Boosting Women's Access to More and Better Jobs

JOBS, LABOR AND MIGRATION CORE COURSE
WEEK 1: Overview of Jobs Challenges and Special Themes
October 31, 2019
Outline

1. What is the situation? Trends and gaps
2. Why gaps exist?: Gender constraints
3. Global transformation and trends
4. What can be done?: Policies and interventions
5. Examples from country work
   • Bangladesh: Tom Farole – jobs diagnostics to Jobs DPC
   • Croatia: Tara Sharafudheen – country gender assessment to RAS
   • Vietnam: Wendy Cunningham - jobs diagnostics to policy dialogue
Gender gaps in the labor markets
Women are less likely to participate in the labor market than men.
Figure 35
While male employment rates mirror OECD employment rates, female employment rates are considerably lower than those of their male counterparts, 2013.
Not just more but also better jobs

Women are more likely to work
• part-time
• in informal jobs
• in non-wage work
• in sectors/occupations with lower productivity and earnings
• to make less money than men

Source: World Bank Gender Data Portal
GENDER-BASED EMPLOYMENT SEGREGATION

• both horizontal and vertical dimensions

Women’s jobs also tend to be concentrated in the informal sector.

Ratio of female to male informal employment

Mozambique: Women are over represented in informal and micro entrepreneurs

HE = home-based enterprises

Source: Mozambique Jobs Diagnostic 2018.
• Persistent gender gaps in FLFP
• Women over represented in informal jobs
• Women also experience higher rates of unemployment.
Gender pay gaps - Median gender pay gap in monthly earnings

Tajikistan: Determinants of wages from mincer regression - 2009

Tajikistan Jobs Diagnostic 2017.
Gender gap in self-employed earnings

Source: OECD Gender Portal
Gender Gaps in Agricultural Productivity

Women farmers consistently produce less per hectare than their male counterparts.

**Note:** The symbols */**/*** denote statistical significance at the 10%, 5% and 1% levels.

**Source:** O'Sullivan, Rao, Banerjee, Gulati, Vinez. 2014. *Levelling the field: improving opportunities for women farmers in Africa*
Ethiopia: Gender Gaps in Agricultural Productivity

Factors That Explain the Gender Gap in Agricultural Productivity

Oaxaca decomposition – whether it is the endowment or the coefficient

Source: Buehren et al. (2019). *Ethiopia Gender Diagnostic Report*
What is holding women back?

Constraints to more and better jobs for women
Women face additional gender constraints

- Disproportionate child care responsibility
- Limited ownership of and access to assets
- Lack of marketable skills
- Norms against women’s employment
- Gender-based violence at work and in public
- Physical mobility restriction
- Legal discrimination
Interactive question to the audience #1

In your country context and based on your experience, what are the top two constraints women face to enter and stay in the labor market?

<Multiple choice for voting>
Women spend more in unpaid care work.

Less time in paid work.
Women tend to own fewer assets, thus lack access to finance

The credit gap for formal, women-owned small and medium-sized enterprises is estimated at about US$300 billion dollars globally.
Quality of education and marketable skills

Even at secondary level, countries have achieved gender parity in education completion.
Tertiary level: Large gender gaps in marketable skills

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>COUNTRIES BY GENDER DOMINANCE OF UNIVERSITY AREAS OF STUDY</th>
<th>Female dominated %</th>
<th>Neutral %</th>
<th>Male dominated %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SOCC SCIENCES, BUSINESS, LAW</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SERVICES</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCIENCE</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HUMANITIES AND ARTS</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HEALTH AND WELFARE</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENGINEER</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EDUCATION</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AGRICULTURE</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Gender norms: View that women should not work is still prevalent

*When jobs are scarce, men should have more of a right to a job than women.*

Agreement with the statement above by country

Source: World Values Survey (2014 or last available year)
Pakistan: Norms against women’s employment – family and husband

Data analysis of STEP survey from Pakistan shows that gender norms drives FLFP

Women are

more likely to participate in the labor force if men in the household agree that married women should be allowed to work outside the home.
Norms against women’s employment: Labor demand

- Enterprise Surveys in South Asia asked questions whether firms think that hiring women could cause disruption in the working environment

Source: Kotikula, Chowdhury, and Islam (2019)
Physical mobility – Pakistan

Women with greater mobility are more likely to be in the labor force.

17% of women who can travel to local markets alone are in the labor force, compared to 9% of those who are never allowed to go to the local market alone.
Laws affect women's decisions to enter and remain in the labor force

• 45% of Economies Have Laws Constraining Women's Decision to Join and Remain in the Labor Force

• Exp: in 29 economies, women cannot work the same night hours as men

• This map depicts topic-level scores for Starting a Job for WBL2018.

• A score of less than 100 indicates at least one legal limitation on a woman's job prospects, the lack of sexual harassment legislation, criminal penalties or civil remedies to protect women at the workplace.

• Source: Women, Business and the Law
Global transformation and trends in women’s jobs

Cr: witi.com
Global transformation affecting jobs for women

- Fertility decline
- Greater education parity
- Economic growth
- Aging

Source: Klasen (2019)
Regional Trends of FLFP

EAP: Female labor intensive manufacturing, strong LM attachment, and low fertility. HH conditions not matter.

MENA: strong stigma, remaining legal barriers and stagnant public, health, and education sectors.

SSA: Agri is mainstay employment & strong female involvement -> high FLFP.

SAR: FLFP much more circumscribed. Household conditions matter.

ECA: fading socialism & difficulty combining children with employment -> declining FLFP.

LAC: that a range of factors conducive to greater FLFP.

Source: Klasen 2019
U-shaped pattern in cross country comparison, but may not explain in country dynamic
What are we doing to address these constraints in the jobs agenda?
Childcare

- Regulation on standard of childcare centers
- Public daycare programs (publicly provided or subsidized)
- Employer supported child care
- Community-based child care provision (e.g., in low-income areas)
- Government support in public-private partnerships
- School day extension
- Pre-school and afterschool clubs
Flexible work arrangements

- HR guidelines and practices that allow for flexible work and/or remote work
- From Maternity to Parental Leave
- Policies to permit home-based work and protect workers who work from home
Addressing gender norms about women’s work

Informational interventions (targeting men):

• In Riyadh, Saudi Arabia, “information about other men’s positive attitude toward women’s employment impacts the willingness of men to let their wives join the labor force.”
• Joint couple training to promote gender equality (Ghana)

Increase women in male dominated sectors

• Providing information on the earnings opportunities in male-concentrated sectors.
• In Kenya: info exposure (expected earnings and a video of female mechanics) increases women’s preference by nine percentage points
• Exposure through apprenticeships and by including male mentors
• Especially for the informal sector

• Organize informal workers into strong membership-based organizations (MBOs), where they can negotiate for decent work and secure livelihoods (from WIEGO).

• Private sector engagement through partnerships/initiatives e.g. Better Work, WINvest, SheWorks (IFC), WEP

WIEGO “increase Voice by supporting and strengthening organizations of the working poor and linking organizations together.”

Strengthen collective voice
Addressing sexual harassment

• **Sexual harassment in the workplace**
  • Private and public sector should prevent and be prepared to respond to SH and other form of GBV experiences by their staff. e.g. Peru (Safe Company Seal).
  • Clear expectations of behavior, accountability and response mechanism with sanctions commensurable to acts of sexual harassment.
  • Recognize their staff may experience GBV outside of work – thus allow resources.

• **Sexual harassment in transportation to and from work**
  • The Safe Cities and “safety audit” programs: active engagement of the police and citizen in making streets and transport safer for women.
  • Hazme el Paro! project, piloted in 2015 in Mexico City
• Employment non-discrimination law
  • Enact laws mandating nondiscrimination based on gender in various aspects of employment including hiring and promotions

• Equalize mandatory retirement ages between men and women

• Remove laws barring women from working in certain types of jobs

• Family laws and other legal texts
  • to give all women equal opportunities to own and inherit property, and to conduct businesses without husband’s authorization

———

Legal and regulatory reforms to address legal discrimination
Adapting skills training programs

- **Adapt**
  - to take into account specific constraints women face to increase their success in increasing women’s enrollment, retention, and graduation in such programs.

- **Approaches**
  - **Behavioral**: boost aspiration through “Edutainment” (media) and peer groups, networks and mentorship opportunities
  - **Financial**: combine training with cash grants
  - **Operational**: wrap around services (such as childcare) and holding training in accessible and safe locations
  - Move away from traditional “female” fields or trades to “cross over” to “male” fields or trades where returns are higher.
Adapting entrepreneurship programs

- Training programs addressing socio-emotional skills as opposed to standard managerial training programs.
- Supporting women with secure savings mechanisms.
- Providing large cash grants to female-owned businesses as part of business plan competitions.
- Wraparound services (such as childcare and transport during the training).