DIGITAL APPROACHES TO DEMAND REDUCTION: RECENT RESULTS FROM THE FIELD

USAID Wildlife Asia, World Wildlife Fund, and WildAid

Joint Webinar for USAID Combating Wildlife Trafficking Learning Group and World Bank Global Wildlife Program

September 18th (Asia), 2019
September 17th (US), 2019
USAID’s CWT LEARNING AGENDA QUESTIONS:
Reduce Consumer Demand through Behavior Change Methodologies

Guiding question: What does effective demand reduction look like?

• What is the effect of reducing supply of illegal wildlife products as a consumer demand reduction strategy?
• What are the most appropriate metrics and methodologies for monitoring demand reduction activities, especially the link between attitudes and behavior change?
• Are certain messaging strategies more effective than others (i.e., positive messaging, messaging with enforcement information, etc.)?
TODAY’S SPEAKERS

Eleanora De Guzman
USAID Wildlife Asia

Sunny Patel
Trends Digital

David Garcia Cumplido
Trends Digital
TODAY’S SPEAKERS

Jan Vertefeuille
WWF US

Anny Liang
WWF China
**Objective 1**
Reduce consumer demand through social and behavior change communication (SBCC)

**Objective 2**
Strengthen Regional Law Enforcement Capacity and Coordination

**Objective 3**
Increase commitment to addressing CWT (Legislation, Environmental Jurisprudence)

**Objective 4**
Improving regional action to reduce wildlife crime in ASEAN and China

---

**Project Duration:** 2016-2021  
**PRIME:** RTI  
**SUB-CONTRACTORS:** FHI 360  
IFAW  
Freeland  
TRAFFIC  
CCN  
**Project Office:** Bangkok, Thailand
DIGITAL DETERRENCE CAMPAIGN - Thailand:

- Thailand consumer research (USAID Wildlife Asia 2018) revealed consumers go online to seek information and/or purchase wildlife products.
- Innovative pilot digital marketing campaign to deter purchase of illegal wildlife products among potential online buyers using google.
- Google deterrence ads to increase perception of risk among those who go online with a sense of comfort and anonymity.
- Ads create a hostile, uncomfortable, “risky” online trading environment to prevent potential buyers from pursuing their purchase.
DIGITAL DETERRENCE CAMPAIGN:

- Partnership with Department of National Parks, Wildlife and Plant Conservation (DNP), Thailand.
- In 4 languages (Thai, English, Chinese, Vietnamese) using 4 message concepts.
- Digital analytics to monitor results and trackers.
- Implemented from August 4, 2018 to March 15, 2019.
Here we track events, such as clicks to learn more, call hotline or sending a message to DNP.

Select keyword list triggers serving of one of our Deterrence Search Ads.

If a user clicks, s/he goes to landing page.

illegalwildlifetrade.info/en & /th
WARNING!

The content you are searching for may be prohibited!

Enforcement authorities across South East Asia are now monitoring the online trade in illegal wildlife. You may not buy, sell or trade illegal wildlife parts or products in this country.
GOOGLE ADS USED DATA ON PURCHASE DRIVERS & CONCERNS:
THAILAND CONSUMER RESEARCH, USAID WILDLIFE ASIA 2018
Among those who bought parts and/or products in the past 3 years

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elephant</th>
<th>Tiger</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Top 3 benefits</strong></td>
<td><strong>Top 3 benefits</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ivory purchasers</td>
<td>Tiger purchasers/ users</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ivory is rare and of high value</td>
<td>Tiger parts/products are rare &amp; of high value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ivory brings luck/good fortune</td>
<td>Tiger products provide protection from evil/ harm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ivory provides protection from evil, wards off harm</td>
<td>Tiger products bring luck/good fortune</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elephant</th>
<th>Tiger</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Top 3 concerns</strong></td>
<td><strong>Top 3 concerns</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ivory purchasers</td>
<td>Tiger purchasers/ users</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some ivory products are not legal in Thailand</td>
<td>Many fake tiger products in the market</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People can't tell which ivory products are illegal</td>
<td>Tiger products are not legal in Thailand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There are many fake ivory products in the market</td>
<td>Are associated with cruelty/tiger extinction</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CAMPAIGN FORMAT:

• 4 key Message Concepts with corresponding Google ads
  – Concept 1: “Searching for you”
  – Concept 2: “Searching for Bad Luck”
  – Concept 3: “Can you afford the Fines”
  – Concept 4: “Official Alert”

• Each concept executed in 4 languages: Thai, English, Chinese and Vietnamese.

• All 4 key species – Elephant (Ivory), Pangolin, Rhino and Tiger targeted using Paid Google search ads and Search Engine Optimization (SEO)
4 CREATIVE CONCEPTS – SAMPLE GOOGLE ADS

1. Searching For Illegal Ivory? - Then We’re Searching For You
   Ad www.illegalwildlifetrade.info
   Trade In Trafficked Ivory Is Illegal. Undercover Officers Are Online.

2. Buying Amulets? - Don't Buy Bad Luck
   Ad www.stopillegalwildlifetrade.org
   Tiger Amulets Are Illegal. Undercover Officers Are Online.

   Ad www.stopillegalwildlifetrade.org
   Many Elephant and Tiger Amulets Are Illegal. Undercover Officers Are Online.

4. *OFFICIAL ALERT* - You Are Being Monitored
   Ad www.stopillegalwildlifetrade.org
   OFFICIAL WARNING from Thai Authorities, Your Search Has Triggered An Alert.
SUMMARY RESULTS (AUG 4 2018 - MARCH 15 2019)

• Ran for 223 Days Thailand Google Search is the dominating search platform with +90% share. Used Google in its opposite format & structure (Instead of PPC, we were looking at Impressions of message)
  – Abided by all privacy regulations
  – Over half a million impressions at low cost

• Geolocation focused on Thailand with Thai (89%), English (10%), small pilots on Chinese and Vietnamese languages (incl. of search terms & served ads).

• Average ~2.6K Searches / Day over 223 day campaign. Tracked 596K keyword searches in Google.

• Ivory searches dominated (>90%) followed by Rhino (5%) and Tiger (3.5%)

• Largest search demographic is ages 25-44 years (39.1%), Male (44%) and Metropolitan (>90%)

• Lower Income linked with Thai searches & conversely Top Income Bracket highest for English searches

• Mobile platform significantly used to conduct searches at (~80%)

• Search highly cost-effective with 50% below market average CPM (costs)

• Multiple “Phases” with ongoing adjustments & optimizations resulting in a scalable learnings for Phase 2 with cost-effective strategies for impact and unexpected positive consequences
• **Total of 596,370** keyword searches in Google tracked and **560,470** searches were served the our Deterrence Ads resulting in **94% of total search share**.

We ranked on **first position** on average over campaign period, resulting in high visibility.
### RESULTS

**Most common Search Terms in English***

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Terms in English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Broad Ivory Searches</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>ivory, what is ivory used for, ivory types, is ivory legal, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accessories / Items</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>tiger amulet, tiger tooth fang, ivory caps, ivory necklace, ivory seals, tiger tooth necklace, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Animal Parts</td>
<td>&gt;5%</td>
<td>pangolin scales, tiger teeth, rhino horn, tiger fang, black ivory tusk, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchase of Animal</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>tiger for sale, real baby tiger for sale, buy elephant, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product / Purchase Information</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>real tiger teeth price, ivory mahout real or fake, how do you tell ivory from bone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>&lt;10%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Please note, these are top-level estimate percentages based on data filtered and reviewed to-date*
Most common Search Terms in Thai*

- Broad Searches (40%)
- Accessories / Items (25%)
- Religion (>20%)
- Price / Purchase Infos (10%)
- Other (5%)

RESULTS

Top-level key differences to English

- Thai language searches have a higher proportion of accessory and product specific queries
- High count of religious / belief / luck related search terms (at times belief inferred into type of product)
- Searches for different types of Ivory that have a different belief or impact purpose (for luck, power, fortune) also including type of end-product (amulet, bracelet, etc.)
- Authenticity, rarity, pattern related service queries are common and hint at informed consumer audiences (very rare in English searches)
- Law queries regarding legality & registration were found

*Please note, these are top-level estimate percentages based on data filtered and reviewed to-date
RESULTS

User searches for one of our targeted keywords

User is served Deterrence Ad, either clicks or skips

If User Clicks, they land on our Campaign Landing Page (w/ Analytics)

Repeat Visitor Count from Search or Direct traffic is very low

596K (100%)
Total Searches

560K (94%)
Total Ads Served

17.4K (3.1%)
Total Clicks to Site

13.K (2.4%)
Unique Sessions

1.08 Sessions
Per Unique User, suggesting high deterrence effect

9/18/2019
Users landing on the landing page were offered 3 paths of action:

1) Click to DNP Page to learn more

2) Inform / Send a message about infractions

3) Call Hotline

Total of 523 positive actions were measured, equaling 3% of total 17,410 sessions.
• Searches in Vietnamese and Chinese low for Google Search Platform > Vietnamese ads and Chinese ad buys terminated on Jan 17 and Feb 5, respectively.

• Search Terms in detail reveal additional information about online behavior but require in-depth review since large dataset

• “Searching for You” Ad had lowest Click-Rate (to landing page), suggesting highest potential deterrence effect, followed by “Official Alert”.

• No seasonality identified during campaign timeframes (223 days)

• With multiple adjustments (ad bidding, blacklisting, new search term inclusions, etc.) we now have an optimized and scalable campaign model for Google Search
PLANNED NEXT STEPS

• “Clean out” our database of Unique Ad Ids (privacy regulations followed) and help stratify **high intent users vs the educational, researchers, etc.**

  – A) **Run Online Survey** on information from both groupings and gather intel
  – B) Will use **A/B/C Ad types** allowing groups to choose their path such as opt-out and sign Pledge as one example (messages aligned with Ivory and Spiritual Beliefs messages)
    – Green messaging **positive and supportive**, learn more, take action
    – Amber message reminding that we are **still here and amplify the pressure** to stop or repercussions (exact messaging TBC)
    – **RED**: Retargeting searchers with **sustained purchase intent** with Deterrence Messaging- Follow the users outside of their illicit search

• Other items:
  • Expand deterrence messages and **scale campaign framework to additional social channels** and develop an **optimized cross-channel** campaign model
  • Dark web fishing (TBC)
**Target:** Chinese outbound tourists in popular SE Asia destinations during biggest travel periods.

**New approach:** Digital precision marketing to reach travelers in real time while at key purchase decision points and near open ivory markets.

**Bolstered with:** On-the-ground activities to engage travelers in tourist locations; partners included travel industry.
• **Key demographic:** Regular outbound travelers are the consumer group most interested in continuing to buy ivory despite a ban on ivory sales in China.

• **Top foreign destinations:** Thailand is the No. 1 foreign destination for Chinese travelers where ivory is still widely available; Vietnam is also a popular destination.

• **Biggest travel periods:** Lunar New Year in Feb and Golden Week in Oct are the top outbound travel seasons for Chinese tourists.
RESULTS

• **101 million**: Times campaign messages were viewed and shared

• **2 million**: Pledges taken to travel ivory free

• **622,000**: Minimum number of Chinese nationals engaged on the ground in Thailand and Vietnam during Lunar New Year
ONLINE OUTREACH

Campaign materials:

• Social posts w/ 3 messages
• Public pledge
• Blog post
MESSAGE TESTING

Themes: illegality, elephants, responsible traveler, gifting

2018.10 Golden Week
2019.02 Lunar New Year
**1) GPS-enabled technology at key decision points in Thailand & Vietnam**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Thailand</th>
<th>Vietnam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Number of users <strong>traveled</strong> to the country in February</td>
<td>299,769</td>
<td>89,130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Number of users <strong>reside</strong> in the country</td>
<td>147,534</td>
<td>85,769</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Number of users in <strong>real-time locations</strong> at airports or tourist attractions</td>
<td>153,282</td>
<td>77,451</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: 1) and 2) are exclusive groups, while 3) might overlaps with either 1) or 2)
# PRECISION MARKETING

## 1) GPS-enabled technology at key decision points in Thailand & Vietnam

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Destination City in Thailand</th>
<th>Monthly Active Users in February</th>
<th>Airport</th>
<th>Tourist Attractions</th>
<th>Shopping Destinations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bangkok</strong></td>
<td>221,879</td>
<td>Suvarnabhumi International Airport (BKK) Don Mueang International Airport (DMK)</td>
<td>Great Place Erawan Shrine Bangkok Chao Phraya Khaosan Road Asiatique The Riverfront Sea Life Bangkok Wat Phra Kaew</td>
<td>Siam Square Central World Plaza Central Chidlom Chao Phraya Weekend Market King Power Duty Free Shop – Bangkok Downtown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Phuket</strong></td>
<td>169,261</td>
<td>Phuket International Airport (HKT)</td>
<td>Rang Hill Nai Harn Beach Patong Beach Kata Beach Promthep Cape Phuket Zoo</td>
<td>Jungceylon Shopping Mall Central Festival Phuket King Power Duty Free Shop–Phuket Downtown Barisan Fresh Market Boots</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chiang Mai</strong></td>
<td>94,993</td>
<td>Chiang Mai International Airport (CNX)</td>
<td>Wat Phra That Doi Suthep Chiang Mai Night Safari Nisornanamitr Road Wat Chedi Luang Wat Phra That Hariphunchai Mueang Chiang Mai Provincial National Museum</td>
<td>Maya Lifestyle Shopping Center Central Festival Chiangmai Saturday Walking Market</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pattaya</strong></td>
<td>77,734</td>
<td>U-Tapao Rayong-Pattaya International Airport (UTP)</td>
<td>Pattaya Beach Nong Nooch Tropical Garden The Sanctuary of Truth Teddy Bear Museum Wat Yansangwararam</td>
<td>Central Festival Pattaya Beach Pattaya Floating Market King Power Duty Free Shop–Pattaya Downtown Central Marina Royal Garden Plaza Pattaya Boots (Royal Garden Pattaya)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Koh Samui</strong></td>
<td>49,243</td>
<td>Samui Airport (USM)</td>
<td>Haad Chaweng Haad Tia &amp; Haad Yu Beach Ang Thong National Marine Park Lamai Beach Nai Tao Na Hua Tapu No Phang Sali Park</td>
<td>Central Festival Samui Chaweng Walking Street Tesco Lotus Lamai Fisherman’s Night Market</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Krabi</strong></td>
<td>27,226</td>
<td>Krabi International Airport (KBV)</td>
<td>Ao Nang Beach Railay Beach Krabi Town Ko Lanta Emerald Pool Koh Rok Island Luang Noi Bay</td>
<td>Krabi Outlet Vogue Mall Krabi Fresh Market</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Phi Phi Island</strong></td>
<td>9,004</td>
<td>——</td>
<td>——</td>
<td>——</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pai</strong></td>
<td>5,192</td>
<td>——</td>
<td>——</td>
<td>——</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chiang Rai</strong></td>
<td>2,233</td>
<td>Chiang Rai International Airport (CEI)</td>
<td>Wat Bang Khun Bua Dom Single Park Oba Khun Museum Chiang Rai</td>
<td>Boots (Chiangrai) Mueang Chiang Rai</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Find users who followed the hashtags about Thailand and Vietnam travel, and the users who actively participate in the discussion, for example, #Travel to #Thailand #Vietnam Tour Guide#

Analyze users’ microblog text, such as talking about the upcoming trips to Thailand and Vietnam, posting their Thailand and Vietnam’s trip experiences on Weibo.
Official Accounts & KOLs

Find users who interacted with official accounts and KOLs of Thailand and Vietnam’s tourism, as well as the followers of these accounts and KOLs. The interaction refers to forward, comment, like, follow, etc.

Keywords & Guides

Analyze users’ searching behavior, and find who searched keywords about Thailand and Vietnam trips and tourist attractions, such as “Thailand travel guide” “Bangkok” “The Royal Palace” “Vietnam’s souvenir” etc.
3) social media influencer engagement

- 10 travel companies and 3 industry associations
- Celebrities and key opinion leaders (KOLs)
- Many other official accounts of govt, public welfare, wildlife, radio, etc.
EXPOSURE OF MESSAGES
CAMPAIGN ENGAGEMENT PROFILE:
Analysis of 374,000 Weibo users who engaged thru geolocation

- Mostly use iPhones
- Like to travel to TH, JP, VN, MY, S. Korea
- Most born after the 1990s
- Mostly single women
- Most from SME (Small and Medium Enterprises)
- Most have bachelor's degree or above
SOCIAL LISTENING: SENTIMENT ON IVORY BAN

- Pre-Campaign: 9% Against the Ban, 69% Neutral, 22% Pro the Ban
- During-Campaign: 41% Neutral, 1% Pro the Ban
- Post-Campaign: 50% Neutral, 8% Pro the Ban

Overall sentiment shifted by 36% from Pre-Campaign to During-Campaign.

9/18/2019
PHYSICAL ACTIVITIES
ON ARRIVAL …
SOUVENIR POP-UP MARKET
Award-winning artist Wasinburee Supanichvoraparch created original art installation for campaign at Bangkok Art Culture Center in high-traffic tourist area.
• Travel Ivory Free announcement on 35+ CN-TH and CN-VN flights

• Social Media posts

• 1500+ souvenirs distributed to passengers on CN-TH flights

• In-flight magazine article
KEY FINDINGS

- Campaigns were most successful at engaging young, professional women.
- Precision marketing is a powerful, cost-effective way to reach specific audiences in specific locations.
- Target audience is more likely to engage in and share campaign activities on social media that tie into their holiday mood.
- Reach of campaign is easy to measure; impact is more challenging and various approaches are being explored.
- Regardless of other tactics, using celebrities and influencers increases engagement.
UPCOMING GOLDEN WEEK CAMPAIGN

Next Travel Ivory Free campaign runs from 26 Sept. through 7 Oct.

We welcome your support!

Campaign package: https://www.dropbox.com/sh/9ekpvl t3usqvgz5/AACswI_8HpqSJDQFM1 olaJW1a?dl=0
PARTNER SUPPORT
DISCUSSANT

John Baker
WildAid
QUESTIONS & ANSWERS

USAID E3/FORESTRY AND BIODIVERSITY
Combating Wildlife Trafficking
COLLABORATIVE LEARNING GROUP

PHOTO: USAID
9/18/2019
TOOLS AND RESOURCES

• CWT Learning Group Site: https://rmportal.net/combating-wildlife-trafficking

• CWT Learning Agenda: https://rmportal.net/combating-wildlife-trafficking/learning-agenda
THANK YOU!

Eleanora De Guzman, Team Lead, SBCC, eleanora.deguzman@usaidwildlifeasia.org
Megan Hill, Environment Protection Specialist, Office of Forestry and Biodiversity, mhill@usaid.gov
Jan Vertefeuille, Senior Director of Advocacy, WWF US, Jan.Vertefeuille@wwfus.org
Anny Liang, Demand Reduction Specialist, WWF China, yliang@wwfchina.org
John Baker, Chief Program Officer, WildAid, baker@wildaid.org