

Rated Criteria Examples and Evaluation Approach

From September 1, 2023, the use of Rated Criteria will be the default approach for most international procurements. Combined with price and life cycle cost formulas, Rated Criteria provide a truer assessment of value that focuses on quality, sustainability, and other key criteria.

To support the introduction of the mandatory use of Rated Criteria the Bank has issued updated [Evaluating Bids and Proposals](#) Guidance, rolled out global training and is developing an e-learning program.

This document is part two of a two document series;

- Document One – **Rated Criteria Examples**
 - Provides examples of Rated Criteria that can be used as starting points when developing Rated Criteria to be used in World Bank-funded projects. These examples should be adapted and tailored as needed to address the specifics of the projects.
- Document Two – **Rated Criteria Examples and Evaluation Approach**
 - Provides examples of Rated Criteria found in document one (Rated Criteria Examples) with additional information regarding what to look for when evaluating the Rated Criteria. Document two only has a selection of the Rated Criteria found in document 1, these will be updated to cover a wider range of Rated Criteria in the future. The Rated Criteria numbers in these documents correlate.

When identifying Rated Criteria, it is good practice to minimize the number of criteria so that focus can be brought to the factors that enable differentiation between Bids/Proposals. Rated Criteria should be project specific and representative of the critical issues and risks that the procurement is seeking to address, and which have been identified in the PPSD.

The information / evidence that is required to be submitted by each Bidder, evaluation methodology and associated weightings should be clearly set out in the Procurement Documents. Specific examples of Rated Criteria are provided for each of the following subject areas:

- Methodology/Work Plan
- Health and Safety
- Performance
- Capacity
- Functionality
- Project Team / Key Personnel
- Sustainability
- Net Zero / Carbon Reduction
- Supply Chain Management
- Cybersecurity

These examples will be updated regularly and posted on the Bank website.

Examples only for illustrative purposes

Tuesday, July 11, 2023

Version 2

Copyright © 2023 The World Bank 1818 H Street NW

Washington DC 20433

Telephone: 202-473-1000

Internet: www.worldbank.org

Disclaimer

This work is a product of the staff of The World Bank. The findings, interpretations, and conclusions expressed in this work do not necessarily reflect the views of the World Bank, its Board of Executive Directors, or the governments they represent.

Rights and Permissions

The material in this work is subject to copyright. Because the World Bank encourages dissemination of its knowledge, this work may be reproduced, in whole or in part, for noncommercial purposes as long as full attribution to this work is given. Any queries on rights and licenses, including subsidiary rights, should be addressed to:

Office of the Publisher

The World Bank

1818 H Street NW Washington, DC 20433 USA

Fax: 202-522-2422

1. Methodology/Work Plan

Theme	#	Rated Criteria Title	Description (of evidence to be submitted)	What to Evaluate
Works	1.1	Understanding of specific project requirements and proposed approach	Detail how you have taken into account the specific project requirements (detailed below), and how they will affect the delivery of the project. If necessary, include risk register for specific project requirements. - <i>(Please insert site specific requirements (e.g., the effects of noise and air pollution on surrounding areas))</i> Key requirements that are causing a risk to the critical path should be noted, with minimum requirements of; - Describing the risk - Stating the effects, the Risk has on the project - Develop a possible mitigation of the risk	Has the contractor / bidder provided: - Key specific project requirements identified within the procurement documents. - An explanation of how the requirements will affect the delivery of the project and detailed where on the critical path will be affected. - Risks to the critical path including effective proposals for mitigation of those risks.

2. Health and Safety

Theme	#	Rated Criteria Title	Description (of evidence to be submitted)	What to Evaluate
Works	2.3	Health and safety management	<p>Provide details of how you will manage health and safety risks, your training proposals and provide a copy of the Health and Safety Management Plan and details of the persons who will be responsible for health and safety on site during the project, including details of their experience managing similar risks.</p> <p>As a minimum the Health and Safety Management Plan should include the following details;</p> <p>Site Details</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Site Location - Site Induction Details - Location of Health and Safety Kits - Incident Reporting Details - Welfare Provisions <p>Persons Responsible</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Nominated Health and Safety Manager (management team) - Construction Management Plan - Site Foreman - Site First Aider(s) <p>The Health and Safety Management Manual.</p>	<p>Has the contractor / bidder:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Adequately explained how they will manage the health and safety risks for the project. - Provided a technically sufficient Health and Safety Management Manual. - Identified responsible persons with the right experience and expertise to manage the project’s health and safety risks.

3. Performance

Theme	#	Rated Criteria Title	Description (of evidence to be submitted)	What to Evaluate
Works	3.2	Quality management systems	Provide details on Quality Management Systems you currently have in place and would plan on using throughout the project lifecycle. Please also provide information on any team member with quality management qualifications and their role and responsibilities for quality management on the project. Also, evidence of current quality management certification.	Has the contractor / bidder: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Produced a technically adequate quality management system proposal. - Produced any valid certification or other evidence that they have been awarded and work towards, such as an ISO certification. - Adequately explained how these quality management systems will be used and affect the project. - Provided details of team members in charge of the quality management system and evidence of their expertise and experience such that they can ensure that a quality management system can be implemented for the project.

4. Capacity

Theme	#	Rated Criteria Title	Description (of evidence to be submitted)	What to Evaluate
Works	4.1	Current capacity of company	<p>With an understanding of the project and desired timeframes, we would like to understand your capacity to deliver. Examples of how you can show this capacity can include;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Current Workloads - Competing projects - expected finish date and managing any overlaps in terms of resource - Contracts in the pipeline but not yet awarded - Projects in negotiation and anticipated date of decision; and - Size and scale of other projects looking to be awarded in terms of percentage of turnover <p>Please include additional information to tell us about what resources you have available to deliver the Project being procured for(including plant, equipment, special equipment, processes or other arrangements you have that you think is relevant to the Project.)</p>	<p>Has the contractor / bidder:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Displayed a clear understanding of the desired timeframes and workload the project will require. - Adequately detailed the current projects they are working on and how any overlaps will be managed. - Completion dates for those current projects and when their project teams will be available to start the new project. - Contracts they have in their pipeline that may not yet be awarded, which they may take on in the near future that could overlap with the Client's project. - Projects they are currently negotiating; are there other large projects they are considering taking on that may take resource away from this project. - Details of the size and scale of other projects they are currently working on / in the pipeline, in percentage of turnover. - Adequately detailed resources they have access to or will have access to deliver the project including; plant / equipment, specialized sector equipment, specific processes that may enhance efficiency or other relevant resources that will help efficient delivery of the project.

5. Functionality

Theme	#	Rated Criteria Title	Description (of evidence to be submitted)	What to Evaluate
Works	5.2	Detail construction materials that will enhance final product (value engineering)	<p>List the materials that you plan to use for the project and how they will add value to the project and enhance the final usability and quality of finish for the final product.</p> <p>Depending on the stage the project is at, if the designs are not yet finalized, the contractor may suggest potential design and materials to enhance performance, efficiency, speed of construction, reliability, safety and costing. If the designs have been developed the contractor can state changes in materials that may be used during the project to create efficiency or reduce project costs.</p> <p><i>For example,</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Using renewable energy sources - Using recycled concrete to reduce the amount of Carbon used for the project - Energy efficient windows to help normalize the inside temperature of the building 	<p>Has the contractor / bidder:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Provided specific details of value engineering that have the potential to take place throughout the project. - Proposed changes to the project timeline in order to shorten the project timeline overall. - Proposed any changes to the site designs to enhance safety. - Proposed any changes to the project design to enhance reliability.

7. Sustainability

Theme	#	Rated Criteria Title	Description (of evidence to be submitted)	What to Evaluate
Works	7.4	Verification of recycled content	<p>Identify what construction materials will be used on the project.</p> <p>List out the recycled construction materials that the bidder intends to use.</p> <p>Describe how you will verify claims of recycled material being brought onto site for use in the project. Also provide evidence of where and how this has worked on similar projects.</p>	<p>Has the contractor / bidder:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Provided an adequate description of the verification system that will be in place. This should include: information from supplier(s) of the construction products used, mass balance calculations supported by batch testing results, delivery documentation, factory production control documentation and / or third-party inspection reports.
Works	7.6	Waste elimination	<p>Please provide a site waste management plan, if this is required in the specifications. The plan should include systems for the separate collection of materials on-site for re-use, recycling, and other forms of recovery, and proper disposal of different types of waste (hazardous v. non-hazardous). It should encompass:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Construction products that form main building elements, including timber, glass, metal, brick, ceramics, concrete and inert waste, as well as associated packaging materials. - Construction products that form part of the building fit-out, including flooring, ceiling tiles, plaster and gypsum panels, plastic profiles and insulation materials, as well as associated packaging materials. - A bill of materials with estimates for waste arisings based on good practices. - Estimates of the % re-use potential based on separate collection during the construction process. - An estimation of the % recycling and recovery potential based on separate collection. - A monitoring and accounting system for waste arisings and to track the destination of consignments of waste. 	<p>Has the contractor / bidder:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Provided a credible site waste management plan which includes systems for the separate collection of materials on-site for re-use, recycling, and other forms of recovery. <p>Does the plan also include credible:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A bill of materials with estimates for waste arisings based on good practices. - Estimates of the % re-use potential based on separate collection during the construction process. - An estimation of the % recycling and recovery potential based on separate collection. - An adequate system for monitoring and accounting for waste arisings and for tracking the destination of consignments of waste.

8. Net Zero / Carbon Reduction

Theme	#	Rated Criteria Title	Description (of evidence to be submitted)	What to evaluate
Works	8.4	Carbon reduction initiatives	<p>Provide detail on carbon reduction initiatives you would propose for (i) the construction phase of the project; and (ii) (where possible) the life cycle of the project. We are particularly interested in innovated ideas to reduce carbon. Please also include details of how you will monitor, verify and evaluate any carbon reduction initiatives.</p> <p>Provide details of your current corporate carbon initiatives including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Any carbon accounting exercise undertaken with regards to your current carbon emissions, and which areas of your operations/other projects the emissions are coming from; - Any processes planned or undertaken to reduce those carbon emissions and, where they are in place, details of progress / success; and - Any second stage carbon reduction strategies in development. 	<p>Has the contractor / bidder:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Provided a credible proposal for reducing carbon emissions during the construction of the project. - Provided a credible proposal for monitoring and evaluation of their carbon reduction proposals. - Identified innovative ways to reduce carbon (i) during the construction phase; and (ii) during the life cycle of the project. - Provided adequate and credible evidence of their corporate commitment to carbon reduction.

9. Supply Chain Management

Theme	#	Rated Criteria Title	Description (of evidence to be submitted)	What to evaluate
Works	9.1	Supply chain management process/approach	Describe your process / approach to supply chain risk management. This should include any major risks you have identified in your supply chain and how they are being addressed.	Has the contractor / bidder: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Adequately described their approach to supply chain risk management. - Identified the major supply chain risks. - Described credible strategies to mitigate the identified risks (This should include an evaluation of each risk's likelihood of occurrence and severity of impact and the mitigating action.) - Provided a credible disaster response plan. - Identified credible personnel with relevant experience and expertise to manage supply chain risks.
			<p>Please provide a copy of your disaster response plan (if available).</p> <p>Please name the persons responsible for supply chain management and provide a copy of their CVs.</p>	
Works	9.2	Code of conduct	Provide your Supplier/Contractor code of conduct.	Has the contractor / bidder: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Provided a credible Code of Conduct that is fit for purpose for the particular project and its location.
Works	9.3	Supplier/contractor performance	Describe how you evaluate, select, and manage your Suppliers/Contractors.	Has the contractor / bidder: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Described a credible process for supplier / contractor selection and management?
			It should include details of KPIs, procedures for quality inspection, and processes for corrective actions. If you have a preferred Supplier/Contractor list please provide a copy and details of any inclusion criteria.	

Works	9.4	Supplier/Contractor environmental and social performance	<p>Describe the processes you have in place to assess and monitor the environmental and social performance and impact of your Suppliers/Sub-contractors.</p> <p>Describe how you develop and update these processes.</p> <p>The process should include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Your ES policy or statement. - Governance structures, strategies, risk management protocols, metrics and targets and evidence of how these are effectively cascaded through your Suppliers/Subcontractors. - Procedures for reporting, inspections and audits. 	<p>Has the contractor / bidder:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Adequately and clearly described and provided evidence to show: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) the environmental and social due diligence that they have undertaken. (ii) how it requires Suppliers/Subcontractors to meet the relevant requirements, (iii) how it verifies that these requirements are met during contract implementation; (iv) the actions taken in cases of non-compliance. (v) how audits are conducted and the consequences from the findings of audit (Details provided should include timing of audits, who conducts them, whether they are independent, what is audited, whether the audits are announced or not, and what is done if requirements / obligations are not met).
-------	-----	--	--	--

Appendix 1

Bibliography

- Auckland District Health Board RFP (New Zealand)
- Autodesk Construction Cloud, Essential Construction KPIs to Improve Profits and Productivity
- Department for Environment Food and Rural Affairs, London 2012 Olympic and Paralympic Games. The Legacy: Sustainable Procurement for Construction Projects (United Kingdom)
- Environmental Agency (Tender Evaluation Model, Tidal Barrier Works) (United Kingdom)
- Environmental Agency, Tender Evaluation Model (United Kingdom)
- Gallagher, Interesting Examples of Evaluation Criteria and Scoring
- Generic Component Configuration Definition Template – KPI's
- Institute of Civil Engineers, Procurement and Contract Guidance on Delivering Net-Zero Carbon
- Sustainability Victoria, Evaluation Document for Request for Tenders (Australia)
- Waitemata District Health Board (TŌTARA HAUMARU RFT) (New Zealand)
- Waitemata District Health Board, Request For Tender (New Zealand)
- World Bank (Government of Liberia Works RFP 2)
- World Bank (Government of Liberia Works RFP)
- World Bank (Republic of Angola RFP)