**World Bank – IFC Pakistan Office and Oxford Pakistan Programme Partnership**

**November 30, 2022 – January 30, 2023**

**Short-Term Consultant (STC): Agriculture GP**

**Terms of Reference:**

Pakistan is currently the 6th most populous country in the world. Between 1947 and 2019, the country grew from 31 million to 217 million (United Nations Population Division 2019). The World Population Review 2021 reports that population growth in Pakistan is increasing at a much faster rate (2.02 percent) than the gains being achieved in education, creating pressures on public services. In turn, high population growth in Pakistan has negated many efforts at increasing student enrolment and resources for education (Benz 2021).

Despite a decades-long focus on education and a major devolutionary policy shift in education financing and decision-making to the provincial level with the 18th Constitutional Amendment (2010), Pakistan continues to grapple with low basic education access, equity, learning levels, and attainment. With over a third of its school-aged children (5-16 years) out of school, Pakistan is home to the largest number of out of school children (20.3M) in the world. The top barriers to children’s enrollment and progression in school include shortage of qualified teachers, followed by the poor quality of education, the distance to schools (particularly at the middle-school level and above), and the high costs to households associated with educating their children – including transportation to and from school. These problems are particularly relevant in rural schools, among girls, and across education levels, worsening as children age. (World Bank, Barriers to Girls’ Education in Pakistan, forthcoming)

Those fortunate enough to be in school are often not learning. According to the World Bank’s quality-adjusted ‘years of schooling’ indices, if a child is in school for eight odd years, their quality-adjusted learning level (LAYs) amounts to only four or 4.5 years. Prior to the global COVID-19 pandemic, learning poverty stood at 75 percent, meaning less than 25 percent of those aged 10 could read and understand a simple paragraph of age-appropriate text. Below is a summary of Pakistan’s pre-pandemic education indicators, in comparison to its regional (SAR) peers:

**Table 1: Regional Comparison of Education Indicators**



Source: Pakistan Economic Survey 2020

In response to the global COVID-19 pandemic, Pakistan’s schools were closed for over 11 months and early data from ASER and others points to learning losses in key foundational skills, including literacy and numeracy (ASER 2021). The World Bank Group estimates that as a result of pandemic-related school closures, Learning Poverty will now move from 75 percent to 79 percent in Pakistan.

It is important to mention that Pakistan’s total educational budget outlay amounts to around 2.5 percent of its national GDP, which is substantially below the international median of 4.4 percent. Annually, Pakistan spends roughly 10 percent of its total budget on education, which is about half what may other countries spend on education. Increasing funding and the efficiency of that funding to deliver results remain key challenges for guaranteeing every child is provided with a quality education. Education expenditure per child by district shows high heterogeneity, and it matters for years of schooling, school satisfaction and learning outcomes (World Bank, 2019). The overall level of expenditure linked with this correlation partly explains Pakistan’s low education results. Efficiency of expenditure also matters, and Pakistan could do much better in comparison to other countries (Herrera and Ouedraogo 2018).

Education finance systems pay for the inputs required to implement education policies, such as teachers, school buildings, and learning materials. Governments are under increasing pressure to use education resources efficiently, but often lack guidance on the optimal ways to invest and manage their school finance systems. In order to better build human capital, Pakistan’s education sector should use country and donor resources effectively, efficiently, and equitably.

Public expenditure reviews (PERs) are one of the World Bank’s core diagnostic tools for informing various stakeholders about the state of education financing in a country. Such reviews assess the efficiency, effectiveness, and equity of expenditures on education and their adequacy and sustainability relative to the country’s educational goals. All education systems rely on financing to function.[[1]](#footnote-1)

The World Bank’s [Actions to Strengthen Performance for Inclusive and Responsive Education (ASPIRE)](https://projects.worldbank.org/en/projects-operations/project-detail/P173399?lang=en) program aims to help Pakistan address school disruptions due to COVID-19 by accelerating virtual and distance learning opportunities for out-of-school children, particularly among disadvantaged communities. It helps strengthen coordination among federal and provincial authorities to generate new investments in traditional and alternative education programs to accelerate recovery. Through the Foreign, Commonwealth & Development Office (FCDO)’s Data Accountability & Research in Education (DARE) program, FCDO and the World Bank Group are collaborating to provide technical support to the Federal Government of Pakistan, to strengthen education data infrastructure and coordination mechanisms between the federal and provincial governments, enhance evidence-based decision making and improve targeting of programs to reduce inequality and gender-gaps. With the overall objective of improving education sector efficiency and efficacy to provide a quality education for every child, Pakistan’s education PER will take place under DARE to ASPIRE, an initiative that combines the work of these two flagship education programs.

**Duties and Accountabilities:**

The World Bank Group seeks an STC to support various aspects of Pakistan Education PER. The STC will support the education task team to review and assess the efficiency, effectiveness, and equity of Pakistan’s education expenditures and their adequacy and sustainability relative to the country’s educational goals.

For PER Guidelines see: <https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/handle/10986/27264>

Pakistan’s PER will build on the Multi-Sector Public Expenditure and Institutional Reviews (PEIR) for Pakistan and deepen some of the analysis to draw a more comprehensive picture of the expenditure on education, in particular public financing, and its characteristics (e.g., equity, efficiency, efficacy). The PER then will be a standalone piece focusing on answers the to the following general questions:

1. Who finances education and how are funds channeled?
2. How much does the government spend and on what?
3. Is the public financial management system set up to enhance financial accountability?
4. Relative to the government’s policies and standards, how much is needed now (adequacy), and what can be afforded in the medium and long term (sustainability)?
5. Are public resources being used efficiently and effectively?
6. Does public spending promote equity?

The answers to these questions will be answered and structured in the following tentative outline for the PER:

Section 1: Background and Overview of the Education System

Section 2: Overview of Education Financing and Spending

Section 3: Financial Accountability

Section 4: Adequacy and Sustainability

Section 5: Efficiency and Effectiveness

Section 6: Equity

Section 7: Recommendations

The PER will maximally exploit available datasets and administrative data, including household and socio-demographic and educations surveys (PSLM, HEIS, ASER, as examples) as well public expenditure data, administrative data from PIE, and other public sources. When possible, analysis will include geographic and by subgroup or provinces to better understand geographical disparities, and the heterogeneity of expenditure and outcomes.

In addition to the above, the PER for Pakistan will also dig deeper into:

1. Parent’s choice on the type of school private versus public. Given the high proportion of private schools and the challenges of the public sector to provide quality education, we are proposing some data work to understand what parents consider when making this decision.
2. Is it possible to increase funding for education in Pakistan to 4% of GDP? Given budget parameters and Pakistan’s budget process, increasing overall budget to 4% would require a disproportionate effort from provincial budgets. This analysis will provide an answer to this.

**New data collection:** One phone survey of a random sample of parents (n=2,000). This survey will target parents of children 5-16 years old (whether they are in school or not). In addition to the quantitative data, the WB team will design and implement focus groups discussions (FGDs) in all provinces of Pakistan to gather qualitative information, deepening understanding of phone survey findings.

**Deliverables**

The selected STC will support with the scoping, data collection and analysis, and writing of Pakistan’s PER documents, including:

1. **First Draft:** In coordination with the WB task team, the STC will be required contribute to a first draft of the document that will provide a narrative on the team’s PER approach.
2. **Phone survey**
3. **FGD questionnaire**
4. **Clean and coded data** in STATA format from the phone survey and **transcripts** from the FGDs.
5. **Final Document.** A final report drawing on the qualitative and quantitative data, along with select case studies will be produced by the STC to illustrate the status of public expenditures on education across Pakistan today.

Note:

Intellectual property rights to all data, questionnaires, transcripts, and reports resulting from this contract belong solely to the World Bank.

**Schedule of Deliverables and Expected Outputs (to be revised once contract is signed) -- These are Milestones for the work *\* Dates to be adjusted & discussed with team once work experience begins***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Milestones | Deadline |
| Concept Note | August 30, 2022 |
| PER Outline | September 30, 2022 |
| Cleaning and coding of all collected data | September 15, 2022 |
| Presentation of Results | November 30, 2022 |
| Draft report for team comments | December 15, 2022 |
| Final Report | January 15, 2023 |

**Qualifications:**

The STC will be commissioned by the World Bank Group and selected based on meeting qualification requirements detailed in the remainder of this section. As required, the STC will liaise with assigned World Bank Group staff and MoFEPT focal persons delegated to manage the PER activity. The STC will also have the opportunity to learn how the Education Team work, and engages client and partners.

**STC Profile (*Minimum Requirements*)**

The STC must be based within Pakistan (any province), and meet the following criteria:

* PhD or Masters-level candidate in Economics/Statistics/Education (or related field) with at least 3 years of experience conducting education research on similar assignments.
* Advance knowledge using Stata
* Experience in data analysis and visualization, preferably in the education sector and on previous development projects, required.
* Strong research and writing skills in English. Urdu a plus but not required.
* Demonstrated capacity to work in teams
* Experience in design of large-scale education surveys, including public expenditure data, within the education sector is also an advantage.
* Demonstrated understanding of various Data systems and Monitoring and Evaluation frameworks used to analyze school efficiency from both qualitative and quantitative points of view is highly desirable.

**Application and Selection Process:**

This is a pilot phase of partnership program at the World Bank Group Pakistan Country Office where up to 9 STCs will be selected to work with us in a hybrid mode. This pilot phase is being implemented initially with 20 universities across the Pakistan in partnership with the Oxford Pakistan Program. In Phase 2 scheduled to start in March/April 2023, the program will expand to include all universities in Pakistan.

Each applicant can only apply to one position advertised. Shortlisted applicants will be interviewed, and one candidate will be selected per position.

1. World Bank Group. 2017. Education Public Expenditure Review Guidelines. World Bank, Washington, DC. © World Bank. <https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/handle/10986/27264> License: CC BY 3.0 IGO. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)