

World Bank Proposed Country Partnership Framework Consultations

June 9th & Aug 5th, 2024 | Lahore, Punjab

GOVERNMENT

THEMATIC AREA	DISCUSSION POINTS
REDUCING STUNTING	- Mapping Stunting Data: The government wishes to gather and map data for a clear understanding of the scope and depth of this long-existing problem that spans over several regions and districts with varying magnitudes. This will help evaluate past efforts and design a calculated response. - School Nutrition: Aimed at access to education and retention of students in schools, as well as meeting their nutritional needs, the Punjab government has launched the province's first ever school nutrition program in South Punjab. It plans to scale it up to include the rest of the province.
REDUCING LEARNING POVERTY	- Restructuring the Education System: The government is restructuring the education system to respond to current industry needs. Labs and syllabi are being upgraded to include modern skills, including I.T. courses, artificial intelligence and machine learning, cyber security, and online learning. Solar energy studies are being introduced to cater to the rising demand in line with the government's ambition to indigenize the sector. - Engaging the Private Sector: The government is outsourcing "non-performing" schools to the private sector to help improve learning outcomes. For the eight districts in Punjab without universities, the government is providing land and other facilities to build these through public-private partnerships, with some potential international investors. - Scooties for Schools: Alongside providing transport facilities to special children, the government is offering scooties to female students to address drop-outs due to distances and lack of transportation facilities. - Skill Training for the Non-formal Sector: Using the existing vocational infrastructure, the government is developing a skills-training program for the non-formal sector. It will also cater to out-of-school children to equip them with skills relevant to the job market. - Adult Literacy: The government has held about 6000 adult literacy camps in central Punjab. This will be translated into an accelerated learning program – currently being designed – for adult literacy.
RESILIENCE TO CLIMATE CHANGE	- Climate Change Responsive Curriculum is being incorporated in schools. - Climate Resilience Vision: The province has developed a long-term vision to tackle climate change challenges, which will be shared soon.
DECARBONIZATION OF THE ECONOMY	- Electric Busses and Vehicle Fitness Program: The government is introducing electric busses to replace diesel fueled transport. The scooties provided to female students are electric. A new vehicle fitness regime has been introduced whereby vehicles would be both tested and certified for road fitness.

	- Air Quality: Given Lahore's smog problem, Punjab's air quality control initiatives are ambitious, ranging from introduction of electric vehicles to mechanization of agriculture. Emission analyzers are being installed at key locations in the city. - Climate Smart Agriculture: The government's smog control initiative encompasses providing farmers with subsidized machinery to utilize farm/crop residue to produce byproducts, instead of burning it. Small scale farmers will receive subsidized solar panels for their clean energy needs. - Transition to Clean Energy is being done under two projects. First, free and subsidized solar panels are being provided to those who cannot afford them. Second, efforts are underway in engaging the private sector to promote renewable energy technologies such as hydro-kinetic, hydel power, biomass for biofuel, indigenization of solar panel industry and, clean fuel to reduce household emissions etc. The government is keen on financing clean energy projects and incentivizing them for the private sector investment. - Carbon Credit: The provincial government sought assistance from the World Bank Group to help it realize its carbon credit plan, a high priority area.
WATER AND AGRICULTURE	- Water Conservation: The province is focusing on alternatives to flood irrigation by introducing mechanisms like furrow, pivot, drip irrigation etc. Water courses are being lined with concrete to reduce wastage due to seepage. - Rainwater Harvesting: In the water-deficient mountains of Muree city, the Punjab government has piloted a rain harvesting project where the cumulative water needs of low-income households are met through rainwater conservation. The government now plans to extend it across the entire city. - Promoting Aqua-culture: Facilitating research and development alongside transfer of technology from countries that have successfully strengthened aqua-culture, the Punjab government is encouraging investment in the field. Seeking to engage the private sector, it has millions of acres of barren land that can be brought under use. It has just piloted a shrimp production project, certified for international exports. - Subsidized Farm Machinery and Agri-Malls: Under its farm mechanization, indigenization and manufacturing initiative, the government is providing subsidized tractors and farm machinery to medium and small-scale farmers. 'Farmers malls' are being piloted, offering subsidized farm services to buy farm produce and make it available to consumers. This will also help map and monitor the sector for crops and farm yield. - Agri-Financing: The government offers interest free loans under <i>kissan</i> cards and livestock cards to strengthen agriculture and livestock sectors. It has embarked on a livestock nutrition program to bolster export of meat. Foot and Mouth Free Zones for livestock farming will ensure disease free cattle. Mapping and tagging of animals is being undertaken to document and evaluate production of milk and meat.
MORE INCLUSIVE JOB OPPORTUNITIES	- Garment City: Based on the Bangladesh model, the government is setting up a garment city in Shiekhupura city. Spread over 630 acres and leased to interested parties, the city will be powered by solar energy. It

	will have its own vocational training institution. The machinery will be imported duty-free and the city will be tax-free for ten years.
OTHER PRIORITIES	- Water, Sanitation and Hygiene, and Waste Management: The Punjab government is embarking on an ambitious “end to end” solid waste management and Water, Sanitation and Hygiene (WASH) initiative, outsourcing picking, dumping, recycling and, landfill site management to the private sector. Several hundred companies have prequalified. Every 250 households will have a dedicated sanitary worker to collect waste. To ensure sustainability, a sanitation fee will be charged. Sanitation services are currently available to only a few cities in Punjab and none in the rural areas. Related to this is the revamping of the old drainage and sewerage infrastructure in Lahore, both as a sanitation and flood control imperative. So is the provision of clean drinking water that the World Bank Group has identified as one of its goals under the CPF to reduce stunting. This ambitious plan will open several new employment avenues. - Revitalized Public-Private Partnership Regime: A taskforce under Chief Minister Punjab is looking into revising the Public Private Partnership Act to facilitate private sector investment through major amendments to the law – or even rewriting the Act from scratch to incentivize the role of the private sector. Once the law/amendments is finalized, it would be taken to the cabinet for approval. - A Sustainable Approach: The province is currently implementing 12 projects with the World Bank Group. To ensure reciprocity and graduate beyond existing projects, the government seeks consolidated data from the World Bank Group to inform its development agenda and align it with the CPF over the next ten years. The government also seeks an exit strategy for CPF projects and partnerships, and clarity on graduating to the next step, in line with its priorities. - The government has requested for a smaller working group comprising representatives from the Punjab government and the World Bank Group to align the CPF with provincial goals, and help the government arrive at its own corresponding ten-year strategy to work in tandem with the CPF. - Right Sizing of Departments: The government would like support from the World Bank Group to execute this plan in phases.

ACADEMIA

THEMATIC AREA	DISCUSSION POINTS
REDUCING STUNTING	- High Fertility Rate: Pakistan suffers from an extremely high fertility rate. Reducing it should be the core priority. Population growth is the root cause of stunting. - Water, Sanitation, and Hygiene, and Local Government: An efficient local government system is indispensable to an efficient Water, Sanitation, and Hygiene (WASH) agenda. Beyond supporting the federal and provincial governments, the World Bank Group should fund and strengthen local partners

	like local governments to ensure the CPF's focus on building sustainable and resilient communities at the grassroots. - Stunting starts before Pregnancy, especially in the case of adolescent girls. In rural areas, poor families have a male nutrition bias. This and other factors contribute to a disequilibrium in stunting and learning problems, putting girls at greater disadvantage than boys. - Lessons Learnt: Incorporate the successful Orangi Pilot Project as a model in the WASH agenda. The project used innovative low-cost water and sanitation, health, housing, and microfinance to squatter areas of Orangi in Karachi and was successfully implemented by local non-governmental organizations (NGOs).
REDUCING LEARNING POVERTY	- The Education-Poverty Nexus: Lack of access to education and the consequent learning poverty contributes to general poverty. - Teaching Quality and Curriculum Reform: The poor quality of teaching and curricula has become a silent crisis in Pakistan, forcing students to leave schools. - Conditional Cash Transfer for Education: Learning poverty is linked to general poverty, worsened by inflation which forces parents to send children to work to supplement household income. Conditional Cash Transfer (CCT) could help children, especially girls, return to school.
DECARBONIZATION OF THE ECONOMY	- Electric Vehicles and Thermal Energy: The shift to electric vehicles (EV) will increase demand for energy – presently generated from thermal sources in Pakistan and being the main cause of carbon emissions. - Electric Vehicles or Urban Planning: Perhaps better traffic management can reduce emissions as much as electric vehicles. A better planned and improved public urban transport system could help cut down carbon emissions. - Road to Railways: With the push to run cargo on trains and not trucks to reduce emissions, what is overlooked is the fact that a lot of people are dependent on road cargo for livelihoods. Shifting to rail cargo transportation will create new challenges to create jobs. - Long-term Independent Power Producers (IPP) Contracts, running well into 2050 and 2060, are contributing to fiscal imbalances as the circular debt adds up over the decades, claiming a major chunk of revenue.
MORE INCLUSIVE JOB OPPORTUNITIES	- Women's Participation in the Labor Force: The increase in female labour force participation in recent years could be a result of the rising cost of living.
OTHER PRIORITIES	- Information Communication Technologies and Behavior Change Communication may serve as useful tools for awareness around the five CPF themes. - Scale and Ownership: More information on the scale and scope of CPF interventions in terms of percentages, allocation (federal vs provincial), and indicators is needed. How will local and national ownership of its objectives and goals be created? What is the extent of public budget and private funds crowded into different heads under the CPF? - Ensuring Access to Data and Information for people in general, for better public planning and particularly for the private sector to undertake interventions that are both efficient and needed.

	- Micro Vs Macro: The interventions in the CPF are micro-economic in their focus. How would they address the macroeconomic crisis in the country? - Political Instability: Political instability is a major factor contributing to the country's economic woes. The CPF must be built on accountability and conditionalities to ensure that the support offered does not fall prey to political shocks. - Policy Conflicts: The policies related to development subjects at the federal level are different from those at the provincial level. This divergence became more acute in the aftermath of the 18th Amendment. This impacts the national and provincial development agendas, causing political polarization.
--	---

CIVIL SOCIETY ORGANISATIONS & MEDIA

THEMATIC AREA	DISCUSSION POINTS
REDUCING STUNTING	- Immunization and Stunting: Many children have no access to vaccination. Zero-dozed children are vulnerable to infections that may cause stunting. - Prioritize Family Planning: The reducing stunting agenda is comprehensive, but family planning is treated as a secondary focus when it should be the primary. Stunting among mothers and children results from a lack of family planning. - Local Government Reforms: Local governments should be reformed to ensure human resource development (HRD) at the community level.
REDUCING LEARNING POVERTY	- Access to Education: Improving access to education is a key concern. What key Performance Indicators (KPIs) would go into evaluating progress on this? - Children Out-of-School: With millions of children still out of school, the challenges related to learning poverty are immense. - Education is not a Priority in Pakistan, owing more to a lack of political will and interest, than a shortage of resources and funds. - Out-of-the-Box Solutions: Out-of-school children need out-of-the-box solutions. Efforts so far have not delivered to increase enrollment and discourage drop-outs. - Curriculum Reforms: Access to learning is important but so are reforms in curriculum to produce good citizens.
RESILIENCE TO CLIMATE CHANGE	- Resilient Agriculture: How will this be achieved? What will be the nature of participation from the communities? Would there be institutional reforms related to both water and agriculture, without which yield cannot increase? What agri-reforms are needed to address elite capture in the countryside fields? These reforms can work to strengthen cooperative agriculture structures. - Participatory Irrigation and Agriculture Mechanisms: If land reforms are too radical, could participatory mechanisms be initiated to strengthen irrigation and agriculture? - Integration of Irrigation and Agriculture Departments: The former is more into a “brick and mortar” function, focusing on building infrastructure and not its management. Human resource in the irrigation sector needs to be diversified to become compatible with climate change realities, such as changing crop patterns and their irrigation needs based on innovative solutions and approaches. - A Preventive not Curative Approach: When it comes to development agendas, they tend to be curative, not preventive. In addition to climate-

	compatible development, there is a need to look into solutions like social forestry that could deliver significant green cover over the 10 years of CPF.
STRENGTHENING THE PRIVATE SECTOR	- Strengthen the private sector by providing an enabling environment for them to invest in Pakistan. - Building Synergies: How does the World Bank plan to synergize the private and the public sectors under different CPF heads, when the two sectors have different operational approaches and work ethic? Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and civil society organizations (CSOs) need to work closely with the government and should be integrated into the CPF implementation plan.
MORE INCLUSIVE JOB OPPORTUNITIES	- Focus on Youth: Skills development for youth should be a priority but vocational training is absent from the CPF. Punjab has good vocational training institutions where youth can learn digital skills - even out-of-school children can acquire productive skills there.
OTHER PRIORITIES	- Digitization: Official systems and networks need to be digitized for efficiency, documentation, and transparency. - Finance and Loans: Banks function on a 'give and take' basis – providing loans to only those individuals and businesses who have the potential to repay. Micro-finance also hasn't delivered on its own, with micro-finance institutions having little success in Pakistan. - Data Availability: There is not enough data available for indicators related to the CPF subjects. Planning largely encompasses aggregated data when it must be disaggregated to develop a true picture of poverty and attendant inequalities. - Inter-Sectoral Coordination: The 'rules of business' overseeing the inter-departmental and inter-sectoral coordination at the provincial level are redundant because they are rarely followed. At best, the coordination is ad-hoc, often causing duplication of projects and activities. - A more nuanced approach to development is required. Regions with high economic growth make development interventions sustainable because of relative prosperity and availability of developed human capital. The same approach to development cannot work for regions that do not have the wherewithal for sustainable development.