ABCDE 2023

Structural Transformation and Labour Markets Session

Discussion

Aart Kraay
World Bank Group Deputy Chief Economist
Director of Development Policy, DEC

June 5, 2023
Canuedo and Keller: Capital Embodied Structural Change

• Headlines (for United States 1950-2020)
  • Rate of capital embodied technical change (CETC): AGR < MAN < SER
  • Rate of labour productivity growth: AGR > MAN > SER
  • Resolution in differing trends in capital share: AGR↑↓ MAN↑↑ SER ↑
Canuedo and Keller: Capital Embodied Structural Change

• Headlines (for United States 1950-2020)
  - Rate of capital embodied technical change (CETC): AGR < MAN < SER
  - Rate of labour productivity growth: AGR > MAN > SER
  - Resolution in differing trends in capital share: AGR↑↓  MAN↑↑  SER ↑

• Question 1 (Theory): Role of trade? Matters because core fact on CETC identified through trends in PK/PC
Canuedo and Keller: Capital Embodied Structural Change

• Headlines (for United States 1950-2020)
  • Rate of capital embodied technical change (CETC): AGR < MAN < SER
  • Rate of labour productivity growth: AGR > MAN > SER
  • Resolution in differing trends in capital share: AGR↑↓  MAN↑↑  SER ↑

• Question 1 (Theory): Role of trade? Matters because core fact on CETC identified through trends in PK/PC

• Question 2 (Measurement): Trends in capital shares in agriculture are key. Family farms to factory farms? Land rents?
Canuedo and Keller: Capital Embodied Structural Change

• Headlines (for United States 1950-2020)
  • Rate of capital embodied technical change (CETC): AGR < MAN < SER
  • Rate of labour productivity growth: AGR > MAN > SER
  • Resolution in differing trends in capital share: AGR↑↓ MAN↑↑ SER ↑

• **Question 1 (Theory):** Role of trade? Matters because core fact on CETC identified through trends in PK/PC

• **Question 2 (Measurement):** Trends in capital shares in agriculture are key. Family farms to factory farms? Land rents?

• **Question 3 (Implications for developing countries):** What does this imply for types of capital goods LDCs should import? How does this interact with
• Headlines (for 24 African countries 1990-2020):
  • Granular subnational data on FDI and labour market outcomes
  • FDI shifts increases employment, shifts employment to modern sectors, and shifts jobs and to higher skills (on impact only)
Hoekman, Sanfilippo and Tambussi: FDI and Structural Transformation in Africa

• Headlines (for 24 African countries 1990-2020):
  • Granular subnational data on FDI and labour market outcomes
  • FDI shifts increases employment, shifts employment to modern sectors, and shifts jobs and to higher skills (on impact only)

• Question 1: Structural transformation or just geographical reallocation? Are there aggregate effects or does this just reflect shuffling of jobs from one region to another within a country?
Hoekman, Sanfilippo and Tambussi: FDI and Structural Transformation in Africa

• Headlines (for 24 African countries 1990-2020):
  • Granular subnational data on FDI and labour market outcomes
  • FDI shifts increases employment, shifts employment to modern sectors, and shifts jobs and to higher skills (on impact only)

• **Question 1:** Structural transformation or just geographical reallocation? Are there aggregate effects or does this just reflect shuffling of jobs from one region to another within a country?

• **Question 2:** Identification – are minimal pre-trends enough? FDI selecting into “dynamic” regions? Effects of policies to attract FDI?
Hoekman, Sanfilippo and Tambussi: FDI and Structural Transformation in Africa

• Headlines (for 24 African countries 1990-2020):
  • Granular subnational data on FDI and labour market outcomes
  • FDI shifts increases employment, shifts employment to modern sectors, and shifts jobs and to higher skills (on impact only)

• Question 1: Structural transformation or just geographical reallocation? Are there aggregate effects or does this just reflect shuffling of jobs from one region to another within a country?

• Question 2: Identification – are minimal pre-trends enough? FDI selecting into “dynamic” regions? Effects of policies to attract FDI?

• Question 3: Incidence versus characteristics of FDI? Is volume of FDI macroeconomically significant? Types of capital (see previous paper)?
Chipunklar and Kleineberg: Gender Barriers, Structural Transformation and Economic Development

• Headlines (for 91 countries + 6 countries):
  • Sectoral employment patterns different for men (AGR→IND→SER) and women (AGR→OUT→SER)
  • Women sort into lower-status occupations in services
  • Gender gaps in employment narrow but gaps in pay narrow much less
  • Both gender norms and pay discrimination matter a lot quantitatively
Chipunklar and Kleineberg: Gender Barriers, Structural Transformation and Economic Development

• Headlines (for 91 countries + 6 countries):
  • Sectoral employment patterns different for men (AGR→IND→SER) and women (AGR→OUT→SER)
  • Women sort into lower-status occupations in services
  • Gender gaps in employment narrow but gaps in pay narrow much less
  • Both gender norms and pay discrimination matter a lot quantitatively

• Question 1: Is there more to U-shaped FLFP than middle-income majority-Muslim countries?
Chipunklar and Kleineberg: Gender Barriers, Structural Transformation and Economic Development

• Headlines (for 91 countries + 6 countries):
  • Sectoral employment patterns different for men (AGR→IND→SER) and women (AGR→OUT→SER)
  • Women sort into lower-status occupations in services
  • Gender gaps in employment narrow but gaps in pay narrow much less
  • Both gender norms and pay discrimination matter a lot quantitatively

• **Question 1:** Is there more to U-shaped FLFP than middle-income majority-Muslim countries?

• **Question 2:** How do huge differences (changes) in female human capital across countries (over time) factor into the story?
Chipunklar and Kleineberg: Gender Barriers, Structural Transformation and Economic Development

- Headlines (for 91 countries + 6 countries):
  - Sectoral employment patterns different for men (AGR→IND→SER) and women (AGR→OUT→SER)
  - Women sort into lower-status occupations in services
  - Gender gaps in employment narrow but gaps in pay narrow much less
  - Both gender norms and pay discrimination matter a lot quantitatively

- **Question 1:** Is there more to U-shaped FLFP than middle-income majority-Muslim countries?

- **Question 2:** How do huge differences (changes) in female human capital across countries (over time) factor into the story?

- **Question 3:** How to think about sorting into gendered career tracks and the role of policy (e.g. publicly-provided childcare)?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Canuedo/Keller</th>
<th>Hoekman/Sanfilippo/Tambussi</th>
<th>Chipunklar/Kleineberg</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Trade?</td>
<td>Transformation or reallocation?</td>
<td>U-shaped FLFP?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>Measuring K-share?</td>
<td>Identification?</td>
<td>Supply of female human capital?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Implications for developing countries?</td>
<td>Incidence vs type of FDI?</td>
<td>Sorting and policy?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>