

ABCDE 2023

Structural Transformation and Labour Markets Session

Discussion

Aart Kraay

World Bank Group Deputy Chief Economist

Director of Development Policy, DEC

June 5, 2023

Canuedo and Keller: Capital Embodied Structural Change

- Headlines (for United States 1950-2020)
 - Rate of capital embodied technical change (CETC): $AGR < MAN < SER$
 - Rate of labour productivity growth: $AGR > MAN > SER$
 - Resolution in differing trends in capital share: $AGR \uparrow \downarrow$ $MAN \uparrow \uparrow$ $SER \uparrow$

Canuedo and Keller: Capital Embodied Structural Change

- Headlines (for United States 1950-2020)
 - Rate of capital embodied technical change (CETC): $AGR < MAN < SER$
 - Rate of labour productivity growth: $AGR > MAN > SER$
 - Resolution in differing trends in capital share: $AGR \uparrow \downarrow$ $MAN \uparrow \uparrow$ $SER \uparrow$
- Question 1 (Theory): Role of trade? Matters because core fact on CETC identified through trends in PK/PC

Canuedo and Keller: Capital Embodied Structural Change

- Headlines (for United States 1950-2020)
 - Rate of capital embodied technical change (CETC): $AGR < MAN < SER$
 - Rate of labour productivity growth: $AGR > MAN > SER$
 - Resolution in differing trends in capital share: $AGR \uparrow \downarrow$ $MAN \uparrow \uparrow$ $SER \uparrow$
- Question 1 (Theory): Role of trade? Matters because core fact on CETC identified through trends in PK/PC
- Question 2 (Measurement): Trends in capital shares in agriculture are key. Family farms to factory farms? Land rents?

Canuedo and Keller: Capital Embodied Structural Change

- Headlines (for United States 1950-2020)
 - Rate of capital embodied technical change (CETC): $AGR < MAN < SER$
 - Rate of labour productivity growth: $AGR > MAN > SER$
 - Resolution in differing trends in capital share: $AGR \uparrow \downarrow$ $MAN \uparrow \uparrow$ $SER \uparrow$
- Question 1 (Theory): Role of trade? Matters because core fact on CETC identified through trends in PK/PC
- Question 2 (Measurement): Trends in capital shares in agriculture are key. Family farms to factory farms? Land rents?
- Question 3 (Implications for developing countries): What does this imply for types of capital goods LDCs should import? How does this interact with

Hoekman, Sanfilippo and Tambussi: FDI and Structural Transformation in Africa

- Headlines (for 24 African countries 1990-2020):
 - Granular subnational data on FDI and labour market outcomes
 - FDI shifts increases employment, shifts employment to modern sectors, and shifts jobs and to higher skills (on impact only)

Hoekman, Sanfilippo and Tambussi: FDI and Structural Transformation in Africa

- Headlines (for 24 African countries 1990-2020):
 - Granular subnational data on FDI and labour market outcomes
 - FDI shifts increases employment, shifts employment to modern sectors, and shifts jobs and to higher skills (on impact only)
- Question 1: Structural transformation or just geographical reallocation? Are there aggregate effects or does this just reflect shuffling of jobs from one region to another within a country?

Hoekman, Sanfilippo and Tambussi: FDI and Structural Transformation in Africa

- Headlines (for 24 African countries 1990-2020):
 - Granular subnational data on FDI and labour market outcomes
 - FDI shifts increases employment, shifts employment to modern sectors, and shifts jobs and to higher skills (on impact only)
- Question 1: Structural transformation or just geographical reallocation? Are there aggregate effects or does this just reflect shuffling of jobs from one region to another within a country?
- Question 2: Identification – are minimal pre-trends enough? FDI selecting into “dynamic” regions? Effects of policies to attract FDI?

Hoekman, Sanfilippo and Tambussi: FDI and Structural Transformation in Africa

- Headlines (for 24 African countries 1990-2020):
 - Granular subnational data on FDI and labour market outcomes
 - FDI shifts increases employment, shifts employment to modern sectors, and shifts jobs and to higher skills (on impact only)
- Question 1: Structural transformation or just geographical reallocation? Are there aggregate effects or does this just reflect shuffling of jobs from one region to another within a country?
- Question 2: Identification – are minimal pre-trends enough? FDI selecting into “dynamic” regions? Effects of policies to attract FDI?
- Question 3: Incidence versus characteristics of FDI? Is volume of FDI macroeconomically significant? Types of capital (see previous paper)?

Chipunklar and Kleineberg: Gender Barriers, Structural Transformation and Economic Development

- Headlines (for 91 countries + 6 countries):
 - Sectoral employment patterns different for men (AGR→IND→SER) and women (AGR→OUT→SER)
 - Women sort into lower-status occupations in services
 - Gender gaps in employment narrow but gaps in pay narrow much less
 - Both gender norms and pay discrimination matter a lot quantitatively

Chipunklar and Kleineberg: Gender Barriers, Structural Transformation and Economic Development

- Headlines (for 91 countries + 6 countries):
 - Sectoral employment patterns different for men (AGR→IND→SER) and women (AGR→OUT→SER)
 - Women sort into lower-status occupations in services
 - Gender gaps in employment narrow but gaps in pay narrow much less
 - Both gender norms and pay discrimination matter a lot quantitatively
- Question 1: Is there more to U-shaped FLFP than middle-income majority-Muslim countries?

Chipunklar and Kleineberg: Gender Barriers, Structural Transformation and Economic Development

- Headlines (for 91 countries + 6 countries):
 - Sectoral employment patterns different for men (AGR→IND→SER) and women (AGR→OUT→SER)
 - Women sort into lower-status occupations in services
 - Gender gaps in employment narrow but gaps in pay narrow much less
 - Both gender norms and pay discrimination matter a lot quantitatively
- Question 1: Is there more to U-shaped FLFP than middle-income majority-Muslim countries?
- Question 2: How do huge differences (changes) in female human capital across countries (over time) factor into the story?

Chipunklar and Kleineberg: Gender Barriers, Structural Transformation and Economic Development

- Headlines (for 91 countries + 6 countries):
 - Sectoral employment patterns different for men (AGR→IND→SER) and women (AGR→OUT→SER)
 - Women sort into lower-status occupations in services
 - Gender gaps in employment narrow but gaps in pay narrow much less
 - Both gender norms and pay discrimination matter a lot quantitatively
- Question 1: Is there more to U-shaped FLFP than middle-income majority-Muslim countries?
- Question 2: How do huge differences (changes) in female human capital across countries (over time) factor into the story?
- Question 3: How to think about sorting into gendered career tracks and the role of policy (e.g. publicly-provided childcare)?

Question Summary

	Canuedo/Keller	Hoekman/Sanfilippo /Tambussi	Chipunklar/ Kleineberg
Q1	Trade?	Transformation or reallocation?	U-shaped FLFP?
Q2	Measuring K- share?	Identification?	Supply of female human capital?
Q3	Implications for developing countries?	Incidence vs type of FDI?	Sorting and policy?