poverty in two ways:
  
  - Helping poor people climb out of poverty by making it possible to invest in education and business—and small enterprises pursue promising growth opportunities.
  
  - Providing ways to survive economic disasters like unemployment, drought/floods, or the loss of a breadwinner, financial inclusion also prevents people from falling into poverty in the first place.

- For example,
  
  - *In India, an effort to set up accounts for rural farmers reduced the rate of rural poverty between 14-17 percentage points* (Burgess and Pande, 2005).
  
  - *In Niger, digital payments for agricultural wages resulted in time savings that were equivalent to a cash amount large enough to feed a family of five for a day* (Aker, et al., 2015).
In 2014, the World Bank -- with funding from the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation and in partnership with Gallup, Inc. – updated and expanded the Global Findex dataset, an unprecedented study of financial inclusion based on interviews with almost 150,000 adults in over 140 countries worldwide.
Account Ownership in Developing Countries

Total Percentage of Adults, 2014

- **Men**: 59% unbanked
- **Women**: 50% unbanked
- **Richest 60% of Households**: 46% unbanked
- **Poorest 40% of Households**: 60% unbanked

The percent of unbanked adults in the poorest 40% of households dropped by 17 percentage points – but more than half in developing countries are still without accounts.

In India, men are more than 20 percentage points more likely than women to have an account.

In the Middle East older adults are twice as likely as younger adults to have an account.

234 million adults in China remain unbanked and 71% of them live in rural areas.

Source: Global Findex (2014); http://www.worldbank.org/globalfindex
Barriers to Account Ownership Around the World

Total Percentage of Adults

- Do not need an account: 30%
- Family member already has an account: 28%
- Accounts too expensive: 23%
- Financial institutions too far away: 22%
- Lack of necessary documentation: 18%
- Lack of trust: 12%

Source: Global Findex (2014); http://www.worldbank.org/globalfindex
How Can Digital Payments Raise Income?

Digital payments can facilitate wage, transfer and remittance payments and has the potential to increase income by allowing households to smooth consumption and accumulate savings.

- **Lower cost and time to send and receive payments** (Aker et al., 2013; CGAP, 2011b; Babatz, 2013; Lindert, et al., 2007)

- **Increased security of payments and lower associated crime** (McKenzie and Yang, 2014; Ashraf, et al., 2014; Wright et al., 2014)

- **More transparency and thus lower leakage between sender and receiver** (Muralidharan et al., 2014)

- **Increasing the security, privacy and control over the funds received, especially for women** (Docquier, Lowell and Marfouk, 2009; Dupas and Robinson, 2009; Morawcynski and Pickens, 2009; Duflo, 2012)

- **Helps people meet unanticipated expenses** (Jack and Suri, 2011; Blumenstock et al., 2012)

- **Provides a first entry point into the formal financial system; Encourages savings; Builds transaction history which can improve credit access** (Allen et al., 2013; Li et al., 2014; Aportela, 1999; Prina, 2012; Masino and Nino-Zarazua, 2014; Batista and Vicente, 2013)
Digital Payments via Accounts

Two-thirds of adults in South Africa use digital payments

In China and South Africa wealthier adults are more than 20 percentage points more likely than poorer adults to make digital payments

In India, men are about twice as likely as women to make digital payments

Note: The height of the bar is the percentage of adults with an account.
Source: Global Findex (2014); http://www.worldbank.org/globalfindex
The Income Gap in Digital Payments

Digital Payments
Total Percentage of Adults

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poorest 40% of Households</th>
<th>vs.</th>
<th>Wealthiest 60% of Households</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brazil</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russian Federation</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HI-OECD</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Green bars show percentage of adults that use an account to make or receive a digital payment in the poorest 40% of households as compared to the richest 60% of households, as measured by household income.

Source: Global Findex (2014); http://www.worldbank.org/globalfindex
Receiving Government Transfers or Public Wages

About 9 in 10 government payment recipients in Brazil and South Africa collect them with an account – among the world’s highest shares.

160 million unbanked adults receive government payments in cash.

Notes:
- The height of the bar is the percentage of adults receiving government transfers or public wage payments.
- Source: Global Findex (2014); http://www.worldbank.org/globalfindex
Receiving Private Sector Wages

In India about 1 in 5 private sector employees get paid through direct deposit.

Globally 280 million unbanked adults get private sector wages in cash.

Note: The height of the bar is the percentage of adults who receive private sector wage payments.

Source: Global Findex (2014); http://www.worldbank.org/globalfindex
What is the impact of moving to digital payments on entrepreneurship?

- **Speeds-up business registration & payments for business licenses and permits**  (Klapper et al., 2007; Daye, Sema et al, 2014)

- **Increases participation in e-commerce and improves interaction with clients, vendors and financial institutions**  (Hejazi, 2014; Adractas et al, 2015, Denecker et al. 2014)

- **Improves operational efficiency by improving supply chain management and risk management**  (Rai, Patnayakuni, Seth, 2006., Manfre & Nordehn, 2013)

- **Provide ways to reduce gender gap in business ownership by improving access to formal financial products, market place**  (Salma, 2014; Malhotra, Kanesathasan & Patel, 2012 )

- **For medium-to large sized businesses, digital applications like e-filing and e-payment of taxes can help reduce the cost of tax compliance**  (Che Azmi et al, 2012; Handbook for Tax Simplification, IFC, 2009; Yilmaz and Coolidge , 2013)

- **Can help build credit history**
440 million unbanked adults in developing countries receive agricultural payments in cash.
Formal savings products can increase income by allowing households to accumulate assets; Some evidence suggests that access to formal credit and insurance can increase income and/or smooth consumption for rural farmers.

**Savings** (Aportela, 1999; Dupas and Robinson, 2009; Ashraf et al., 2010).

- Higher investments in business and agriculture
- Easier to cope with income shocks
- Increased women’s economic empowerment through greater confidentiality and control over savings

**Credit** (Murdoch, 1999; Banerjee et al. 2015; Angelucci et al., 2015; Attanasio et al., 2015; Karlan & Zinman, 2010)

- Access to credit is associated with higher agricultural incomes and increase and/or smoother consumption for rural farming populations
- But ambiguous impact of credit on personal welfare like income and consumption

**Insurance** (Karlan and Morduch, 2010; Cole et al., 2013; Karlan et al., 2014)

- Agricultural insurance can encourage farmers to invest in riskier crops and lead to higher yields
The Use of Financial Services

Savings behavior
Total Percentage of Adults

Formalizing savings could double account ownership in Ethiopia

Did not save
Saved in other ways
Saved using a community savings group
Saved using an account

Source: Global Findex (2014); http://www.worldbank.org/globalfindex
How Can Financial Inclusion Help Women?

Financial services help women shape household spending decisions, make investments, and manage economic risk.

- Access to insurance helped women farmers in Burkina Faso and Senegal increase yields and better manage food security (Delavallade et al., 2015)

- In Niger, mobile cash transfers strengthened women’s bargaining power, boosted spending on nutritious foods, and allowed women to spend more time on productive tasks by reducing the need to travel to receive cash payments (Aker et al., 2015)

- Women in the Philippines who used a savings account reported greater over household decisions and increased spending on items they needed, such as washing machines and kitchen appliances (Ashraf et al., 2010)

- In Kenya, women merchants who received a basic account invested more in their businesses; they also spent 13% more on food and 38% more on private expenses (Dupas and Robinson, 2013)

- Women-headed households in Nepal spent 20% more on education and 15% more on meat and fish after receiving a savings account (Prina, 2015)
Challenges in Closing the Gender Gap

Women Trail Men in Financial Literacy
Adults answering three out of four answers correctly (%), 2014

- India
  - Men: 28%
  - Women: 24%
- South Asia, excl. India
  - Men: 30%
  - Women: 25%
- China
  - Men: 30%
  - Women: 27%
- East Asia & Pacific, excl. China
  - Men: 32%
  - Women: 28%
- South Asia
  - Men: 29%
  - Women: 24%
- East Asia & Pacific
  - Men: 32%
  - Women: 28%
- Sub-Saharan Africa
  - Men: 30%
  - Women: 26%
- Middle East
  - Men: 28%
  - Women: 23%
- Latin America & Caribbean
  - Men: 31%
  - Women: 27%
- Europe & Central Asia
  - Men: 32%
  - Women: 28%

53% of adults in major emerging economies who use a credit card or borrow from a financial institution cannot answer three questions correctly.

3-in-10 adults with a housing loan are unable to perform basic interest calculations on their loan payments.

Challenges in Closing the Gender Gap

**Technology gaps**

1.7 billion women in low- and middle-income countries do not own a mobile phone.

Women across 11 countries reported poor network quality and coverage as the second highest barrier to ownership and use of mobile phones.

In South Asia women are half as likely as men to have Internet access in their home.
Managing Financial Health

Financial Resilience: Source of emergency funds
Total Percentage of Adults

Note: the height of the bar is the percentage of adults that report being able to come up the equivalent of 1/20\textsuperscript{th} of GNI in a month.

1.2 billion adults in developing countries say they would use savings in case of an emergency—but 56% of them lack formal savings.

Source: Global Findex (2014); http://www.worldbank.org/globalfindex
www.worldbank.org/globalfindex

@GlobalFindex