Results Measurement for Jobs and Labor Programs

November 1, 2019

Siv Tokle and Raphaela Karlen
Jobs Group, World Bank

Jobs, Labor & Migration Course
Roadmap

- Why do we assess and how do we define results on Jobs?
- Designing for jobs results with a Theory of Change
  - **Case Study** – Tunisia Youth Economic Inclusion Project
- Easily assess jobs outcomes with the Jobs M&E Toolkit
  - **Case Study** – Tunisia Youth Economic Inclusion Project
- Impact evaluations or: How to rigorously assess jobs impacts
Why do we assess and how do we define results on jobs?
Temporary Jobs created  Percentage of youth securing new 2D frontline animation jobs who come from inner city communities  At least 5,000 women from the project villages are placed in appropriate jobs as a result of project efforts  No. of new jobs created in beneficiary SMEs Created jobs  Formal full-time equivalent jobs in agribusiness  Increase in jobs created in selected non-textile sectors  No. of new jobs created, of which % are filled by women  Jobs  Number of direct jobs created in rural communities receiving project assistance  Number of female jobs created by the cashew agro-processing units directly supported by the project  Number of formal jobs created in the targeted poles  Number of jobs created  Number of jobs created by MSMEs Project Beneficiaries  Number of jobs created in select value chains  Number of jobs generated by enterprises supported by the grants
WBG Jobs Portfolio

28% of current WB projects have a jobs component

12.6 Million beneficiaries during FY18
  Women 4 million
  Men 8.6 million

580 Current job-related projects

75 $US billion investment
  IDA countries 39 $US billion
  Other 36 $US billion

113 projects in 31 FCV countries
$US 7 billion investment
How Do we Define a Job? What is the Jobs Challenge?

Jobs are “activities that generate income, monetary or in kind, without violating human rights” (WDR on Jobs, 2013)

▪ Thus ‘jobs’ encompass wage work (formal and informal), self-employment and farming, but not forced labor or child labor

▪ Focus on creating more jobs, as well as improving the quality of existing jobs and connecting traditionally vulnerable population groups to jobs

More jobs-focused operations – How do we best mainstream jobs in WBG activities as a pathway to the twin goals?

Better articulation of jobs outcomes in projects – What is the conceptual link with Jobs in WBG activities?

Better measurement of jobs results – How do we demonstrate results?
Jobs Conceptual Framework: key jobs outcomes

**Job Creation**
- Job Creation in Existing Enterprises
- New Enterprises
- Entrepreneurs / Self-employed

**Job Quality**
- Worker Productivity
- Working Conditions and Benefits
- Earnings / Livelihoods

**Access to Jobs**
- Labor Force Participation
- Working of Labor Market (LM)
- Access and Opportunity for Jobs
**Secondary jobs** = job creation through benefits of improved access to infrastructure

**Direct jobs** = created by service providers that a project directly works with

**Induced jobs** = resulting from direct and indirect employees spending more and increasing consumption

**Indirect jobs** = employment changes in suppliers and distributors

**Value chain**
## Direct vs. indirect vs. induced jobs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Definition</th>
<th>Example</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Direct jobs</strong></td>
<td>Jobs that are a primary output of the investment -- <em>Typically realized directly within a project implementation period</em></td>
<td>Additional construction workers hired to build new low-income housing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Indirect jobs</strong></td>
<td>Jobs that are an output of additional activities made possible by the investment, but not as a direct output of the investment itself. This concept refers to the jobs created through the supply chain; the part of the investment spent on intermediate goods -- <em>Typically realized directly within a project implementation period (in parallel with direct jobs)</em></td>
<td>Increased demand for building supplies means that suppliers hire new factory workers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Induced jobs</strong></td>
<td>Jobs resulting from the additional spending from workers in the newly-created (direct + indirect) jobs -- <em>Typically realized with a short lag of the initial investment (up to one year)</em></td>
<td>New retail jobs created as construction workers hired as part of the low-income housing project and workers hired by suppliers spend their wages in shops</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Monitoring Jobs Results: At what level?

- Sustainable Development Goals
- Corporate Scorecard
- Country Typologies
- National Plans
- Country Frameworks or Programs
- Core Sector Indicators
- Sector Strategies
- Thematic Plans/Strategies
- Project Results Framework
DESIGNING FOR JOBS RESULTS WITH A THEORY OF CHANGE
What is a Theory of Change (ToC)?

- The ToC is used to define *what* a project is trying to achieve and *how* to achieve it in a particular context (*the causal pathways*)
- The ToC starts with the *identification of the outcome to be achieved* before deciding *what has to happen to achieve it* (*backward mapping*)
- The ToC is *based on evidence and lessons learnt* from previous projects

The Theory of Change helps project teams to...

- Develop a *common understanding* about the project’s design and *keep focus on binding constraints* to achieve expected outcomes
- Design and implement *results-focused operations*
- Define *realistic Project Development Objectives and measurable outcomes*
What are Key Steps in Developing a ToC?

**Step 1.** Identify the **problems** and clarify the **specific changes that need to happen**

- Changes or outcomes that need to happen in targeted groups or institutions to address the problems

**Step 2.** Define the **key interventions** and the **pathway** to achieve specified outcomes

- **Drawing on:** recent evidence, experience, lessons learned, stakeholders understanding of binding constraints

  Map the **necessary sequences of causes and effects** which are presumed to lead to the desired outcomes, starting with the specific outcome, and connecting to intermediate outcomes and interventions
Example of a Theory of Change

Component 1: Promoting agribusiness

Activities
- Extension services for cashew farmers
- Agricultural manuals
- Provision of inputs for rice plantations

Output

Outcomes

Outcomes/Impact
CASE STUDY – TUNISIA YOUTH ECONOMIC INCLUSION PROJECT
Case Study – Tunisia Youth Economic Inclusion Project

Project Development Objective

Improve economic opportunities for targeted disadvantaged youth in selected Governorates in Tunisia

Component 1 – Connecting Youth to Jobs

Provide tailored services to selected target youth (i) to facilitate their transitions from unemployment/inactivity into wage or self-employment, or (ii) to help them move from low to higher quality jobs (including from informal to formal)

Component 2 – Supporting Job Creation

Help the private sector realize its potential in creating jobs by (i) supporting the development of value chains that have a high potential for job creation and (ii) supporting selected targeted youth in the creation and development of their micro-projects
Case Study – Tunisia Youth Economic Inclusion Project

1 November 2019
Developing a ToC – Tunisia Case Study

Step 1 – Identify the problem and clarify the outcome to be achieved

Problems to be addressed

- A large share of the working age youth is unemployed or working in low quality jobs
- Social and economic exclusion is increasing for certain groups, especially youth

Outcomes
Developing a ToC – Tunisia Case Study

Step 2 – Define Key Interventions and Pathways to Achieve Outcomes

Group exercise 2: Place the statements into the appropriate logical order of the ToC, starting with the final outcome, and connecting the intermediate outcomes and interventions

1. Microenterprises owned by targeted youth created
2. Improved earnings for selected youth
3. Increased social and economic inclusion
4. Improved access to economic opportunities for disadvantaged youth
5. Support to selected firms in value chains with high job creation potential
6. New jobs created
7. Selected youth connected to self- or wage employment
8. Identification of value chains with high job creation potential
9. Matching grants provided to selected firms
10. Delivery of tailored services to selected youth through performance-based contracts with service providers
11. Identification and profiling of disadvantaged youth
12. Youth who completed internship and/or training
13. Support in creating new microenterprises by targeted youth

19
Developing a ToC – Tunisia Case Study
EASILY ASSESS JOBS OUTCOMES WITH THE JOBS M&E TOOLKIT
Objective of the Jobs M&E Toolkit

- To support **mainstreaming the jobs agenda** within the WBG
- To **standardize jobs indicators and their definition** across jobs operations
- To help project teams and project implementation units with **simple tools for administrative data collection** on jobs
- For use **ex-ante in design** of projects as well as **monitoring and reporting** on results
A ‘Menu’ of Jobs Indicators to choose from (see Handout)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Job Outcomes</th>
<th>Job Indicators</th>
<th>Individuals</th>
<th>Firms</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>WBG Corporate Scorecard</td>
<td>Number of project beneficiaries reached by jobs-focused WBG interventions</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job Creation</td>
<td>• Number of (self- and/or wage) employed project beneficiaries (*)^5</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*disaggregate by self- and wage-employed project beneficiaries</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Number of full-time equivalent (FTE) jobs in beneficiary firms (*)</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New enterprises</td>
<td>• Number of newly established firms with more than one paid employee (**)^5</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entrepreneurs/Self-employed</td>
<td>• Number of self-employed project beneficiaries (*)</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Worker productivity</td>
<td>• Average output per worker among beneficiary firms (**)</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working conditions and benefits</td>
<td>• Number of project beneficiaries covered by social security insurance (*)</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Share of project beneficiaries reporting satisfaction with their job (*)</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Average number of hours worked per project beneficiary per week (*)</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earnings/ Livelihoods</td>
<td>• Average annual earnings of project beneficiaries (*)</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor force participation</td>
<td>• Labor force participation rate among project beneficiaries (*)</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working of labor market</td>
<td>• Number of project beneficiaries using (public or private) employment services (*)</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Average length of time for beneficiary firms to fill a vacancy</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access and Opportunity for Jobs</td>
<td>• Disaggregation by gender and/or age for indicators marked with (*)</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Disaggregation by gender of firm owner for indicators market with (**),</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access to/ working of product</td>
<td>• Number of project beneficiaries who are member of a cooperative or producer</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>markets</td>
<td>group (*) / (**),</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Number of beneficiaries with new commercial relationships (**),</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Average time to get to market where output can be sold or traded</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Firm performance/ Investment</td>
<td>• Additional sales revenue for beneficiary firms (USS) (**),</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Investment generated (USS) (**),</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Share of newly established beneficiary firms still operational after X months (**),</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Capital</td>
<td>• Share of project beneficiaries completing training</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Tools available in the Jobs M&E Toolkit (see Handout)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jobs M&amp;E Toolkit</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Project Preparation</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An Introduction to the Jobs M&amp;E Toolkit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Definition of ‘jobs operations’ and the two beneficiary types most commonly targeted by jobs projects – Individuals and Firms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Menu of Jobs Indicators by Job Outcomes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Definition and Guidance on the WBG Corporate Results Indicator on ‘Jobs’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matrix to Assess Relevance of Jobs M&amp;E Toolkit for project – including definitions of jobs outcomes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Jobs Indicator Definitions and Guidance – for use at the project development objective and/or intermediate level in Results Framework – by beneficiary type: Individual Beneficiaries (A.1.) and Firm Beneficiaries (A.2.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Project Implementation</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Jobs Data Collection Forms – Paper-based (Excel) and online (online platform) version for administered and self-administered data collection respectively – by beneficiary type: Individual Beneficiaries (B.1.) and Firm Beneficiaries (B.2.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Jobs Data Collection Manuals for firms contracted by project implementation units to collect data – by Beneficiary Type: Individual Beneficiaries (C.1.) and Firm Beneficiaries (C.2.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Terms of Reference for implementation of Jobs Data Collection for project implementation units subcontracting firms to collect data</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A ‘Menu’ of Jobs Indicators to choose from

Indicators along the key jobs outcomes of job creation, job quality and access to jobs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Job Outcomes</th>
<th>Job Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>WBG Corporate Scorecard</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job creation</td>
<td>• Number of (self- and/or wage) employed project beneficiaries (*) *disaggregate by self- and wage employed project beneficiaries *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New enterprises</td>
<td>• Number of new enterprises *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entrepreneurs/Self-employed</td>
<td>• Number of self-employed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Worker productivity</td>
<td>• Average output per person *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working conditions and benefits</td>
<td>• Number of project beneficiaries *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earnings/ Livelihoods</td>
<td>• Average annual earnings of project beneficiaries (*)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor force participation</td>
<td>• Labor force participation *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working of labor market</td>
<td>• Number of project beneficiaries *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access and Opportunity for jobs</td>
<td>• Average length of road *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access to/ markets</td>
<td>• Disaggregation by gender of firm owner *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Firm performance/ Investment</td>
<td>• Additional sales revenue for beneficiary firms (US$ **) *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Investment generated (US$ **) *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Capital</td>
<td>• Share of newly established beneficiary firms still operational after X months *</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Individual beneficiaries include job-seekers, those who aspire to improve their employability or earnings, subsistence farmers, and self-employed individuals

Firm beneficiaries include firms or entrepreneurs, including farms
CASE STUDY – TUNISIA YOUTH ECONOMIC INCLUSION PROJECT
Resources and Contacts

The Toolkit can be accessed through the following links:

- Jobs M&E Toolkit;
- Interactive version of the Toolkit on the Jobs and Development website

Contacts:

- Siv Tokle, M&E Lead, Jobs Group
- Raphaela Karlen, Jobs and Development Specialist, Jobs Group
IMPACT EVALUATIONS OR: HOW TO RIGOROUSLY ASSESS JOBS IMPACTS
Monitoring…

Let’s have a look at the number of beneficiaries with a job before and after an intervention:

According to monitoring, the number of beneficiaries with a job decreased

Does it mean that the intervention had a negative effect?
Between the beginning of the intervention and its completion, an economic recession, a war, a political crisis etc. might have taken place/started.

According to an evaluation, the intervention had a positive effect: **without it, job losses would have been bigger**

And the evaluation allows us to **quantify the difference**
## Difference between Monitoring and Impact Evaluation

### MONITORING

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Collecting data on treatment group to:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>▪ Improve day-to-day management and decisions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Track program performance against expected results</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Descriptive before and after comparison</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Describes what is happening, but not whether this is because of our intervention (attribution)

### IMPACT EVALUATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Collect data on treatment and control groups to:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>▪ Test hypotheses of the results chain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Establish causality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Determine cost-benefit analysis</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tests underlying mechanisms so we know whether an intervention is effective, or whether one approach is more effective than another

Helps us understand what would have happened in the absence of the intervention
Not every project needs an impact evaluation

- Evaluate impact selectively, when a project is...
  - Innovative
  - Replicable, scalable, or implemented at scale
  - Strategically relevant (e.g. large budget)
  - Evaluation will fill knowledge gap
  - Substantial policy impact

- Impact Evaluation can focus on selective innovations within projects
  - Beyond ‘does my program work’?
  - Towards ‘which design is more effective’?
Resources

Reference: available in English, Spanish, French and Portuguese

www.worldbank.org/ieinpractice
THANK YOU!