## Acronyms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AfDB</td>
<td>African Development Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALMP</td>
<td>Active Labor Market Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BE</td>
<td>Bank Executed Projects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFP</td>
<td>Call for Proposals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CGAP</td>
<td>Consultative Group to Assist the Poor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSO</td>
<td>Civil Society Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EFE</td>
<td>Education for Employment in Yemen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EOI</td>
<td>Expression of Interest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAC</td>
<td>Development Assistance Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DGPC</td>
<td>Direction Générale des Ponts et Chaussées</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPF</td>
<td>Development Policy Financing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FCV</td>
<td>Fragility, Conflict and Violence-afflicted (countries)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GoT</td>
<td>Government of Tunisia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GPE</td>
<td>Global Partnership for Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GRM</td>
<td>Grant Reporting and Monitoring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICS</td>
<td>Implementation Completion Summary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDP</td>
<td>Internally Displaced Person</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labour Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IOA</td>
<td>Institutional and Organizational Assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IsDB</td>
<td>Islamic Development Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IYF</td>
<td>International Youth Foundation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KRG</td>
<td>Kurdistan Regional Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LG</td>
<td>Local Governance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LSCE</td>
<td>Life Skills and Citizenship Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDTF</td>
<td>Multi-Donor Trust Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MELQO</td>
<td>Measuring Early Learning Quality and Outcome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MENA</td>
<td>Middle East and North Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoSA</td>
<td>Ministry of Social Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MTR</td>
<td>Mid-Term Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M&amp;E</td>
<td>Monitoring and Evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-Governmental Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NVSP</td>
<td>National Volunteer Service Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PC</td>
<td>Program Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PCM</td>
<td>Program Council Meeting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PCU</td>
<td>Program Coordination Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PMU</td>
<td>Program Management Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RBM</td>
<td>Results-Based Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REOI</td>
<td>Request for Expressions of Interest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RFP</td>
<td>Request for Proposals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TA</td>
<td>Technical Assistance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOR</td>
<td>Terms of Reference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOC</td>
<td>Theory of Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRC</td>
<td>Technical Review Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TTL</td>
<td>Task Team Leader</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TVET</td>
<td>Technical and Vocational Education Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UDLGP</td>
<td>Urban Development and Local Governance Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UMG</td>
<td>Universalia Management Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WB</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WDR</td>
<td>World Development Report</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Contents

1 INTRODUCTION .................................................................................................................. 1

2 CONTEXT AND OBJECTIVES .......................................................................................... 2
  2.1 Overview of the MENA MDTF ...................................................................................... 2
  2.2 Context of the 2nd Cycle MENA MDTF ..................................................................... 2
  2.3 Summary of 2nd Cycle Activities ............................................................................... 5

3 MTR APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY ....................................................................... 8
  3.1 Review Objectives, Questions and Purpose ................................................................. 8
     3.1.1 Objectives and Scope of the Assignment ............................................................... 8
     3.1.2 Evaluation Criteria Questions ............................................................................... 9
     3.1.3 Quality Standards ............................................................................................... 9
     3.1.4 The Formative Nature of the MTR ..................................................................... 9
     3.1.5 Utilization-Focused Approach ............................................................................ 10
     3.1.6 Inception Phase .................................................................................................. 10
     3.1.7 Data Collection Phase ....................................................................................... 11
     3.1.8 Case Studies ....................................................................................................... 13
     3.1.9 Data Analysis and Reporting Phase ...................................................................... 14

4 SUMMARY OF CASE STUDIES ......................................................................................... 15
  4.1 Case Study #1: Youth and Jobs ................................................................................... 15
  4.2 Case Study #2: Refugees ............................................................................................. 19
     4.2.1 MENA MDTF’s Funded Activities Relating to Refugees in Syria and Lebanon .... 19
  4.3 Case Study #3: Recovery and Reconstruction ............................................................ 24
     4.3.1 MENA MDTF’s Funded Activities Relating to Recovery and Reconstruction .... 24
  4.4 Case Study #4: Regional Activities ........................................................................... 30
     4.4.1 MENA MDTF’s Activities Relating to Regional Activities ................................. 30
  4.5 Tunisia Case Study ...................................................................................................... 34
     4.5.1 Strategic Relevance ............................................................................................. 34
     4.5.2 Overview of Cycle II Funded Activities in Tunisia ............................................... 36

5 FINDINGS .......................................................................................................................... 44
  5.1 Relevance and Strategic fit ......................................................................................... 44
  5.2 Effectiveness ................................................................................................................ 51

6 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS ................................................................. 59
  6.1 Recommendations ....................................................................................................... 59
Figures

Figure 3.1 Phases of the Mid-Term Review........................................................................................................ 10
Figure 4.1 MENA MDTF’s funded activities relating to Youth and Jobs............................................................... 16
Figure 4.2 MENA MDTF’s Funded Activities Relating to Refugees in 2nd Cycle .............................................. 19
Figure 4.3 2nd Cycle MENA MDTF’s Funded Activities Relating to Recovery and Reconstruction .......... 25
Figure 4.4 2nd Cycle of the MENA MDTF’s Funded Activities Relating to Regional Activities ................. 30
Figure 4.5 MENA MDTF’s funded activities relating to Tunisia in 2nd Cycle .................................................. 36
Figure i.1 Evolution between 1st Cycle and 2nd Cycle of the MENA MDTF’s funded activities relating to youth and jobs........................................................................................................................................ 64
Figure i.2 ENA MDTF’s funded activities relating to Refugees in 2nd Cycle ..................................................... 68
Figure i.3 2nd Cycle MENA MDTF’s funded activities relating to Recovery and Reconstruction .......... 73
Figure i.4 MENA MDTF’s 2nd Cycle funded activities relating to Recovery and Reconstruction in Iraq.. 74
Figure i.5 Evolution between 1st Cycle and 2nd Cycle of the MENA MDTF’s funded activities relating to regional activities........................................................................................................................................ 80
Figure i.6 MENA MDTF’s funded activities relating to Tunisia in 1st Cycle ..................................................... 87
Figure i.7 MENA MDTF’s funded activities relating to Tunisia in 2nd Cycle ..................................................... 88

Tables

Table 2.1 Investments by WB MENA Strategy Pillar (June 2018) ........................................................................ 5
Table 2.2 2nd Cycle Project Allocations by Country and Pillar (June 2018)......................................................... 6
Table 2.3 Results Framework / Projections 2nd Cycle......................................................................................... 7
Table 3.1 Evaluation Questions for the MTR ...................................................................................................... 9
Table 4.1 Results of the MENA MDTF Youth and Jobs funded activities........................................................... 18
Table 4.2 Results of the MENA MDTF Refugees Funded Activities................................................................. 22
Table 4.3 Results of the MENA MDTF Recovery and Reconstruction funded activities ............................. 28
Table 4.4 Results of the MENA MDTF Regional Activities.......................................................................... 33
Table 4.5 Results of the MENA MDTF funded activities in Tunisia................................................................. 41
Table i.1 Results of the MENA MDTF Youth and Jobs funded activities............................................................. 66
Table i.2 Results of the MENA MDTF Refugees funded activities................................................................. 70
Table i.3 Results of the MENA MDTF Recovery and Reconstruction funded activities ............................. 76
Table i.4 Results of the MENA MDTF Regional Activities.......................................................................... 83
Table i.5 Results of the MENA MDTF funded activities in Tunisia................................................................. 92
Appendices

Appendix I Thematic and Country Case Studies ................................................................. 63
Appendix II Evaluation Matrix .......................................................................................... 99
Appendix III Data Collection Tools ................................................................................. 103
Appendix IV List of Interviewees ....................................................................................... 111
Appendix V Bibliography ................................................................................................. 115
1 Introduction

The Universalia Management Group Limited (hereafter referred to as “Universalia”) is pleased to submit this report in accordance with the Terms of Reference provided by the World Bank (WB) to conduct the 2018 Mid-Term Review of the Middle East & North Africa Multi-Donor Trust Fund (MENA MDTF).

Structure of the document

This report is structured as follows:

- **Section 1** – Introduction
- **Section 2** – Context and Objectives of the MTR
- **Section 3** – Approach and Methodology Adopted
- **Section 4** – Summary of Case Studies
- **Section 5** – Findings
- **Section 6** – Conclusions and Recommendations
- Appendices
2 Context and Objectives

2.1 Overview of the MENA MDTF

The MENA MDTF was created in 2012 by the United Kingdom, Finland, Norway and Denmark to support the World Bank MENA Regional Strategy with the overall objective of providing catalytic donor support to countries in the region that were undergoing historic transition and reform. Eligible countries included Djibouti, Egypt, Iraq, Jordan, Lebanon, Morocco, Tunisia, the West Bank and Gaza, and Yemen.

The MDTF is designed as a programmatic trust fund that supports technical assistance for project preparation, analytical studies, capacity building and knowledge sharing activities. These soft activities are the glue that holds together reform programs and provide the critical underpinnings for broad participation and sound institutions. Typically, these activities often are not funded by hard financing and investments.

The MENA MDTF aims at accelerating economic and social transformation to build peace and stability across the region with strategic analytics and technical assistance. The MDTF complements the Bank’s and other Donors’ activities through real-time support for MENA countries undergoing reform, working with both governments and non-traditional partners (e.g. CSOs, media, academia, the private sector, chambers of commerce, and trade unions) under both Recipient and Bank-executed arrangements, as the situation requires.

The governance structure of the MDTF is comprised of the following: Program Council (PC), World Bank Technical Review Committee (TRC), and Program Management Unit (PMU). The PC governs the MENA MDTF and is formed by the PMU and the Donors (United Kingdom, Denmark, Finland and Norway). Program Council Meetings (PCM) take place on an annual basis to review ongoing progress, determine the yearly plan, discuss new funding, and approve any changes to the MENA MDTF Operating Principles. The PMU supports the proposal selection process, arranges PCMs, handles monitoring and evaluation, and is responsible for reporting and communications. The TRC is in charge of reviewing and selecting the proposals received.

The delivery of results is a priority for the MENA MDTF. Interventions must be catalytic with a high likelihood of replicability and local scaling up, and demonstrate they are “doing things differently” to contribute to reforms. A particular emphasis has been placed on innovation, strengthening of the social contract, reconstruction, resilience, and regional cooperation.

2.2 Context of the 2nd Cycle MENA MDTF

The 2nd Cycle of the MDTF, designed to run from 2018-2021, with initial financing established at $8 million, is firmly rooted in the 2015 World Bank MENA Strategy, supporting its goal of peace and stability as a prerequisite for development, along with its four pillars: (1) renewing the social contract; (2) regional cooperation; (3) recovery and reconstruction, and; (4) resilience to refugee/ IDP shocks. Operationally, in late 2017, the MDTF’s objectives and operations were restructured to make it better suited to meet the
region’s needs, aligning the MDTF with the changes to the MENA Regional Strategy and revamping its Results Framework. More than $4 million has been disbursed to fund activities under the four Pillars.

The 2nd Cycle created an on-demand stream of funding to be more responsive to the region’s rapidly changing needs and re-alignment of the MENA MDTF with the World Bank’s 2015 MENA regional strategy. Bank-executed grants range between $50,000 and $500,000 and are executed within 12 months. Recipient-executed grants range between $200,000 and $750,000 and are executed in 18 months. Under the revised operational parameters, initiatives are discussed and coordinated with key partners working on the ground to avoid duplication of efforts and donor resources.

The MDTF operates in a Middle East and North Africa region characterized by conflict, social turmoil and economic challenges. Conflicts have continued since the Arab Spring in Syria, Libya and Yemen, creating constant instability, damage to human lives and physical infrastructure, limiting human potential and creating a region-wide crisis of 16 million refugees and internally displaced people. Neighbouring countries, especially Jordan, Lebanon, Djibouti and Tunisia have felt the brunt of these shocks, burdening societies with previously smaller populations which are ill-suited to deal with these concerns. Gender issues, youth unemployment and poor-quality public services have not been addressed in these countries and others in MENA, giving rise to widening grievances throughout the region. Indeed, MENA has among the highest unemployment rate in the developing world, with youth unemployment rates about twice the world average, and with one of the lowest rates of women’s labour participation rates.

**MENA MDTF Linkage with WB MENA Strategy**

The 2015 World Bank MENA Strategy and the associated shift in objectives in the 2nd Cycle are grounded in the acceptance that peace and stability are pre-requisites for development to take place. To achieve
the World Bank’s twin goals of ending extreme poverty and boosting shared prosperity, the MDTF has shifted course and is moving its focus towards alleviating or preventing the root causes of violence and instability in the region. In alignment with the World Bank orientation to directly promote peace and social stability in the MENA region, MDTF activities are linked to the WB MENA Strategy’s four pillars:

Renewing the Social Contract

Renewing the social contract addresses three important areas: (a) addressing jobs through sound investment policies, those that build skills through a market orientation and improved labour relation; (b) promoting quality services and building on local success stories, including cases of non-state providers and local governments providing quality services; and (c) citizen engagement promoting more inclusive policymaking through (i) enabling cross-cutting reforms and legislation, setting up independent accountability institutions, and greater internet access; (ii) improving sectoral institutions, such as the accountability in social service delivery mentioned above; and (iii) incorporating citizen feedback and beneficiary engagement in all World Bank projects.¹

Regional Cooperation

Promoting regional cooperation delivers economic and trade benefits, while underpinning peace and stability in the region. As one of the least integrated areas in the world, the MENA region has been unable to effectively advance collaborative efforts. The World Bank and the MDTF tackles three specific aspects of regional cooperation looking at key areas of water, education and energy. Much of the work undertaken builds on previous analytical work that documented the challenges and the costs of not integrating and advances unique initiatives that can affect incremental and replicable change.

Recovery and Reconstruction

Considering the conflicts noted in the region, and the hundreds of billions of dollars in damage to the affected countries, the most realistic contribution the MDTF can make under this pillar are “dynamic” needs assessments that are undertaken during conflict. The work for the most part is in relation to Syria and Iraq activities, such as the Yemen Catalyzing Private Sector and the pathfinding work the MDTF has supported for surveys in Syria.

According to the WB MENA strategy, starting reconstruction before the conflict is over means regaining citizens’ trust in the state, working with non-traditional partners and stimulating dialogue, which are some of the areas being addressed by the MDTF.

Resilience to IDP and Refugees

Considering the scale of the crises affecting IDPs and Refugees, addressing these millions of people in the region is a high priority. Given the scope of the challenge, the MDTF has focused on key areas where it impacts social protection through improved livelihood prospects and stimulating local markets. In other areas, it has sought to improve relationships and interactions with host communities through analytical studies and consultations which could result in improvements in the delivery of basic services that enable

the displaced to take advantage of income-generating opportunities. Other areas addressed under the resilience pillar include livelihood programs, such as cash-for-work, training and apprentice programs, access to microfinance and enterprise development.

2.3 Summary of 2nd Cycle Activities

The Program Management Unit (PMU) of the MDTF is located at the World Bank offices in Washington. Working closely with WB personnel in headquarters and in country offices, the MDTF is able to tap into its strength and its ability to generate, curate and transfer knowledge; its convening power as a global institution; and its capacity to leverage its own financial resources and expertise to help meet global financing needs. As a unique Trust Fund, it is one of few financial mechanisms that provides seed funding for upstream strategic analysis, technical assistance, capacity building, and knowledge sharing work required to design, implement, and replicate transformational initiatives.

As noted above, the 20 ongoing (most of which were approved in 2018) activities of the 2nd Cycle are closely aligned with the priorities and pillars of the 2015 MENA Regional Strategy. Investments are distributed more or less evenly between the Middle East and North Africa sub-regions. Project investments by pillar are roughly distributed as follows, with approximately one-half of the investments under the pillar of Renewing Social Contract.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CODE</th>
<th>MENA STRATEGY PILLARS</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>REN</td>
<td>Renewing Social Contract</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REC</td>
<td>Recovery and Reconstruction</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RES</td>
<td>Refugees &amp; Resilience/ IDP Shocks</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REG</td>
<td>Regional Cooperation</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The 2nd Cycle supports activities related to renewing the social contract with a focus on women and youth. The Jordan On-the-Job Program, the EmpowerHer Maghreb and the KRG Pilot Jobs Program for an Inclusive Labor Market are prime examples. Another example is the creation of a MENA Youth Platform which began as a moderated online network and has now evolved into youth-led projects across the region with the MDTF’s support. In Tunisia, targeted initiatives focused on improving inclusion, deepening decentralization, and enhancing leadership capabilities.

In line with the Recovery and Reconstruction Pillar, the MENA-MDTF supports the building blocks for private sector engagement in Yemen. The work in Yemen looks beyond the humanitarian, social and economic crisis and focuses on the private sector’s role in the supply of goods, services, and jobs in Yemen and the opportunities and obstacles to doing so. In Libya, the MDTF supports the preparation of a program to improve emergency electricity supply. In Iraq, technical assistance activity aims to support the development of the regulatory framework for an Iraqi Natural Gas Market, in addition to supporting the preparation of a housing reconstruction and repair plan in the liberated areas.
Table 2.2  
2nd Cycle Project Allocations by Country and Pillar (June 2018)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ref</th>
<th>Activity name</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Total Allocated</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>REN201</td>
<td>Jordan on-the-Job Program</td>
<td>Jordan</td>
<td>250,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REN202</td>
<td>Transforming the Road Sector in Tunisia</td>
<td>Tunisia</td>
<td>909,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REC201</td>
<td>Catalyzing the Private Sector Role in Recovery and Reconstruction in Yemen (BBB)</td>
<td>Yemen</td>
<td>250,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REN203</td>
<td>MENA Regional Youth Platform</td>
<td>MENA</td>
<td>280,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REN204</td>
<td>Support to Deepening Decentralization and Improving Inclusion in Tunisia</td>
<td>Tunisia</td>
<td>300,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REN205</td>
<td>TA for Design of an Incremental Home Improvement Program in Djibouti</td>
<td>Djibouti</td>
<td>150,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REN206</td>
<td>Understanding Child and Adolescent Skills Development in Tunisia</td>
<td>Tunisia</td>
<td>250,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REN207</td>
<td>Women Economic Empowerment - EmpowerHer Maghreb</td>
<td>Tunisia, Morocco</td>
<td>325,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RES201</td>
<td>Developing Innovative Practices for Improving Social Cohesion between Lebanese and Syrian Refugees Living in Host Communities</td>
<td>Lebanon</td>
<td>250,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REN208</td>
<td>Women and Jobs for an Inclusive Labor Market in KRG: A Pilot Program</td>
<td>Iraq/KRG</td>
<td>300,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RES202</td>
<td>Addressing Health Needs of Syrian Refugees</td>
<td>Regional</td>
<td>280,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REG201</td>
<td>Water Scarce Cities Initiative</td>
<td>Regional</td>
<td>120,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REG202</td>
<td>World Development Report 2018 Regional Events</td>
<td>Regional</td>
<td>100,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REN209</td>
<td>Household Expenditure and Income Survey (HEIS) TA 2017/2018</td>
<td>Jordan</td>
<td>100,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REN210</td>
<td>Supporting the Implementation of Key Economic Reforms in Tunisia: Thinking and Working Adaptively</td>
<td>Tunisia</td>
<td>300,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RES203</td>
<td>Economic Analysis of Refugee Returns in Syria (Analytical Roadmap)</td>
<td>Syria</td>
<td>300,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REC202</td>
<td>Libya Preparation of Emergency Electricity Supply Improvement (Pipeline)</td>
<td>Libya</td>
<td>250,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REN211</td>
<td>Iraq Natural Gas Market Framework TA</td>
<td>Iraq</td>
<td>350,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REC203</td>
<td>Iraq Emergency Housing Reconstruction and DNA (Pipeline)</td>
<td>Iraq</td>
<td>400,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REC204</td>
<td>Iraq Education Development Support Operation</td>
<td>Iraq</td>
<td>200,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5,664,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results Framework of the MDTF 2nd Cycle

The Results Framework has been revamped to ensure closer alignment with the 2015 MENA Regional Strategy. Expected results are now centered around three outcome indicators, three output indicators, and six levels of beneficiaries, to be reported at the aggregate level. Only projections (based on project by project estimates) are provided for these indicators, as it is challenging to attribute the achievement of targets to the MDTF alone.

Generally speaking, a review of the results framework provides a good quantitative reflection on achievement. The format which follows, does not however provide qualitative information.
### Table 2.3  Results Framework / Projections 2nd Cycle

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LEVEL OF EXPECTED RESULTS</th>
<th>PILLAR INDICATOR</th>
<th>INDICATOR DESCRIPTION</th>
<th>UNIT OF MEASURE</th>
<th>2017</th>
<th>2018</th>
<th>2019</th>
<th>2020</th>
<th>2021</th>
<th>By Pillar</th>
<th>By Region</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Baseline</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>Projected</td>
<td>Projected</td>
<td>Projected</td>
<td>Projected</td>
<td>Projected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>F1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$ million</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>0.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>F2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$ million</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>F3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$ million</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>75%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>GP1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>GP2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>GP3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>DC1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>DC2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>980</td>
<td>1500</td>
<td>4,454</td>
<td>4,454</td>
<td>4,454</td>
<td>4,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>DC3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2,329</td>
<td>3,800</td>
<td>7,344</td>
<td>7,344</td>
<td>8,000</td>
<td>6,475</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### ESTIMATED IMPACT (INDIRECT BENEFICIARIES)

| BE1 Women | Total number of women beneficiaries positively affected by MDTF-supported activities | Number | 0 | 1,202 | 2,000 | 4,017 | 4,017 | 4,017 | N/A | 2,835 | 81 | 1,101 | - | 577 | 3,203 | 227 |
| BE2 Youth | Total number of youth beneficiaries positively affected by MDTF-supported activities | Number | 0 | 1,655 | 2,000 | 3,128 | 3,128 | 3,128 | N/A | 1,778 | - | 1,350 | - | 35 | 2,573 | 520 |
| BE3 People in Lagging Regions | Total number of people from lagging regions (remote, non-urban areas) positively affected by MDTF-supported activities | Number | 0 | 424 | 500 | 724 | 724 | 724 | N/A | 724 | - | - | - | 500 | 224 | - |
| BE4 Host Communities | Total number of people in host communities positively affected by MDTF-supported activities | Number | 0 | - | 500 | 1,350 | 1,350 | 1,350 | N/A | - | - | 1,350 | - | - | 1,350 | - |
| BE5 Refugees/IDPs | Total number of refugees/IDPs positively affected by MDTF-supported activities | Number | 0 | 500 | 2,500,068 | 2,500,068 | 2,500,068 | N/A | - | - | 68 | 2,500,068 | - | 2,500,068 | - |
| BE6 Conflict-Affected People | Total number of conflict-affected people positively affected by MDTF-supported activities | Number | 0 | 500 | 1,350 | 1,350 | 1,350 | N/A | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |

Notes:

Beneficiaries: (1) This indicator is to be understood as broadly including people positively affected by MDTF-supported policies, programs, or projects, through employees from businesses receiving support, employment generation, improved access to basic services or programs, i.e. education, water, social protection, etc. (2) Only projections (based on project by project estimates) will be provided for these indicators, as it will be difficult to attribute the achievement of targets to the MDTF alone.
3 MTR Approach and Methodology

3.1 Review Objectives, Questions and Purpose

As part of the strategic shift which took place in 2017, the PCM held on August 31st, 2017 recommended that the PMU carry out a midterm review exercise (MTR), to evaluate the relevance and effectiveness of the changes that are being implemented. In that sense, the MTR is expected to highlight and reflect on the MDTF structure and portfolio, derive appropriate lessons from the 1st Cycle of operations and their resulting impact, and validate the new orientation of the fund and its active portfolio.

3.1.1 Objectives and Scope of the Assignment

The objective of the assignment was to conduct a Mid-Term Review (MTR) of the 2nd Cycle of operations of the MENA MDTF focusing on the relevance and effectiveness of the new strategic orientation, in particular at the structure and portfolio levels. The MTR has also built on the 1st Cycle report to provide lessons learned and recommendations. The scope of the evaluation can be broken down in the following components:

- **Evaluation Criteria**: relevance and effectiveness. Thematic criteria were also developed during the Inception Phase to inform the drafting of four thematic case studies and one country case study.
- **Levels of analysis**: structure and portfolio of the MENA MDTF.
- **Programmatic scope**: 15 activities supporting (i) renewing the social contract, (ii) resilience to shocks, (iii) reconstruction and recovery, and (iv) regional cooperation.
- **Temporal scope**: all activities funded by the MENA MDTF during the 2nd Cycle of operations.
- **Geographic scope**: all MENA countries that have received support from the MDTF.
- **Stakeholders**: PC, PCU/PMU, TRC, donors, partners (governments and non-traditional partners), TTLs, Sector and Country Directors, MENA Director of Strategy and Operations, MENA Country Units, and beneficiaries.

According to the Terms of Reference the MTR will:

1. establish three core evaluation questions, and one thematic evaluation question, to be validated including through a quick survey of donors;
2. collect and compile all relevant data, including five case studies;
3. provide substantiated responses to the evaluation questions; and
4. recommend any additional adjustments to the MDTF.

The team prepared five case studies as per the TOR, these are:

1. a deep dive on the Tunisia portfolio (including a one-week field visit to meet counterparts and beneficiaries);
2. a desk/remote analysis of the Youth & Jobs portfolio;
3. a desk/remote analysis of the Refugees portfolio;
4. A desk/remote analysis of the value added of regional activities; and
5. Propose a 5th and last case study following the inception stage. Universalia proposed, and it was accepted that Recovery and Reconstruction should be the fifth case study.
3.1.2 Evaluation Criteria Questions

For each criterion specified in the Terms of Reference, specific evaluation questions were suggested following the inception phase of the evaluation. These questions were formulated as follows.

Table 3.1 Evaluation Questions for the MTR

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CRITERIA</th>
<th>OECD-DAC DEFINITION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Relevance and Strategic Fit</td>
<td>1. To what extent is the MDTF relevant in the changing country contexts?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. To what extent has the new strategic orientation been well adapted to the WB MENA Strategy and to the changing circumstances in MENA?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. To what extent do the various calls for proposals, sectoral areas covered, and types of activities funded respond to needs of the recipients? Are there gaps or areas that are more relevant than others?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. To what extent is the support of the MDTF to the donors relevant? What is its value-added?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. Is the MDTF’s work relevant to its strategic orientation?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6. Does the MDTF have an explicit Theory of change?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effectiveness</td>
<td>7. To what extent have funded activities achieved the donors’ bilateral objectives?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8. To what extent have the funded activities contributed to the achievement of the objectives stated in the MENA MDTF results framework?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9. Are the achievements well documented, communicated and known?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10. What are the main factors that contributed or hindered the achievement of results?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11. What specific contributions has the MDTF made to the achievement of results beyond expected results?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.1.3 Quality Standards

The approach to the MTR of the MENA MDTF was guided by OECD-DAC Evaluation Quality Standards for Development Evaluation.² As a Multi-Donor Trust Fund administered by the World Bank with an important partnership component, we also referenced the ‘Sourcebook for Evaluating Global and Regional Partnership Programs’ from the Independent Evaluation Group of the World Bank.³

3.1.4 The Formative Nature of the MTR

An MTR, by definition, is conducted half-way into the implementation of a programme. Its main objective is to provide real-time learning about what works, what doesn’t, and how it can be improved to keep the programme on track towards meeting its stated objectives. MTRs are considered as a formative exercise, as opposed to summative ones that are conducted after the programme is completed and are more oriented towards accountability and learning for future programming.

---

This formative MTR is tailored to both strengthen the successes and address the challenges of the implementation of the 2nd Cycle of the MENA MDTF at the strategic, programmatic, and operational levels. The timing to conduct this MTR was important given that the strategic orientation of the 2nd Cycle of operations is expected to be completed in 2021. The MTR provides useful, practical, and actionable learning and recommendations to improve the performance of the MDTF both at the structure and portfolio levels.

### 3.1.5 Utilization-Focused Approach

The MTR adopted a utilization-focused approach aiming to increase the relevance and uptake of recommendations by stakeholders. The review also adopted a mixed-methods approach, and triangulated different sources of information including document review; interviews with the WB, donors, beneficiaries (RE and BE), observation; and survey results analysis.

The team worked closely with the PMU and PC members, and other key stakeholders as relevant, to select and refine the evaluation questions, identify the fifth case study, and agree on the methodology and work plan, providing a solid guide for the implementation of the MTR. The team consulted the PMU to review progress at important points, to secure approval of approaches, to identify key informants, to coordinate country visit and contact with World Bank country offices, and to provide meaningful and timely inputs to the development of useful, feasible and actionable recommendations.

The review process included four main phases that are summarized in the following Figure 3.1

#### Figure 3.1 Phases of the Mid-Term Review

- **Inception**
  - MTR Questions
  - MTR Matrix
  - Interview Protocol
  - Document Review Framework
  - Timeline

- **Data Collection**
  - Stakeholders Consultations
  - Document Review

- **Case Studies**
  - Tunisia country case
  - Refugees portfolio
  - Youth & Jobs portfolio
  - Value Added of Regional Activities
  - Recovery & Reconstruction of Iraq

- **Data Analysis and Reporting**
  - Draft Report
  - Final Report

### 3.1.6 Inception Phase

Following a preliminary document review and virtual consultations with main project stakeholders (including PMU, HQ and MENA based WB staff), the evaluation team conducted an inception mission at the PCM meeting in Helsinki (October 18-19, 2018) and produced an inception report that outlined the detailed evaluation methodology, the evaluation matrix, data collection tools and the review timeline (Appendices I & II).
3.1.7 Data Collection Phase

We used the following combination of methods and participatory techniques to execute the data collection phase.

**Document review:** The evaluation team reviewed all documentation provided by the PMU and covered the following documentation: PCM minutes and decisions; annual and interim reports; newsletters; and activities data, operating principles, and other relevant material from secondary sources (see Appendix IV Bibliography for a detailed presentation of the documentation reviewed).

**Semi-structured interviews** with key stakeholders: During the review process, we virtually consulted with 45 stakeholders. In all, these included: 7 interviews with PMU (current and previous) staff, 34 interviews with grant recipients, and 4 interviews with donors. Please refer to Appendix IV for a list of stakeholders consulted. A one-week data collection mission was conducted in Tunisia to inform the evaluation questions and the Tunisia case study. It took place 19-23 November 2018, during which the evaluation Team Leader held individual and group interviews with a variety of target groups such as WB staff, government officials, and grant beneficiaries. The interviews were conducted based on detailed interview protocols (Appendix II).

**Online survey:** Data were complemented by an online survey among grant beneficiaries. The survey response rate was 50 percent with 19 respondents (total requested was 38). Of the 19 respondents, 3 of the respondents were involved in both recipient-executed grants and the balance bank-executed grants. Half of the respondents were involved in current projects; the other half had completed activities funded by the MDTF.

All the respondents were World Bank Staff who played varying roles in the delivery of MDTF activities, providing a suitable variety of perspectives on its operation.

The survey complemented the information gathered during semi-structured interviews, which demonstrated that the work of the MDTF is completely relevant and in line with the work of World Bank staff.
Similarly, it was maintained that the work of the MDTF is in alignment with the World Bank Regional Strategy. The strategic shift of the MDTF in 2017-2018 to bring it in line with the 2015 Regional Strategy was effectively pursued and administered by Bank staff.

Observation: Attendance in 8th Program Council Meeting: The PMU determined it would be advantageous for Universalia to attend the Annual Meeting in Helsinki on October 18th, 2018. Hussein Amery, the Project Manager had the opportunity to attend the meeting on behalf of the team.
The meeting was an opportunity to meet personnel (Task Team Leaders) involved in the delivery of WB Bank-executed projects supported by the MENA MDTF, Bank staff and the donor representatives of the UK, Finland and Norway, along with PMU members. Participants, which included those attending in person and remotely, delivered presentations on specific country and regional activities. This was particularly useful in gaining an in-depth understanding of what the MDTF was delivering and what results it was achieving.

The approach enabled the Universalia team to engage in enhanced subsequent one-on-one interviews with most of the individuals who were participants in the PCM. Donors benefited from a Universalia presentation on the approach to the MTR and provided feedback/approval on the Evaluation matrix and questions, and the timeline for delivery of the MTR Evaluation.

### 3.1.8 Case Studies

The thematic and country case studies under this MTR are not intended to be merely illustrative or exploratory but are rather the cornerstone of the review, the lens of analysis and the foundation of the findings, lessons and recommendations. The TOR identified four thematic case studies, with a fifth case study to be proposed by the Consultant.

6) a desk/remote analysis of the youth & jobs portfolio;
7) a desk/remote analysis of the refugee portfolio;
8) a desk/remote analysis of the value added of regional activities;
9) a deep dive on the Tunisia portfolio (including a one-week field visit to meet counterparts and beneficiaries).
10) As per the TOR, a fifth case study was proposed by Universalia and accepted by the PMU for Recovery and Reconstruction in Iraq.

During the course of the case studies Universalia:
- Reviewed the proposal process and outputs;
- Categorized activities for the thematic country case studies;
- Assessed the performance of activities (mainly effectiveness and efficiency, as agreed); and
- Identified contributing/hindering factors that have affected performance.

To that end, the MTR used a number of relevant variables to categorize the activities (see sidebar). Individual project performance was aggregated to reflect the outcomes and outputs of the MDTF overall

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Study variables</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number, types, and value of proposals funded</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duration of the intervention (approval/completion)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sectors funded (social contract, resilience, etc.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sub-sector (linked to the thematic case studies)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of intervention (Analytics, TA or knowledge activity)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country or regional activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bank or recipient executed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget range</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of entity supported (i.e, Ministry of Finance...)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partners involved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crosscutting issues: gender, climate change...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Performance from Output Summary Reports, ICS or GRM, and MDTF Annual Report (if available) based on individual results frameworks (broken-down into performance indicators categorized to allow aggregation into the overall Results Framework)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internal and external factors involved in success or shortcomings</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Results Framework. This technique allowed the team to provide a better assessment of the overall performance of the MDTF.

3.1.9 Data Analysis and Reporting Phase

The various approaches utilized in the data collection phase yielded rich information through which to view the appropriateness of the direction of the MDTF.

The document review enabled the team to have a sound understanding of the operation of the MDTF, the focus of its work in both the 1st and 2nd Cycles, the characterization and types of results produced (or expected), the quality of reporting, and the operational context.

This information enabled the MTR team to develop the distributed survey, which principally targeted World Bank staff. On a separate tact, the team developed and adjusted the interview protocols in line with acquiring appropriate and useful information, applied them and posited the information garnered in a master data sheet which facilitated analysis of stakeholder feedback.

Case studies were viewed through the lens of alignment of the work of individual projects with the four pillars of the World Bank MENA strategy and the results produced, which in the long run would contribute to achievement of the goals and objectives.

In keeping with the principles and structure of a MDTF, the team’s analytical perspective was focused on the identification of key aspects which lent themselves to continued or additional donor support.

**Donors’ Priorities & the MDTF:**
- Donors’ bilateral thematic priorities
- Donors’ regional assistance strategy
- Donors’ presence or lack thereof in the region
- Existence of alternative means of channeling support (i.e., country-based MDTFs)
- Donors’ perspective on the appropriateness and utility of WB-managed funds in the absence of mechanisms and country offices
- Unique regional nature of MENA MDTF as a vehicle for channelling donor support
- Donors’ level of awareness of MDTF’s achievements
- Donors’ perspective on communication and reporting
- Donors’ willingness to continue or increase participation in MDTF
4 Summary of Case Studies

The following section presents a summary of five case studies: youth and jobs, refugees, recovery and reconstruction, regional activities, and Tunisia country case.

Each summary presents an overview of Cycle II value contributions, an overview of the projects, key results and outputs achieved. Each case study is presented in a summary table, focusing on the contribution to the achievement of MDTF’s overall targets as per the MENA MDTF Results Framework in the following areas.

1) Analytical products produced with resources from MDTF (policy notes, survey work, evaluations, reports) targeted at policymakers or for project preparation.

2) Technical assistance projects (project design, capacity building, guidelines) that provide clear and practical recommendations, with positive client feedback.

3) Dialogue and knowledge sharing events (workshops, S-S exchange, etc.) leading to clear policy conclusions in focus areas, using resources from the MDTF.

4) Activities that have at least somewhat influenced policy.

5) Volume of funding leveraged by MDTF activities for Bank operations and/or programs. (specific projects and programs emerging from work).

6) People directly benefitting from capacity development (skills development, certification programs, training for capacity building, participation in events and workshops).

As the 2nd Cycle has just completed its first year of operation, it is important to note that it is possible to identify the initial contribution to Outcome level results.

4.1 Case Study #1: Youth and Jobs

The MENA MDTF’s funded activities relating to Youth and Jobs portfolio of activities are aligned with strategic priority / Pillar I - Renewing the Social Contract - of the WB MENA Regional Strategy. Renewing the social contract aims to generate a new development model that is built on greater citizen trust; more effective protection of the poor and vulnerable; inclusive and accountable service delivery; and a stronger private sector that can create jobs and opportunities for MENA’s youth.

The 2nd Cycle supported activities relating to renewing the social contract with a jobs and youth focus. During the 2nd Cycle, the MENA MDTF provided grants to four activities, namely: the Jordan On-the-Job Program, EmpowerHer Maghreb and the pilot Women and Jobs for an Inclusive Labor Market in KRG, Iraq. Additionally, the MENA MDTF supported the creation of a MENA Youth Platform which began as a moderated online network and has evolved into youth-led projects across the region.

---


5 The “EmpowerHer” and “MENA Youth Platform” funded activities will be covered in the “Tunisia” and the “Value-added of Regional Activities” case studies.
Jordan On-the-Job Program - $250,000, Bank executed

The program complements a larger pilot Active Labor Market Policy (ALMP) program that aims to implement selected labor market interventions and learn about their effectiveness towards building a coherent active labor market system. The ALMP is comprised of three main components: career guidance and intermediation; job search; and on the job training. Together, they aim to pilot the following combination: private sector firms to perform the intermediation for youth placement; a wage subsidy above the minimum wage that decreases over time while beneficiaries attend the program; and life skills training prior to placing in the internship on the job training.

The MENA MDTF financed an impact evaluation, aiming to fill a knowledge gap, as the combination of these three innovations has rarely been tested, and little knowledge exists on the appropriate length and subsidy pricing for such programs.

Contribution to Outcome level results: A learning product that contributed to policy influence, dialogue and development in Jordan (OC1 Policies Influenced)

Output level results

1) The results of the study informed the development of a 5-year reform matrix for equitable growth and job creation program in Jordan which incorporates supply and demand side interventions (more focus on entrepreneurship development, e-services, etc.).

2) The impact study report informed policy dialogue and the new Development Policy Financing (DPF) of the WB in Jordan: The First Equitable Growth and Job Creation Development Policy Financing. This is designed to help Jordan lay the foundations for a higher and more sustainable economic growth path, while creating more jobs for Jordanians and non-Jordanians.  

3) The MENA MDTF developed a Management Information System (MIS) and the tracing mechanisms (for monitoring) that were implemented during the impact study. The MIS was developed with flexibility to be used with baseline and impact data collection in future labour market interventions and was kept within the national employment fund.

---

4) As part of the implementation of this activity, the grant recipient organized dialogue and knowledge sharing events where the results of the impact study were presented, including policy dialogue events with the Government of Jordan, relevant ministries such as the Ministry of Labour, the Ministry of Social Affairs, and the Jordan Employment Fund. Other knowledge sharing events were held with the donor community (such as GIZ) and other UN agencies (including the International Labour Organisation).

**Iraq Kurdistan Regional Government (KRG): Women & Jobs for an Inclusive Labor Market: A Pilot Program - $300,000, Bank executed**

This pilot project aims to identify barriers and test solutions to increasing women’s labor market participation. The key objective of the activity is to better understand and test behaviorally informed labor market program interventions to increase female labor market participation. More specifically, it aims to: assess the behavioral, regulatory, and social barriers to women’s employment; design intervention mechanisms to boost women’s economic inclusion; and examine the impact of the pilot for potential scaling-up in KRG and in Iraq.

**Contribution to Outcome level results: Ingredients for women’s participation and impediments to participation identified;** The pilot program informed a larger project in Iraq supported by the Government of Canada, the $CDN 17 million “Bolstering Reconstruction in Iraq through Development, Growth and Employment” (BRIDGE) project. (OC1 Policies Influenced)

**Output level results**

1) Identified the legal constraints, laws and regulations that would inhibit women’s participation in labour and put in place recommendations on revisions, where needed. The data collected informed a $2 million technical assistance project, funded by Global Affairs Canada in the area of empowerment of women. Key information was produced on political leadership and institutional mainstreaming of gender policies at the government level.)

2) Identified (through study) the behavioral aspects that would motivate women to work in the private sector (Supply side);

3) Determined if companies have good policies that allow bringing in women into the private sector (Demand side).

Other Regional Initiatives are described in the other case studies, including the following activities. These activities will be presented in the following case studies.

- EmpowerHer Maghreb, (Tunisia and Morocco) $325,000, Bank executed
- MENA Youth Platform, $280,000, Bank executed.

**Summary of Achievements of Youth and Jobs Initiatives**

The following table presents the results of the MENA MDTF grants relating to Youth and Jobs. The Results of the MDTF-funded activities are presented in a summary table, focusing on the contribution to the achievement of MDTF’s overall targets as per the MENA MDTF Results Framework.
### Table 4.1 Results of the MENA MDTF Youth and Jobs funded activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GRANT NAME</th>
<th>ANALYTICAL PRODUCTS</th>
<th>TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE</th>
<th>DIALOGUE AND KNOWLEDGE SHARING</th>
<th>POLICY INFLUENCE</th>
<th>FUNDING LEVERAGED</th>
<th>CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jordan on-the-Job Program</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>Informed the development of a 5-year reform matrix for equitable growth and job creation program in Jordan.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Impact study report</td>
<td>Indirectly through the implemented MIS</td>
<td>Policy dialogue events with the Gov. of Jordan, Min. of Labour, Ministry of Social Affairs Knowledge sharing meetings with donor community, ILO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iraq KRG Pilot Program - Women &amp; Jobs for an Inclusive Labor Market</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>Informed the development of a $2 million GAC funded project</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Study on legal constraints and behavioral economics Social norms survey</td>
<td>Study results sharing event - planned – December 2018</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.2 Case Study #2: Refugees

This case study analyzes the refugee crisis management in Middle East and North Africa. The ongoing conflicts in the region created an unprecedented displacement crisis with more than 16 million refugees and internally displaced persons as of 2017. In countries such as Lebanon, Jordan and Syria, they represent up to 20-30 percent of the total population. The second pillar of MENA MDTF’s strategy aims to strengthen MENA countries’ resilience through strengthened refugee assistance and collaboration with host countries.

4.2.1 MENA MDTF’S Funded Activities Relating to Refugees in Syria and Lebanon

Figure 4.2 shows the three activities on refugees funded in the 2nd Cycle, for a total budget of $830,000: Improving Social Cohesion between Lebanese and Syrian Refugees in Host Communities in Lebanon, Addressing Health Needs of Syrian Refugees and Economic Analysis of Refugee Returns in Syria (Analytical Roadmap). No projects related to refugees were funded in the 1st Cycle.

Figure 4.2 MENA MDTF’s Funded Activities Relating to Refugees in Cycle II

Lebanon Improving Social Cohesion between Lebanese and Syrian Refugees in Host Communities - $250,000, Bank executed

The Lebanon’s National Volunteer Service Program (NVSP), managed by the Ministry of Social Affairs (MoSA), wishes to improve social cohesion and social service delivery in the most vulnerable Lebanese communities hosting Syrian refugees. The key objective of this activity is to carry out a pilot project to

---

increase knowledge and promote capacity building among MoSA/NVSP staff on innovative practices for improving social cohesion between Lebanese and Syrian refugees living in host communities. The grant specifically supports the Lebanese Ministry of Social Affairs to carry out the impact evaluation of NVSP, conduct a behavioural diagnosis of the constraints to social cohesion in Lebanon, strengthen psychosocial support components of the NVSP, and share best practices of social cohesion.

**Contribution to Outcome level results:** Social Cohesion Activity with Refugees Informed Lebanon’s New Strategy on Youth Engagement; the initiative contributed to consideration of inclusion of volunteerism across government programs. (OC1 Policies Influenced, OC3 Capacity built) Approximately 1,300 people benefitted from the activity.

**Output level results**

1) Policy influence resulting from the activity on social cohesion with Syrian refugees in Lebanon contributed to aspects in Lebanon’s new strategy on youth engagement. In particular, MoSA and the Ministry of Youth have included the promotion of volunteerism in both the National Social Development and the National Youth strategies.

2) A series of recommendations were implemented which resulted in a better inclusion of refugees.

3) A meeting was held between the World Bank and the Lebanese Council of Ministers to discuss the Ministry of Youth engagement strategy and what could be learned from activities and successes of the MDTF.

4) The pilot project generated interest in other countries, such as Jordan and Kosovo, wishing to scale-up and include volunteerism across their government programs.

**Addressing Health Needs of Syrian Refugees - $280,000, Bank executed**

This activity aims to produce knowledge briefs and publications to shape the global dialogue on Syrian refugees’ health needs. It seeks to address those needs using the Bank’s convening power in facilitating dialogue and harmonizing efforts for a coordinated response to the Syrian refugee crisis. The needs of Syrian refugees were assessed in the 1st Cycle as part of the SIRI - Regional Syrian Damage and Needs Assessment. The 2nd Cycle activity now intends to meet the needs of these refugees. This activity seeks to generate new knowledge on health and fragility, conflict and violence-afflicted (FCV) contexts.

**Contribution to Outcome level results:** New Knowledge Products support better identification of Health Needs in the region, in particular Syrian Refugees. (OC1 Policies Influenced)

**Output level results**

1) Developed analytical products providing detail on healthcare access and health financing for Syrian refugees.

2) The drafting of knowledge briefs on FCV settings targeting policymakers, development partners and the World Bank staff. The publications cover specific health knowledge products and provide guidance on what these products are and how they could be improved. A publication was released recently to influence future policy debates on refugees’ needs in terms of health.

3) Several meetings were held in Washington with more than 300 people from around the globe to share knowledge and this information was used to develop the briefs and publications. Technical support was provided for workshops on Syrian refugees, but also for colleagues working on the Rohingya crisis.
Economic Analysis of Refugee Returns in Syria - $300,000, Bank executed

This activity aims to financially support an analysis of Syrian refugee mobility and returns to home-country in order to shape the international community’s decisions in the coming years. The economic analysis is part of a larger project for which MENA MDTF contributed to 25 percent of total budget. The other financial contributors are the State and Peacebuilding Fund, the World Bank and the German government. This economic analysis builds on the 1st Cycle activity “Syria Information and Research Initiative (SIRI) – Regional Syrian Damage and Needs Assessment” which included an analysis of refugee returns. An analysis was undertaken to provide insight on drivers and enabling conditions that influence the return of displaced populations to cities within post-crisis Syria. The cities of focus were Dar’a, Aleppo, and Homs. Building on this previous activity, the 2nd Cycle analysis focuses on the economic implications of refugee return in Syria.

Contribution to Outcome level results: MDTF Analysis Informs International Community on Refugees Return, contributing to discussions and assessments on this important stability-related issue. (OC1 Policies Influenced)

Output level results

1) A report that intends to shape the international community’s reflection as it provides insight on how to assist refugees and how to support them in host countries. This policy influence activity will impact global decisions on refugee assistance in the coming years.

2) A series of meetings took place with the European Commission, UN agencies and governments to share early results and discuss potential solutions. An initial report under preparation is part of a series of publications the World Bank will produce, including a regional environmental and social impact assessment. The World Bank is under discussion with the United Kingdom, Canada and the Netherlands to raise funds for the next study.

Summary of Achievements Relating to Refugees in Syria and Lebanon

The following table presents the results of the MENA MDTF grants relating to refugees. The Results of the funded activities are presented in a summary table, focusing on the contribution to the achievement of the MDTF’s overall targets as per the MENA MDTF Results Framework.
### Table 4.2  Results of the MENA MDTF Refugees Funded Activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GRANT NAME</th>
<th>ANALYTICAL PRODUCTS</th>
<th>TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE</th>
<th>DIALOGUE AND KNOWLEDGE SHARING</th>
<th>POLICY INFLUENCE</th>
<th>FUNDING LEVERAGED</th>
<th>CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lebanon Improving Social Cohesion between Lebanese and Syrian Refugees in Host Communities</td>
<td>✔️ NVSP impact evaluation conducted. Behavioural analysis conducted by the WB.</td>
<td>✔️ The WB and Council of Ministers met. Behavioural analysis conducted by WB was presented and now UNDP wants to adopt WB MDTF goals.</td>
<td>✔️ MTDF informed two pillars of Lebanon’s new strategy on Youth Engagement. MoSA and the Ministry of Youth included promotion of volunteerism in the National Social Development Strategy and the National Youth Strategy.</td>
<td>✔️ Evaluation of one of the MDTF projects led to a request from Government of Lebanon to scale-up and institutionalize volunteerism across Ministry Programs.</td>
<td>✔️ Identified sources of tensions in Lebanon and made improvements benefiting refugees. 2nd phase of project in Lebanon resulted in inclusion of refugees. MENA governments to scale up based on results.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Addressing Health Needs of Syrian Refugees</td>
<td>✔️ Produced 5 knowledge briefs on FCV settings (on average 5 pages) for policy makers of client countries, development partners and WB staff</td>
<td>✔️ Provided technical support for colleagues (TTL for Bangladesh during Rohingya crisis).</td>
<td>✔️ Organized events and shared drafts with speakers. Developed final products based on input from dialogue.</td>
<td>✔️ Provided support for workshop, no costing of different types of health services being provided (itemization).</td>
<td>✔️ Held 7 events including 300 participants.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GRANT NAME</td>
<td>ANALYTICAL PRODUCTS</td>
<td>TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE</td>
<td>DIALOGUE AND KNOWLEDGE SHARING</td>
<td>POLICY INFLUENCE</td>
<td>FUNDING LEVERAGED</td>
<td>CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic Analysis of Refugee Returns in Syria</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This report is nearly finished and is part of</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Held a meeting with donors in</td>
<td>The economic</td>
<td>Negotiating with</td>
<td>Communication and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a series of publications. There will also be a</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Beirut in Oct. 2018 to share</td>
<td>analysis shapes</td>
<td>UK, Canada and the</td>
<td>support to international</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>regional environmental and social impact</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>results.</td>
<td>the international</td>
<td>Netherlands to</td>
<td>community in non-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>assessment.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Partnered with UNHCR and other UN</td>
<td>community</td>
<td>raise funds for the</td>
<td>public events.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>agencies to share early results.</td>
<td>discussions on</td>
<td>next study.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Consultations with French and</td>
<td>refugee assistance.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Belgian governments and EC to</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>discuss solutions to Syrian</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>refugee crisis.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Meeting in January 2019 with EU</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>donors, WB, Lebanon and Jordan to</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>discuss frame of analysis.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.3 Case Study #3: Recovery and Reconstruction

MENA MDTF’s strategy strongly supports private sector engagement in recovery and reconstruction in terms of infrastructure, electricity, housing, etc. Considering the scale of destruction in the region, the MDTF strategy consists of a dynamic approach bringing together external partners, and leveraging large scale financial support, beyond humanitarian response to destruction. The ongoing activities include immediate social assistance, restoring basic services, enhancing livelihoods, and fostering social cohesion. The overall goal of the recovery and reconstruction pillar is to preserve the foundations essential for a future strong state. According to MENA 2015 Regional Strategy, 20 percent of MDTF budget should be devoted to recovery and reconstruction.

This section will provide an overview of MDTF’s work in the thematic area of recovery and reconstruction in Iraq.

4.3.1 MENA MDTF’s Funded Activities Relating to Recovery and Reconstruction

During the 2nd Cycle, five different activities were funded with a total budget of $1.4 million. These include: Catalyzing the Private Sector in Recovery and Reconstruction in Yemen, Libya Preparation of Emergency Electrical Supply Improvement, Iraq Education Development Support Operation, Iraq Emergency Housing Reconstruction and DNA and Technical Assistance on the Security-Development Nexus in Iraq.9

---

9 The only activity related to recovery and reconstruction in 1st Cycle was “SIRI – Syria Damage and Needs Assessment” and its budget was $499,914
Iraq Education Development Support Operation - $200,000, Bank executed

This activity focuses on helping the Iraqi Ministry of Education develop strategies to improve access to quality education for children, focusing on the most disadvantaged and vulnerable. Although there is universal access to education in Iraq and spending on education is relatively high, important gaps remain in the Iraqi education system. There has been no education minister in place since the spring of 2018.

The sub-objectives of this specific activity are to support the reform of early learning in the Iraqi school system, organize several meetings with key stakeholders to spread awareness on Iraq’s new strategy and replicate this initiative in other MENA countries. Capacity building on project management and monitoring for the national team is a key element of this activity.

Contribution to Outcome level results: Supported Iraq Education System to Improve Early Learning. (OC1 Policies Influenced)

Output level results

1) Contributed to the Iraqi Ministry of Education development of an Early Learning Strategy.

2) A number of countries are interested in replicating this activity which has resulted in skills and knowledge exchange. The skills improvement work done with the MDTF is being replicated in Egypt and Palestine where there is more funding leveraged for these activities.

Iraq Emergency Housing Reconstruction and DNA - $400,000, Bank executed

The activity seeks to provide technical assistance and guidance to support the preparation of a housing reconstruction and repair plan in the liberated areas of Iraq. Through this activity, the MENA MDTF wishes to contribute to the design and implementation of a housing policy that will improve resilience and capacity building.

The objective is to support the engagement of the Iraqi government on the housing sector, upon government’s request. The Government wants to create a longer-term housing policy and housing mortgage program to help reduce the housing supply gap.
The MDTF is expanding its presence in Iraq given its centrality to peace and stability in the region. It supports long-term sustainability through assistance to government institutions and meeting short-term critical needs through emergency funding for housing reconstruction.

**Contribution to Outcome level results: New Policy on Housing Developed and Implemented in Iraq. (OC1 Policies Influenced)**

**Output level results**

1) Contributed to developing a housing policy and housing mortgage program to tackle the current housing shortage in Iraq. A note was also developed in collaboration with UNHABITAT to provide guidance on the short, medium and long-term housing reconstruction policy and housing market recommendations. The note was used by the Iraqi government to inform the future housing reconstruction policy as part of the National Housing Policy.

2) Contributed to the preparation of a housing reconstruction and repair plan in the liberated areas of Iraq.

3) Housing damage assessment methodology and housing reconstruction operational modalities (used for developing the TOR for international consultants working on housing reconstruction activities), developed.

**Technical Assistance on Security-Development Nexus in Iraq - $200,000, Bank executed**

The overall objective of this activity is to provide technical assistance and advisory services in preparation of interventions on the security-development nexus in Iraq. It aims to help the Iraqi government establish a multi-stakeholder Coordination Committee on the security-development nexus. The Government’s internal structure must be enabled to manage policy and programmatic actions that foster peacebuilding, security and development. The MDTF funding will support the production of analytical tools, including methodology, terms of reference and data collection tools, to be used for technical assessment and capacity building. Technical assistance on project design and management is also a key component of this activity. Selection criteria for beneficiaries and localities will be developed along with relevant project documents for pilot initiatives in the field of security and development.

**Contribution to Outcome level results: Multi-Stakeholder Coordination Committee on Security-Development Nexus to be Established by the Iraqi Government.**

**Output level results**

1) In view of the recent fund transfer for this activity, results are not yet available. The project team requested funding to provide technical assistance in future security-development operations. It intends to provide technical assistance, produce analytical tools and support the Government of Iraq in the creation of a coordination committee on the security-development nexus.

**Catalyzing the Private Sector Role in Recovery and Reconstruction in Yemen (Bring Back Business)**

The overall objective of the project was to engage directly with the private sector to inform the design, financing, and deployment of interventions and investments. The success of efforts to achieve recovery and reconstruction results even prior to a full, peaceful resolution in Yemen necessitates new
approaches that take good advantage of all existing capacities and resources available – including the private sector.

The activity looked beyond the immediate food crisis into the private sector’s role in the supply of goods, services, and jobs in Yemen and the opportunities and obstacles to doing so. It provided data collection, analysis, and consultations needed to inform the strategies and design of operations to be devised to achieve that objective.

For example, the survey conducted by the World Bank in October 2018 showed that around 35% of businesses in the country have closed, and over 51% of surviving firms have experienced a shrinkage in size and a scaling down of operations. Around 73% of closed firms cited security and financial constraints as the main reason for closure, with financial constraints, the increase of input costs, and the loss of demand and customer base as the main reasons for the change in many firms’ size.

The meeting was organized by the Small and Micro Enterprise Promotion Service agency (SMEPS), with funding from the World Bank Bringing Back Business (BBB) Project

**Contribution to Outcome level results:** i) inform the World Bank Strategy for Yemen’s recovery and reconstruction and Yemen “blueprint” implementation; and ii) inform the design of World Bank operations and a financing facility for the private sector. (OC1)

**Output level results**

1. Research on regional and domestic markets identified private sector actors and activities who are ready and able to engage in recovery and reconstruction. A firm survey of Yemeni enterprises still active in Yemen and diaspora Yemeni enterprises was completed to identify coping behaviors.

2. Identified market opportunities for supply of goods and services and creation of jobs, including key obstacles for a private sector response.

3. A supply chain analyses (construction and food sectors or other key sectors);

4. Consultative sessions undertaken with Yemeni private sector The private sector agreed to develop a set of actions and recommendations under the pillar to be discussed with other stakeholders. It agreed to develop a private sector cluster to enable more effective advocacy, participation, and coordination of the sector with other stakeholders. It also agreed to increase private sector participation in humanitarian efforts during conflict and in the identification of business opportunities during reconstruction and recovery.

**Summary of Achievements Relating to Recovery and Reconstruction**

The following table presents the results of the MENA MDTF grants relating to recovery and reconstruction. The Results of the funded activities are presented in a summary table, focusing on the contribution to the achievement of MDTF’s overall targets as per the MENA MDTF Results Framework:

---

10 While many representatives were physically present at the meeting in Sana’a, other representatives connected via video conference from the Yemeni cities of Hodeida, Aden, and Mukalla, as well as internationally from Amman, Dubai, and Istanbul.
Table 4.3 Results of the MENA MDTF Recovery and Reconstruction funded activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GRANT NAME</th>
<th>ANALYTICAL PRODUCTS</th>
<th>TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE</th>
<th>DIALOGUE AND KNOWLEDGE SHARING</th>
<th>POLICY INFLUENCE</th>
<th>FUNDING LEVERAGED</th>
<th>CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Iraq Education Development Support Operation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iraq Emergency Housing Reconstruction and DNA</td>
<td>✓ Note on short, medium and long-term reconstruction policy and finance options was developed.</td>
<td>✓ Short and medium term technical assistance to come up with a longer-term housing policy and housing mortgage program to reduce housing supply gap in Iraq.</td>
<td>✓ Knowledge exchange on skills that are being used and what each country is doing, includes Palestinians, Jordanians and Tunisians. Second meeting planned for February 2019.</td>
<td>✓ There is more funding leveraged for activities replicated in Egypt and Palestine.</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓ Skills work being done with MDTF is being replicated in Egypt and Palestine.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TA on Security-Development Nexus in Iraq</td>
<td>Not Implemented yet Plans to develop analytical products such as methodology, terms of reference and data collection tools for technical assessment and capacity building.</td>
<td>Not Implemented yet Plans to develop selection criteria for beneficiaries and localities for implementation of pilot initiatives. Plans to prepare proposals, relevant</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© UNIVERSALIA
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GRANT NAME</th>
<th>ANALYTICAL PRODUCTS</th>
<th>TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE</th>
<th>DIALOGUE AND KNOWLEDGE SHARING</th>
<th>POLICY INFLUENCE</th>
<th>FUNDING LEVERAGED</th>
<th>CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Catalyzing the Private Sector Role in Recovery and Reconstruction in Yemen</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>security-development nexus.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>project documents and design pilot projects.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Four consultative sessions undertaken with Yemeni private sector</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Libya Emergency Electricity Supply Activity (Pipeline project)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.4 Case Study #4: Regional Activities

The MENA MDTF’s work relating to regional activities is strongly aligned with the second area of focus of the MENA MDTF: Regional Cooperation. There is an emphasis on regional cooperation in public goods and sectors such as education, water, and energy to foster greater trust and collaboration across MENA countries.

4.4.1 MENA MDTF’s Activities Relating to Regional Activities

During the 2nd Cycle, the MENA MDTF provided grants to five activities in total. The present case study will present three of these activities, namely, the Water Scarce Cities Initiative, the World Development Report Education focused on regional events, and the MENA Regional Youth Platform. The “EmpowerHer” and “Addressing the Health Needs of Syrian Refugees” funded activities are covered in the “refugees” and the “Tunisia” case studies, respectively.

Figure 4.4  2nd Cycle of the MENA MDTF’s Funded Activities Relating to Regional Activities

Water Scarce Cities Initiative - $100,000, Bank executed

The Water Scarce Cities Initiative aims to connect diverse stakeholders to share their experiences in bolstering integrated approaches for water security and climate resilience. The objective of this initiative is to bolster awareness of integrated approaches to managing water resources and service delivery in water scarce cities as the basis for water security and climate resilience.

This activity is comprised of three main components: (1) Generating knowledge on improved urban water management approaches in a water scarcity context, building on the review of water scarce cities experiences around the world; (2) Facilitating multi-stakeholder dialogue, knowledge flow and
collaboration through establishing a global network of practitioners and experts on the subject of urban water management in water scarce regions and; (3) Supporting concrete engagement to support water scarce cities, including through the facilitation of technical assistance in interested cities.

**Contribution to Outcome level results:** *A water focused regional initiative created opportunities for targeted cross-learning on water management.* (OC1 Policies Influenced, OC2 Portfolio supported, OC3 Capacity built)

**Output level results**

1) As part of its efforts to generate knowledge on improved urban water management approaches, a MENA focused version of the Global report was drafted, providing examples from all regions (USA, Jordan, Morocco, Spain, etc.) presenting the diversity of the solutions and their feasibility for countries with different income levels.

2) Multi-stakeholder dialogue and knowledge regional/ country sharing events were held uniting practitioners (engineers, utility staff) to discuss urban water management solutions and the approach of circular systems.

3) Cross country learning opportunities were also created; for example, Iraq was linked to Oman and Lebanon though cross learning opportunities. Lebanon benefitted from experiences from Australia, Spain, Malta, Cyprus, and Marrakesh. Oman benefitted from example from Jordan and Morocco.

4) The activity allowed WB staff to identify the existing networks and create linkages between them and contributed to some “incubation” of the existing networks.

5) The leveraging effect of the Water Scarce cities initiative technical assistance manifested through the engagement in Lebanon, through two projects, to support water scarce cities, including the facilitation of technical assistance in interested cities. (Greater Beirut water supply project\(^\text{11}\) (US$20 million + US$90 million additional financing – based on the lessons drawn from the water scarce cities project). Bisri Dam project\(^\text{12}\) – Lebanon water supply augmentation project – on how to optimize all the dams – when country borrowing – US$ 1 billion).

**World Development Report - $100,000, Bank executed**

The World Development Report is a flagship report that is published every year since 1978 by the World Bank. The World Development Report 2018 (entitled “LEARNING to Realize Education’s Promise”) is the first ever devoted entirely to education. It explores four main themes: Education’s promise; The need to shine a light on learning; How to make schools work for learners; and how to make systems work for learning.

The 2018 version of the World Development Report (WDR 2018) was entitled “LEARNING to Realize Education’s Promise”. It is the first ever devoted entirely to education. This MENA MDTF funded activity contributed to the launch of the WDR results in the MENA region and to the writing of a MENA specific

---


WDR flagship report entitled: “Expectations and Aspirations: A New Framework for Education in the Middle East and North Africa”\(^\text{13}\).

**Contribution to Outcome level results:** A MENA focused version of the 2018 World Development Report and set the stage for policy dialogue on education in the region. (OC1 Policies Influenced)

**Output level results**

1) Awareness raising in the region increased: MENA launch events were attended by Ministers of education from the region (Ministers of Education from Lebanon, Jordan, Egypt, etc.). The regional launch event was also livestreamed and widely attended: WB records indicate that the livestream was followed by 40,000 viewers.

2) Key sets of tensions that are holding back education in the region identified and a new framework outlined that can help address these tensions and unleash the potential of education in MENA.

**MENA Regional Youth Platform - $250,000, Bank executed**

The MENA Regional Youth Platform (entitled Open Village) is an online and offline platform created in 2017. The ultimate goal of the initiative is that participants adopt each other’s successful strategies and contribute positively to their society. This platform represents a social innovation approach for the Bank, by leveraging youth-led solutions to local challenges.

The initiative aims at young social entrepreneurs from six countries (Tunisia, Morocco, Lebanon, Jordan, Egypt and Palestine) to enable connections across communities, regions and borders. Under the MENA MDTF’s guidance, the vendor EdgeRyders has prototyped and launched an online and collective platform to connect participants: Open Village.\(^\text{14}\)

Key objectives of the platform are to:

- Provide a youth-oriented (internal) and youth-led (external) forum;
- Invite young social entrepreneurs to share their experiences and success stories in social innovation and resilient living;
- Develop a peer-to-peer mentorship, including technical and capacity-building support between the platform’s contributors;
- Initiate a dialogue within and between targeted MENA communities around the themes of social entrepreneurship.

**Contribution to Outcome level results:** A Regional Youth Platform facilitates peer-to-peer mentorship and learning among young social entrepreneurs through an online platform. (OC3 People whose capacity increased).

**Output level results**


\(^{14}\)https://edgeryders.eu/c/openvillage
1) Created a network of physical spaces providing courses, business development and example of viable prototypes of nascent business to expand its outreach.

2) To date, the Platform has supported more than 1,100 new relationships between young social entrepreneurs. The MENA MDTF team captured more than 43,500-page views, 8,900 visits, 240 signed-up participants prior to full November launch, 296 forum threads, 1,942 posts and 641 relationships (unique pairwise interactions) observed.

3) A platform that can mobilize financial as well as technical assistance for young social entrepreneurs. The idea is to pool small monetary investments to fund promising new businesses.

As a ‘community of changemakers’, participants can share their experiences, read about others and bring their contributions to co-create self-sustaining projects that compensate everyone who contributes.

4) The development of analytical tools intending to guide Task Teams, Country Teams, and senior management to develop engaging strategy frameworks and design youth-responsive operations. Specifically, Youth-at-a-glance Country Notes were prepared to provide specific guidance for specific contexts and a flagship report, Cost of Youth Exclusion in MENA, to equip Bank management with cutting-edge evidence on youth, innovation, entrepreneurship and start-up programs.

Summary of Achievements Relating to Regional Activities

The following table presents the results of the MENA MDTF grants relating to Regional Activities. The Results of the funded activities are presented in a summary table, focusing on the contribution to the achievement of MDTF’s overall targets as per the MENA MDTF Results Framework.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GRANT NAME</th>
<th>ANALYTICAL PRODUCTS</th>
<th>TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE</th>
<th>DIALOGUE AND KNOWLEDGE SHARING</th>
<th>POLICY INFLUENCE</th>
<th>FUNDING LEVERAGED</th>
<th>CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Water Scarce Cities Initiative</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓ Practitioners connected</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓ Practitioners connected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Global report tailored into a MENA focused report</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>World Development Report</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓ WDR regional launch event</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓ Launch events as learning and awareness raising events</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Education flagship report produced</td>
<td></td>
<td>40,000 viewers of the event livestream</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Three country-level launch events</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Knowledge produced, and momentum created for policy dialogue</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.5 Tunisia Case Study

Eight years after the fall of the old regime, Tunisia achieved mixed socio-economic results. While significant progress has been made on the political transition to a democratic system of governance, a full economic transition is still difficult to achieve. Youth and women have been especially affected by the lack of economic opportunity: Tunisia is one of the few countries where a higher level of education decreases employability, in particular for women. Youth and women, in inland areas, are affected to the greatest extent, and the resulting growing outward migration of youth from these regions poses a threat to Tunisia’s long-term economic competitiveness.

Furthermore, the governance environment is still challenged and characterized by limited accountability, poor service delivery, and the lack of effective means for citizens to participate in the policy-making process. An improved governance environment is a prerequisite for achieving equitable and inclusive economic growth.

4.5.1 Strategic Relevance

**Alignment with the Government of Tunisia’s Strategic Plan (2016-2020)**

In September 2015, the Tunisian authorities unveiled “La Note d’Orientation”, a roadmap for the Government’s action on the horizon 2016-2020. Its main premise is that Tunisia will maintain its strong partnerships with the international community; rely on the private sector to lead economic growth and job creation; and promote a vibrant civil society. The Note presents a new development model based on the promise of a new social contract under which the state is expected to ensure inclusion and equal opportunity.

The Note consists of five pillars:

i) Good governance (fighting corruption and easing administrative barriers to economic participation);

ii) Positioning Tunisian businesses in global value chains and increasing productivity for competitiveness;

iii) Promoting human development and social inclusion (quality education, women’s participation, and social protection);
iv) Tackling regional disparities (building economic infrastructure and supporting entrepreneurship in lagging regions); and

v) Promoting green growth for sustainable development.

By supporting the implementation of key economic reforms; improving efficiency and sustainability of public expenditure in the road sector; deepening decentralization and local government; enabling the GoT to design policies and interventions for improving skill formation; and strengthening the economic and financial autonomy of women in the poorest regions and empowering youth, the MDTF is fully aligned with the five pillars of the GoT's Strategic Plan.

Alignment with the World Bank Strategy in Tunisia

Since the revolution, the World Bank Group has adjusted its overall strategy to support the transition goals. The bulk of this support has been in the form of a series of Development Policy Financing (DPFs). The DPLs were designed to provide budget support and allow the Government to focus on key reforms.

The WB strategy in Tunisia is based on three pillars:

i) Strengthening economic and fiscal management and improving the business environment for private sector driven job creation and innovation.

ii) Reducing disparities between coastal and lagging regions in terms of economic opportunities and living standards; and

iii) Increasing social inclusion and promoting skills development, transparency and accountability.

The Strategy is implemented through a series of operations, including a Development Policy Financing (DPF) series aimed at supporting the implementation of key reforms such as the Investment Code, Competition and Bankruptcy legislation, and further efforts to promote investor-friendly government procedures.

Alignment with the World Bank Strategy and Pillars in MENA

The MDTF is in line with the Bank's pillars and consequently the MDTF's activities effectively support the Bank's program in Tunisia. For example, by supporting key reforms and strengthening decentralization, the MDTF improves the overall Bank's operations and projects such as the Road Transport Corridors Modernization Project (PCMR) or the Urban Development and Local Governance Program (UDLGP).

The MDTF activities are aligned with the Bank’s MENA strategy in Tunisia, particularly around « Renewing the social contract » which focuses on building greater citizen trust, promoting inclusive and accountable service delivery and a stronger private sector that can create jobs and opportunities for all Tunisians, especially youth and women.

Evolution of MENA MDTF in TUNISIA

The 2nd cycle (2018-2021) focuses on the inclusion of large groups, which were excluded from jobs and growth: youth, women, and people from lagging regions. The current focus is on public services modernization, job creation, trade, energy, water, and education, basic services and livelihoods. In the 2nd cycle, Tunisia benefits largely from this ongoing cycle with a contribution of around US$2 million, representing a quarter of the total MDTF budget (25 percent).
4.5.2 Overview of 2nd Cycle Funded Activities in Tunisia

Transforming the Road Sector in Tunisia - $909,000, Recipient executed

The road sector in Tunisia is managed with outdated methods and limited resources. There is a pressing need to transform the way the road sector is managed, with better allocation of resources and increased efficiency in public expenditure. The objective of this activity is to improve efficiency and sustainability of public expenditure in the road sector in Tunisia through a transformational approach of its management. The GoT received funding (US$200 million) from the World Bank for the Road Transport Corridors Modernization Project (PMCTR), which has two components: Component 1: Improvement of Road Corridors and Component 2: Improving Road Network Management. The project supports the Ministry of Equipment’s reform concerning the management of the road network and the public investment plan.

The activities funded by the MDTF aimed to: 1) Facilitate the design and implementation of decision-making tools to better plan maintenance and public expenditure, including in lagging regions; 2) Review the management role of public and private sectors (mainly the use of performance-based contracts for rehabilitation and maintenance of roads); and 3) Provide capacity building on road asset management and performance-based contracts.

Contribution to Outcome level results: Capacity Building in the Road Sector Helps the Tunisian Government Carry Out a Reform in Modernization, Management, and Maintenance of Transport Corridors. (OC1 Policies Influenced)

Output level results

1) Selection, purchase and installation of a road asset management information system for the Tunisian road network;
2) Preparation of yearly maintenance condition reports of national and regional roads (including in lagging regions) and support to sustainable investment to link lagging regions to economic centers;

3) Feasibility study and technical specification for a performance-based pilot project;

4) Training programs support road asset management and performance-based contracts. The performance-based manual that was produced will allow the “Direction Générale des Ponts et Chaussées” (DGPC) to contract more road maintenance companies and efficiently monitor their work and results.

5) Capacity building enabled the DGPC to master the use of road data collection. The DGPC will be able to scale up the activities and collect data for the entire road network.

6) These results will greatly facilitate the implementation of the overall PMCTR supported by the World Bank.

Support to Deepening Decentralization and Improving Inclusion in Tunisia - $300,000, Bank executed

Decentralization reforms remain a critical foundation of the transition in Tunisia. The GoT has undertaken a phased approach to decentralization reforms, in recognition that decentralization is a gradual and multiface process, especially in a politically contested and transitional context such as Tunisia. The objective of the MDTF activities is to deepen the positive impact of the Bank support on decentralization by anticipating the next set of reforms aiming to improve local governance and service delivery. The key objective of the proposed activity is to identify and test ways to deepen decentralization and reinforce Tunisia’s new social contract.

The activities aim to i) carry out a diagnostic to identify how the upcoming legal changes will affect local governments (LG) and intergovernmental systems; ii) conduct analytical work and capacity building to make participatory planning work for Tunisians; and iii) establish an external community, connecting youth to decision-making levels.

The Bank supports the GoT (mainly through the ongoing Urban Development and Local Governance Project - UDLGP) to allow it to carry out the decentralization reforms codified in the Constitution and to shift from a purely “infrastructure delivery” approach to one that focuses on LG performance and accountability.

Contribution to Outcome level results: Local Governments Code is Being Finalized with MDTF Support. (OC1 Policies Influenced, OC2 Portfolio Increased)

Output level results

1) The new LG code was adopted, reinforcing decentralization of the legal framework in Tunisia. MDTF funding for legal work regarding the LG Code influenced the decentralization policy and reinforces the implementation and generalization of the entire decentralization process in Tunisia.

2) Contributed to supplemental support for Urban Development and Local Governance program (UDLGP). The UDLGP was designed to help the GoT carry out the decentralization reforms codified in the Constitution and to shift from a purely “infrastructure delivery” approach to one that focuses on LG performance and accountability. The MDTF helped the GoT to prepare the WB documents (Program Paper) for an additional loan of US$130 million over five years (ending 2023). A Program Paper for the additional loan produced with the MDTF funding identified the
most crucial needs of the selected municipalities as well as the most important institutional constraints to decentralization.

3) Contributed to LG reform of the selection process for disadvantaged neighborhoods to receive conditional grants for carrying out municipal investment projects and by adding more transparency.

4) Increased capacity of “La Caisse des prêts et de soutien des collectivités locales” to design and manage loan programs for municipalities.

Understanding Child and Adolescent Skills Development - $300,000, Bank executed

The Measuring Early Learning Quality and Outcomes (MELQO) project consists of a set of modules measuring child development and learning, and quality of learning environments for children in pre-primary schools. Once adapted, MELQO is intended to generate relevant, useable data to guide governmental policies and programs to improve pre-primary education for children aged 3 to 8. In Tunisia, the MDTF allowed the realization of the necessary activities prior to the implementation of a MELQO program.

When used properly, MELQO can contribute to building a data-driven discussion on young children’s development and on how to better support them. The MDTF financed the activities to conceptualize the Model and to adapt and test the Life Skills and Citizenship Education (LSCE) concept within the Tunisian educational system with the involvement of students and teachers at the high school level. It also financed the organization of meetings among the officials of the three countries (Tunisia, Egypt and Palestine), external expertise supported ministries of education of the three countries to conceptualize and set up the Model.

Contribution to Outcome level results: New LSCE Concept Developed and Tested in Tunisia’s Education System. (OC3 People whose capacity increased).

Output level results

1) Three countries (Tunisia, Egypt and Palestine) improved learning and investment through individual, social and economic development under the Life Skills and Citizenship Education (LSCE) Initiative.

2) Conceptualized the Model: Adapted and tested the LSCE concept within the Tunisian educational system with the involvement of students and teachers at the high school level.

3) Regionalization supported: Financed the organization of meetings among officials of the 3 countries, external expertise supported the three countries’ ministry of education to conceptualize and set up the Model.

4) Developed a cadre of data collectors (TOT) through training in the MELQO and LSCE models.

Supporting the Implementation of Key Economic Reforms - $300,000, Bank executed

Key economic reforms in Tunisia aim to address certain problems involving transition from an autocratic regime to a democracy, such as: Difficult Political Settlement; Regional and social inequalities; Slow Pace of Critical Economic Reforms; Weak Reform Collaboration and Implementation Capacities at High Level; Weak coordination amongst stakeholders; Poor internal administrative awareness of reform content or requirements; Weak accountability and procedures for designing and implementing result-oriented reforms; and Weak capacities to monitor, evaluate and improve reform policy implementation. The
Objective of this MDTF-financed project is to meet the State’s reform priorities by strengthening government leadership capacities to implement reform processes and to evaluate and improve such processes in Tunisia.

This initiative focuses on leveraging Bank program for enhanced results and piloting innovative approaches in selected reform priority areas, thus enabling the Government to learn and test new approaches with the objective of eventually adapting and scaling up programs.

To achieve its objective, the project has implemented two complementary components. The first component of the project (collaborative leadership) is designed to address identified barriers to reform implementation such as: Limited state capacity, accountability and effectiveness in implementing the economic change process; Weak inter-ministerial government coordination, vision and communication, resulting in limited understanding and implementation of the reforms among public servants; Government’s limited capacity to convince, communicate and negotiate effectively with internal and external stakeholders to achieve new elite bargains and agreements to advance the reforms; and Resistance to reform and political economy barriers, as actors from the governmental, political and economic spheres wish to slow down reforms that challenge their privileged position.

The second component of the project (executive leadership) addresses the problematic “competency gap” between new entrants and experienced, but soon-to-be-retired, government officials within the public administration. Deepening cleavages due to fragmented and fluid coalition politics and limited inter-ministerial coordination exacerbate issues.

Contribution to Outcome level results: Stakeholders’ Commitment to Economic Reform Strengthened by MDTF Activities. (OC3 People whose capacity increased).

Output level results

1) Intensified commitment to the state reforms, especially those supported by the WB, namely: Civil service reform (HR modernization); Administrative reforms (Simplifications and Citizen Service Centers), and E-Government.

2) Collaborative Identification and Inclusion of Reform Stakeholders.

3) Three action plans for the implementation and operationalization of reforms. Agreement on reform objectives & priority actions (SMART) - collaborative 18-month Action Plans on three priority areas.

4) Development and political validation of Internal Reform Communications Strategy

5) Positive project results leveraged more funding in order to scale up the activities. (Mobilization for a digitalization project involving the administrative procedures (e-service))

6) Joint training enables managers (Directors General, Directors and Deputy Directors) to work together on concrete public policy cases and to create an effective working network, influencing governmental policies towards better acceptability of reforms. Cohorts with a total of 42 participants have been trained so far (18 female/24 male). The aim is to reach a critical mass of 300 participants by the end of the project.

Women Economic Empowerment - EmpowerHer Maghreb - $325,000, Bank executed

The poor performance of labor markets over the years has created a feeling of exclusion among many, especially young people. In Maghreb, women still cannot compete with men on equal terms, as men usually take advantage of scarce economic opportunities. Funded by the MDTF, EmpowerHer targets women from...
interior regions who have the potential to work but face multiple constraints (such as lack of access to markets, raw materials, equipment, etc.). The objective is to make young, technology-skilled people available to these women in order to innovate and develop applications and technological solutions to overcome the constraints faced by women. This concept is called "Hackathon" and is based on successful experiences of similar initiatives undertaken by the World Bank in other countries.

**Contribution to Outcome level results: The Hackathon Improved Women's Economic and Financial Autonomy. (OC3 People whose capacity increased).**

**Output level results**

7) Strengthening the economic and financial autonomy of women in the poorest regions through the “Hackathon” held in June 2018. While helping approximately 300 women with their income generating activities, “this initiative is empowering youth – who are important participants in the hackathons – to feel that they are part of the solution, offering them visibility and a myriad of opportunities”.15 This initiative is also aligned with the Tunisian Gender Policy placing Women Empowerment as one of its top priorities.

8) Creation of start-ups: The MDTF funding brought young, unemployed tech graduates together with rural women to create start-ups for applications that help provide services for women in the interior regions of Tunisia. Thanks to the MDTF funding, large investors are providing seed funding to the winners and some of the hackathon’s participants. Banks are also attracted to the young entrepreneurs’ innovative business models. The goal is to get more investors to take these start-ups to the next level.

**Summary of Achievements Relating to Tunisia**

The following table presents the results of the MENA MDTF-funded activities in Tunisia. The Results of the funded activities are presented in a summary table, focusing on the contribution to the achievement of MDTF’s overall targets as per the MENA MDTF Results Framework:

---

Table 4.5  Results of the MENA MDTF funded activities in Tunisia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GRANT NAME</th>
<th>ANALYTICAL PRODUCTS</th>
<th>TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE</th>
<th>DIALOGUE AND KNOWLEDGE SHARING</th>
<th>POLICY INFLUENCE</th>
<th>FUNDING LEVERAGED</th>
<th>CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Transforming the Road Sector in Tunisia</td>
<td>✓ Conducted a feasibility study. Prepared annual maintenance condition reports of national and regional roads (including lagging regions) and supporting sustainable investment.</td>
<td>✓ Implemented decision support tools (Road Maintenance Management System). Introduced performance contracts.</td>
<td>✓ Supported the reform of the Ministry of Equipment concerning the road network management and the public investment plan.</td>
<td>✓ Provided capacity building to “La Caisse des prêts et de soutien des collectivités locales” for program design and loan papers production.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support to Deepening Decentralization and Improving Inclusion in Tunisia</td>
<td>✓ Supported finalizing the LG code which was approved in 2018 and reinforces decentralization legal framework in Tunisia. Conducted a review of the new organic law and relevant accompanying legislation.</td>
<td>✓ Conducted rapid technical assessments for the program for resulting restructuring and scale-up.</td>
<td>✓ Fostered exchanges, workshops, and discussions among stakeholders around the issue of decentralization.</td>
<td>✓ Designed UDLGP to help the GoT carry out the decentralization reforms codified in the Constitution. Conducted policy dialogue to push for planning/programming reforms. This includes moving from yearly programming to multi-year programming.</td>
<td>✓ Helped leverage more funding to the Urban Development and Local Governance program. Supported the GoT prepare the WB Program Paper for an additional loan of US$130 million over 5 years.</td>
<td>✓ Helped leverag...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

@ UNIVERSALIA
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GRANT NAME</th>
<th>ANALYTICAL PRODUCTS</th>
<th>TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE</th>
<th>DIALOGUE AND KNOWLEDGE SHARING</th>
<th>POLICY INFLUENCE</th>
<th>FUNDING LEVERAGED</th>
<th>CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Understanding Child and Adolescent Skills Development</td>
<td>✔ Supported studies to prepare, adapt and test the MELQO model in Tunisia. Achieved planning, adaptation and pre-field testing of new modules.</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔ Financed the organization of meetings among the three countries' officials (Tunisia, Egypt and Palestine).</td>
<td>✔ Analysis to support policy-making.</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔ Trained 30 staff (including directors, inspectors, teachers and data-collectors) on the MLQO and LSCE models.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting the Implementation of Key Economic Reforms</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔ Trained two cohorts totaling 42 participants in executive leadership. Enabled managers to work on public policy and create effective working network.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women Economic Empowerment - EmpowerHer Maghreb</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔ Leveraged additional funding of US$1,500 per winning team and investors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✔ Held a hackathon with 300 women to support their income generating activities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GRANT NAME</td>
<td>ANALYTICAL PRODUCTS</td>
<td>TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE</td>
<td>DIALOGUE AND KNOWLEDGE SHARING</td>
<td>POLICY INFLUENCE</td>
<td>FUNDING LEVERAGED</td>
<td>CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>provided additional seed funding.</td>
<td>Winning teams received training opportunities and paid internships.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5 Findings

5.1 Relevance and Strategic fit

Finding 1: The 2017 revised MENA MDTF’s objectives for the 2nd Cycle (2018-21) are strategic, relevant and aligned with the WB’s (2015) MENA Regional Strategy, supporting twin objectives of promoting peace and stability.

The 2nd Cycle projects are selected based on their alignment with the four pillars of the World Bank MENA Regional Strategy. MENA MDTF donors are in agreement with these pillars as either individually or collectively they also correspond to the individual countries’ bilateral priorities.

Efforts to have projects closely correspond to the pillars under the 2nd Cycle is evidenced by: (a) the wider distribution of projects across pillars when compared to the 1st Cycle; (b) projects that focus on gender and youth empowerment, support to child and youth skills development, and support for decentralization, as well as efforts in regional water security programs. (c) initiatives that contribute to promoting cooperation among states in MENA; (d) projects that contribute to recovery and reconstruction in Iraq, Yemen and Libya; and (e) work in Lebanon and Jordan that emphasizes refugees, employment and economic development, and supporting social cohesion.

Further examples of the relevance and strategic fit of the MDTF operations include:

- Impact and awareness on women participating in the training on options in the labor market
- Establishing a dialogue and professional relationship between the Bank and three parliaments in MENA.
- Launching the MENA chapter of the IMF-WB parliamentary network and revamping the websites of two parliaments.
- Providing guidance on involving citizens in public audit and preparing a citizen audit report.

All of the above contribute towards strengthening transparency, accountability and participation in MENA.

Finding 2: The activities of the 2nd Cycle are relevant and effectively support addressing the region’s priority needs for peace and stability and rapid response to pressing issues.16

World Bank MENA Regional Strategy Pillars

(1) renewing the social contract
(2) regional cooperation;
(3) recovery and reconstruction;
(4) resilience to IDP/refugee shocks.

---

16 The World Bank’s unique analytical work on the Syrian conflict is a good example of this. The “Bringing Back Business in Yemen” activity which fosters creative approaches even in conflict situations and informs the on-going strategies and design of operations for reconstruction in Yemen is another example.
The replacement of the Call for Proposal (CFP) process with a flexible, demand-driven and responsive approach where projects can be solicited on an on-demand basis has facilitated improved and efficient operations of the MDTF, addressing of needs on the ground in a timely manner and enhancing contributions to achievement of the objectives of the MENA Regional Strategy.

Adjustments to the operations of the MDTF were made with an eye on improving the agility of the MENA MDTF. The mid-term review found the consensus opinion of the MDTF as a flexible, agile and an important tool for leverage.

As a response mechanism to support continued demands for improved delivery of services of governments to the population in the region, the MDTF has effectively mobilized resources to address challenges identified by personnel on the ground. Through the demand driven responses, the MDTF has supported:

- Improving efficiency and governance of the targeted implementing entities;
- Energizing the Yemeni National Dialogue;
- Developing instruments that allowed for an expansion of support to the legislative branch on key reform areas that were of importance in Morocco and Tunisia, particularly with regard to transparency and access to information;
- Enhancing private sector participation through capacity building for the private sector (small contractors and SMEs) to improve their responsiveness to bidding opportunities and better access to public sector information;
- Technical assistance to address the Hepatitis C issue in Egypt.

**Finding 3:** The MDTF is relevant in the changing country contexts, responding within the limits of its available resources to key needs and requests for support, which are not readily addressed by other mechanisms.

The context in the MENA region countries is very fluid, marked by numerous structural and political-economic challenges, conflicts, population movements, and the MDTF has appropriately developed and maintained an agility which most consider has made it a successful Trust Fund. Being flexible and agile in this context is essential; it maintains eligibility for a larger number of countries, broad themes and well-developed pillars that allow it to respond to multiple changing contexts in numerous countries simultaneously.

Subsequently, the MENA MDTF activities – in particular pilots and innovations – have developed a leveraging effect for activities that can be mainstreamed at scale within the WB, recipient countries and in some cases donor programs – creating a systematic link between the MENA activities and WB operations. Among the most pressing needs to many countries in the region is high levels of youth unemployment, displaced persons and refugees which all contribute to social instability. In many cases, the work done by the MDTF could not easily be done by the World Bank or bilateral donors on a more immediate basis. The MDTF has thus served as a “rapid response mechanism” providing strategic inputs to address pressing issues in country contexts. Examples of this include:

- Mobilizing advisory work, technical assistance, and training, thereby increasing the attention on and capacity for greater government accountability and performance in the management of public resources.
- Promoting citizen participation and promoting civil society organizations participation and increasing their awareness on the governance reform environment.
Informing civil society organizations of their rights and options for monitoring the Government’s implementing agencies, including reporting of fraud and corruption.

Significantly advanced the internal and external dialogue on groundwater governance in MENA.

Advanced the thinking internally and externally on the urban water management under water scarcity through the production of an important report on the subject matter. MDTF MENA work with improved water management provides the cities with the ability to respond to rapidly increased demand, and shocks; thus, contributes to the social contract and prevention of instability. With regard to changing country contexts, this is particularly relevant to MENA and the most urbanized region – a region affected by high increase of demographics in localized areas due to refugees and internally displaced people.

Interviewees indicated consistently the MENA MDTF is one of the best examples of TFs combining strategic allocations with the just-in-time/ rapid delivery mechanisms. The simplification of the application process/ elimination of the CFP process has corresponded with increased nimbleness and responsiveness. The process for engagement is considered well explained and the team is very responsive to questions/ clarifications.

Finding 4: The Results Framework under which the 2nd Cycle operates with three output indicators and three outcome indicators facilitates improved, relevant and understandable results reporting and an effective presentation of the MDTF’s activities and achievements. This Results Framework provides a good quantitative reflection on achievement. However, it does not provide qualitative information on achievements, which in many projects are not quantifiable.

The new M&E approach enables the MDTF to monitor performance and present contributions to country engagements in a more effective and regular manner focused on project by project achievements specifically attributable to the MENA MDTF.

As such, the results framework (table 2.3 above on page 7), indicates that in 2018, the MDTF has already achieved its 2021 target on one outcome level indicator (OC1), and has made progress towards achieving its targets on all its output and outcome level indicators. The results framework is also a useful tool for measuring the reach of the MDTF, by indicating the number of people reached for each category of beneficiary. In sum, while it is still early to assess the extent to which the funded activities will be sufficient for the MDTF to achieve its objectives, the reporting data from the new M&E approach and reporting mechanisms show that the MDTF is progressing towards achieving its objectives by 2021.

While this is an improvement from the previous methodology, it can be seen that the emphasis of measurement is on the quantitative results produced by the MENA MDTF (as required by the World Bank system). Yet part of the dilemma in measuring the impact of the Trust Fund is that many of its responses and results are related to qualitative improvements, results which are not readily quantified. Examples of this include those relating to political dialogue, education and relationship building which typically are supported by MDTF but which go beyond scope of the activity.

Some of the indicators of achievement of the MENA MDTF which are not easily observed or measured are thus not captured effectively. These include such aspects as: (a) increased awareness of rights and means of participation (b) advanced dialogues which ultimately contribute to long term solutions (c) increasing strategic thinking through regional collaboration and brainstorming (d) modelling through guidance and the demonstration effect. The current results measurement approach while congruent with the Bank’s...
approach to measurement, does not necessarily capture the solid and substantial efforts of some of the MENA MDTF’s contributions. Supplementing the current approach with qualitative indicators would better capture the MDTF’s performance.

Importantly, and in a manner which partially addresses the above issue, the MENA MDTF is tracking the beneficiaries of its work very effectively. This method of measurement allows the Trust Fund to measure its effectiveness and report on who is being impacted and how they are being impacted (see figure 5.1 below).

**Figure 5.1  Outcome and output level targets for 2021**

**OUTPUT INDICATORS | 2021 TARGETS**

- **Analytical Reports | 2021 Target: 40**
  Cumulative number of analytical products produced with resources from the MDTF (policy notes, survey work, evaluations, reports) that demonstrate the good use of analysis with clear recommendations targeted at policymakers or for project preparation.

- **Technical Assistance Products | 2021 Target: 40**
  Cumulative number of technical assistance products (project design capacity building, guidelines) carried out through the MDTF that provide clear and practical recommendations, with positive client feedback.

- **Events | 2021 Target: 40**
  Cumulative number of dialogue and knowledge sharing events (workshops, 5-5 exchange, etc.) leading to clear policy conclusions in focus areas, using resources from the MDTF.

**OUTCOME INDICATORS | 2021 TARGETS**

- **Policies Influenced | 2021 Target: 50%**
  Proportion of activities that have at least somewhat influenced policy. (Percentage)

- **Portfolio Supported | 2021 Target: 4,000**
  Volume of funding leveraged by MDTF activities for Bank operations and/or programs (US$ billion)

- **People Whose Capacity Increased | 2021 Target: 8,000**
  Total number of people whose capacity increased as a result of MDTF activity (skills development, certification programs, training for capacity building, participation in events and workshops).

**Women**
Total number of women beneficiaries positively affected by MDTF-supported activities

**People in Lagging Regions**
Total number of people from lagging regions (remote, non-urban areas) positively affected by MDTF-supported activities

**Refugees/IDPs**
Total number of refugees/IDPs positively affected by MDTF-supported activities

**Youth**
Total number of youth beneficiaries positively affected by MDTF-supported activities

**Host Communities**
Total number of people in host communities positively affected by MDTF-supported activities

**Conflict-Affected People**
Total number of conflict-affected people positively affected by MDTF-supported activities

Finally, the MENA MDTF is supported by a logical model but not does not have a specific Theory of Change (ToC). As such, the MTR drafted the MDTF ToC to better reflect the changes sought by the MDTF, providing a more qualitative assessment of the achievements of the MDTF that are not easily observed or measured in the results framework’s quantitative indicators. The ToC also provides a qualitative assessment of how the MDTF seeks to have a lasting impact on the social and economic development of the region (see figure 5.2 below).
**Figure 5.2 MENA MDTF Theory of Change**

**Ultimate Outcome**

- Economic and social transformation are accelerated, promoting peace and stability in the region

**Outcomes**

- Funded activities influence policies in the MENA region, and increase the awareness of rights and means or participation.
- Funded activities build the capacity of key stakeholders through skills development, certification programs, participation in events and workshops.
- Stakeholders develop partnerships and engage in dialogue, sharing experiences and knowledge across the MENA region, and funded activities are mainstreamed at scale within the WB, recipient countries, and donor programs.

**Outputs**

- Quality analytical products are produced (policy notes, survey work, evaluations, reports), providing clear recommendations targeted at policymakers.
- Quality technical assistance projects are implemented (capacity building, project design, guidelines), providing practical recommendations.
- Quality dialogue and knowledge sharing events are organized (workshops, S-S exchanges), leading to policy conclusions in focus areas.
- Additional funding is leveraged, and partnerships across countries are created.

**Activities**

- 20 MDTF-funded activities, related to renewing the social contract with a focus on women and youth, are implemented in the MENA region: Morocco, Algeria, Tunisia, Libya, Egypt, West Bank & Gaza, Djibouti, Yemen, Jordan, Syria, Lebanon, and Iraq.
- The MENA MDTF provides technical assistance (M&E and capacity building), and uses its convening power to leverage additional funding and foment partnerships.

**Input**

The MENA MDTF provides USD 5.5 million in catalytic and demand-driven funding to activities aligned with the priorities and pillars of the 2015 MENA Regional Strategy: Renewing Social Contract, Recovery and Reconstruction, Regional Cooperation, and Refugees and Resilience/IDP Shocks.

**Assumptions**

- There is sufficient alignment of political power and incentives to implementing policy changes.
- Relevant stakeholders have the opportunity to use their new capacity.
- New policies respond to the social and economic challenges of the region.
- New partnerships are built on lasting institutional mechanisms.
- There is a demand for policy recommendations and absorptive capacity among beneficiaries.
- The generated knowledge influence policy making, and the policy recommendations produced by the funded activities are both relevant and applicable.
- Beneficiaries can identify if they require capacity building, and have the ability and influence to apply the acquired capacity.
- The WB is the preferred partner to deliver solutions.
- There exists a will and favorable context to create partnerships for delivering innovative solutions.
- Minimum support exists among stakeholders to maintain partnerships.
- Adequate financial and technical resources available for activities to be implemented.
- The WB has the capacity and leverage to convene actors around common goals and activities.
Through its rapid and demand-driven funding mechanisms, the MDTF funds activities aligned with the priorities of the WB 2015 MENA regional strategy. These activities in turn are implemented in the targeted countries, with a focus on specific beneficiaries such as women and youth. In addition, the WB provides technical assistance to the funded activities, and uses its convening power to leverage additional funding and generate partnerships with country stakeholders and international organizations.

As a result, the funded activities generate analytical products and provide technical assistance leading to practical recommendations targeted at policymakers. Both the funded activities and the WB’s assistance lead to dialogue and knowledge sharing events in which policy conclusions are reached on key focus areas. Finally, the WB’s supports the activities by leveraging additional funding.

Both the policy recommendations and the capacity building activities influence key decision makers in making policy changes that address key social and economic issues in the region. Furthermore, key stakeholders from targeted countries and international organizations develop partnerships through which experience and knowledge are shared to create innovative solutions are implemented. The funded activities are mainstreamed into these partnerships.

Ultimately, the improvement in capacity, the policy dialogues, and the newly created partnerships contribute to the ultimate outcome the MDTF is seeking: economic and social transformation are accelerated, promoting peace and stability in the region.

The assumptions between each level of results are the following:

**Ultimate Impact Assumptions**
- There is sufficient alignment of political power and incentives to implementing policy changes.
- Relevant stakeholders have the opportunity to use their new capacity
- New policies respond to the social and economic challenges of the region.
- New partnerships are built on lasting institutional mechanisms.

**Outcome level Assumptions**
- There is a demand for policy recommendations and absorptive capacity among beneficiaries.
- The generated knowledge influence policy making, and the policy recommendations produced by the funded activities are both relevant and applicable.
- Beneficiaries can identify if they require capacity building, and have the ability and influence to apply the acquired capacity.
- The WB is the preferred partner to deliver solutions.
- There exists a will and favorable context to create partnerships for delivering innovative solutions.
- Minimum support exists among stakeholders to maintain partnerships.

**Output level Assumptions**
- Adequate financial and technical resources available for activities to be implemented.
- The WB has the capacity and leverage to convene actors around common goals and activities.
Finding 5: The MENA MDTF approach for providing financing for strategic engagement activities, is strongly supported by a methodology that responds to the needs identified by World Bank country-based technical teams and partners in MENA countries.

The 2nd Cycle adjustments and focus on working with country teams and partners on the ground to identify and evaluate proposals, while refining and mainstreaming the monitoring and evaluation processes, has improved responsiveness, reduced the approval and processing time, while increasing the relevance of interventions. Delays in decisions evidenced by the 1st Cycle call for proposal process have been removed. The 2nd Cycle adjustments and modifications have streamlined decision making, expedited commitments and disbursements and simplified the management and implementation for the use of the Trust Fund’s resources to increase efficiency related to administration and use.

As with most smaller Trust Funds, the MENA MDTF is highly customized. This has increased flexibility and room for innovation which is paramount to respond to unanticipated events, regional dynamics and the requirement for new development solutions to deal with challenges which have not been encountered before on a widespread regional basis such as in MENA.

Based on the Projections above for 2021, every US$1m in donor funding is expected to generate/ benefit:

- Five analytical reports
- Five Technical Assistance products
- Five Knowledge Sharing Events
- 1,000 people

For approximately 3-4 Activities.

There are now numerous examples in the MENA MDTF where strategic engagement activities have played a catalytic role – such as in Jordan and work with municipalities, in Morocco and Tunisia, leading to follow-on activities, policy changings, or larger projects.

Other strategic engagements implemented include: Supporting the Implementation of Key Economic Reforms in Tunisia: Thinking and Working Adaptively; Support to Deepening Decentralization and Improving Social Inclusion in Tunisia; an overview of the Iraq portfolio of activities focusing on Women and Jobs for an Inclusive Labor Market, Emergency Housing Reconstruction, Education Development Support, and Technical Assistance for Peacebuilding, Security and Development.

Particularly qualitative interventions have been evidenced in governance related activities- activities which generally would not or could not have been executed without the WB, such as Developing Innovative Practices for Improving Social Cohesion between Lebanese and Syrian Refugees Living in Host Communities.
5.2 Effectiveness

Finding 6: WB Task Teams support country programmatic needs and operate in a highly responsive manner which ensures the appropriateness of investments and is knowledge-based (backed by an awareness of the absence of alternative financing mechanisms). Without the MDTF, important needs would not be addressed, and subsequent commitments would not be made.

The MDTF’s approach has, on numerous occasions, stimulated important policy changes, longer term WB investments and momentum for initiatives in a range of areas. The critical nature of these interventions is evidenced by numerous citations by interviewees that many initiatives would not have been possible without the MENA MDTF.

In some cases, MDTF support helped start programs which could not otherwise be launched and in other cases it stimulated the generation of strategic outputs, without which program expansion could not occur.

An example of the former is mobilization of MDTF, for the adaptation for the Tunisian context, of the Measuring Early Learning Quality and Outcomes (MELQO) modules. MELQO program is designed to generate locally-relevant and globally-comparable data on children’s learning and development and pre-primary learning environments. MELQO includes a suite of six tools in two modules designed to measure early child development and learning (called MODEL) and quality learning environments (called MELE). The project involved the translation of tools into Arabic and French and adaptation to the Tunisian context; adaptation on tablet and other digital media; organization of seminars on how to use the tool and the piloting and testing in early childhood centers (MELQO) and in high schools (LSCE). Working closely with sector specialists (such as in Education) and country. The MDTF contributions formed part of upstream activities led by UNICEF.17

An example of latter (strategic) support by the MDTF for program expansion was the grant to support the mobilization of expertise and technical assistance to assist in the conceptualization and the design of the additional funding of the Urban Development and Local Governance program (UDLGP). The MDTF helped the GoT to prepare the WB documents (Program Paper) for an additional loan of US$130 million for 5 years (ending 2023), a loan which was approved in 2018.

Some strategic responsive activities of the MENA MDTF have the potential to contribute to potentially transformational developments. For example, when the Ministry of Oil in Iraq faced challenges in development of a regulatory framework to tackle the flaring of natural gas, MDTF provided timely and responsive technical support in July 2017 ($350,000), enabling the completion of the framework by October 2017 and the approval by the Council of Ministers by January 2018. This is anticipated to result in total savings of approx. US$6-6.5 billion a year through:

- a reduction of natural gas flaring – the environmental impact will be equivalent to the total emissions of Sweden (1.7 billion cubic feet per day);
- expected savings of this displacement of imported diesel oil and fuel oil equivalent to US$5 billion a year and;

17 http://www.lsce-mena.org
Once the natural gas is captured and processed instead of being flared—a bi-product (LPG) will be exported—additional revenues of US$1.4 billion per year.

Finding 7: The MENA MDTF provides opportunities to apply for specialized financing that can be Bank-executed instead of client (recipient) executed. This allows for rigorous studies/innovative projects which complement other WB activities and open pathways for new development initiatives, which otherwise could not be done.

Evidence of MDTF activities that open pathways to future development is in the skills development area (assessment framework development, background research and literature reviews on 12 priority skills for the MENA region, and use of these skills) through the MDTF is being replicated in Egypt and Palestine and leveraged to access more funding for these activities.

The MDTF funded an Executive Leadership training program in Tunisia with a budget of US$170,000. The program used innovative teaching methods to prepare top managers and leaders to add effective and sustainable value to the public reforms initiated in Tunisia. The program addresses the challenges of implementing public reforms in Tunisia due to a lack of leadership skills and abilities to develop and implement sound public policies among high and middle management staff within the Government.

Financing of this type increases the likelihood of success of other WB and donor financed initiatives dependent on solid public administration and management and contributes to developing a critical mass of policy makers, analysts, advisors and managers able to design, facilitate and conduct public sector reforms in Tunisia.

Another key point not to be overlooked as a dynamic offered by the MENA MDTF, is its willingness to finance small projects that address immediate needs of priority beneficiaries in an innovative manner. A specific example to highlight is the Women’s Economic Empowerment Hackathons in Morocco and Tunisia. This initiative brought young, unemployed tech graduates together with rural women to create start-ups for apps that help provide services for women in the lagging regions in Tunisia. These apps, which will be launched in the very near future, aim to help women sell their handicrafts by providing them access to markets and materials, and connecting them to better social & entrepreneurial services. These apps will
also provide much sought-after high technology jobs and other opportunities for the young Startup entrepreneurs.

In alignment with policies for youth, making youth part of the solution and giving incentives to the youth to create their own jobs, the initiative is also aligned with the gender policies, which put Women Empowerment as one of its top priorities. The project has contributed to increasing women’s economic and financial autonomy, increased social inclusion, and helped local cultures flourish, stimulated youth to develop their own start-up, while engaging private sector investors. MDTF investments in Women’s Empowerment and youth have directly led to bilateral contributions / projects by Canada. Contributions in 2019 included: a Canadian government $CDN 10-million contribution to support the efforts of Lebanon, Iraq and Jordan to implement national women’s economic empowerment action plans, through the World Bank’s Mashreq Regional Gender Facility (The facility will provide technical support and funding for regional and country-level initiatives); and $CDN10 million for Market-Based Opportunities and Skills Training for Women and Youth Project in Lebanon, partnering with Mercy Corps to create opportunities for women and youth to access employment or self-employment by providing market-driven skills training and financial education.

Staff who delivered BE projects consistently noted the MDTF gives them the flexible funds to deliver high impact conceptual and hands on support to counterparts. It would have been extremely difficult to do the deep technical and dialogue work needed to achieve these successes without the MENA MDTF.

The MENA MDTF is one of the best examples of TFs combining strategic allocations with the just-in-time/rapid delivery mechanisms. Simplification of the application process, elimination of the CFP process has corresponded with nimbleness. The process is well explained and the team very responsive to questions/clarifications.

---

18 Contributions through the WOW program https://www.gov.uk/guidance/work-and-opportunities-for-women and EU funded Empowerwomen initiatives. https://www.empowerwomen.org/en

As an example of this, individuals surveyed were asked to what extent the MDTF contributed to the following:

- Producing analytical products (policy notes, survey work, evaluations, reports) targeted at policymakers
- Preparation of a larger project
- Providing technical assistance (project design, capacity building, guidelines)
- Creating dialogue and knowledge sharing events
- Lead to clear policy conclusions in focus areas
- Somewhat influencing policy
- Leveraging volume of funding for Bank operations and/or programs
- Capacity development (skills development, certification programs, training for capacity building, participation in events and workshops)

The results demonstrate a meaningful contribution in all of the targeted areas.
## 2nd Cycle Status of Outputs
### December 31, 2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity name</th>
<th>OP1: Analytical Reports</th>
<th>OP2: TA Products</th>
<th>OP3: Events</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jordan on-the-Job Program</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transforming the Road Sector in Tunisia</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catalyzing the Private Sector Role in Recovery and Reconstruction in Yemen</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MENA Regional Youth Platform</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support to Deepening Decentralization and Improving Inclusion</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TA for an Incremental Home Improvement Program</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding Child and Adolescent Skills Development</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women Economic Empowerment - EmpowerHer</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developing Innovative Practices for Improving Social Cohesion between Lebanese and Syrian Refugees Living in Host Communities</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women and Jobs for an Inclusive Labor Market in KRG</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Addressing Health Needs of Syrian Refugees</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water Scarce Cities Initiative</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>World Development Report 2018 Regional Events</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Household Expenditure &amp; Income Survey 2017/2018</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting the Implementation of Key Economic Reforms in Tunisia: Thinking and Working Adaptively</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic Analysis of Refugee Returns in Syria</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preparation of Emergency Electricity Supply Improvement</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iraq Natural Gas Market Framework TA</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iraq Emergency Housing Reconstruction and DNA</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iraq Education Development Support Operation</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iraq TA on Peacebuilding, Security and Development</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modernizing Targeting and Delivery Systems for Social Protection in Tunisia</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MENA Human Capital: Education for Future Work</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third Party Monitoring Agent Services in Iraq (TPMA)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximizing Finance for Development Know How Accelerator Facility (MENA)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accelerating Private Investment and Job Creation (West Bank &amp; Gaza)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>31</strong></td>
<td><strong>49</strong></td>
<td><strong>45</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Finding 8: The 2nd Cycle MENA MDTF has made considerable improvements in communications. However, the MTR found that more frequent and informative communication with donors should occur, promoting successes on a project by project basis and making observations about relevance to other countries/situations.

Interviewees indicated increased emphasis on presenting MDTF contributions to supporting peace and stability in MENA as a global public good would enhance awareness of its relevance and effectiveness. Indeed, low levels and of limited detail forms of communication on activities and results is viewed as the weakest aspect of the MENA MDTF.

The new (June 2017-June 2018) Annual Report is an example of improved communications, visualization, presentation of project successes on a case-by-case basis, financial summaries and country priorities. Similarly, the June 2018 4th Quarterly Newsletter represents a notable improvement in presenting the approach, responsiveness, activities of the MDTF, while emphasizing how it serves the interests of beneficiaries of donors and notably providing “three examples of what the MDTF can do.” There is still considerable room for improvement in presenting 2nd Cycle results at the outcome level which resonate with donors, and in line with the Result Framework.

Finding 9: The MDTF has made some notable achievements in bringing people together into the dialogue process, contributing to building of trust. During the 2nd Cycle, the MDTF has done very effective and dynamic work in Lebanon, Syria and Iraq, especially in areas where it previously did not work.

The MENA MDTF has enabled and supported capacity building, increasing participation and promoting social inclusion. There have also been notable successes in conducting survey work, policy development
MID-TERM REVIEW OF THE MENA MDTF

and the production and dissemination of knowledge products in Syria. Some of the work in Iraq and Lebanon has been “pathfinding”, enabling new approaches to the delivery of programming.

The MDTF has been effective at connecting voices and exchange projects to engage governance activities, something the WB did not really engage in. The work through the Trust Fund has created the space to discuss governance (operational work on parliament, public finance, access to data, financial management, etc.), without which these would likely not occur.

In the FCV settings MDTF work has proven particularly essential; under the MENA MDTF effective monitoring has been enabled through 3rd Party Monitoring in Iraq; and in Lebanon, focusing social stability – in particular seeking to improve relations between Lebanese and Syrian refugees –using behavioural analysis conducted by WB – the results of this work have been praised and begun to be adopted by UNDP in their work and drawn interest from the Government of Lebanon to institutionalize the approach.

In this case, the MDTF-supported activity identified the sources of tensions in Lebanon, directly supported planning for areas that can improve the life of refugees and based on an impact evaluation, developed a second phase that focused on specific actions that have resulted in the inclusion of refugees and providing direct benefits to them.

Finding 10: The scope of reporting on the MENA MDTF has been previously limited to semi-annual and annual reports; the reporting formats did not leave room for project implementers to present achievements in detail, take note of specific individuals or organizations or present replicable or scalable opportunities and did not in the past effectively communicate results achieved.

Interviewees and implementers provided feedback that reporting arrangements limited their ability to present results. Some indicated the lack of multi-media tools availability, which they maintained would have visibly demonstrated the MDTF’s effectiveness. Interviewees indicated that they believed the World Bank communications could take a more vigorous approach to distributing information internally about MDTF activities to increase awareness among staff. Limitations make reporting somewhat underwhelming in providing detailed information- typically characterized by financial expenditures, without leaving room for demonstrating the importance of activities or presentation of results achieved.

There is limited evidence of communications regarding the work of the MDTF amongst World Bank staff, and a limited awareness of its 2nd Cycle work inside the World Bank, outside of those directly involved.

Donors do not appear to have been regularly informed of progress or achievements that were notable and reporting to them took the form of semi and annual reports. Bank staff report continued challenges in preparing the project reports, which while they can capture financial information through the present reporting structures, the reporting format is not conducive to effectively describing the achievements of investments.
To a certain extent, it appears from a performance standpoint that reporting was limited due to the effectiveness of implementation, the reporting format (which was standard) and communication protocol, which was not well elaborated on until now. At project levels, reporting mechanisms are not very conducive to reporting results, and there is little nuance to the reports (or opportunity to include); reporting could be strengthened or improved by increasing the narrative component.

Major steps towards improving reporting have taken place within the last year. Teams are now requested to provide quarterly results updates on Analytical reports, TA, and Knowledge Sharing events. The renewed MDTF team has simplified its reporting schedule and issues Quarterly Newsletters with highlights on activities and standard financial information and update on results, in lieu of the Interim Report.

The MDTF team indicated that periodic interviews will be conducted with Task Teams to extract outcomes and best practices, all of which will be highlighted and disseminated in newsletters. The Annual Report has been revised into a more concise document and its publishing date has been aligned with the World Bank’s fiscal year.
6 Conclusions and Recommendations

Considering the role of the MDTF, it is well positioned to leverage the Bank's future investments in MENA by helping to support pilots and providing the WBG with information where it could work with governments to take initiatives to scale. The MDTF application and approval process has remained consistent with the country partnership framework/strategies and the WB MENA Regional Strategy. This has been and remains an effective means of operations and part of the reason for its successful implementation.

All stakeholders mentioned that MENA MDTF corresponds adequately to their needs. Three out of four respondents particularly appreciate the flexibility of the MDTF. Indeed, the MDTF is not constrained by typical implementation support and it allows to think outside the box. Stakeholders appreciate this flexibility as it ensures effective implementation. It has positive impacts on political, financing, reputation, risk-management and planning aspects. For example, in a case where a large study had a very tight deadline, the MDTF was flexible and rapidly secured the funding necessary to collect more data.

The 2nd Cycle MENA MDTF is seen by many as a "Blue Sky Fund" and characterized by criteria for selection that allows for differentiation and learning. Uniquely, the MDTF enables MENA governments to scale-up pilot projects, based on evidence gathered through activities – a rarity in the developmental context. To retain this uniqueness, it must remain lean, agile, an innovative and non-traditional MDTF, to justify its purpose.

The MDTF activities also allowed the creation of informative documents that will be useful to advise the international community on Syrian refugees’ needs and support. The MDTF provided the necessary funding to carry out research and analysis. The communication products feed dialogue on refugees’ assistance and shape international community’s decisions in that area. The impact of MENA MDTF on the international stage and global decision-making is remarkable, making it useful as a global knowledge portal, which brings together WB teams to stimulate knowledge products. An important example of this are the products developed by the WB Fragility, Conflict and Violence Team, which have been showcased, published and shared with other donors. These included 5 publications (knowledge briefs, average five pages) in relation to the FCV setting in conjunction with Health, Nutrition and Population FCV Working Group, focusing on health services - what it is, what is done, what else can be done. In addition, the team conducted seven events that involved approximately 300 people. One such paper, the *Creating Catalytic Knowledge on Health in FCV Context* is presented within the paradigm of “Potential New Impact of Policy on Syrian Refugees.”

6.1 Recommendations

1) The MDTF should continue to be used as a pathfinding initiative. In its present approach, it has served as a stimulus for thinking on future activities, supported and influenced policy development and leveraged other opportunities, including forward-looking aspects that promote

---

20 A definition of this is - what is not limited by conventional notions of what is practical or feasible; imaginative or visionary.
investments for the medium term (such as Iraqi natural gas policy). While doing so, the selection process of activities must reflect the donor priorities.21

The MENA MDTF presents a number of examples where its pathfinding activities are innovative, designed to support replication or scaling up, or set the stage for larger initiatives, such as with women and youth and activities. These types of activities present an opportunity for substantial value added to be derived from lessons learned and success stories. The benefits derived from such an approach of the Trust Fund are substantial, and it could be argued greater than simply financing gaps in World Bank country programming in a rapid manner.

2) The MDTF should improve the frequency and content of consultations with donors. While the PMU has made considerable improvements, there should be enhanced efforts to include donors in important activities, inform them of notable achievements and reach out to them as partners in promoting change and development.

Greater efforts should be made to address specific Donor agendas vis-à-vis their interest in contributions to the MDTF, while explaining its catalytic/pathfinding roles. It must continue to be innovative and non-traditional to justify its purpose; it should not be like other initiatives; and continue to act as a stimulus for future activities or to leverage larger programming. Regular contact should be made with donors, to inform them regularly of progress and achievements that are notable.

3) Increased efforts should be made to re-engage in regional activities at a level similar to the 1st Cycle. Donors specifically noted that their participation in the MDTF was initially motivated by its regional scope and ability of the World Bank to reach across boundaries. The reduced levels of regional activities by the MDTF corresponds to declining interests of donors and could potentially limit the ability of the MDTF to secure future contributions. Some of this is conditioned on the existence of country-specific Trusts Funds and donor programs, which make the utility of the MDTF if it is engaged in higher levels of regional activities of greater interest.

4) It would be advantageous to have a briefing paper distributed within the country offices in the regions to increase awareness on the operating principles of the MDTF and timelines for implementation in the 2nd Cycle. In particular, “rolling nature” of the MDTF (rather than the CFP process) and the alignment with the regional strategy (which shifted priorities).

5) The MDTF could do a better job of capitalizing on the achievements to promote and share information about its work. Internally, within the Bank offices, in country operations, it should distribute information on what the projects are doing, at a minimum electronically. Other methods could include workshops, internal BBLs, in country events - with communication/outreach to showcase what the projects are doing. A mandate should be given to personnel to collect the information, such as a researcher who could write good success stories.

At present, there is a limited staff capacity to collect information. The MENA MDTF team does an efficient job with the limited personnel available. Consideration should be given to increasing the team size to include a communication and/or knowledge management specialist to inventory achievements and identify lessons learned for replication.

6) The operational cycle for applying to the specific criteria for application and eligibility for accessing the MDTF, is not well known or distributed. There is no specific guidance on whether

---

21 An example given was addressing peace and stability by addressing the plight of IDPs/refugees which is in line with the WBG MENA strategy.
proposals should be aligned with projects in the pipeline or projects that are ongoing. Webinars or info sessions would support information distribution to country offices and donors, improve the level of participation, awareness and tap into governments in the region’s interests which would produce the greatest ROI.

7) Improved report distribution could support enhanced uptake of lessons learned and the potential for scaling up. Given the limited available human resources of the MDTF, consideration should be given to engaging communications support or processes to produce improved awareness within the WB of the MENA MDTF. MDTF could also rely more on storytelling in its external communications. Many users indicated the results matrix did not capture achievements as well as the new Newsletter has. Increasing the frequency of newsletters is thus recommended, in particular in a digital format which could be widely distributed.

Continued efforts should be made to enhance the reporting protocols, presenting in a more timely manner the substantial achievements of the MDTF. A number of interviewees indicated there could be increased awareness of the relevance and effectiveness of the MDTF if there was other means of accounting for and presenting the outcomes of the grant use other than the standard or currently used approach. Stakeholders stated that the reporting format needs improvement as it is not user-friendly.

The reporting processes should be as responsive as possible, and take into account the highly volatile political situation and rapidly evolving contexts of MENA requiring frequent adjustments to policies and planning, and provide areas for comments on exceptional achievements under challenging circumstances. The new products (newsletter) and reports can be supplemented by testimonials, short videos and success stories. Media or press releases offer another opportunity to promote significant achievements, events or to invite outside observers to attend or observe activities. However, it is important to note the MDTF team is constrained by limited available personnel and this recommendation goes hand in hand with consideration of increasing personnel staffing for the team or encouraging further support from WB country staff.

8) Improved internal distribution of information and presentation of good practices would create a wider awareness of the MDTF’s work and promote possible innovations and replication. This is particularly relevant in relation to states affected by fragility, conflict and violence (FCV) – which is a strategy priority of the WBG to achieve its twin goals of ending extreme poverty and promoting shared prosperity.22

---

22 “Fragility, conflict, and violence (FCV) is a critical development challenge that threatens efforts to end extreme poverty, affecting both low- and middle-income countries. The share of the extreme poor living in conflict-affected situations is expected to rise to nearly 50 percent by 2030. Conflicts also drive 80 percent of all humanitarian needs, while they reduce gross domestic product (GDP) growth by two percentage points per year, on average.”
Appendix I  Thematic and Country Case Studies

1.1 Case Study #1: Youth and Jobs

The MENA MDTF’s funded activities relating to Youth and Jobs portfolio of activities are aligned with strategic priority / Pillar I - Renewing the Social Contract - of the WB MENA Regional Strategy. Renewing the social contract aims to generate a new development model that is built on greater citizen trust; more effective protection of the poor and vulnerable; inclusive and accountable service delivery; and a stronger private sector that can create jobs and opportunities for MENA’s youth.

Evolution of MENA MDTF’s Funded Activities Relating to Youth and Jobs

Figure i.1 presents the evolution between 1st Cycle and 2nd Cycle of the MENA MDTF’s funded activities relating to youth and jobs. It can be observed that both cycles supported activities relating to renewing the social contract with a Jobs and Youth focus.

2nd Cycle demonstrates a decrease in the investment of the MENA MDTF in this thematic area. 90 percent of activities in the 1st Cycle covered the pillar on Renewing the Social Contract. The 2nd Cycle witnessed a decrease in the number of activities supporting this pillar, in order to increase the support to the other three pillars, which were largely underfunded in the 1st Cycle. During this cycle, the MENA MDTF provided grants to four activities: namely, the Jordan On-the-Job Program, EmpowerHer Maghreb and the pilot Women and Jobs for an Inclusive Labor Market in Kurdistan, Iraq. Additionally, the MENA MDTF supported the creation of a MENA Youth Platform which began as a moderated online network and has evolved into youth-led projects across the region.


24 The “EmpowerHer” and “MENA Youth Platform” funded activities will be covered in the “Tunisia” and the “Value-added of Regional Activities” case studies.
1.1.1 Quick Overview of 2nd Cycle Funded Activities Relating to Youth and Jobs

**Jordan on-the-Job Program - $250,000, Bank executed**

The Jordan on-the-Job Program grant complements a larger pilot ALMP that aims to implement selected labor market interventions and learn about their effectiveness towards building a coherent active labor market system.

The ALMP is comprised of three main components: career guidance and intermediation; job search; and on the job training, aimed to pilot the following combination:

1) As part of the on-the-job training component, the program used private sector firms to do the intermediation for youth placement;
2) The combination of wage subsidy above the minimum wage that decreases over time while beneficiaries attend the program;

3) Life skills training prior to placing in the internship on the job training.

The MENA MDTF financed an impact evaluation of this program, aiming to fill a knowledge gap, as the combination of these three innovations has rarely been tested, and little knowledge exists on the right length and subsidy pricing for such programs.

Iraq Kurdistan Regional Government (KRG) Women & Jobs for an Inclusive Labor Market: A Pilot Program - $300,000, Bank executed

This pilot project aims to identify barriers and test solutions to increasing women’s labor market participation. The key objective of the proposed activity is to better understand and test behaviorally informed labor market program interventions to increase female labor market participation. More specifically, it aims to:

1) Assess the behavioral, regulatory, and social barriers to women’s employment;

2) Design intervention mechanisms to boost women’s economic inclusion;

3) Examine impact of the pilot for potential scaling-up in KRG and in Iraq;
ACHIEVEMENTS OF 2<sup>nd</sup> CYCLE FUNDED ACTIVITIES RELATING TO YOUTH AND JOBS

Table i.1  Results of the MENA MDTF Youth and Jobs funded activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GRANT NAME</th>
<th>ANALYTICAL PRODUCTS</th>
<th>TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE</th>
<th>DIALOGUE AND KNOWLEDGE SHARING</th>
<th>POLICY INFLUENCE</th>
<th>FUNDING LEVERAGED</th>
<th>CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jordan on-the-Job Program</td>
<td>Impact study report</td>
<td>Indirectly through the implemented MIS</td>
<td>Policy dialogue events with the Gov. of Jordan, Min. of Labour, Ministry of social affairs Knowledge sharing meetings with donor community, ILO</td>
<td>Informed the development of a 5-year reform matrix for equitable growth and job creation program in Jordan. Informed the policy dialogue and the new development policy financing (DPF) of the WB in Jordan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iraq KRG Pilot Program - Women &amp; Jobs for an Inclusive Labor Market</td>
<td>Study on legal constraints and behavioral economics Social norms survey</td>
<td>Study results sharing event - planned – December 2018</td>
<td></td>
<td>Informed the development of a US$2 million GAC funded project</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A learning product that contributed to policy influence in Jordan

The Jordan on-the-Job Program produced a report that showcased the results of the ALMP impact study. The impact evaluation found no significant positive effects on employment and earnings of the on-the-job training and activities, partially due to governance and implementation challenges and demand-side constraints. The qualitative study found that the life skills and employability training increased awareness regarding understanding of labour market needs and also provided increased self-confidence and increased job search intensity particularly among women. The study led to the conclusion that, in order to have a positive impact on youth employment, there is a need to focus on both labour supply-side or labour demand-side interventions, including a further focus on the entrepreneurship development to address the demand side constraints.

As part of the implementation of this activity, the grant recipient organized dialogue and knowledge sharing events where the results of the impact study were presented, including policy dialogue events with the Government of Jordan relevant ministries such as the Ministry of Labour, the Ministry of Social Affairs, the Jordan Employment Fund. Other knowledge sharing events were held with donors community (such as GIZ) and other UN agencies (including the International Labour Organisation).

The results of the study informed the development of a 5-year reform matrix for equitable growth and job creation program in Jordan which incorporates supply and demand side interventions (more focus on entrepreneurship development, e-services, etc.).

The impact study report also informed the policy dialogue and the new development policy financing (DPF) of the WB in Jordan: The First Equitable Growth and Job Creation Development Policy Financing is designed to help Jordan lay the foundations for a higher and more sustainable economic growth path, while creating more jobs for Jordanians and non-Jordanians.25

Through this activity, the MENA MDTF also contributed to capacity development and to some technical assistance: the MIS and the tracing mechanisms (monitoring) that were established and implemented during the impact study. The MIS was developed with flexibility to be used for baseline and impact data collection in future labour market interventions and was kept within the national employment fund. The Ministry of Labour and the National Employment Fund were trained on the use of the MIS.

A pilot program targeting women informed a larger project in Iraq

By the time of this review, the Iraq KRG Pilot Program Women & Jobs for an Inclusive Labor Market was ongoing, with the implementation of the following activities:

1) Identifying the legal constraints, laws and regulations that would inhibit women’s participation in labour and putting in place recommendations on revisions, where needed;
2) Study of the behavioral aspects that would motivate women to work in the private sector;
3) A social norms survey (Aadat wa taqalid) was being finalized;
4) Private sector – demand side – if companies have good policies that allow bringing in women in the private sector.

In addition to this activity’s achievement in terms of knowledge generation, the data collected helped inform a larger project: the legal constraints study informed a larger engagement in the amount of US$2 million technical assistance project, funded by Global Affairs Canada. (policy, empowerment of women: political leadership and institutional mainstreaming of gender policies at the government level.)

1.2 Case Study #2: Refugees

This case study analyzes the refugee crisis management in Middle East and North Africa. The ongoing conflicts in the region created an unprecedented displacement crisis with more than 16 million refugees and internally displaced persons in 2017.\textsuperscript{26} In countries such as Lebanon, Jordan and Syria, they represent up to 20-30 percent of the total population.\textsuperscript{27} The second pillar of MENA MDTF’s strategy is to strengthen MENA societies’ resilience through strengthened refugee assistance and collaboration with host countries.

1.1.2 Evolution of MENA MDTF’S Funded Activities Relating to Refugees

Figure i.2 shows the activities on refugees that were funded in the 2\textsuperscript{nd} Cycle. There are three activities in total amounting to a budget of $830,000. The activities are Improving Social Cohesion between Lebanese and Syrian Refugees in Host Communities in Lebanon, Addressing Health Needs of Syrian Refugees and Economic Analysis of Refugee Returns in Syria (Analytical Roadmap). No projects related to refugees were funded in the 1\textsuperscript{st} Cycle.

1.1.3 Quick Overview of 2\textsuperscript{nd} Cycle Funded Activities Relating To Refugees In Syria And Lebanon

\textit{Lebanon Improving Social Cohesion between Lebanese and Syrian Refugees in Host Communities - $250,000, Bank executed}

The Lebanon’s National Volunteer Service Program (NVSP), managed by the Ministry of Social Affairs (MoSA) wishes to improve social cohesion and social service delivery in the most vulnerable Lebanese communities hosting Syrian refugees. The key objective of this activity is to carry out a pilot project to increase knowledge and promote capacity building among MoSA/NVSP staff on innovative practices for improving social cohesion between Lebanese and Syrian refugees living in host communities.

\textsuperscript{26} UNHCR. (2017) UNHCR Global Report 2017. p.128.
This activity seeks to increase knowledge and promote capacity building to develop innovative practices that could be implemented by the NVSP. This critical work complements and informs the World Bank’s ongoing support to refugees and host countries, including through the GCFF, as the conflict continues and the pressures from massive displacement remain. In more detail, this activity intends to identify the sources of tensions in Lebanon and find solutions that can improve the life of refugees and their relationships with host communities. The grant specifically supports the Lebanese Ministry of Social Affairs to finish the impact evaluation of NVSP, conduct a behavioural diagnosis of the constraints to social cohesion in Lebanon, strengthen the psychosocial support components of the NVSP and share best practices of social cohesion.

**Addressing Health Needs of Syrian Refugees - $280,000, Bank executed**

This activity aims to produce knowledge briefs and publications to shape global dialogue on Syrian refugees’ health needs. It seeks to address those needs using the Bank’s convening power in facilitating dialogue and harmonizing efforts for a coordinated response to the Syrian refugee crisis. The needs of Syrian refugees were assessed in the 1st Cycle as part of the SIRI - Regional Syrian Damage and Needs Assessment. The 2nd Cycle activity now intends to meet the needs of these refugees. The World Bank’s work especially targets the most vulnerable refugees and those affected by fragility, conflict and violence (FCV).

This activity aims to generate new knowledge on health and fragility, conflict and violence-afflicted contexts. It intends to provide tailored support to conducting stakeholder assessment and country diagnosis. It also contributes to developing and implementing analytical products providing detail on healthcare access and health financing for Syrian refugees. Finally, knowledge dissemination activities for the World Bank staff and a wider audience are held to increase awareness about health development in FCV situations.

**Economic Analysis of Refugee Returns in Syria - $300,000, Bank executed**

This activity aims to financially support the conduct of an analysis of Syrian refugee mobility and return to home-country to shape international community’s decisions in the coming years. The economic analysis is part of a larger project for which MENA MDTF contributed to 25 percent of total budget. The other financial contributors are the State and Peacebuilding Fund, the World Bank and the German government.

This economic analysis is a continuity of the 1st Cycle activity “Syria Information and Research Initiative (SIRI) – Regional Syrian Damage and Needs Assessment” which included an analysis of refugee returns. An analysis was undertaken to provide insight on drivers and enabling conditions that influence the return of displaced populations to cities within post-crisis Syria. The cities of focus were Dar’a, Aleppo, and Homs. Building on this previous activity, the 2nd Cycle analysis focuses on the economic implications of refugee return in Syria.
ACHIEVEMENTS OF 2nd CYCLE FUNDED ACTIVITIES RELATING TO REFUGEES

Table i.02  Results of the MENA MDTF Refugees funded activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GRANT NAME</th>
<th>ANALYTICAL PRODUCTS</th>
<th>TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE</th>
<th>DIALOGUE AND KNOWLEDGE SHARING</th>
<th>POLICY INFLUENCE</th>
<th>FUNDING LEVERAGED</th>
<th>CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lebanon Improving Social Cohesion between Lebanese and Syrian Refugees in Host Communities</td>
<td>NVSP impact evaluation conducted. Behavioural analysis conducted by the WB.</td>
<td>The WB and Council of Ministers met. Behavioural analysis conducted by WB was presented and now UNDP wants to adopt WB MDTF goals.</td>
<td>MTDF informed two pillars of Lebanon’s new strategy on Youth Engagement. MoSA and the Ministry of Youth included promotion of volunteerism in the National Social Development Strategy and the National Youth Strategy.</td>
<td>Evaluation of one of the MDTF projects led to a request from Government of Lebanon to scale-up and institutionalize volunteerism across Ministry Programs.</td>
<td>Identified sources of tensions in Lebanon and made improvements benefiting refugees. 2nd phase of project in Lebanon resulted in inclusion of refugees. MENA governments to scale up based on results.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Addressing Health Needs of Syrian Refugees</td>
<td>Produced 5 knowledge briefs on FCV settings (on average 5 pages) for policy makers of client countries, development partners and WB staff</td>
<td>Provided technical support for colleagues (TTL for Bangladesh during Rohingya crisis).</td>
<td>Organized events and shared drafts with speakers. Developed final products based on input from dialogue.</td>
<td>Provided support for workshop, no costing of different types of health services being provided (itemization).</td>
<td>Held 7 events including 300 participants</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Economic Analysis of Refugee Returns in Syria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grant Name</th>
<th>Analytical Products</th>
<th>Technical Assistance</th>
<th>Dialogue and Knowledge Sharing</th>
<th>Policy Influence</th>
<th>Funding Leveraged</th>
<th>Capacity Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Economic Analysis of Refugee Returns in Syria</strong></td>
<td>This report is nearly finished and is part of a series of publications. There will also be a regional environmental and social impact assessment.</td>
<td>Held a meeting with donors in Beirut in Oct. 2018 to share results. Partnered with UNHCR and other UN agencies to share early results. Met with French and Belgian governments and EC to discuss solutions to Syrian refugee issues. Meeting in January 2019 with EU donors, WB, Lebanon and Jordan to discuss frame of analysis.</td>
<td>The economic analysis shapes the international community discussions on refugee assistance.</td>
<td>Negotiations are underway between UK, Canada and the Netherlands to raise funds for the next study.</td>
<td>Communication and support to international community in non-public events.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Social Cohesion Activity with Refugees Informed Lebanon’s New Strategy on Youth Engagement

Policy influence resulted from the activity on social cohesion with Syrian refugees in Lebanon which led to the creation of Lebanon’s new strategy on youth engagement. The MDTF provided information to support the Lebanese government in the development of strategies. MoSA and the Ministry of Youth have included the promotion of volunteerism in both the National Social Development and the National Youth strategies.

The main sources of tensions between Lebanese and Syrian groups were analyzed through a behavioural analysis conducted by the World Bank. An impact analysis of NVSP was also carried out. A series of recommendations were implemented which resulted in a better inclusion of refugees. A meeting was held between the World Bank and the Lebanese Council of Ministers. The pilot project generated interest in other countries, such as Jordan and Kosovo, wishing to scale-up to and include volunteerism across their government programs.

The value-added of this activity is that it is not constrained by typical implementation support since the MDTF allows for more flexibility to ensure effective implementation and adjustment as change is expected from the design phase to the project end. For example, MDTF allowed for knowledge sharing, components to be added to ongoing engagement, etc. The activity is therefore better adapted to existing needs.

Knowledge Products on Health Needs of Syrian Refugees

The activity on Health Needs of Syrian Refugees led to the creation of knowledge briefs on FCV settings targeting policymakers, development partners and the World Bank staff. The publications cover specific health knowledge products and provide guidance on what these products are and how they could be improved. A publication was released recently to influence future policy debates on refugees’ needs in terms of health. In addition, several meetings were held in Washington with more than 300 people from around the globe to share knowledge and this information was used to develop the briefs and publication. Technical support was provided for workshops on Syrian refugees, but also for colleagues working on the Rohingya crisis.

The progress made towards the achievement of this activity objectives include the development of project ToR, identification of agencies in the area, participation in discussion on health needs in humanitarian settings, meetings to share results and redaction of knowledge briefs based on that dialogue.

MDTF Analysis Informs International Community on Refugees Return

The Economic Analysis of Refugee Return in Syria enabled the conduct of a study on refugee return. Currently at the review stage, the report is undergoing extensive consultations and internal review at the World Bank. It intends to shape the international community’s reflection as it provides insight on how to assist refugees and how to support them in host countries. This policy influence activity will impact global decisions on refugee assistance in the coming years.

A series of meetings took place with the European Commission, UN agencies and governments to share early results and discuss potential solutions. The results are already being communicated. For example, the donors met in Syria to discuss the Syrian conflict and the living conditions of refugees and they referred to the results of this report. The report is part of a series of publications the World Bank will produce including a regional environmental and social impact assessment. The World Bank is currently negotiating with the United Kingdom, Canada and the Netherlands to raise funds for the next study.
1.3 Case Study #3: Recovery and Reconstruction

MENA MDTF’s strategy strongly supports private sector engagement in recovery and reconstruction in terms of infrastructure, electricity, housing, etc. Considering the scale of destruction in the region, the MDTF strategy consists of a dynamic approach bringing together external partners, and leveraging large scale financial support, beyond humanitarian response to destruction. The ongoing activities include immediate social assistance, restoring basic services, enhancing livelihoods, and fostering social cohesion. The overall goal of the recovery and reconstruction pillar is to preserve the foundations essential for a future strong state. According to MENA 2015 Regional Strategy, 20 percent of MDTF budget should be devoted to recovery and reconstruction.

This section will provide an overview of MDTF’s work in the thematic area of recovery and reconstruction in Iraq.

EVOLUTION OF MENA MDTF’s FUNDED ACTIVITIES RELATING TO RECOVERY AND RECONSTRUCTION

In MDTF 1st Cycle, the only activity related to recovery and reconstruction in 1st Cycle was “SIRI – Syria Damage and Needs Assessment” and its budget was $499,914. The amount allocated to recovery and reconstruction increased significantly in 2nd Cycle, as displayed in Figure 2, where five different activities were funded with a total budget of $1.4 million. The activities related to this topic in 2nd Cycle are: Catalyzing the Private Sector in Recovery and Reconstruction in Yemen, Iraq Natural Gas Framework, Iraq Education Development Support Operation, Iraq Emergency Housing Reconstruction and DNA and Technical Assistance on the Security-Development Nexus in Iraq.

Figure i.3 2nd Cycle MENA MDTF’s funded activities relating to Recovery and Reconstruction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Catalyzing the Private Sector in Recovery and Reconstruction in Yemen</td>
<td>$250,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iraq Natural Gas Framework TA</td>
<td>$350,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iraq Emergency Housing Reconstruction and DNA</td>
<td>$400,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iraq Education Development Support Operations</td>
<td>$200,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TA Security Development Nexus Iraq</td>
<td>$200,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure i.4 displays the share of funding for activities in Iraq on recovery and reconstruction during 2nd Cycle. Four activities on recovery and reconstruction were set in Iraq representing a total budget of $1,150,000.

**QUICK OVERVIEW OF 2nd CYCLE FUNDED ACTIVITIES RELATING TO RECOVERY AND RECONSTRUCTION**

**Iraq Natural Gas Framework** - $350,000, Bank executed  
The overall objective of this technical assistance activity is to support the development of the regulatory framework for an Iraqi Natural Gas Market. The activity supports the Iraqi Ministry of Oil in its reform to reduce flaring of natural gas.

The implementation of this reform is expected to be highly beneficial for the environment as total emissions will decrease. In addition, it will result in savings on imported diesel oil and fuel oil. Plus, natural gas will be captured and processed instead of being flared so the bi-product liquefied petroleum gas (LPG) will be exported and will generate additional revenues.

**Iraq Education Development Support Operation** - $200,000, Bank executed  
This activity focuses on helping the Iraqi Ministry of Education develop strategies to improve access to quality education for children, focusing on the most disadvantaged and vulnerable. Although there is universal access to education in Iraq and spending on education is relatively high, important gaps remain in the Iraqi education system. There is no education minister in place since spring 2018.

The sub-objectives of this specific activity are to support the reform of early learning in the Iraqi school system, organize several meetings with key stakeholders to spread awareness on Iraq’s new strategy and replicate this initiative in other MENA countries. Capacity building on project management and monitoring for the national team is a key element of this activity.

**Iraq Emergency Housing Reconstruction and DNA** - $400,000, Bank executed  
The activity seeks to provide technical assistance and guidance to support the preparation of a housing reconstruction and repair plan in the liberated areas of Iraq. Through this activity, MENA MDTF wishes...
to contribute to the design and implementation of a housing policy that will improve resilience and capacity building.

The objective is to support the engagement of the Iraqi government on the housing sector, upon government’s request. The Government wants to create a longer-term housing policy and housing mortgage program to help reduce the housing supply gap.

MDTF is expanding its presence in Iraq given its centrality to peace and stability in the region. It supports long-term sustainability through assistance to government institutions and meeting short-term critical needs through emergency funding for housing reconstruction.

Technical Assistance on Security-Development Nexus in Iraq - $200,000, Bank executed

The overall objective of this activity is to provide technical assistance and advisory services in preparation of interventions on the security-development nexus in Iraq. It aims to help the Iraqi government establish a multi-stakeholder Coordination Committee on the security-development nexus.

The Government’s internal structure must be enabled to manage policy and programmatic actions that foster peacebuilding, security and development. The MDTF funding will support the production of analytical tools, including methodology, terms of reference and data collection tools, to be used for technical assessment and capacity building. Technical assistance on project design and management is also a key component of this activity. Selection criteria for beneficiaries and localities will be developed along with relevant project documents for pilot initiatives in the field of security and development.
ACHIEVEMENTS OF 2\textsuperscript{nd} CYCLE FUNDED ACTIVITIES RELATING TO RECOVERY AND RECONSTRUCTION

Table i.3 Results of the MENA MDTF Recovery and Reconstruction funded activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GRANT NAME</th>
<th>ANALYTICAL PRODUCTS</th>
<th>TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE</th>
<th>DIALOGUE AND KNOWLEDGE SHARING</th>
<th>POLICY INFLUENCE</th>
<th>FUNDING LEVERAGED</th>
<th>CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Iraq Education Development Support Operation</td>
<td>Workshop held with Palestinians, Jordanians and Tunisians resulted in knowledge exchange on skills that are being used and what each country is doing. Second meeting planned for February 2019.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>There is more funding leveraged for activities replicated in Egypt and Palestine.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Skills work being done with MDTF is being replicated in Egypt and Palestine.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GRANT NAME</td>
<td>ANALYTICAL PRODUCTS</td>
<td>TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE</td>
<td>DIALOGUE AND KNOWLEDGE SHARING</td>
<td>POLICY INFLUENCE</td>
<td>FUNDING LEVERAGED</td>
<td>CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iraq Emergency Housing Reconstruction and DNA</td>
<td>Note on short, medium and long-term reconstruction policy and finance options was developed.</td>
<td>Short and medium term technical assistance to come up with a longer-term housing policy and housing mortgage program to reduce housing supply gap in Iraq.</td>
<td>Helps government design and implement a housing policy. MDTF supports the engagement of Iraqi government on the housing sector.</td>
<td>MENA MDTF is positioned to leverage the bank’s future investments to support the pilot project and then scale-up.</td>
<td>Provides support on resilience and capacity building regarding how to deal with shocks including conflicts.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TA on Security-Development Nexus in Iraq</td>
<td>NOT IMPLEMENTED YET Plans to develop analytical products such as methodology, terms of reference and data collection tools for technical assessment and capacity building.</td>
<td>NOT IMPLEMENTED YET Plans to develop selection criteria for beneficiaries and localities for implementation of pilot initiatives. Plans to prepare proposals, relevant project documents and design pilot projects.</td>
<td>NOT IMPLEMENTED YET Plans to support the Government of Iraq establishing a multi-stakeholder coordination committee on the security-development nexus.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Positive Environmental and Financial Results for Iraqi Gas Sector

The approbation of natural gas market framework guidelines regulations in January 2018 is the result of the technical and legal assistance provided in the Iraq Natural Gas Framework activity. The new framework was benchmarked internationally and is competitive for transport and marketing of natural gas. The legal framework regulates private sector contracts and investment in natural gas infrastructure to capture, process, transport and deliver currently flared gas. It covers gas pricing, marketing and transportation.

The activity contributed to the ongoing reform of Iraq’s Ministry of Oil to reduce the flaring of natural gas and the deficit in power generation. MENA MDTF helped the Ministry develop a framework to capture, transport and deliver natural gas for power generation, since July 2017. When asked for additional funding, MENA MDTF was responsive and very timely. Stakeholders believe this is a major shift away from the traditional state led, state funded, to internationally benchmarked and competitive transport and marketing of natural gas.

The expected impact of this activity is significant. The reduction of natural gas flaring will result in positive environmental impacts. Expected savings on diesel oil and fuel oil importation amount to US$ 5 billion a year. In addition, liquefied petroleum gas (LPG) will be transformed and then exported. The total savings of this initiative are estimated at US$ 6-6.5 billion a year.

Iraq Education System to Improve Early Learning

The Iraq Education Development Support Operation activity has helped the Iraqi Ministry of Education develop an Early Learning Strategy.

The project has positive outcomes as many countries are interested in replicating this activity. Workshops were held with Palestinian, Jordanian and Tunisian governments which resulted in skills and knowledge exchange. There was a good buy-in from the Tunisian government who particularly appreciates the value of work, training and support provided by MENA MDTF. Tunisia assessed the framework to design background research and literature. The skills improvement work done with MDTF is being replicated in Egypt and Palestine where there additional funding leveraged for these activities is expected. Youth is the main beneficiary of this activity.

New Policy on Housing Developed and Implemented in Iraq

Technical assistance is being provided to the Iraqi government on the short and medium terms to develop a housing policy and housing mortgage program to tackle the current housing shortage in Iraq. The activity contributed to the preparation of a housing reconstruction and repair plan in the liberated areas of Iraq. The technical assistance also included housing damage assessment methodology and housing reconstruction operational modalities which is used for developing the ToR for international consultants working on housing reconstruction activities. The Iraqi government benefits from the World Bank’s global support which helped to improve resilience and capacity building on how to deal with shocks such as conflicts.

A note was also developed in collaboration with UNHABITAT to provide guidance on the short, medium and long-term housing reconstruction policy and housing market recommendations. The note was used by the Iraqi government to inform the future housing reconstruction policy as part of the National Housing Policy.

MENA MDTF is positioned to leverage the World Bank’s future investments and to support the pilot project to be scaled up. Unfortunately, this activity has slowed down due to elections in Iraq in May 2018.
Multi-Stakeholder Coordination Committee on Security-Development Nexus to be Established by the Iraqi Government

In view of the recent fund transfer for this activity, results are not measurable. The project team requested funding to provide technical assistance in future security-development operations. It intends to provide technical assistance, produce analytical tools and support the Government of Iraq in the creation of a coordination committee on the security-development nexus. This activity is part of the World Bank’s Fragility, Conflict and Violence (FCV) initiative seeking to address instability as a strategic priority to end poverty and promote prosperity.

1.4 Case Study #4: Regional Activities

The MENA MDTF’s work relating to regional activities is strongly aligned with one of the four areas of focus of the MENA MDTF: Regional Cooperation.

This portfolio of activities is also strongly aligned with one of the four strategic priorities of the World Bank’s strategy for the MENA region28, pertaining to strategic priority #2: Regional cooperation—particularly around regional public goods and sectors such as education, water, and energy so as to foster greater trust and collaboration across MENA countries.

EVOLUTION OF MENA MDTF’s FUNDED ACTIVITIES RELATING TO REGIONAL ACTIVITIES

Figure i.5 presents the evolution between 1st Cycle and 2nd Cycle of the MENA MDTF’s funded activities relating to regional activities. It can be observed that both cycles supported activities relating to regional activities. The 2nd Cycle demonstrates a decrease in the investment of the MENA MDTF in this thematic area. Part of this is attributable to the lower level of overall funding (US$8 million) in the 2nd Cycle than the 1st Cycle (US$12 million).

As of December 2018, the MENA MDTF 2nd Cycle provided grants to five activities in total. The present case study will present three of these activities, namely, the Water Scarce Cities Initiative, the World Development Report Education focused regional events and the MENA Regional Youth Platform. The “EmpowerHer” and “Addressing the Health Needs of Syrian Refugees” funded activities will be covered under the “refugees” and the “Tunisia” case studies.

Figure i.5  Evolution between 1st Cycle and 2nd Cycle of the MENA MDTF’s funded activities relating to regional activities

1st Cycle

- Supporting Economic Governance Transition in Morocco and Tunisia, 420,507
- Connecting Voices in MENA MENA, 278,908
- Gender informed Design/Gender Learning and Operational Initiative in Morocco and Yemen, 336,500
- Increasing Knowledge – Learning of SSN and ALMPS in MENA MENA, 441,959
- MENA Early Stage Innovation Technical Assistance MENA, 167,467
- Parliamentary Strengthening in Morocco and Tunisia, 249,442
- Sharing Know-how in Subsidy Reform MENA, 341,692
- Promoting Social Entrepreneurship in MENA MENA, 338,313

2nd Cycle

- World Development Report 2018 Regional Events, 100,000
- MENA Regional Youth Platform, 280,000
- Water Scarlet Cities Initiative, 120,000
- Addressing Health Needs of Syrian Refugees, 280,000
- Women Economic Empowerment - EmpowerHer Maghreb, 325,000

SIRI – Syria Damage and Needs Assessment MENA, 499,914
QUICK OVERVIEW OF 2\textsuperscript{nd} CYCLE FUNDED ACTIVITIES RELATING TO REGIONAL ACTIVITIES

**Water Scarce Cities Initiative - $100,000, Bank executed**

The Water Scarce Cities Initiative aims to connect diverse stakeholders to share their experiences in bolstering integrated approaches for water security and climate resilience.

The objective of this initiative is to bolster awareness of integrated approaches to managing water resources and service delivery in water scarce cities as the basis for water security and climate resilience.

This activity is comprised of three main components:

- Generating knowledge on improved urban water management approaches in a water scarcity context, building on the review of water scarce cities experiences around the world.
- Facilitating multi-stakeholder dialogue, knowledge flow and collaboration through establishing a global network of practitioners and experts on the subject of urban water management in water scarce regions.
- Supporting concrete engagement to support water scarce cities, including through the facilitation of technical assistance in interested cities.

**World Development Report - $100,000, Bank executed**


It explores four main themes:

- Education’s promise;
- The need to shine a light on learning;
- How to make schools work for learners; and
- How to make systems work for learning.

The 2018 version of the World Development Report (WDR 2018) was entitled “LEARNING to Realize Education’s Promise”. It is the first ever devoted entirely to education.

This MENA MDTF funded activity contributed to the launch of the WDR results in the MENA region and to the writing of a MENA specific WDR flagship report entitled: “Expectations and Aspirations: A New Framework for Education in the Middle East and North Africa”\textsuperscript{29}.

**MENA Regional Youth Platform - $250,000, Bank executed**

The MENA Regional Youth Platform (Open Village) is an online and offline platform created in 2017. The ultimate goal of the initiative is that participants adopt each other’s successful strategies and contribute positively to their society. This platform represents a Social Innovation approach for the Bank, by leveraging youth-led solutions to local challenges.

The initiative aims at young social entrepreneurs from five countries (Tunisia, Morocco, Lebanon, Jordan, Egypt and Palestine) to enable connections across communities, regions and borders. Under the

---

MENA MDTF’s guidance, the vendor EdgeRyders has prototyped and launched an online and collective platform to connect participants: Open Village.\(^\text{30}\)

Key objectives of the platform are to:

- Provide a youth-oriented (internal) and youth-led (external) forum;
- Invite young social entrepreneurs to share their experiences and success stories in social innovation and resilient living;
- Develop a peer-to-peer mentorship, including technical and capacity-building support between the platform’s contributors;
- Initiate a dialogue within and between targeted MENA communities around the themes of social entrepreneurship.

Open Village is designed to create a network of physical spaces providing courses, business development and examples of viable prototypes of nascent business to expand its outreach. Extensively, the platform intends to mobilize financial as well as technical assistance for these young social entrepreneurs. The idea is to pool small monetary investments to fund promising new businesses.

\(^{30}\) [https://edgeryders.eu/c/openvillage](https://edgeryders.eu/c/openvillage)
### Achievements of 2nd Cycle Funded Activities Relating to Regional Activities

**Table i.4: Results of the MENA MDTF Regional Activities**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grant Name</th>
<th>Analytical Products</th>
<th>Technical Assistance</th>
<th>Dialogue and Knowledge Sharing</th>
<th>Policy Influence</th>
<th>Funding Leveraged</th>
<th>Capacity Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Water Scarce Cities Initiative</td>
<td>Global report tailored into a MENA focused report</td>
<td></td>
<td>Workshops- connecting practitioners</td>
<td></td>
<td>2 projects in Lebanon</td>
<td>Workshops-connecting practitioners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>World Development Report</td>
<td>Education flagship report produced</td>
<td></td>
<td>WDR regional launch event 40,000 viewers of the event livestream Three country level launch events</td>
<td>Knowledge produced, and momentum created for policy dialogue</td>
<td></td>
<td>Launch events as learning and awareness raising events</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MENA Regional Youth Platform</td>
<td>Youth-at-a-glance Country Notes provide specific guidance for specific contexts</td>
<td></td>
<td>Online knowledge sharing platform created <a href="https://edgeryders.eu/c/openvillage">https://edgeryders.eu/c/openvillage</a></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Capacity development through peer to peer learning of young social entrepreneurs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A water focused regional initiative created opportunities for targeted cross-learning on water management

The Water Scarce Cities Initiative implemented a series of activities that aimed to demystify the technical solutions relating to urban water management and to transform the practice of engineers to one that is further focused on water management.

As part of its efforts to generate knowledge on improved urban water management approaches, a MENA focused version of the Global report was drafted, providing examples from all regions (USA, Jordan, Morocco, Spain, etc.) presenting the diversity of the solutions and their feasibility for countries with different income levels.

Multi-stakeholder dialogue and knowledge sharing events were also held where one regional workshop (in Lebanon) and two country workshops (Lebanon, Jordan) reunited practitioners (engineers, utility staff) to discuss urban water management solutions and the approach of circular systems. Cross country learning opportunities were also created; for example, Iraq was linked to Oman and Lebanon though cross learning opportunities. Lebanon benefitted from experiences from Australia, Spain, Malta, Cyprus, and Marrakesh. Oman, benefitted from example from Jordan and Morocco.

The activity also allowed WB staff to identify the existing networks and create linkages between them, ensuring that when a specific expertise is needed, a reference is made to the appropriate network. In other words, the activity contributed to some “incubation” of the existing networks.

The leveraging effect of the Water Scarce cities initiative manifested through the engagement in Lebanon, through two projects, to support water scarce cities, including through the facilitation of technical assistance in interested cities.

1- Greater Beirut water supply project\textsuperscript{31} ($20 million + $90 million additional financing – based on the lessons drawn from the water scarce cities project).

2- Bisri Dam project\textsuperscript{32} – Lebanon water supply augmentation project – on how to optimize all the dams – when country borrowing – US$1 billion.

A MENA focused initiative produced a MENA focused version of the 2018 World Development Report and set the stage for policy dialogue on education in the region

Thanks to this MENA MDTF funded activity, the 2018 WDR was launched through a series of national events (in Lebanon, Jordan and Tunisia), in addition to a regional launch event in Jordan. These events were attended by Ministers of Education from the region (Ministers of Education from Lebanon, Jordan, Egypt, etc.). The regional launch event was also livestreamed and widely attended: WB records indicate that the livestream was followed by 40,000 viewers.

In addition to creating traction and momentum to place education at the center of policy dialogue in the region, building a case on the findings of 2018 WDR, these launch events were used to conduct additional consultations and discussions on country specific issues, all of which contributed to producing the MENA specific flagship report: “Expectations and Aspirations: A New Framework for Education in the Middle East and North Africa”.\textsuperscript{33} This flagship report identifies key sets of tensions that are holding

\begin{itemize}
\end{itemize}
back education in the region and outlines a new framework that can help address these tensions and unleash the potential of education in MENA.

A Regional Youth Platform created an online platform that facilitates peer-to-peer mentorship and learning among young social entrepreneurs

The first phase of the project was completed in Fall 2018. The MDTF is now supporting the second phase of the MENA Youth Platform, scaling up the successes of the first year to help build social entrepreneurs in the region. As specified by one interviewee, the second phase intends to reinforce and support those gains achieved during the first phase. To date, the Platform has supported more than 1,100 new relationships between young social entrepreneurs.

Metrics of the platform offer testimony of its level of activity: the MENA MDTF team captured more than 43,500-page views, 8,900 visits, 240 signed-up participants prior to full November launch, 296 forum threads, 1,942 posts and 641 relationships (unique pairwise interactions) observed. As a ‘community of changemakers’, participants can share their experiences, read about others and bring their contributions to co-create self-sustaining projects that compensate everyone who contributes.

An example of success story for the project is ‘OurGhema’ in Tunisia. The MENA Youth platform has supported a young Tunisian entrepreneur who opened the first co-working space and cultural coffee of the city of Medenine.

The grant also allowed the development of analytical tools intending to guide Task Teams, Country Teams, and senior management to develop engaging strategy frameworks and design youth-responsive operations. Specifically, Youth-at-a-glance Country Notes were prepared to provide specific guidance for specific contexts and a flagship report, Cost of Youth Exclusion in MENA, intends to equip Bank management with cutting-edge evidence on youth, innovation, entrepreneurship and start-up programs.

1.5 Case Study: Tunisia

Eight years after the fall of the old regime, Tunisia achieved mixed socio-economic results. While significant progress has been made on the political transition to a democratic system of governance, a full economic transition is still difficult to achieve. Youth and women have been especially affected by the lack of economic opportunity; Tunisia is one of the few countries where a higher level of education decreases employability, in particular for women. Youth and women, in inland areas, are affected to the greatest extent, and the resulting growing outward migration of youth from these regions poses a threat to Tunisia’s long-term economic competitiveness.

Furthermore, the governance environment is still challenged and characterized by limited accountability, poor service delivery, and the lack of effective means for citizens to participate in the policy-making process. An improved governance environment is a prerequisite for achieving equitable and inclusive economic growth.

STRATEGIC RELEVANCE

ALIGNMENT WITH THE GOVERNMENT OF TUNISIA’S STRATEGIC PLAN (2016-2020)

In September 2015, the Tunisian authorities unveiled “La Note d’Orientation”, a roadmap for the Government’s action on the horizon 2016-2020. Its main premise is that Tunisia will maintain its strong partnerships with the international community; rely on the private sector to lead economic growth and job creation; and promote a vibrant civil society.

The Note presents a new development model based on the promise of a new social contract under which the state is expected to ensure inclusion and equal opportunity.

The Note consists of five pillars:

i) Good governance (fighting corruption and easing administrative barriers to economic participation);

ii) Positioning Tunisian businesses in global value chains and increasing productivity for competitiveness;

iii) Promoting human development and social inclusion (quality education, women’s participation, and social protection);

iv) Tackling regional disparities (building economic infrastructure and supporting entrepreneurship in lagging regions) and

v) Promoting green growth for sustainable development.

By supporting the implementation of key economic reforms; improving efficiency and sustainability of public expenditure in the road sector; deepening decentralization and local government; enabling the Government to design policies and interventions for improving skill formation; and strengthening the economic and financial autonomy of women in the poorest regions and empowering youth, the MDTF is fully aligned with the five pillars of the Government’s Strategic Plan.

ALIGNMENT WITH THE WORLD BANK STRATEGY IN TUNISIA

Since the revolution, the World Bank Group has adjusted its overall strategy to support the transition goals. The bulk of this support has been in the form of a series of Development Policy Financing (DPFs). The DPFs were designed to provide budget support and allow the Government to focus on key reforms.

The WB strategy in Tunisia is based on three pillars:

i) Strengthening economic and fiscal management and improving the business environment for private sector driven job creation and innovation.

ii) Reducing disparities between coastal and lagging regions in terms of economic opportunities and living standards; and

iii) Increasing social inclusion and promoting skills development, transparency and accountability.

The Strategy is implemented through a series of operations, including a Development Policy Financing (DPF) series aimed at supporting the implementation of key reforms such as the Investment Code, Competition and Bankruptcy legislation, and further efforts to promote investor friendly government procedures.

The MDTF is perfectly in line with the Bank’s three pillars. The MDTF’s activities support the Bank’s program in Tunisia. By supporting key reforms and strengthening decentralization, the MDTF improves the overall Bank’s operations and projects such as the Road Transport Corridors Modernization Project (PCMR) or the Urban Development and Local Governance Program (UDLGP).

ALIGNMENT WITH THE WORLD BANK STRATEGY in MENA

The MDTF activities are remarkably aligned with the Bank’s MENA strategy in Tunisia, particularly around «Renewing the social contract» which focuses on building greater citizen trust, promoting inclusive and accountable service delivery and a stronger private sector that can create jobs and opportunities for all Tunisians, especially youth and women.
EVOLUTION OF MENA MDTF’S FUNDED ACTIVITIES IN TUNISIA

Figure i.6 shows the 1st Cycle of the MENA MDTF (2012-2016) in Tunisia which played a catalytic role in helping deliver transformative action within the framework of the WB MENA Strategy’s four pillars. The MDTF in Tunisia provided technical assistance grants for South-South knowledge exchange, project preparation support (design and implementation), conferences and workshops, outreach activities, institutional strengthening and capacity building, research, data collection and analysis in areas where Tunisian stakeholders and the Bank have identified clear and urgent needs for capacity building. In the 1st Cycle, Tunisia was the largest single recipient of TA with 18 percent totalizing $2.2 million. When considering all regional activities, the percentage is even greater.

Figure i.6 MENA MDTF’s funded activities relating to Tunisia in 1st Cycle

As displayed on Figure i.7, the 2nd Cycle (2018-2021) focuses on the inclusion of large groups, which were excluded from jobs and growth: youth, women, and lagging regions. The 2nd Cycle focuses more on public services modernization, job creation, trade, energy, water, and education, basic services and livelihoods.

In the 2nd Cycle, Tunisia benefits largely from this ongoing cycle (as it did for the 1st Cycle) with a contribution of around US$2 million representing a quarter of the total MDTF budget (25.0 percent).
QUICK OVERVIEW OF 2nd CYCLE FUNDED ACTIVITIES TAKING PLACE IN TUNISIA

Transforming the Road Sector in Tunisia - $909,000, Recipient executed

The road sector in Tunisia is managed using outdated methods and limited resources. There is a pressing need to transform the way the road sector is managed, with better allocation of resources and increased efficiency in public expenditure. The objective of this activity is to improve efficiency and sustainability of public expenditure in the road sector in Tunisia through a transformational approach of its management.

The Government received funding (US$ 200 million) from the World Bank for the Road Transport Corridors Modernization Project (PMCTR), which has two components:

1) Component 1: Improvement of Road Corridors.
2) Component 2: Improving Road Network Management.

The project supports the Ministry of Equipment’s reform concerning the management of the road network and the public investment plan. Among the activities of the PMCTR, there is the Institutional Development of the DGPC (Direction Générale des Ponts et Chaussées) through:

(i) Implementation of decision support tools (Road Maintenance Management System) improving the programming and allocation of budgetary resources;
(ii) Introduction of performance contracts; and
(iii) Training/coaching public and private sector employees.

The activities funded by the MDTF aimed to:

1) Facilitate the design and implementation of decision-making tools to better plan maintenance and public expenditure, including in lagging regions;
2) Review the management role of public and private sectors (mainly the use of performance-based contracts for rehabilitation and maintenance of roads); and,
3) Provide capacity building on road asset management and performance-based contracts.

Support to Deepening Decentralization and Improving Inclusion in Tunisia - $300,000, Bank executed
MID-TERM REVIEW OF THE MENA MDTF

Decentralization reforms remain a critical foundation of the transition in Tunisia. The Government has undertaken a phased approach to decentralization reforms, in recognition that decentralization is a gradual and multi-face process, especially in a politically contested and transitional context such as Tunisia.

The key objective of the proposed activity is to identify and test ways to deepen decentralization and reinforce Tunisia’s new social contract.

The activities aim to i) carry out a diagnostic to identify how the upcoming legal changes will affect local governments (LG) and intergovernmental systems; ii) conduct analytical work and capacity building to make participatory planning work for Tunisians; and iii) establish an external community, connecting youth to decision-making levels.

The Bank supports the Government (mainly through the ongoing Urban Development and Local Governance Project - UDLGP) to allow it to carry out the decentralization reforms codified in the Constitution and to shift from a purely “infrastructure delivery” approach to one that focuses on LG performance and accountability.

The objective of the MDTF activities is to deepen the positive impact of the Bank support on decentralization by anticipating the next set of reforms aiming to improve local governance and service delivery.

Understanding Child and Adolescent Skills Development - $300,000, Bank executed

The Measuring Early Learning Quality and Outcomes (MELQO) project consists of a set of modules measuring child development and learning, and quality of learning environments for children in pre-primary schools. Once adopted, MELQO is intended to generate relevant, useable data to guide governmental policies and programs to improve pre-primary education for children aged 3 to 8.

In Tunisia, the MDTF allowed the realization of the necessary activities prior to the implementation of a MELQO program.

The tools are intended to be adapted and tested before implementation. It is important to ensure that the ideas of MELQO are adapted to Tunisia, and that data collectors are adequately trained. When used properly, MELQO can contribute to building a data-driven discussion on young children’s development and on how to better support them.

MELQO supports a thorough assessment of skill gaps in young children and adolescents in selected schools and communities in Tunisia. It enables the Government to design and target effective policies and interventions to improve skill formation and increase social and economic inclusion.

The MDTF financed the activities to conceptualize the Model and to adapt and test the Life Skills and Citizenship Education (LSCE) concept within the Tunisian educational system with the involvement of students and teachers at the high school level.

An additional aspect of the work under this project supported the organization of meetings in October 2018 among the education officials from Tunisia, Jordan and Palestine as well as the participation of external expertise in Amman examine the Model’s potential application in Jordan and Palestine; a second meeting was planned for February 2019.

The MDTF funding involved two components:

I. MELQO

The activities funded by the MDTF involve the adaptation to the Tunisian context of the Measuring Early Learning Quality and Outcomes (MELQO) modules. MELQO program is designed to generate locally-relevant and globally-comparable data on child learning and development and pre-primary learning environments. MELQO includes a suite of six tools in two modules designed to measure early child development and learning (called MODEL) and quality learning environments (called MELE).
The MODEL Module assesses early learning and development of children aged 4 to 6 through direct child assessments as well as surveys of parents and teachers.

The MELE Module assesses early learning environments through classroom observations and surveys of parents, teachers and school administrators. These different sources of information can create a complete picture of child development and learning environment across multiple indicators.

II. **LSCE in three countries (regional approach)**

The education situation in countries such as Tunisia, calls for a holistic, long-term and rights-based vision of education that maximizes the potential of all children and youth in the region and enables them to make sense of knowledge and face the transitions from childhood to adulthood, from education to work, and from unreflective development to responsible and active citizenship.

This is what drives the Life Skills and Citizenship Education (LSCE) Initiative, with the aim to help three countries (Tunisia, Egypt and Palestine) to improve learning and to invest such learning in individual, social and economic development.

A set of twelve core life skills have been identified using the four-dimensional learning model: ‘Learning to Know’ (Cognitive Dimension), ‘Learning to Do’ (Instrumental Dimension), ‘Learning to Be’ (Individual Dimension), and ‘Learning to Live Together’ (Social Dimension). The twelve core life skills are lifelong, and they build on evidence that underlines the importance of skills acquisition from an early age. Furthermore, the twelve core life skills are acquired and sustained through all forms of learning in a system approach that recognizes multiple pathways of learning: formal, non-formal and informal.

Supporting the Implementation of Key Economic Reforms - $300,000, Bank executed

Key economic reforms in Tunisia aim to address certain problems involving transition from an autocratic regime to a democracy, such as:

- Difficult Political Settlement;
- Regional and social inequalities;
- Slow Pace of Critical Economic Reforms;
- Weak Reform Collaboration and Implementation Capacities at High Level;
- Weak coordination amongst stakeholders;
- Poor internal administrative awareness of reform content or requirements;
- Weak accountability and procedures for designing and implementing result-oriented reforms; and
- Weak capacities to monitor, evaluate and improve reform policy implementation.

The objective of this MDTF-financed project is to meet the State’s reform priorities by strengthening government leadership capacities to implement reform processes and to evaluate and improve such processes in Tunisia.

This initiative focuses on leveraging Bank programs for enhanced results and piloting innovative approaches in selected reform priority areas, thus enabling the Government to learn and test new approaches with the objective of eventually adapting and scaling up.

To achieve its objective, the project has implemented two complementary components. The first component of the project (collaborative leadership) is designed to address identified barriers to reform implementation such as:

- Limited state capacity, accountability and effectiveness in implementing the economic change process;
Weak inter-ministerial government coordination, vision and communication, resulting in limited understanding and implementation of the reforms among public servants;

Government’s limited capacity to convince, communicate and negotiate effectively with internal and external stakeholders to achieve new elite bargains and agreements to advance the reforms; and,

Resistance to reform and political economy barriers, as actors from the governmental, political and economic spheres wish to slow down reforms that challenge their privileged position.

The second component of the project (executive leadership) addresses the problematic “competency gap” between new entrants and experienced, but soon-to-be-retired, government officials within the public administration. Deepening cleavages due to fragmented and fluid coalition politics and limited inter-ministerial coordination exacerbate issues.

Tunisian authorities have recognized the need to push for the development of relevant public policy and leadership skills of mid and high-level civil servants in order to develop a critical mass of policymakers, analysts, advisors and managers able to design and implement appropriate development strategies and effective policy measures aimed at facilitating the economic transition.

**Women Economic Empowerment-EmpowerHer Maghreb - $325,000, Bank executed**

The poor performance of labor markets over the years has created a feeling of exclusion among many, especially young people. In Maghreb, women still cannot compete with men on equal terms, as men usually take advantage of scarce economic opportunities.

Funded by the MDTF, EmpowerHer targets women from interior regions who have the potential to work but face multiple constraints (such as lack of market, raw materials, equipment, etc.). The objective is to make young people and technology available to these women in order to innovate and develop applications and technological solutions to overcome the constraints faced by women. This concept is called "Hackathon" and is based on successful experiences of similar initiatives undertaken by the World Bank in other countries.  

---

35 For example, a series of hackathons was held across Asia in 2014 through Code for Resilience, a collaboration of the World Bank's Global Facility for Disaster Reduction and Recovery (GFDRR) and Code for Japan, a civil society organization dedicated to using software coding as a means of improving social welfare.
### ACHIEVEMENTS OF 2nd CYCLE FUNDED ACTIVITIES IN TUNISIA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GRANT NAME</th>
<th>ANALYTICAL PRODUCTS</th>
<th>TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE</th>
<th>DIALOGUE AND KNOWLEDGE SHARING</th>
<th>POLICY INFLUENCE</th>
<th>FUNDING LEVERAGED</th>
<th>CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Transforming the Road Sector in Tunisia</td>
<td>Conducted a feasibility study. Prepared annual maintenance condition reports of national and regional roads (including lagging regions) and supporting sustainable investment.</td>
<td>Implemented decision support tools (Road Maintenance Management System). Introduced performance contracts.</td>
<td>Supported the reform of the Ministry of Equipment concerning the road network management and the public investment plan.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Institutional Development of the DGPC. Training/coaching for employees of the public and private sectors. (approx. 250 people)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support to Deepening Decentralization and Improving Inclusion in Tunisia</td>
<td>Helped finalize the LG code which was approved in 2018 and reinforces decentralization legal framework in Tunisia. Conducted a review of the new organic law and relevant accompanying legislation.</td>
<td>Conducted rapid technical assessments for the Program for result restructuring and scale-up.</td>
<td>Fostered exchanges, workshops, and discussions among stakeholders around the issue of decentralization.</td>
<td>Designed UDLGP to help the GoT carry out the decentralization reforms codified in the Constitution. Conducted policy dialogue to push for planning/programming reforms. This includes moving from yearly programming to multi-year programming.</td>
<td>Helped leverage more funding to the Urban Development and Local Governance program. Helped the GoT prepare the WB Program Paper for an additional loan of US$ 130 million over 5 years.</td>
<td>Provided capacity building to “La Caisse des prêts et de soutien des collectivités locales” for program design and loan papers production. (approx. 20 people)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GRANT NAME</td>
<td>ANALYTICAL PRODUCTS</td>
<td>TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE</td>
<td>DIALOGUE AND KNOWLEDGE SHARING</td>
<td>POLICY INFLUENCE</td>
<td>FUNDING LEVERAGED</td>
<td>CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding Child and Adolescent Skills Development</td>
<td>Supported studies to prepare, adapt and test the MELQO model in Tunisia. Achieved planning, adaptation and pre-field testing of new modules.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Financed the organization of meetings among the three countries’ officials (Tunisia, Egypt and Palestine.</td>
<td>Provided analysis for policy-making.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Trained data-collectors on the MLQO and LSCE models.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting the Implementation of Key Economic Reforms</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Developed and validated Internal Reform Communication Strategy. Produced 3 action plans to implement and operationalize the reforms.</td>
<td>Mobilized US$ 100 million (UK funding) to scale-up digitalization project involving e-service. Prepared projects for additional loans from the World Bank.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Trained two cohorts totaling 42 participants in executive leadership. Enabled managers to work on public policy and create effective working network.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women Economic Empowerment- EmpowerHer Maghreb</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Capacity Building in the Road Sector Helps the Tunisian Government Carry Out a Reform

The MDTF funded some crucial activities that were not budgeted in the PMCTR but were nonetheless critical to its success. Results achieved by the MDTF:

▪ Selection, purchase and installation of a road asset management information system for the Tunisian road network;
▪ Preparation of yearly maintenance condition reports of national and regional roads (including in lagging regions) and support to sustainable investment to link lagging regions to economic centers;
▪ Feasibility study and technical specification for a performance-based pilot project; and,
▪ Training programs to support road asset management and performance-based contracts.

Those results will greatly facilitate the implementation of the overall PMCTR supported by the World Bank. Capacity building enabled the “Direction Générale des Ponts et Chaussées” (DGPC) to master the use of road data collection. The DGPC will be able to scale up the activities and collect data for the entire road network.

The performance-based manual that was produced will allow the DGPC to contract more road maintenance companies and efficiently monitor their work and results.

Local Governments Code is Being Finalized with MDTF Support

The MDTF supported the finalization of the LG Code, facilitating many rounds of discussions among several governmental departments and institutions. The MDTF helped finalize the various drafts until the elaboration of the final version in order to accelerate its adoption. In April 2018, the new LG code was adopted, reinforcing decentralization of the legal framework in Tunisia.

One of the MDTF activities was to help find more funding for the Urban Development and Local Governance program (UDLGP), which was designed to deliver municipal investment projects and strengthen institutional capacity of local governments, through a combination of grants and/or loans to LGs and the use of LGs’ own sources of revenues.

The UDLGP was designed to help the GoT carry out the decentralization reforms codified in the Constitution and to shift from a purely “infrastructure delivery” approach to one that focuses on LG performance and accountability.

The MDTF helped the GoT to prepare the WB documents (Program Paper) for an additional loan of US$ 130 million over 5 years (ending 2023).

One of the components of the UDLGP is to improve access to municipal infrastructure in disadvantaged neighborhoods by providing conditional grants to carry out municipal investment projects.

However, the neighborhood selection was opaque and lacked transparency which created tension and frustration among municipalities. The MDTF used the services of an expert consultant in LG to reform the selection process and add more transparency.

The MDTF allowed to:

1) Conduct rapid technical assessments for the Program for result restructuring and scale-up;
2) Conduct a review of the new organic law and relevant legislation;
3) Conduct policy dialogue to push for planning/programming reforms. This includes moving from yearly programming to multi-year programming.

Because of the additional funding, the GoT will be able to scale up the activities of the UDLGP in order to:

(i) Address institutional constraints to achieving results;
(ii) Align the grant system and approach to upgrading disadvantaged neighborhoods with the next phase of decentralization reforms;
(iii) Broaden and deepen the institutional development and capacity building activities, including Human Resource Management (HRM), transparency and accountability, public financial management and procurement;
(iv) Revise the Results Framework (RF) to capture scaled-up results; and
(v) Modify the Program Action Plan (PAP).

The Program Paper for the additional loan that was produced with the MDTF funding helped to clearly identify the most crucial needs of the selected municipalities as well as the most important institutional constraints to decentralization.

All the legal work that has been done with MDTF funding regarding the LG Code has certainly influenced the decentralization policy and reinforces the implementation and generalization of the entire decentralization process in Tunisia.

It also helped build the capacity of “La Caisse des prêts et de soutien des collectivités locales” to design and manage loan programs for municipalities. It allowed, as well, more exchanges, workshops, and discussions among stakeholders around the issue of decentralization.

**New LSCE Concept Developed and Tested in Tunisia’s Education System**

The MDTF financed the activities to adapt and test the MELQO modules.

The following activities piloting the MODEL and MELE modules were completed:

- Planning, which includes defining the exercise purpose and linking to existing systems;
- Adaptation and pre-field-testing;
- Field-testing and data collection; and
- Analysis and application to policy.

The MDTF financed the activities to conceptualize the Model and to adapt and test the LSCE concept within the Tunisian educational system with the involvement of students and teachers at the high school level. It also financed the organization of meetings among the officials of the 3 countries, and the external expertise as well as the one existing in the three countries’ Ministry of Education to conceptualize and set up the Model.

The MDTF has funded an impressive number of studies to prepare, adapt and test the MELQO model in the Tunisian context. It allowed the organization of many workshops and exchanges among the institutional stakeholders in Tunisian education.

Many data collectors (TOT) have been trained on the MLQO and LSCE models.

The Bank approved a $100 million project (PREFAT - P162297) with a core focus on expanding and improving preschool education. This activity was developed in complementarity with the project with the objective of
developing quality assurance diagnostic tools to measure preschool activities and learning outcomes and also guide professional development activities for preschool teachers.

In addition, the Education for Competitiveness Project (E4C), which supports education transformation in the MENA region, was leveraged as a result of this activity. Additional financing in the amount of $100,000 was utilized from the E4C activity.

**Stakeholders’ Commitment to Economic Reform Strengthened by MDTF Activities**

The MDTF activities created a strong dynamic among stakeholders and intensified their commitment to the state reforms, especially those supported by the WB, namely:

- Civil service reform (HR modernization);
- Administrative reforms (Simplifications and Citizen Service Centers), and
- E-Government.

a) First Component (Collaborative Leadership)

- Collaborative Identification and Inclusion of Reform Stakeholders.
- Agreement on reform objectives & priority actions (SMART) - collaborative 18-month Action Plans on three priority areas. (Civil service reform (HR modernization), Administrative reforms (Simplifications and Citizen Service Centers), and E-Government).
- Development and political validation of Internal Reform Communications Strategy
- Mobilization of US$100 million (UK funding) for a digitalization project involving the administrative procedures (e-service)

b) Second Component (Executive Leadership)

Two cohorts with a total of 42 participants are being trained so far (18 female/24 male). The aim is to reach a critical mass of 300 participants by the end of the project (please refer to the end of this section for quotes on reactions to trainings received by participants).

Participants are mainly from the public sector (95 percent from Central Government, majority director-level); others are from CSO (including UGTT) and the private sector.

One of the problems with reforms is their slow rate of implementation.

MDTF funding has resulted in three action plans for the implementation and operationalization of reforms. This means that concretely, some activities are carried out and results are measured showing progress in the implementation of reforms.

In addition, thanks to the MDTF, the participation of all stakeholders, under the auspices of the Ministry of Large Reforms, has become more concrete in order to accelerate the implementation of reforms.

Positive project results have leveraged more funding (UK) in order to scale up the activities. They also allowed more ownership of key reform actions, which in return will bring other loans from the World Bank (several projects are in preparation).

At the same time, different training courses, in the Executive Leadership component, enable managers (Directors General, Directors and Deputy Directors) to work together on concrete public policy cases and to create an effective working network, influencing governmental policies towards better acceptability of reforms.
The Hackathon Improved Women’s Economic and Financial Autonomy

MDTF helped to pave the way for strengthening the economic and financial autonomy of women in the poorest regions through the “Hackathon” held in June 2018. While helping approximately 300 women with their income generating activities, “this initiative is empowering youth – who are important participants in the hackathons – to feel that they are part of the solution, offering them visibility and myriad opportunities”. It is remarkably aligned with the Tunisian Policy for Youth which has several objectives including making youth part of the solution and giving incentives to young people to create their own jobs. This initiative is also aligned with the Tunisian Gender Policy placing Women Empowerment as one of its top priorities.

The MDTF funding brought young, unemployed tech graduates together with rural women to create startups for applications that help provide services for women in the interior regions of Tunisia. These applications aim to help women sell their handicrafts by giving them access to markets and materials and connecting them to better social & health services. These applications will also provide sought-after high technology jobs and other opportunities to the young start-up entrepreneurs (please refer to the end of this section for quotes from participants of the hackathon).

Challenges taken into consideration by hackathon teams included access to:

- Capacity-building opportunities;
- Information about regulation affecting entrepreneurs;
- Finance/credit for entrepreneurs;
- Jobs via internet platforms;
- Long-term support measures for entrepreneurs;
- Information about pricing;
- Markets for local products and handicrafts.

Winning teams were awarded checks of up to $1,500. In addition, winning teams received iPads, courtesy of corporate sponsors, as well as incubation and training opportunities, paid internships, and complimentary access to Microsoft software and tools.

Thanks to the MDTF funding, large investors are providing seed funding to the winners and some of the hackathon’s participants. Banks are also attracted to the young entrepreneurs’ innovative business models. The goal is to get more investors to take these start-ups to the next level.

The next phase of the project is to ensure the transformation of the winning teams into entrepreneurial firms. These new applications are economically viable and profitable products that go beyond the supplier-customer relation. They impact women’s economic and financial autonomy, increase social inclusion, and help local cultures flourish.

The EmpowerHer Project will also focus on ensuring that women artisans learn about these new applications and receive the training needed to improve the quality and marketing of their products. Each of these five winning applications and how they will make a difference for youth and for rural women will be featured in upcoming publications.

---

Quotes by Participants in Training

Some reactions to trainings received by participants:

“The training allowed me to reconnect with the economic theory learned during my studies at ÉNA (National Administration School) and the real practical management world! This has helped me rediscover the indispensable reflexes that must prevail in any Public Servant. Public policy was at the center of several courses and the training covers them in depth, with completeness and rigor.”

“This rewarding training is the first training course in the public service that has largely met my expectations. Usually, trainings are mostly oriented towards theory and are sometimes superficial, but this one was based on practical cases, which help me in my daily work.”

“I would not hesitate to recommend this training to my colleagues in order to strengthen their ability to analyze and evaluate public policies which is much needed in our country.”

“For us, the training financed by the MDTF, made a great difference in our unit (Direction Générale des Ponts et Chaussées). We are now capable of operating the new Management System that we were able to acquire, thanks to the MDTF funding. That will help us to better manage the Road Transport Corridors Modernization Project (PMCTR).”

After Hackathons:

“Even the unemployed youth who competed but did not win have been transformed just by participating. Instead of waiting at home for a government job to materialize, they have been energized by the coaching and training they received, and by the challenge of helping others. Some of them have been offered paid internships that could result in permanent jobs”.

“They know their skills can play a role that benefits society; along with women, they too have been empowered, and they have a new vision for their future”.
## Appendix II  Evaluation Matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EVALUATION CRITERIA</th>
<th>QUESTIONS</th>
<th>INDICATORS</th>
<th>DATA COLLECTION METHODS</th>
<th>SOURCES OF INFORMATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1. Relevance</strong></td>
<td>To what extent is the MDTF relevant in the changing country contexts?</td>
<td>Level of alignment of the MDTF’s work in target countries with national frameworks such as WB country strategies, national plans, etc. Stakeholders’ perceptions on the relevance of MENA MDTF’s interventions in target countries. Evidence of changes in MENA MDTF’s planning, project portfolio and program implementation to further align with the changing country contexts.</td>
<td>Doc. Review Interviews Survey</td>
<td>WB country documents and country needs assessments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>MENA MDTF portfolio Documentation PMU Grants recipients Activities’ stakeholders Donors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Nature of changes brought to the MENA MDTF strategic orientation. Level of alignment of the changes brought to the MENA MDTF strategic orientation with:</td>
<td>Doc. Review Interviews Survey</td>
<td>World Bank, PMU Grants recipients WB relevant staff Activities’ stakeholders stakeholders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- WB MENA strategy;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Changing circumstances in MENA. Stakeholders’ perceptions on the relevance of the changes brought to the MENA MDTF strategic orientation to the WB’s strategy and the changing circumstances in MENA.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>To what extent do the various calls for proposals, responsive funding, sectoral</td>
<td>Recipients’ perception of the extent to which MENA MDTF’s interventions’ <strong>focus is on most</strong></td>
<td>Doc. Review Interviews</td>
<td>MDTF planning documents and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EVALUATION CRITERIA</td>
<td>QUESTIONS</td>
<td>INDICATORS</td>
<td>DATA COLLECTION METHODS</td>
<td>SOURCES OF INFORMATION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>areas covered, and types of activities funded respond to needs of the recipients? Are there gaps or areas that are more relevant than others?</td>
<td>pressing needs in the desired change for each country. Evidence of clear and explicit guidelines for grants selection process and selection criteria. WB country staff perception of responsiveness of MDTF to identified needs and requests. Stakeholders’ perceptions of the relevance of the grants selection process, selection criteria, and gaps, if any, in terms of interventions’ focus and prioritization.</td>
<td>Survey</td>
<td>guidelines for grants selection PMU Grants recipients World Bank Country Staff Activities’ stakeholders Donors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>To what extent is supporting the MDTF to the donors’ relevant? What is its value-added?</td>
<td>Nature and depth of the support of the MDTF to the donors. Donors’ perception of the relevance and value-added of the MDTF’s support. Donor’s perception of the gaps, if any, between their expectations and the support that the MDTF is providing. Renewal of commitment to funding MDTF</td>
<td>Doc. Review Interviews Survey</td>
<td>PMU Donors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Is the MDTF’s work relevant to its strategic orientation?</td>
<td>Level of alignment of the MENA MDTF’s grants with its strategic orientation. PMU’s perception of the relevance of the MDTF’s work with its strategic orientation.</td>
<td>Doc. Review Interviews Survey</td>
<td>Grants portfolio documents and data MDTF’s planning documents and results framework PMU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Does the MDTF have an explicit Theory of change?</td>
<td>Evidence in documentation of an explicit ToC for MDTF’s interventions in each country, and for the MDTF overall. Evidence of a clear results framework, objectively verifiable indicators, impact metrics, risks and assumptions.</td>
<td>Doc. Review Interviews</td>
<td>MDTF’s planning documents and results framework MDTF’s M&amp;E framework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EVALUATION CRITERIA</td>
<td>QUESTIONS</td>
<td>INDICATORS</td>
<td>DATA COLLECTION METHODS</td>
<td>SOURCES OF INFORMATION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Common understanding amongst stakeholders about the expected results of the MDTF in each country and overall.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Effectiveness</td>
<td>To what extent have funded activities achieved the donors' bilateral objectives?</td>
<td>Donors’ perceptions of MDTF’s contribution in each country. Stakeholders at both the strategic and programmatic levels can offer examples, stories for how new skills, abilities, services have led to, or are leading to, changes in institutional performance and/or behaviors. Reasons behind gaps, if any.</td>
<td>Doc. Review Interviews</td>
<td>M&amp;E data and annual reports PMU and stakeholders Donors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Evidence and nature of the results of the funded activities’ contribution to the achievement of MDTF’s overall targets.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Existence of an effective monitoring and evaluation system that generates lessons learned and good practices. Extent to which, and processes through which lessons learned and good practices were disseminated internally and externally. Evidence of an objective in the MDTF results framework relating to producing knowledge and learning. Stakeholders’ knowledge of key achievements and their perception of the extent to which the MDTF shares its accomplishments</td>
<td>Doc. Review Interviews Survey</td>
<td>M&amp;E data and annual reports Performance Measurement Framework PMU and stakeholders Donors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Evidence of contributing / hindering factors in reviewed documentation.</td>
<td>Doc. Review Interviews</td>
<td>M&amp;E data and annual reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EVALUATION CRITERIA</td>
<td>QUESTIONS</td>
<td>INDICATORS</td>
<td>DATA COLLECTION METHODS</td>
<td>SOURCES OF INFORMATION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>hindered the achievement of results?</td>
<td>MDTF staff perceptions of contributing / hindering factors to results achievement.</td>
<td>PMU</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>What specific contributions has the MDTF made to achievement of results beyond expected results?</td>
<td>Stakeholders’ perceptions on any unexpected results, positive or negative that occurred/are occurring in countries following the MDTF’s interventions in target countries. Evidence of unexpected results, positive or negative in project reporting.</td>
<td>Doc. Review Interviews</td>
<td>M&amp;E data and annual reports PMU and stakeholders Donors</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix III  Data Collection Tools

A.1  Interview Protocols – MDTF PMU

The Middle-East and North Africa’s (MENA MDTF) Programme Management Unit (PMU) has recently commissioned a mid-term review of the Fund. The objectives of the review are to assess the relevance and effectiveness of the recent strategic shift undertaken by the MENA MDTF, and to derive appropriate lessons from the MDTF activities since its inception in 2012.

Universalia Management Group, a Canadian consulting firm based in Montreal, has been contracted to conduct this mid-term review.

Thank you for agreeing to contribute to the evaluation. This interview will take about 30 minutes. Please note that we treat information deriving from all interviews confidential, which means that, for example, we will not attribute specific statements to individuals, but rather report on stakeholder views in aggregated form.

1. Date of interview:
2. Name:
3. Organisation:
4. Could you introduce yourself by specifying your current position and how long you have been in this position?
5. Please provide an overview of your work with the MDTF
6. How has the MENA MDTF adapted to changing country context? Please provide specific examples?
7. How do you ensure that the MENA MDTF remains relevant in changing country contexts?
   a. For donors
   b. For countries
   c. For MDTF strategic priorities and results framework
   d. For WB MENA strategy
8. What is the link between the activities and what the MDTF is trying to achieve? In other words, what is the theory of change of the MDTF?
9. How are the priorities of the MDTF determined in target countries?
10. How, if any, does the selection process of activities ensure relevance of the MDTF in terms of:
    a. Selection countries
    b. Selection of thematic areas of focus / pillars
    c. Bank executed / recipient executed grants
11. Does the grants selection process allow the MDTF to pursue its strategic objectives? (Accelerate economic and social transformation to build peace and stability across the regions with strategic analytics and assistance).
12. To what extent did the funded activities contribute to the achievement of the MDTF results as per the results framework?
   a. analytical products produced with resources from MDTF (policy notes, survey work, evaluations, reports) targeted at policymakers or for project preparation.
   b. technical assistance projects (project design, capacity building, guidelines) that provide clear and practical recommendations, with positive client feedback.
   c. dialogue and knowledge sharing events (workshops, S-S exchange, etc.) leading to clear policy conclusions in focus areas, using resources from the MDTF.
   d. activities that have at least somewhat influenced policy.
   e. volume of funding leveraged by MDTF activities for Bank operations and/or programs.
   f. capacity development (skills development, certification programs, training for capacity building, participation in events and workshops).

13. What methods or tools does the MDTF communicate its achieved results? (Including to the donors?) – (prompt: annual reports, web site, steering committees, briefs. What else?)

14. If you were to do things differently, what recommendations would you have for the MDTF? (For example, in terms of selection process, communications, areas of focus, etc.)
A.1.1 Interview Protocols – Donors

The Middle-East and North Africa’s (MENA MDTF) Programme Management Unit (PMU) has recently commissioned a mid-term review of the Fund. The objectives of the review are to assess the relevance and effectiveness of the recent strategic shift undertaken by the MENA MDTF, and to derive appropriate lessons from the MDTF activities since its inception in 2012.

Universalia Management Group, a Canadian consulting firm based in Montreal, has been contracted to conduct this mid-term review.

Thank you for agreeing to contribute to the evaluation. This interview will take about 30 minutes. Please note that we treat information deriving from all interviews confidential, which means that, for example, we will not attribute specific statements to individuals, but rather report on stakeholder views in aggregated form.

1. Date of interview:
2. Name:
3. Organisation:
4. Could you introduce yourself by specifying your current position and how long you have been in this position?
5. Please provide an overview of your work with the MDTF
6. How were the priorities of the MDTF selected?
7. The MDTF focuses on four thematic areas / pillars: recovery and reconstruction, regional cooperation, refugees and resilience and renewing social contract.
   a. Is the focus of the MDTF on these 4 pillars relevant for (PICK COUNTRY: Norway; UK, Finland, Denmark)?
   b. Is the focus of the MDTF on these 4 pillars relevant for recipient countries?
   c. (prompt: explore balance between areas)
8. Should the MDTF work on additional areas? Are there areas that are more relevant than the current areas of work? Please explain.
9. What is the value-added of the MDTF? (prompt: to your knowledge, what is the comparative advantage compared to other trust funds in the region such as CMI, Transition Fund?)
10. How relevant is the support that the MDTF provides to you?
11. Are there additional questions regarding relevance that we have not discussed and that are important for you to discuss?
12. To what extent has the MDTF contributed to the achievement of results relating to individual donor bilateral strategic objectives? Do you have examples?
13. Is the MDTF achieving its global objectives? and country level objectives? Do you have examples?
14. How are you kept informed about the MDTF activities and achievements?
15. What can the MDTF do differently to improve its positioning and results achievement?
A.1.2 Interview Protocols – Recipients (WB staff for BE and other for RE)

The Middle-East and North Africa’s (MENA MDTF) Programme Management Unit (PMU) has recently commissioned a mid-term review of the Fund. The objectives of the review are to assess the relevance and effectiveness of the recent strategic shift undertaken by the MENA MDTF, and to derive appropriate lessons from the MDTF activities since its inception in 2012.

Universalia Management Group, a Canadian consulting firm based in Montreal, has been contracted to conduct this mid-term review.

Thank you for agreeing to contribute to the evaluation. This interview will take about 30 minutes. Please note that we treat information deriving from all interviews confidential, which means that, for example, we will not attribute specific statements to individuals, but rather report on stakeholder views in aggregated form.

1. Date of interview:
2. Name:
3. Organisation:
4. Could you introduce yourself by specifying your current position and how long you have been in this position?
5. Please provide an overview of your work with the MDTF
6. Briefly describe the activities funded by the MDTF
7. What was the value added of the MDTF grant?
8. Are the activities funded by the MDTF aligned with the objectives of the program to which they are attached?
9. Did the grant help you accomplish results that you could not accomplish? What difference did the MDTF grant make?
10. What are the accomplishments of the activities funded by the MDTF fund that you are most proud of?
11. Have the MDTF funded activities:
   a. Produced analytical products (policy notes, survey work, evaluations, reports)
   b. Produced knowledge sharing and dialogue events
   c. Have somewhat influenced policies
   d. Benefited vulnerable populations (youth, women, refugees, people in lagging regions, conflict affected people).
12. How do you report on results for activities funded by the MDTF? Are the current reporting mechanisms adequate for showcasing achievements and learning?
13. Does the type of fund provided correspond to your needs? Do you have recommendations regarding the selection and reporting processes with the MDTF?
A.2 Survey Questionnaire – MENA MDTF Grant Recipients

Universalia, a management consulting firm based in Canada, was contracted by The World Bank to conduct the Mid-Term Review of the MENA Multi-Donor Trust Fund (MENA MDTF). The objectives of the review are to assess the relevance and effectiveness of the recent strategic shift undertaken by the MENA MDTF in 2017, and to derive appropriate lessons from the MDTF activities since its inception in 2012.

One important research and review methods being deployed is the current MENA MDTF grant recipients survey aimed at gathering data on the overall relevance and value-added of the MENA MDTF grants. As such, we kindly request your participation in this review through the completion of this survey. The survey should take less than 15 minutes to complete and will greatly help to inform the study.

If for any reason you cannot respond to a question, please select “Don’t know”.

We kindly request that you complete this survey by XXX

All information provided will be kept confidential. Findings will be presented in aggregate form and will not be attributed to individual respondents.

If you require further information concerning this survey, or if you experience any technical difficulties, please contact Luc Franche at: lfranche@universalia.com

Should you wish to verify the validity of this survey, please contact XXX at XXX

1. Did your organization receive a grant from the World Bank MENA MDTF?
   a. No (stop survey here if answer is no)
   b. Yes
   c. Don’t know (stop survey here if they say so)

2. Please choose the option that best describes your current employment
   a. I am a World Bank staff.
   b. I work in an United Nations Agency
   c. I work for an Non-Governmental Organization
   d. I work for the Government of my country
   e. Other, please specify: __________________

3. When did your organization receive the MENA MDTF grant?
   a. 2012
   b. 2013
   c. 2014
   d. 2015
   e. 2016
   f. 2017
   g. 2018
   h. Don’t know

4. In which of the following ways have you been involved with the MENA MDTF grant? Please select all that apply
   a. Responded to the MDTF’s call for proposals by drafting and sending a proposal.
   b. Managed and executed the activities funded by the grant
   c. Monitored and/or evaluated the activities funded by the grant
   d. Other, please specify: __________________

5. To what extent are the activities funded by the grant relevant to your organization’s mandate?
6. To what extent are the activities funded by the grant relevant to the context of the country in which you work?
   a. Minimally
   b. Partially
   c. Substantially
   d. Fully
   e. Don’t know/no opinion

7. (Ask only to people who answered a) at question # 2) To what extent are the activities funded by the grant relevant to the World Bank MENA Regional Strategy?
   a. Minimally
   b. Partially
   c. Substantially
   d. Fully
   e. Don’t know/no opinion

8. (ask only to people who answered b), c), or d) to question #7). To which of the World Bank MENA Regional Strategy’s pillar(s) are the activities funded by the MENA MDTF grant related? Please select all that apply.
   a. Recovery and reconstruction
   b. Regional cooperation
   c. Refugees and resilience
   d. Renewing the social contract
   e. Don’t know

9. To what extent have the implementation of activities and progress toward results under the grant been monitored and reported?
   a. Minimally
   b. Partially
   c. Substantially
   d. Fully
   e. Don’t know/no opinion

10. Has the implementation period ended for the activities funded by the MENA MDTF grant?
    a. No
    b. Yes
    c. Don’t know

11. (ask only if they answered b) to question #10) To what extent the activities funded by the grant have been implemented?
    a. Minimally
    b. Partially
    c. Substantially
    d. Fully
    e. Don’t know/no opinion
12. (ask only if they answered b) to question #10) To what extent have the implementation of the activities funded by the MENA MDTF grant contributed to achieving expected results?
   a. Minimally
   b. Partially
   c. Substantially
   d. Fully
   e. Don’t know/no opinion
      i. Redirect to this question if responded a) or b) at question #12, optional: what are the main factors explaining why the activities did not yield the expected results? ______________

13. Are/were the MDTF funded activities supporting an already existing and ongoing World Bank program or project?
   a. No
   b. Yes
   c. Don’t know

14. (Ask only to people who answered b) at question #13) To what extent are the activities funded by the MENA MDTF grant relevant to the program to which they are attached?
   a. Minimally
   b. Partially
   c. Substantially
   d. Fully
   e. Don’t know/no opinion
   i. Redirect to this question if responded a) or b) at question #14, optional: what are the main factors explaining why the activities did not contribute to achieving the objectives set in the program to which they are attached? ______________

15. (Ask only to people who answered b) at question #13 and b) to question #10) To what extent has the implementation of the activities funded by the MENA MDTF grant contributed to achieving the objectives set in the program to which they are attached?
   a. Minimally
   b. Partially
   c. Substantially
   d. Fully
   e. Don’t know/no opinion
   i. Redirect to this question if responded a) or b) at question #15, optional: what are the main factors explaining why the activities did not contribute to achieving the objectives set in the program to which they are attached? ______________

16. Regarding the outputs of the activities funded by the MDTF, have these activities (Please select all that apply):
   a. Produced analytical products (policy notes, survey work, evaluations, reports)
   b. Produced knowledge sharing and dialogue events
   c. Supported Technical Assistance activities?
   d. Have somewhat influenced policies?
   e. Benefited vulnerable populations (youth, women, refugees, people in lagging regions, conflict-affected people).
   f. None of the above
17. Please indicate whether the activities funded by the MENA MDTF grant:
   a. Were targeted to specific and well-identified needs
      i. Minimally
      ii. Partially
      iii. Substantially
      iv. Fully
      v. Don’t know/no opinion
   b. Could have been financed by another source of funding
      i. No
      ii. Yes
      iii. Don’t know
           1. (Redirect to this question if responded ii) at question #17b) If so, which one: _________

18. (Ask to people who answered a) in question #4) To what extent the call for proposals and the grant selection process provided information that was specific and clear enough to allow your team to prepare a competitive proposal.
   i. Minimally
   ii. Partially
   iii. Substantially
   iv. Fully
   v. Don’t know/no opinion

19. Are there any comments or recommendations you would like to make regarding the bidding process with the MENA MDTF? Optional question

20. Are there any comments or recommendations you would like to make regarding the MENA MDTF reporting process? Optional question

21. Are there any comments or recommendations you would like to make regarding the MENA MDTF in general? Optional question
## Appendix IV  List of Interviewees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAME</th>
<th>POSITION</th>
<th>ORGANIZATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abdelkrim Omri</td>
<td>Road Specialist</td>
<td>Tunisia’s Directorate-General for Highways</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abderrahim Fraiji</td>
<td>Senior Operations Officer</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afeef Haddad</td>
<td>Deputy to the Director, Maghreb and Malta, Country Program Coordinator for Maghreb</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agnes Said</td>
<td>Consultant</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmed Musbah Elsadig</td>
<td>Senior Partnership Specialist</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amal Talbi</td>
<td>Professional Water Resources and Supply Expert</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carlos Alberto Lopez</td>
<td>Senior Oil and Gas Specialist</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Claire Azzabi</td>
<td>Decentralization Specialist - Consultant</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Claire Kfouri</td>
<td>Country Program Coordinator for Mashreq Countries</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denise Kassab</td>
<td>Program Coordinator, Consultant, MENA MDTF</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elisabeth Sedmik</td>
<td>Analyst at MENA Education Global Practice</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faizaa Fatima</td>
<td>Social Development Consultant</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fatma Marrakchi Charfi</td>
<td>Senior Counselor</td>
<td>Tunisia’s Ministry of Great Reforms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fernando Torres</td>
<td>Senior Health Economist</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frank Bousquet</td>
<td>Senior Director for Fragility, Conflict, Violence and Forced Displacement</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friederike Rother</td>
<td>Senior Social Protection Specialist</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghassan Al Khoja</td>
<td>Senior Operations Officer</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harun Onder</td>
<td>Senior Economist</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ines Zaghdoudi</td>
<td>Deputy Director, Financing Division</td>
<td>Caisse des prêts et de soutien des collectivités locales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leila Triki</td>
<td>Dean of Mediterranean School of Business - Tunis</td>
<td>Mediterranean School of Business - Tunis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manal Quota</td>
<td>Education Specialist</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marion Magali Daull</td>
<td>Public Sector Consultant</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAME</td>
<td>POSITION</td>
<td>ORGANIZATION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May Blackburn</td>
<td>Head of North Africa Regional Fund</td>
<td>UK DFID / FCO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael Drabble</td>
<td>Senior Education Specialist</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moez Ben Tahar</td>
<td>Professor at MSB-Tunis</td>
<td>Mediterranean School of Business-Tunis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mohammed Guesmi</td>
<td>Transportation Specialist</td>
<td>Tunisia’s Directorate-General for Highways</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mourad Hamrouni</td>
<td>Road Specialist</td>
<td>Tunisia’s Directorate-General for Highways</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Noura Bakkour</td>
<td>Project manager for the Executive Component</td>
<td>Mediterranean School of Business - Tunis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Olivier Lavinal</td>
<td>Former Program Manager MENA MDTF</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Raja Rehan Arshad</td>
<td>Lead Disaster Risk Management Specialist</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Renaud Seligmann</td>
<td>Practice Manager, Governance Global Practice</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rene Leon Solano</td>
<td>Senior Social Protection Specialist</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richard Abdulnour</td>
<td>Special Assistant to the Regional Vice-President for MENA, current Program Manager, MENA MDTF</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ridah Ghodhbane</td>
<td>Director of Project Management Unit, Road Transport Corridors Modernization Project</td>
<td>Tunisia’s Ministry of Habitat Equipment and Land Planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saloua Triki</td>
<td>Consultant</td>
<td>BTE Ingénierie</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sam Fell</td>
<td>Regional Economic Advisor</td>
<td>UK DFID/FCO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shantayanan Devarajan</td>
<td>Former Chief Economist for MENA</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simon O’Meally</td>
<td>Senior Public Sector Specialist</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suvi Sipila</td>
<td>Programme Officer</td>
<td>Finland’s Ministry of Foreign Relations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Takahiro Hasumi</td>
<td>Junior Professional Officer</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tarek Houari</td>
<td>Data collection Specialist</td>
<td>Tunisia’s Directorate-General for Highways</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thomas Djurhuus</td>
<td>Lead Partnership Specialist</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tiina Kajakoski</td>
<td>Desk Officer</td>
<td>Finland’s Ministry of Foreign Relations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wahid Kraiime</td>
<td>Decentralization Specialist Consultant</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yogita Mumssen</td>
<td>Senior Infrastructure Specialist</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### 2nd Cycle Activities and TTLs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ACTIVITY NAME</th>
<th>TTL</th>
<th>EMAIL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jordan on-the-Job Program</td>
<td>Friedericke Uta Rother</td>
<td><a href="mailto:frother@worldbank.org">frother@worldbank.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transforming the Road Sector in Tunisia</td>
<td>Andrew Losos</td>
<td><a href="mailto:alosos@worldbank.org">alosos@worldbank.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catalyzing the Private Sector Role in Recovery and Reconstruction in Yemen</td>
<td>Sami Sofan</td>
<td><a href="mailto:sssofan@worldbank.org">sssofan@worldbank.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MENA Regional Youth Platform</td>
<td>Olivier Lavinal/ Tobias Lechtenfeld</td>
<td><a href="mailto:tlechtenfeld@worldbank.org">tlechtenfeld@worldbank.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support to Deepening Decentralization and Improving Inclusion in Tunisia</td>
<td>Ayah Mahgoub, Salim Rouhana</td>
<td><a href="mailto:srouhana@worldbank.org">srouhana@worldbank.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TA for Design of an Incremental Home Improvement Program in Djibouti</td>
<td>Alexandra Le Courtois</td>
<td><a href="mailto:alecourtois@worldbank.org">alecourtois@worldbank.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding Child and Adolescent Skills Development in Tunisia</td>
<td>Manal Quota, Samira Nikaein Towfighian</td>
<td><a href="mailto:mquota@worldbank.org">mquota@worldbank.org</a>; <a href="mailto:snikaien@worldbank.org">snikaien@worldbank.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women Economic Empowerment - EmpowerHer Maghreb</td>
<td>Aef Haddad</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ahhaddad@worldbank.org">ahhaddad@worldbank.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developing Innovative Practices for Improving Social Cohesion between Lebanese and Syrian Refugees Living in Host Communities</td>
<td>Rene Antonio Solano</td>
<td><a href="mailto:rleonsolano@worldbank.org">rleonsolano@worldbank.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women and Jobs for an Inclusive Labor Market in KRG: A Pilot Program</td>
<td>Ghassan Alkhoja</td>
<td><a href="mailto:galkhoja@worldbank.org">galkhoja@worldbank.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Addressing Health Needs of Syrian Refugees</td>
<td>Fernando Torres</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ferxmont@worldbank.org">ferxmont@worldbank.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water Scarce Cities Initiative</td>
<td>Amal Talbi</td>
<td><a href="mailto:atalbi@worldbank.org">atalbi@worldbank.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>World Development Report 2018 Regional Events</td>
<td>Lianqin Wang</td>
<td><a href="mailto:lwang4@worldbank.org">lwang4@worldbank.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Household Expenditure and Income Survey (HEIS) TA 2017/2018</td>
<td>Nethra Palaniswamy</td>
<td><a href="mailto:npalaniswamy@worldbank.org">npalaniswamy@worldbank.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting the Implementation of Key Economic Reforms in Tunisia: Thinking and Working Adaptively</td>
<td>Simon O’Meally/ Lydia Habhab</td>
<td><a href="mailto:lhabhab@worldbank.org">lhabhab@worldbank.org</a>; <a href="mailto:someally@worldbank.org">someally@worldbank.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic Analysis of Refugee Returns in Syria (Analytical Roadmap)</td>
<td>Harun Onder</td>
<td><a href="mailto:honder@worldbank.org">honder@worldbank.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Libya Preparation of Emergency Electricity Supply Improvement</td>
<td>Mikul Bhatia; Samira Elkhamlich</td>
<td><a href="mailto:selkhamlich@worldbank.org">selkhamlich@worldbank.org</a>; <a href="mailto:mbhatia2@worldbank.org">mbhatia2@worldbank.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACTIVITY NAME</td>
<td>TTL</td>
<td>EMAIL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iraq Natural Gas Market Framework TA</td>
<td>Carlos Alberto Lopez</td>
<td><a href="mailto:clopezq@worldbank.org">clopezq@worldbank.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iraq Emergency Housing Reconstruction and DNA</td>
<td>Ibrahim Dajani/ Raja Arshad</td>
<td><a href="mailto:idajani@worldbank.org">idajani@worldbank.org</a>; <a href="mailto:ranshad@worldbank.org">ranshad@worldbank.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iraq Education Development Support Operation</td>
<td>Manal Quota, Pierre Kamano</td>
<td><a href="mailto:mquota@worldbank.org">mquota@worldbank.org</a>; <a href="mailto:pkamano@worldbank.org">pkamano@worldbank.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TA on Peacebuilding, Security and Development in Iraq</td>
<td>Abderrahim Fraiji</td>
<td><a href="mailto:afrajii@worldbank.org">afrajii@worldbank.org</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix V Bibliography


The World Bank. (s.d.). 1st and 2nd Cycle Recipients MENA MDTF.


The World Bank. (s.d.). MDTF Master Data-MAIN.