JOBS STRATEGIES COURSE

SOLUTIONS FOR MORE AND BETTER JOBS FOR WOMEN –
CHILDCARE AND FLEXIBLE WORK ARRANGEMENTS

November 8, 2019
Context

Women still lag behind men in accessing more and better jobs

Gender gaps in labor force participation (2017)

- When women work, they are more likely to work in lower quality jobs.

See week 1 gender session for more data and evidence on gender gaps in the labor markets.
WHY GENDER GAPS EXIST?: WOMEN FACE ADDITIONAL GENDER CONSTRAINTS

- Disproportionate child care responsibility
- Limited ownership of and access to assets
- Lack of marketable skills
- Norms against women's employment
- Gender-based violence at work and in public
- Physical mobility restriction
- Legal discrimination
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONSTRAINT/CAUSE</th>
<th>EVIDENCED BY</th>
<th>SOLUTION AREA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Disproportionate child care responsibility</td>
<td>FLFP data</td>
<td>Childcare, Flexible work arrangements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limited ownership of and access to assets</td>
<td>Gender gap in access to finance and firm ownership</td>
<td>Adapting entrepreneurship program &amp; access to finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of marketable skills</td>
<td>Occupational segregation</td>
<td>Adapting skills training program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender-based violence at work and in public</td>
<td>Specialized survey data</td>
<td>Strengthen collective voice, Addressing sexual harassment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical mobility restriction</td>
<td>Specialized survey data</td>
<td>Addressing gender norms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal discrimination</td>
<td>Country own legal code - WBL</td>
<td>Strengthen collective voice, Legal and regulatory reforms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norms against women’s employment</td>
<td>Specialized survey data, direct discrimination</td>
<td>Addressing gender norms</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Solutions for more and better jobs for women

Focusing on

- Childcare
- Flexible work arrangements (including parental leave)
Job Context for childcare and flex work

Women bear disproportionate responsibility in providing childcare

Lack of childcare services and flex work arrangement is a constraint for women to

- i) join labor force
- ii) work outside home (higher paying jobs that non-wage work at home)

Transformation to urban economy and from agricultural to manufacturing/services increases demand for care

Evidence: positive effect on probability of employment of mothers
## Market or Policy Failure Justifying the Solutions: Childcare

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Types of failure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Solution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Information asymmetry</td>
<td>• Parents do not know/trust CC providers</td>
<td>• Public support for pre-primary education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Externalities- Public</td>
<td>• Early childhood development -&gt; HC</td>
<td>• Standard and regulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>goods</td>
<td>• High fixed costs + WTP</td>
<td>• Employer supported childcare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Missing markets</td>
<td>• Efficiency gain from CC for multiple children</td>
<td>• CC financing arrangements: PPP, subsidies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Agglomeration effects</td>
<td>• Locally thin market of CC providers and workers</td>
<td>• Father’s role/social norms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Coordination failure</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Market or Policy Failure Justifying the Solutions: Flex work and parental leave

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Types of failure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Solution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Information asymmetry</td>
<td>Lack of info about HR management</td>
<td>Financing benefits through social security or public funds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Externalities</td>
<td>Firms to recognize benefits, but may not include reduction in congestion (from commute)</td>
<td>Introduction of flex work system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Uncertainty future employment</td>
<td>Investment in new technology for remote work and collaboration</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Childcare: The Jobs Constraints or Symptoms**

What are symptoms that we need to observe to identify childcare as a solution?

1. **Disproportionate allocation of childcare between husband and wife**
   - Data requirement: time-use data, either from standalone Time Use Survey, HH survey with TU module, which could be diary or partial
   - Can be complemented with qualitative data

2. **Women with children have lower LFPR than those without children (or with fewer children)**
   - LFS data – tabulate LFPR of married women, by number of children under certain age (depending on country context)
   - Cross tabulate with proxy of "access to informal childcare" such as presence of elderly in the household – see Indonesia example

3. **Women with available childcare have higher LFPR than those without**
   - Compare FLFP by availability of local preschools (may need to combine multiple data sources)
   - Compare FLFP by availability of informal childcare (proxied by presence of elderly in household)

4. **Unmet demand for childcare**
   - Collect specialize data about demand for childcare from survey or qualitative study
CHILDCARE: DATA SOURCE

Tool to help you locate data sources on childcare

http://datanavigator.ihsn.org/#

Potential indicators
- Demographic → primary care giver
- Education → preschool attendance
- Labor → Information on work → Availability of child care/elder care
- Other → Time use
Indonesia has **low FLFP**
- FLFP at 50.9 lags regional average of 60.8 and has been nearly stagnant since 1990

**Data:** Indonesian Family Life Survey: round 5 (2014)
- Family relation
- Age
- Gender
- Employment outcomes

**Motherhood** is identified through the number of co-resident children
Sample restricted to urban females age 19-45

**Compared** mothers with access informal care arrangement to those without
- Access to informal care = presence of elderly in HH

**Source:** Halim, Johnson, Perova (2019)
When fertility peaks, more urban women with an elderly in the household work.

**Figure 1a:** Percent of women who work / have a child under 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>No elderly</th>
<th>Any elderly</th>
<th>Has child under 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Indonesia case study
Indonesia case study

• 67% households with young children do not have access to informal childcare

• Without access to informal childcare: Prolonged absence from work

• Public and private preschools appear to cater to different populations: presence of a public/private school does not substantively affect enrollment into private/public school
**Childcare: The Jobs Constraints or Syndromes – Urban Bangladesh**

**Measuring unmet demand for childcare:**

Bangladesh DIGNITY survey in low-income areas of Dhaka, Bangladesh (special survey)

The unmet demand for childcare appears to be large, particularly among working women

- We find that women who work
  - Choose to work at home or near home, instead of wage employment away from home
  - Work shorter hours

**Childcare arrangement among adults in the labor force with the youngest child younger than 15**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Spouse</td>
<td>0.63</td>
<td>0.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other household member</td>
<td>0.09</td>
<td>0.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relative not living in the house</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>0.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other individual</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School/nursery/other facilities</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No one</td>
<td>0.21</td>
<td>0.55</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Considerations for childcare solutions

- **Public support for pre-primary education**
  - Both service and subsidy
  - **LIC**: provide through various types of providers
  - May crowd-out private or informal care
  - May be targeted

- **Public support for after school programs**
  - School day compatible with working families
  - Include extension of school day

- **Employer supported childcare**
  - Need a strong business rationale
  - Only cover formal employees of large firms
  - Policy: based on the # of ALL employees

- **Father’s role/social norms**
  - Paternity leaves
  - Health system (prenatal care) as entry point
  - Engage with both men and women

Combination of interventions that will fill excess demand in childcare
Country Examples: Childcare and Flex Work

Public support for pre-primary education
- Government provided services: Denmark, Sweden, France (preschool), Brazil, Chile (preschool), Mexico (preschool), India
- Financial support: UK
- Incentives subsidies for childcare providers: Turkey (tax break), Mexico (grants and subsidies for home-based childcare providers).

Public support for after school programs
- Chile: extension of school day

Employer supported childcare
- Mandatory employer support childcare: Turkey (>150 women), India (>50 employees), Brazil (>30 women)

Father’s role/social norms
- Paid parental leaves: Median length 5 days. Iran (compulsory two weeks).

Flexible working arrangement
- Jordan: Introduced Flexible Work System and minimum wage by hours
- Among large firms in UK, US, France, Germany, Australian, Singapore, 60% of offer flex time and 41% remote working
For More information:

  

**World Banks Contacts:**

- Rudaba Nazir, IFC, Global Lead for Employment & Childcare
- Amanda Devercelli, World Bank, Global Lead for Early Childhood Development