

Rated Criteria Examples

From September 1, 2023, the use of Rated Criteria will be the default approach for most international procurements. Combined with price and life cycle cost formulas, Rated Criteria provide a truer assessment of value that focuses on quality, sustainability, and other key criteria.

To support the introduction of the mandatory use of Rated Criteria the Bank has issued updated [Evaluating Bids and Proposals](#) Guidance, rolled out global training and is developing an e-learning program.

This document is part one of a two document series;

- Document One – **Rated Criteria Examples**
 - Provides examples of Rated Criteria that can be used as starting points when developing Rated Criteria to be used in World Bank-funded projects. These examples should be adapted and tailored as needed to address the specifics of the projects.
- Document Two – **Rated Criteria Examples and Evaluation Approach**
 - Provides examples of Rated Criteria found in document one (Rated Criteria Examples) with additional information regarding what to look for when evaluating the Rated Criteria. Document two only has a selection of the Rated Criteria found in document 1, these will be updated to cover a wider range of Rated Criteria in the future. The Rated Criteria numbers in these documents correlate.

When identifying Rated Criteria, it is good practice to minimize the number of criteria so that focus can be brought to the factors that enable differentiation between Bids/Proposals. Rated Criteria should be project specific and representative of the critical issues and risks that the procurement is seeking to address, and which have been identified in the PPSD.

The information / evidence that is required to be submitted by each Bidder, evaluation methodology and associated weightings should be clearly set out in the Procurement Documents. Specific examples of Rated Criteria are provided for each of the following subject areas:

- Methodology/Work Plan
- Health and Safety
- Performance
- Capacity
- Functionality
- Project Team / Key Personnel
- Sustainability
- Net Zero / Carbon Reduction
- Supply Chain Management
- Cybersecurity

These examples will be updated regularly and posted on the Bank website.

Examples only for illustrative purposes

Monday, July 10, 2023

Version 2

Copyright © 2023 The World Bank 1818 H Street NW

Washington DC 20433

Telephone: 202-473-1000

Internet: www.worldbank.org

Disclaimer

This work is a product of the staff of The World Bank. The findings, interpretations, and conclusions expressed in this work do not necessarily reflect the views of the World Bank, its Board of Executive Directors, or the governments they represent.

Rights and Permissions

The material in this work is subject to copyright. Because the World Bank encourages dissemination of its knowledge, this work may be reproduced, in whole or in part, for noncommercial purposes as long as full attribution to this work is given. Any queries on rights and licenses, including subsidiary rights, should be addressed to:

Office of the Publisher

The World Bank

1818 H Street NW Washington, DC 20433 USA

Fax: 202-522-2422

1. Methodology/Work Plan

Theme	#	Rated Criteria Title	Description (of evidence to be submitted)
Works	1.1	Understanding of specific project requirements and proposed approach	<p>Detail how you have taken into account the specific project requirements (detailed below), and how they will affect the delivery of the project. If necessary, include risk register for specific project requirements. - <i>(Please insert site specific requirements (e.g., the effects of noise and air pollution on surrounding areas))</i></p> <p>Key requirements that are causing a risk to the critical path should be noted, with minimum requirements of;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Describing the risk. - Stating the effects, the Risk has on the project. - Develop a possible mitigation of the risk.
Works	1.2	Construction management strategy, construction methodology	<p>Provide a construction methodology that addresses at least the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Site Establishment Plan; - Site Hoarding plans; - Site access and traffic management plans; - Drainage plans and laydown areas; - Temporary works and overall staging plans; - Noise, dust and vibration controls; - Bulk excavation and removal of earthworks from site; - Methodology for dealing with Asbestos; and - Testing and disposal of contaminated material. <p>If you have other points which you think are important, please identify those too (separately to the above).</p>
Works	1.3	Method statement for key construction activities	<p>Detail a method statement for the key construction activities that will follow the critical path. (as a minimum we expect to see the critical path of the project, detailed with approximate time scales for each activity) - <i>(If appropriate please give examples of a brief sequence of the critical path for the suppliers to work off)</i></p>
Water	1.4	Pipeline design	Identify from the details that you have been given the distribution pipeline location and routing for the project.
Water	1.5	Pipe laying	Describe in detail your proposed process to lay the water pipes following the project details that you have received. Please detail the machinery and access you will use to complete the project as you have planned.
Water	1.6	Pipe welding and joining	Detail your proposed water pipe welding and joining methods, as well as where you plan on welding/joining the pipes. Please note the access that will be needed.
Water	1.7	Household connections	State the methodology of the proposed household connections.
Works	1.8	Disposal of non-hazardous materials	State your methodology for disposing of non-hazardous material and where it will be disposed of.
Works	1.90	Disposal of hazardous material	State your methodology for disposing of hazardous material and where it will be disposed of.
Works	1.10	Disposal of distributed soil	State your methodology for removing and disposing of soil. Please state if you plan on recycling the soil. If you plan to dispose of the soil, please provide details of the disposal methodology.

Works	1.11	Code of conduct	Provide your employee code of conduct.
Works	1.12	Details of project management tools in place	Provide details of project management software's that you will be using.
Works	1.13	Risk assessment (Management Plan	Produce a detailed risk management plan which takes into account the risks and mitigations that you have identified following a risk assessment.
Works	1.1	Key performance indicators	Describe key performance indicators that you have successfully used on past projects and describe the KPIs you propose should be used for this project.
Works	1.15	Disruption management plan	Provide copies of any disruption management plans you can foresee needing for this project. Where available, provide copies of past disruption management plans you have used, describe when you have had to implement them and any lessons learnt.
Works	1.16	Key equipment strategy	Provide details of the key equipment strategy that you have in place.
Works	1.17	Specialist equipment used	Provide a list of all of the specialized equipment that will be needed to complete this project and describe why it is needed.
Works	1.18	Facilitates proposed	Detail any site facilities that will be needed.
Works	1.19	Details of planned division of work into subcontractors	Detail how you will divide work between subcontractors and describe why you have chosen each subcontractor for their specific job.
Works	1.20	Reporting and recording systems used	Provide details of reporting and recording systems that you will use.
Works	1.21	Alignment of timeline with proposed schedule	Provide your proposed work program and schedule against the project details.



2. Health and Safety

Theme	#	Rated Criteria Title	Description (of evidence to be submitted)
Works	2.1	Reporting method for site registration and accounting for people on the site at any one time	Provide your proposed strategy for accounting for people that are on site and provide a copy of the site register that will be used, details of where the site register will be kept, and who will be responsible for maintaining it.
Works	2.2	Staff induction	Describe how the staff induction for the site will be undertaken and provide a copy of the staff induction program/plan.
Works	2.3	Health and safety management plan	<p>Provide details of how you will manage health and safety risks, your training proposals and provide a copy of the Health and Safety Management Plan and details of the persons who will be responsible for health and safety on site during the project, including details of their experience managing similar risks.</p> <p>As a minimum the Health and Safety Management Plan should include the following details;</p> <p>Site Details</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Site Location - Site Induction Details - Location of Health and Safety Kits - Incident Reporting Details - Welfare Provisions <p>Persons Responsible</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Nominated Health and Safety Manager (management team) - Construction Management Plan - Site Foreman - Site First Aider(s) <p>A Health and Safety Management Manual.</p>
Works	2.4	Health and safety training	Provide details of any health and safety training that staff have to undertake, when this is undertaken and how often it will be undertaken during the lifetime of the project.
Works	2.5	Incident response plans	Please provide a copy of your Incident Response Plan. Where available, please provide details and examples of incident response plans that have been used on similar past projects, provide examples of where they have had to be used and the lessons learnt.
Works	2.6	Health and safety promotion	Provide examples of health and safety promotion campaigns that have been used on similar past projects and detail any health and safety campaigns proposed for this project.

Works	2.7	Additional machinery and equipment operators' qualifications to be undertaken to work on site	Detail any qualifications machinery and equipment operators need to be able to work on this project.
Works	2.8	OHS management systems	Detail occupational health and safety management systems used during projects you run.

3. Performance

Theme	#	Rated Criteria Title	Description (of evidence to be submitted)
Works	3.1	References for equivalent size and type of projects and services	<p><i>(If References have not been asked for as pre-qualification, please use option 1. If references have been asked for as pre-qualification, please use option 2.)</i></p> <p>Option 1. Please detailed history of similar projects in terms of size and value that you have completed, with documented performance records. Please provide specific detail on number of late days, budget overrun etc. Please also provide references for each of those projects.</p> <p>Option 2. References that have been collected as pre-qualification will not be rated.</p>
Works	3.2	Quality management systems	Provide details on Quality Management Systems you currently have in place and would plan on using throughout the project lifecycle. Please also provide information on any team member with quality management qualifications and their role and responsibilities for quality management on the project. Also, evidence of current quality management certification.
Works	3.3	To what extent the proposal adds value in terms of functionality	When producing your proposal, please state to what extent your proposal will add value to the project in terms of functionality. This is your opportunity to let us know of any potential changes you would make to the project and reasoning behind these changes.

4. Capacity

Theme	#	Rated Criteria Title	Description (of evidence to be submitted)
Works	4.1	Current capacity of company	<p>With an understanding of the project and desired timeframes, we would like to understand your capacity to deliver. Examples of how you can show this capacity can include;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Current Workloads - Competing projects - expected finish date and managing any overlaps in terms of resource - Contracts in the pipeline but not yet awarded - Projects in negotiation and anticipated date of decision; and - Size and scale of other projects looking to be awarded in terms of percentage of turnover <p>Please include additional information to tell us about what resources you have available to deliver the Project being procured for(including plant, equipment, special equipment, processes or other arrangements you have that you think is relevant to the Project.)</p>

5. Functionality

Theme	#	Rated Criteria Title	Description (of evidence to be submitted)
Works	5.1	To what extent does the Proposal enhance the quality of the project in terms of the specification	Detail how your proposal will enhance the quality of the final product in terms of the details that have been specified in the specification.
Works	5.2	Detail construction materials that will enhance final product (value engineering)	<p>List the materials that you plan to use for the project and how they will add value to the project and enhance the final usability and quality of finish for the final product.</p> <p>(Depending on the stage the project is at) If the designs are not yet finalized, the contractor may suggest potential design and materials to enhance performance, efficiency, speed of construction, reliability, safety and costing. If the designs have been developed the contractor can state changes in materials that may be used during the project to create efficiency or reduce project costs.</p> <p><i>For example,</i> <i>use renewable energy sources</i> <i>- Using recycled concrete to reduce the amount of Carbon used for the project</i> <i>- Energy efficient windows to help normalize the inside temperature of the building</i></p>
Works	5.3	Durability of construction materials	Detail the durability of proposed construction materials, with an explanation on why they have been used over other materials.
Works	5.4	Innovative processes used	Provide details of any innovative processes that will be used throughout the project.

6. Project Team / Key Personnel

Theme	#	Rated Criteria Title	Description (of evidence to be submitted)
Works	6.1	Team committing to the project	<p>Please complete the “Team Members Information Template” located on page 12. The outline information that is needed is as follows, for the positions stated below;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Position - Name - Qualifications / Educations - Total Experience (years) - Total Experience in similar works (years) <p>In order to deliver this project successfully we believe key members of the Project delivery team will be needed. This include the following;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Project Director - Service Manager - Planner / Scheduler - Design Manager - Senior Quantity Surveyor - Disruption Manager - BIM Manager (if applicable) - Health and Safety Manager - Quality Manager - Construction / Site Manager(s) <p>This list is of the team members we believe will be needed for this project to be successful, however, is not limited to this list. Any other members of the team you would like to detail please add.</p>
Works	6.2	Team's experience	<p>Provide us with the following details for the nominated Key Project Team as above;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Their involvement and role in the delivery of the Works (and if for a limited period, you should note this and on what basis they would be able to step away from the project, and similarly, what would be the basis for someone’s involvement needing to commence); and - Their technical skills and length of experience and their areas of expertise or responsibility (including with you). <p>We would like to understand if the proposed team have experience working on this type of project and if they have worked together in the past on similar successful projects.</p>
Works	6.3	Contract personnel resource schedule	<p>In order to allow us to understand the capacity of the key project team (stated above) detail the capacity, current project workload and planned project workload for the members noted.</p>
Works	6.4	Key personnel resourcing	<p>Please provide a copy of the resourcing plan, and any associated plan to introduce new key personnel to the project if it is necessary. If new members of the key personnel were to join the project whilst the project is ongoing, we would like to know how onboarding new key personnel will take place.</p>

	6.5	Subcontractors and suppliers that will be relied upon for delivery	Please provide your subcontractor team detailing their relevant experience and expertise along with details as to your track record of working together previously. This should include details of how you manage your relationships with others (including for example, your standard forms of contract for sub-contractors). If using specialist subcontractors, we will be looking for clarity in your response on how you will manage this. We want you to demonstrate that you have considered and understand what is needed, and that you will be able to react to the varied needs of the physical works with capable and relevant resource in a manner which is timely, reliable and suitability experienced.
Works	6.6	Key trades	Where any Key Trades have, or propose to have, subcontractors, who will they be? How will they be managed?

7. Sustainability

Theme	#	Rated Criteria Title	Description (of evidence to be submitted)
Works	7.1	Technical capability / past experience of the bidder	Provide verification of sufficient experience in sustainable facility construction Provide comprehensive information verifying their experience, with credible references in the following fields: - Use of building materials produced in a socially responsible manner (e.g.: certified sustainable timber, reconstituted concrete) - Energy efficient construction in accordance with internationally recognized environmentally sustainable standards and that the construction/s has been independently audited and accredited to that standard.
Works	7.2	Use of local labor/ SMEs	It is encouraged to engage and manage suitably skilled/experienced local subcontractors & tradespeople as well as unskilled tradespeople who shall receive skills/trade training during the project. Confirm as a dollar cost the percentage of total allocation for 'subcontractors & trades people' stated above.
Works	7.3	Sustainably sourced materials	It is encouraged to procure local, sustainably sourced materials to be used in the works. Confirm as a dollar cost percentage of total construction value for materials procurement.
Works	7.4	Verification of recycled content	Identify what construction materials will be used on the project. List out the recycled construction materials that the bidder intends to use. Describe how you will verify claims of recycled material being brought onto site for use in the project. Also provide evidence of where and how this has worked on similar projects.
Works	7.5	Waste reduction	Nominate, as a dollar cost percentage of the total construction value, proposed prefabricated elements to be used in the works (and supported with necessary break-up figures).
Works	7.6	Waste elimination	Please provide a site waste management plan. The plan should include systems for the separate collection of materials on-site for re-use, recycling, and other forms of recovery. It should encompass: - Construction products that form main building elements, including timber, glass, metal, brick, ceramics, concrete and inert waste, as well as associated packaging materials - Construction products that form part of the building fit-out, including flooring, ceiling tiles, plaster and gypsum panels, plastic profiles and insulation materials, as well as associated packaging materials - A bill of materials with estimates for waste arisings based on good practices - Estimates of the % re-use potential based on separate collection during the construction process - An estimation of the % recycling and recovery potential based on separate collection - A monitoring and accounting system for waste arisings and to track the destination of consignments of waste.
Works	7.7	Technical capability	Provide verification of sufficient experience in sustainable construction.
Works	7.8	Sustainably sourced materials	Detail the sustainably sourced materials that will be sourced and how they will be sourced.
Works	7.9	Waste reduction	Detail how waste will be reduced.

8. Net Zero / Carbon Reduction

Theme	#	Rated Criteria Title	Description (of evidence to be submitted)
Works	8.1	Net Zero commitment	Provide your current corporate statement of commitment to net zero under the Paris Agreement 2015.
Works	8.2	Net Zero commitments	Please provide details of your corporate proposals for reducing carbon / GHG emissions and how these efforts will be reflected in, and benefit this project.
Works	8.3	Net Zero commitment	Provide your current data covering Scope 1 and 2 carbon emissions and relevant Scope 3 carbon emissions.
Works	8.4	Carbon reduction initiative	<p>Provide detail on carbon reduction initiatives you would propose for (i) the construction phase of the project; and (ii) (where possible) the life cycle of the project. We are particularly interested in innovated ideas to reduce carbon. Please also include details of how you will monitor, verify and evaluate any carbon reduction initiatives.</p> <p>Provide details of your current corporate carbon initiatives including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Any carbon accounting exercise undertaken with regards to your current carbon emissions, and which areas of your operations/other projects the emissions are coming from; - Any processes planned or undertaken to reduce those carbon emissions and, where they are in place, details of progress / success; and - Any second stage carbon reduction strategies in development.
Works	8.5	Carbon reduction targets	Provide detail on progress towards your corporate carbon targets to date.
Works	8.6	Carbon reduction	Provide detail on initiatives, investments, skills and competencies within your organization to address carbon reduction.
Works	8.7	Carbon reduction	Detail the quantification approach that will be used to measure both your own and (where possible) the relevant supply chain carbon emissions throughout the project.
Works	8.8	Supply chain	Describe how the supply chain will be required to engage in the carbon reduction plans for the project.
Works	8.8	Carbon reduction strategy	Provide detail on the carbon reduction strategy you propose for this project.
Works	8.9	Carbon reduction strategy	State who in the project will be involved/ responsible managing your carbon reduction strategy.
Works	8.10	Carbon reduction	Provide contract/project-specific targets set for carbon reduction or aimed at carbon reduction (e.g., a waste reduction target, certain materials to be used).
Works	8.11	Carbon reduction	Detail the projected carbon footprint for the works.
Works	8.12	Carbon reduction opportunities	Describe further carbon reduction opportunities identified beyond the client's specified baseline and reduction target.
Works	8.13	Carbon reduction targets	Detail predicted performance of the proposed works against specified targets.

9. Supply Chain Management

Theme	#	Rated Criteria Title	Description (of evidence to be submitted)
Works	9.1	Supply risk management process/approach,	Describe your process / approach to supply chain risk management. This should include any major risks you have identified in your supply chain and how they are being addressed.
			Please provide a copy of your disaster response plan (if available).
			Please name the persons responsible for supply chain management and provide a copy of their CVs.
			Describe a situation where your supply chain risk management process/ approach helped to prevent or mitigate a disruption in your supply chain.
			The situation chosen should be of considerable magnitude (e.g., not just a small error), and include what strategies were pursued to address the disruption and resume stable operations; the description should also include lessons learned, and what was improved going forward so that similar disruptions will have no or only limited impact in the future.
Works	9.2	Code of conduct	Provide your Supplier/Contractor code of conduct.
Works	9.3	Supplier/contractor performance	Describe how you evaluate, select, and manage your Suppliers/Contractors.
			It should include details of KPIs, procedures for quality inspection, and processes for corrective actions.
			If you have a preferred Supplier/Contractor list please provide a copy and details of any inclusion criteria.
Works	9.4	Supplier/Contractor environmental and social performance	Describe the processes you have in place to assess and monitor the environmental and social performance and impact of your Suppliers/Sub-contractors.
			Describe how you develop and update these processes.
			The process should include: - Your ES policy or statement - Governance structures, strategies, risk management protocols, metrics and targets and evidence of how these are effectively cascaded through your Suppliers/Subcontractors - Procedures for reporting, inspections and audits
Works	9.5	Supply chain visibility	Describe the visibility you have through your supply chain, specifically, until what tier you are able to monitor your supply chain, and what information you are able to obtain.
			Provide the associated supply chain map.
			Describe the approaches and sources you use in obtaining supply chain visibility.

Works	9.6	Proficiency in supply chain risk management	Describe potential SCM risks that could occur in the project and how you would mitigate or manage them.
Works	9.7	SCM competencies of key personnel	Describe key personnel’s experience in managing supply chains of a similar complexity as the supply chain in this project and what their specific SCM role would be for this project.
Works	9.8	Proficiency in delivering against environmental and social objectives	Describe what approaches you would undertake in your supply chain(s) to support the project in achieving its environmental and social goals.

10. Cybersecurity

Theme	#	Rated Criteria Title	Description (of evidence to be submitted)
Works	10.1	Cybersecurity systems	Please state the systems you currently use to protect your cyber security.
Works	10.2	Disaster and recovery	Please detail your backup and recovery systems that are in place.
Works	10.3	Virus attacks	Please detail past virus attacks and how they were dealt with.
Works	10.4	Compatibility	Please detail the IT systems that are currently used so we can determine whether or not they are compatible with systems we currently use.

Annex 1

Bibliography

- Auckland District Health Board RFP
- Autodesk Construction Cloud, Essential Construction KPIs to Improve Profits and Productivity
- Department for Environment Food and Rural Affairs, London 2012 Olympic and Paralympic Games. The Legacy: Sustainable Procurement for Construction Projects
- Environmental Agency (Tender Evaluation Model, Tidal Barrier Works)
- Environmental Agency, Tender Evaluation Model
- Excavation KPIs
- Gallagher, Interesting Examples of Evaluation Criteria and Scoring
- Generic Component Configuration Definition Template – KPI's
- Institute of Civil Engineers, Procurement and Contract Guidance on Delivering Net-Zero Carbon
- Procurement Journey, Selection Criteria
- Sustainability Victoria, Evaluation Document for Request for Tenders
- Waitemata District Health Board (TŌTARA HAUMARU RFT)
- Waitemata District Health Board, Request For Tender
- Webinar Evaluation Matrix
- World Bank (Government of Liberia Works RFP 2)
- World Bank (Government of Liberia Works RFP)
- World Bank (Republic of Angola RFP)