Delivery Systems for Labor Programs: A Framework

John Blomquist
World Bank
October 31, 2019
Outline

- What are delivery systems in social protection
- The delivery chain and enabling information technology
- The delivery chain summary (the “Sourcebook”)
- Selected trends and key messages
Countries offer a range of risk management policies and programs to help households manage shocks to livelihoods, reduce poverty and improve equity. These occur across the life cycle of individuals. (The “what”)

Delivery systems are the processes and methods by which programs are actually implemented. They cut across the types of programs. (The “hows”)

- Social Safety Nets
- Labor/Skills
- Jobs
- Pensions & Social Insurance
Given diverse needs, many countries offer many social protection **benefits** & **services** to various groups along the life cycle.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cash Transfers (CCTs or UCTs)</th>
<th>In-Work Benefits</th>
<th>Disability Benefits</th>
<th>Social Pensions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Food Stamps</td>
<td>Maternity Benefits</td>
<td>Unemployment Benefits</td>
<td>Contributory Pensions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Birth, Child Allowances</td>
<td>School Feeding, Supplies, Transport</td>
<td>Wage Subsidies</td>
<td>Survivor &amp; Death Benefits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing &amp; Utility Subsidies</td>
<td>Scholarships</td>
<td>Public Works</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency Assistance</td>
<td>Scholarships</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Health Benefits**

- **Birth, Child Allowances**
- **Maternity Benefits**
- **School Feeding, Supplies, Transport**
- **Nutrition Supplements**
- **Scholarships**
- **Wage Subsidies**
- **Public Works**

**Transport Subsidies**

**Social Work Services:** Information & awareness; Assessment & referrals; Counseling & mediation

- **Family Services**
- **Parenting Services**
- **Child Care Services**
- **ECD & Nutrition**
- **Emergency Services**
- **Child Protective Services**
- **Services for At-Risk Youth**
- **Disability Services**
- **Active Aging Services**
- **Employment Services to help people find jobs**
- **ALMPs to help people improve employability, skills**
- **Financial & Productive Inclusion Services**
- **Social & Long-Term Care Services**

**Legal services**
All Benefits and Services Have a Similar Delivery Chain

Assess
Potential Demand

Enroll

Provide

Monitor & Manage

1. Assess
2. Enroll
3. Provide
4. Monitor & Manage

Recurring Cycle

7 8
All Benefits and Services Have a Similar Delivery Chain

1. Outreach
2. Intake & Registration
3. Assess Needs & Conditions
4. Eligibility & Enrollment Decisions
5. Determine Benefits & Service Package
6. Notification & Onboarding
7. Benefits and/or Services
8. Recurring Cycle
9. Monitor & Manage

- Potential Demand
- Assess Needs & Conditions
- Eligibility & Enrollment Decisions
- Determine Benefits & Service Package
- Notification & Onboarding
- Benefits and/or Services
- Monitor & Manage
- Exit Decisions
- Notifications
- Case Outcomes

Periodic Re-Assessment
People & Institutions interact all along the delivery chain.

Communications, Information Systems, and Technology can all serve as enablers to help intermediate among them.
The Challenge of Fragmentation
Information systems as enabling factors all along the delivery chain

1. Outreach
2. Intake & Registration
3. Assess Needs & Conditions
4. Eligibility & Enrollment Decisions
5. Determine Benefits & Service Package
6. Notification & Onboarding
7. Benefits and/or Services
8. Recurring cycle
9. Monitor & Manage

Assess
Potential Demand

Enroll

Provide

Recurring Cycle

Monitor & Manage

Potential Demand

Assess Needs & Conditions

Eligibility & Enrollment Decisions

Determine Benefits & Service Package

Notification & Onboarding

Benefits and/or Services

Recruiting

Monitor & Manage

Information systems as enabling factors all along the delivery chain
Beneficiary Operations Management System

1. Registration & Assessment system
2. Benefit Management
3. Process Automation
4. Information systems as enabling factors all along the delivery chain

Assess Potential Demand

Enroll

Provide

Monitor & Manage

Recurring Cycle

Outreach
Intake & Registration
Assess Needs & Conditions
Eligibility & Enrollment Decisions
Determine Benefits & Service Package
Notification & Onboarding
Benefits and/or Services
Beneficiaries Grievances Compliance
Exit Decisions Notifications Case Outcomes

Registration & Assessment system
Beneficiary Operations Management System
Beneficiary Management
Compliance Monitoring
Foundational Technology Platforms for Social Protection and Beyond
Useful Tool: “Swim Lanes” Delivery Chain Process Maps: Clarity of Institutional Roles & Sequencing of Steps

Outreach

1. Go to ESO to register as unemployed

Intake & Registration

2. Review documents, certify UWOI declaration
3. Go to SSO to pick up UA application
4. Provide application form, checklist, information on UA process
5. Fill out application, gather docs, go to SSO to submit application
6a. Enter data into UNISO, scan documents, cross-check information
6b. Enter data into UNISO, scan documents, cross-check information
7. Go to SSO for interview on scheduled date
8. Conduct interview, obtain consent form, explain next steps
9. Assess client profile; submit profile to MoSA via UNISO
10. UNISO verifies client data, and automatically checks eligibility and computes benefits for UA and other benefits
12. Receives MoSA’s decisions, sends notifications to applicants

Assessment of N&C

11. Enrollment Decision
13. Receive notification; if approved go to ESO
15. Start job search, record efforts in Jobseeker Logbook
16. File 1st benefit claim at SSO
17. Check client information, verify compliance in job search logbook; submit reviewed benefit claim to MoSA
18. Reviews benefit claims, authorizes payment and sends payment order to post office (not shown), which then sends the check to clients in the mail
19. Receives 1st Payment, Go to ESO
20. Continue job search, Go to ESO
21a. Monthly service appointment with client: provide Job Search Assistance, referrals
21b. Monthly service appointment with client: provide Job Search Assistance, referrals
22. Record service visit in Jobseeker logbook
23. File 2nd benefit claim at SSO
24. Check client information, verify compliance in job search logbook; submit reviewed benefit claim to MoSA
25. Reviews benefit claims, authorizes payment and sends payment order to post office (not shown), which then sends the check to clients in the mail
26. Receives 2nd Payment, continues job search activities & recording in logbook

Social Support Office (SSO)

Employment Service Office (ESO)

Monitoring

Monitoring Benefit Provision

Benefit Provision

Service Provision

Repeat 20-26
Journey Mapping Tools: Anais’ Experience applying for UA Benefits with Job Search Conditions

**Experiences:** Negative to Positive

**Doing:** Steps, Actions, Touchpoints

- Learn about UA through friends
- Take bus to ESO, Walk to SSO; Long lines at both offices.
- Go back to ESO, Create Jobseeker profile on self-service kiosk; Print Jobseeker number; Pickup Jobseeker Logbook
- Go back to SSO for interview
- Go back to SSO twice to inquire about status of her application. Missed notification? Search for a job...
- Go back to SSO to submit Application
- Go back to SSO to file Benefit Claim

**Feeling:** Highs, Lows, Painpoints

- Hopingful
- Discouraged by process; worried about using up savings to pay bills
- Hopefully the benefits will arrive soon
- Worried about delays, missed notification, & paying bills; still no job leads despite efforts
- Relieved!
- Still hopeful, but worried about paying bills; Only a few leads for job search
- Frustrated: Check still hasn’t arrived, miss paying some bills

**TCV**

- 4 + 3 hours $4 bus fare 2 visits
- 18 hours $16 bus fare $10 notary fees 4 trips
- 3 hours Long walk 1 visit
- 6 hours Long walk 1 visit
- 3+3 hours Long walk 2 visits
- 4 + 3 hours $4 bus fare 2 visits
- 3+3 hours Long walk 2 visits

**Scenario 1: Katia’s Experience Applying for UA Benefits with Job Search Requirements**

- Onboarding @ EFO
- Create Jobseeker profile on self-service kiosk
- Print Jobseeker number
- Pickup Jobseeker Logbook
- Go to ESO, SSO
- Long walk 2 visits
- Go back to SSO twice to inquire about status of her application.
- Missed notification?
- Search for a job...
- Go back to SSO to file Benefit Claim

**Onboarding @ EFO**

- Receive Benefit Check By Mail; Continue Job search...

**Receive Approval Notification By Mail**

- File Claim
- Receive Benefit Check By Mail; Continue Job search...

**Receive Approval Notification By Mail**

- Approval!
- Still hopeful, but worried about paying bills; Only a few leads for job search
- Benefit check arrives!
- Job Search

**Gather docs**

- 2 visits
- 63 days after losing job...
Chapter 1: Introduction

Chapter 2: Overview of the social protection delivery systems framework, including delivery chain, actors (clients, institutions, interface) and enabling factors (communications, information systems and technology)

Chapter 3: Assess
Potential Demand

Chapter 4: Intake & Registration
Assess Needs & Conditions

Chapter 5: Enroll
Eligibility & Enrollment Decisions
Determine Benefits & Service Package
Notification & Onboarding

Chapter 6 - Benefits
Chapter 7 - Services

Chapter 8: Provide
Benefits and/or Services

Chapter 9: Measuring, Monitoring & Evaluating the Performance of SP Delivery Systems

Chapter 10: Conclusions and Future Directions in Delivery Systems

Glossary of Terms
### Demographic Groups:
- e.g., Children, Elderly

### Categorical Programs:
- e.g., Child Allowances, Social Pensions

### Socio-Economic Groups:
- e.g., Poor, Low-Income

### Programs Targeted by Socio-Economic Status:
- e.g., UCTs, CCTs, public works, labor benefits, social services, health insurance subsidies, needs-based scholarships, housing & utility benefits, etc.

### Individuals Classified by Labor-Force Status:
- e.g., Unemployed, Job-Seekers

### Labor Benefits & Services:
- e.g., Unemployment Insurance & Assistance, Employment Services, ALMPs, activation packages

### Disabled Persons:
- Moderate vs Severe; Short-Term vs Long-Term

### Benefits & Services for the Disabled:
- e.g., Disability Insurance & Assistance; Social-Care Services

### Individuals Facing Social Risks:
- e.g., Children, Youth, Adults, Elderly

### Social Services:
- e.g., Social Work Services (information & awareness; assessment & referrals; counseling & mediation); Social Care Services (home, community, institutional); Specialized Preventative Services

### Integrated Approaches:
- e.g., Population groups with multiple constraints

### Integrated Approaches for Programs:
- e.g., Programs with multiple eligibility criteria; multiple programs using common delivery platforms
Chapter 1: Outreach
Outreach is crucial for promoting inclusion, awareness, and understanding.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outreach Method</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Direct Outreach</td>
<td>- Outreach officers&lt;br&gt;- On-demand&lt;br&gt;- Mobile teams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community-Based Outreach</td>
<td>- Peer-to-peer outreach and mentoring&lt;br&gt;- Rely on local capacities for disseminating info, connecting people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outreach via Intermediaries</td>
<td>- Personal referrals from other professionals or programs&lt;br&gt;- Disseminate info via other services (schools, clinics, etc.)&lt;br&gt;- Info via other organizations – e.g., foundations, employer or trade organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indirect Outreach</td>
<td>- Printed media&lt;br&gt;- Mass media&lt;br&gt;- Online, websites</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Avoid Access Barriers:
Chapter 4: Registering & Assessing Intended Population
Instruments to Assess Jobseekers
Integrated Approach to Assess Needs and Conditions

- **Group 1: Closer to LM, Ready for Activation**
  - Jobseekers; ST unemployed
  - Complexity of Risks, including Social Risks: Low

- **Group 2: Farther from LM, Need to enhance employability**
  - LT unemployed, discouraged workers, lack skills, first-time job seekers, inactive
  - Complexity of Risks, including Social Risks: Low

- **Group 3: Closer to LM, willing to work, but with some social constraints**
  - e.g., disability, parenting responsibilities, language or cultural barriers
  - Complexity of Risks, including Social Risks: High

- **Group 4: Farther from LM, complex social risks**
  - (not activable right away)
  - Complexity of Risks, including Social Risks: High
Many countries use Integrated Social Registries as a common registration & eligibility “gateway” for numerous social programs.

See our recent social registries study: Leite et. al. (2017).
Integrated Social Registries can serve as Integrated Platforms for Social Protection & Beyond

See our recent social registries study: Leite et. al. (2017).
Chapter 5: Who gets in & Who gets what?
Tensions between inclusion goals & limited budget constraints

1. Outreach
   - Intended Population

2. Intake & Registration
   - Registrants
   - Content of information + info from interoperability, CBT methods; + Issue of registration targets/quotas
   - Registered population that is assessed for needs & conditions

3. Assessment of Needs & Conditions
   - Tools and algorithms for profiling classifications

4. Eligibility & Enrollment Decisions
   - Eligible Population
   - Enrolled Eligible Applicants (in)
   - Non-enrolled Eligible Applicants (waitlist)

5. Decide on B/S Package; Notification & On-boarding

6. Enrolled Beneficiaries
   - Some people may be referred to other programs

7. Decide on B/S Package; Notification & On-boarding

8. Enrolled Beneficiaries
   - Some people may be referred to other programs
Tensions Between Design of Benefit Menus vs. Ease of Implementation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Benefit Structure</th>
<th>INFORMATION FOR BENEFITS CALCULATIONS</th>
<th>NOTIFICATION &amp; BENEFICIARY UNDERSTANDING</th>
<th>PAYMENTS PROCESSING, DENOMINATION ISSUE</th>
<th>MONITORING, UPDATES, GRM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. FLAT BENEFITS</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1 (especially if even denomination)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. VARIABLE BY HH SIZE, COMPOSITION</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. VARIABLE BY SOCIO-ECONOMIC GROUP</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. VARIABLE BENEFITS DIFFERENTIATED BY INCOME LEVEL (e.g., GMI)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. VARIABLE BENEFITS BY EARNINGS &amp; CONTRIBUTION HISTORY (UI, DI)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. VARIABLE BENEFITS BY DEGREE OF DISABILITY</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Activation Benefit-Service Packages for the Unemployed

1. Intake & Registration
2. Assessment of Needs & Conditions (Labor Profiling + Caseworker Assessment)
3. Far from LM + Complex Risks
4. Determine Eligibility
5. Assign Benefit & Service Packages

Goals: Improve Employability / Address Complex Risks
- Intensive Counseling/IAP
- Social Assistance Benefit
- ALMPs to enhance employability
- Referrals to social services

Goals: Improve Employability
- Counseling/IAP
- UI/UA Benefit
- ALMPs to enhance employability
- Some Employment Services

Goals: Connect with Jobs
- Possible IAP
- Short-term UI/UA Benefits
- Employment Services, such as job search assistance, career counseling

Then Provision of B&S, Monitoring of IAPs
Chapter 6: Provision of Payment Benefits
Payments implementation involves two main processes: administration & provision

Chapter builds on: Payments Inventory (forthcoming), G2P 3.0 (CGAP), Previous CGAP inventories, in-country SPJ work
How are Payments Implemented?  
Composite Example – with Digital EBCs & Manual Payments

Central Level (MoSA, Payment Info System)
- Generate Payroll (HH designated recipient IDs, amounts, payment methods)
- Approve Payroll (final closing)
- Send payment instruction to Treasury & Send payroll order to PSP

National Treasury
- Reviews payments instruction and schedules transfer of funds to MoSA Account
- Check are printed, sorted and sealed according to post office batches

Payment Service Provider (PSP)
- PSP receives funds and payments order from Treasury
- PSP receives payroll order with details from MoSA
- PSP transfers to each Benefit Card accordingly

Funds Flows
- Checks are printed, sorted, sealed and sent in batches to each local PSP Agency
- Local PSP Agency receives, verifies and records batch of checks with payroll instructions
- Local PSP Agency announces payments schedule and locations
- Beneficiaries pick up checks at local PSP agency or distribution point, with ID Authentication

Beneficiaries
- Beneficiaries Cash Out With EBC with card & PIN
Payments administration

Multi-actor/ Multi-sector agenda

Establishment of payroll: Interoperability of BOMS & Social Registry and ID system(s)

Payments management: Interactions with MOF (Treasury) and Payment Service Provider(s) (PSP) for the delivery of funds

Reconciliation of payments: Confirmation of who and when received the benefits

Process (administration) maps for: Nigeria, Ghana, Indonesia, Turkey, Pakistan, Bangladesh

Technology support payments admin: from excel list (Ghana), to payments module in BOMS (Turkey), payment ‘gateways’ to provide interoperability with PSP (Zambia) or even block chain (Australia)
Rapid evolution in payments delivery mainly linked to technological development and financial sector regulatory changes.

### Payments Service Provision

- **Instrument**
- **Security**
- **Modality**

### Actors/PSP (and inst. arrangements)
- Methods (manual vs. electronic)
- Instruments (cash, voucher, cards, e-wallets, biometric)
- Frequency
- Indicative Costs
- Innovations (including behavioral nudges)

### Evolution of Safety Net Payment in Bangladesh

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Version</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Instrument</th>
<th>Security</th>
<th>Modality</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>Payments not from FI</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Unsecured</td>
<td>FSP-based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>Payments from State owned FI</td>
<td>Cheque</td>
<td>Semi secure</td>
<td>FSP-based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>Payments from State owned FI + Private FI</td>
<td>Mobile Phone &amp; Exisit Card</td>
<td>Full secure</td>
<td>FSP-based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>Payments from State owned FI + Private FI</td>
<td>Mobile Phone &amp; Exisit Card-Biometric</td>
<td>Fully secure</td>
<td>Customer elects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>Payments from any FI</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>Fully secure</td>
<td>Customer elects</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Aziz, Cho, Nishikawa Chavez, 2018*
Chapter 7: Provision of Social & Labor Services
# Table 7.6 – Taxonomy of Labor Services for the Short-Term and Long-Term Unemployed by Type of Service

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Risk Group</th>
<th>Benefits (Passive or Active)</th>
<th>Employment Services: helping people find jobs</th>
<th>Employability-Enhancing Services / ALMPs: helping people become more employable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Short-Term Unemployed (similar for youth/first-time job seekers)** | • ST benefits (UI or UA), usually with IAPs & co-responsibilities  
• Back-to-work incentives  
• Start-up support for businesses, entrepreneurship | • Self-service tools  
• Job matching platforms  
• Websites and call centers | • Job search assistance  
• Caseworker guidance and monitoring, including IAPs  
• Job referrals  
• Career counseling | • Training to refresh or upgrade skills  
• Entrepreneurship training  
• Apprenticeships  
• Wage subsidies for firms to hire unemployed or first-time job seekers  
• Subsidies for firms to adjust working place or to purchase assistive technology for employees with disabilities |
| **Long-Term Unemployed (LTU)**                 | • LT benefits (UA or SA after UI runs out), usually with IAPs & co-responsibilities         | • Self-service tools & job matching platforms  
• Outreach activities for youth, discouraged, inactive workers | • Intensified counseling and caseworker guidance, including IAPs  
• Some job search assistance, referrals  
• Mentoring | • Job-readiness and soft-skills training  
• Occupational / technical skills training  
• Basic & second-chance education  
• Digital literacy  
• Wage subsidies for firms to hire LTU  
• Public works/job creation |

Source: Authors’ compilation based on: Kuddo (May 2012); Loxha and Morgandi (August 2014); Brown and Koettl (2015).  
ST = Short Term; UI = Unemployment Insurance; UA = Unemployment Assistance; IAP = Individualized Action Plans; LT = Long Term; SA = Social Assistance; LTU = Long Term Unemployed.
Composite Example: Labor Services for Youth-at-Risk (NEET)

Outreach, Intake, Registration, Assessment

- Self-Initiated (walk-in)
- Active Recruitment
- Referral from other agency, program, professional

Intake, Registration, Initial Assessment

- Job-or-Training-Ready?

Comprehensive Assessment

- Ready to work?

Establish IAP With Service Package

Enrollment

- Yes
- No

Employment Services (job search assistance, placement, etc.)

Training Programs

Apprenticeship Program

Life & Workplace Skills Program

Education Programs (Basic & 2nd Chance Education, Higher Ed)

Social Services Agency (complex needs)

Health Services (Mental, physical Health concerns)

Monitoring & Management

Programs Managed by PES

Public Provision (PES)

Vendor or Voucher

Partnership

Public Provision (PES)

Establish IAP

With Service Package

Outreach, Intake, Registration, Assessment

M&M
# Modalities for Integrated Service Delivery (Labor and/or Social Services)

## Table 7.9 – Instruments for integrated provision of services

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Instrument</th>
<th>Information and Orientation</th>
<th>Levels of integration</th>
<th>Case Work</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Information Systems</td>
<td>Service Mapping with additional information for managing and improving the system (number and types of requests, etc.)</td>
<td>Contains specific information about the client. Ideally this system would automatically calculate the eligibility for each individual/family. It also serves for the referrals.</td>
<td>More sophisticated system that supports assessment (information gathering and eligibility calculation), planning (preparing the joint plan), and monitoring the joint plan. Serves the referrals and counter-referrals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Mapping</td>
<td>Contains information on generic characteristics such as location, schedule, main eligibility criteria, type of support, etc.</td>
<td>Must contain detailed information on the eligibility criteria, and the specific schedule or timing for receiving new beneficiaries</td>
<td>Similar details as for intermediation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Referral and Counter-referral mechanisms</td>
<td>N.A.</td>
<td>Simple service protocols, often just general agreements to collaborate</td>
<td>More detailed service protocols specifically containing how the referral and counter-referrals would be done, and the joint monitoring of the case</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single Case File</td>
<td>N.A.</td>
<td>File including simple information, from a short screening, generally not sent to other programs</td>
<td>More detailed file, containing information from assessment, joint plan and activities, and monitoring of progress informed by the services themselves (and not the clients)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter 8: How to Monitor & Manage Beneficiaries?
Beneficiary Monitoring and Management Framework

Main BMM Functions and other information streams (inputs)
- Basic Beneficiary Management
- Conditionalities Monitoring
- GRM
- Reconciliation

Information processing & decisions
- Information is validated, processed and recorded
- Decisions are made

Updated Beneficiary Information (output)
- Updated Beneficiary Registry
- Updated Benefit/Service Package
- Grievance process updated
- Updated delivery logistics
- Required field actions

From Provision Stage (recurrent cycle) → To Provide Stage
- New beneficiaries

From Enrollment Stage →
### Basic Beneficiary Management Framework

#### Source of Update

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Triggered</th>
<th>Beneficiary Triggered</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fieldwork-based</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Database Interlink-based</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Updating Process

**Updating rules / protocols**
- Updating periods
- Update requirements
- Validation
- Authorization / approval

#### Outputs

- Update the beneficiary registry (including exiting beneficiaries)
- Update the benefit or Service package.
- Update delivery logistics.
- Basic information corrected
Labor Program Compliance Verification

Central Level (Ministry or Department)

Employment Service Office (ESO) or Service Provider

Jobseeker

Social Support Office (SSO)

Check jobseeker information, verify compliance in logbook, submit claim to center (or recommend sanction)

Record service visit, may record job activity as per IAP

Offer remedial service or revise IAP (if available)

Start job search or ES activity, may record in logbook or online

Participate in service and/or resume job search

Approve claim or Issue remedial action/sanction

Approve

Payroll Department for benefit calculation and payment of UI or UA

Action/sanction

Approve

No

Terminate/withdraw

Yes

Payroll Department for benefit calculation and payment of UI or UA
### Grievances, Complaints, Appeals Along the Delivery Chain: Examples

#### Recurring Cycle

1. **Assess**
   - Potential Demand

2. **Enroll**
   - Eligibility & Enrollment
   - Determine Benefits & Service Package
   - Notification & Onboarding
3. **Provide**
   - Benefits and/or services

4. **Monitor & Manage**
   - Recurring Cycle
   - Beneficiary Monitoring
   - Grievance Redress
   - Compliance Monitoring
   - Exit Decisions
   - Notifications
   - Closing Cases

#### Key Milestones

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Milestone</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Outreached</td>
<td>People not informed or missed due to outreach efforts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Intake &amp; Registration</td>
<td>Information errors, miscommunication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Assess Needs &amp; Conditions</td>
<td>Inclusion &amp; exclusion errors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Eligibility &amp; Enrollment</td>
<td>Determining eligibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Determine Benefits &amp; Service Package</td>
<td>Benefit amount errors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Notification &amp; Onboarding</td>
<td>Wrongful terminations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Benefits and/or Services</td>
<td>Benefit payment errors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Monitor &amp; Manage</td>
<td>Payment service complaints</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Oversee</td>
<td>Data correction errors</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Examples

**Outreach:**
- "We weren't informed" (people excluded from or missed by outreach efforts);
- "That's what they told us" (misinformation, miscommunication).

**Intake & Registration:**
- "The information on my income is incorrect." (information error?)
- "We weren't given a chance to register." (exclusion)
- "We had to wait many hours and come back many times." (TCV)
- "La entrevistadora no hablaba inglés." (lack of language translation for intake)

**Assessment:**
- "Why were we classified as higher-income/employed?" (questions on assessment)
- "The caseworker refused to certify my disability status even though I had a note from the clinic." (assessment error?)
- "The caseworker was rude and judgmental about my situation." (process)

**Eligibility, B&S Package:**
- "My neighbor has a car and was admitted to the program, but my situation is worse and I was excluded." (exclusion & inclusion errors?)
- "I never heard back from the program about my application." (failure to notify)
- "My cousin's family was awarded $120 per month, but we only get $90." (benefit errors?)
- "My pension was miscalculated due to errors in my contributions data." (social insurance complaint on benefit amounts)
- "They made me sign an individual action plan that I was not comfortable with, but I wanted to get the benefits so I signed it anyway." (individual action plans)

**Payment of Benefits:**
- "My account was not credited this month." (missing or delayed payment)
- "This month's payment was less than last month." (payment error)
- "We have to walk 6 hours to get to the payment point, the post used to bring it to us directly." (payment service complaints)

**Provision of Services:**
- "They have no jobs for me." (lack of job placement services)
- "The caseworker put me in a job that I am over-qualified for." (mismatched employment)
- "The day care center that they placed us with is dirty and the staff ignore the kids." (quality service standards)

**Oversee:**
- "My address is incorrect in the system so I missed the notification." (data correction)
- "I filed a complaint 6 months ago and never heard back." (complaints about GRM)
- "My kid was in school the whole month, why did they reduce our benefits for absences?" (complaint on conditionalities compliance and consequences)
- "I have to go to the PES and CSW every three months to show that I’m looking for a job – I can’t afford to take that many buses." (TCV, processes)
- "My benefits were wrongly terminated." (appeal of exit decision)
Chapter 9: Performance of Delivery Systems
Common lack of attention to role of delivery in M&E Frameworks

**Impacts**
- Reduced poverty, inequality, vulnerability and malnutrition

**Outputs**
- Productive inclusion of poor and vulnerable beneficiaries
- Increased consumption
- Increased social inclusion
- Enhanced resilience of beneficiaries to moderate shocks

**Intermediate outcomes**
- Increased livelihood diversification
- Increased income
- Strengthened linkages and referral of beneficiaries to complementary benefits and services
- Increased access to financial and income generating activities and skills building

**Activities (Programs)**
- Categorical Programs for Demographic Groups
- Programs for Poor / Low-income Groups
- Benefits & Services for Persons with Disabilities
- Labor Benefits/Services
- Social Services for Individuals/Families
- Integrated approaches for benefits & services

Performance of delivery systems
• **Performance measurement** indicates what a program does and how well it does it (formative, ongoing, responsive, adaptive, relying on routine operational data)

• **Program evaluation** determines the program’s effect on the beneficiaries it is serving (summative, discrete, relying on external data collection like special surveys)

When the cook tastes the soup, that’s formative  
When the guests taste the soup, that’s summative

Robert Stakes

Source: *Measure4Change* program, World Bank Group and the Urban Institute
### Delivery Systems Performance Indicators: Examples

**Assess**
- Potential Demand
  - % of population that is registered
    - **Data source:** Numerator: Registry data; Denominator: census data
  - % of intended population that is registered (or of vulnerable groups)
    - **Data source:** Numerator: Registry data with indicators of characteristics of intended population; Denominator: Administrative, Census, HH survey data
  - % of registered population with up-to-date basic information (e.g., < 2 years old)
    - **Data source:** Numerator: Registry data or Periodic audit data; Denominator: Registry data
  - % of service clients with Individualized Action Plans (IAPs)
    - **Data source:** Administrative data

**Enroll**
- Eligibility & Enrollment Decisions
- Determine Benefits & Service Package
- Notification & Onboarding
  - % of intended population enrolled in the program and % of benefits going to specific groups (e.g., poorest quintile)
    - **Data source:** ASPIRE coverage and coverage data; administrative data from program; denominator: administrator, census, or HH survey data
  - Processing times: # of days from application to eligibility notification; # of applications processed according to quality standards (e.g., < 30 days)
    - **Data source:** Administrative data

**Provide**
- Benefits and/or Services
  - % of registered grievances resolved
    - **Data source:** GRM data
  - % of individual beneficiaries in each category with conditionalities monitoring information
    - **Data source:** Administrative data
  - % of service clients with IAPs that are monitored according to quality standards
    - **Data source:** Administrative data

**Monitor & Manage**
- Recurring Cycle
- % of beneficiaries with updated information
  - **Data source:** Administrative info
- % of sampled (or cross-checked) beneficiaries without information errors
  - **Data source:** Periodic audits or cross-check
- % of registered grievances resolved
- Beneficiaries Compliance
- Exit Decisions
- Notifications
- Case Outcomes

**Recurring Cycle**

1. Outreach
2. Intake & Registration
3. Assess Needs & Conditions
4. Eligibility & Enrollment Decisions
5. Determine Benefits & Service Package
6. Notification & Onboarding
7. Benefits and/or Services
8. Monitoring
9. Manage
### Menu of assessment options for delivery systems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evaluation Type</th>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Approach</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Process Evaluation</strong></td>
<td>Focus on implementation processes to identify what works, what doesn’t and why, and how to remedy issues</td>
<td>A range of evaluation methods (quantitative and qualitative) can be leveraged, including user satisfaction or beneficiary feedback surveys</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Business Process Reviews</strong></td>
<td>Assess the effectiveness of specific business processes or procedures, typically communication, intake and registration, payment provision, grievance handling</td>
<td>Process mapping, process definition chart</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Compliance audits/checks</strong></td>
<td>Determine whether the rules and procedures are being undertaken in accordance with the requirements of the program and standards operating procedures</td>
<td>Spot checks, sample recheck, to validate the accuracy of the information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Efficiency Analysis</strong></td>
<td>Compare costs of alternative systems or processes, and relate costs to outcomes</td>
<td>Setting out a baseline scenario against which the incremental costs and benefits will be measured, monetizing costs, produce a cost effectiveness ratio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Information Systems Reviews</strong></td>
<td>Determine whether the information systems, related resources and their environment are appropriate (safeguard assets, maintain data integrity, provide reliable information and consume resource efficiently)</td>
<td>Review of data management procedures, data entry, data quality verifications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Institutional Reviews</strong></td>
<td>Diagnostic of the institutional and operational structure of the agency or program to establish whether management system, policies, staffing, organizational structure are appropriate</td>
<td>A range of methods, including staff survey, benchmarking, institutional mapping</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
New trends: linking the 2 frameworks

**Within Impact Evaluations**
- Complementing (quasi)-experimental design with other approaches
- Movement towards “mechanism-based” causal analysis

**Beyond Impact Evaluations**
- Long tradition of process-evaluation
- Systems approach to evaluation
- New sources of data
- More integration with other business practices
Selected Trends in Delivery System Developments

- Surge in digital technologies applied to service delivery
  - Digital payments
  - Cloud technologies
  - Process automation and AI
  - Big data analytics

→ Every problem is a nail to the person with a hammer (!) Assess need and use for technology; Pay attention to data protection and privacy

- Many countries are developing integrated services/benefits delivery approaches. Includes an emphasis on Social Registry/Beneficiary Registry with dynamic inclusion as common gateways for multiple programs (Chile, Brazil, Turkey, Georgia, etc.)

→ Integration of services may be the wave of the future (employment and social services, emergency assistance and housing)
Increasing attention among some governments and institutions to “human-centered design” considerations for delivery systems. Technology is only useful if people can use it (beneficiaries as well as administrators). Leads to a concern over institutional capability for delivery.

Institutions matter, along with budgets, processes and skilled human resources.
Key Messages from the Sourcebook

- Delivery systems evolve over time. Starting points matter (path dependency)
- Keep it simple, do it well (!)
- The weakest link affects the whole system (interconnectedness)
- First mile of client interface matters (often neglected)
- Avoid developing delivery systems in isolation (whole-of-government approach)
- Delivery systems in social protection can enable interventions in other sectors (e.g. health insurance, scholarships, housing, human capital interventions)
- There is no single blueprint for delivery systems, but there are commonalities and context-based good practices.
Thank You!