

Ripot Namba 64458-PG

Report No. 64458-PG

The Inspection Panel



Investigation Report

**INDEPENDENT STATE OF
PAPUA NEW GUINEA:
Smallholder Agriculture
Development Project
(IDA Credit No. 4374-PNG)**

September 19, 2011

Investigesen Ripot

**INDIPENDEN STET BILONG PAPUA NIUGINI:
Smolholda Agrikalsa Dívelopmen Projek (IDA
Credit No. 4374-PNG)
September 19, 2011**

Stori bilong Panel

Inspeksen Panel i bin kirap long mun Septemba 1993, bihainim tok orait bilong Bod bilong ol Eksektiv Dairekta bilong World Bank long mekim wok em yet bilong strongim gutpela wok pasin long wok bilong Benk, bihainim ol polisi na wok bilong em. Inspeksen Panel em i wanpela masin bilong ol grup i gat tupela o moa manmeri husat i bilip olsem sindaun bilong ol i bungim hevi long wok Wol Benk i givim mani long mekim, long autim wari bilong ol insait long wanpela Request of Inspeksen, o Askim long Wok Sekim.

Panel i stap olsem bris namel long Benk na ol pipel i kisim hevi long ol projek Benk i givim mani long ol.

Ol memba bilong Panel, em ol i save makim ol – *bihainim save bilong ol long bekim gut askim ol i kisim, we luksave na nem bilong ol long wok ol yet i mekim, i stap ausait long wok bilong Benk Menesmen, na save bilong ol long ol developmen hevi na sindaun insait long ol developing kantri*. Dispela tripela-memba Panel i gat strong bihainim tok orait bilong Bod, long sekim ol hevi we i kamap bikos Benk yet i abrus long bihainim ol opereting polisi na prosidia bilong em.

Wok bilong Panel i bihainim ol bikpela astingting bilong indipendens (sanap wok em yet), integriti (gutpela bel na wok pasin), na impasialiti, o i no bihainim sait bilong wanpela tasol. Ol dispela bikpela astingting na bilip i givim strong long Panel bilong bekim ol hevi i kamap, na tu, long givim gutpela wok skelim long Bod bilong Benk.

Prosesim ol Rikwes o Askim

Bihain long Panel i kisim wanpela Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, em i save bihainim dispela rot:

- Panel bai skelim tingting sapos Rikwes em i *prima facie* o i no tambu long glasim bilong Panel.
- Panel bai rejestaim Rikwes – em wanpela administretiv wok tasol.
- Panel bai salim Rikwes i go long Benk Menesmen, we em i gat 21 wok de long bekim olgeta sut tok i kam long ol lain i kirapim Rikwes.
- Em nau bai Panel i kirapim wanpela sotpela 21 wok de wok glasim bilong sekim sapos ol lain i Askim, na Askim yet i stret o nogat.
- Sapos Panel i rekomenim wanpela wok painim, na Bod i tok oraitim, Panel bai karimaut ful wok painim, we i nogat pinis taim bilong en.
- Sapos Panel i no rekomenim wanpela wok painim, Bod ov Eksektiv Dairektas i ken tokim Panel long karimaut wanpela wok painim, sapos i gat nid long en.
- Tripela de bihain long Bod i tok sapos bai gat wok painim o nogat, Ripot bilong Panel, (wantaim Rikwes o Askim bilong Inspeksen na Bekim bilong Menesmen long en) bai stap long websait bilong Panel na sekreteriet, long Info Sop bilong Benk, na ol wan wan Wol Benk Kantri Opis.

¹ IBRD Resolution No. 93-10; IDA Resolution No. 93-6.

- Taim Panel i pinisim wampela wok painim, em bai salim ol samting me i painimaut, na bungim tingting bilong en long olgeta sut tok i stap insait long Rikwes o Askim bilong Inspeksen, i go long Bod, na tu long Benk Menesmen.
- Em nau, Benk Menesmen bai gat sikspela wik long givim ol rekomendesen bilong en i go long Bod long wanem samting Benk i ken mekim long bekim ol samting Panel i painimaut, na ol bungim tok bilong en.
- Em nau, Bod bai mekim fainol o las disisen long wanem i mas kamap bihainim ol samting Panel i painimaut, na ol rekomendesen o tok stia bilong Benk Menesmen.
- Tripela de bihain long disisen bilong Bod, Ripot bilong Panel na ol Rekomondesens bilong Menesmen bai op long pablik long websait bilong Panel na Sekreteriet, Projek websait bilong Benk, Info Stua bilong Benk, na ol wanwan Kantri Opis bilong Benk.

Tok Luksave

Raitim dispela ripot i no inap kamap sapos i nogat halivim na sapot na planti gutpela stia i kam long planti manmeri. Panel i laik tok tenkyu long ol Rikwesta, o lain i askim, na ol memba bilong ol komyuniti em i bungim insait long Projek eria. Panel i laik tok tenkyu tu long ol memba bilong ol sivil sosaiti ogenaísesen i wok insait long Papua Niugini na wanem arapela hap, husat i bin halivim long kamapim dispela Ripot.

Panel i laik tok tenkyu long planti ol gavman opisa long nesenel na lokol gavman level long Papua Niugini husat i bung wantaim Panel. Ol i bin givim planti tok stia na stori.

Panel i laik tok tenkyu long Menesmen na ol wokman bilong Benk, long halivim ol i givim long painim ol pepa, givim infomesen long Panel, na bekim ol askim ol i raitim na salim i kam, na moa yet, Papua Niugini Kantri Tim long halivim long stretim ol kar na rum silip bilong tim.

Panel i givim luksave long bikpela stia i kam long ol konsalten o saveman bilong, Bruce Carrad, Donald Gilmour, Lesley Potter, na Paul Michael Taylor. Panel i luksave na tok tenkyu tru long gutpela wok pasin ol i bihainim long redim kamap dispela Ripot.

Panel i laik tok tenkyu long Rachel Nathanson, Jennifer Hatch, Matthew Irish, na Leslye Penticoff, husat i givim namba wan risets halivim tru.

Las tru, Panel i laik tok tenkyu na givim luksave long ol memba bilong Sekriteriet, moa yet Dilek Barlas, Deputi Ekseketiv Sekreteri, na Mishka Zaman, Operesens Opisa, long gutpela halivim ol i givim long dispela wok painim.

Ol Sotpela Nem na Toktok

AusAID	Australia Ejensi bilong Intanesenel Developmen
BCS	Bikpela Komyuniti Sapot
CAS	Kantri Asistens Strateji
CDC (British)	Komonwelt Developmen Koporesen
CDD	Komyuniti Driven Developmen
CELCOR	Senta bilong Envairomen Lo na Komyuniti Raits
CLUA	Klen Len Yus Agrimen
CPB	Kastomari Peses Blok
CPO	Krud Welpam
CSTB	Sentral Saplai na Tenda Bod
DEC	Dipatmen bilong Envairomen na Konsavesen
DNPM	Dipatmen bilong Nesenel Plening na Monitaring
DOW	Dipatmen bilong Woks
DPLGA	Dipatmen bilong Provinsal na Lokol Gavman Afes
EA	Envairomen Asesmen
ECMMP	Ol Envairomen Kontrol Mesa na Monitaring Progreman
EMP	Envairomen Menesmen Plen
ERR	Ekonomik Ret ov Riten
ESCR	Ekonomik, Sosol, na Kalsarel Rait
ESMF	Envairomen na Sosol Menesmen Fremwok
FFB	Fres Frut Bans
FIRR	Fainensal Intenal Ret ov Riten
GoPNG	Gavman bilong Papua Niugini
ha	Hekta
HCVF	Hai-Konsavesen Velu Fores
HIV/AIDS	Humun Imunodifisensi Vairus na Akwaiet Imun Difisensi Sindrom
HOP	Higaturu Welpam Limitet
IBRD	Intanesenel Benk bilong Rikonstraksen na Developmen
ICCC	Indipenden Konsuma na Kompetisen Komisin
ICESCR	Intanesenel Kavanen long Ekonomik, Sosol na Kalsarel Raits
ICR	Implimentesen Komplisen Ripot
IDA	Intanesenel Developmen Asosiesen
IEE	Inisal Envairomental Eksaminesen
IPP	Indijines Pipels Plen
LLG	Lokol Level Gavman
LPC	Lokol Plening Komiti
LSS	Len Setelmen Skim
M&E	Monitaring na Iveluesen
MOU	Memorendum ov Andastending
MLFS	Mama Lus Frut Skim
MTDS	Midium-Tem Developmen Strateji
NBPOL	Nu Briten Welpam Developmen Limitet
NIWG	Nesenel Intepritesen Wok Grup
NES	Nuklius Estet Skim
NGO	Non-Gavman Ogenaisesen
NPV	Net Presen Velu
OPIC	Welpam Indastri Koporesen
OPID	Welpam Infrastraksa Developmen
PAD	Projek Apresal Dokumen

PCD	Projek Konsep Dokumen
PIC	Pablik Infomesen Senta
PKO	Welpam Kenal
PNG	Papua Niugini
PNGOPR	Papua Niugini Welpam Risets Asosiesen
PNGSDP	Papua New Guinea Sastenabol Dvelopmen Program
POPGA	Popondetta Welpam Growas Asosiesen
PPM	Pats Pe Milion
PSC	Projek Stiaring Komiti
QABB	Kwin Alexandria Bedwing Bataflai
QAG	Kwolati Asurens Grup
QER	Kwolati Enhensmen Riviu
RMTE	Rot Mentenens Tras Fan
RPF	Risetolmen Polisi Fremwok
RSPO	Rauntebol long Sastenabol Welpam
SA	Sosol Asesmen
SADP	Smolholda Agrikalsa Dvelopmen Projek
SDR	Ol Spesol Droing Rait
VOP	Vies Welpam
WDC	Wod Dvelopmen Komiti
WNB	Wes Nu Briten

Tingim: Olgeta Dola namba i stap insait long dispela ripot em long US dola

Ovaviu

Dispela Investigesen Ripot i kamap long bekim wanpela Rikwes o Askim bilong Inspeksen long Papua Niugini: Smoolholda Agrikalsa Developmen Projek (SADP, o Projek).

Rikwes i kam long Desemba 8, 2009, em Ahora/Kakandetta Pressure Group, em kastomari papagraun long Oro provins na ol smolholda insiat long wanpela long tripela Projek eria (ol – Rikwesta). Ol Rikwesta i askim Senta bilong Envaironmental Lo na Komyuniti Raits (CELCOR), wanpela non-gavman ogenaísesen (NGO) bilong Papua Niugini yet, long makim ol.

Projek i wok kamap long tripela eria long Oro na Wes Nu Briten (WNB) provins. Em i wok bilong apim winmani na strongim sindaun bilong ol smolholda i wok wel pam, we i larim ol i planim moa welpam bihain wok ‘infilling’. Infilling em taim ol i planim ol nupela blok welpam namel long ol blok i stap pinis, na bihainim ol ekseks rot insait long Nuklius Estet na ol Smolholda Skim eria.

Projek em bilong stretim na lukautim ol rural ekseks rot, strongim lokol sevis na infrastraksa bihainim wanpela lokol gavanens na komyuniti wok progreem, na givim institusenal sapot bilong Projek menesmen. Dispela projek i bihainim longpela histori bilong Wol Benk long welpam long Papua Niugini, we i bin kirap long 1969; na Benk i bin go pas long kamapim komasal welpam wok long Oro provins long 1976.

Ol Bikpela Kleim i go long Panel

Ol Rikwesta i bilip olsem Benk i asua long inapim sampela long ol Operesenal Polisi na Prosidia long disain, skelim manimak, na karimaut Projek.

Ol i bilip olsem ol dispela asua i kamapim pinis, o bai kamapim hevi long komyuniti na envaironmen bilong ol.

Tokaut long Infomesen, Konsaltesen, na Bikpela Komyuniti Sapot:

Ol Rikwesta i wari olsem i nogat inap toktok wantaim komyuniti insait long ol Projek eria na gutpela tok klia long olgeta pepa-wok. Ol i tok olsem maski ol em ol tru tru Asples Manmeri na tumbuna papagraun, ol i no gat sans long givim tingting long wokmak bilong Projek, astingting bilong projek, na ol arapela wok. Ol Rikwesta i askim sapos i bin i gat bikpela komyuniti sapot bilong Projek.

Poveti o Turangu Pasin na ol Hevi long Sindaun: Ol Rikwesta i tok planti yia i lus, na wok welpam i no daunim pasin turangu long ol smolholda o strongim sindaun bilong ol, long tripela as. Ol i tok namba wan, bikos ol smolholda i save wok bihainim, na brukim pe wantaim estet mil, we praisim sistem bilong Fres Frut Bans (FFB) i save brukim moa winmani i go long ol mil kampani.

Namba tu, ol Rikwesta i tok i gat ol bikpela takis ol smolholda i mas peim, na dispela i pasim ol long strongim sindaun bilong ol; ol i tok tu, olsem antap long ol kain kain takis i stap pinis, ol i mas peim narapela takis gen long sapotim Rot Mentenens Tras Fan (RMTF), we i kamap aninit long Projek, na dispela i katim winmani bilong ol moa yet.

Na las tru, ol i bilip olsem Projek i save promotim mono-kroping bilong welpam, we ol smolholda i ting sapos ol inap groim ol arapela gaden kaikai, em i ken kisim moa winmani, na i no long welpam tasol. Dispela, ol i tok em i bikpela rot long ol i kamapim mobeta sindaun.

Hevi long Envairomen o Busgraun na wara: Ol Rikwesta i tok olsem Projek bai kamapim sampela hevi long busgraun na wara, bikos Envairomen Asesmen o wok skelim long hevi long busgraun i no gutpela. Hevi i kamap taim Projek i mekim ol “infilling”, we ol Rikwesta i tok em i wanpela hait toktok bilong opim moa graun bilong groim welpam, i kamapim ol hevi olsem rausim graun, bagarapim ol hanwara na rausim ol diwai, na senisim graun we i save holim sosol, ekonomik na kalsarel sindaun bilong ol komyuniti. Ol Rikwesta i bilip olsem Envairomen Asesmen i abrusim ol bikpela hevi Projek i kamap, wantaim tu, moa pipia i wok kamaut long mil. Ol i tok ol rot bilong daunim ol dispela hevi long sait bilong holim strong ol Hai Konsavesen Veliu Fores, i no inap.

Institusenal Sastenabiliti: Maski ol i luksave long strongim rot mentenens sistem, ol Rikwesta i no wanbel long sanap bilong Rot Mentenens Tras Fan (RMTF) na strong bilong Welpam Industri Koporesen (OPIC), lain i save mekim wok. Ol Rikwesta i tok olsem RMTF bai no inap long stap i go longpela taim, bikos mani kam long ol provinsal gavman na ol mil kampani bai no inap kamap gut. Ol i bilip stap bilong ol Projek benefit bai bagarap long mak bilong wok bilong OPIC, we bai bagarapim givim bilong ol gutpela ekstensen sevis.

Ol samting Panel i painimaut: Lukluk bilong wok painim Panel i mekim, em long sekim sapos Benk i bihainim ol polisi bilong em yet na ol prosidia o rot bilong wok long sait bilong disainim, sekim, na karimaut bilong Projek, na sapos i gat taim ol i no bihainim, sapos ol yet i mekim, o i ken givim hevi o birua we ol Rikwesta i tok long en. Long karimaut dispela wok painim, Panel i bihainim asbilip olsem ol smolholda, we Projek i kamap long halivim, em olgeta memba bilong ol asples komyuniti, na i bihainim Indijines Pipels Polisi o Polisi bilong ol Asples Pipel (OP4.10) long mekim komplaiens analisis o wok skelim long bihainim stret. I go long namel bilong Projek taim, nogat wanpela bikpela Projek wok i bin kirap, na bikpela lukluk long wok painim i go long sait bilong disain, plenim na wok apresal o skelim.

Panel i painimaut olsem ol dispela isiu we ol i no bihainim polisi bilong Benk na we bihainim stret bilong ol polisi, i ken inap daunim ol hevi.

Tokaut long Infomesen, Konsaltesen, na Bikpela Komyuniti Sapot: Panel i glasim gut Sosol na Benefisaris Asesmen, bikos dispela em ol bikpela pepa i stiaim wok konsaltesen o toktok wantaim. Ol i painimaut olsem wok glasim bilong ligel na institusenal fremwok bilong kastomari lo, lidasip, na mekim disisen, na rot bilong stretim hevi, na bungim beslain infomesen long ol asples komyuniti, i no inap, we i mas givim hevi long wok konsaltesen. Menesmen i abruss tu long givim inap infomesen pastaim long wok konsaltesen i kirap, bihainim gut pasin bilong ples, rot bilong paitim tok, na long tokples bilong asples yet. Moa yet, Panel i no inap painim wanpela stori i tok olsem i bin i gat bikpela komyuniti sapot i stap. I nogat insait long ol Projek pepa, na Sosol na Benefisaris Asesmen. Panel i painimaut olsem dispela i no bihainim OP4.10. Ol dispela asua long wok konsaltesen wantaim ol smolholda i senisim disain bilong Projek pinis. Panel i luksave olsem Bekim bilong Menesmen i to klia olsem Menesmen i laik strongim wok konsaltesen long taim bilong implimentesen o karimaut wok.

Poveti o Pasin Turangu, na ol Senis long Sindaun: Panel i painimaut olsem maski Projek i traim long apim mak bilong winmani i go long ol smolholda, long bihainim Polisi bilong Benk long Poveti Ridaksen o Rausim Pasin Turangu, em i no bihainim Indijines Pipels Polisi, we i tok Benk – *i mas luksave olsem ol Indijines Pipel o Asples Manmeri i mas kisim ol sosol na ekonomik benefit we i orait long pasin tumbuna na long man na meri wantaim, na i stiaim olgeta lain tumbuna tu.*// Panel i luksave olsem disainim bilong Projek i mas gat rot bilong bekim ol bikpela hevi namel long ol Projek eria. Moa yet, Menesmen i no bin karimaut wanpela rivi bilong ol institusenal na fainensal laiabiliti bilong ol mil kampani, na i larim Projek i nogat gutpela as long larim ol rot i op long promotim wanpela gutpela rot bilong seim mani o groim winmani bilong ol smolholda, we ol i toke m i bikela samting tru long strongim sindaun bilong ol smolholda insait long Sosol Asesmen. Panel i tok stret olsem bikpela moa potnait pe i no kamapim wankain mak gutpela senis long sindaun mak bilong ol smolholda.

Ol Hevi long Busgraun na Wara: Taim ol i luksave long klem bilong ol Rikwesta long hevi i kamap long busgraun bihainim ol bikpela wok katim diwai, bagarap long ol wara, na ol arapela hevi nogut long busgraun na wara i bin kamap bipo wantaim ol olupela welpam projek, Panel i painim olsem Projek yet em i bihainim Polisi bilong Benk long Envairomen Asesmen o wok skelim busgraun na wara. Isiu bilong ol mil efluen o pipia i kam long mil, tasol, em i nogat. Panel i wanbel wantaim tingting bilong Menesmen, olsem bikos i nogat inap wok glasim insait long Envairomen Asesmen Eksen Plen i stap insait long Efluen Stadi bilong stretim hevi bilong birua i kamap long ol mil efluen o pipia, taim ol i mekim, i ken bringim Projek kamap komplaien o bihainim stret ol polisi.

Institusenal Sastenabiliti: Panel i luksave, na wanbel wantaim tok bilong Menesmen olsem wok i mas go het long mekim mentenens long rot netwok oltaim, bikos em i bikpela samting long ol smolholda na indastri. Tasol Panel i painimaut olsem Menesmen i larim disainim bilong dispela bikpela hap bilong Projek bilong wok implimentesen taim, na proposal o tok olsem 25% kontribusen ol smolholda i mas peim, em ol no luksave gut long strong bilong ol smolholda long peim, na ol i makim. Bikos i nogat rot bilong inapim olgeta kontribusen i go insait long RMTF long ol provinsal gamvan na mil kampani, Panel i wari olsem olgeta hevi i go bek long ol smolholda. Projek i gat wanpela kapesiti developmen hap bilong Oil Pam Indastri Koporesen (OPIC), we i luksave pinis long ol wokmak bilong OPIC, we i bihainim stret ol polisi askim. Tasol bikpela taim i lus nating long karimaut Projek, i soim olsem, taim Benk i lusim wok supavisin i go long – implimentesen sapot ||, i go bek gen long Menesmen long apim wok mak bilong en yet long hariap na painim ol asua wantaim luksave olsem ol i mas kisim stretim kwik.

Ol Samting i Stap Insait

Stori bilong Panel.....	i
Ol Tok Luksave.....	iii
Ol Sotpela Nem na Toktok.....	iv
Ovaviu.....	vi
Ol Samting i Stap Insait.....	ix
Ekseketiv Sameri o Bungim Tok.....	xiii
Sapta 1: Rikwes o Askim long Inspeksen, Bekim bilong Menesmen na Rot bilong Wok Painim.....	1
A. Ogenaisesen o Stretim bilong Ripot.....	1
B. Sotpela stori bilong Projek.....	1
C. Ol Samting i kamap, na i go inap Wok Painim i go het.....	4
D. Rikwes o Askim long Inspeksen.....	5
E. Bekim bilong Menesmen na Wok Benk i mekim.....	9
F. Strong bilong Askim na Disisen bilong Bod.....	17
G. Rot bilong Wok Painim na ol Bikpela Askim.....	17
Sapta 2: Lukluk long Projek.....	20
A. Ovaviu.....	20
B. Ol Asples Pipel long Papua Niugini.....	20
C. Ol Asples Pipel Komyuniti long ol Projek Eria.....	21
D. Lo bilong Lukautim Graun insait long ol Projek Eria.....	27
E. Provinsal na Lokol Level Gavanens.....	29
F. Wok Welpam insait long Developmen bilong Papua Niugini.....	29
G. Sindaun bilong ol Smolholda na Senis long Wok Gaden bilong Kaikai i go Wok Mani.....	30
H. Histri bilong Benk insait long Oil Pam Sekta bilong Papua Niugini.....	34
Sapta 3: Tokaut long Infomesen, Konsaltesen na Komyuniti Sapot.....	38
A. Tok I Go Pas.....	38
B. Ol Klem bilong ol Rikwesta.....	38
C. Bekim bilong Menesmen.....	39
D. Luksave bilong Panel long ol Birua Rikwes o Askim i sut long en.....	41
E. Ol Polisi na Rot bilong mekim wok bilong Benk.....	43
1. Indijenes o Asples Pipel Polisi OP/BP 4.10.....	43
2. Envairomen Asesmen OP 4.01.....	44
F. Glasim bilong Panel long Komplaiens o Wok Bihainim ol Polisi bilong Benk.....	45
1. Sosioekonomik na Kalsarel Tok Tru i Sapotim Disain bilong Projek.....	45
2. Fri, Klia Konsaltesen bilong Go Pastaim.....	53

3. Evidens o mak bilong Bikpela Komyuniti Sapot.....	59
4. Ol Laspela Tok Luksave.....	59
Sapta 4: Pasin Turangu na Ol Hevi long Sindaun.....	60
A. Tok i go pas.....	60
B. Ol Klem bilong ol Rikwesta.....	61
C. Bekim bilong Menesmen	62
D. Tingting bilong Panel long ol sut tok long Birua long Rikwes o Askim	63
1. Winmani bilong Welpam.....	64
2. Sindaun long laip	66
3. Ol Rot bilong Sevim Mani.....	75
4. Ol Hevi bilong Wok Mani.....	76
E. Bungim Tok bilong ol Tingting bilong Panel long ol Birua.....	77
F. Ol Benk Polisi na Prosidia bilong Bihainim.....	78
1. Indijines Pipels Polisi (OP/BP 4.10)	78
2. Poveti Ridaksen (OP 1.00).....	78
3. Projek Apresal (OMS 2.20)	79
4. Ekonomik Iveluesen bilong ol Invesmen Operesen (OP 10.04).....	79
G. Glasim bilong Panel long Bihainim ol Benk Polisi	80
1. Poveti Ridaksen o Daunim Pasin Turangu	80
2. Ekonomik Wok Skelim na Glasim Strong bilong Mekim Mani.....	81
3. Strongim Sindaun: Sevings na Skelim Winmani.....	85
H. Ol Las Tingting	88
Sapta 5: Ol Hevi long Busgraun na Wara.....	90
A. Tok i go pas.....	90
B. Ol Klem bilong ol Rikwesta.....	90
C. Bekim bilong Menesmen	92
D. Tingting bilong Panel long ol Birua sut tok i stap long Rikwes o Askim.....	93
E. Ol Benk Polisi na Prosidia bilong bihainim.....	95
1. Envairomental Asesmen (OP 4.01)	95
F. Glasim bilong Panel long Bihainim ol Benk Polisi	96
1. Strong bilong Envairomen Asesmen	96
2. Infilling agensim Opim wok na ol hevi bilong en.....	98
3. Graun i lus, Topsoil i Pinis na Graun i pulap long wara	101
4. Kemikal na Baiolojikal Posin long ol Han wara	104

5. Birua bilong Rausim ol bikpela lain Diwai	111
G. Ol Las Tokluksave	118
Sapta 6: Institusenal Sastenabiliti	120
A. Tok I Go Pas	120
B. Ol Klem bilong ol Rikwesta	120
1. Rot Mentenens Tras Fan	120
2. Ol Ekstensen Wok bilong OPIC	122
C. Bekim bilong Menesmen	122
1. Rot Mentenens Tras Fan	122
2. Ol Ekstensen Wok bilong OPIC.....	124
D. Tingting bilong Panel long ol Birua sut tok i stap long Rikwes o Askim.....	124
1. Rot Mentenens Tras Fan	124
2. Ol Ekstensen Wok bilong OPIC	133
E. Ol Polisi na Prosidia bilong Benk long bihainim	135
1. Projek Apresal (OMS 2.20)	135
2. Indijines Pipels Polisi (OP/BP 4.10)	135
F. Glasim bilong Panel long Bihainim ol Benk Polisi	136
1. Rot Mentenens Tras Fan	136
2. Ol Ekstensen Wok bilong OPIC.....	138
G. Ol Las Tokluksave	138
Sapta 7: Ol Sistemik Isiu	139
A. Bihainim Indijines Pipels Polisi long ol Projek we ol Indijines o Asples Pipel em ol lain i Kisim Samting	139
B. Bihainim Indijines Pipels Polisi long taim bilong Karimaut wok	140
C. Skelim ol Birua bilong ol Opis i nogat Strong long Mekim wok	141
D. Samting bilong Tingim long Bihainim WBG Fremwok long Wok insait long Welpam Sekta.....	143
ANNEX 1: Tebol i soim ol samting ol i painimaut	146
ANNEX 2: Taimlain bilong SADP	160
ANNEX 3: Gutpela Praktis Nout bilong ol WBG Wokman.....	161
ANNEX 4: Ol Baiografi	163

Pictures

Piksa 1: Welpam Fres Frut Bans (FFB) i redi long kisim.....	4
Piksa 2: Wanpela ples long Oro provins.....	5
Piksa 3: Wanpela ples long Wes Nu Briten provins	8
Piksa 4: Lukluk i go daun long ol welpam blok long Wes Nu Briten Provins.....	9
Piksa 5: Welpam Blok i gat ol bikpela diwai	13
Piksa 6: Panel tim i toktok wantaim ol plesmanmeri long Hoskins.....	39
Piksa 7: Panel tim i toktok wantaim ol plesmanmeri long Oro provins.....	42
Piksa 8: Panel tim long wanpela ples long Oro provins.....	48
Piksa 9: Panel tim i bungim ol plesmanmeri long WNB provins	60
Piksa 10: Lukluk long wanpela ples long Oro provins	67
Piksa 11: Lukluk long wanpela ‘welpam’ haus na ol arapela haus bilong ples long WNB provins.....	67
Piksa 12: Panel tim i bungim ol plesmanmeri long Oro provins.....	70
Piksa 13: Panel tim i raun lukim wanpela kaikai gaden long Oro provins	73
Piksa 14: Panel tim i raun lukim wanpela kaikai gaden long Oro provins	74
Piksa 15: Lukluk i go long NBPOL Nesei, Hoskins, WNB.....	97
Piksa 16: Lukluk i go daun long ples kunai klostu long Popondetta.....	99
Piksa 17: Wanpela infil blok klostu long wanpela rot long Popondetta.....	100
Piksa 18: — Klas 1 hanwara long Hoskins eria	103
Piksa 19: Ol rop plawa i karamapim graun long holim pas graun	104
Piksa 20: Lukluk long Wara Ambogo long Oro provins, we ol i tok pipia bilong welpam mil i go insait long en....	105
Piksa 21: Raun wara bilong holim pipia bilong mil long Kula/Higaturu Welpam taim Panel tim i raun mekim wok painim.....	108
Piksa 22: Kampani Trak i kisim ol FFB bihainim Popondetta-Kokoda Nesenel Haiwe	121
Piksa 23: Panel tim i brukim wanpela wara namel long Popondetta-Kokoda Nesenel Haiwe	126
Piksa 24: Wara brukim Kokoda Nesenel Haiwe	127
Piksa 25: Man brukim Wara Mambare long wanpela taia gumi	127
Piksa 26: Ol Kampani Trak i Stretim sampela Seksen bilong Kokoda Nesenel Haiwe.....	129

Ol Bokis

Bokis 1: Straksa bilong mekim Disisen bilong Binandere Komyuniti, Namba	24
Bokis 2: Ol Orokaiva	25
Bokis 3: Welpam insait long Ekonomi bilong Papua Niugini	31

Ol Tebol

Tebol 1: Ol Wanpisin na Tokples Grup insait long ol Projek Eria 26	
Tebol 2: Ol Wol Benk Welpam Projek long Papua Niugini	35
Tebol 3: Avers Enuat Net Inkam o Winmani bihainim wan wan Skim	83
Tebol 4: Ol Nupela Fertilaisa Ret bilong 2010	106
Tebol 5: Rot Rikonstraksen Skediul	126

Ol Mep

Mep 1: Ol SADP Projek Eria	
Mep 2: SADP Oro Provins, Popondetta Projek Eria	
Mep 3: SADP Wes Nu Briten Provins, Hoskins na Bialla Projek Eria	

EKSEKYUTIV SAMERI O BUNGIM TOK

Inspeksen Panel i redim dispela Investigesen Ripot long bekim wanpela Askim bilong Inspeksen long Papua Niugini: Smolholda Agrikalsa Dvelopmen Projek (SADP, o Projek||). Rikwes o Askim i kam long Desemba 8, 2009, long Ahora/Kakandetta Presa Grup, em ol tumbuna papagraun bilong Oro provins, na ol smolholda insait long wanpela long tripela Projek eria (ol - Rikwesta||). Ol Rikwesta i askim olsem nem bilong ol i mas stap hait, na Senta bilong Envaironmental Lo na Komyuniti Raits (CELCOR), wanpela non-gavman ogenaísesen (NGO) bilong Papua Niugini yet, i makim ol. Ol Rikwesta i tok ol i kism hevi, na bai ol i bungim hevi, na bikpela bagarap yet long kain disain na wok karimaut bilong Projek.

I gat sevenpela sapta long ripot bilong Panel. Sapta 1 i karamapim Rikwes o Askim, Bekim bilong Menesmen na Rot bilong Investigesen o Wok Painim, na Sapta 2, em long Projek yet. Sapta 3 i go 6 em ol sabstentiv sapta, i karamapim ol isiu ol Rikwesta i autim long sait bilong Infomesen Disklosa, Konsaltesen, na Bikpela Komyuniti Sapot; Poveti Ridaksen o Daunim Pasin Turangu, na ol Hevi long Sindaun; Hevi long Envairomen o Busgraun; na Institusenal Sastenabiliti. Laspela sapta i lukluk long ol Sistemik Isiu. Bungim tok long wanwan ol sekta i stap daunbilo.

Sapta 1: Askim bilong Inspeksen, Bekim bilong Menesmen, na Rot bilong Wok Painim

Projek

Projek i laik apim winmani mak na strongim sindaun bilong ol smolholda i wok insait long welpam prodaksen pinis. Long mekim dispela, em i strongim ol smolholda long planim moa welpam diwai bihainim pasin “infilling|| (em, planim ol nupela blok welpam namel long ol blok i stap pinis, na bihainim ol rot i go insait long Nuklius Estet na ol Smolholda Skim eria), stretim na strongim ol rurel eksen rot, strongim ol asples i givim sevis na infrastraksa bihainim wanpela lokol gavanens na komyuniti-patisipesen komponen, na givim halivim long menesim Projek. Projek i kamap insait long tripela eria long Oro na Wes Nu Briten (WNB) provins long Papua Niugini (PNG).

Askim bilong Inspeksen

Ol Rikwesta i bilip olsem Benk i abrus long biahinim sampela ol Operesenal Polisi na Prosidia o wok rot bilong em yet long sait bilong disainim, apresal o wok skelim, na karimaut bilong SADP. Ol i bilip olsem ol dispela asua i kamapim, o bai kamapim birua long komyuniti na busgraun bilong ol.

Infomesen Disklosa, Konsaltesen, na Bikpela Komyuniti Sapot. Ol Rikwesta i wari olsem i nogat inap konsaltesen o toktok wantaim ol memba bilong komyuniti i sindaun long Projek na i nogat tok klia long ol pepa. Ol i tok olsem maski ol em ol Asples Pipel na kastomari o tumbuna papagraun, ol i no bin gat sans long givim tingting long skop bilong Projek, astingting long Projek i kamap, na ol wok bilong en. Ol toksave long Projek i no bin go aut pastaim long Projek tok orait, na nau yet, i nogat, o i go aut long tok inglis tasol, na i no ol narapela tokples. Ol Rikwesta i gat bikpela askim sapos i bin i gat inap komyuniti sapot long Projek i kamap, bikos i nogat klia rekot i stap long wok konsaltesen.

Pasin Turangu na Hevi long Sindaun. Ol Rikwesta i bilip olsem welpam prodaksen i no save daunim poveti bilong ol smolholda o strongim sindaun bilong ol. Ol Rikwesta i makim tripela as long tok klia watpo ol i no bilip olsem sindaun insait long Projek eria i no senis, maski welpam prodaksen i stap planti yia pinis. Namba wan, ol i luksave olsem ol smolhoda i save sindaun long wok skelim winmani wantaim estet mil. Ol i tok olsem Fres Frut Bans (FFB) praisim sistem i save senisim prais skelim wantaim moa luksave long ol mil kampani. Namba tu, ol Rikwesta i tok olsem antap long planti levi o takis ol smolholda i mas peim long prosesim welpam bilong ol, ol i save baim narapela levi gen long sapotim Rot Mentenens Tras Fan (RMTF), em Projek yet i makim, we bai daunim winmani mak bilong ol moa yet. Las tru, ol i bilip olsem Projek i save promotim monocropping o groim welpam tasol, we ol smolholda i laik groim ol arapela gaden kaikai bilong salim na kisim moa winmani.

Ol Hevi long Busgraun Ol Rikwesta i tok olsem Projek bai kamapim sampela ol birua long busgraun, bikos i nogat gutpela wok skelim long busgraun. Senis Projek i kamapim wantaim wok -infilling||, we ol Rikwesta i tok em i wanpela hait-tok i minim opim o groim bilong projek, i ken rausim graun, posinim ol hanwara na katim rausim ol lain diwai, na senisim graun we nau i holim bikpela sosol, ekonomik na kalsarel risos bilong ol komyuniti. Ol Rikwesta i bilip tu olsem Envairomen Asesmen i asua, na i abrusim ol bikpela wokkamap bilong Projek, olsem moa pipia bihainim planim long moa welpam aninit long Projek, hevi projek i givim long ol lain diwai na kunai ples. Ol i tok tu olsem wok bilong lukautim ol bikpela lain diwai i no inap.

Institusenal Sastenabiliti Ol Rikwesta i tok i tru i mas i gat wanpela rot mentenens sistem, tasol ol i askim long bihain taim na longpela taim wok bilong Rot Mentenens Tras Fan (RMTF) na institusenal wok strong bilong Welpam Industri Koporesen (OPIC). Ol Rikwesta i tok olsem RMTF bai no inap stap longpela taim bikos ol kontribusen o bungim mani i kam long ol provinsal gavman na ol mil kampani i no gutpela. Ol i bilip olsem longpela taim wok bilong Projek na ol gutpela bilong en bai no inap long mak long wanem wokmak bilong OPIC, we i ken daunim givim bilong gutpela ekstensen sevis. Ol Rikwesta i pinis wantaim askim olsem ol lain i go pas long Projek i mas givim inap luksave long wok-daunim sindaun nogut insait long Projek disain, ol i mas kamapim ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani, na karimaut wanpela bikpela envairomen asesmen o wok skelim long kilim strong bilong ol pipia na marasin i go aut long mil na kaunim ol lain diwai, senisim disain bilong strongim wok bilong Projek i go longpela taim bihain, na karimaut stretpela na mobeta wok konsaltesen long givim ol komyuniti fri, gutpela na klia tok orait long olgeta wan wan hap wok bilong Projek.

Bekim bilong Menesmen

Tokaut long Infomesen, Konsaltesen na Komyuniti Sapot Menesmen i tok olsem Sosol Asesmen, na ol arapela wok i kamap, em inapim bikpela komyuniti sapot long olgeta bikpela wok bilong Projek, na dispela sapot i go het yet. Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok tu olsem OP 4.10 long ol Indijines o Asples Pipel long sait bilong *_bikpela komyuniti sapot_* i no nidim tok orait bilong olgeta wan wan manmeri o grup. Maski Menesmen i bilip olsem i gat stori long olgeta wok konsaltesen, em i *“luksave olsem stori bilong wok konsaltesen insait long Sosol Asesmen bai moa gutpela sapos em i bin gat moa klia stori na i pinis gut. Ol pepa i mas tok moa na tok klia long sampela ol samting long wok konsaltesen, na tu, wanem kain infomesen ol i givim long Projek, rot ol i givim dispela infomesen, na rot ol i bihainim long makim ol ples na manmeri i kisim dispela infomesenn. ||*

Pasin Turangu na Hevi long Sindaun Menesmen i klia olsem i gat luksave olsem dispela Projek em i wanpela – *hai-risk wok o wok i gat planti birua.*// Tasol, Menesmen i bilip olsem invesmen o wok bisnis Wol Benk i mekim insait long welpam sekta long PNG, i kamapim pinis bikpela senis, na Projek bai go het yet long givim mmoa gutpela samting we i orait long busgraun, na sindaun bilong komyuniti i go long bihain taim. Menesmen i bilip olsem dispela - *paradox o pait long tupela samting*// em bikpela winmani mak na sindaun turangu em i wanpela samting i stap long planti hap long kantri, na i no long wok welpam tasol o long dispela Projek eria *tasol*. Menesmen i tok tu, olsem invesmen o givim mani long ol rot long ol rurel eria bai karim gutpela kaikai we ol i ken opim rot long ol pipel i kisim ol sevis olsem helt na edukesen. Moa yet, Menesmen i tok olsem komyuniti developmen na ol lokol gavanens wok aninit long Projek bai karim gutpela kaikai long sindaun bilong ol pipel insait long ol Projek eria.

Ol Hevi long Busgraun Menesmen i bilip olsem ol Projek pepa i makim ol birua na hevi long busgraun, na ol rot bilong daunim ol dispela birua o hevi. Tasol, Menesmen i tok luksave olsem, - *...i no bin i gat inap tok klia insait long Envairomen Asesmen (EA) long sait bilong ol efluen, o pipia bilong mil,*// na — *... wanpela bikpela moa wok glasim long ol birua bilong apim wokma bilong ol welpam mil na efluen o pipia i mas kamap bihainim ol askim na stia bilong OP/BP 4.01.*// Moa yet, Menesmen i tok olsem Projek i gat inap ol rot bilong skelim na daunim ol birua bilong rausim ol diwai insait long ol bikpela lain bus na diwai. Menesmen i tok tu olsem – *[n]ogat bikpela senis o daunim bilong ol bikpela fores eria o lain diwai*// bai kamap aninit long Projek.

Institusenal Sastenabiliti. Menesmen i wanbel olsem i nogat wwnapela gutpela institusenal arensmen bilong rot menentenens, na dispela em i namba wan as long ol rot insait long ol Projek eria i bagarap. Menesmen i bilip olsem mobeta rot bai daunim wok-bisnis manimak bilong ol smolholda, taim pe bilong trenspot i go daun, we bai gutpela moa, na inapim ol kos ol i save peim bilong rot mentenens. Menesmen i tok tu, olsem RMTF em ol i no tok oraitim olgeta yet, na fomula o rot bilong kalkuletim RMTF i no pinis yet. Long kalkuletim o kaunim — *mak bilong smolholda rot takis* || bilong RMTF, Menesmen i tok olsem em bai karimaut wanpela bikpela wok konsaltativ stadi long namel long yia 2010.

Menesmen i tok olsem i nogat planim taget wokman iveluesen sistem is tap long OPIC, olsem ol Rikwesta i tok. Menesmen i tok tu olsem maski Projek – *abrus long makim ol birua bilong wok i no kirap kwik na taim bilong sanapim projek menesmen wok-strong bilong OPIC*//, Projek i gat wanpela hap long en bilong strongim wok-mak bilong OPIC.

Maski Menesmen i bilip bikpela wok i go het long bihainim stret ol polisi na prosidia bilong en, na ol rait bilong ol Rikwesta i no kisim bagarap, em i luksave tu olsem i gat sampela eria we i nidim strongim, we wok i kirap pinis long mekim. Ol dispela eria em tanim ol Projek pepa i go long Tok Pisin; yusim ol OPIC redio program long toksave long ol bikpela wok bilong Projek; kirapim wanpela wok glasim long tromoi pipia bilong welpam; rausim ol krangi hap insait long ol Projek pepa; glasim gen FFB prais fomula wantaim ol smolholda mausmanmeri; strongim wok konsaltesen bilong ol bikpela wok long taim karimaut wok, na tu, disain bilong RMTF; glasim gut Rot Rikonstraksen Sab-Manual, Envairomen Menesmen Plen, na Risetolmen Polisi Fremwok; kamapim ol indipenden sosol na envairomen odit; na strongim ol rot bilong stretim ol belhevi long Projek.

Strong bilong Rikwes na Disisen bilong Bod

Insait long Elijiibiliti Ripot, Panel i luksave olsem Rikwes o Askim em inapim olgeta samting long kirapim wok painim na i givim stia olsem wanpela wok painim i go het. Long Mas 25, 2010, Bod i tok oraitim rekomendesen bilong Panel. Insait long wok painim bilong en, Panel i skelim sapos Benk i bihainim stret OP/BP 4.10 long Indijines o Asples Pipel, OP1.00 long Poveti Ridaksen o Daunim Pasin Turangu, OP10.00 long Invesmen Lending, OMS 2.20 long Projek Apresal, OP10.04 long Ekonomik Iveluesen long ol Invesmen Operesen, OP4.01 long Envairomen Asesmen, OP/BP 4.36 long Fores, OP/BP 4.04 long Netseral Habitset, na OP/BP 13.05 long Projek Supavisin.

Sapta 2: Lukluk long Projek

Ol asples pipel bilong Papua Niugini em i wanpela tasol long wol we i gat planti kainkain manmeri i stap. Dispela i soim olsem i gat wankain namba tokples – em i gat 841 tokples.

Planti long ol Rikwesta em ol lain Orokaiva tokples grup, we i makim bikpela namba bilong ol manmeri bilong Oro Provins.

Ol Orokaiva i save bihainim papa, na wanwan pisin i save bihainim famili bilong en i go bek long wanpela bikpela tumbuna. Sosol kalsa bilong Orokaiva i sanap long ples o famili yunit, we olgeta manmeri i save bihainim, na we em i pasim ol insait long pasin bilong givim bek, bihainim bikpela tok long Tok Pisin/Melanesia Tok pisin tok – *wantok* || (i kam long — one talk||). Aninit long *wantok* sistem, husat manmeri i gat wankain tokples i gat sosol na ekonomik wok luksave long bekim ol halivim ol yet. Ol luksave aninit long *wantok* sistem em i wanpela as long bikpela winmani wok na pasin turangu na sindaun nogut insait long ol Projek eria.

Graun insait long ol Projek eria bilong Hoskins, Bialla, na Popondetta em i bihainim kastomari graun, na graun bilong gavman. Ol dispela graun bilong gavman, ol i bin baim pastaim long PNG i kisim indipendens. Ol welpam estet na graun setelmen skim (LSS) i sindaun long graun bilong gavman, na ol viles o ples welpam blok (VOP) i sindaun long ol kastomari graun bilong wanwan ol lokol klen na sab-klen.

Dvelopmen bilong welpam em i wanpela bikpela wok aninit long progrem bilong gavman long inapim ol rurel developmen wokmak bilong en. Senis i wok kamap long wok-gaden i go long wanpela maket ekonomi i wok kamapim planti salens bilong PNG, na welpam em i wanpela rot bilong kamapim dispela senis.

Taim kamap bilong ol kes-krop i halivim ol fama long opim moa rot bilong kisim moa winmani na go insait long eksport maket bisnis, em i mekim ol rurel produsa i sindaun wetim ol mil kampani na ol maket i liklik tumas na bagarapim wok-gaden bisnis bilong ol. Dispela i kamapim moa hevi long komyuniti.

Senis long wok-gaden i go long kes-krop i senisim tu tumbuna pasin bilong wok na lukautim graun. Kastomari graun i min olsem graun em i bilong komyuniti o hauslain, na i no bilong wanpela manmeri o famili tasol.

Dispela kain komyuniti kastomari wok graun em longpela taim wok welpam developmen i senisim pinis. Projek i bihainim longpela taim stap bilong Wol Benk insait long wok-welpam long PNG, we i bin kirap namba wan taim long 1969. Nupela projek insait long Oro Provins em Oro Smolholda Wel-Pam Developmen Projek (1992-2001), we i bin inapim olgeta wok-mak bilong en, tasol em i painim nid bilong wok-mentenens long rot netwok i go insait long projek. Taim wok-redi bilong dispela Projek i bin kirap long 2002, Projek i no bin kamap inap 2009.

Sapta 3: Infomesen Disklosa, Konsaltesen, na Bikpela Komyuniti Sapot

Sut tok bilong ol Rikwesta olsem Projek i ken givim birua long komyuniti o busgraun bilong ol bikos ol na ol arapela komyuniti i no kisim gut tok klia, o ol toksave bilong Projek i no go aut gut long olgeta hap, pastaim long Projek i bin kisim tok orait. Olsem na ol lain asples komyuniti i bungim hevi i nogat rot long givim tingting long Projek. Luksave bilong Panel long mak bilong wok-konsaltesen long fil, i lukim olsem i no inap, tasol i tok olsem save-mak ol pipel i gat long Projek, i no inap. Moa yet, maski i gat bikpela laik long groim welpam, i gat belwari i stap long wok-mak bilong en. Planti long ol smolholda i no save gut long tok Inglis o Tok Pisin, na tokples Orokaiva em namba wan bikpela tok ples insait long Oro Provins, olsem na ol i no inap kisim na klia long planti ol pepa-wok long tok Inglis. Bihainim dispela sut-tok o klem, Panel i glasim sapos Menesmen i bihainim stret ol Wol Benk operesenal polisi na prosidia, moa yet OP 4.10 (Indijines Pipels) na OP 4.01 (Envairomen Asesmen). Dispela wok glasim i karamapim tupela sait: namba wan sosio-ekonomik na kalsa wok-painim, na fri, gutpela na klia wok-konsaltesen na bikpela komyuniti sapot.

Sosio-ekonomik na Kalsarel Wok-Painim

Lukluk long Ligel na Institusenal Fremwok bilong ol Indijines o Asples Pipel. Namba wan samting long wanpela Sosol Asesmen o wok-skelim, aninit long Annex A bilong OP 4.10, em i rivi bilong – *ligel na institusenal fremwok bbilong ol Indijines o Asples Pipel.*|| Benefisaris Asesmen i tok olsem – *Ol Klen lida i gat bikpela luksave na pawa insait long ol komyuniti bilong ol, na sapos i nogat sapot bilong ol, bai ol SADP-wok bai no inap go het gut o kisim sapot bilong bikpela komyuniti||*, na i rekomen olsem — *ol SADP wokman i mas luksave long ol lokol klen lida na bungim ol i kam insait long wok bilong mekim disisen long ol SADP wok.*||

Maski long dispela, Sosol na Benefisaris Asesmen i no givim inap tok-paitim o toksave long luksave long kastomari lidasip, rot bilong mekim disisen, na stretim hevi rot bilong ol asples manmeri insait long Projek eria, na i nogat inap luksave long ol senis long ol dispela samting namel long ol kain kain asples grup.

Panel i painimaut olsem glasim bilong ol ligel na institusenal fremwok bilong kastomari lo, lidasip, rot bilong mekim disisen na stretim hevi, na ol arapela long dispela (sapos i gat), namel long ol kain kain hauslain grup, i no inapim ol askim bilong Annex A bilong OP 4.10, na olsem, em i no bihainim Polisi bilong Benk.

Bungim Beslain Infomesen. Ol Projek pepa i makim wanpela bikpela asples na kalsarel grup, em Orokaiva, insait long Oro Provins. Ol Projek pepa i makim tu ol bikpela grup insait long Wes Nu Briten provins, wantaim sevenpela bikpela hauslain i gat 25 kain tokples.

Maski Benefisaris Asesmen i luksave olsem lukautim bilong graun na sosol straksa long Popondetta eria bilong Oro Provins em i – *strong bihainim papa*// na insait long Wes Nu Briten provins, em i — *bihainim mama*,// em i tingsave olsem insait long tupela provins —...*ol asples/tokples grup i gat wankain luksave long sait bilong kalsa, sosol ogenaísesen na ol sistem bilong wok long graun.*//

Panel i painim olsem taim em i tok ol dispela asples grup i gat wankain bikpela luksave na tingting, Benefisaris Asesmen i no luksave long ol samting i narakain long ol sistem i bihainim papa, na ol dispela i bihainim mama. Ol dispela narakain samting i ken senisim SADP long sait bilong onasip na menesmen o wok graun na kastomari rot bilong mekim disisen.

Panel i no painim inap evidens na tok klia insait long Sosol na Benefisaris Asesmen long sapotim tingting olsem tupela lain asples grup i wankain. Panel i luksave olsem i mas i gat moa wok glasim long mak we kain kain komyuniti i save sindaun long ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani (olsem, kes-krop, gaden bilong haus na lokol maket, pulim pis, na painim abus), na tu ol mep i makim klia ol eria we ol kain kain asples na tokples grup i sindaun, i bin inap halivim moa.

Panel i ting i mas i gat bikpela moa wok glasim long ol pasin bilong wan wan asples grup insait long projek eria, na moa yet long sait bilong ol bikpela isiu long Projek (olsem, wok-graun na lukautim long famili, kastomari rot bilong mekim disisen, ol pasin bilong wok gaden) i mas i stap insait long Sosol Benefisaris Asesmen pastaim long tok-luksave olsem dispela ol grup i “*wankain tasol*.” I nogat bikpela beslain infomesen long ol dispela asesmen o wok-skelim, we Panel i painim, i no bihainim OP 4.10.

Luksave long ol Projek Stekholda na Tok klia long wanpela Wok Konsaltesen wantaim ol Asples Pipel. Sosol Asesmen i makim ol kain kain stekholda grup bilong toktok wantaim, maski i no tok klia long wanem wan wan komyuniti. **Panel i painim olsem Sosol na Benefisaris Asesmen i tok klia long wanpela konsaltesen wok long kamap long wan wan stes bilong Projek, bihainim stia bilong OP 4.10.** Tasol, **Panel i painim olsem Konsaltesen Fremwok i no bihainim stret kalsa, bikos i nogat inap luksave long rivi long ol ligel na institusenal fremwok na bungim long ol beslain infomesen long ol asples komyuniti, olsem na em i no bihainim OP/BP 4.10.**

Sekim samting Projek i senisim long ol Asples Pipel Sosol Asesmen o wok-skelim i painim ol hevi i ken kamap bihainim kirap o laik long kirapim kes-krop faming. Ol dispela i stap tu insait long Rikwes bilong Inspeksen na i karamapim ol hevi i kamap long wok-gaden, olsem luksave long mani na tilim bilong mani insait long komyuniti, pilai laki, bikpela pasin spak, na pasin pamuk, na domestik vailens o pasin paít insait long famili. **Panel i painim olsemm Sosol Asesmen i makim ol kain kain gutpela na nogut bilong SADP, bihainim OP/BP 4.10.** Tasol, wok bilong painim ol nogut samting na ol rot bilong daunim ol i ken klia moa sapos i bin i gat gutpela beslain infomesen na wok-konsaltesen.

Painim ol Rot bilong Abrusim ol Birua na Stretim ol Asples Manmeri olsem ol namba wan lain long kisim ol Gutpela Benefit bihainim kalsa bilong ol. Sosol Asesmen i toktok long ol arapela rot bilong mekim mani, na moa yet, bikpela luksave long sanap na wok bilong ol gaden kaikai. Bihain, em i tok makim we bilong slekim ol hevi na birua bilong welpam developmen, bihainim ol rot bilong daunim mani-hevi bilong bekim dinau, na strongim pasin bilong sevim mani. **Panel i painim olsem Sosol Asesmen i makim sampela rot bilong abrusim, daunim, na slekim ol birua bai ol asples pipel i ken kisim gut ol benefit o gutpela bilong Projek.** Tasol, ol konsaltesen wantaim ol stekholda long inapim bilong projek disain, i no kamap bihainim polisi bilong Benk. Panel i wari olsem sapos i bin gat gutpela wok-konsaltesen, nogut em i bin inap autim ol arapela birua na rot bilong daunim ol.

Konsaltesen i Fri, I go pastaim, na i Strong moa, na Bikpela Komyuniti Sapot

Namba wan wok tingting bilong Projek i bin karamapim welpam infiling na planim bek. I bin gat senis long dispela tingting, na olgeta lukluk i go long wok infilling. Panel i no painim wanpela rekot long konsaltesen i kamap bai Projek i rausim wok planim bek olsem wanpela wok, maski i bin gat ol grup i tokaut long laik bilong ol long mekim wok planim bek, long namba wan wok kirap bilong Projek. Taim Sosol Asesmen i kamap, infilling i bin wanpela bikpela hap bilong Projek, na i no planim bek, na ol konsaltesen i bin kamap bihainim dispela tingting. **Panel i painim olsem bikos i no bin gat konsaltesen wantaim ol smolholda long senis long Projek disain we i Projek i senis long infiling na planim bek, i go long infiling tasol, dispela i no bihainim OP 4.10.**

Panel i painim tu olsem ol Projek pepa i no klia long we ol konsaltesen i bungim ol lida bilong klen na sab-klen, maski Benefisaris Asesmen i tok olsem dispela ol lain i mas stap insait long olgeta wok konsaltesen. **Panel i no painim wanpela evidens insait long ol Projek pepa olsem taim ol i mekim ol konsaltesen, em i painim tingting bilong ol klen lida, antap long ol lain is tap insait long ol lidasip grup tude (moa yet ol Lokol Level Grup).**

Menesmen i luksave olsem ol infomesen na toksave i go aut long ol stekholda long taim bilong konsaltesen bilong Envairomen Asesmen em long toktok tasol. **Panel i painim olsem nogat wanpela pepa long sait bilong Envairomen Asesmen i tok klia sapos ol infomesen na toksave i bin go aut longpela taim pastaim long konsaltesen i kamap, na insait long tokples na tok klia we i klia moa, na i go gut long ol grup, olsem i stap klia insait long OP 4.01.**

Menesmen i luksave tu olsem – *nogat wanpela pepa i bin stap long ol asples tokples,*// maski olgeta i bin stap long tokples tai mi go bek long Infoshop bilong Wol Benk long Februari 22, 2007. **Moa yet, taim EA na ol arapela pepa wok i bin op long pablik long Pot Mosbi na Washington long Februari 22, 2007, na OPIC i bin tokaut long niuspepa long dispela de yet, ol pepa i bin stap long tok Inglis tasol, na i no long ol arapela tokples we i klia moa long ol grup insait long wok konsaltesen. Dispela i no makim fri, i go pastaim, na strongpela konsaltesen bihainim OP/BP 4.10.**

Long olgeta dispela, **Panel i painim planti samting i sot long wok konsaltesen. Moa yet, Menesmen i abrus long givim stretpela infomesen pastaim long konsaltesen i go het gut bihainim pasin bilong ples, tingting bilong ples, na tokples bilong ol asples. Dispela i no bihainim OP 4.10 na OP 4.01.** Long lukluk bilong Panel, bikipela komyuniti laik long groim welpam, i no wankain olsem bikipela komyuniti sapot bilong Projek. – *Bikipela Komyuniti Sapot*|| em i taim konsaltesen em i fri, i go pastaim, na i gutpela na klia konsaltesen, olsem i stap long OP 4.10. **Panel i no bin inap painim long ol Projek pepa, Sosol na Benefisaris Asesmen, toksave i soim kamap bilong bikipela komyuniti sapot. Panel i painim olsem dispela i no bihainim OP 4.10.**

Sapta 4: Pasin Turangu na ol Hevi long Sindaun

Taim em i glasim ol sut tok bilong ol Rikwesta olsem groim welpam i no daunim pasin turangu o strongim sindaun bilong ol smolholda, Panel i painim olsem ‘groim welpam i kamapim moa winmani. Tasol Panel i painim tu dispela tupela samting i no wankain, we ol Rikwesta na Menesmen i tok long en. Panel i lukim olsem bikipela moa manimak i no kamapim gutpela senis long sindaun bilong ol smolholda. Panel i glasim dispela sut tok bihainim ol polisi bilong Benk we i givim stia long disain bilong ol projek i laik strongim sindaun na daunim pasin turangu. Ol dispela polisi em OP 1.00 long Poveti Ridaksen, OP 10.04 long Ekonomik Iveluesen bilong ol Invesmen Operesen, na OP 4.10 long ol Indijines o Asples Pipel.

Poveti Ridaksen o Daunim Pasin Turangu

Welpam i gat histri long kamapim bikipela winmani, na Panel i painim olsem Projek i gat as olsem wanpela rot bilong apim mak bilong winmani bilong ol smolholda welpam produsa. Moa yet, Projek i bihainim stret Papua Niugini Kantri Asistens Strateji bilong daunim pasin turangu. Astingting bilong Projek long strongim rot mentenens em i bihainim tu lukluk bilong Kantri Asistens Strateji long mobeta trenspot sistem, olsem we bilong daunim pasin turangu na strongim sindaun.

Panel i painim olsem Projek i lukluk long apim winmani mak bilong ol smolholda, na em i bihainim Benk Polisi long Poveti Ridaksen OP 1.00.

Ekonomik Asesmen na Glasim Strong bilong Mekim Winmani

Bihainim ol Projek pepa, Panel i lukim bikipela ekonomik, fainensal, na institusenal senis namel long ol Projek eria. Em i klia moa long ol senis long smolholda net welpam winmani insait long tupela provins. Ol dispela senis i no kamap klia insait long Projek disain o kisim luksave long taim bilong mekim wok.

Panel i ting olsem Projek disain i mas mekim ol provision bilong bekim ol senis namel long ol Projek eria, bai ol smolholda i ken kisim stretpela ekonomik, sosol na kalsarel benefit long Projek. Panel i painim olsem dispela i no bihainim OMS 2.20 na OP/BP 4.10.

Projek Apresal Dokumen (PAD) i luksave long bikipela wok bilong ol praivet miling kampani insait long gutpela kamap bilong Projek. Tasol maski dispela luksave i stap, Panel i no painim wanpela evidens long ol asesmen o wok skelim long strong bilong ol long mekim winmani (o nogat) long ol kampani i wok insait long welpam indastri insait long Projek eria, o wok ol i mekim long miling, trenspot, sidling prodaksen, input saplai, kredit na dinau menesmen, planim bek, o ol bikipela mani kontribusen bilong ol i go long OPIC na Papua Niugini Welpam Risets Asosiesen (PNGOPRA).

I nogat wok glasim long ol winmani i go long ol smolholda, ol estet na miling kampani, long taim bipo yet, o aninit long Projek.

Long sait bilong ol planti yia Benk i sapotim wok insait long welpam sekta long Papua Niugini, aninit long ol patnasip wantaim ol welpam kampani, na bikpela wok bilong kampani long karimaut Projek, na ol senis ol i kamapim long winmani bilong ol smolholda, Panel i painim olsem Menesmen i no bin karimaut inap wok sekim long institusenal na mani strong bilong kampani. Panel i painim olsem dispela i no bihainim OMS 2.20 na OP/BP 10.04.

Strongim Sindaun: Seavings na Moa rot bilong Winmani

OP/BP 4.10 i tok – *Ol projek Benk i givim mani long en i karamapim ol wok bilong (a) abrusim ol birua long ol Asples Komyuniti; o (b) taim i no inap abrusim, long daunim, slekim, o givim kompensesen long mak bilong ol birua.*|| Panel i luksave olsem ol Projek pepa long 2002 yet i makim ol rot bilong halivim ol smolholda long senis i go long wanpela kesmani ekonomi. Wanpela rot, insait long Sosol Asesmen, em long kamapim wanpela rot bilong sevim mani. Tasol SADP i no karamapim wanem kain wok bilong promotim seavings bilong ol smolholda. Panel i tokluksave long wok Menesmen i mekim long painim ol rot bilong sevim mani. Tasol bikos kamapim rot bilong sevim mani em i wanpela bikpela rekomendesen long Sosol Asesmen, na tu long taim wok redi bilong Projek i bin go het, na bikos kain samting olsem i sut stret long strongim sindaun bilong ol smolholda, Menesmen i asua long em i no strongim tingting bilong painim gutpela rot bilong sevim mani.

Wankain tasol, Menesmen i luksave olsem ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani i mas gutpela bilong ol smolholda long bihainim. Panel i save tu olsem i nogat samting long projek we i lukluk long moa rot bilong winmani namel long ol smolholda. Projek yet i no save strongim ol smolholda long groim ol arapela krop moa long welpam, o long bihainim ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani. Projek i save lukluk bihainim tingting olsem moa rot bilong winmani bai kamap olsem wanpela han bisnis long strongim ol rot na bildim sampela (i no olgeta) komyuniti infrastraksa. Panel i luksave tu olsem maski ol gutpela rot bai givim moa rot bilong mekim winmani, bikos trenspot bilong karim ol arapela kes-krop bilong eksportim o bilong ol lokol maket antap long mobeta trenspot bilong ol welpam FFB. Tasol ol dispela kain han wok bai no inap go daun olgeta long ol lain turangu, o hauslain i nogat wok bisnis.

Sevim winmani na moa rot bilong kisim winmani, em ol bikpela wok i stap olsem rekomendesen insait long Sosol Asesmen bilong abrusim ol birua na hevi long ol asples komyuniti.

Bikos Projek i no bihainim ol rekomendesen insait long Sosol Asesmen long abrusim na slekim ol birua long ol asples smolholda i groim welpam, Panel i painim olsem Menesmen i no bihainim OP/BP 4.10.

Sapta 5: Hevi long Busgraun

Ol klem bilong ol Rikwesta long bagarap long busgraun i moa long ol birua long wok – *infilling*,// graun i raus, posin insait long ol hanwara, na rausim ol diwai. Panel i bilip olsem ol belwari bilong ol Rikwesta long bagarap long busgraun i kamap bihainim ol birua i kamap bipo long Oro provins wantaim ol projek Wol Benk i halivim wantaim mani, long bipo. Bihain long taim Rikwes i kam, SADP i no go het wantaim ol infiling wok yet, we planti long ol hevi long busgraun i kamap, Panel i lukim ol klem bilong ol Rikwesta olsem long birua i ken kamap, sapos Projek i no bihainim ol polisi na prosidia bilong Benk long taim bilong disainim projek, apresal, na mekim wok.

Long ol birua bilong groim welpam, intanesenel luksave na wok bihainim long ol envairomen na sosol kamap bilong welpam developmen i senis bikipela tru insait long las tenpela yia. Long Papua Niugini, ol senis i kamap wantaim wok akreditesen insait long ISO14000 menesmen sistem, na setifikesen aninit long Rauntebol long Sastenabel Welpam (RSPO). Panel i ting ol wok i go het bai ol bikipela instramen bilong Projek i bihainim stret ol stendat bilong RSPO, em i wanpela bikipela wokabaut i go het long daunim ol birua long busgraun. Tasol bikos i gat bikipela wok daunim diwai, posin i kam long ol pipia bilong mil, na ol arapela hevi nogut i kam long ol wok welpam long bipo, Panel i luksave long as bilong ol belwari bilong ol Rikwesta.

Investigesen Ripot bilong Panel i lukluk inapim Envairomen Asesmen, Infiling, Graun i lus, Posin i bagarapim ol Hanwara na Diforestesen o rausim lain diwai. Glasim bilong Panel i lukluk long wok bihainim OP 4.01 long Envairomen Asesmen, OP 4.04 long ol Netseral Habitot o liklik busgraun ples, na OP 4.36 long ol Fores o lain diwai.

Envairomen Asesmen. Ol Rikwesta i autim wari olsem ol Projek Envairomen Asesmen i no inap. Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok olsem Envairomen Asesmen (EA), Envairomen Menesmen Plen (EMP) na Envairomen na Sosol Menesmen Fremwok (ESMF) bilong projek i makim ol hevi long busgraun, na ol rot bilong daunim ol. EMP i pinis wantaim sampela ol Envairomen Kontrol Mesa na ol Monitoring Program (ECMMP). Ol ECMMP i tok klia long rot bilong skelim ol nupela blok bilong planim welpam we i bihainim blok yet na ol ples klostu. Ol rot bilong mekim dispela i stap insait long ECMMP em i bihainim wok pasin aninit long OPIC – *SADP Welpam Infiling Planim Tok Orait Fom*.|| Panel i luksave olsem EA i makim gutpela wok pasin bilong lukautim busgraun. Moa long en, Panel i no painim ol asua insait long Envairomen Asesmen, olsem ol Rikwesta i tok, na i no kisim wanpela tru tru piksa long dispela kain asua rot. Insait long wanpela provision bilong independen envairomen na sosol odit o wok sekim long PIM, Menesmen i opim em yet long kisim ol tok stia long ol stekholda. **Panel i painim olsem karamapim bilong envairomen menesmen na ol rot bilong daunim hevi na strong bilong ol saveman ol i yusim insait long Envairomen Asesmen i bihainim stret OP 4.01.**

Infiling agensim Ekspensen. Ol Rikwesta i tok olsem dispela tok —*infilling*|| em ol i yusim hait insait long Projek na dispela em Projek i yusim long apim namba bilong ol welpam ol i planim, em i mobeta ol i kolim ‘expansion’ o grom i go bikipela moa

Em i tingting bilong Panel olsem dispela tok ‘infilling’ em Menesmen i no yusim long traim haitim wok bilong opim mak bilong welpaim ol i planim.

Ol Rikwesta i wari long ol i bungim hevi sapos ol infil blok i kamap insait long ol eria we i – *i givim ekonomik na sosol sevis long ol asples komyuniti na tu long mekim ol gaden bilong kaikai*//, Panel i luksave olsem nupela plantim fom bilong mun Me 2011, i no tok orait long senisim ol gaden long kamapim ol infil blok, sapos dispela ol gaden em wanpela ples tasol long apliken i mekim gaden.

Graun i lus, Gris long graun i pinis, na Siltesen o graun i pulap long wara Menesmen i luksave long birua bilong graun i lus na wara i pulap long graun i ken kamap long taim bilong sanapim ol nupela blok welpam.

Em nau, EA, EMP, na ECMMP i gat ol rot i stap long daunim wanem kain hevi i bihainim graun i lus, gris long graun i pinis, na graun i pulap long wara. Olgeta dispela ol rot bai daunim graun i lus na graun i go insait long ol hanwara. Em i orait, tasol pasin bilong bipo long mak bilogn OPIC, Menesmen i mas givim ol OPIC ekstensen wokman, inap trening, halivim na stia long inapim kamap tru bilong Projek. **Panel i painim olsem Projek i gat ol rot i stap bilong slekim ol hevi bilong graun i lus, gris long graun i pinis, na graun i pulap long wara, na dispela i bihainim stret OP 4.01.**

Posin i go insait long ol Wara. Ol Rikwesta i autim wari long kemikal na baiolojikal posin i go insait long ol wara bihainim wok welpam developmen. Ol mil i save mekim wok glasim long ol wara long sekim kemikal hevi na sans long kemikal posin bilong ol wara, na wok iutrofikesen, olsem i stap insait long EA na EMP. Ol ECMMP na OPIC Infilling Plenting Apruval Fom tu i gat ol gaitlain o stia long daunim ron bilong ol kemikal o marasin i go insait long ol wara. **Em i luksave bilong Panel olsem Menesmen i luksave long sans long kemikal posin i stap insait long welpam developmen, na i mekim olgeta samting insait long disain bilong Projek long daunim olgeta birua nogut long marasin bilong groim welpam i go insait long wara. Panel i painim olsem dispela i bihainim stret OP 4.01.**

Ol Rikwesta i tok tu olsem Envairomen Asesmen i no tingim bikipela hevi sapos moa pipia bilong mil i go insait long wara, na birua em i ken kamapim long ol pis na pipel. Ol Rikwesta i tok olsem hevi i stap yet bikos pipia bilong mil i wok long go insait long ol wara, na moa yet, insait long Wara Ambogo, na ol hetwara bilong Wara Mambare.

Insait long Bekim bilong en, Menesmen i tok wanbel olsem i nogat inap stori long en insait long EA long sait bilong pipia i kam long mil, na i strong long karimaut wanpela wok-glasim long ol hevi i stap sapos i gat moa pipia i kamaut long ol mil bihainim ol wok bilong Projek.

Menesmen i karimaut wanpela Stadi, we ol i kolim — *Effluent Study*||, long 2010, we i lukim kamap bilong wanpela Agreed Action Plen o Wanbel Eksen Plen, we i makim ol rot bilong kisim tok-promis long ol mil kampani long bihainim ol rot bilong stretim dispela hevi, na halivim long apdetim Papua Niugini Koud ov Praktis bilong Welpam Industri.

Panel i wanbel wantaim tingting bilong Menesmen olsem bikos i nogat gutpela wok-glasim bilong ol hevi i kam long pipia bilong ol mil, em i no bihainim stret OP 4.01. Panel i luksave na i wanbel olsem dispela Agrid Eksen Plen i stap insait long Effluent Study, i lukluk na stretim hevi bilong ol birua bilong pipia i kam long ol mil, na taim ol i mekim, em i ken bringim Projek i bihainim stret OP 4.01. Bikos i gat ol salens long karimaut ol lo bilong lukautim busgraun long Papua Niugini, olsem i stap insait long Effluent Study, Panel i ting Menesmen i isi tumas long mekim dispela wok, na dispela wok i mas kamap bipo yet.

Birua bilong Rausim ol bikpela lain Diwai. Ol Rikwesta i bilip olsem Projek em i bikpela birua long rausim ol bikpela lain diwai. Ol bikpela lain diwai long Oro Provins i lukim bikpela senis long ol yia i go pinis, bikos long senis long pasin bilong yusim graun.

Menesmen i luksave olsem i nogat inap saveman i stap long OPIC, na i sanapim pinis ol rot bilong stretim dispela ol hevi na strongim wok-mak bilong ol OPIC ekstensen wokman bai ol i ken stiaim wok bilong welpam bai em i inapim olgeta envairomen na sosol stendat o mak. **Panel i painim olsem wok Projek i mekim insait long disain bilong en long bildim strong bilong ol OPIC ekstensen wokman i bihainim olgeta askim bilong OP 4.04 long ol Netseral Habitot o busgraun.**

Menesmen i luksave tu olsem i mobeta long lukautim gut ol bikpela lain diwai, na em i kamapim ol rot long wok operesen bilong en insait long PIM long pasim planim bilong welpam long ples ol diwai i sanap. Tasol em i ken planim long ol – *impek na non-jenereting fores o lain diwai we i nogat planti diwai i gro long en*|| Tasol, Projek i nogat rot long mekim wanpela wok-kaunim long ol bikpela fores eria, we, wantaim wanpela me pi soim ol bikpela lain konsavesen veliu fores, i soim klia ol – *no go*|| na ol — *caution*|| eria o eria we ol i mas was gut long en. Ol dispela bai poromanim gut ol menesmen wok i stap pinis, na bai halivim ol OPIC opisa long skelim ol kain kain lain diwai we i hat long skelim. **Em i tingting bilong Panel olsem Menesmen i no inapim gut askim wantaim OP/BP 4.36 long strongim Borowa o lain i kisim dinau long givim Benk wanpela asesmen o skelim bilong gutpela bilong graun menesmen i ken yusim, konsavesen, na sastenabel developmen bilong ol fores, we i karamapim tu wanpela lis bilong ol bikpela fores eria. Tasol maski long dispela, Menesmen i gat ol rot i stap insait long Projek long pasim senis o daunim bilong ol bikpela fores eria o wankain bikpela ples busgraun; Panel i painim olsem Menesmen i bihainim stret OP/BP 4.36 long dispela sait.**

Sapta 6: Institusenal Sastenabiliti

Ol Rikwesta i autim belwari bilong ol long strong na stap longtaim bilong tupela hap bilong Projek bilong inapim ol aswok bilong Projek, em Rot Mentenens Tras Fan (RMTF) na wok-mak bilong OPIC long mekim wok.

RMTF em i wanpela yusa-pe fan we bai sanap insait long wanwan ol Projek eria aninit long Projek. Proposal o tok askim em long 25% bilong olgeta mani bilong rot mentenens olgeta yia bai kam long ol smolholda welpam growa, 25% bai kam long ol welpam kampani, na 50% bai kam long ol provinsal gavman. Em i tingting bilong ol Rikwesta olsem ol smolholda bai bungim hevi aninit long dispela rot bilong kisim mani bilong RMTF. Taim takis bilong ol smolholda i gat strong long kisim, i nogat rot i stap long kisim stret olgeta kontribusen bilong ol miling kampani na ol provinsal gavman, olsem na i nogat klia luksave long stap-longtaim bilong dispela rot bilong kisim mani, na tu, em i givim moa hevi long ol smolholda. Wankain tasol, ol smolholda bai kisim hevi bikos ol OPIC ekstensen opisa i nogat inap strong na save long karimaut dispela wok gut, wantaim ol ekstensen sevis bilong en. Panel i sekim ol dispela sut tok bihainim stia bilong OMS 2.20 long Projek Apresal, na OP 13.05 long Projek Supavisin.

Sastenabiliti o longtaim stap bilong RMTF

Panel i luksave olsem Menesmen i bin, na nau yet, i klia long bikpela wok bilong rot mentenens bilong strongim wok bilong ol smolholda i go longpela taim bihain. Tasol disain bilong SADP i no karamapim rot bilong pulim mani bilong mekim rot mentenens na olgeta dispela samting, ol i lusim long stap long taim wok i kamap long mekim Projek.

Panel i painim olsem Menesmen i asua long bihainim OMS 2.20 taim em i abrusim disain bilong dispela bikpela hap bilong Projek, we i mas i stap long inapim olgeta astingting bilong Projek, i go long karimaut wok bilong Projek. Moa long en, Panel i painim olsem askim bilong Menesmen long kisim 25% kontribusen long ol smolholda i go long RMTF i kamap, tasol i nogat gutpela wok skelim long strong bilong ol smolholda long inapim dispela manimak, na moa yet, i nogat konsaltesen wantaim ol smolholda.

Sastenabiliti o longtaim stap bilong ol OPIC Ekstensen Wok

Ol Rikwesta i autim belwari bilong ol long —...savemak bilong OPIC long givim ol gutpela ekstensen sevis//. Panel i tok olsem Menesmen i klia long liklik savemak bilong OPIC olsem wanpela ogenaísesen na savemak bilong ol ekstensen opisa bilong en. Ol dispela sot long save long mekim wok nau i kisim wok stretim long tupela rot: (a) i gat rot i stap nau long bildim savemak na strong bilong OPIC olsem wanpela institusen na, moa yet, ol ekstensen opisa bilong en; na (b) ol wok-rot bilong OPIC, olsem i stap insait long PIM, ECMMP na ol arapela menesmen tul, i givim stia long ol wok ekstensen bai ol i kamap gut, na long daunim wanem ol hevi i ken kamap long busgraun o komyuniti.

Panel i klia olsem Menesmen i traim long stretim ol sot bilong OPIC taim em i askim long sanapim na givim wok long OPIC Projek Opis na OPIC Rot Enjiniaring Yunit, olsem wanpela rot i gat mani bilong em yet.

Panel i luksave olsem, insait long mak bilong ol wokman bilong Menesmen long sapotim dispela Projek, Menesmen i bihainim olgeta askim bilong OP 13.05 long Projek Supavisin, paragraph 2b, em i tok, “Painim ol hevi kwik taim ol i kamap long wok karimaut na givim stia long borowa o lain i kisim dinau, long stretim ol.”

Tasol, taim Benk i senis long supavisin i go long – implimentesen sapot||, em i stap nau wantaim Menesmen long apim strong bilong em yet long painim ol hevi, wantaim luksave long stretim ol kwik. Moa yet sapos hevi i stap long sot bilong save long ejensi i go pas long mekim wok.

Sapta 7: Ol Sistemik o Bikpela Isiu

Wok-painim bilong Panel i autim ol lukluk glasim long ol bikpela isiu long tupela eria, em long bihainim stret Indijines Pipels Polisi long ol projek we ol indijines o asples pipel em ol namba wan lain long kisim gutpela bilong en, na long skelim ol birua long sait bilong sot long save bilong ol opis i mekim wok. Moa long dispela, wok-painim i autim sampela tingitng we i ken halivim long bihainim WBG Fremwok long Mekim wok insait long Welpam Sekta.

Yusim Indijines o Asples Pipels Polisi long ol Projek We ol Asples Pipel em ol Bikpela Benefisari

Panel i luksave olsem Menesmen i no redim wanpela Indijines Pipels Plen (IPP) bilong Projek, taim Projek yet i mekim wok bilong halivim ol asples komyuniti. As-wok bilong OP 4.10 long Indijines Pipels em long mekim ol projek i — *karamapim ol rot bilong (a) abrusim ol bikpela birua long ol Asples Pipel komyuniti; o (b) sapos i nogat rot long abrusim, daunim, slekim, o givim kompensesen long en. Ol projek Benk i givim mani long sapotim, em ol i disainim bai ol Asples Pipel i kisim sosol na ekonomik benefit we i gutpela bilong komyuniti na manmeri wantaim, na i tingim tu ol lain bilong bihain.*|| Panel i wari olsem ol wokman bai lus tingting long namba tu hap bilong ol sosol na ekonomik benefit)insait long ol projek we ol *‘birua na hevi’* i no klia, na i gat nid long kamapim wanpela IPP.

Wanpela bikpela wari em long konsaltesen wok; sapos em i mitim ol stendat bilong *‘fri, go pastaim na klia konsaltesen’*, sapos *‘bikpela komyuniti sapot’* long ol asples komyuniti i stap pinis, na sapos ol konsaltesen i lukluk gut long ol *‘benefit’*. Wok-painim bilong Panel i painim olsem ol konsaltesen i bin asua long mak, toksave, na rot ol i givim, na tu, em i no tingim ol kastomari straksa na i nogat stori long bikpela komyuniti sapot.

Wok-painim i painimaut olsem Projek disain i no makim gut ol tok klia na rekomendesen bilong Sosol Asesmen.

OP 4.10 i askim olsem konsaltesen wantaim ol komyuniti i kamap long taim bilong wok karimaut, we i mas bungim tu save bilong ol wokman i gat bikpela save.

Panel i painim olsem luksave bilong Menesmen long dispela polisi i bin pundaun taim Projek i pinisim bikpela wok disain, na i go long wok-karimaut na supavisin. Olsem na em bai mobeta long kamapim ol klia stia bilong wok long inapim OP 4.10 long ol projek we i gat nid long wanpela IPP i sanap em yet. Panel i luksave olsem ol projek long Papua Niugini i gat bikpela salens bilong Benk bikos olgeta pipel em ol asples pipel, we i kam long moa long et-handret tokples na kalsa, na em i nidim OP 4.10 long olgeta projek, wantaim bikpela luksave bilong ol i stap long sait bilong sefti mak.

Skelim ol Birua bilong Sot long Save na Wokmak bilong ol Institusen i Mekim Wok

Panel i luksave long bikpela ol asua long karimaut kwik Projek, we i autim tupela bikpela isiu Menesmen i mas stretim: Namba wan em, Menesmen i skelim ol birua long sot bilong save na wokmak bihainim bikpela bilong projek disain o nogat? Na namba tu, Menes mi bungim ol risos inap long mak bilong ol dispela asua insait long wok bilong supavaisim Projek o nogat?

Menesmen i luksave long hevi bilong sot long save insait long disain bilong en long Komponen 3, we i lukluk long strongim savemak bilong OPIC. Tasol insait long namba foa yia bilong Projek, i nogat disain o wok karimaut bilong RMTF na komyuniti developmen. SADP, em OPCS i bin luksave long en long mun Me 2007 olsem wanpela – *hai risk projek*|| bikos long — *bikpela bilong projek*||. Olsem na i gat nid long Projek i mas —*klia na isi long mekim*||, wankain olsem ol rekomendesen bilong ol projek insait long Pasifik Rijen insait long Kwolati Enhensmen Riviu long 2008, we i ken gutpela moa bilong SADP. Tasol long kipim klia na isi long mekim, i no min olsem i noken asua long birua.

Tru tumas, Panel i givim luksave long Menesmen long traim na sanapim wanpela strongpela rot bilong kamapim rot mentenens, we i mas i stap long strongim wok welpam. Tasol maski long dispela, wanpela bikpela isiu bilong risk menesmen em long lukim olsem hevi bilong birua i no pundaun long ol lain turangu. Panel i wari olsem insait long RMTF, olsem i stap pastaim yet, mani hevi na sans bilong birua i wok pundaun long ol smolholda tasol.

Taim Panel i amamas long savemak bilong wanwan wokman husat i wok wantaim Projek, bikpela moa savemak i mass tap long bekim ol salens we bai kamap long taim bilong karimaut projek, insait long kain ples olsem Papua Niugini.

Ol Skul i kamapim Bihainim long WBG Fremwok long Mekim wok long Welpam Sekta

Askim bilong Inspeksen i kamap bihain long Novemba 2009 Wol Benk Grup tambu long ol nupela welpam projek. Bikos ol i lonsim pinis SADP, dispela tambu i no karamapim em. Bihain, long mun Mas, 2011, Wol Benk Bod ov Ekseketiv Dairekta i tok oraitim wanpela WBG Fremwok long Mekim wok long Welpam Sekta.

Dispela wok painim i autim tripela isiu bilong WBG taim em i muv i go het wantaim Fremwok: (i) strong bilong ol borowa institusen long mekim wok, na strong bilong Benk yet long givim wok sapotim; (ii) luksave na kamapim ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani olsem wanpela bikpela rot bilong halivim ol smolholda; (iii) stretim ol hap long sekta we i no sanap gut, na pasin wokbung namel long ol smolholda na mil kampani.

Sapta 1: Rikwes o Askim long Inspeksen, Bekim bilong Menesmen na Rot bilong Wok Painim

A. Sindaun bilong Ripot

1. Dispela ripot i makim glasim bilong Inspeksen Panel na ol samting i kamap long Rikwes o Askim bilong Inspeksen (em “Rikwes”) long Papua Niugini: Smolholda Agrikalsa Dvelopmen Projek (long nau na i go – em – Projek ||).
2. Ripot i gat sevenpela sapta. Dispela Sapta i tokaut long Projek, i bungim tok long ol klem bilong ol Rikwesta na Bekim bilong Benk Menesmen long ol dispela klem o sut tok, na i tok makim rot bilong wok painim na disain bilong Panel; Sapta 2 i givim wanpela tok-stori long sindaun bilong Projek i kamap; Sapta 3 i lukluk long ol isiu long sait bilong tok klia na wok-konsaltesen wantaim ol asples pipel; Sapta 4 i toktok long bikpela askim sapos moa welpam prodaksen i save daunim pasin turangu na strongim sindaun bilong ol smolholda; Sapta 5 i lukluk long ol hevi long busgraun insait long Rikwes; Sapta 6 i stretim ol wari insait long Rikwes long longtaim stap bilong Welpam Industri Koporesen (OPIC) na Rot Mentenens Tras Fan (RMTF); na Sapta 7 i pinis wantaim ol bikpela isiu we Panel i painimaut.
3. Bihainim pawa na wokmak bilong en, wok-painim bilong Panel i lukluk moa long ol samting Rikwes i autim long ol sut-tok olsem Projek i no bihainim ol wok-polisi na prosidia bilong Wol Benk, na ol hevi bilong en, long Projek.

B. Sotpela Stori bilong Projek

4. Projek i traim long apim winmani na strongim sindaun bilong ol smolholda i wok insait long welpam prodaksen, na strongim ol long planim moa welpam bihainim pasin bilong "infilling||² long 9,000 hekta,³ stretim bek na lukautim ol rot i go insait long ples na Projek, na strongim wok bilong givim sevis na infrastraksa wantaim halivim bilong komyuniti. Projek bai kamap insait long wanwan distrik long Oro na Wes Nu Briten (WNB) provins long faivpela yia.⁴
5. Insait long Fainensing Agrimen, astingting bilong Projek em long "*apim, bihainim gutpela rot, mak bilong wokbung insait long lokol developmen bilong komyuniti taim ol i apim winmani bilong welpam na lokol wokbung.*"⁵

² Infilling em ol nupela blok bilong welpam ol i planim namel long ol blok i stap pinis, bihainim ol eksekutif rot insait long Nuklius Estet na ol Smolholda Skim eria. ³ Long olgeta 9,000 hekta (ha) long ol nupela welpam ol i planim, Projek Apresal Dokumen (PAD) i took olsem 3,500 ha bai stap long Hoskins, 1,240 ha long Bialla, and 4,000 ha long Oro, em nau i apim wok groim welpam i go antap 13%, 9%, na 28%, yet. PAD, p. 28. ⁴ Projek Apresal Dokumen (PAD), Ripot Namba: 38558-PNG, long Novemba 19, 2007, p.4, 14. Menesmen i toksave long Panel olsem ol projek eria em Ijivitari long Oro provins na Talasea distrik long WNB provins. ⁵ PAD, p. 3, 11.

6. Ol dispela astingting bai kamap bihainim tripela komponen o hapwok:⁶
- **Komponen 1: Strongim Wokmak bilong ol Smolholda** (\$18.9 milion i kam long Intanesenel Developmen Asosiesen (IDA). Dispela komponen i sapotim: smolholda welpam developmen long 9,000 hekta (ha) graun i stap nating bihainim ol eksekutif long wok infiling; apgredim 550 kilomita long ol rot i stap pinis na sanapim Rot Mentenens Tras Fan (RMTF) insait long tripela Projek eria; na givim ol agrikalsa ekstensen sevis aninit long Welpam Industri Koporesen (OPIC).
 - **Komponen 2: Lokol Gavanens na Komyuniti Wokbung** (\$3 milion IDA). Dispela pailot komponen i sapotim mobeta givim bilong ol lokol sevis na infastraksa insait long tupela projek provins bilong Oro na Wes Nu Briten bihainim ol rot bilong wokbung (Developmen i kam long Komyuniti yet).
 - **Komponen 3: Projek Menesmen na Institusenal Sapot** (\$5.6 milion IDA). Dispela komponen i sapotim wok OPIC i mekim long strongim projek menesmen taim em strongim wokmak bilong en, na strongim save bilong en long givim ol ekstensen sevis long ol growa, we i halivim em long kisim kontrak wantaim wanpela menesmen ejensi long karimaut Komponen namba 2, strongim smolholda welpam sekta (ol growa asosiesen na Papua Niugini Welpam Riset Asosiesen), na givim mani long karimaut ol wok stadi(Fres Frut Bans⁸ prais fomula rivi na disain bilong ol RMTF) na ol ovasis masta kos.
7. Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok Projek em i —*bihainim stret*// Pillar II bilong Papua Niugini Kantri Asistens Strateji (CAS) (2008-11) we i tok, —*Strongim sindaun na wok givim sevis, moa yet bilong ol lain turangu i stap long ples,*⁹ na gavman i luksave long welpam developmen insait long Nesenel Agrikalsa Developmen Plen, 2007-16.
8. Manimak bilong Projek em \$68.8 milion, wantaim IDA mani em \$ 27.5 milion—we i wankain long ol Spesol Droing Rait (SDR) 17.7 milion. Ol lain i givim mani long Projek em Papua Niugini Sastenabel Developmen Program (PNG SDP) (\$10.2 milion), Provinsal Gavman bilong Wes Nu Briten provins (\$7.2 milion), Provinsal Gavman bilong Oro provins (\$3.5 million), Ol Welpam Miling Kampani (\$5.7 milion), na ol Smolholda^{10 11} (\$7.3 million).
9. Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok olsem Projek i bin kamap namba wan taim long mun Novemba 2002, tasol wok prosesim i bin isi liklik long saspensen na kanselim o rausim bilong

⁶PAD., pp. 4-5. ⁷ Rot Mentenens Tras Fan em i wanpela yusa-pe mani rot bilong mekim rot mentenens wok. ⁸ Fres Frut Bans (FFB) em i wanpela praimer yunit bilong skelim ol welpam sels. ⁹ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 6, Futnot 18. ¹⁰ Bihainim PAD p. 5, bikipela hap bilong smolholda mani kontribusen bilong Projek em i sea bilong Rot Mentenens Tras Fan takis. ¹¹ Bekim bilong Menesmen – Rikwes bilong Inspeksen bilong Papua Niugini: Smolholda Agrikalssa Divelomen Projek (IDA 43740-PNG), Februari 8, 2010, p. 10, ¶ 30.

Forestri Konsavesen Projek we Wol Benk i bin givim mani long kamapim. Ol wok redi bilong Projek i bin kirap gen bihain long ol Wol Benk Enual Miting long Septemba 2005.¹²

10. IDA dinau i bin kisim tok orait long Desemba 18, 2007 na em i bin kamap long Janueri 28, 2009. Taim bilong Projek i Pas em Desemba 31, 2012, tasol dispela i ken senis bihainim kaikai bilong ol toktok namel long Menesmen na Gavman bilong Papua Niugini long senisim bilong Projek na wanpela tupela yia sukuruim.¹³ Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok abrus long kirapim ol Projek wok bihain long Projek i kisim tok orait, i bihainim abrusim bilong sainim Kredit, inapim strong bilong Projek, na kirap bilong ol wok redi olsem wok bilong kisim na rikrutmen.

11. Projek Apresal Dokumen (PAD) i tok olsem Papua Niugini welpam sab-sekta i bihainim nuklius estet sistem. Insait long dispela sistem, i gat strongpela wokbung namel long tripela lain: ol praivet sekta welpam miling kampani wantaim ol plantesen na mil bilong ol husat i save givim dinau, agrikalsa tok stia, na frut koleksen sevis long ol smolholda; ol smolholda growa; na OPIC. Projek eria i gat tripela welpam Nuklia Estet Skim: Popondetta insait long Oro provins na Hoskins na Bialla long Wes Nu Briten provins. Olgeta dispela tripela eria i gat ol estet plantesen na ol Viles Welpam (VOP) blok na ol Len Setelmen Skim (LSS) blok. Ol VOP bloke m ol dispela we ol growa i sainim wanpela Kastomari Yusim Graun Agrimen i save givim ol rait bilong yusim graun we ol i save groim na lukautim tupela o foapela hekta welpam. Ol LSS blok em ol dispela we ol wairaman bilong kain kain hap bilong Papua Niugini i sindaun long ol blok i gat siksipela hekta we sampela, o olgeta i go long groim welpam.

12. OPIC yet i karimaut Projek. Wanpela Projek Stiaring Komiti (PSC) i sanap long stiaim wok karimaut na givim stia long ol wok polisi. Siaman bilong Komiti em Sekreteri bilong Dipatmen bilong Nesenel Plening na Monitaring (DNPM) na bai gat ol mausmanmeri bilong ol gavman dipatmen na ejensi, olsem Dipatmen bilong Tresari, Agrikalsa na Laipstok, Envairomen na Konsavesen, Woks, Provinsal na Lokol Gavman Afes, Komyuniti Dvelopmen; ol Provinsal Gavman, na Papua Niugini Sastenabel Dvelopmen Program.

¹² Bekim bilong Menesmen, 36. ¹³ Papua Niugini: Smolholda Agrikalsa Dvelopmen Projek (IDA 43740-PNG), Fainal Aid Memo, Namba Faiv Implimentesen Sapot Misin: Epril 15-19, 2011, 34.



Piksa 1: Welpam Fres Frut Bans (FFB) i redi long kisim

C. Ol Samting i Kamapim Wok-painim

13. Long Desemba 8, 2009, Inspeksen Panel i kisim wanpela Rikwes bilong Inspeksen¹⁴ long Papua Niugini: Smolholda Agrikalsa Dvelopmen Projek we IDA i givim mani long kamapim.¹⁵ Rikwes i kam long Desemba 8, 2009, em Ahora/Kakandetta Pressure Group, em kastomari papagraun long Oro provins na ol smolholda insiat long wanpela long tripela Projek eria (ol – Rikwesta). Ol Rikwesta i askim Senta bilong Envaironmental Lo na Komyuniti Raits (CELCOR), wanpela non-gavman ogenaísesen (NGO) bilong Papua Niugini yet, long makim ol.

Ol Rikwesta i tok olsem ol bungim hevi pinis, na bai ol i bungim hevi yet, na kisim bikpela birua long disain na wok karimaut bilong Projek.

14. Panel i rejistaim Rikwes long Desemba 17, 2009. Menesmen i kisim wanpela ekstensen o skruim long Bod ov Ekseketiv Dairekta, na givim bekim bilong en (em “Bekim bilong Menesmen”) long Februari 8, 2010.

15. Long Mas 10, 2010, Panel i givim Ripot na Rekomendesen bilong en¹⁶ long ol Ekseketiv Dairekta. Insait long ripot, Panel i tok oraitim wok-painim long ol sut tok i stap insait long Rikwes bilong Inspeksen. Long Mas 25, 2010, Bod i tok oraitim, we i nogat tok daunim, rekomendesen bilong Panel long karimaut wanpela wok-painim i go insait long ol sut tok long Rikwes bilong Inspeksen.

16. Dispela Investigesen Ripot i givim ol samting Inspeksen Panel i painim, na ol tingting long bekim Rikwes o askim.

¹⁴ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, December 17, 2009. ¹⁵ Bilong dispela Ripot, IDA em sampela taim, i kisim nem “Benk.” ¹⁶ Inspeksen Panel Ripot na Rekomendesen, Papua Niugini – Smolholda Agrikalsa Dvelopmen Projek, Mars 10, 2010, p. 19, ¶80.



Piksa 2: Wanpela ples long Oro provins

D. Rikwes bilong Inspeksen

17. Ol Rikwesta i bilip olsem Benk i asua long inapim sampela long ol Operesenal Polisi na Prosidia long disain, apresal o skelim manimak, na karimaut Projek, na i kamapim pinis, o bai kamapim hevi long komyuniti bilong ol. Ol dispela paragraph nau i tok klia na bungim tok long Rikwes bilong Inspeksen.

¹⁷ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p.2., i stap long www.inspectionpanel.org.

18. Rikwes i tok olsem tingting bilong Projek i bin kamap long 2003, olsem wampela folo-ap o bihainim bipo projek Wol Benk i givim mani long en, Papua Niugini: Oro Smolholda Welpam Dvelopmen Projek (1992-2001). Tasol Projek i “*no bin go het*” na ol wok redi no bin go het inap 2006. Ol Rikwesta i bilip olsem Projek tingting i bin senis namel long dispela taim long wampela opim mak bilong welpam projek i go long wampela “*infilling*” na rot mentenens projek.

19. Ol Rikwesta i painim bikipela wari wantaim welpam dvelopmen, we, ol i tok welpam prodaksen i no daunim pasin turangu long ol smolholda. Ol i tok olsem projek bai — *daunim mak bilong ol ekonomik rot bilong ol, na fosim ol long groim welpam, maski ol i pilim olsem stap bilong ol insait long wok welpam i no inap strongim sindaun bilong ol.*¹⁷ Moa yet, ol i tok olsem i gat ol arapela birua bilong welpam prodaksen, na i nogat toksave long dispela i go aut long ol smolholda, olsem: kliarim graun na daunim ol bikipela lain diwai, we i ken kamapim graun i lus, topsoil i pinis, na graun i pulap long wara; na kemikal na baiolojikal posin i go insait long wara.

20. Ol Rikwesta i tok, dinau rot aninit long namba wan komponen bilong Projek, we i save givim dinau long ol smolholda i laik planim welpam long sait bilong ol eksekutif rot we i nogat welpam dvelopmen (em ‘infilling’), em i samting olsem 9,000 hekta long graun ‘*i stap nating*’ bilong nupela wok-planim, na i no tok strongim moa wokmak long ol blok i stap pinis.

21. Moa long dispela, ol Rikwesta i painim ol dispela ol birua i stap pinis, o i ken kamap yet, we ol i tok Projek i kirapim:

22. **Infomesen Disklosa, Konsaltesen na Komyuniti Sapot.** Ol Rikwesta i tok olsem “*Wol Benk na projek sponsa i no toktok wantaim ol lain i mekim klem na ol arapela asples komyuniti.*” na “[p]rojek infomesen i no go aut olgeta pastaim long tok orait na i no stap yet, na i no go aut long tok inglis tasol, na nogat narapela tokples.” Dispela haitim bilong ol toksave na konsaltesen insait long Projek eria pastaim long Projek i kisim tok orait, em ol Rikwesta i tok em i “*wampela bikipela wari tru bilong ol*”. Ol Rikwesta i tok tu olsem maski ol i Asples Pipel na ol kastomari papagraun, Wol Benk i no givim ol sans long givim tingting long “*bikipela, astingting na ol wok*” bilong Projek. Ol Rikwesta i bilip ol konsalten i go pas long ol proposal long ol arapela rot bilong mekim winmani na tokpait long “*yusa fi*”. Ol Rikwesta i tok olsem maski ol i askim, ol i no kisim ol rekot bilong ol konsaltesen, we Benk i tok em i mekim long taim bilong disain wok. Dispela “*haitim bilong ol konsaltesen rekot i tromoi askim sapos i bin i gat gutpela na bikipela komyuniti sapot*” bilong Projek, i mekim ol Rikwesta long kisim tingting olsem wanem kain konsaltesen i bin kamap, i no bin inap, na i bin “*liklik tasol*” na “*i no op long kisim moa bikipela tok orait.*”¹⁹

23. **Pasin Turangu na Hevi long Sindaun.** Ol Rikwesta i tok olsem “*maski i gat bikipela mak invesmen*” Wol Benk i givim long welpam indastri, ol dispela invesmen “*i no mekim wampela samting long senisim sindaun bilong ol smolholda.*”²⁰ Ol i tok-sut long Sosol Asesmen²¹ i kamap aninit long Projek, we i tok olsem “*sindaun bilong ol i bagarap moa yet, na ol bikipela indiketa olsem poveti o pasin turangu olsem haus, klin wara na helt sevis i soim olsem gutpela sindaun i wok bagarap.*”²² Ol Rikwesta i tok moa olsem Sosol Asesmen “*i luksave olsem pundaun long mak bilong sindaun i no wankain*”²³ bikos kes winmani bilong ol welpam smolholda i antap moa long winmani bilong ol arapela kes-krop smolholda.

24. Ol Rikwesta i tok olsem aninit long Projek, ol fama bai no inap long “*apim sindaun mak*”²⁴ bilong ol” bikos ol i “*sindaun long strong bilong ol arapela*” na pasin brukim-winmani wantaim estet mil. Ol i tok tu olsem Projek bai “*strongim moa*” Fres Frut Bans (FFB) prais sistem, we, ol i tok, i save mobeta long ol miling kampani na ol smolholda, nogat. Ol Rikwesta i bilip olsem pasin bilong promotim welpam olsem “*wampela winmani rot tasol bilong ol Asples Pipel i sindaun insait long tripela projek eria*” i save kamapim monokropping o pasin bilong groim wampela kain samting tasol, we “*i agensim tru ol wok skelim bilong Wol Benk yet long bikipela luksave long opim planti rot bilong kisim winmani insait long ol smolholda eria*”²⁶ na i save pasim ol smolholda long yusim graun bilong ol long mekim ol arapela wok bilong kisim winmani.

¹⁸ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 2. ¹⁹ Ibid, pp. 6-7. ²⁰ Ibid, p. 5. ²¹ Curry, G.N., Koczberski, G., Omuru, E., Duigu, J., Yala, C., na Imbun, B. Sosol Asesmen Ripot bilong Smolholda Agrikalsa Dvelopmen Projek (SADP), Papua Niugini, 2007. ²² Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p.

5. ²³ Ibid, p.5 ²⁴ Ibid, p.5. ²⁵ Ibid, p.5. ²⁶ Ibid, p. 6.

Moa yet, ol i tok olsem antap long ol planti takis ol smolholda i mas peim long wok welpam, ol i mas peim *"narapela takis moa long sapotim Rot Mentenens Tras Fan"*²⁷ we i kamap aninit long Projek. Olsem na, long lukluk bilong ol, taim Projek i *"strongim olgeta"* dispela pasin, na apim ol takis, Projek bai no inap halivim ol smolholda long *"apim ol yet na lusim pasin turangu."*²⁸

25. **Ol Hevi long Busgraun.** Ol Rikwesta i tok olsem *"ol envairomen asesmen i k amap i no kamap gut na i abrusim ol bikpela hevi,"*²⁹ olsem birua bilong moa pipia i kamaut long ol mil na i go insait long ol wara, pis na pipel. Ol i bilip olsem Envairomen Asesmen³⁰ i gat ol *"bikpela asua"* bikos em i no yusim gutpela ol namba na stori, na i no glasim tritmen bilong pipia bilong mil, na i no givim rot bilong daunim ol hevi bilong Projek long ol bikpela lain bus na diwai.
26. Long sait bilong ol bikpela lain diwai, ol Rikwesta i bilip olsem Projek bai lukim bikpela lain diwai i lus bikos ol i yusim ol *"sait sensitiviti sevei"* bilong OPIC we i save stiaim ol OPIC opisa long makim ol graun i gat bikpela lain diwai olsem ol ples i gutpela long planim welpam, na makim ol taget bilong planim welpam. Ol Rikwesta i tok ol diwai bilong ol — *i save givim ol ekonomik na sosol sevis bilong ol lokol komyuniti na ol gaden long haus.*³¹ Ol i bilip olsem daunim ol diwai bai kamap bikos *"ol OPIC opisa i nogat inap save long klasifaim ol lain diwai"*³² stret, bihainim sait sevei mak, na bikos long wanpela insentiv sistem we i save luksave long ol bihainim hamas welpam ol i planim. Ol Rikwesta i laikim sampela ol rot bilong pasim daunim bilong ol diwai, na karimaut wanpela bikpela veliu lain diwai inventori o wok kaundim pastaim long nupela wok-planim i go het.
27. **Institusenal Sastenabiliti.** Ol Rikwesta i autim ol wari long longpela taim stap bilong Rot Mentenens Tras Fan (RMTF) na institusenal savemak bilong OPIC, we ol i tok i *"tupela bikpela hanmak bilong projek."* Ol i bilip olsem tupela samting wantaim, ol i no disainim gut, na bai no inap stap longpela taim bihain long Projek i pinis. Ol Rikwesta i tok olsem ol rot insait long Projek eria i bagarap pinis, na ol rot insait long Provins we ol bipo Wol Benk Oro Smolholda Welpam Developmen Projek (1992-2001) i bagarap pinis. Long lukluk bilong ol, ol rot bilong kamap aninit long Projek bai no inap stap longpela taim bikos bungim bilong mani kontribusen i kam long ol provinsal gavman na long welpam indastri i no gutpela. Ol Rikwesta i tok olsem narapela samting we bai daunim strong bilong ol dispela em liklik wok-mak bilong OPIC na nogat inap ekstensen opisa long inapim olgeta growa, we bai lukim pundaun long givim gutpela ekstensen sevis, na dispela bai mekim Projek i no gutpela.
28. Moa long en, ol Rikwesta i tok olsem ol manmeri i save peim takis long Papua Niugini bai peim mani long ol dispela rot tripela taim olgeta, taim ol i peim takis long ol rot long bipo Wol Benk projek, na nau bilong dispela Projek, na bihain, taim ol i peim ol yusa fi. Rikwes i tok olsem aninit long olpela Wol Benk Oro Smolholda Welpam Developmen Projek (1992-2001) *"samting olsem 180kilomita rot, ol i no mekim, na ol smolholda i nogat gutpela rot long yusim"*³.

²⁷ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen.p.5. ²⁸ Ibid, pp. 5-6. ²⁹ Ibid, p. 9. ³⁰ Douglas Environmental Services. Envairomen Asesmen, Smolholda Agrikalsa Developmen Projek, 2007, OPIC. ³¹ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 3. ³² Ibid, pp. 9, 10.

Rikwes i toktok tu long wanpela imejensi AusAID fan, ol i bungim long pinisim ol *“leftova”* rot bilong Oro projek. Ol i tok olsem Projek bai agredim ol wankain rot AusAID i givim mani long stretim, wantaim moa long 100 kilomita i nidim wok stretim.

29. Long bungim tok, ol Rikwesta i tok olsem Projek *“i agensim”* sampela ol Wol Benk polisi na bai: daunim ekonomik wok sans bilong ol na fosim ol long produsim welpam, maski ol i bilip olsem welpam faming bai no inap strongim sindaun bilong ol; bagarapim wara; daunim ol lain diwai; no inap stap strong longpela taim; na i ken kamapim moa mani hevi taim em i askim ol growa long peim moa takis long ol rot mentenens fi.
30. Ol Rikwesta i luksave olsem ol i autim ol wari bilong ol wantaim Wol Benk planti taim pinis, na ol i givim lis i soim ol pas ol i salim olsem evidens, tasol ol i tok ol i *“no kisim wanpela gutpela bekim long tok olsem projek bai no inap larim ol dispela birua antap long kamap.”*³⁴
31. Moa yet, ol Rikwesta i askim long Projek i stap pastaim inap: *“(a) wok bilong rausim pasin turangu i stap insait long projek disain; (b) i gat ol arapela winmani rot i stap long strongim mani sindaun; (c) bikipela envairomen asesmen i kamap, na karamapim asesmen bilong ol tritmen long pipia bilong mil, na mak bilong ol diwai; (d)projek disain i senis long kamapim gut projek sastenabiliti o stap longpela taim; na (e) stretpela wok konsaltesen i go het long givim ol komyuniti fri, klia tok orait i go pastaim long olgeta hap wok bilong projek.”*³⁵



Piksa 3: Wanpela ples long Wes Nu Briten provins

³³ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 11. ³⁴ Ibid, p. 2. ³⁵ Ibid, p. 17.

E. Bekim bilong Menesmen na Wok Benk i mekim

32. Long Februari 8, 2010, Menesmen i givim Bekim bilong em long Rikwes bilong Inspeksen.³⁶ Bekim i lukluk long ol bikipela isiu ol Rikwesta i autim, na i karamapim foapela anekses na tripela mep. Bungim tok bilong Bekim bilong Menesmen i stap daunbilo.
33. Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok olsem Wol Benk i wok wantaim ol welpam projek long Papua Niugini long 1969 yet taim namba wan welpam projek bilong Wol Benk i kamap. Benk i givim mani long kamapim foapela welpam projek pastaim long SADP.³⁷ Menesmen i luksave olsem taim Wol Benk i kirapim wok wantaim Papua Niugini gen long 2005, bihain long tupela yia malolo taim ol i saspnim Papua Niugini Forestri na Konsavesen Projek (2001),³⁸ ol i makim welpam olsem namba wan rot bilong strongim sindaun long ples. Long abrusim ol birua long busgraun, we i kamap bipo long ol nupela welpam developmen, Wol Benk i lukluk moa long ol smolholda insait long ol welpam eria i stap pinis we ol i laik apim wokmak bilong ol na strongim rot bilong ol long go long ol mil kampani na kisim ol lokol-level sevis bihainim stretim bilong ol rurel rot. Menesmen i toksave olsem Papua Niugini welpam indastri i save givim bikipela halivim long laip na sindaun bilong ol manmeri long ples, na i save givim gutpela kaikai long ol smolholda, moa long ol arapela kes-krop,³⁹ na em i namba tu bikipela bisnis i save kisim wokman insait long kantri, bihain long pablik sekta. Moa long en, welpam (em wel i kam long frut bilong welpam diwai) em i wanpela bikipela kontributa long ekonomi bilong Papua Niugini, we em i wok groa long laspela 30 yia na insait long las faivpela yia, em i go bikipela moa. Tasol Menesmen i tok olsem maski kontribusen bilong en long nesenel ekonomi, Papua Niugini welpam sekta em i liklik long wol, we em i napim 1% long olgeta welpam long wol.



Piksa 4: Lukluk i go daun long ol welpam blok long Wes Nu Briten provins

³⁶ Bekim bilong Menesmen –Rikwes bilong Inspeksen long PNG: Smolholda Agrikalsa Dvelopmen Projek (IDA Kredit Namba. 4374-PNG), Februari 8, 2010. I stap long www.inspectionpanel.org.³⁷ Ol dispela em Nu Briten Smolholda Dvelopmen Projek 1969-73 (Namba 1hap) na 1970-76 (Namba 2 hap); Popondetta Smolholda Welpam Dvelopmen Projek (1976-84); Nuklius Estet na Smolholda (Milen Be) Projek (198592); na, Oro Smolholda Dvelopmen Projek (1992-2001).³⁸ Bekim bilong Menesmen, ¶36.³⁹ Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok olsem ol welpam smolholda i save mekim K2,793 Iha na KI30/de wok, we ol arapela kes-krop olsem kakao (KI,136Iha na K2I/de wok) na kofi (K2,058Iha na KI13/de wok). Bekim bilong Menesmen, Eksektiv Sameri o Bungim Tok, p. vii.

34. **Wol Benk Grup Tambu.** Menesmen i luksave tu olsem Wol Benk Grup⁴⁰ tambu long welpam i kamaut long Novemba 2009 i no long SADP bikos Projek i bin stap pinis long dispela taim na "*...disain bilong em bilong stretim ol kain kain hevi long komyuniti na busgraun we i bin kamap long sait bilong sekta yet.*"⁴¹ Tasol Menesmen i bilip olsem i ken i gat rivi long Projek, na i ken i gat senis long sait bilong ol kaikai bilong nupela welpam strateji bilong Wol Benk Grup. Dispela strateji, —*Wol Benk Grup Fremwok na IFC Strateji bilong Wok insait long Welpam Sekta,*⁴² i bin pinis na go aut long pablik long mun Mas 2011.
35. Menesmen i tok olsem SADP i sapotim Midium-Tem Dvelopmen Strateji (2005-2010) bilong Papua Niugini na i bungim olgeta skul Benk i kisim long wok bilong en insait long welpam sab-sekta, na moa yet long Oro Smolholda Welpam Dvelopmen Projek, we i pas long 2001.⁴³ Maski ol asua long karimauut wok i surukim olgeta bikpela wok bilong Projek, Projek i bin givim halivim bihain long Saiklon Guba i kamap na bagarapim Oro Provins long 2007.
36. **Birua bilong Projek.** Menesmen i luksave olsem planti i tok Projek "*i gat planti birua*"⁴⁴ long taim bilong apresal bikos em i traim long stretim hevi bilong ol ekkses rot wantaim RMTF, na bikos savemak bilong Projek long mekim dispela wok i no nogat inap strong. Tasol, Menesmen i bilip i gat rot i kamap pinis long stretim ol dispela hevi. Moa yet, wanpela 2008 Kwolati Asurens Grup (QAG) rivi i painim olsem SADP em i wanpela "*bikpela*" na "*stretpela*" wok bisnis bilong Papua Niugini, maski i gat tok olsem wok redi, we i stap long liklik hap taim tasol long bihainim wok dinau, i bin hariap tumas, na "*i bin inap long kisim gutpela wok redi long wokim RMTF na stretim ol Tems ov Refrens (TOR) bilong ol wok konsaltensi aninit long Projek.*"⁴⁵
37. **Sanap bilong Projek.** Menesmen i tok olsem tupela yia bihain long Bod i givim tok orait bilong en "*...ol bikpela Projek wok wantaim rot konstraksen na mentenens, infil planim na givim ol lokol sevis na infrastraks aninit long CDD i no kirap yet, na bai kirap long namba tri kwota bilong 2010.*"⁴⁶ Tasol Menesmen i bilip olsem bikpela wok i go het i bin kamap insait long "*Oro imejensi rot stretim progem, wok infiling bilong en, bungim bilong ol Projek mani, na wok redi bilong strongim wok-mak na save bilong OPIC.*"⁴⁷ Menesmen i luksave olsem PAD "*i asua long painim ol birua rot bilong wok karimaut i go het isi tumas na taim bilong sanapim projek menesmen savemak bilong OPIC.*"⁴⁸

⁴⁰ Bilong dispela Ripot, Wol Benk Grup em i Intanesenel Dvelopmen Asosiesen (IDA), Intanesenel Benk bilong Rikonstraksen na Dvelopmen (IBRD), Intanesenel Fainens Koporesen (IFC), na Multilateral Invesmen Geranti Ejensi (MIGA).⁴¹ Bekim bilong Menesmen, Eksekutiv Sameri, p. vii.⁴² Wol Benk, WBG Welpam Fremwok na IFC Strateji bilong Wok insait long Welam Sekta, Mas 31, 2011.⁴³ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 8, 26.⁴⁴ Ibid., 32.⁴⁵ Ibid, p. 12, 35.⁴⁶ Ibid., p. 11, 34.⁴⁷ Ibid, p. 14, 41.

38. **Daunim Pasin Turangu.** Menesmen i bilip olsem Wol Benk invesmmen insait long welpam sekta long Papua Niugini i gat gutpela kamap na Projek bai go het long givim ol kain gutpela samting long gutpela envairomen na komyuniti rot. Menesmen i tok olsem indastri i save givim bikpela wok-mak na *“welpam tude i givim ol smolholda moa winmani bilong graun na hatwok moa long planti ol arapela agrikalsa komoditi i go long ol winmani bilong wan wan hauslain.”*⁴⁹ Long luksave bilong Menesmen, winmani bilong wampela Viles Welpam (VOP) growa inap long (K)5,586 olgeta yia, long wampela tu-hekta blok, i mobeta wampela yia winmani bilong wampela ful-taim wokman husat i save kisim K3,200 long mak bilong minimum weis o potnait pe. Menesmen i luksave olsem welpam i nogat hatwok olsem ol arapela kes-krop (43 de olgeta yia bilong wampela tu-hekta blok) na i givim gutpela winmani taim yu rausim frut olgeta potnait.⁵⁰ Menesmen i wanbel olsem pasin bilong opim rot bilong kisim winmani em i bikpela samting bilong tingim, na i tok olsem ol stori na namba i stap pinis, i tok olsem ol VOP hauslain insait long Projek eria, moa long ol LSS hauslain, i gat ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani pinis we Projek bai sapotim wantaim mobeta rot na Komponen 2, we i save givim mani long ol smol-skel, komyuniti-level ekonomik infrastraksa, wok bilong sindaun gut, trening, na teknikal halivim.
39. Menesmen i bilip olsem paradoks o sindaun bilong ol bikpela kes winmani na sindaun i tamblo tru em i wampela hevi i stap long olgeta hap bilong kantri, na i no long ol welpam produsa o Projek eria tasol. Menesmen i tok dispela i kamap long bikpela mak bilong kaikai, nogat inap seving, na ol wok kastom we i mekim ol hauslain i brukim winmani bilong ol wantaim ol arapela lain famili na poroman. Dispela, wantaim *“wok i no strong o slek”* bilong gavman sevis i go long ol rurel eria, na i save mekim hevi i go bikpela moa. Moa yet, bikpela mak bilong populesen insait long ol LSS hauslain-wantaim inap long tripela lain famili i kisim pe long wampela LSS blok long sampela hap na senisim bilong welpam frut namel long ol yet – i mekim ol i sindaun moa long ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani na kaikai long gaden.
40. Menesmen i tok, strongpela pasin poroman bilong ol welpam growa wantaim mil kampani i save opim mobeta rot long kisim dinau na wok-save i go long wok faming moa long ol arapela kes-krop. Bekim bilong ol dinau long wok i go insait long faming i kam long mil kampani long taim bilong peim winmani i go long wanwan growa, olsem na i gat strongpela rot bilong bekim. Menesmen i tok olsem, rot i op long kisim dinau i no min olsem ol smolholda bai go insait long groim welpam, bikos wok infiling em i stap long laik bilong wanwan, sapos ol inapim olgeta askim bilong en. Moa yet, Menesmen i bilip olsem strongim bilong Mama Lus Frut Skim (MLFS)⁵¹ bai gat long gutpela kaikai long ol meri, na long hauslain tu.

⁴⁸ Ibid., p. 11, ¶ 34. ⁴⁹ Menesmen i tok olsem pe bilong welpam long prais tude, em i samting olsem K2,793/ha na K130/de wok, we em i K1, 136/ha na K21/de wok bilong kakao na K2,058/ha na K13/de wok bilong kofi. Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 17, ¶ 47. ⁵⁰ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 17, ¶ 47. ⁵¹ Mama Lus Frut Skim (MLFS) em NBPOL i kamapim long Hoskins eria na i go moa long ol smolholda eria; 85% long ol meri insait long olgeta tripela SADP Projek eria i gat ol havesting kat bilong ol yet. Bungim lus frut,

41. Menesmen i bilip tu olsem mani i go long ol rurel ekses rot bai gat gupela kamap taim ol i opim rot i go long ol sevis olsem helt na edukesen. Moa yet, Komponen 2 bilong Projek bai inapim ol komyniti long karimaut wok invesmen bihainim pasin wokbung. Long lukluk bilong Menesmen, dispela tu bai gat gupela kamap bilong laip na sindaun insait long ol Projek eria.
42. **Fres Frut Bans (FFB) Praising Fomula.** Menesmen i tok klia olsem FFB — *...praising fomula i sanap long wanpela wok-skelim long ol kostim bilong prodaksen bilong ol smolholda na miling kampani. Mak bilong peiaut em ol i save kaunim olsem hap bilong indastri averes smolholda kostim bilong prodaksen long wanwan tan FFB (long fil i go long mil get) i go long bikpela indastri averes kostim bilong prodaksen (long fil i go long ol welpam prodak ol i salim na i redi long go long sip long sip-bris).* ⁵² ¶ Menesmen yet i tok, FFB fomula em i wanpela bikpela isiu bilong tokpait namel long ol smolholda na ol miling kampani. Fomula i save kisim glasim olgeta yia, na wanpela nupela glasim i kamap long 2001 em ol indipenden saveman aninit long Oro Smolholda Developmen Projek (1992-2001), we Wol Benk i givim mani long kamapim. Ol i save kaunim prais bilong FFB olgeta mun, na olgeta mil kampani i save bihainim. Fam-get prais ol i save peim i go long ol smolholda i kam long mil-get prais taim ol i rausim ol FFB trenspot kostim na ol arapela takis (Papua Niugini Welpam Risets Asosiesen lefi, OPIC levi, ol FFB trenspot kostim, na Sexava levi ^{53 54}).
43. Menesmen i tok wanbel olsem makim bilong FFB prais fomula i mas kisim tingting long olgeta stekholda na tok olsem praising fomula i mas kisim glasim aninit long Projek bikos i ken gat senis insait long indastri kostim straksa bihain long 2001 Riviui. Menesmen i ting dispela riviui i mas kamap long namel bilong 2010 na i ting em “...bai apdetim na senisim rot na tingting ol i yusim bilong makim ol prais na sea namel long ol smolholda na ol mil.” ⁵⁵ ¶
44. **Rot Mentenens Tras Fan (RMTF):** Menesmen i tok klia olsem “*RMTF em i wanpela rot bilong bungim mani bilong wok mentenens long ol smolholda ekses rot, bihainim ol kontribusen i kam long ol end-yusa bilong netwok, wantaim ol smolholda, ol miling kampani na ol Provinsal Gavman i makim jeneral populesen o lain pipel i yusim na kisim gupela halivim long ol ekses rot.*” ⁵⁶ ¶ Menesmen i bilip mobeta rot bai daunim o kostim bilong prodaksen bikos long trenspot kostim i daunbilo na i opim mobeta rot i go long kisim ol sosol sevis, na halivim long daunim pasin turangu. RMTF takis, olsem ol arapela takis, bai ol i rausim long ol smolholda. Menesmen i tok olsem — *Taim astingting bilong serim ol kostim bilong rot mentenens namel long ol Provinsal Gavman (50 pesen), ol miling kampani (25 pesen) na ol smolholda (25 pesen) i kamapim as bilong luksave i stap namel long dispela tripela lain na Gavman bilong PNG, ol arapela bikpela samting, olsem wok lukautim, mani menesmen na ol wok operesen bilong RMTF,*

em ol i tok em i wok bilong ol meri, tasol bikos ol meri no save kisim gut pe long en, ol i go moa long groim na salim kumu na ol gaden kaikai. Ol MLFS i save givim ol meri ol net bilong havestim frut na wanpela peimen kat ol i save kolim “mama kat” we i save rekodim olgeta kaikai ol i salim, na ol dinau bilong ol. Ol meri nau i gat narapela rot bilong kisim winmani aninit long MLFS. ⁵² Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 21, ¶ 61. ⁵³ Sexava Hopper em i wanpela binatang birua bilong welpam we ol i save daunim groa bilong en wantaim halivim i kam long ol mil kampani. ⁵⁴ Bekim bilong Menesmen, ¶63. ⁵⁵ Ibid, p. 22, ¶ 64. ⁵⁶ Ibid, Annex 1, p. 66.

*na level bilong smolholda rot levi, em ol i mas mekim yet na tokpait long en na kisim tokbel long en wantaim olgeta stekholda //.*⁵⁷

45. Menesmen i tok olsem "*maski ol smolholda bai peim moa mani long rot mentenens takis; ekonomik na mani wok glasim bilong SADP i soim olsem ol gutpela i kamap long mobeta rot bai winim olgeta apim bilong kostim.*"⁵⁸ Menesmen i tok tu olsem PAD i tok klia long ol bikpela astingting long ol RMTF, tasol disain bilong en i o pinis gut olsem insait long Fainensing Agrimen Skediul 1, we i sut long sapotim "*disain bilong ol Rot Mentenens Tras Fan.*"⁵⁹ Menesmen i tok gen olsem ol stia bilong RMTF em i no pinis gut yet, na "*level bilong smolholda rot takis*"⁶⁰ na laspela RMTF takis manimak bai ol i makim na tokwanbel long en long wanpela bikpela konsaltativ stadi taim rot mentenens wok i kirap. Menesmen i ting dispela wok stadi bai go het long namel bilong 2010.



Piksa 5: Welpam Blok wantaim ol bikpela diwai

46. **Fri na Klia Konsaltesen i Go Pastaim, na Bikpela Komyuniti Sapot (BCS):** Menesmen i bilip olsem "*...fri, klia konsaltesen i go pastaim i kamapim bikpela komyuniti sapot bilong Projek i bin kamap long taim bilong Projek wok-redi.*"⁶¹ Menesmen i tok olsem bikpela mak bilong ol pipel i sindaun insait long Projek eria em ol asples, bihainim polisi bilong Benk, na Gavman bilong Papua Niugini i karimaut wanpela Sosol Asesmen na ol arapela wok bilong inapim fri, klia konsaltesen i go pastaim we i painim bikpela komyuniti sapot long olgeta bikpela wok bilong Projek developmen. Sosol Asesmen, we i kamap aninit long stia bilong wanpela tim konsalten i save gut long Tok Pisin, i bin kirap long mun Jun 2006 na, long tingting bilong Menesmen, moa wok konsaltesen wantaim ol arapela stekholda i bin kamap insait long tripela Projek eria na long Pot Mosbi. Menesmen i tok olsem moa long 550 manmeri i bin givim tingting insait long ol fokas-grup toktok na wan-on-wan miting na olgeta i kisim toksave long Projek long stori (bihainim pasin bilong asples yet), we i nogat pepa long en. Menesmen i bilip olsem i bin gat, na i gat yet, strongpela sapot bilong Projek insait long Projek eria olsem ol i toksave long en insait

⁵⁷ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 30, ¶ 96. ⁵⁸ Ibid., p. 23, ¶ 66.. ⁵⁹ Ibid, Futnot 25, p. 8. ⁶⁰ Ibid., p. 30, ¶ 96. ⁶¹ Ibid, p. 23, ¶ 68.

insait long Sosol Asesmen na Benefisaris Asesmen. Maski Menesmen i bilip olsem ol kaikai bilong wok konsaltesen ol i raitim gut stori bilong ol, em i *“luksave olsem pepawok bilong wok konsaltesen insait long Sosol Asesmen i no klia inap, o i no pinis gut. O pepawok i mas tok klia moa long sampela ol hap bilong wok konsaltesen we i tok klia long wanem infomesen long Projek ol i givim, rot ol i givim dispela infomesen, na ol i makim ol ples na manmeri olsem wanem.”*⁶²

47. Moa yet, Menesmen i *“bilip strong olsem bikpela komyuniti sapot bilong Projek i stap insait long tripela eria o i groim welpam long en aninit long Projek na Projek disain i makim ol belwari bilong ol benefisari.”*⁶³ Menesmen i tingim olsem ol rikwaiamen aninit long OP 4.10 long *“bikpela komyuniti sapot”* na *“fri, tok klia konsaltesen i go pas ”* i *“no min olsem ol i kisim bikpela laik bilong olgeta tingting o long kamapim wanpela Benk porojek long kisim tok orait long olgeta wanwan manmeri o grup.”*⁶⁴

48. **Infomesen Disklosa:** Menesmen i tok olsem *“Sosol Asesmen, EA, na pepa wok bilong en i bin op long pablik”* long tok Inglis long Pot Mosbi long Papua Niugini Pablik Infomesen Senta (PIC) na long Washington long InfoShop bilong Wol Benk long Februari 22, 2007. Menesmen i bilip olsem autim bilong infomesen aninit long Projek i bin – *bihainim stret Polis bilong Benk long Disklosa o Tokaut long Infomesen.”*⁶⁵

49. **Stap bilong Projek i go longpela taim bihain:** Menesmen i tok-wanbel olsem longpela taim stap bilong projek em i bikpela samting, na rot mentenens dinau long gutpela FFB koleksen em i stap long as bilong lukim ol smolholda i tanim ol frut bilong ol i kamap kesmani na mobeta rot long kisim ol komyuniti sevis. Menesmen i autim bikpela wok bilong rot mentenens long wanpela ples i save kisim bikpela ren, na i bilip —*bikos i nogat gutpela institusenal arensmen bilong imejensi na wok mentenens bilong rot netwok ol smolholda welpam growa i save yusim, em i stap long as bilong sindaun i stap nau.”*⁶⁶ Moa yet, ol i kisim skul pinis long bipo Oro Projek (1992-2001), Menesmen i tok olsem *“maski progremim long mani bilong wok mentenens i go insait long ol provinsal baset i no min olsem dispela ol wok mentenens bai kamap. //”*⁶⁷ na i klia olsem i mas i gat ol menesmen rot i stap pastaim. Long lukluk bilong Menesmen, Projek i stretim dispela hevi wantaim ol RMTF, we em bai yusim aninit long ol astingting bilong serim ol kostim na wokbung long wok menesmen. Moa yet, kamapim bilong wanpela Rot Enjiniering Yunit aninit long Projek na opim bilong infrastraksa dipatmen bilong OPIC, long lukluk bilong Menesmen, bai rausim hevi bilong i nogat gutpela wok mentenens.

50. Menesmen i tok tu olsem *“Ol PNG manmeri i save peim takis i no peim 150 kilomita rot we i no bin pinis gut aninit long olupela Oro projek, olsem na ol bai no inap baim moa taim ol dispela rot i pinis.”*⁶⁸ Menesmen i tok, dispela em bikos 79% long ol mani ol makim bilong ol rurel rot, na 2% bilong mani ol i makim bilong ol bikpela rot, em ol i yusim tru.

⁶² Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 27. ¶ 83. ⁶³ Ibid., p. 31, ¶ 99. ⁶⁴ Ibid., p. 32, ¶ 101. ⁶⁵ Ibid., p. 33, ¶ 105. ⁶⁶ Ibid., p. 34, ¶ 110. ⁶⁷ Ibid. ⁶⁸ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 35, ¶ 113.

Na tu, sampela long ol rot Oro Smolholda Projek i bin givim mani long kamapim, em ol i yusim man ii kam long Ovasis Aid Progreem bilong Australia Gavman (AusAID) long stretim bek, na laspela 105 kilomita bai ol i stretim gen wantaim grent mani i kam long Papua Niugini Sastenabol Dvelopmen Progreem (PNGSDP) (75km) na ol IDA mani (30km).

51. Menesmen i tok olsem PAD i tok luksave olsem wokmak bilong OPIC i mas kisim wok strongim na mani i stap aninit long Projek long stretim dispela hevi. OPIC bai haiarim wanpela *"ekstensen konsalten"* long kamapim wanpela rot bilong wok wantaim ol smolholda bai ol i ken rausim ol banis long smolholda sindaun na wok-mak. Moa yet long en, *"mobeta smolholda prodaktiviti bai kontribut long longpela taim mani sindaun bilong OPIC //*⁶⁹ *olsem "wanpela bikpela apim mak long smolholda prodaksen bihainim ol mobeta rot, mobeta ekstensen sevis, infiling, na apim long mak bilong ol frut //*⁷⁰ *bai apim OPIC takis bilong K4/FFB (foa Kina long wanwan IMT FFB long wanwan fama).*
52. Moa yet, Menesmen i tok olsem OPIC i nogat polisi long givim luksave o mekimsave long ol wokman long planim ol nupela welpam blok na em i nogat iveluesen sistem bilong skelim ol wok-mak bilong ol wokman. Menesmen i bilip olsem wanpela rot tasol we i ken stap olsem taget, em wok bilong OPIC, bihainim ol namba, long lukim ol sidling (we ol i planim wanpela yia pastaim) i stap bilong ol smolholda husat i gat laik long planim ol.
53. **Ol Hevi long Busgraun:** Menesmen i tok olsem ol konsaltesen i kamap insait long ol Projek eria na long Pot Mosbi olsem hap bilong envairomen asesmen wok. Antap long ol smolholda, ol arapela sivil sosaiti lain na ol lokol gavman atoriti tu i bin givim tingting bilong ol. Tasol, *"Menesmen i luksave olsem ol askim bilong OP 4.01 i no kisim inap luksave, na infomesen i go aut long ol stekholda long taim bilong konsaltesen tasol bilong EA i bin kamap long maus tasol"*⁷¹ na moa konsaltesen bai kamap olsem hap bilong ol Projek wok bai kamap.
54. Menesmen i tok wanbel olsem *"i no bin gat inap stori insait long EA long sait bilong ol efluen o pipia bilong mil"*⁷² na *"antap long wok monitaring bilong miling kampani ISO 14001 na RPSO setifikesen, wanpela bikpela wok glasim long hevi moa efluen o pipia bilong mil bihainim ol Projek wok bai kamap."*⁷³ Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok klia olsem *"ISO 14001 em i wanpela intanesenel stendat bilong envairomen menesmen na wanpela fremwok bilong daunim lek-mak bilong kampani long busgraun."* Menesmen i tok klia moa olsem Rauntebol long Sastenabol Welpam (RSPO) *"em i wanpela wol kolisen bilong ol indastri, NGO, ol mani bisnis, envairomen na konsavesen grup, ol ritela na konsuma prodak kampani husat i kam bung bihain long 2004 long kamapim wanpela klia rot i go het long prodaksen na yusim bilong sastenabol welpam."*⁷⁴ Na maski Envairomen Asesmen (EA), Envairomen Menesmen Plen (EMP) na Envairomen na Sosol Menesmen Fremwok (ESMF)

⁶⁹ Ibid., ¶ 114. ⁷⁰ Ibid., futnot 62, p. 35. ⁷¹ Ibid., p. 28, ¶ 85. ⁷² Ibid., p. 36, ¶ 117. ⁷³ Ibid. ⁷⁴ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 7, ¶ 23.

i painim ol envairomen birua long Projek na stretpela na gutpela rot bilong slekim strong, bihainim Rikwes, Menesmen “*i tokwanbel olsem wanpela bikpela wok-skelim bilong moa wok prodaksen long ol welpam mil na ol efluen i mas kamap bihainim ol askim bilong OP/BP 4.01.*”⁷⁵

55. Long sait bilong ol Hai-Konsavesen Veliu Fores (HCVF), Menesmen i bilip “*disain bilong Projek i karamapim ol gutpela rot bilong daunim na skelim ol birua long rausim ol eria i gat ol bikpela lain diwai.*”⁷⁶ Moa yet, Menesmen i tok olsem “*nogat bikpela senis o daunim bilong ol bikpela fores eria o bikpela lain busgraun na wara i stap aninit long Projek.*”⁷⁷ Menesmen i tok olsem wok glasim i kamap pinis long Komponen 1 na 2 wantaim, na fores na wail-laip menesmen meping wok, bai banis agensim nogut envairomen hevi long ol diwai o long ol diwai i laik groa bek gen. Na tu, ol ekstensen opisa bilong OPIC i save long luksave long ol HCVF, tripela nupela Envairomen Opisa bai winim wok, na moa trening bai kamap aninit long Projek. Menesmen i bilip olsem bikos i nogat gutpela fores inventori o kaunim, em i no bagarapim BP 4.36 (Fores) olsem paragraph 4 bilong Polisi i sut long wanpela wok kaunim bilong ol bikpela fores eria na i no long wanpela fores inventori. Las tru, sapos i nogat welpam koud ov praktis, bai ol i mas bihainim Papua Niugini logging koud ov praktis na ol nesenel envairomen lo.⁷⁸
56. Menesmen i lukim sampela samting i no stret long tok klia bilong brukim wok namel long ol OPIC opisa i kamap ples klia long redim bilong Bekim bilong Menesmen, na dispela bai kisim stretim na luksave.
57. **Bekim bilong Menesmen na ol Wok bilong en:** Mski Menesmen i bilip olsem bikpela wok i go het long bihainim ol polisi na prosidia na ol rait o laik bilong ol Rikwesta i no kisim bagarap, em i givim luksave long sampela eria i mas kamap strong moa.⁷⁹ Ol dispela em ol tanim bilong ol bikpela Projek pepa i go long Tok Pisin, tanim bilong ol Projek pepa, na toktok i go kam long Projek long ol OPIC redio program; komisining bilong wanpela stadi long ol pipia bilong mil; luksave long pepa wok bilong sosol asesmen wok i ken gat moa tok klia na pinis gut; kodinetim gut name long ol graun na busgraun opisa long ol planim tok orait pepa; strongim rot bilong konsaltesen, moa yet bilong Komponen 2, disain bilong RMTF, rivi bilong FFB praising fomula; lukluk gen long ol provision insait long Rot Rikonstraksen Manuel, Envairomen Menesmen Plen, na Risetelmen Polisi Fremwok bikos IDA bai givim mani long sampela ol rot long Oro provins i no pinis, we bipo ol i bin kisim mani long Papua Niugini SDP; mekim ol gutpela provision bilong ol independen sosol na envairomen odit; na strongim ol rot bilong autim wari na hevi aninit long Projek.

⁷⁵ Ibid. ⁷⁶ Ibid., p. 7, ¶ 23. ⁷⁷ Ibid., p. 37, ¶ 124. ⁷⁸ Ibid., p. 38, ¶ 125. ⁷⁹ Ibid., pp. 39-41, ¶ 129-130.

F. Strong bilong Rikwes na Disisen bilong Bod

58. Olsem i sanap insait long namba wan Resolusen,⁸⁰ Panel i sekim sapos Rikwes bilong Inspeksen i napim ol mak i stap insait long Resolusen na 1999 Klarifikesen o Tok klia.⁸¹ Long mekim olsem, Panel i glasim gen Rikwes na Bekim bilong Menesmen na raun i go lukim Projek eria.
59. Panel Memba Eimi Watanabe, wantaim Deputy Eksekutiv Sekreteri Dilek Barlas na Operesens Opisa Mishka Zaman, i bin kam long Papua Niugini long Februari 16-20, 2010. Long taim bilong raun bilong ol, Panel tim i bung wantaim CELCOR, ol gavman opisal, ol wokman bilong Benk, na ol mausman bilong OPIC. Panel tim i bin raun i go long Popondetta insait long Oro provins, we ol Rikweta i stap, na i bung wantaim ol lain i sainim Rikwes bilong Inspeksen na ol arapela welpam smolholda. Panel tim i bungim tu wanpela mausman bilong lokol administresen long Popondetta, ol mausman bilong OPIC fil opis, na ol mausman bilong Popondetta Welpam Growas Asosiesen (POPGA). Panel tim i laik autim tok tenkyu bilong olgeta manmeri antap long givim ol tingting bilong ol, na senisim infomesen na tingting wantaim Panel.
60. Long Mas 10, 2010, Panel i givim Ripot na Rekomendesen bilong en⁸² long ol Eksekutiv Dairekta we Panel i givim rekomendesen long wanpela wok painim long ol samting i stap long Rikwes bilong Inspeksen.
61. Long Mas 25, 2010, Bod i tok oraitim, bikos i nogat tok bekim long en, rekomendesen bilong Panel long karimaut wanpela wok painim i go insait long ol sut tok insait long Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, Rikwes yet, Bekim bilong Menesmen, na Ripot bilong Panel na Rekomendesen i bin go aut long pablik sotpela taim bihain long Bod i givim tok orait long en.

G. Rot bilong Wok Painim na ol Bikpela Askim

62. Astingting bilong wok-painim em long sekim sapos Wol Benk i bihainim ol polisi na prosidia bilong em yet long disain, apresal, na karimaut bilong Projek, na sapos i gat taim we ol i no bihainim stret, na sapos dispela i kamapim, o i ken kamapim biruua long ol Rikwesta. Panel Memba Eimi Watanabe i go pas olsem Lid Inspekta long wok-painim bilong Panel.
63. Panel i mekim tupela-hap wok-painim. Namba wan hap em wanpela bikpela wok risets i go insait long ol Benk rekot long Projek, ol intaviu wantaim ol Benk wokman long Washington, D.C. na long Sidni, na wanpela glasim bilong ol pepa-wok. Namba tu hap em wanpela in-kantri painim tok tru raun. Long halivim wantaim wok-paiinim, Panel i kisim foapela saveman konsalten i gat nem long wol: em Dokta Donald Gilmour, husat i gat save long wok forestry; Profesa Lesley Potter, husat i save wok long humen jiografi na i gat bikpela save long wok risets long ol welpam smolholda; Bruce Carrad, wanpela ekonomis; na Dokta Paul Michael Taylor, wanpela antropolojis. (Lukim Annex 4 bilong Stori bilong ol saveman konsalten).

⁸⁰ Intanesenel Benk bilong Rikonstraksen na Developmen (IBRD), Resolusen Namba. IBRD 93-10, Septemba 22, 1993 (the —1993 Resolusen||).

⁸¹ Namba tu Rivi bilong Resolusen i Sanapim Inspeksen Panel (1999 Clarification).⁸² Inspeksen Panel Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, Papua Niugini – Smolholda Agrikalsa Developmen Projek, Ripot na Rekomendesen, Mas 10, 2010.

64. Panel Memba Eimi Watanabe, Operesens Opisa Mishka Zaman, na ol saveman konsalten⁸³ i bin raun i go long Papua Niugini long Oktoba 1-10, 2010. Long dispela raun, Panel tim i bungim ol Rikwesta, ol Gavman Atoriti, ol OPIC Opisal, Sif Eksektiv bilong Papua Niugini Welpam Risets Asosiesen (PNG OPRA), na ol wokman bilong Benk long Pot Mosbi na Sidni. Panel tim i raun i go long ol Projek eria long Wes Nu Briten na Oro provins na bung wantaim ol mausman bilong ol growa asosiesen, ol welpam mil kampani eksektiv, ol lokol gavman opisal, ol lokol wokman bilong OPIC, ol lokol NGO, na ol smolholda.
65. Insait long wok-painim bilong en, Panel i painim na glasim gut olgeta pepa-wok i sut long kes ol Rikwesta, ol Benk wokman, na ol arapela lain i givim long Panel. Panel i glasim gut ol evidens ol i kisim long ol fil raun lukluk o em i bungim long wok risets bilong en, wantaim tu ol akademik ripot.
66. Panel i laik luksave olsem maski Projek i karamapim tripela eria insait long tupela provins bilong Oro na WNB, wok-painim i lukluk tasol long Projek eria long Oro provins, bikos ol Rikwesta em ol lain Oro provins. Panel tim i bin raun i go long Hoskins Projek eria long WNB provins long kisim mobeta luksave long Projek, na i bungim olgeta samting em i lukim na tingting bilong en long ol samting i wankain na narakain long tupela Projek eria insait long dispela Ripot.
67. Na tu, wok-painim bilong Panel i no glasim ol isiu long ol LSS smolholda. Dispela em bikos ol VOP smolholda tasol i orait long mekim wok infiling aninit long Projek. Tasol, Panel i luksave wantaim belwari, ol hevi ol LSS smolholda i gat, bikos namba bilong ol pipel i groa, na i nogat inap graun i stap na i nogat gutpela luksave long wok bilong holim graun, olsem long tok klia insait long Sosol Asesmen.
68. **Ol operesenal polisi na prosidia bilong bihainim.** Long dispela Projek, Panel i sekim sapos Benk i bihainim ol dispela Operesenal Polisi na Prosidia:

OP 1.00 Poveti Ridaksen o daunim pasin turangu
OP/BP 4.01 Envairomen Asesmen
OP/BP 4.10 Indijines o Asples Pipel
OP/BP 4.36 Ol Fores o lain diwai
OP/BP 4.04 Ol Netseral Habitet
OP/BP 10.00 Dinau long wok invesmen
OP/BP 13.05 Projek Supavisin
OMS 2.20 Projek Apresal

⁸³ Dokta Taylor i no stap insait long ol raun i go long fil, na Mista Carrad i stap insait long hap bilong dispela raun tasol.

69. **Ol Bikpela Askim bilong Wok-Painim.** Olsem tok pastaim, lukluk bilong wok-painim bilong Panel em long sekim sapos Benk i bihainim stret olgeta polisi na prosidia bilong en long disain, apresal, na karimaut bilong Projek, na sapos ol i painim taim we ol i no bihainim stret, sapos ol i kamapim, o i ken kamapim birua o bagarap olsem ol Rikwesta i tok.
70. Bikos long taim bilong dispela Ripot, karimaut bilong ol SADP wok long graun i no bikpela, planti long ol birua ol Rikwesta i tok long en i sut long ol hevi bihainim smolholda welpam prodaksen long ol yia i go pinis, wantaim o i no wantaim Wol Benkm, na wari bilong ol Rikwesta olsem kain birua i ken kamap yet long SADP. Glasim bilong Panel long wok bihainim i lukluk moa long ol wok Menesmen i mekim long disain, apresal, na karimaut bilong Projek bihainim ol Wol Benk polisi na prosidia.
71. Ol Bikpela isiu bilong komplaiens o wok-bihainim na ol birua, ol i glasim moa insait long Sapta 3, 4, 5 na 6, i karamapim:
- ☐ **Infomesen Disklosa, Konsaltesen, na Komyuniti Sapot:** I bin gat fri, klia konsaltesen i go pastaim, na i kamap wantaim bikpela komyuniti sapot long ol asples welpam smolholda bilong Projek? Projek i givim ol sosol na ekonomik benefit we i bihainim kalsa na luksave long ol meri na ol lain tumbuna bilong bihain long ol asples welpam smolholda?
 - ☐ **Pasin Turangu na ol Hevi long Sindaun:** Projek, long disain na karimaut bilong en i bringim ol benefit i kam long ol welpam smolholda o nogat? Sapos laik bilong welpam i bin gutpela, Projek disain i gutpela, na i orait long lukim mobeta sindaun na laip bilong ol smolholda? Benk i bin karimaut gutpela wok-glasim long strong bilong kisim winmani na stap longtaim bilong welpam bilong ol smolholda o nogat? Disain bilong Projek i givim moa rot bilong ol smolholda long kisim winmani, bihainim Benk Polisi long Indijines Pipel?
 - ☐ **Ol Hevi long Busgraun:** Projek i bekim gut ol hevi long busgraun na givim ol rot bilong slekim? Ol rot bilong glasim busgraun biong welpam infiling wok i bihainim ol polisi na prosidia bilong Benk, o nogat?
 - ☐ **Stap Longtaim bilong ol Progreem:** Disain bilong Rot Mentenens Tras Fan, wantaim ol rot bilong kisim mani na wok, i strong inap long stap long-taim, i gutpela, na i bihainim ol Benk polisi na prosidia, o nogat? Menesmen i bin skelim gut wok na save-mak bilong karimaut ol wok bilong Projek, o nogat?

Sapta 2: Lukluk long Projek

A. Ovaviu

72. Dispela sapta i givim stori bilong tok-klia long sosol na envairomen banis polisi bilong Projek na bilong painim bilong Panel long wok-bihainim.
Plantu long sapta i tok-klia long jigografik, kalsarel, historik, na politikal sindaun bilong Projek insait long Papua Niugini.⁸⁴ Dispela i karamapim tu wanpela tok-makim bilong ol indijines komyuniti insait long ol Projek eria na ol pasin bilong ol long wok long graun, na provinsal na lokol gavanens, na ovaviu bilong welpam long developmen bilong Papua Niugini, na wanpela sotpela wok rivi bilong ol stori long senis long ol smolholda long wok-gaden i go long wok-mani. Sapta i pinis wantaim wanpela sotpela stori long ol Wol Benk welpam projek long kantri.

B. Ol Asples Pipel long Papua Niugini

73. Papua Niugini, wantaim populesen inap long 6.7 milian (2010 kaunim), i sindaun long graun inap long 462,840 skwea kilomita long isten sait (53%) bilong — bikples⁸⁵ ailan bilong Niugini na long ol ailan i stap klostu (em Nu Briten, Nu Ailan, na Bogenvil) bilong Saut Pasifik, not bilong Australia. Long wes, em i serim boda wantaim Indonesia, we ol noten Papua provins bilong en (bipo ol i kolim Irian Jaya) i sindaun long wesem 47% bilong ailan bilong Niugini na i bosim liklik hap-sait bilong bikpela hap bilong Indonesia.
74. Niugini rijen em i wanpela long tupela bikpela kalsa rijen long wol (wantaim Amazon besin), na makim, olsem, bihainim namba bilong ol tokples em i gat. Long 6,000 tokples long wol, wanpela stendat bilong kaunim ol tokples⁸⁶ i listim 841 indijines tok-ples i stap long Papua Niugini tasol (na 11-pela tu i stap long 2005 yet we nogat manmeri i save toktok moa na nau em i lus pinis).⁸⁷
75. Ol Asples pipel bilong Papua Niugini em i wanpela long ol namba wan kantri long wol i gat bikpela kain kalsa, we ol i makim bihainim namba bilong ol tokples na ol arapela kalsa na tumbuna pasin. Dispela em i kamap long longpela taim stap bilong en (moa long 60,000 yia pinis), na tu, long bikpela ples maunten bilong kantri, we i brukim ol pipel, sosol sindaun, na kalsa grup. Ol i bruk long tokples, kastom, na tumbuna pasin, sampela long ol komyuniti long Papua Niugini i go insait long lou-skel traibal kros-pait wantaim ol wansolwara bilong ol pastaim long wok i kamap long rausim

⁸⁴ Opisali nem bilong en Indipenden Stet bilong Papua Niugini. ⁸⁵ Taylor, Paul Michael 1996 —Irian Jaya The Land and its People. || pp. 28-33 in Konrad, G. and U. Konrad, eds., *Asmat: Myth and Ritual, the Inspiration of Art*. (Venezia: Erizzo). Koentjaraningrat (1991)

Irian Jaya: Membangun Masyarakat Majemuk (Jakarta: Djambaan). ⁸⁶ Ol namba i narakain liklik long namba bilong ol tokples i stap insait long Bekim bilong Menesmen na ol arapela hap, bikos boda-mak i brukim tupela han-tokples bilong wanpela bikpela tokples, agensim tupela tokples yet, i ken kisim narakain luksave.

⁸⁷ th

Ethnologue Raymond G. Gordon. Dallas: SIL International 15ed. 2005.

ol pasin-pait na kamapim wanpela moden stet sosaiti.⁸⁸ Brukim i kamap long ol bikpela ples maunten i bikpela tru na planti ol grup long hailans, inap nau tasol, i no save long ol lain nambis o sampela ol arapela hailans pipel yet.

76. Insait long wanpela stadi Wol Benk i mekim, politikal saintis Francis Fukuyama i raitim:

Bikpela arere-mak bilong bruk bilong kantri bihainim tokples em i samting olgeta lain i go long PNG i save lukim pastaim, na em i stap long as bilong asua long kisim strongpela wok-tingting na luksave long nesenel level. I no bikos sosaiti i bruk; ol sosol grup i strong tru na i save wok wantaim, mobeta long ol sosol straksa long ol arapela developmen kantri. Birua bilong modenaisesen i kilim ol tumbuna komyuniti straksa na i ronim planti milion pipel long ol ples i go long ovasis long ol ples long Latin Amerika na Afrika, i no strong tumas long Papua Niugini... Papua Niugini, em i wanpela long ol strongpela demokratik sosaiti long wol. Ol viles na ol arapela komyuniti i save kamapim wanbel bihainim longpela tok pait na tok-skelim. Lidasip – bihainim pasin bilong - bikman//— i kamap⁸⁹ long hatwok, na i no kisim nating. I mas kamap bihainim sampela taim, na i save oltaim gat salens na senis.

77. Tude, samting olsem 96% long olgeta manmeri em ol Kristen, wantaim olgeta bikpela sios i stap aninit long lukaut bilong ol asples pipel yet. Wanpela liklik hap (3.3%) bilong ol pipel i save bihainim yet ol asples bilip.⁹⁰

C. Ol Asples Komyuniti insait long ol Projek Eria

78. Projek i wok long go het insait long Talasea distrik bilong Wes Nu Briten provins na Ijivitari na Sohe distrik bilong Oro provins. Welpam infiling wok, aninit long Komponen 1 bilong Projek, i stap tasol long kesmen eria bilong tripela mil kampani – em Nu Briten Welpam Limitet na Hargy Welpam Limitet long Talasea distrik long Wes Nu Briten provins na Kula/Higaturu Welpam Developmen Limitet⁹¹ long Ijivitari na Sohe distrik insait long Oro provins. Ol Komyuniti developmen wok, aninit long Komponen 2 bilong Projek i ken stap long wanpela long ol 15 Lokol Level Gavman (LLGs) insait long tripela SADP Projek distrik, sapos ol i ken inapim olgeta askim.⁹²

⁸⁸ Dispela bungim tok bilong histori na populesen, em hap i kam long US Stet Dipatment, mun Ogus 10, 2011, Bekraun Nout long Papua Niugini. <http://www.state.gov/r/pa/ei/bgn/2797.htm>.

⁸⁹ Fukuyama, Francis. (2007) Gavanens Rifom long Papua Niugini. I kam long mun Julai, 2011 long: <http://unpan1.un.org/intradoc/groups/public/documents/un-dpadm/unpan044622.pdf>. p. 9-10. Man i raitim i tok olsem ol tingting em bilong em yet, na i no bilong Wol Benk.

⁹⁰ CIA. The World Factbook: Papua New Guinea. <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/pp.html>. Based on the 2000 census.

⁹¹ Higaturu Oil Palm Limited (HOP), em mil kampani i wok long Oro provins em New Britain Palm Oil Group i baim long Epril 2010 na givim nupela nem, Kula Palm Oil. Long dispela Ripot, mil kampani long Oro em Kula /Higaturu Oil Palm Limited.⁹² Bekim bilong Menesmen, ¶70 na Futnot 2; ol arapela klarifikesen i kam long Inspeksen Panel na i kisim long Menesmen long Ogus 3, 2011.

79. **Wantok na Pasin bilong Givim bek.** Maski ol asples kalsa bilong Papua Niugini i narakain tru, planti ol saveman⁹³ i makim sampela samting we i wankain long pasin tumbuna bilong planti ol komyuniti long Papua Niugini. Dispela em i karamapim ol agrikalsa sabsistens ekonomi i mekim wok; wanpela strongpela poroman wantaim graun; na bikpela luksave long kisim graun bihainim famili na hauslain, tasol wantaim bikpela luksave long wok bilong ol i mas bekim long ol arapela ol i pas wantaim, o ol arapela husat i wan-memba bilong wanpela lokol yunit.
80. Dispela pasin, long Tok Pisin/Melanesia Tok Pisin, ol i save kolim —*wantok*,|| we i stap tu insait long ol Projek pepa. Em i sut long sistem bilong bekim i stap insait long wanpela klen, famili, o viles, bihainim wanwan asples grup – em, husat i gat wankain tokples (—one talk||) na husat ol i gat sosol na ekonomik wok dinau. Olsem long arapela hap bilong Papua Niugini, *wantok* sistem i stap strong long ol Projek eria.
81. Sampela ol lain obseva i lukim *wantok* olsem wanpela tumbuna sosol sekyuriti sistem we i lukautim olgeta, taim ol arapela i lukim olsem wanpela rot i save pasim laik na strong bilong wanwan, bikos wanwan i mas serim gutpela em i gat wantaim ol *wantok* bilong en. Sampela i bilip olsem as-bilip na strong bilong *wantok* sistem i save wok gut long tumbuna Papua Niugini sosaiti, tasol em i ken kamap rot bilong paulim gutpela wok taim em i kam long sindaun bilong taun na wok-gavman, we i wok long kamap moa long Papua Niugini.
82. Moa yet, sampela ol obseva lain i gat gutpela luksave bilong *wantok*. Ol i lukim nesenel palamen bilong Papua Niugini olsem wanpela han bilong *wantok*, olsem Papua Niugini kantri em i wanpela ples we olgeta manmeri i ken halivim na kisim strong long ol yet.⁹⁴ Dispela luksave i narakain long wok bilong *wantok* insait long ol developmen pepa-wok, na ol dispela wantaim dispela Projek. Bekim bilong Menesmen, olsem, i luksave olsem hap bilong as long dispela —*paradox*|| o krangi sindaun bilong ol bikpela kes winmani na pasin turangu (we Menesmen i tok em i pasin bilong kantri) em i —*bikpela sosol na tumbuna wok askim long ol smolholda*|| long serim kes winmani ol i kisim wantaim ol *wantok*.⁹⁵ Francis Fukuyama, long wanpela pepa em i raitim bilong Wol Benk,⁹⁶ i tok olsem sosioekonomik modenaisesen bai no inap long daunim ol sosol straksa olsem *wantok* long bihain taim.⁹⁷ Fukuyama yet i tok olsem dispela i min olsem i mas i gat rot i stap we i ken poroanim gut ol sosol sistem, tasol wantaim longpela taim luksave long mekim ol i kam insait moa, i nogat wansait luksave, na i no stap aninit long stia bilong ol asples bikmanmeri.⁹⁸

⁹³ Lukim, olsem, Sillitoe, Paul (1998) *An Introduction to the Anthropology of Melanesia: Culture and Tradition* (Cambridge U. Press); Moore, Clive (2003) *New Guinea: Crossing Boundaries and History*. Honolulu: U. of Hawaii Press. ⁹⁴ Lukim tu, Waiko (1993), p. 15. ⁹⁵ Bekim bilong menesmen, ¶150. ⁹⁶ Fukuyama, Francis. (2007), *Obsavesen long Bildim ol Stet insait long Westen Pasifik*. Retrieved April, 2011 at: http://fukuyama.stanford.edu/files/working_papers/WP_State-Building.doc. Man i raitim i tok klia olsem ol tingting em i raitim em i tingting bilong em yet, na i no tingting bilong Wol Benk. ⁹⁷ Ibid., p. 16. ⁹⁸ Ibid., p. 19.

83. Sosol Asesmen i tok klia long ol wok askim bilong ol wanwan manmeri long ol *wantok* tasol em i luksave tu olsem ol pipel i gat gutpela luksave long ol rot bilong wok olsem long Bialla Growas Fan. Dispela Fan, i sanap long 2001,⁹⁹ i apim manimak bilong rausim long ol pemen i go long ol smolholda long ol welpam haves bilong ol, na i strongim ol long bungim mani long sait bilong ol kain wok olsem skul fi o haus.— *As bilong skim i kamap gut, em olsem wanpela komponen bilong winmani ol smolholda i kisim, i stap ausait long ol askim bilong kisim kwik, na ol hevi ol wantok i givim long tilim winmani bihainim pasin tumbuna. Long ol growa yet, em i pasim rot bilong ol long inapim dispela askim long tilim ol winmani bilong ol namel long ol wantok, bikos em i lok i stap insait long ol spesol pepes akaun we i tambu long rausim bilong ol arapela wok.*¹⁰⁰
84. Ol tumbuna pasin insait long pasin *wantok* i gat arere bilong en, na Bialla Growas Fan em i luk olsem em i (stap insait long dispela wanpela grup insait long dispela hap bilong Wes Nu Briten provins) wanpela gutpela piksa bilong we wanpela samting olsem kesmani (we ol i klasifaim insait long kategori bilong samting/aset we i mas tilim bihainim askim) i senis long kamap wanpela arapela tumbuna klas bilong samting/aset – em, kain olsem (ol famili tumbuna bilas bilong givim long ol pikinini long famili long ol bikpela de) we ol arapela i no inap long askim long kisim nating.
85. Ol Asples rot bilong mekim disisen (wantaim tu ol klen), we i narakain moa namel long ol Papua Niugini asples grup, pastaim long Papua Niugini i kisim indipendens, na long olgeta eria, pasin bilong mekim disisen bihainim ol klen o ples i go het yet. Ol kain rot bilong mekim disisen olsem long Oro provins i gat stori bilong ol rot bilong mekim disisen bilong ol Binandere (wanpela tokples grup we antropolojis Ira Bashkow i toke m i wanpela long ol sabgrup bilong Orokaiva, na tokples bilong ol i klostu long ol Orokaiva tokples spika bilong Oro provins; lukim daunbilo).¹⁰¹ Dispela ol stori, em —*arapa*|| o viles/famili yunit we ol pipel i save givim luksave na bihainim, i gat wankain nem olsem viles spes we ol *arapa* memba i kam bung wantaim long mekim ol komyuniti disisen.¹⁰² (Lukim Boks 1 bilong ol toktok long dispela.)

Boks 1: Straksa o rot ol Binandere i save mekim Komyuniti Disisen

Ol Binandere pipel [insait long Popondetta eria] i lukim ol yet olsem ol i sindaun insait long wanpela famili na namel long ol liklik grup we ol i gat strongpela pasin pren pinis...Ol asples bilong Binandere em i anka long arapa bilong ol haus, we ol i bikpela, na we ol i tingim oltaim long bihain taim.

Arapa [eria namel long Haus Man na Haus Meri long wanpela ples] em i wanpela ples we ol man na meri i save bung long paitim tok long ol bikpela hevi. Ol bikpela kaikai na bikpela tumbuna pasin i save kamap insait long dispela eria., we ol i save kisim ol sponsa, amamasim ol, na kaikai, na we tilim bilong mit bilong pik na kumu i save kamap. Long taim bilong kros-pait, ol i save sindaun long arapa na givim toktok. Ol disisen i save kamap hia bihain long ol 'bikman' i mekim toktok bilong ol

⁹⁹ Sosol Asesmen, p. 58. ¹⁰⁰ Ibid, p. 58. ¹⁰¹ Ol Orokaiva na Binandere tokples em ol Trans-Niugini phylum tokples, tupela wantaim i stap insait long —Proper Binanderean|| sabgrup bilong Binandere long isten grup bilong —Bikpela Seksen || long ol Trans-Niugini tokples (lukim *Ethnologue* (Raymond G. Gordon, editor), Dallas: SIL International 15th ed., 2005, p. 593). ¹⁰² See *A Short History of Papua New Guinea*, Professor John Dademo Waiko, 1995.

Olgeta tokpait long marit na braid prais i save kamap tu long arapa, wantaim senis bilong braid prais. Bihain long nait, tupela bikman bai bung na toktok long pasin posin. Tude, ol ples komiti i save yusim arapa long tok-paitim wok bilong komyuniti na ol hevi long wok bisnis.

Wanpela bikpela hanmak bilong komyuniti em long pasin we ol toktok i kamap, ol disisen i kamap, na ol rekomendesen i go het. Arapa em i ples bilong gat ol praivet toktok, na pablik tok-pait na bungim tok-wanbel long gutpela bilong olgeta i sindaun harim. Disisen we ol i bung wantaim na mekim, i ken bungim olgeta i stap na harim, inap disisen i go het. Sapos i nogat wanbel i kamap, orait, dispela forum i stap long moa tok-pait i ken go het.

Sapos gavman i no halivim, sistem bilong Binandere i save strongim bikpela luksave long pasin bekim namel long ol pipel. Pasin bilong sore na wokbung i mas kamap pas insait long famili, bihainim stap bilong arapa, na bihain i go aut long viles, klen, na long hauslain.

Ol pasin pren i ken groa i go bikpela long nuklia famili bihainim ol famili lain long karampim olgeta han bilong famili insait long sata o lo bilong arapa, na rot we ol kandidat i ken salim askim bilong ol long ileksen olsem wanpela memba bilong wanpela kaunsol, wanpela provinsal, o nesenel gavman. Dispela, long planti rot, i orait long tingting long palamen olsem wanpela nesenel arapa.

I kam long: Waiko, John (1993), pp. 13, 14, 15

86. Long 100,000 manmeri bilong Oro provins, namba wan bikpela asples grup – ol Orokaiva¹⁰³ inap olsem 60,000. Planti long ol Rikwesta em bilong dispela grup. Orokaiva i save long planti tokples, na bikpela, wantaim 35,000 manmeri i save toktok, em ol i kolim Orokaiva tu.¹⁰⁴ Nem —Orokaiva|| em ol i bin yusim namba wan taim long ol kolonial opisa husat i bin raun sekim eria long let 1800 na eli 1900.¹⁰⁵ (Lukim Boks 2 long moa stori long ol Orokaiva.)

Boks 2: Ol Orokaiva

—Ol Orokaiva i save long planti tokples bilong non-Austronesian Binandere tokples famili. Bikpela bilong ol, i gat samting olsem 35,000 spika bilong en, na nem bilong en i Orokaiva; ol arapela em wanples bilong en Notu, Hunjara, Aeka, na Binandere.// I kam long: Bashkow, 2006, p. 27.

—Ol tokples saveman i save brukim tokples Binandere famili i go long 14 ol tokples, we olgeta yet i save stap long Oro Provins...//

I kam long: Bashkow, 2006, p. 263, footnote. 2.

—Ol Stadi i stap, i no makim _ol Orokaiva' olsem wanpela grup i wankain olsem ol arapela, tasol ol i tokmakim ol bikpela samting i narakain namel long ol lokol komyuniti long stori bilong sosol ogenaisen, rot bilong bihainim, kaikai, ol ats na tumbuna save. [...] Long wankain taim, i gat ol bikpela samting i wankain long sait bilong morality na kalsa isnait long olgeta hap bilong ol Orokaiva. Ol Orokaiva komyuniti i gat wanpela kain ol samting i narakain long ol pasin kalsa bilong Melanesia, olsem luksave bilong senis givim long komyuniti, spirit bilong _eklektisim' na _opotunisim' [...], sindaun bilong lidasip na wok lukautim graun, sabsistens ekonomi i sanap long wok agrikalsa, na bikpela luksave long manmeri.//

¹⁰³ Bashkow, Ira. *The Meaning of Whitemen: Race and Modernity in the Orokaiva Cultural World*, 2006 (Chicago: University of Chicago Press), esp. p. 27 and Chapter 2, Footnote 1. ¹⁰⁴ Ibid., p.27. ¹⁰⁵ B4Ibid., pp.29-32.

I kam long: Bashkow, 2006, pp.31-32

—Insait long Orokaiva rijen, wanpela bikpela lukluk long komyuniti laip em groim taro, wanpela rop kaikai i save groa long ol gaden na i gat bikpela sosol, ritual, na spiritual mining. Wantaim pik na ol arapela gaden kaikai, taro em i wanpela bikpela kaikai bilong senis. Pipel i save groim gaden kaikai bilong ol yet (na i ken yusim ol lain diwai samting bilong ol long bildim ol haus) i min olsem long wok, ol i save kisim gutpela kaikai long kes ekonomi, na bihain, wanwan hauslain i save go bek gen long en. I kam long: Bashkow, 2006, p. 32. Long skelim wantaim ol arapela asples pipel, ol Orokaiva i strong moa long holim ol tumbuna pasin bilong ol, na tumbuna ekonomi, tasol nau ol i strong moa long komoditi kes-krop wok, wanpela wok i kirap bihainim laik bilong pipel long kisim mani na groim bilong wanpela nupela developmen projek bilong groim welpam we Wol Benk i givim mani long en//.

I kam long: Bashkow, 2006, p.2.

87. **Ol Asples Grup long ol Projek Eria.** Kaunim bilong Panel long ol asples grup insait long ol Projek eria i stap long Tebol 1; na infomesen i kam long Benefisaris Asesmen¹⁰⁶ na Envairomen Asesmen.¹⁰⁷

Tebol 1: Ol Klen, na Tokples Grup insait long ol Projek Eria

Projek Eria (provins)	Klen/Ples Grup	Tokples Grup	Benefisaris Asesmen	Envairomen Asesmen
Oro	Orokaivans	Orokaiva	Orokaiva i gat planti dailek o pikinini tokples.	
Wes Nu Briten, Hoskins eria	Bakovi	Bola	I karamapim bikpela hap bilong Talasea Peninsula saut long Bula tokples eria na is bilong Gaungo Viles.	13,746 spika insait long Talasea Distrik.
		Bula	I sindaun long noten sait bilong Talasea Penenisula.	
	Nakani	Bebeli	I sindaun long eria namel long Gaungu VOP na Hoskins long Is.	1,050 spika insait long Talasea Distrik.
		Nakanai	I go aut long Hoskins i go long Is abrusim Bialla.	13,000 spika insait long Hoskins Distrik.
Wes Nu Briten, Bialla eria	Aigon	Aigon	I sindaun long ol maun long saut bilong Bebeli tokples grup.	
	Kol	Kol	Insait long ol maunten long Is bilong projek eria wantaim Meramera na Mengens long noten na westen boda yet; klostu olgeta teritori na westen boda; klostu olgeta graun bilong Is Nu Briten.	

¹⁰⁶ Koczberski, G., and Curry, G.N. Benefisaris Asesmen Ripot bilong Smolholda Agrikalsa Developmen Projek (SADP), Papua Niugini, 2007.

¹⁰⁷ Tebol i bihainim Projek dokumen we i givim infomesen long sindaun bilong grup na bikpela bilong populesen. Bikos Sosol Asesemen i no stori long ol dispela hauslain o tokples, em i no stap olsem wanpela sos dokumen long hia.

	Mamusi	Mamusi	Sindaun long ol maunten long saut bilong sentral Nakanai na i go long saut kos; planti long graun bilong ol i stap long ENB.	
	Manseng/ Mangseng	Manseng/ Mangseng	Sindaun long ol maun eria saut bilong sentral Nakanai; planti hap long graun bilong ol i stap long ENB.	2,500 spika long Bialla Distrik (nambis).
	Mengen	Mengen	Sindaun long graun long is lusim Bialla long go raunim Navo na i go olgeta long saut kos.	
	Meramera	Meramera	I go aut liklik long Ulamona Viles long hapsait bilong boda i go long ENB.	2,000 spika long Bialla Distrik (nambis).
	Pele Ata	Pele Ata	I sindaun long ples-maunten long saut bilong isten Nakanai.	1,900 spika long Bialla Distrik (long bus).

88. Benefisaris Asesmen i tok ol asples pipel insait long Projek eria long Oro provins, we ol Rikwesta i stap, olsem —*wanpela bikpela kalsarel na etnik grup ol i kolim — ol Orokaivans* // (tok strongim long orijinal). Ol Orokaiva i bihainim papa na wanwan klen na sab-klen i save bihainim lain bilong em i go long wanpela bikpela tumbuna. Benefisaris Asesmen i tok tu olsem i nogat —*bikpela kalsarel, etnik, o risos pait namel long ol Orokaiva hauslain o klen, na ol pipel i strong bihainim long stap olsem wanpela _Orokaivan.* ||¹⁰⁸
89. Kalsarel bungim bilong ol indijines pipel long WNB Provins i planti moa long Oro provins, we Benefisaris Asesmen i tok olsem — *maski wanwan samting i narakain long pasin bilong wok gaden na ol agrikalsa sistem bilong ol kain kain kalsarel na tokples grup, ol i gat wankain sosol na kalsarel sistem.*"¹⁰⁹ Insait long tupela provins wantaim, Benefisaris Asesmen i tok olsem — *indijines kalsarel na tokples grup i wankain long sait bilong kalsa, sosol ogenaísesen na ol sistem bilong wok long graun.* ||¹¹⁰ (Dispela ripot bai karamapim isiu bilong — sampela samting i wankain long olgeta || long Sapta 3.)
90. Wanwan long ol kalsarel grup i gat tokples bilong en yet,¹¹¹ maski planti manmeri i klia long Tok Pisin na Inglis, moa yet long ol lain i skul (literasi o save long rit na rait i sanap long 24% long Tok Pisin, na 36% long Inglis insait long Oro provins, na 44% na 33% insait long WNB provins).¹¹²

¹⁰⁸ Beneficiaries Assessment, p. 8. ¹⁰⁹ Ibid., p. 9. ¹¹⁰ Ibid., p. 8.

¹¹¹ Olsem antap Bashkow (2006) i yusim —Orokaiva|| long makim wanpela bikpela grup wantaim klostu wankain ol kalsa olsem ol pipel i gat wanpela tokples bilong Binandere famili, we wanpela tasol em i —Orokaiva|| tokples; na narapela ol rot olsem Ethnologue (Gordon, 2005) i yusim toktok long makim ol spika bilong Orokaiva tokples.

¹¹² Ol pesentes i bihainim ol literasi ret insait long Envairomen Asesmen (p. 42) na populesen namba i stap bihainim ol 2000 sensus namba.

91. Moa long ol kalsarel grup insait long Tebol 1, ol bikpela namba ol wairaman bilong ol ples we namba bilong ol manmeri i go antap olgeta, olsem Hailans, Sepik, Morobe, na Gazelle Peninsula, nau i stap insait long dispela tupela provins. Ol i kisim ol dispela grup i kam long groim welpam aninit long bipo Wol Benk projek na ol arapela kes-krop, dispela i givim moa narakain luksave long ol pipel i sindaun long hap. WNB i gat bikpela namba ol wairaman, wantaim 22,000 long ol i kam long ol arapela hap bilong kantri. Bikpela namba mak bilong olgeta manmeri nau i sanap long 184,000.¹¹³

D. Wok-graun insait long ol Projek Eria

92. Ol Projek pepa i toktok long pasin bilong komyuniti i lukautim graun insait long ol Projek eria. Dispela i tok-makim pasin-pren namel long ol fama, husat i yusim ol rait o tok orait (sampela taim ol i save senis wantaim ol arapela famili memba) long wok na haves o rausim frut long wanpela hap graun, na ol lain famili grup i holim graun (olsem klen i bosim Orokaiva o Binandere, antap), we i holim graun bihainim tumbuna pasin.
93. Olsem Papua Niugini Welpam Riset Asosiesen (OPRA) i luksave, —*kastomari graun, em i graun i stap aninit long lukaut bilong komyuniti bihainim pasin tumbuna na famili lain olsem ol wan-pisin, ol klen, o sab-klen. Kamap bilong ol komoditi krop olsem welpam i kamap wantaim ol senis long kastomari wok-graun.*||¹¹⁴ Dispela Nout go het long tok klia olsem — *kastomari wok-graun long Papua Niugini i bihainim tupela lain astingting. Namba wan, wanwan papabilong graun na graun i bihainim lain famili i no bin gat bikpela luksave bikos klostu olgeta graun i stap wantaim ol papagraun grup, moa yet ol lain famili olsem ol klen na sab-klen || na —namba tu hap astingting em long sait bilong bihainim pasin bilong kastomari lukaut bilong graun. Ol rait long holim graun em i save senis long bihainim sosio-politikal, demografik sindaun, na sindaun bilong busgraun.*||¹¹⁵
94. Ol asbilip bilong kastomari lukaut bilong graun bilong wok gaden i senis long karamapim ol kes-krop aninit long lukaut bilong wanwan manmeri longpela taim moa bilong ol wok gaden, we i gat sotpela taim gaden na longpela taim senis-gaden.
95. Sosol Asesmen¹¹⁶ i tok olsem ol bikpela wok lukautim graun we smolholda wok welpam i bihainim long Papua Niugini em:
- ☐ Agrikalsarel Stet lis-hold graun long ol Len Setelmen Skim (LSS);
 - ☐ Viles Welpam (VOP) holdings long kastomari graun namel long ol bikpela na liklik klen;
 - ☐ Wok Lukautim na Senisim blok; and
 - ☐ Kastomari Peses Blok (CPBs) long kastomari graun.

¹¹³ UNRISD, *Ethnic Structure, Inequality and Governance of the Public Sector in Papua New Guinea*, Ray Anere, 2004. ¹¹⁴ The OPRative Word, Technical Note 17, August 2010, PNG OPRA. ¹¹⁵ The OPRative Word, 2010. ¹¹⁶ Sosol Asesmen, p. 7.

96. Ol kain kain rot bilong bosim graun, bihainim Sosol Asesmen, em ol bikpela samting long luksave long en, bikos ol i ken — sampela taim, senisim wok-mak bilong ol smolholda, pasin bilong palnim bek na infiling, ol mak bilong invesmen o wok bisnis i go insait long strongim fam na ol arapela samting, ol rot bilong welpam prodaksen bilong ol smolholda, rot ol smolholda i save bihainim long stretim sindaun bilong ol, na sindaun o laip bilong ol smolholda famili.¹¹⁷
97. Wok graun sistem insait long ol Projek eria bilong Hoskins, Bialla, na Popondetta i gat kain kain ol asples kastomari graun na graun bilong gavman, we ol graun bilong gavman, em ol i kisim pastaim long Papua Niugini i kisim independens. Ol welpam estet na ol graun setelmen skim i sindaun long graun bilong gavman, na ol viles welpam blok (VOP) i sindaun long sampela hap bbilong kastomari graun bilong ol kain kain asples klen na sab-klen.
98. Sosol Asesemen i tok olsem ol VOP wok-planim long Popondetta i groa bikpela tru long pinis bilong 1990s, aninit long bipo Oro welpam projek, wantaim 74% bilong olgeta smolholda eria em ol i plantim wantaim welpam bilong ples.¹¹⁸
99. Welpam ol i groim long graun bilong ples, em i bihainim olgeta loan a sistem bilong kastomari lo na pasin bilong lukautim graun. Ol Klen agrimen o tok-wanbel long planim bilong wanwan welpam holdings em ol informal sosol kontrak o i bihainim wanpela Klen Yusim Graun Agrimen (CLUA). Wanpela CLUA em i wanpela tok-wanbel namel long wanpela klen an wanpela manmeri we i givim luksave long rait bilong dispela manmeri, aninit long lo na kastom, long plantim welpam long graun. Rot bilong go insait long welpam i min olsem ol papagraun grup i nogat ol fida rot long graun bilong ol i mas sanap long gutpela bel na luksave bilong ol arapela papagraun grup (klen o sab-klen) long gat rot i go long graun bilong wok welpam. Rot netwok em i wanpela bikpela rot bilong kisim winmani bilong ol kain kain papagraun grup i stap long ol ples.
100. Bekim bilong Menesmen i luksave olsem Oro provins i gat longpela histori bilong kros-pait long graun.¹¹⁹ Sosol Asesmen i tok olsem —...*ol asples [Orokaivan] papagraun i save oltaim tokim ol LLS lis-holda olsem stap bilong ol i no gutpela*// na —Oro bilong Oro// kempen long 1990, em ol i mekim long rausim ol wairaman fama long lusim graun bilong ol.¹²⁰ Sosol Asesmen i luksave olsem —...*birua namel long ol kastomari papagraun an ol wairaman bilong ol arapela provins i senis i go kamap pait namel long ol kastomari papagraun na ol wairaman bilong ol arapela hap bilong Oro Provins. Dispela kain senis long sindaun bilong ol Popondetta wairaman i save pasim ol long mekim longpela taim wok-kontrak long ol blok bilong ol, na sampela ol LLS growa i tok ol i no wanbel long go het long planim gen. Ol i wari olsem wok-planim bek, na groim bilong ol blok bilong ol bai pulim kros bilong ol asples papagraun i go long ol. Long bungim tok, Oro-bilong-Oro pasin i strong yet long Popondetta, na olsem, ol LSS growa i no strong long wok –planim gen, na dispela i mekim planti LSS growa i lusim wol planim, na mekim ol arapela longpela taim wok bisnis long ol blok bilong ol, o sanapim ol liklik bisnis. Moa yet, sampela ol LSS growa i tok olsem ol i no kisim inap haves long FFB long taim bilong gutpela groim welpam bikos ol i ting ol kastomari papagraun bai askim mani long ol.*//¹²¹

¹¹⁷ Sosol Asesmen, p. 7. ¹¹⁸ Sosol Asesmen, p. 14. ¹¹⁹ Bekim bilong Menesmen p. 26, ¶ 81. ¹²⁰ Sosol Asesmen, p. 11. ¹²¹ Sosol Asesmen, p. 11.

E. Provinsal na Lokol Level Gavanens

101. Papua Niugini i gat tripela level bilong gavman – nesenel, provinsal na lokol. Ol Benk pepa na intaviu wantaim ol wokman i soim klia olsem rekot bilong ol provinsal gavman i no gutpela long menesmen ol developmen projek. PAD i luksave olsem —*bikpela lokol gavanens envairomen i go het long bihainim liklik mak akauntabiliti bilong ol pablik opis i go long ol komyuniti, nogat inap klia wok pasin long yusim bilong pablik mani, liklik mak bilong pablik rot i go long kisim infomesen (moa long yusim na skelim bilong pablik mani), na paulim mani bilong yusim ol yet (korapsen) o long skelim mani i go long ol arapela wok i no kisim luksave (elit holimpas).*¹²²
102. Bihainim indipendens bilong Papua Niugini long 1975, ol bikpela polisi senis i kamap olsem disentralaisesen o brukim pawa, wantaim kamap bilong 19 Provinsal Gavman (long 1976), we i givim ol pawa moa long ol lokol kaunsol. Ol dispela i senis na kamap olsem ol Lokol Level Gavman (LLG), bihainim moa wok bilong brukim pawa long wok gavman. 1995 Ogenik Lo long Provinsal na Lokol Level Gavman (LLGs) i kisim strong long traim strongim wok-sevis long lokol level.

F. Wok bilong Welpam long Developmen bilong Papua Niugini

1. Dispela welpam, *Elaeis guineensis*, i bin kamap namba wan taim long Noten Distrik bilong Papua Niugini (nau Oro provins) long samting olsem 1923, taim ol i planim sampela liklik blok klostu long Popondetta. Kaikai bilong en i gutpela bikos sid i no strong long groa long ol ples tais. Long 1966, ol wok traim i kirap long 12-pela ples ol i makim, na wantaim ol luksave long wok planim i stap pinis, ol i kamapim wok welpam risets. Dispela em nainpela yia pastaim long sanapim bilong Indipenden Stet bilong Papua Niugini long 1975.¹²³
2. Komesal welpam developmen i bin kirap long 1976 klostu long Hoskins wantaim sanapim bilong Nu Briten Welpam Developmen Limitet (NBPOL), wanpela join vensa bisnis namel long Gavman na Harrisons and Crosfield (Australian and New Zealand) Limited.
3. Developmen bilong welpam em i wanpela bikpela wok bilong Gavman long inapim ol rurel developmen wokmak bilong en: long lukautim groa bilong dispela developmen, long opim moa rot bilong ol Papua Niugini manmeri long kisim winmani, long opim wok agrikalsa, na long apim mak bilong ol winmani i kam long ol ekspot. Dispela i kamap taim ol i kamapim ol nuklius estet skim (NES) tingting. NES i save kamapim ol smolholda eria bihainim ol estet, long opim moa wok na givim gutpela sindaun bilong ol wairaman i kam long ol arapela hap bilong kantri husat i nogat rot long kisim gutpela graun bilong wok agrikalsa.

¹²² PAD, p. 23, ¶ 17. ¹²³ Asian Development Bank, 1991. Smallholder Oil Palm Productivity Study. Main Report. ADB TA 790 PNG, p. 16.

106. Wol Benk yet i bin kamapim NES tingting, wantaim halivim bilong Gavman bilong Papua Niugini. Insait long fopela ten krismas, wok welpam long Papua Niugini ekonomi i bin op long karamapim faivpela NES welpam skim – klostu long Hoskins na Bialla long Wes Nu Briten provins, klostu long Popondetta long Oro Provins, long Gurney na Sagari long Milen Be provins, na long Kavieng long Nu Ailan provins. Namel long dispela taim, Papua Niugini gavman i bin mekim wok long tupela sait wantaim bilong dispela NES wokbung. Em i kamap seholda long kampani, wantaim ol sea bilong em i sanap long 50% onasip. Em i bosim wok bilong reguleta bilong ol wok kampani i mekim, we em i was long komplaiens o wok bihainim ol envairomen stendat na i mekim rivi long ol prais na pe i go long ol smolholda. Gavman i givim tu ol sevis long ol smolholda, olsem ekstensen sevis, dinau, na ol subsidi bilong wok prodaksen – na em i karimaut komyuniti developmen wok long ol NES skim taim em i givim infrastraksa olsem rot, ol helt sevis, edukesen na polis. Bikpela polisi bilong Gavman, em i sut yet long ol smolholda, na wok bilong ol estet insait long ol NES projek, em long givim wok-pasin bilong tude, wantaim wok miling, maketing, na sapotim menesmen.
107. Projek Apresal Dokumen (PAD) bilong SADP i tok olsem, long 2007, — *agrikalsa sekta long PNG, maski em i no mekim gut wok, i stap long as bilong sindaun gut bilong pipel, na em i stap bikpela samting long developmen na rausim pasin turangu.*¹²⁴ Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok olsem Wol Benk i lukim welpam olsem namba wan rot bilong strongim sindaun long ol rurel ples taim em i kirapim wok long en gen long kantri long 2005.¹²⁵

Bokis 3: Welpam insait long Ekonomi bilong Papua Niugini

— Welpam indastri bilong PNG, taim em i makim wan pesen tasol bilong wol prodaksen, i save givim bikpela halivim long rural winmani long kantri. Long prais tude, welpam i save givim ol smolholda wantaim planti gutpela bekim long graun na hatwok bilong ol. (K2,793/ha na K130/de wok), we ol arapela kes-krop olsem kakao (K1,136/ha na K21/de wok) na kofi (K2,058/ha na K13/de wok). Indastri em i namba tu long pablik sevis, long sait bilong givim fomal wok, wantaim samting olsem 16,000 pipel i wok bilong siksipela miling kampani. Klostu 18,500 smolholda i save saplaim ol mil wantaim frut. Wel bilong welpam i kamap bikpela kontributa long agrikalsa foren eksens winmani bilong PNG, we i makim 43.2 pesen bilong olgeta agrikalsa ekspot veliu long 2008.||

I kam long: Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. vi.

G. Sindaun bilong ol Smolholda na Senis long Wok Gaden Ekonomi i go long Kes Ekonomi

1. Senis long wok gaden ekonomi i go long wanpela maket ekonomi em i wanpela long ol bikpela developmen salens bilong kantri, na em i bikpela luksave bilong SADP.
2. Sampela man-luksave i bilip olsem wok agrikalsa i save holim kesmani ekonomi bilong Papua Niugini. Ol i tok olsem maski prodaksen na salim bilong ol kes-krop em i wanpela bikpela rot bilong kisim winmani long nesenel na hauslain level, ol kes-krop i noken senisim wok-gaden o sabsistens sekta.¹²⁶

¹²⁴ PAD, p. 18. ¹²⁵ Wok bilong Wok Benk long PNG em ol i saspenim long 2003, bihainim kanselim bilong Fores Konsavesen Projek. Olgeta wokbung i bin kirap gen long 2005.

Em bikos sabsistens wok agrikalsa i save kamapim bikpela mak kaikai long kantri – *samting olsem 83 pesen bilong kaikai enoji na 73 pesen bilong abus*||.¹²⁷ Tru tumas, dispela tok —*sabsistens afluens*// i bin kamap long 1960s long tok-makim sistem bilong prodaksen insait long Melanesia komyuniti we ol askim bilong wok kastom i save kamap long ol liklik hap wok bilong graun na hatwok.¹²⁸

110. Kantri Asistens Strateji bilong Wol Benk (2008-11)¹²⁹ long Papua Niugini i tok ekonomi em i —*haili dualistik, o nupela wok ekonomi na wok-gaden ekonomi i wok strong*// wantaim wanpela —*fomal sekta i lukluk moa long ol bikpela wok ekspot bilong ol netseral risoses, na wanpela infomal sekta i sanap strong long sabsistens na hap-sabsistens wok-gaden long bikpela moa namba manmeri long ples*.|| 85 pesen bilong olgeta manmeri long kantri i stap long ples, na i save sindaun long wok agrikalsa na ol arapela infomal wok long strongim sindaun.¹³⁰

1. I gat kain kain luksave long kamap bilong ol fama long wanpela senis lusim wok-gaden ekonomi na i go kamap wanpela kesmani ekonomi. Ol dispela senis em Lawrence Grossman (1984) i tok-makim, i bihainim wok glasim bilong en long Hailans rijen long 1980s, na i stap strong yet long ol Projek eria. Stadi¹³¹ i painim olsem ol fama i groim ol kes-krop bilong ekspotim, i no save lukim bikpela senis long sindaun bilong ol. Grossman i makim sampela piksa long ol hevi o birua i save kamap long wok developmen, we i tok olsem — *hevi long busgraun, sabsistens na sosol pasin pren – olgeta samting i stap insait long rural prodaksen sistem – i ken pait na kamap birua*.||¹³² Luksave olsem hevi long busgraun (we i save kamap long wok kliarim graun, planim wanpela kain krop tasol, o yusim masin bilong mekim wok long graun, na tu, yusim ol marasin bilong kilim binatang o bilong strongim groa bilong krop) i gat bikpela tok-luksave pinis, ol stadi pepa bilong en i bihainim ol hevi long komyuniti i kamap long —*pait namel long sabsistens na kes-krop wok*// long viles level.¹³³
2. Namba wan eria bilong kisim birua we Grossman i tok-makim, em brukim bilong ol pasin tumbuna long wok gaden na moa sindaun na luksave i go long wanpela maket we i no strong tumas. Em i luksave olsem:

We graun i sot, ol komesal wok i ken daunim mak bilong wok-gaden. Kes-krop wok i wok stilim graun bilong wok-gaden, na i ken bagarapim ol manmeri long ples long kain kain we. Taim ol i go insait long komesal wok, ol rurel produsa i stap nau long han bilong ol komoditi prais long ol nesenel na intanesenel maket. Long wankain taim, ol wok bisnis i no save luksave long ol, wantaim ret bilong inflesen o aprim prais bilong ol kaikai i kam long ausait long kantri i antap moa long prais bilong ol praimer prodak ol i salim ... Moa yet, sapos moa komoditi prodaksen i save kamapim moa kes-winmani, i nogat strongpela bilip olsem helt bilong ol pipel bai strong moa, bikos ol stua kaikai we ol i save baim, we i save pulap long suga, i no strong olsem ol

¹²⁶ Bourke, R. Michael and Harwood, Tracy (eds). Food and Agriculture in Papua New Guinea, ANU E Press, 2009, p. vii. ¹²⁷ Ibid, p. 6. ¹²⁸ Jones, Luke Trebor and McGavin, P.A. Labour Resources Utilization in Melanesia, Asia Pacific Printers, 1997. ¹²⁹ Country Assistance Strategy for Papua New Guinea for the Period 2008-2011, November 20, 2007, Report No. 41571-PG, p. 1. ¹³⁰ Management Response, p. 2, ¶ 9. ¹³¹ Grossman, Lawrence S. Peasants, subsistence ecology, and development in the highlands of Papua New Guinea, Princeton University Press, 1984. ¹³² Grossman (1984), p. 8. ¹³³ Ibid.

- gaden kaikai ol i senisim. (Nietshmann 1973; Dewey 1981).*¹³⁴
113. Ol arapela tu i tok strongim dispela tingting, na tok olsem planti smolholda —*i save bungim planti banis long mu vi go long wanpela komesal wok prodaksen we i save kamapim ol agrikalsarel prodak we i inapim ol maket rikwaiamen o askim.*// Dispela, long tingting bilong ol, em bikos —*Ol pasin bilong komyuniti, pasin jeles, bruk long pasin poroman, na ol askim bilong ples i save sotim taim bilong ol long apim mak bilong prodaksen na laik bilong kisim moa winmani i no save wankain long olgeta grup. Rot long inap gutpela graun bilong wok agrikalsa na teknikal save, na rot bilong salim samting em ol arapela hevi i save daunim rot long ol arapela agrikalsa wokmani. Bungim olgeta dispela, na ol i kamapim kain kain sindaun insait long agrikalsa sekta. Sampela manmeri na grup i soim bikpela savemak long bekim ol nupela salens na rot bilong kisim winmani; planti long ol i no save abrus.*//¹³⁵
114. Ol arapela i no wanbel na i bilip olsem —*wokmani i kamap long stap insait long kes ekonomi (maski ol i wok olsem ol praimeri produsa long wanpela kain tropikal kes-krop) i ken lukim mobeta kaikai sindaun long ol lain i gat kesmani. Kesmani i ken kamap wanpela banis agensim ol sot long gaden kaikai long taim bilong drai, fros o ais, na ol arapela birua bilong mama graun.*//¹³⁶
115. Wok kesmani i kam long kain kain rot i ken banisim ol smolholda agensim moa wok resis namel long ol manmeri we namba bilong ol i wok long go antap tasol. Wanpela stadi i painim olsem, —*groa bilong populesen we i nogat slo-daun bilong en, taim i nogat groa long rot bilong kisim winmani, i ken kamapim moa birua long komyuniti, sapos groa long namba bilong pipel i kamapim ol pait namel long ol kastomari papagraun na ol wairaman. Tasol sapos wanpela bikpela ekonomik bes i kamap na i mekim nupela winmani rot bihainim groa long namba bilong pipel, bai nogat hevi long sindaun bilong komyuniti.*//¹³⁷
116. Olgeta sindaun antap – long senis long wanpela sabsistens ekonomi i go long wanpela i strong moa long kes-krop – i stap long ol Orokaiva tu. Moa long ol rot we pasin pren o sindaun long komyuniti i ken bagarap (olsem long tok klia antap), senis i go long groim kes-krop i ken sotim graun bilong groim gaden kaikai bilong hauslain na lokol maket. Moa yet, hevi long nogat rot long groim taro, em i bikpela samting. Bashkow i raitim olsem —*ol Orokaiva em ol pipel i sindaun long graun na long pasin bilong groim taro*// na dispela em i wanpela —*strongpela na bikpela pasin insait long kalsalrel laip bilong ol Orokaiva.*//¹³⁸

¹³⁴ Grossman (1984), p. 8-9. ¹³⁵ Bob McKillop, R. Michael Bourke and Valentine Kambori, Policy Making in Agriculture in Policy Making and Implementation: Studies from Papua New Guinea, May, R.J. (ed), 2009, E Press, p. 71. ¹³⁶ Heywood, Peter F. and Hide, Robin L. Nutritional effects of export-crop production in Papua New Guinea: A review of the evidence. ¹³⁷ Koczberski, G. & G. Curry. (2003, May). Sustaining Production and Livelihoods Among Oil Palm Smallholders: A socioeconomic study of the Bialla smallholder sector. Curtin University of Technology. p. 101. ¹³⁸ Bashkow (2006), p. 182.

117. Pasin bilong lusim sabsistens agrikalsa na i go long wok kes-krop prodaksen i wok kamap long Oro na Wes Nu Briten long sampela yia pinis. Na welpam (wantaim kopra, kofi, kakau, na raba i nogat moa luksave) em i wanpela bikpela krop i kamapim dispela senis. Wanpela bikpela hap bilong senis long sabsistens i go long maket ekonomi long Papua Niugini, em olsem welpam wok ekspensen o groa long 1990s i bin kamap taim — *...Papua Niugini gavman i wok long strongim - yusa peim// sistem bilong givim ol sevis olsem helt na edukesen*|| na — *Long tok klia moa, ol jeneral populesen i nidim kesmani long sindaun, na welpam em i namba wan bikpela rot bilong kisim kes-winmani oltaim, long Popondetta Plen.*||¹³⁹
118. Bashkow, husat i mekim fil-wok long Agenehambo viles long Oro long 1990s, i tok-makim dispela senis i kamap long ol welpam projek Wok Benk i givim mani long kamapim, olsem:
 — *...kesmani em i save bringim i go insait long lokol ekonomi i wok strongim sindaun bilong ol Orokaiva long ples. Bikos dispela projek i stap, ol Orokaiva bai no inap lusim ol viles bilong ol long kisim mani, olsem planti ol arapela Papua Niugini viles... gutpela kamap bilong (welpam) moa long ol arapela bikpela developmen skim we ol i traim long rijen (olsem kofi, kakau, na lukautim bulmakau) i bin lukim projek i go bikpela moa long namel bilong 1990s we i dabolim graun i go long wok welpam...olgeta hap nupela graun we ol smolholda i planim long en, em kastomari graun, na planti em ol lain gaden graun bilong ol, we i stap klostu long ol ples. Opim bilong projek i bin pulim rot netwok tu, na i bringim wok planim welpam i go long plantu nupela hap bilong Orokaiva kantri, olsem ol nupela eria raunim Agenehambo. Nau welpam i karamapim bikpela hap bilong ol graun bilong ol lain Agenehambo, na olgeta gutpela graun bilong gaden we i stap klostu long ol rot...Birua bilong opim welpam indastri i save givim bikpela hevi long graun we i stap pinis bihainim groa bilong populesen na yusim graun bilong groim ol arapela, kes-krop olsem kofi na kakau, we i no save bagarapim busgraun tumas. Pasin bilong rausim bikpela hap graun long wok-gaden sistem i lukim sotim bilong taim we wok-gaden senis wok i save sindaun malolo...Taim ol i gat rot bilong go insait long welpam projek, ol Orokaiva manmeri i no inap long peim ol bikpela hap mani projek i save peim ol smolholda olsem dinau bilong paim ol tuls, sidling, na arapela samting, na ol i painim tok promis bilong kisim winmani oltaim, em i wanpela bikpela samting long ol...Birua long graun bilong ol Orokaiva na laip sindaun bilong ole m i bikpela hevi long sindaun bilong laip bilong Orokaiva kalsa. Moa bikpela senis long graun bilong gaden i go long planim welpam bai bagarapim tru laip na sindaun bilong ol Orokaiva pipel...*||¹⁴⁰
119. Sindaun Bashkow i stori long en long sait bilong pait namel long graun bilong wok-gaden (we em i bikpela wok strongim kaikai sekyuriti na kalsa) na graun bilong welpam (we i mas stap bilong wok insait long bikpela nesenel ekonomi) i mas stap long luksave long bekgraun stori bilong dispela Rikwes o askim.

¹³⁹ Tom Diwai Vigus (2001) Environmental impact review of current project and recommendations for consideration in any future development. Study of Oro Smallholder Oil Palm Development Project (Ln. 3485-PNG), p. 39. ¹⁴⁰ Bashkow (2006), pp.237-39.

H. Histori bilong Benk insait long Welpam Sekta bilong Papua Niugini

1. Wol Benk i wok namba wan wantaim Papua Niugini long 1963¹⁴¹ taim Australia gavman i askim Benk long redim wanpela developmen polisi bilong samting em i kolim 'Territory of Papua and New Guinea'.¹⁴²
2. Pastaim long SADP, Wol Benk i bin givim halivim mani bilong foapela welpam projek long Papua Niugini (Tebol 2)

Tebol 2: Ol Wol Benk Welpam Projek long Papua Niugini

Nem bilong Projek	Laip bilong Projek	Projek Manimak
Nu Briten Smolholda Developmen Projek	1969-73 (Namba 1 hap) 1970-76 (Namba 2 hap)	\$ 3.35 milion (Namba 1 hap) \$ 4.95 milion (Namba 2 hap)
Popondetta Smolholda Welpam Developmen Projek	1976-84	\$ 18.5 milion
Nuklius Estet na Smolholda (Milen Be) Projek	1985-92	\$ 68.3 milion
Oro Smolholda Welpam Developmen Projek	1992-2001	\$ 36.3 milion

1. Namba wan long ol dispela projek, Nu Briten Smolholda Developmen Projek.¹⁴³ i gat gutpela hap implimentesen. Namba 1 hap i lukluk long sindaun bilong ol famili insait long wanpela eria bilong groim welpam na givim infrastraksa long sapotim ol smolholda.¹⁴⁴ Namba 2 hap bilong projek i lukluk long groa long namba bilong ol pipel i stap long ol setelmen long groim wok welpam na bildim wanpela sip-bris bilong opim rot bilong eksportim ol welpam na kenel na ol arapela samting.¹⁴⁵
2. Ol bikpela skul Benk i kisim long dispela tupela hap projek em ol i mas glasim gut ol developmen long ol mil, wankain olsem ol developmen long ol fam na sindaun long wanpela busples bilong mekim ol nuklius estet diwai krop projek i ken gutpela sapos em i bihainim developmen bilong estet tupela yia bihain.¹⁴⁶

¹⁴¹ —Current Economic Position and Prospects for the Territory of Papua and New Guinea,|| World Bank, Report No. AS129, August, 1967, p. ii. ¹⁴² —The Economic Development of the Territory of Papua and New Guinea,|| Report of a Mission Organized by the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development at the Request of the Government of the Commonwealth of Australia World Bank, Report No. 11153, 1965. ¹⁴³ Management, Bank. "Bekim bilong Menesmen long Rikwes bilong Inspeksen Panel Rivi long Papua Niugini.

Smolholda Agrikalsa Developmen Projek (IDA 43740-PNG)." p. 5. 2010. ¹⁴⁴ IBRD/IDA. "Papua Niugini Briten Smolholda Developmen Porjek Staf Apresal Ripot."

1968, p. 5,6. ¹⁴⁵ Indipenden Iveluesen Grup. Papua Niugini – Nu Briten Smolholda Developmen Grup.

<http://wbln1023.worldbank.org/oed/oeddoclib.nsf/DocUNIDViewForJavaSearch/059702>

890693E71852567F5005B930D?opendocument. ¹⁴⁶ IBRD/IDA. Ol hailait bilong "Papua Niugini Nu Briten Smolholda Developmen Staf Apresal Ripot."

124. Namba tu long ol dispela projek em Popondetta Smolholda Welpam Dvelopmen Projek. Dispela projek, wankain olsem Nu Briten Smolholda Dvelopmen Projek, i traim long sanapim wanpela smolholda setelmen bilong welpam prodaksen long Popondetta insait long Noten Provins bilong Papua Niugini, long sanapim wanpela welpam faktori kampani long prosesim ol smolholda na nuklius estet prodaksen, na long apgredim ol infrastraksa sevis inap long stendat bilong gavman long ol rurel eria.¹⁴⁷
125. Maski i gat luksav olsem projek i kamap gut, ol nupela na olupela wairaman na pleslain i no bin kisim gutpela luksave long yusim ol welpam blok bilong ol, bikos karim bilong ol diwai i no kamap gut. I bin gat luksave olsem i mas i gat moa ekstensen wok long ol nupela smolholda projek long inapim daunim mak bilong hatwok taim ol i wok bilong inapim ol komyuniti wok long ples. Em nau, ol karim mak bilong ol pleslain i ken go antap, na hebi wantaim ol wairaman i go daun, na i bungim wantaim dispela ol kain kain grup pipel.¹⁴⁸
1. Popondetta Smolholda Welpam Dvelopmen Projek i soim olsem diwai krop prodaksen i ken kamap gut na mekim gutpela winmani sapos i gat gutpela menesmen na sapos i kam long ol gutpela praivet o komesal kampani.¹⁴⁹ Dispela gutpela kamap i bin bihainim ol komesal bisnis olsem Higaturu Oil Palm Plantation Company (HOP) we Gavman na British Commonwealth Development Corporation (CDC) i sanapim.
2. Namba tri long ol dispela projek em Milen Be projek, we i bin gat wankain luksave. Aswok bilong en em long apim mak bilong ol enual ekspot bilong kakau na wel bilong pam na kenel taim em i kamapim ol welpam na kakau nuklius estet plantesen, ol smolholda welpam blok, na ol ples bilong prosesim ol. Projek i bin lukim konstraksen bilong ol haus na bris, na agredim wok long infrastraksa insait long ol projek eria.
3. Maski projek i bin inapim planti long ol aswok bilong en, ol prais bilong wel bilong pam na kenel i no bin kamap; na ol prais i bin pundaun nogut tru. Dispela i min olsem maski dispela welpam projek i bin gat gutpela teknikal luksave, projek i bin bungim bikipela mani hevi bikos em i gat bikipela moa dinaw winim winmani em i mekim, we i kamap bilong ol bikipela komoditi prais luksave.¹⁵⁰
4. Namba foa long ol dispela projek, em Oro Smolholda Welpam Dvelopmen Projek. Namel long ol bipo Wol Benk welpam projek, dipsela em i wankain moa olsem SADP, na mobeta luksave i mas kam long ol skul bilong en. Oro Smolholda Welpam Dvelopmen Projek i bin lukluk long apim mak bilong agrikalsa prodaksen na ekspot, mekim moa wok, na kamapim moa winmani bilong ol turangu lain fama, holim strong winmani i go long ol smolholda i wok pinis, na kisim sapot aninit long ol bipo smolholda welpam projek bilong Benk, na banisim busples bilong Kwin Aledxandra Birdwing Bataflai (QABB).

¹⁴⁷ Projects Department East Asia and Pacific Region. "Papua New Guinea: Appraisal of the Popondetta Smallholder Oil Palm Development Project." i. 1976. ¹⁴⁸ Operations Evaluation Department. "Project Performance Audit Report Papua New Guinea Popondetta

Smallholder Oil Palm Development Project." 29. 1987. ¹⁴⁹ Ibid., p. 8. ¹⁵⁰ Agriculture Operations Division Country Department III East Asia and Pacific Regional Office. "Project Completion Report Papua New Guinea Nucleus Estate and Smallholder (Milne Bay) Project." 1993. p.21.

130. Projek wok i karamapim: plantim welpam long tupela eria bilong Oro provins; strongim ol ekstensen sevis; bildim na lukautim ol agrikalsarel rot na sosol infrastraksa; apgredim na strongim ol nesenel rot seksen; givim banis long liklik namba bataflai spisis na busgraun em i stap long en; strongim mak bilong Dipatmen bilong Agrikalsa na Laipstok long kamapim polisi na redim ol projek insait long diwai-krop sabsekta; menesmen bilong Welpam Industri Koporesen (OPIC); na mekim welpam risets.
131. Maski projek i inapim olgeta bikpela aswok bilong en, ol pundaun bilong projek i karamapim: ekkses rot infrastraksa wok bilong en, we i no bin wok strong na i kaikaim nating moa long 50% long projek manimak; bikpela rot konstraksen, we i no kamap long laip bilong projek; planim bek welpam insait long eria bilong bipo Popondetta welpam skim; na pundaun bilong en long inapim wanpela gutpela menesmen infomesen sistem.
132. Implimentesen Komplisen Ripot (ICR) i tok strong olsem taim em i sanap, mentenens long ol ekkses rot netwok i mas kamap sapos em i laik strongim ekonomik welpam prodaksen. ICR i tok olsem, lukluk i go bek gen, moa luksave i bin inap go long dispela wok bilong projek. Maski bikpela luksave long mentenens bilong olgeta welpam invesmen (long agrikalsa developmen, ol sevis, na rot netwok), taim kapitel mani bilong wok i bin kamap, Gavman i no skelim mani long en insait long baset.
Mentenens em i wok bilong ol provinsal gavman, tasol mani ol i givim, i no inap n a makim bilong rot mentenens wok i no kamap. Tai mi nogat skelmani i kam long provinsal gavman, OPIC kam insait na mekim imejensi wok mentenens wantaim mani bilong ol yet. Tasol arere mak bilong dispela projek i min olsem long taim nogut, wok mentenens i no kamap, na bikpela hap bilong rot i bagarap olgeta.¹⁵¹
133. **Redim bilong Smolholda Agrikalsa Developmen Projek (SADP).** Long Bekim bilong Menesmen, redim bilong wanpela nupela projek long Oro i sapos long kamap long kirap bilong 2003. Taim ol teknikal raun i bin kamap na sampela ol stadi i go het, ol projek wok i bin stop long taim ol i saspenim narapela projek. Bihain long ol 2005 Wol Benk Enual Miting, Gavman bilong Papua Niugini i bin wanbel long opisal kirap gen bilong Projek wok redi. Projek i kisim tok orait bilong Wol Benk Bod long Desemba 2007 na ol i sainim Kredit long Julai 2008.
134. Long Novemba 2007, Oro provins i bagarap long saiklon Guba, we i bagarapim ol bikpela infrastraksa na kamapim bikpela bagarap long welpam sekta. Bihainim askim bilong nesenel na provinsal gavman, em nau, senis i kamap long Projek long halivim proivns i karimaut ol bikpela imejensi wok stretim long ol rot. Dispela i lukim ol Projek lonsim woksop i bin kamap long mun Mas 2009 tasol, sampela etpela yia bihain long pinis bilong bipo projek long Oro.

¹⁵¹ Implementation Completion Report: Papua New Guinea Oro Smallholder Oil Palm Development Project, 2002. p. 11.

Sapta 3: Tokaut long Infomesen, Konsaltesen, na Bikpela Komyuniti Sapot:

A. Tok i go pas

135. Dispela sapta i glasim klem bilong ol Rikwesta olsem Menesmen i no bin toktok gut wantaim ol klemen na ol arapela komyuniti na Projek infomesen i no go aut long olgeta hap pastaim long Projek i kisim tok orait, na dispela i pasim ol long givim moa tingting long Projek. Klem bilong ol Rikwesta na Bekim bilong Menesmen long en i stap pastaim. Bihain, tingting bilong Panel long ol birua ol Rikwesta i tok long en. Sapta i pinis wantaim glasim bilong Panel long Menesmen i bihainim ol Wol Benk operesen polisi na prosidia, em OP 4.10 (Indijines Pipels) na OP 4.01 (Envairomen Asesmen), o nogat.

B. Ol Klem bilong ol Riwesta.

136. Ol Rikwesta i tok olsem *"Wol Benk na projek sponsa i no toktok wantaim ol klemen na ol arapela lokol komyuniti"* na sapos i bin i gat konsaltesen i kamap, em i *"liklik tru"* na *"i no givim rot long moa tingting na toktok."*¹⁵² Moa long en *"[p]rojek infomesen i no go aut gut pastaim long projek tok orait i kamap na nau yet i nogat, na i no kam long ol arapela tokples moa. Em i kam long Inglis tasol."*¹⁵³ Pasin bilong i no givim inap infomesen na konsaltesen insait long Projek eria pastaim long Projek i kisim tok orait, em ol Rikwesta i tok olsem *"wanpela long ol namba wan bikpela wari bilong ol,"* na *"i nogat klia rekot bilong konsaltesen i askim sapos i gat bikpela komyuniti sapot o nogat"* bilong Projek. Ol Rikwesta i kolim OP 4.10 na tok olsem maski ol em ol Indijines o Asples Pipel na ol kastomari papagraun, Wol Benk i no givim ol sans long givim tingting long *"skop o wokmak, astinging na ol wok "* bilong Projek, o paitim tok wantaim ol long *"moa rot takis ol bai mas peim "* aninit long Projek. Ol i bilip ol konsaltesen i ken kamapim ol proposal o tok askim long moa rot bilong kisim winmani, na tok paitim dispela *"yusa fi."*
137. Ol Rikwesta i kolim tu OP 4.01¹⁵⁴ long tok klia long klem bilong ol olsem ol konsaltesen i no inap. Ol i tok olsem *—...long gutpela konsaltesen i kamap namel long OPIC na ol smolholda, bihainim askim aninit long OP 4.01 Envairomen Asesmen polisi, ol smolholda i mas kisim olgeta infomesen pastaim long konsaltesen i kamap, insait long "wanpela tokples" we i "klia na isi long kisim". Dispela i no kamap. Ol smolholda i no kisim wanpela samting, long tok Inglis o arapela tokples, na ol i no kisim infomesen long tok klia long maus tu. Olsem na, i nogat gutpela wok konsaltesen i kamap, bihainim askim bilong OP 4.01.*//¹⁵⁵

¹⁵² Askim long Inspeksen, pp. 6-7. ¹⁵³ Ibid., p. 2. ¹⁵⁴ OP 4.01, ¶ 15. ¹⁵⁵ Askim long Inspeksen, p. 14.



Piksa 6: Panel tim i toktok wantaim ol plesmanmeri long Hoskins

C. Bekim bilong Menesmen

138. Menesmen i bilip "...fri na gutpela konsaltesen i go pas i kamapim bikpela komyuniti sapot bilong Projek i bin kamap long taim bilong wok redi long Projek..¹⁵⁶ Menesmen yet i tok olsem bikpela hap lain manmeri i sindaun insait long Porjek eria em bilong wanpela lain tasol. Bihainim Benk polisi, Gavman bilong Papua Niugini i bin karimaut wanpela Sosol Asesmen na ol arapela wok bilong inapim fri, gutpela konsaltesen i go pastaim bilong kisim bikpela komyuniti sapot long olgeta bikpela wok bilong Projek developmen. Menesmen i tok moa long 550 manmeri i bin givim tingting insait long ol fokas grup toktok na wan-on-wan miting, we bihaihnim pasin tumbuna, olgeta lain i kisim toksave long Projek, long toktok long maus, na i nogat pepa wok i stap long soim dispela.
139. Bekim bilong Menesmen i luksave tu olsem long dispela Projek, konsaltesen wantaim olgeta bikpela komyuniti i no bin kamap, na i tok olsem —*bungim long toktok long olgeta komyuniti i no bin inap kamap*//. Tasol bikpela wok konsaltesen i bin kamap wantaim ol komyuniti memba na ol ogenaísesen i makim planti luksave bilong komyuniti, olsem ol sios grup, ol NGO na ol komyuniti-bes ogenaísesen insait long ol projek eria.¹⁵⁷ Menesmen i tok olsem as long ol i toktok wantaim ol sios em bikos em i save wok wantaim ol yut na meri.¹⁵⁸ Moa long ol dispela fomal ogenaísesen, ol i toktok tu long ol infomal komyuniti na viles grup.¹⁵⁹
140. Maski Menesmen i bilip olsem ol painimaut bilong konsaltesen i kamap gut, Menesmen i "*luksave olsem pepawok bilong wok konsaltesen rot insait long Sosol Asesmen i no bin klia na pinis gut. Ol pepa wok i mas tok klia moa long sampela ol hap bilong wok konsaltesen long wanem infomesen i stap long Projek, rot dispela infomesen i go aut, na rot ol i makim ol ples na manmeri long kisim*

¹⁵⁶ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 23, ¶ 68. ¹⁵⁷ Bekim bilong Menesmen p. 24, Sosol Asesmen, p. 72. ¹⁵⁸ Sosol Asesmen, p. 73. ¹⁵⁹ Ibid., p. 75.

dispela ol infomesen.||¹⁶⁰

141. Long sait bilong ol envairomen hevi, OP 4.01, Menesmen i tok olsem —*planti konsaltesen*||¹⁶¹ i kamap olsem hap bilong Envairomen Asesmen, stat long taim bilong rivi bilong Oro Smolholda Developmen Projek long 2001.¹⁶² Menesmen i tok moa olsem “*EA i go het wantaim wanpela bikpela tok askim bilong wanpela pablik miting long Pot Mosbi, na bihainim dispela, i gat ol fil visit na miting (wantaim ol smolholda na mausman bilong ol growas asosiesen) insait long tupela SADP provins long Julai 2006*|| (Tok klia i stap long orijinal).¹⁶³ Menesmen i tok moa olsem ol konsaltesen bilong EA i bin kamap long Tok Pisin.¹⁶⁴ Bekim bilong Menesmen i pinis wantaim toktok olsem —*Menesmen i luksave olsem ol rikwaiamen o askim bilong OP 4.01 ol i no inapim, bikos wanpela infomesen tasol i go aut long ol stekholda em long taim bilong konsaltesen long EA, na em long toktok tasol.*||¹⁶⁵ Tasol, maski long ol dispela hevi, Menesmen i bilip olsem —...*Ol rait o laik bilong ol Rikwesta i no kisim bagarap long i Benk i no karimaut ol polisi na prosidia bilong en.*||¹⁶⁶
142. Moa yet, Menesmen “*i bilip strong olsem bikpela komyuniti sapot bilong Projek i stap yet insait long tripela eria bilong groim welpam i stap aninit long Porjek na Projek disain i soim ol wari bilong ol benefisari.*||¹⁶⁷ Menesmen i luksave tu long ol askim bilong OP 4.10 long sait bilong “*bikpela komyuniti sapot*” na “*fri na gutpela konsaltesen i go pastaim*” i “*no nidim bikpela mak bilong tingting o em i no wanpela kondisen long Benk bilong kisim tok orait long olgeta wanwan manmeri na grup.*||¹⁶⁸
143. Taim ol Rikwesta i autim ol wari bilong ol, long ol i nogat sans long givim tingting long Projek disain, Bekim bilong Menesmen em —*Disain bilong Projek i kamap bihainim longpela taim wok bilong Benk wantaim welpam sekta na i bungim ol skul ol i kisim long ol bipo projek, na moa yet, long Oro Smolholda Welpam Developmen Projek, we i bin pas long 2001.*||¹⁶⁹
144. Menesmen i tok olsem “*Sosol Asesmen, EA, na ol arapela pepa-wok i bin go aut gut long pablik*” long tok Inglis long Pot Mosbi long Papua Niugini Infomesen Senta (PIC) na long Washington long Wok Benk InfoStua long Februari 22, 2007. Menesmen i bilip olsem autim bilong ol infomesen aninit long Projek i “*bihainim stret Polisi bilong Benk long Tokaut long Infomesen.*||¹⁷⁰

¹⁶⁰ Social Assessment., p. 27, ¶ 83. ¹⁶¹ Management Response, p. 29, ¶ 90. ¹⁶² Ibid., p. 27, ¶ 84. ¹⁶³ Ibid., p. 27, ¶ 85. ¹⁶⁴ Ibid., p. 28, ¶ 85. ¹⁶⁵ Ibid. ¹⁶⁶ Ibid, p. 40, ¶ 129. ¹⁶⁷ Ibid., p. 31, ¶ 99. ¹⁶⁸ Ibid., p. 32, ¶ 101. ¹⁶⁹ Ibid., p. 8, ¶ 26. ¹⁷⁰ Ibid, p. 33, ¶ 105.

D. Luksave bilong Panel long ol Birua Rikwes o Askim i sut long en

145. Panel i luksave olsem pepa wok bilong Menesmen i no toktok long konsaltesen long wan wan komyuniti bilong ol asples pipel, o lidasip bilong ol, maski ol Papua Niugini manmeri i save makim ol yet bihainim klen, famili o hauslain.
146. Sapta 2 i luksave olsem Oro em i wanpela provins we planti manmeri i save tok Inglis, we 48,493 (36%) i save long tok Inglis na 32,023 (24%) i save long Tok Pisin, tasol Wes Nu Briten em i wanpela provins we planti i save long Tok Pisin, wantaim 80,946 (44%) i save long Tok Pisin na 61,007 (33%) i save long Inglis.¹⁷¹ Panel tim i kisim toksave olsem planti pipel husat i ken ritim Tok Pisin i ken ritim Inglis tu; olsem na bikpela hap bilong ol dispela lain i klia long tupela tokples wantaim. Tasol dispela i lusim bikpela namba long tupela provins i no save olgeta long tupela tokples. Ol Projek pepa i soim luksave long bikpela mak bilong ol Orokaiva tokples (o dailek) insait long Oro provins, na 11-pela asples tokples long Wes Nu Briten (olsem tok klia long Sapta 2).
147. Long taim bilong fil visit, Panel tim i bin bung wantaim planti komyuniti manmeri husat i bin toktok long Inglis o Tok Pisin. Planti taim, ol askim bilong Panel tim na ol bekim bilong ol smolholda i bin bihainim tupela man bilong tanim tok, Inglis i go long Tok Pisin, na bihain Tok Pisin i go long Inglis, na olsem tasol. Wanpela taim, wanpela meri long wanpela famili i kam long narapela ples na man bilong em i tanim tok long asples tok ples i go long tokples bilong em. Panel i tok olsem ***bikpela mak bilong ol tokples i givim wanpela bikpela salens bilong wok konsaltesen na komyunikesen.***
148. Bilong Envairomen Asesmen, ol konsalten OPIC i kisim long karimaut wanpela stekholda woksop (we i bungim ol NGO, gavman ejensi, komasal welpam growa, ol gavana bilong ol welpam provins, na eid ejensi) long Pot Mosbi long Julai 18, 2006 bilong —...*larim ol i autim wanem kain belwari ol i gat (sic.) long sosol na envairomen hevi we i ken kamap long projek.*||¹⁷² Wanpela ful ripot long dispela woksop, wantaim ol isiu ol grup i autim, i stap long Appendix 3 insait long Envairomen Asesmen, maski i nogat toktok long en long namba bilong ol pipel i stap insait long dispela woksop. Long ol fil visit long sait bilong karimaut Envairomen Asesmen, moa pipel i kisim wok konsaltesen long Wes Nu Briten na Oro provins, na ol dispela pipel (51 olgeta) i stap insait long Appendix 2 bilong Envairomen Asesmen. Tasol, sikspela tasol, long dispela 51 em ol blok holda o papagraun, maski ol memba bilong ol growas asosiesen (10) na sampela long ol meri mausmanmeri (4) em ol welpam blok ona.
149. Panel tim i raun lukim 16-pela viles i groim welpam long WNB na Oro long taim em i mekim Eljibiliti na Investigesen raun bilong en; sampela smolholda bilong ol ples klostu i bin kamap long ol dispela miting tu. Bikos i bin hat long makim ol ples bihainim mausmanmeri bilong ol, Panel tim i askim CELCOR (em NGO i makim

¹⁷¹ Percentages are based on literacy rates referenced in the Environmental Assessment (p. 42) and population figures presented in the 2000 census data. ¹⁷² OPIC (n.d.) Environmental Assessment, p. 76.

ol rikwesta) na OPIC long mekim ol arapela raun i go long tupela provins bai Panel tim i ken lukim narakain bilong tupela. Nogat wanpela long ol smolholda Panel tim i bungim, i nap tingim taim ol i stap wok insait long wok konsaltesen, insait long ol ples i stap long Sosol Asesmen tu, olsem we ol konsaltesen i bin kamap, o long ol lain i bin raun i go long konslatesen i kamap long arapela ples. Bihainim dispela, Panel tim i luksave olsem dispela em i noinap evidens olsem i nogat konsaltesen i kamap, bikos ol lain husat i bin go long ol konsaltesen, nogut ol i no bin stap long ples taim Panel tim i bin raun i go. Panel tim i bin inap long tok stret, olsem i gat sampela save long Projek i stap, bikos sampela ol smolholda i autim belkros long peim moa takis bilong RMTF; tasol planti i no klia long RMTF.



Piksa 7: Panel tim i toktok wantaim ol plesmanmeri long Oro provins

150. Taim wanwan smolholda i tok olsem ol i no laik groim welpam moa, bikpela namba bilong ol smolholda we Panel tim i toktok wantaim ol i tok ol i gat laik, o i orait long welpam i kamap namba wan bikpela rot bilong ol long kisim winmani. Maski, klostu olgeta i komplem long i nogat klia wokpasin na wan-sait makim bilong ol levi o takis, nogat inap arapela rot bilong kisim winmani, FFB koleksen i no save kamap long taim bilong en stret, na pundaun long kisim inap winamani bikos long praising fomula, na ol arapela samting. Panel i luksave olsem Menesmen i tok tu, long taim bilong konsaltesen bilong Sosol Asesmen, i nogat gutpela kisim bilong FFB em i wanpela long ol bikpela eria ol i no wanbel long en. OPIC, em welpam mil kampani, na kontrak trenspot i kisim bikpela tok-daunim tru long ol nogut ret bilong pikim frut na ol trenspot progreem we i no gutpela.
151. Maski long dispela, tingting bilong Panel tim em long bikpela laik namel long ol smolholda em i bungim, long groim moa welpam sapos ol i ken kisim moa luksave. Wankain long en, long OPIC opis long Popondetta, Panel tim i soim moa long wan tausen aplikesen fom bilong wok infiling, we Panel tim i tok em i soim klia save, na laik bilong Projek.
152. Sampela long ol konsaltesen wantaim ol smolholda i kamap wantaim ol mausmanmeri bilong Welpam Growas Asosiesen. Long dispela fil visit, Panel tim i kisim toksave long sampela smolholda long kain kain komyniti, olsem maski ol i makim

ol mausmanmeri bilong Growas Asosiesen ol yet, ol i nogat bilip long ol, na ol i no lukim Asosiesen olsem i makim laik bilong ol na toktok makim ol. Olsem na long lukluk bilong planti smolholda, ol konsaltesen i abrusim Asosiesen na bungim ol smolholda ol yet, wantaim ol meri, na ol kastomari lida bilong ol, long skelim gut tingting ol i gat.

153. Long bungim tok, Panel i no inap long tok stret sapos i gat inap klia, o bikipela sapot bilong Projek na ol wok bilong em, namel long ol smolholda. Tasol, Panel i luksave olsem i gat bikipela laik namel long ol smolholda, long groim moa welpam aninit long butpela sindaun. Dispela bai klia moa insait long wok glasim long komplaiens o bihainim long wok konsaltesen.
154. Panel i wanbel na bihainim wari bilong ol Rikwesta olsem i nogat inap konsaltesen i ken bagarapim Projek we bai no inap gutpela bilong ol smolholda.

E. Ol Polisi na Rot bilong mekim wok bilong Benk

153. Dispela seksen i tokmakim ol Wol Benk polisi bilong ol klem i kam long ol Rikwesta long konsaltesen na tokaut long infomesen.

1. Indijines Pipels Polisi OP/BP 4.10

155. SADP i kirapim Indijines Pipels Polisi, OP/BP 4.10, bikos planti long ol piel insait long Projek eria em ol asples. Ol Rikwesta i tokto tu long OMS 2.20 long Projek Apresal, bihainim Intanesenel Konvensen long Ekonomik, Sosol, na ol Kalsarel Rait (ICESCR), we Papua Niugini i sainim pinis. Dispela Triti i pasim olgeta pati bilong en long wok bilong givim ekonomik, sosol, na ol kalsarel rait (ESCR) i go long ol manmeri, na ol arapela, dispela rait i go long wanpela gutpela mak sindaun. OMS 2.20tok olsem taim ol intanesenel agrimen i karamapim wanpela projek, Benk —*i mas amamas olsem projek plen i bihainim stret olgeta tok long ol agrimen.*¹⁷³ Tasol, bikos OP/BP 4.10 i karamapim, na i bihainim, ol bikipela asbilip bilong Triti long sait bilong ol sosol na kalsarel rait (long sait bilong ol dispela astingting long wan wan ol asples pipel), glasim bilong Panel long komplaiens o bihainim, i stap insait long banis bilong OP/BP 4.10.
1. OP/BP4.10 i askim sapos ol Asples Pipel i sindaun insait long ol projek eria, Benk i mas karimaut wanpela Sosol Asesmen.
2. Long skelim tingting long go het wantaim projek o nogat, Borowa i tok olsem, bihainim Sosol Asesmen (paragraf 9) na fri, klia konsaltesen i go pastaim (paragraph 10), sapos ol Asles Pipel komyuniti i givim bikipela sapot bilong ol long Projek. Bikipela sapot bilong komyuniti long projek i mas gat gutpela raitim bilong en, na Benk i glasim ol rot na kaikai bilong wok konsaltesen i kamap long Borowa yet long inapim em olsem ol Asples Komyuniti i givim bikipela sapot bilong ol long projek. Benk i lukluk moa long Sosol Asesmen na long

¹⁷³ OMS 2.20, ¶24.

Rekot na kaikai bilong fri, gutpela konsaltesen i go pastaim wantaim ol Asples Pipel komyuniti long sekim sapos dispela sapot i stap o nogat. Benk i no go het wantaim projek prosesim sapos em i no inap long tok klia long kain sapot olsem (paragraph 11).

158. Konsaltesen i mas kamap na i no long taim bilong Sosol Asesmen tasol, tasol OP 4.10 i askim olsem —*wanpela rot bilong givim fri, klia konsaltesen i go pastaim, wantaim ol Asples Pipel komyuniti **long olgeta wok bilong projek**, na moa yet long taim bilong wok redi, long kisim tingting bilong ol na sekim sapos i bin i gat bikpela komyuniti sapot bilong projek* ||¹⁷⁴ [tok strongim i stap].
159. BP 4.10 i tok makim —*fri, klia konsaltesen i go pas i save kamap fri na bihainim laik bilong wanwan, na i nogat stia bilong ausait, wok pasim, o grisim, we olgeta lain i gat klia rot long infomesen long laik na mak bilong projek bihainim tokples na kalsa bilong ol,* ||¹⁷⁵ na olsem —*konsaltesen wok i luksave long ol Indijines Pipels Ogenaisesen (IPOs) i karamapim ol kaunsel ov eldas, ol hetman, na ol klen lida, na givim tu moa luksave long ol meri, yut, na ol lapun* ¹⁷⁶¹⁷⁷ ||-- na i tok strongim nid long statim kwik konsaltesen wok pastaim. Polis ii askim tu olsem — *wanpela rekot bilong wok konsaltesen i stap olsem hap bilong ol projek fail.* ||¹⁷⁸ Olsem na taim projek i senisim sindaun bilong ol Indijines Pipel, polisi bilong Benk i nidim wanpela bikpela rot bilong komyuniti konsaltesen na tu, klia mak long bikpela komyuniti sapot bilong projek.

2. Envairomen Asesmen OP 4.01

160. Long sait bilong konsaltesen, OP 4.01, Envairomen Asesmen i askim olsem: —*...insait long EA wok, borowa i save toktok wantaim ol grup i sindaun long projek eria grup na ol lokol nongavman ogenaisesen (ol NGO) long envairomen sait na kisim tingting bilong ol.* ||¹⁷⁹ Em i askim tu olsem —*Borowa yet bai kirapim ol kain konsaltesen kwik.* ||¹⁸⁰
161. Ol disklosa o tokaut askim aninit long OP 4.01 i tok olsem —*Long stretpela pasin konsaltesen namel long borowa na ol grup long projek, na ol lokol NGO long olgeta Kategori A na B projek* ¹⁸¹ *bilong IBRD o IDA fainens, borowa i mas givim olgeta stori na infomesen kwik taim pastaim long konsaltesen i go het, na i mas stap long raitim na tokples we i klia na i op long ol grup i stap long wok konsaltesen.* ||¹⁸² Moa yet, Polisi i askim olsem —*Wanem narapela Kategori B ripot bilong wanpela projek bilong IDA mani halivim i go aut long ol grup long projek na ol lokol NGO. I mas op long pablik insait long*

¹⁷⁴ OP 4.10, ¶6(c). ¹⁷⁵ Ibid., ¶2(a). ¹⁷⁶ Ibid. ¹⁷⁷ Ibid, ¶2(c). ¹⁷⁸ Ibid., para 2(d). ¹⁷⁹ OP 4.01 – Environmental Assessment, ¶ 14. ¹⁸⁰ Ibid. ¹⁸¹ SADP is a Category B project. ¹⁸² OP 4.01, s. 15.

kantri i kisim dinau, na opisal risit i kam long Benk long ... wanem Kategori B EA ripot bilong ol projek i bilong kisim IDA mani em ol askim bilong Benk, long sekim strong bilong ol dispela projek ||¹⁸³ na olsem EA ripot bilong ol Kategori B projek na i go aut long pablik we i stap long InfoStua bihain long Benk i kisim ol.

F. Glasim bilong Panel long Komplaiens o Wok Bihainim ol Polisi bilong Benk

162. Dispela seksen i givim Glasim bilong Panel long Menesmen i bihainim ol Polisi bilong Benk, olsem long bungim tok insait long laspela seksen. Em i lukluk long tripela bikpela isiu: sosioekonomik na kalsarel fek fainding sapotim disain bilong Projek; fri, klia konsaltesen i go pastaim; na evidens bilong bikpela komyuniti sapot. Namba wan hap i glasim wok bihainim bilong Sosol na Benefisaris Asesmen wantaim ol askim bilong Annex A bilong OP 4/10. Namba tu hap i glasim ol fri, klia konsaltesen i go pastaim, na laspela hap i glasim evidens bilong bikpela komyuniti sapot. Dispela seksen i pinis wantaim ol laspela tingting bilong Panel.

1. Sosioekonomik na Kalsarel Tru tok i Sapotim Projek Disain

163. Sosol Asesmen Ripot na Benefisaris Asesmen Ripot, tupela wantaim i kamap long Janueri 2007, i gat ol bungim tok long kain kain rot bilong inapim benefit na ol rot bilong daunim ol hevi bilong Projek bilong wan wan kategori smolholda bihainim luksave ol i gat long wok lukautim graun.¹⁸⁴ Sosol Asesmen na Benefisaris Asesmen em tupela biknem saveman i klia long Papua Niugini, wantaim save long welpam sekta, na i save gut long Tok Pisin. Bikos Benefisaris Asesmen i save poromanim Sosol Asesmen na i bungim sampela ol infomesen i mas stap aninit long OP 4.10, strong bilong dispela tupela ripot i stap wantaim daunbilo.

164. Annex A bilong OP 4.10 i listim faivpela askim bilong Sosol Asesmen:

- (a) *Wanpela rivi, bihainim bikpela bilong projek, long ligel na institusenal fremwok i gutpela long ol Indijines o Asples Pipel.*
- (b) *Bungim ol beslain infomesen long demografik, sosol, kalsarel, na politikal han-mak bilong ol Asples Pipel komyuniti i stap long projek, graun na teritori ol i papa long en, o yusim bihainim tumbuna pasin, na ol netseral risos ol i save sindaun long en.*

¹⁸³ OP 4.01, s. 17. ¹⁸⁴ Astingting bilong Sosol Asesmen i karamapim: opim moa rot bilong strongim komyuniti developmen bihainim makim bilong ol projek benefisari na nid ol i gat, ol tingting na askim; sekim strong bilong wok konsaltesen na painim rot bilong kisim moa komyuniti wokbung; daunim ol komyuniti hevi na kostim long Projek; givim ol gaitlain bilong bihainim wanpela sastenabol projek disain; redim bikpela sosio-ekonomik na sosol indiketa bilong projek monitaring na iveluesen. Sosol Asesmen Ripot (Jan 2007) G. Koszberski and G.N. Curry. (2007). Benefisaris Asesmen Ripot bilong Smolholda Agrikalsarel Developmen Projek (SADP). Papua Niugini.

(c) Bihainim rivi u na beslain infomesen, makim bilong ol bikpela projek stekholda na tok klia long wanpela rot bilong toktok wantaim ol Asples Pipel long wan wan hap bbilong projek wok redi na karimaut (lukim paragraph 9 bilong dispela polisi).

(d) Wanpela asesmen, i sanp long fri, klia konsaltesen i go pastaim, wantaim ol Asples Pipel komyuniti, long ol hevi o birua na gutpela kamap bilong projek. Bikpela samting long sekim ol birua i ken kamap em wanpela wok glasim bilong strong, o birua, long ol Indijens Pipels komyuniti, bikos ol i save pas klostu long busgraun bilong ol, na tu, hevi long ol i nogat inap rot long kisim winmani, moa long ol arapela sosol grup insait long ol komyuniti, rijen, o nesenel sosaiti yumi stap long en.

(e) Painim na skelim strong, bihainim fri, klia konsaltesen i go pastaim, na mobeta konsaltesen wantaim ol Indijinesn Pipels komyuniti, long ol rot i mas stap bilong abrusim ol birua, o sapos i nogat rot i stap bilong abrusim, long painim ol rot bilong daunim strong bilong ol birua, o bekim mak bilong hevi ol i kisim, na long inapim luksave i go long ol asples pipel long kisim ol gutpela samting aninit long projek.¹⁸⁵

a.Rivi u bilong Ligel na Institusenal Fremwok i Karamapim ol Indijines o asples Pipel

165. Namba wan hap bilong wanpela Sosol Asesmen (aninit long Annex A bilong OP 4.10) em i rivi u bilong —*ligel na institusenal fremwok i karamapim ol Indijines Pipel.*¹⁸⁶ Ol Sosol na Benefisaris Asesmen i tok klia long ol kain kain luksave mak bilong yusim graun, na ol kros i stap pinis o i ken kamap long onasip na yusim graun pasin. Ol Asesmen i givim ol strongpela rekomendesen long stretim ol isiu bilong wan wan ol dispela kategori.
166. Ol eksen bilong kisim em OPIC bai mekim, Dipatmen bilong Lens na Fisikal Plening, na Provinsal Lens Opis, wantaim wokbung wantaim ol kastomari papagraun grup.¹⁸⁷ Benefisaris Asesmen i lukluk long bikpela wok ol klen lida i ken mekim long stiaim skelim bilong graun, na luksave long gat ol komyuniti miting i kamap long —*biknem komyuniti lida.*¹⁸⁸ Benefisaris Asesmen i go moa long tok olsem ol —*Klen lida i holim yet rispek na pawa insait long komyuniti bilong ol na sapos i nogat sapot bilong ol, ol SADP-wok bai no inap long win o kisim sapot long bikpela mak bilong komyuniti* [tok strongim i go insait].¹⁸⁹ I gat rekomendesen olsem —*ol SADP wokman i mas painim ol lokol klen lida na bungim ol insait long mekim ol disisen bilong ol SADP wok.*¹⁸⁹

¹⁸⁵ OP 4.10, Annex A. ¹⁸⁶ OP 4.10, Annex A. ¹⁸⁷ Benefisaris Asesmen, p. 11. ¹⁸⁸ Ibid., p. 36. ¹⁸⁹ Koszberski and Curry 2007, p. 11.

167. Maski long dispela rekomendesen, i gat liklik moa tokpait o infomesen insait long Sosol na Benefisaris Asesmen long painim ol kastomari lidasip, ol rot bilong mekim disisen, na rot bilong stretim kros na hevi long sait bilong ol Asples Pipel long ol Projek eria, o we pasin bilong ol i narakain long ol arapela asples grup.
168. Kain infomesen olsem bai bikpela samting, olsemm, long stretim ol askim long husat i save mekim disisen, wanem taim disisen i save kamap, na sapos wan wan ol famili i laik groim welpam, o long planim gen, o long go long wok infiling; na long wanem hap kastomari graun; na we graun i ken go aut long ol arapela klen o sab-klen, ol wairaman o mini-estet bilong groim welpam.
Wanpela rekomendesen insait long Benefisaris Asesmen em bilong ol OPIC ekstensen opisa long strongim save bilong ol long —*seveim na yusim ol mep, rekodim ol famili lain na straksa bilong klen, na kastomari rot bilong stretim kros o hevi.*¹⁹⁰ Olsem na wok bilong rekodim ol famili lain na klen straksa, olsem hap bilong dispela wok bilong stretim ol wok lukautim graun, na stap bilong ol rot bilong stretim ol hevi, i gat luksave. Tasol i nogat moa tok klia insait long Sosol na Benefisaris Asesmen.
169. Bikos i nogat glasim insait long Sosol Asesmen, i no wankain long ol tems ov refrens bilong Sosol Asesmen, we i tok oslem em i mas —*Bungim olgeta stori (em sosio-politikal) long ol bikpela senis (sapos i gat), namel ol asples grup insait long ol projek eria long Wes Nu Briten na Oro long sait bilong lokol politikal ekonomi, lidasip, politiks resis, mekim disisen, makim man, na ol pasin pren wantaim ol LLG.*¹⁹¹
170. Olsem i stap insait long OP 4.10, painim bilong ligel na institusenal fremwok, wantaim kastomari lidasip, na rot bilong mekim ol disisen, i mas stap bilong konsaltesen na bilong kisim komyuniti sapot. **Panel i painim olsem glasim bilong ligel na institusenal fremwok bilong kastomari lo, lidasip, mekim disisen, na stretim ol hevi, na ol senis (sapos i gat) long ol dispela pasin namel long ol asples grup, i sot long ol askim bilong Annex A bilong OP 4.10, olsem na em i no bihainim Benk Polisi.**

b. Bungim Beslain Infomesen

171. Taim Sosol Asesmen na Benefisaris Asesmen i gat planti infomesen long ol sosol na ekonomik isiu wantaim ol welpam growa insait long ol kain kain Projek eria, em i no karamapim inap —*sosol, kalsarel na politikal pasin bilong ol Asples Pipel,*¹⁹² olsem i stap long Annex A of OP 4.10, long pinisim wanpela etnografik beslain. Benefisaris Asesmen i painim ol bikpela etnolingwistik grup insait long tupela Projek provins. Ol asples manmeri bilong Projek eria insait long Oro provins (na tu planti long ol Rikwesta) i kam long wanpela bikpela etnik na kalsarel grup, ol Orokaiva, i gat sevenpela hauslain – wanwan i gat sampela ol klen na sab-klen, husat i bihainim papa – we bikpela hap mak kalsa pasin i wankain. Benefisaris Asesmen i makim tokples bilong ol olsem

¹⁹⁰ Benefisaris Asesmen, p. 39. ¹⁹¹ Tems ov Refrens, p. 138. ¹⁹² OP 4.10, Annex A, ¶ 2(b).

Orokaiva, we i gat sampela ol han-tokples bilong en.¹⁹³ Ol pipel long Wes Nu Briten provins i gat planti moa manmeri bilong kain kain ples, wantaim seven-pela bikpela ples na hauslain grup i save toktok long samting olsem 25 tokples,¹⁹⁴ we Benefisaris Asesmen i tokluksave olsem -- *taim i gat wanwan samting i narakain long wok gaden na agrikalsa sistem bilong ol wanwan ples na tokples grup, ol i gat wankain ol sosol na kalsarel sistem.*//¹⁹⁵ Moa long en, long Oro na WNB wantaim, bikpela hap namba bilong ol wairaman i kam long groim welpam na kakau. Planti i lusim ol ples bilong ol we i gat planti manmeri tumas, olsem long ol Hailans, Sepik, Morobe, na Gasel Peninsula, na i givim moa kain kain pasin na luksave bilong ol manmeri, olsem i stap long Benefisaris Asesmen.¹⁹⁶

172. Tasol maski, Benefisaris Asesmen i pinis na tokluksave olsem long tupela provins wantaim – *asples na tokples grup i wankain long sait bilong kalsa na sosol ogenaísesen, na pasin bilong wok-graun.*//¹⁹⁷



Piksa 8: Panel tim long wanpela ples long Oro provins

173. Long bikpela hap bilong en, glasim bilong ol asples grup insait long sosol na envairomen asesmen pepa i sapotim tingting olsem olgeta i wankain. Tupela i save stap long ol ples we i gat ogenaísesim gut bilong en – *bihainim pasin famili we ol wanwan klen na sab-klen i ken bihainim lain famili bilong ol i go bek long wanwan tumbuna.*//¹⁹⁸ Tasol wanpela samting i narakain, i save kamap long sosol ogenaísesen bilong ol asples grup insait long Oro na ol dispela long WNB. Benefisaris Asesmen i luksave olsem taim wok-graun na sosol straksa long Popondetta – *i strong long pasin **bihainim papa** [mipela yet tok strongim] we man i save holim rait bilong ol papa bilong ol, na ol meri i save bihainim ol man bilong ol bihain long ol marit,* ol klen long noten Wes Nu Briten, em – *ol i **bihainim mama** [mipela yet tok strongim] wantaim rot i go long lain bilong mama bai man i gat bikpela luksave long bosim graun bilong mama bilong en,*

¹⁹³ Benefisaris Asesmen, p. 8. The differences among these communities of speakers are classified as different but closely related —languages|| by some authors (including Gordon 2005, Bashkow 2006) and as different —dialects|| of one language in the Beneficiaries Assessment. ¹⁹⁴ Ibid., p. 8. ¹⁹⁵ Ibid., p. 9. ¹⁹⁶ Benefisaris Asesmen, p. 6. ¹⁹⁷ Ibid., p. 8. ¹⁹⁸ Benefisaris Asesmen, p. 9.

na ol dispela rait i save go long ol pikinini man bilong ol susa bilong em bihain long em i dai (ol rait i stap wantaim namba wan bikipela pikinini meri).¹⁹⁹

174. I gat planti ol bikipela samting i narakain namel long patrilineal (bihainim papa), na matrilineal (bihainim mama). Olsem, —Long matrilineal sosaiti long noten WNB, wanpela bikipela luksave em namel long graun bilong groim kes-krop, olsem welpam na graun bilong wok gaden. Ol welpam blok i save go long pikinini bilong man na graun bilong wok-gaden i save bihainim ol pasin bilong bihainim mama, olsem na i save go long pikinini man bilong susa bilong en, taim em i dai.²⁰⁰ Ol narakain namel long ol matrilineal na patrilineal sosaiti i save go moa yet, na i no olsem graun bilong givim tasol: -- Long WNB, posisen bilong klen lida i pas long pasin bilong bihainim mama, we ol man i kisim nem bilong ol brata bilong mama.²⁰¹ Moa yet, Benefisaris Asesmen i luksave olsem – Insait long ol matrilineal sosaiti bilong WNB em i bikipela samting long bungim ol meri klen lida husat i no save soim pes tumas long ol lida wok bilong ol aninit long ol man, tasol husat i gat pawa long mekim disisen [mipela yet tok strongim].²⁰²
175. Ol dispela senis i kamap long famili lain sistem i mas bihainim liklik kamap bilong SADP long sait bilong onasip na yusim bilong graun na kastomari rot bilong mekim ol disisen. Moa yet, taim ol Orokaiva em ol bikipela lain manmeri long Oro, populesen o pipel long WNB i bikipela moa wantaim sevenpela ples na hauslain grup i save yusim samting olsem 25 kain kain tokples.
176. Na tu, olsem mipela i tok long Sapta 2, sampela savemanmeri i ting olsem ol Orokaiva i no wanpela grup i wankain long olgeta samting na i luksave olsem – bikipela narakain samting i stap namel long ol lokol komyuniti long sait bilong sosol ogenaísesen, pasin kastom, kaikai, ats, na tumbuna save //. Tasol wantaim dispela luksave, i gat tingsave tu olsem i gat sampela – ol liklik samting i wankain|| insait long Orokaiva sosaiti we i karamapim sampela asbilip bilong Melanesia kalsa olsem pasin bilong givim presen long pasin bung, pasin bilong *‘eclecticism’* o luksave na *‘opportunism’* o pasin bilong mekim senis [...], pasin bilong lidasip na wok-graun, wanpela wok-gaden ekonomi i sindaun long senis graun agrikalsa, na bikipela ol luksave long wanwan manmeri//.²⁰³
 1. Tems ov refrens bilong Sosol Asesmen i tok olsem, —Dispela asesmen bai givim spesol luksave long ol bikipela senis (sapos i gat) namel long ol kain kain asples grup we i gat luksave long ol bihainim ol komyuniti ol i stap long en, toktok wantaim ol na karimaut ol sosol asesmen long skelim ol hevi i ken kamap, ol gutpela na ol nogut, o birua.²⁰⁴ Bihainim wanem bai mipela i tok paitim bihain long dispela sapta, dispela wok glasim i bikipela samting long stap long karimaut gutpela wok konsaltesen wantaim ol asples grup long projek eria.
 2. Annex A bilong OP 4.10 i askim tu long i mas i gat bungim long ol beslain infomesen long, —graun na ol arapela ples we ol i holim bihianim ol tumbuna bilong ol, na ol netseral risos we ol i sindaun long en.²⁰⁵ Benefisaris Asesmen i tok makim

¹⁹⁹ Benefisaris Asesmen, p. 10. ²⁰⁰ Sosol Asesmen Ripot (January 2007), p. 32. ²⁰¹ Benefisaris Asesmen, p. 11. ²⁰² Ibid. ²⁰³ Bashkow, 2006, p. 31-32. ²⁰⁴ Tems Ov Refrens, p. 137. ²⁰⁵ OP 4.10 Annex A, ¶ 2(b).

graun mak na ol netseral risoses²⁰⁶ na i toktok liklik tasol long pasin bilong painim abus na pulim pis, na moa yet long wok gaden. Tasol Asesmen i luksave olsem ol dispela pasin em i wankain namel long ol asples grup i kisim senis bilong projek. **Panel i no painim inap evidens na stori insait long Sosol o Benefisaris Asesmen long sapotim bilip bilong wanpela kain pasin bilong ol kain kain asples grup. Em i tingting bilong Panel olsem moa bikpela tritmen long mak we ol komyuniti i sindaun long ol arapela rot bilong kisim gutpela sindaun (olsem kes-krop, ol gaden bilong haus na lokol maket, pulim pis, na painim abus), na moa yet, ol me pi soim stret ol eria i gat ol kain kain etno-lingwistik grup, em ol samting i ken halivim na moabeta long tok klia.**

179. **Panel i ting olsem wantaim moa strongpela wok glasim, bilong ol pasin bilong ol papagraun i stap long ol Projek eria, moa yet long sait bilong ol bikpela wok bilong Projek (olsem wok-graun na holim graun long famili, ol rot bilong mekim kastomari disisen, ol pasin bilong wok-gaden) i mas stap insait long ol Sosol na Benefisaris Asesmen pastaim long kamap long tingting olsem dispela ol grup, i “klostu wankain tasol”. Bikos i nogat ol bikpela beslain infomesen long ol dispela asesmen, we Panel i painim olsem i no bihainim OP 4.10.**

c. Painim ol Projek Stekholda na Tok Klia long wanpela Rot bilong Konsaltesen wantaim ol Asples Pipel

180. Sosol Asesmen i painim ol kain kain stekholda lain bilong toktok wantaim, maski i no bihainim ol wanwan asples komyuniti.²⁰⁷ Benefisaris Asesmen i gat wanpela bikpela fremwok, ol i kolim — Benfisari Patisipesen Fremwok,|| bilong wanwan long dispela tripela hap bilong SADP (Ol Tebol 6.1 i go inap 6.3) ol kain kain stekholda long painim. Dispela fremwok i save strongim tripela eria: long toktok wantaim, na promotim tilim bilong infomesen i go long ol stekholda; long lukim ol turangu grup olsem ol meri, yut na blokholda i nogat gutpela gaun, i ken kisim gutpela long Projek; na long muvim rot bilong mekim disisen i go long lokol na komyuniti level. Wanpela piksa bilong ol dispela kain wok aninit long dispela fremwok em —*insait long ol VOP eria ol i makim bilong infiling, i mas i gat ol komyuniti miting i kamap long taim bilong plenim wok long paitim tok na painim namba wan ples bilong ol fida rot (long makim tilim bilong ol klen graun holdings) na long plen bilong ol nid bilong ol yut bilong ol papagraun klen long opim rot i go long graun bilong ol welpam. Ol biknem komyuniti lida i mas go pas long Komyuniti miting. Ples fasiliteta long gat gutpela wokbung wantaim wantaim OPIC.*²⁰⁸||
181. **Panel i painim olsem ol Sosol na Benefisaris Asesmen i toktok long wanpela rot bilong konsaltesen long kamap long wanwan stes bilong Projek aninit long OP 4.10. Tasol, Panel i painim olsem Konsaltesen Fremwok i no bihainim pasin kalsa, we i nogat rivi long ligel na institusenal fremwok na bungim beslain infomesen long ol asples komyuniti, na olsem, i no bihainim OP/BP 4.10. Rot em i kamap, na sapos em i kamap long taim bilong plening na wok karimaut, em bai yumi glasim moa long seksen bihain long dispela seksen, - Fri, Klia Konsaltesen i Go pastaim.||**

²⁰⁶ Benefisaris Asesmen, pp. 8-12. ²⁰⁷ Sosol Asesmen, pp.71-72. ²⁰⁸ Benefisaris Asesmen, p. 36, Tebol 6.1.

d. Skelim bilong ol Senis Projek i bringim long ol Asples Pipel

182. Annex A bilong OP 4.10 i askim long —*Wanpela asesmen, i sindaun long fri, klia konsaltesen i go pastaim, wantaim ol Asples Pipel komyuniti, bilong ol nogut na gutpela bilong projek. Bikpela samting long skelim ol birua i ken kamap, na wanpela wok-glasim bilong banis ol Asples Pipel komyuniti i gat bikos ol i save pas klostu long graun na ol netseral risos, na tu, ol i nogat rot long kisim gutpela sindaun we i no olsem ol arapela komyuniti, rijen, o ol nesenel sosaiti ol i stap long en.*²⁰⁹||
183. Sosol Asesmen i makim sampela ol birua i stap wantaim kamap bilong ol winmani bilong kes-krop faming, we i kamap tu insait long Rikwes bilong Inspeksen. Asesmen i sut long kes-krop faming na resis em i save givim long ol wok-gaden, na luksave bilong kesmani o rot bilong tilim insait long ol bikpela sosol sistem.
184. Sosol Asesmen i painim tu ol birua bilong kes-winmani. Maski ol birua long welpam prodaksen i no kisim bikpela luksave bipo, ol i kamap klia long pinis bilong Oro Smolholda Welpam Projek (1992-2001). Sosol Asesmen i makim stret ol hevi ol komyuniti i bungim, long ol potnait bilong welpam, olsem pilai laki, bikpela pasin spak, pasin pamuk, na pait insait long famili. Sosol Asesmen i luksave tu olsem ol meri i karim moa hevi, bikos ol save kisim hevi bilong pasin pait, ol i mas strongim gutbel na pasin bilong famili, redim kaikai olgeta de, na bungim mani bilong inapim ol nid bilong famili helt na skul bilong ol pikinini. Sosol Asesmen i painim tu ol birua bilong sindaun wantaim Human Immunodefisiensi Vairus/Akwaiet Imun Difisiensi Sindrom (HIV/AIDS).
185. Asesmen i glasim gut sindaun narakain bilong winmani i no kamapim gutpela sindaun, olsem, —*lus bilong wanpela strongpela rot bilong seving long brukim wanpela hap bilong kes-winmani long laik bilong tumbuna senis pasin ekonomi na ol arapela askim bilong winmani, we ol growa i lukim olsem wanpela bikpela banis long ol i sevim mani.*²¹⁰||²¹¹ Asesmen i tok klia tu long piksa bilong Bialla Growas Fan, wanpela spesol wok seving fan, we ol Bialla smolholda i laik, olsem wanpela gutpela piksa bilong wanpela rot we i ken brukim seving long olla skim bilong en. Tasol i nogat moa glasim bilong ol kalsarel rot we winmani i ken stap em yet, bai i ken pasim ol wantok long mekim klem o askim.

²⁰⁹ Annex A, OP. 4.10, ¶ 2 (d). ²¹⁰ Sosol Asesmen, p.76. ²¹¹ Lukim Nimal Fernando, *Informal Finance in a Semi-Subsistence Economy: The Case of Papua New Guinea*, National Research Institute Discussion Paper, Number 62, 1991, long lukim ol piksa bilong ol infomol seving na kredit grup long Papua Niugini. Wanpela piksa bilong wanpela infomal na kalsarel seving na kredit skim i stap long

186. **Panel i painim olsem Sosol Asesmen i painim ol birua i ken kamap, na ol gutpela mak bilong SADP bihainim OP/BP 4.10.** Tasol em i tingting bilong Panel, olsem sapos i bin gat moa glasim long ligel na institusenal fremwok, na wok i go het long askim na kisim ol beslain infomesen na karimaut wanpela konsaltesen wok, painim bilong ol birua i ken kamap na ol gutpela bilong en bai klia moa.

e. Painim ol Rot bilong Abrusim ol Birua na Strongim ol Asples Pipel long Kisim ol Gutpela Benefit we i gutpela wantaim kalsa

187. Annex A of OP 4.10 i laikim —*Painim na skelim strong, bihainim fri, gutpela konsaltesen i go pastaim, wantaim ol Asples Pipel komyuniti long ol rot bilong abrusim ol birua i ken kamap, o sapos ol dispela rot i no stap, painim ol rot bilong sotim, slekim hevi o givim kompensesen long ol birua, bai ol Asples Pipel i kisim olgeta gutpela samting bihainim kalsa bilong ol, i kam long projek.*²¹²
188. Sosol Asesmen i tok makim ol sosio-ekonomik sindaun bilong ol smolholda, moa yet ol LSS (we sindaun bilong ol i bungim hevi long groa bilong populesen na sot long graun), na ol birua bilong gat planti kesmani insait long komyuniti we i gat planti askim long sait bilong komyuniti wok na pasin bilong skelim winmani. Asesmen i paitim tok long ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani, olsem bikpela luksave bilong ol kaikai gaden. Bihain em i rekomenim ol rot bilong daunim ol hevi nogut, bihainim ol rot bilong slekim mani hevi long bekim ol dinau, na i tok-makim wanpela seving rot Bialla komyuniti i laikim. (Glasim bilong laip sindaun insait long sapta i kam bai paitim tok long ol rot i gat rekomendesen insait long Sosol Asesmen.)
189. **Panel i painim olsem Sosol Asesmen i no painim rot bilong abrusim, daunim na slekim birua bai ol asples pipel i ken kisim gut ol gutpela samting aninit long Projek. Tasol, olsem tok klia antap na long ol tokpaitim daunbilo, konsaltesen wantaim ol stekholda long strong na stretpela bilong Projek disain i no kamap bihainim Benk polisi.** Gutpela wok konsaltesen na rivi bilong ol stori bai gat bikpela moa luksave long strong bilong ol non-keskrop wok gaden na i ken painim rot bilong slekim ol hevi long sait bilong peim kesmani insait long Oro rijen.

rural Papua Niugini ol i stori long en em —*Wok Meri* // grup we i sindaun bihainim famili lain. —*Wok Meri em i Tok Pisin nem bilong —wok bilong ol meri // na wanwan grup —i wok insait long seving aninit long lidasip bilong wanpela o tupela _bikmeri ‘...Em i ogenaism wanpela nupela grup, sanapim na strongim netwok wantaim ol bik meri bilong ol arapela grup, kamapim ol miting na seremoni...ol bikmeri i save strongim ol grup bilong ol long sevim moa mani.* // (p.9). Na tu, —*Ol Wok Meri grup i gat wanpela seving sistem ol i tok i wankain olsem wok-benking. Wanwan meri i save dipositim mani bilong em i go long wanpela akaun na rekot i stap insait long liklik notbuk bilong en, we i stap insait long pasbuk. Mani bilong em i stap insait long hap laplap o bilum, na olgeta ‘bandol mani’ i stap wantaim insait long haus bilong lida. Ol i save dipositim mani long ol miting na long nait bilong wanpela maket de. Olsem na ol emir i ken sevim mani bilong ol, pastaim long ol i tingting long yusim o ol man o pikinini i askim ol long mani.* // (p. 9-10), na —*Ol Wok Meri grup...na tu, ol i wok insait long kredit maket antap long wok seving bilong ol. Ol dispela grup i gat ol inta-grup transeksen.* // (p. 11), na — *Wok Meri em i wanpela bikpela sistem bilong seving na kredit...na i gat wanpela longpela taim bilip bilong ol memba. Seving tai mi save kamap namel long faiv na nainpela yia.* // (p. 12)²¹² OP 4.10, Annex A, ¶ 2(e).

190. Isiu long sapos ol rot ol i painim na givim rekomendesen long en insait long Sosol Asesmen i bin stap insait long Projek disain bai kisim moa tok paitim long sapta 4.

f. Bungim tok long Wok Komplaiens o bihainim

191. Panel i painim olsem ol Sosol na Benefisaris Asesmen i bin bihainim OP 4.10 long karamapim ol seksen wantaim ol strongpela rekomendesen long ol rot bilong abrusim ol birua, na long bekim ol hevi bilong welpam prodaksen. Panel i painim olsem ol sot long rot ol nupela benefisari na pipel i sindaun long Projek eria i wok long tok paitim ol strong bilong ol dispela rekomendesen. Moa yet, Panel i painim olsem Sosol Asesmen i no karamapim gut ol kastomari lo, rot bilong mekim disisen na stretim hevi, wantaim moa sans bilong wok konsaltesen na disain bilong Projek. Moa yet, Sosol Asesmen i no bihainim gut bikpela mak bilong ol asples grup insait long ol Projek eria pastaim long em i tok olsem olgeta grup i klostu wankain tasol. Ol dispela asua i stap, sapos i bin gat stretim, bai bringim ol Asesmen moa wantaim laik na astingting bilong Indijines Pipels Polisi.

2. Fri, Gulpela Konsaltesen i Go Pastaim

192. Fri, Gulpela Konsaltesen i go pastaim em i wanpela long ol bikpela samting long Indijines Pipels Polisi. OP 4.10, i tok olsem ol dispela samting i mas i stap long mekim dispela kain wok konsaltesen:

(a) *i sanapim wanpela gulpela jenda na intajeneresen fremwok we i opim rot bilong konsaltesen long wanwan stes bilong redim projek na karimaut wok namel long borowa o lain i dinau, ol Asples Pipel komyuniti long projek eria, ol Indijines Pipels Ogenaisesen (IPO) sapos i gat, na ol arapela lokol sivil sosaiti ogenaisesen (CSO) we ol Indijines o Asples Pipel komyuniti yet i painim;*

(b) *yusim ol konsaltesen rot i bihainim ol sosol na kalsarel veliu bilong ol Asples Pipel komyuniti na sindaun bilong ol long ples, na long disainim ol dispela rot, givim spesol luksave long ol wari bilon g ol Asples Meri, yut, na ol pikinini na rot ol i gat long kisim developmen na ol benefit; na*

(c) *i save givim ol Asples Pipel komyuniti olgeta infomesen long projek (wantaim wanpela asesmen o skelim long ol birua nogut bilong projek long ol Asples Pipel komyuniti) bihainim stret kastom long wanwan stes bilong redim projek, na karimaut.*²¹³

193. Ol dispela seksen i makim glasim bilong Panel long Projek na bihainim bilong en wantaim ol astingting bilong fri, gulpela konsaltesen i go pastaim askim bilong OP 4.10.

²¹³ OP 4.10

a. Ripot bilong Konsaltesen

194. Insait long Bekim bilong en, Menesmen i luksave olsem, —*fri, gutpela konsaltesen i go pas i bin kamap long taim bilong Projek wok redi, na bikpela komyuniti sapot bilong Projek i stap insait long ol Projek eria.*²¹⁴ Bekim bilong Menesmen i go moa na tok olsem — *Sosol Asesmen na Benefisaris Asesmen i makim gut ol samting ol konsaltesen i painim. Tasol Menesmen i luksave olsem i nogat inap ripot long wok konsaltesen insait long Sosol Benefisaris Asesmen. Sosol Asesmen ripot i no paitim tok long wanem infomesen i go aut wantaim ol lain manmeri long ol dispela konsaltesen, rot dispela ol toksave i bihainim, o ol ples na rot ol i makim ol lain i kamap long ol dispela kibung.*²¹⁵ Moa yet, Menesmen i luksave olsem —*...ol askim bilong OP 4.01 i no inap, bikos ol infomesen i go aut long ol stekholda long taim bilong konsaltesen bilong EA, i bin go aut long toktok tasol.*²¹⁶
1. Maski Benefisaris Asesmen i tok long wanpela fremwok, we i stap insait long wanpela anneks insait long Projek Implimentesen Manuel (PIM) we i strongim nid bilong konsaltesen wantaim ol smolholda long wanwan stes bilong projek wok redi na karimaut, Panel i no painim evidens olsem kain fremwok olsem i bin gat tok klia long en, na i go aut long wanwan stes bilong redim Projek na karimaut.²¹⁷
 2. Panel i luksave olsem planti long ol konsaltesen i kamap long kirap stret bilong Projek disain, taim i gat luksave olsem projek i senisim Oro Smolholda Porjek (1992-2001) bilong bihainim wanpela sotpela taim.²¹⁸ Menesmen i tok olsem — *Projek disain i kisim bikpela stia long Benk na wok em i mekim long welpam sab-sekta na i karamapim ol skul ol i kisim long ol olupela wokbisnis, na moa yet, long Oro Smolholda Welpam Dvelopmen Projek, we i bin pas long 2001.*²¹⁹
 3. Olsem long tokpaitim long Sapta 2, i bin gat longpela taim malolo we smolholda welpam sekta, moa yet long Oro provins, i bin karim hevi bilong nogat wok lukautim. Sekta i kisim moa bagarap long Saiklon Guba long 2007,²²⁰ na wol prais bilong welpam i bin pundaun long pinis bilong 2008. Olsem insait long Sapta 2, win bilong ol olupela projek i bin apim mak bilong laik, tasol longpela taim sapot i no stap i lukim pundaun bilong ol sevis, na i kamapim planti belhevi na belkros.²²¹ Ol dispela senis long sindaun i lukim bikpela wok konsaltesen wantaim ol smolholda, pastaim long Sosol Asesmen i bin kamap, bikos Asesemn i bin stap pinis insait long SADP plen. Olsem na i nogat bikpela sans bilong ol bikpela senis long Projek disain.
 4. Olsem, long sait bilong wok infiling agensim wok planim bek. PAD i painim olsem maski Projek i bin laik mekim wok infiling na wok planim bek, i bin i gat senis

²¹⁴ Management Response, p. 42. ²¹⁵ Ibid. ²¹⁶ Management Response, ¶ 85. ²¹⁷ Beneficiaries Assessment. ²¹⁸ PAD, ¶ 4, Footnote 2. ²¹⁹ Management Response, p. 8, ¶. 26. ²²⁰ Ibid., p. 34, ¶ 110. ²²¹ Management Response, p. 26, ¶ 80.

i go long bikpela sapot bilong wok infiling tasol.²²² Panel i luksave olsem taim Projek i bin kirap bihian long pinis bilong 1992-2001 projek, —em i bin sut moa long longpela taim sindaun bilong smolholda welpam sab-sekta, i wanbel moa long givim mani bilong plantim bek ol olupela pam diwai, rot mentenens, strongim smolholda wokmak na strongim ol institusen insait long indastri.|| Projek Konsep Dokumen (2003) Aidentifikesen Apdet Misin Fainal Aide Memoire(2005)²²⁵ bilong Menesmen^{223 224} i tok klia long ol dispela astingting olsem: planim bek bilong 6,500 hekta olupela welpam blok na kamapim ol mani rot bilong inapim wok planim bek long bihain taim; na sanapim samting olsem 6,000 hekta nupela ples welpam long ol blok i stap nating bihainim ol rot i stap pinis.

199. PAD i tok, olsem —Wanpela planim bek progrem i stap insait long wanwan skim, tasol bai no inap stap insait long projek, bikos ol i stap pinis insait long wanpela welpam prodaksen sistem. Ol welpam miling kampani i wanbel long sapotim wok planim bek progrem insait long projek taim na bihain long karimaut ol asosietet smolholda dinau yet.||²²⁶ Wankain tasol, long Septemba-Oktoba 7, 2010, Mid-Tem Riviu-Fainal Aide Memoira i mekim klia olsem SADP i no save mekim mani bilong planim bek, na i save makim infiling olsem wanpela bikpela Projek wok.²²⁷
200. Panel i no painim evidens bilong konsaltesen wantaim ol smolholda o welpam growa asosiesen taim dispela — bikpela senis// i kamap. Long narapela sait, ol konsaltesen we i bin kamap bipo long senis i soim moa laik bilong planim bek. Ol namba wan konsaltesen, long Novemba 25-Desemba 8, 2001, wantaim ol welpam growa asosiesen memba long Popondetta i tok olsem ol memba i laikim Projek long sapotim smolholda long planim bek na wanpela fan bilong planim bek i mas gat luksave.²²⁸ Wankain tasol, ol welpam growa asosiesen long Bialla i tok wanpela long ol bikpela wok bilong en em posin i go long ol olupela welpam long larim wok planim bek i go het.²²⁹ Dispela i go het yet olsem wanpela bikpela hevi long Me 10, 2006, insait long ol konstitusen wantaim ol welpam growa asosiesen long Popondetta.²³⁰
201. Panel i no painim wanpela rekot bilong konsaltesen olsem Projek i rausim wok bilong planim bek olsem wanpela hap, maski i gat laik long planim bek i kam long ol grup i kisim tok konsaltesen long kirap bilong Projek laip. Maski sampela konsaltesen i bin kamap aninit long senis wantaim ol welpam growa asosiesen, em i no klia sapos dispela senis long lukluk long Projek i no klia sapos dispela i bin gat tok-klia long dispela senis long lukluk bilong Projek.

²²² PAD, p. 16, ¶ 51. —Senis long lukluk bilong projek (long planim bek 6,500 hekta na nupela planim em 6,000 hekta (infiling|| bihainim ol rot i stap pinis), long infiling inap long 9,000 hekta wantaim nogat wok planim bek) i bin kamap wantaim ol DEC opisal. DEC i tok stret olsem pas bilong en long Me 23, 2006, bai stap strong sapos astingting bilong —infiling|| bihainim ol rot i stap pinis i stap strong na ol provinsin insait long DEC pas i gat inap bihainim.||

²²³ Papua Niugini Smolholda Agrikalsa Developmen Projek, Ol Minit bilong PCD Riviu Miting, Jun 25, 2003. ²²⁴ Projek Konsep Dokumen, 2003, p.5. ²²⁵ Papua Niugini Propos Smolholda Agrikalsa Developmen Projek, Aidentifikesen Apdet Misin Fainal Aide Memoire, Oktoba/Novemba 2005 ²²⁶ PAD, p. 30, ¶ 9. ²²⁷ Oktoba 7, 2010 Mid-Tem Riviu- -Fainal Aide Memoire, ¶ 18. ²²⁸ Bekim bilong Menesmen, Annex 2 Bungim Tok bilong Konsaltesen, p. 70. ²²⁹ Ibid., p. 72. ²³⁰ Ibid., Annex A, p. 75.

Taim Sosol Asesmen i kamap, infiling – na i no planim bek – i bin wanpela bikpela wok bilong Projek, na ol konsaltesen i bin kamap bihainim dispela tingting na luksave.²³¹

202. Panel i luksave tu olsem New Britain Palm Oil Group, husat i bin tekova long menesmen bilong Higaturu Oil Palm Limited long Oro provins long Epril 2010, i bin gat wari long infiling program²³² na i givim bikpela moa luksave long wok bilong makim ol sidling na ol arapela saplai long planim bek, na i no long infiling aninit long Memorandum ov Agrimen bilong Infiling Kredit Komponen.²³³ Dispela i antap moa long wari long inapim bilong konsaltesen long infiling agensim planim bek. **Panel i painim olsem i nogat konsaltesen wantaim ol smolholda long senis insait long Projek disain bihainim senis long luksave bilong Projek long infiling na planim bek, i go long infiling tasol, i no bihianim OP 4.10.**

b. Konsaltesen wantaim ol Kastomari Lida

1. Olsem mipela i tok pastaim, Panel i painim olsem Sosol Asesmen i no makim klia ol kastomari lidasip na rot bilong mekim disisen. Ol Projek pepa i no klia inap long rot ol konsaltesen i bungim ol klen na sab-klen lida, maski Benefisaris Asesmen i luksave long bikpela wok bilong ol. **Panel i no painim evidens insait long ol Projek pepa olsem ol konsaltesen, taim ol i bin kamap, i bin askim long tingting bilong ol klen lida, moa long ol dispela i bin stap insait long ol lidasip grup i stap nau (olsem ol LLG).**
2. Projek Implimentesen Manuel (PIM) bilong Komyuniti Dvelopmen wok, olsem, i no mekim wanpela tok-luksave long ol klen lida na kastomari rot bilong mekim ol disisen. Olsem, Manuel i tok:

Bikpela samting long strongim wok bilong ol WDC (wod developmen komiti) bai lukim stap bilong ol infomal grup na manmeri long komyuniti level long inapim bikpela makim na long apim wok-mak na risos bilong WDC.²³⁴ WDCs i stap nau i no inap long karamapim olgeta komyuniti laik na nid. Olsem na ol open kibung, na bikpela moa luksave plening grup long wod level em ol rot bilong bihainim long strongim moa wok pasin.²³⁵

²³¹ Ibid., Annex 2 Bungim tok long ol Konsaltesen, pp. 70-79. ²³² Aide Memoire, Fifth Implementation Support Mission: April 15 – April 19, 2011 ¶ 5 na Footnote 2. Na tu, insait long wanpela miting wantaim Panel tim, Kula/Higaturu Welpam menesmen i tok strongim olsem Projek i mas lukluk long bikpela mak karim long ol blok i stap pinis, moa long apim welpam prodaksen long pasin infiling. Dispela luksave i kamap bihainim luksave bilong Kampani olsem i nogat inap yangpela pipel long Oro long lukautim ol welpam blok bikos planti i save go long Pot Mosbi long wok. Olsem na, i gat wok havestim i bihainim -- nid|| long Oro, na ol blok i no stap aninit long lukaut bilong ol lapun, we i hat moa long lukautim wanpela 2-hekta blok. ²³³ Memorendum ov Agrimen namel long PNG Microfinance Limited na Welpam Industri Koporesen na Higaturu Welpam Ltd na PNG Sastenabel Dvelopmen Program Limited long sait bilong Karimaut bilong Infiling Kredit Komponen bilong Gavman bilong PNG, Smolholda Agrikalsa Dvelopmen, s. 3.3.2. ²³⁴ PIM, p. 5. ²³⁵ PIM, p. 6.

205. Olsem na maski em i lukluk long nid i stap long strongim na bungim ol Wod Developmen Komiti, i nogat toktok long kastomari lidasip. Dispela abrus bai bikpela moa long ol komyuniti i save bihainim mama we ol meri klen lida i nogat luksave namel long ol lain i holim ol wok-lida tude.

c. Serim Infomesen bihainim Gutpela Rot na Tokples

1. Planti kainkain tokples ol i save yusim long WNB, na bikos planti i no save long rit na rait long Inglis o Tok Pisin, i klia pinis. Menesmen i luksave olsem —*nogat wanpela pepa i bin tanim i go long ol lokol tokples.*²³⁶ Moa yet, —*olgeta fokas grup toktok wantaim ol welpam smolholda na hauslain i no groim welpam, i bin kamap long Tok Pisin.*²³⁷ Olsem, i no long Orokaiva long Oro, o wanpela long ol asples tokples long WNB we bikpela namba bilong ol smolholda i klia moa long en.
 2. Olsem long antap, Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok olsem Sosol Asesmen i no tok-paitim wanem infomesen ol i mas serim wantaim ol arapela konsaltesen. Olsem na, Panel i no inap long skelim sapos ol asples komyuniti i gat rot long kisim infomesen pastaim long konsaltesen i go het. Long dispela, Panel i no inap skelim sapos ol indijines komyuniti i gat rot long dispela infomesen pastaim long konsaltesen i kamap. Long tok-makim —*fri, gutpela konsaltesen i go pastaim,*²³⁸ Polisi i tok olsem wanem kain konsaltesen i mas karamapim —*pastaim rot i go long infomesen bihainim laik na skop bilong projek i laik kamap, bihainim stretpela pasin kalsa, rot na tokples.*²³⁹
208. Long pasin disklosa, Menesmen i luksave olsem —...*nogat pepa i bin tanim i go long ol lokol tokples*²³⁹ tasol ol i bin go aut long Wol Benk InfoSop long Februari 22, 2007.
209. Long sait bilong konsaltesen bilong Envairomen Asesmen, Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok olsem tupela miting long ol envairomen isiu i bin kamap wantaim ol NGO long Pot Mosbi, long Janueri 31, 2004, na Me 25, 2006. Tupela long ol dispela miting i bin kamap bihainim askim bilong Wol Benk na, bihainim ol not i stap long Annex 3 bilong Bekim bilong Menesmen, Benk i mekim ol dispela kibung bilong toksave long ol NGO long sampela ol hap bilong wok disain, olsem, ol i gat wanpela bikpela wok tasol bilong tilim infomesen.
210. Ol konsalten i mekim wok bilong EA i bin toktok wantaim sampela ol grup long Projek eria. Moa yet, Menesmen i bin luksave long sampela ol envairomen (na sosol) wari bilong ol lain ol i toktok long en, na em i kamapim wanpela provisin bilong ol baienual indipenden envairomen na sosol odit insait long Projek disain (olsem i stap insait long PIM).²⁴⁰
211. Nogat wanpela pepa long sait bilong EA i soim sapos ol EA konsalten i givim sampela —...*gutpela toksave long gutpela taim pastaim long konsaltesen i kamap, bihainim*

²³⁶ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 40. ²³⁷ Ibid., p. 43. ²³⁸ BP4.10, 2(a). ²³⁹ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 40, ¶ 129. ²⁴⁰ PIM, p. 24.

*pasin na tokples we i klia na i op long ol grup i stap long konsaltesen,*²⁴¹ aninit long OP 4.01. Menesmen i luksave olsem wanpela infomesen i go aut long ol stekholda long taim bilong konsaltesen bilong EA i bin kamap long maus tasol.²⁴² Ripot long EA woksop wantaim ol grup insait long Projek eria long Pot Mosbi i no tokaut long dispela, tasol wanpela ridim bilong riot i tok olsem nogat wanpela toksave long pepa i bin go aut pastaim long ol i toktok. Dispela wankain luksave i stap long ol wok konsaltesen i kamap long Wes Nu Briten na Oro provins long ol dispela fil wok raun. (olsem na, nogat toksave long wanem kain tokples i bin go aut pastaim long ol konsaltesen i kamap).

212. **Panel i painim olsem nogat pepa wok i stap long Envairomen Asesmen i soim klia olsem i bin gat toksave i go aut pastaim long bikpela taim pastaim long wok konsaltesen i kamap, na bihainim pasin na tokples i klia na op long ol grup insait long konsaltesen, olsem i stap long askim bilong OP 4.01.**
213. **Moa yet, taim EA na ol arapela pepawok i op long pablik long Pot Mosbi na Washington long Februari 22, 2007, na taim fomal toksave i go aut long pablik long tokaut we ol pepa OPIC i pablisim insait long ol niuspepa long dispela de yet, ol toksave pepa i stap long tok Inglis tasol, na i no long wanpela rot na tokples i klia na i op long olgeta grup i stap long konsaltesen. Dispela i no bihainim fri, klia konsaltesen i go pastaim aninit long OP/BP 4.10.**

d. Bungim tok long ol Painim bilong pasin Komplaiens o bihainim

214. **Panel i painim planti sot insait long wok konsaltesen. Moa yet, olsem Menesmen i asua long givim inap infomesen pastaim long konsaltesen bihainim stretpela pasin, rot na tokples. Dispela i no bihainim OP 4.10 na OP 4.01.**
215. Panel i luksave long bikpela wok Menesmen i mekim long strongim wok komyunikesen long strongim OPIC long karimaut kain kain wok konsaltesen, o sindaun miting wantaim wanwan, ol redio brodkas, ol fil de, na ol niusleta.²⁴³ Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok tu olsem (paragraf 86) olsem — *Moa wok konsaltesen i stap long kamap long kain kain Projek wok long taim bilong karimaut long inapim inap manmeri i stap long konsaltesen.*||
216. I go het, Panel i luksave olsem Projek bai karimaut ol bikpela wok i karamapim stekholda konsaltesen, moa yet RMTF stadi na FFB Praising Stadi. Panel i bilip olsem kain konsaltesen olsem bai kamap bihainim tingting bilong OP 4.10 (Ol Asples Pipel) – olsem, wantaim spesol luksave long pulim tingting bilong ol asples smolholda, wantaim luksave long kastomari rot bilong mekim disisen

²⁴¹ OP 4.01, ¶ 15. ²⁴² Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 49. ²⁴³ Papua Niugini: Smolholda Agrikalsa Dvelopmen Projek (Kredit Namba. 4374-PNG), Aide Memoire, Mid-Term Review, ¶20.

Long wanwan bilong ol asples pipel – na i abrusim i go long salim Projek infomesen i go aut.

3. Evidens bilong Bikpela Komyuniti Sapot

217. Olsem antap, astingting bilong wok konsaltesen, bihainim OP 4.10, em long inapim —*bikpela komyuniti sapot*// bilong ol projek Benk i givim mani long mekim, na i karamapim ol asples pipel.²⁴⁴ Indipenden luksave bilong Panel i tok strongim bikpela komyuniti laik long groim welpam olsem namba wan rot bilong kisim winmani. Tasol Panel i luksave tu long ol belhevi bilong ol birua bilong welpam, ol takis bilong en, nogat gutpela pikap bilong FFB, senis long prais, na luksave olsem pe mak i no stret.
218. Menesmen i tok olsem —*I gat strongpela sapot bilong Projek insait long ol projek eria na long ol konsaltesen, pipel i autim bikpela luksave long wanem ol samting Projek bai bringim.*//²⁴⁵ Tasol, skelim bilong Menesmen yet, olsem antap, Projek — *em planti benefisari i nogat gutpela luksave long en (wantaim tu ol growas asosiesen).*//²⁴⁶ Bihainim dispela toktok, Panel i askim sapos i ken i gat bikpela komyuniti sapot sapos i nogat inap klia tingting long Projek.
219. Long lukluk bilong Panel, bikpela komyuniti laik long groim welpam i no inap wankain olsem bikpela komyuniti sapot bilong Projek. —*Bikpela Komyuniti Sapot* || i ken kamap long fri, klia konsaltesen i go pastaim, bihainim stia bilong OP 4.10. Moa yet, **Panel i no inap long painim, insait long ol Projek pepa, na ol Sosol na Benefisaris Asesmen, wanem infomesen i stap na tok klia long bikpela komyuniti sapot i kamap. Panel i painim olsem dispela i no bihainim OP 4.10.**

4. Ol Laspela Tingting

220. Long bungim tok, Panel i bilip olsem inap konsaltesen, we i luksave long ol kastomari straksa na tokples na larim bipo rot i go long kisim Projek infomesen, i bin inap kamapim bikpela senis long disain na karimaut bilong SADP. Wantaim kain konsaltesen olsem long wanwan stes bilong Projek, ol asples smolholda bai gat sans long tokaut long ol wari bilong ol long Projek, ol asples smolholda bai gat rot long autim tingting bilong ol long ol Projek wok na tingting bilong ol long ol arapela rot bilong wok. Dispela wok i ken karim mobeta kaikai long disain na karimaut bilong Projek. Moa yet, nogat inap konsaltesen i bin inap long daunim ol gutpela kamap ol smolholda i wetim long Projek long sait bilong strongim sindaun na disain bilong wanpela rot bilong mekim wok rot mentenens. Olgeta dispela samting bai gat moa glasim long sapta 4 na 6.

²⁴⁴ OP 4.10, ¶11 i listim olgeta askim bilong rekodim long pepa —*bikpela komyuniti sapot*//; ol dispela i karamapim (namel long ol arapela) raitim ol painimaut bilong sosol asesmen, raitim bihainim rot bilong fri, gutpela konsaltesen i go pastaim, ol fomal agrimen i kamap wantaim ol Asples Pipel komyuniti na/o ol IPO.

²⁴⁵ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 25. ²⁴⁶ Aide Memoire bihainim pinis bilong SADP MTR, Oktoba 18, 2010, p. 5, ¶20.

Sapta 4: Poveti o Pasin Turangu, na Senis long Sindaun

A. Tok i go pas

221. Dispela sapta i glasim klem bilong ol Rikwesta, olsem groim welpam i no daunim turangu sindaun bilong ol smolholda, na, moa yet, dispela i no givim inap gutpela samting long sindaun bilong ol. Klem bilong ol Rikwesta na ol operesenal polisi na prosidia. Bikpela hap bilong dispela sapta i sut long lukluk bilong Panel long ol hevi ol Rikwesta i tok long en, na wok bihainim bilong Benk long ol polisi na prosidia bilong em yet.



Piksa 9: Panel tim i bungim ol plesmanmeri long WNB provins

222. Bikos i kam inap long namel bilong 2011, karimaut bilong ol SADP wok long graun i no bin go het yet, planti long ol birua ol Rikwesta i tok long en, i sut long ol hevi bilong smolholda welpam prodaksen long ol yia i go pinis – wantaim, o i no wantaim Wol Benk – na ol i pret olsem kain birua bai kamap gen aninit long SADP. Olsem na Panel i glasim wok komplaiens o bihainim, na bai lukluk moa long ol rot Menesmen i kisim long disainim, skelim strong bilong en, na karimaut Projek long – *luksave olsem ol Asples Pipel i kisim ol sosol na ekonomik benefit we i bihainim stret lain man na meri na i karamapim tu ol tumbuna, na abrusim ol birua i ken kamap long ol Asples Pipel komyuniti, o taim abrusim i no gutpela, long daunim mak bilong en, o slekim, o givim kompensesen long en,*²⁴⁷ bihainim ol askim bilong Indijines Pipels Polisi (OP/BP 4.10).
223. Olsem bikpela mak bilong ol SADP benefisari em ol indijines o asples pipel, wanpela arapela Indijines Pipels Plen i no bin kamap. Olsem na bikpela Projek disain i bin kamap long makim ol astingting i stap long OP 4.10. Dispela sapta bai glasim sapos ol i disainim Projek long inapim ol askim bilong OP4.10, na luksave long ol asples smolholda i kisim hevi long Projek bihainim ol sosol na ekonomik benefit i kam bihainim pasin kalsa

²⁴⁷ OP 4.10, ¶ 1.

na sapos ol ekonomik benefit na/o birua bilong en i bin abrus, i bin liklik, o kamapim kompensesen. Moa yet, wok glasim bai lukluk long seavings na ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani.

224. Long Sapta 3, Panel i lukim olsem i gat inap konsaltesen i kamap we i luksave long ol kastomari straksa na tokples bai ol asples smolholda i kisim ful infomesen long Projek, na moa yet, sapos Sosol Asesmen i bin bihainim stret OP 4.10, disain na karimaut bilong SADP bai kamap moabeta. Insait long dispela sapta, hevi bilong ol dispela sot long wok konsaltesen long daunim mak bilong pasin turangu na ol sindaun bilong Projek, wantaim ol sot long tanim ol rekomendesen long daunim birua bilong Projek disain, i kisim glasim.
225. Rivi bilong Panel i sanapim sampela ol asples smolholda husat bai kisim gutpela bilong Projek, i noken pret long en (maski i gat birua long en), na dispela i kamap bikos Benk i asua long bihainim ol banis i stap insait long Indijines Pipels Polisi.

B. Ol Klem bilong ol Rikwesta

226. Bihainim evidens i kam long Sosol Asesmen bilong Projek, ol Rikwesta i klem olsem —*maski bikpela mak invesmen bilong welpam, i no mekim bikpela wok strongim long laip bilong ol smolholda.*²⁴⁸ Ol Rikwesta i klem tu olsem Projek bai no inap daunim pasin turangu, tasol bai sotim ol laik bilong ekonomik wok, na givim wanwan rot tasol long ol smolholda i ken strongim sindaun bilong ol. Ol Rikwesta i tok-makim ol dispela wari pastaim, bikos ol mil kampani i gat pawa tasol long makim prais bilong FFB (na olsem, ol i makim tu ol winmani bilong ol smolholda long welpam), na dispela i save pasim ol smolholda long sindaun bihainim laik bilong estet mil.²⁵⁰ Dispela rot bilong makim prais, ol Rikwesta i tok, —*i save tanim prais hevi long orait long ol kampani taim ol i andaveliuim ol kostim bilong ol smolholda na veliu bilong kastomari graun, taim em i luksave long pe bilong ol bisnis na strong bilong ol welpam mil i lus.*²⁵¹ Namba tu, ol Rikwesta i tok bikpela mak ol levi o takis long ol smolholda olsem narapela as long pasim ol long strongim sindaun bilong ol. Namel long bekim dinau ol mil kampani save rausim (em 30%), ol takis bilong gavman sevis (moa long 44%)^{252 253} ol arapela takis (growas asosiesen pe, trenspot takis, OPRA takis, na Sexava takis)²⁵⁴, na wanpela takis long

²⁴⁸ Askim bilong Inspeksen, p. 5; kolim ol painim bilong Sosol Asesmen bilong Projek (Janueri 2007, p. 46) olsem —*Sindaun i bagarap olgeta na ol bikpela hanmak bilong poveti o sindaun turangu olsem haus slip, rot long kisim klin wara na ol helt sevis i soim olsem kwolati bilong laip i go daun* || insait long ol eria i groim welpam. Tasol Sosol Asesmen bilong 2007 (p. 46) i luksave tu olsem edukesen i bin strong moa insait long ol eria i groim welpam, maski long paradoks o narakain sindaun || i go daun insait long ol dispela kwolati bilong laip hanmak. ²⁴⁹ Ibid., p. 5, ¶ B.3. ²⁵⁰ Ibid. ²⁵¹ Ibid. ²⁵² Askim bilong Inspeksen, p. 5, ¶ B.3. ²⁵³ Ibid. ²⁵⁴ Sexava em i wanpela kain binatang we ol namba wan birua bilong welpam, em ol mil kampani i save givim tritmen bilong kilim.

sapotim Rot Mentenens Tras Fan, —*ol smolholda bai karim moa hevi na bai no inap long apim ol yet lusim pasin turangu,*¶²⁵⁵ ol Rikwesta i tok.

227. Las tru, ol Rikwesta i autim belwari bilong ol olsem Projek i promotim welpam olsem wanpela rot tasol bilong ol Asples Pipel, long kisim winmani, we ol Rikwesta i toke m i save daunim gen ol asesmen bilong Benk yet long strong bilong ol arapela rot long kisim winmani namel long ol smolholda. Ol Rikwesta i luksave olsem – *ol smolholda husat i laik kisim ol dinau bilong ol arapela wok agrikalsa [i nogat narapela rot] ausait long groim welpam.*¶²⁵⁶ Ol Rikwesta i tok strong olsem ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani long poromanim winmani ol i kisim long welpam em i wanpela bikpela tingting bilong ol smolholda. Ol i tok olsem opim ol liklik bisnis na kisim trening long mekim wok i no inap long stretim olgeta nid bilong opim rot bilong kisim winmani insait long Projek eria.²⁵⁷

C. Bekim bilong Menesmen

228. Menesmen i luksave olsem —*wok bisnis insait long welpam indastri long PNG i gat bikpela gutpela wok-kamap long sindaun insait long ol rurel ples.*¶²⁵⁸ Menesmen i klem olsem welpam prodaksen i save givim ol smolholda wantaim moabeta kaikai long graun na hatwok bilong en moa long ol arapela komoditi krop, we i save bringim winmani-mak moa long pe bilong wok potnait.²⁵⁹ Masi i gat bikpela ol takis long welpam, moa long ol arapela krop, Menesmen i tok strong olsem infil planim bilong welpam em i wanpela gutpela invesmen bilong ol smolholda bikos em i gat bikpela bekim long hatwok.²⁶⁰ Menesmen i luksave tu olsem, —*sindaun i go bagarap moa... [na] long sampela bikpela mak bilong poveti o pasin turangu olsem hausng, na rot long kisim klin wara na helt sevis, na laip sindaun i go daun,*¶²⁶¹ wanpela painim we i narakain long lukluk bilong kisim moa winmani mak ol welpam smolholda i lukim, moa long ol arapela kes-krop produsa. Dispela narakain sindaun, em Menesmen i tok, i no bilong ol welpam smolholda tasol, na i ken bihainim ol arapela samting olsem bikpela mak yusim mani, nogat rot bilong sevim mani, na ol bikpela komyuniti askim na wok long skelim winmani bilong wanwan wantaim ol pren na famili, na nogat gutpela sevis bikos developmen i no kamap strong (olsem long edukesen, helt na infrastraksa).²⁶²
229. Menesmen i tok wanbel wantaim ol Rikwesta long bikpela luksave bilong gat ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani long halivim na banisim ol smolholda long senis long prais bilong ol kes-krop.²⁶³ Menesmen i tok olsem SADP i no sapotim moa rot bilong kisim winmani long invesmen long rural rot infrastraksa na bihainim Komponen Namba 2 bilong Projek (Lokol Gavanens na Komyuniti Wokbung).²⁶⁴ Long bekim ol klem bilong ol Rikwesta,

²⁵⁵ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, pp. 5-6. ²⁵⁶ Ibid. ²⁵⁷ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 6, ¶ B.3. ²⁵⁸ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p.17, ¶ 47. ²⁵⁹ Ibid., p. 17, ¶ 47. ²⁶⁰ Ibid., p. 63, ¶19. ²⁶¹ Curry, G.N., Koczberski, G., Omuru, E., Duigu, J., Yala, C., and B. Imbun. (January 2007). Sosol Asesmen Ripot bilong Smolholda Agrikalsa Developmen Projek (SADP). Papua New Guinea. p. 46, ¶ 3.8. ²⁶² Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 18, ¶ 50. ²⁶³ Ibid., p. 17, ¶ 48. ²⁶⁴ Ibid., p. 17, ¶ 48.

olsem Projek bai fosim ol smolholda husat i laik kisim dinau mani bilong ol arapela wok agrikalsa long go insait long groim welpam tasol, Menesmen i tok olsem stap wok insait long SADP bai bihainim laik bilong wanwan, na bikos — *kredit o dinau i stap bilong ol welpam infiling wok, em i no min olsem wanpela smolholda i pas long groim welpam.*²⁶⁵//

230. Long makim prais bilong FFB, (we ol Rikwesta i tok olsem em i wanpela samting i save pasim ol long bihainim ol mil), Menesmen i luksave olsem dispela isiu i gat planti kros long en, tasol nau ol mani i kam aninit long SADP long rivium na apdetim rot bilong makim prais bilong FFB.²⁶⁶

D. Luksave bilong Panel long ol Sut tok insait long Rikwes

231. Dispela seksen i karamapim tu ol luksave bilong Panel long ol birua i kamap long groim welpam, olsem ol Rikwesta i tok long en. Ol isiu i ken givim hevi long kain sindaun olsem we Menesmen, ol Rikwesta na ol arapela lain husat i kisim senis long Projek i gat kainkain luksave long ol benefit bilong Projek na senis em i kamap long laip sindaun bilong ol asples smolholda fama. Moa yet, dispela isiu em i stap klia insait long ol Projek pepa, we i tok olsem em i —*paradoxical*// we em i apim mak bilong winmani i kam long groim welpam, tasol i no kamapim gut sindaun.²⁶⁷
232. Ol Rikwesta i klem olsem Projek bai no inap daunim poveti o sindaun turangu, na bai sotim ol ekonomik rot ool i gat, na aninit long Projek, ol smolholda bai sot long ol rot bilong strongim sindaun bilong ol, an welpam bai no inap rausim pasin turangu.²⁶⁸ Long narapela sait, —*Menesmen i bilip olsem i gat inap luksave long rausim pasin turangu...insait long disain bilong Projek.*²⁶⁹// Menesmen i tok tu olsem Projek i bihainim Benk polisi OP/BP 10.00 long Invesmen Lending.
233. Panel i luksave olsem ol Rikwesta na Menesmen i yusim ol toktok – poveti ridaksen|| na —laivlihut, o sindaun|| wantaim, na i no save klia, bihainim mining tru bilong ol dispela tok. Sampela taim — poveti ridaksen o rausim pasin turangu || em ol i yusim bilong minim apim winmani mak; na arapela taim, em i gat bikpela moa mining. Tok —laivlihut o sindaun|| em ol i save yusim long mining sindaun bilong manmeri, na arapela taim, em i minim wokmani. OP 1.0 long Poveti Ridaksen, i tok-makim poveti olsem —*i nogat rot (na strong o save), nogat maus na makim, na i nogat inap banis long ol birua.*²⁷⁰// Tasol, i nogat wanpela Wol Benk polisi miting long laivlihut o sindaun. Laivlihut em long sampela akademik luksave olsem — *strong, ol samting (em ol samting yu baim na ol sosol risoses) na wok i mas stap long kisim winmani na gutpela sindaun. Laivlihut em i save strong taim em i ken inap na kirap bek long ol hevi na birua, na strongim mak bilong save na samting wanpela i gat, na i no*

²⁶⁵ Management Response, p. 19, ¶ 54. ²⁶⁶ Ibid., p. 21, ¶ 61. ²⁶⁷ Social Assessment Report (January 2007), p. 38, ¶ 3.8 and Management Response, p. 17, ¶ 46. ²⁶⁸ Request for Inspection, p. 4-5. ²⁶⁹ Management Response, p. 56. ²⁷⁰ OP 1.00, ¶ 1.

sotim netseral risos bes.||²⁷¹ Tupela tok wantaim i karamapim moa long dispela pasin bilong kisim winmani, na i bungim tu ol tingting bilong strong na save long banis agensim ol birua.

234. Olsem na dispela Ripot i yusim dispela tok —income|| long toktok long mani sait bilong poveti ridaksen o daunim pasin turangu, na tok —livelihood|| long soim rot bilong sindaun, we — living conditions o sindaun|| bai soim mak bilong sindaun.
235. Ol dispela seksen i givim ol luksave na tingting bilong Panel long fopela sait bilong birua i stap insait long Rikwes bilong Inspeksen na i bungim tingting bilong poveti ridaksen na laivlihut. Ol dispela samting i pas wantaim winmani i kam long welpam, laip sindaun, seving na ol birua bilong wok-kesmani.

1. Winmani i kam long Welpam

236. Long sait bilong kontribusen bilong en long ekonomi bilong kantr, em i klia olsem welpam em i bikpela samting, na inapim 43.2% bilong ol agrikalsa ekspot veliu (2008). Indastri em i namba tu tasol long pablik sevis sekta long bikpela namba bilong ol wokman, bihainim Bekim bilong Menesmen.²⁷² Moa yet, — *wel pam i save givim bikpela mak winmani bilong ol smolholda long sait bilong winmani long wanwan hekta na wanwan de wok long agrikalsarel sekta bilong PNG.*²⁷³ Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok olsem —...***ol invesmen insait long welpam indastri bilong PNG i kamapim bikpela sevis long laip bilong ples.***²⁷⁴ (Tok strongim i stap pinis long orijinal.) Bekim bilong Menesmen i go moa long tok klia long bikpela hap wok i kamap insait long ol eria i groim welpam na bikpela mak kes winmani i wok go insait long ol welpam smolholda hauslain. Bekim bilong Menesmen i makim tu ol arapela gutpela bilong wok welpam, olsem liklik wok moa long planti ol arapela krop; planti kesmani i kam long ol miling kampani, na mobeta rot long kisim mani, moa long ol arapela kes-krop fama.²⁷⁵
237. Insait long raun bilong em i go long Oro provins, Panel tim i kisim toksave olsem welpam em i namba wan indastri long givim wok, na namba wan long mekim winmani insait long provins. Panel i luksave tu olsem provins i senis long wanpela sabsistens ekonomi, i go long wanpela kesmani ekonomi long welpam indastri tasol. I nogat asua olsem long ol yia wok welpam i stap, em i kamapim kes winmani bilong ol smolholda bilong Oro, maski i no stret long olgeta level, na ol welpam smolholda i gat wanpela mak bilong kesmani we i antap moa long dispela bilong ol arapela smolholda kes-krop produsa o growa longpela taim nau, olsem i tok insait long Sosol Asesmen.²⁷⁶
238. Kantri Asistens Strateji (CAS) bilong Papua Niugini ol i redim long 2007 i tok olsem —...*long PNG, poveti em i nogat rot long kisim sevis [we] i karamapim tu nogat rot long yusim ol besik pablik sevis na infrastraksa, na nogat rot long kisim winmani*

²⁷¹ Scoones, I. (1998). Sustainable Rural Livelihoods: A Framework for Analysis. *Institute of Development Studies, Working Paper 72.*

²⁷² Bekim bilong Menesmen, p.2-3. ²⁷³ Ibid., p. 3, ¶ 14. ²⁷⁴ Ibid., p. 17, ¶. 47. ²⁷⁵ Bekim bilong Menesmen, pp. 18-22. ²⁷⁶ Sosol Asesmen Ripot (Jan 2007), p. xv.

na ol rot bilong wok na kisim winmani.||²⁷⁷ Taim rot bilong kisim ol besik pablik sevis na infrastraksa i stap olsem wanpela hevi bilong ol smolholda, ol i nogat luksave olsem —poveti,|| bihainim dispela tok-makim, long sait bilong gat inap rot long kisim winmani.

1. Tasol em i klia olsem i gat planti ol bikpela samting i narakain namel long Oro na WNB long siat bilong strong bilong wok bilong ol smolholda, na ol winmani ol i kisim. Stori bilong PAD i soim olsem averes enual net winmani mak i bilong Hoskins bai 25%, na Bialla 10%, moa long Oro. Narakain long kaikai bilong wok namel long provins i sindaun long namba foa yia bilong wok planim, i go long namba 23 yia, bai sanap long 18.4 tans FFB long wanwan hekta long Hoskins, we Bialla na Oro bai karim 17 tan FFB long wanwan hekta.²⁷⁸
2. Dispela narakain sindaun i bihainim sampela ol samting, olsem histori bilong indastri insait long ol dispela provins, na tu, ol sosol na ekonomik, na kalsarel samting. I gat ol arapela hanmak olsem smolholda welpam prodaksen em i sanap mobeta long WNB moa long Oro provins. Panel tim i kisim toksave olsem bihain long pinis bilong Oro Smolholda Projek long 2001, na inap long nupela kampani Kula/Higaturu i bin kamap long 2010, i no bin gat wok planim bek o fetilaisa i go aut long ol growa: we long tupela Projek sait long WNB provins, kampani i go het long planim bek na tilim fetilaisa. Moa long en, Panel i kisim toksave olsem samting olsem 10% bilong ol smolholda welpam hekta long Oro em ol i lusim, we long Hoskins na Bialla, ol i no lusim ol smolholda planim.
241. Insait long ol toktok wantaim Panel, menesmen bilong Kula/Higaturu Oil Palm i autim wari bilong ol long smolholda sekta long Oro provins. Ol i tok olsem em i nidim bikela halivim na nid bilong kirapim bek. Olsem mipela i tok pinis, long wanpela miting wantaim Panel tim, Kula/Higaturu Oil Palm menesmen i tok i gat nid long lukluk long ol karim na planim bek na menesmen ol dispela blok i stap pinis, na maski long kamapim ol nupela blok long wok infiling. Wari bilong kampani, em ol i autim pinis long Janueri 2011 insait long Implimentesen Progres Ripot long Projek, we ol i tok olsem smolholda sekta i mas lukluk moa long planim bek moa long wok infiling long Oro.²⁷⁹
242. Sampela long ol hevi nogut long welpam prodaksen, olsem i stap long Oro, i bikpela moa long ol hevi bilong bipo long Oro yet. Insait long Projek Komplisen Ripot, Oro Smolholda Projek (1992-2001) — *i gat moa benefit long provins bilong Oro. Wantaim bikpela apim long kes winmani mak long ol pam frut wok karim, laik bilong maket i groa long taim bilong projek. Wanpela nesenel supamaket bisnis i bihainim wok long Popondetta, provinsal kapitel. Go-kam bilong ol kontena long wof i go antap 30% long 1997 i go long 2000 (olgeta mesendais i save kam long solwara).*²⁸⁰ *Kes winmani i kam long pam frut i givim moa rot long kisim winmani, na strongpela moa hauslain ekonomi.*|| Insait long ol yia bihain long pinis bilong olpela projek na lonsim bilong SADP, smolholda welpam sekta

²⁷⁷ Kantri Asistens Strateji bilong Papua Niugini long taim FY08-11, Report No. 41571-PG, November 20, 2007, page 7, ¶. 22. ²⁷⁸ Projek Apresa Dokumen (Novemba 2007), p. 86, Annex 9, Table 3. ²⁷⁹ OPIC Implimentesen Progres Ripot, Janueri 2011, p. 6. ²⁸⁰ Implimentesen Komplisen Ripot, Oro Smolholda Welpam Developmen Projek (June 2002), p. 5.

i go bagarap, we i nogat planim bek o nupela planim, nogat tilim bilong fetilaisa, na nogat wok mentenens long rot.

1. Saiklon Guba i bin bagarapim Oro provins long 2007 (1,800 inap 2,000 haus i bin bagarap na samting olsem 9,500 pipel i bin nogat haus, na olgeta infrastraksa i bin bagarap olgeta, wantaim moa long 56 bris na baret em wara i wasim o brukim olgeta), na dispela i daunim prodaksen na kolektim bilong welpam. Wantaim pasim long wok karimaut bilong SADP, ol luksave long moa benefit long welpam prodaksen, we i bin bikipela moa long olpela projek, i no bin inap long dispela projek nau.
2. Olsem mipela i tok pinis, wok pasin bilong ol smolholda i no wankain —*em bikos long kainkain samting olsem wok-graun sekyuriti i go inap pasin pren namel long ol hauslain.*//²⁸¹ Taim sampela smolholda i save yusim ol teknoloji na strongim wok kamap, ol arapela i save laik givim moa mani long ol arapela krop o ol arapela rot bilong stretim sindaun.²⁸² Planti long ol smolholda Panel tim i bungim long ol raun bilong em i toktok strong long groim welpam; dispela i bihainim moa long wan tausen aplikesen bilong wok infiling i go long OPIC long Oro taim Panel tim i raun i go long Septemba 2010. Tasol wanpela bikipela namba bilong ol smolholda i tokim Panel olsem ol i gat bikipela wari long ol mani ol i rausim, senis long sindaun bilong prais, bikipela wok long en, na ol birua bilong busgraun long sait bilong indastri.

2. Laip Sindaun

245. Long sait bilong laip sindaun, Menesmen bihainim tingting bilong ol Rikwesta, long luksave long dispela —*paradox*// we maski i gat bikipela kes winmani bilong ol smolholda, laip sindaun bilong ol i bagarap na ol bikipela indiketa olsem poveti na hausing, rot long kisim klin wara na helt sevis i soim laip kwolati i go daun na tok olsem em i no wanpela samting i pas long welpam smolholda o eria wantaim welpam prodaksen insait long SADP.²⁸³
246. Menesmen i tok klia olsem dispela paradoks o narakain sindaun i olsem: —*Bikipela kostim bilong wok, nogat inap rot bilong sevim mani, na bikipela sosol na tumbuna wok ol smolholda i mas skelim winmani wantaim ol pren na famili i save strongim dispela pasin na sindaun. Givim sevis bilong gavman long rurel eria (olsem edukesen, helt na infrastraksa) i save mekim dispela hevi i go bikipela moa.*//²⁸⁴

²⁸¹ Vermeulen, S. and N. Goad. (2008). Towards Better Practice in Smallholder Palm Oil Production. *International Institute for Environment and Development*. p. 25. ²⁸² Ibid., p. 25. ²⁸³ Sosol Asesmen Ripot (Janueri 2007), p. 46, ¶ 3.8. ²⁸⁴ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. viii.



Piksa 10: Lukluk i go long wanpela ples long Oro provins

247. Sosol Asesmen i tok moa olsem —*Insait long olgeta tripela projek eria, i nogat inap fokas grup wntaim ol smolholda na ol LLG, em mak bilong senis i kamap long laip bilong ol bihainim kamap bilong welpam. Moa long edukesen, we bikpela wok kamap i kirap long ol yia, we i lukim ol sinia posisen long indastri na gavman i gat ol namba tu jeneresen bilong ol welpam growa, sindaun bilong ol, na moa yet long ol graun setelmen sabdivisen, i bruk daun pinis. Dispela pundaun long laip sindaun em i wanpela paradoks bihainim tingting olsem ol welpam smolholda i gat longpela moa taim (38 long Hoskins, em i olupela skim stret)i gat kesmani mak i winim manimak bilong ol arapela smolholda kes-krop produsa.*²⁸⁵
248. Luksave bilong Panel tim long sindaun bilong pipel i bin kainkain; planti smolholda i sindaun long ol haus lip-saksak, na ol arapela i stap long ol haus-kapa.
249. Panel tim i bungim ol liklik smolholda husat i wok lukautim ol liklik bisnis, sampela i gat ol kar. Panel i no karimaut ol fil-bes stadi



Piksa 11: Lukluk long wanpela ‘welpam’haus long fran, na wanpela lip-saksak haus long baksait, long WNB provins

²⁸⁵ Sosol Asesmen Ripot (January 2007), p. 46, ¶ 3.8.

long ol sosol na ekonomik indiketa o mak, Panel i no inap long mekim toktok long pasin pren namel long ol smolholda welpam winmani na sindaun. Tasol, Panel i serim luksave olsem ol Rikwesta na Menesmen long sait bilong dispela —*paradox*.||

250. Ol Rikwesta i makim tripela bikpela as watpo —*Aninit long SADP, ol smolholda bai sot long ol rot bilong strongim sindaun bilong ol.*||²⁸⁶ Ol dispela em:

- (a) Ol fama i pas long bihainim estet mil;
- (b) Ol Smolholda bai mas peim planti takis bilong produsim welpam (wantaim tu, wanpela nupela mentenens takis); na
- (c) Ol smolholda bai sot long ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani.²⁸⁷

251. Ol dispela hap stori bai lukluk long wanwan long ol dispela samting.

a. Pasin pren wantaim ol Estet Mil

1. Aninit long nuklius estet na smolholda skim (NES), pasin pren namel long miling kampani na ol smolholda em i luksave long wanpela baia tasol na planti ol lain i salim. Insait long wanwan ol Projek eria, miling kampani na ol smolholda i go insait long wokbung long bisnis we wanpela i save givim ol sidling, fetilaisa na ol tuls long dinau, kolektim haves bilong welpam, na bihain, em i save peim ol smolholda bihainim hamas ol i bungim, na ol i save rausim dinau bilong ol long ol samting ol i bin givim pastaim, na ol takis bilong OPRA, OPIC na Sexaca na tu, kostim bilong trenspot. Ol kampani i save givim dinau we i nogat inters, bilong sotpela taim, na ol i save kisim bekim long 50% bilong olgeta Fres Frut Bans winmani insait long tripela mun (bilong ol tuls), wanpela yia (bilong fetilaisa), o tupela yia (bilong ol sidling).²⁸⁸ Aninit long kain skim olsem, taim ol smolholda i nogat narapela rot, na planim welpam tasol, taim ol i mekim olsem, ol i save sindaun olgeta long kampani long kisim olgeta saplai bilong ol, na long mekim wok koleksen.
2. Insait long wanpela rivi bilong welpam indastri long Papua Niugini, sampela i tok olsem i gat tripela samting i save daunim ekonomik benefit bilong ol smolholda, na ol dispela em ol smolholda i stap long laspela hap tru bilong bikpela growa maket we ol i nogat kontrol long prais long maket, na ol i stap long han bilong bikpela²⁸⁹ kampani insait long nuklius estet na smolholda model, na olsem, ol i stap daunbilo tru long longpela veliu sen.
3. Fres Frut Bans prais fomula, we i save makim pe bilong ol smolholda, i soim sindaun namel long ol kampani na ol smolholda. Baim prais bilong FFB i save bihainim wol prais bilong Krud Pam Wel (COP) na Pam Kenal Wel (PKO). Fomula i sanap long FOB veliu bilong ol praimer pam prodak (COP na PKO) i kamaut long wanpela tan Fres Frut Bans. Dispela veliu, em i save bruk i go long skelim pe mak (i kam long kos bilong prodaksen bilong smolholda na miling

²⁸⁶ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 5, ¶ B.3. ²⁸⁷ Ibid ²⁸⁸ Vermeulen, S. and N. Goad. (2008). Towards Better Practice in Smallholder Palm Oil Production. *International Institute for Environment and Development*. p. 21. ²⁸⁹ Anderson, T. (2006). *Oil Palm and Small Farmers in Papua New Guinea*. University of Sydney. Report for the Centre for Environmental Law and Community Rights on the economic prospects for small farmers in PNG's oil palm industry, p. 3.

kampani na ol brek-iven poin) namel long ol smolholda na miling kampani. Bikos salim prais i save bihainim wol sindaun bilong ol komoditi prais, na ol rausim na takis em ol mak i stap pinis, winmani bilong ol smolholda i save bihainim tu, we i sanap bihainim FFB rivi u wok na i save gat rivi u olgeta wanwan yia. Ol bipo rivi u bilong prais fomula i bin kamap long 1990, 1996, 1998, na 2001, na narapela bai kamap aninit long SADP.

255. Long lukluk bilong ol Rikwesta, ol FFB rivi u i bagarapim —*prais long lukluk gut long ol kampani taim em i katim kos na veliu bilong kastomari graun, na luksave long ol komesal potnait pe na kostim bilong ol welpam mil.*²⁹⁰ Wapela indipenden wok-glasim bilong ol dispela rivi u wen wapela saveman konashten bilong Panel i bin glasim, i painim olsem long bipo, FFB fomula i bin lukluk gut moa long ol kampani, maski long maket prais bilong welpam – we i wok long daunim bilip bilong ol smolholda long ol mil kampani, na fomula ol i yusim. I no long taim i go pinis, ol fam-get prais na mil sasi wok long mobeta na i nogat paul makim. Tasol, Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok olsem long 2001 FFB Praising Fomula Rivi u — *ol miling kampani...i glasim ol namba ol konsalten i yusim long kalkuletim kostim bilong prodaksen, na ol i tok orait long peiaut mak bilong 57% //* i go long ol smolholda, na i no 59% olsem i stap long Praising Rivi u.²⁹¹
256. Menesmen i luksave tu olsem FFB rivi u em i wapela bikpela samting bilong tokpait long en. SADP i sapotim wapela FFB prais fomula rivi u, na ol tems ov refrens i stret pinis. Dispela rivi u bai — *tok long i mas i gat senis bilong strongim wok bilong praising fomula, wantaim luksave long i gat wapela klia na stretpela praising fomula i stap na olgeta wanwan mil kampani i mas bihainim. Moa yet, nau we FFB prais em FFB baia i save makim, em i mas gat taim bilong sekim, na wanem ol arapela rivi u bilong fomula na ol enual odit bilong FFB prais i go long smolholda bai kamap.*²⁹²
257. Maski long ol dispela hevi wantaim ol FFB prais, indipenden wok glasim Panel konsalten i mekim i tok olsem i gat inap evidens—moa long ol WNB smolholda, na tu long sampela long Oro—olsem welpam i givim bikpela winmani long planti ol smolholda.

²⁹⁰ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 5. ²⁹¹ Bekim bilong Menesmen, paragraf 61 i tok olsem —*Long kamap long dispela peiaut mak i stap nau bilong 57 pesen, wapela bikpela wok glasim bilong ol kostim bilong ol smolholda na miling kampani olsem hap bilong 2001 rivi u bilong FFB praising fomula. Kalkulesen bilong ol smolholda kostim bilong wok prodaksen wantaim olgeta fiks kos na dispela i save senis, wantaim ol leba kostim (bilong kliarim graun, planim na wok mentenens), ol material kostim (bilong ol sidling, fetilaisa na masin), PNGOPRA levi, the OPIC levi, ol FFB trenspot kostim, Sexava levi, 45 graun rent (bilong ol LSS blok), ol growa asosiesen membasip fi, kostim bilong dinau (intares pemen na benk fi) na konstraksen kostim bilong ol smolholda hausing.*⁴⁶ 2001 FFB praising rivi u i rekomendim sampela ol senis long praising fomula i stap long dispela taim na apim mak long smolholda peiaut skel long 55 pesen i go 59 pesen long soim ol kostim bilong prodaksen long smolholda na miling kampani wantaim, na ol smolholda winmani mak long salim FFB. Ol miling kampani, i kwestenim ol namba ol konsalten i yusim long kaunim ol kos bilong ol smolholda, na i wanbel long apim peiaut skel i go long 57 pesen bilong ol smolholda. //

²⁹² Terms of Reference, FFB Price Review and Audit (November 2010).



Piksa 12: Panel tim i mitim ol plesmanmeri long Oro provins

258. Panel i luksave tu olsem aninit long Rauntebol long Sastenabol Welpam (RSPO) rot, na bihain long sanapim bilong wanpela Smolholda Tas Fos long 2006, moa luksave i go long strongim sindaun bilong ol smolholda. Dispela em i luksave bilong Panel tu taim em i bungim menesmen bilong Kula/Higaturu Welpam, kampani i lukautim olgeta wok welpam long Oro. Dispela bai lukim moa banis long ol smolholda, tasol taim dispela wanpela baia tasol i stap yet, bai ol smolholda i sindaun yet long han bilong ol mil kampani. Olsem na bikpela isiu em i mak Projek, we i toke m bai strongim sindaun bilong ol smolholda, i ken halivim long stretim ples tupela i bung na pilai long en. Panel i tok strong tu long wari bilong en long ol samting i kamap long FFB rivi²⁹³, we, long lukluk bilong Menesmen i no kamap yet, long wanem as, Menesmen i no inap long toksave.
1. Wanpela rekomendesen bilong ol smolholda i kam long Wol Benk rivi²⁹³ long ol welpam wok bisnis bilong en, em long —*strongim mak bilong toktok wantaim ol smolholda mausmanmeri na ol smolholda koporetiv. Ol smolholda asosiesen i save mekim bikpela wok long tok paitim ol wokbisnis wantaim ol welpam kampani.*²⁹⁴ Insait long olgeta taim Panel i bungim ol smolholda, olgeta i tok olsem ol i nogat bilip long Growas Asosiesen bilong ol, na ol i pilim olsem ol asosiesen i no makim laik bilong ol stret, maski ol yet i makim ol long mekim dispela wok.
 2. Olsem na Panel i luksave olsem pasin wokbung namel long ol mil kampani na ol smolholda i kamap mobeta, ol isiu bilong smolholda i sindaun na han bilong ol mil, na ol i nogat inap banis insait long bikpela welpam indastri. Tru tumas, Panel i bungim tingting olsem sindaun bilong ol smolholda bai no inap

²⁹³ According to Aide Memoire of the Fifth Implementation Support Mission: April 15–19, 2011, ¶ 28-29, OPIC has informed the Bank that the —*FFB Price Formula Review has been suspended due to notification received from the Independent Consumer and Competition Commission (ICCC) alleging contravention of the ICCC Act if OPIC goes forward with the FFB Price Review study. The allegation is that OPIC is participating in a price fixing arrangement. OPIC has had discussions with the ICCC but the issue is yet to be resolved*// and that —*OPIC does not wish to be embroiled in litigation and it was agreed (by the PSC Chairman and the OPIC Chairman) that the review would be put on hold pending resolution of the matter by DAL and the ICCC.*//

²⁹⁴ The World Bank Group Framework and IFC Strategy for Engagement in the Palm Oil Sector, p. 24.

kamap gut sapos ol arapela wok i no kamap long strongim sanap bilong ol smolholda na mausmanmeri bilong ol.

b. Ol Levi na Didaksen

261. Ol smolholda i save peim kain kain levi na didaksen long ol kampani kredit o dinau long kostim bilong planim, fetilaisa, na tuls, na Inspeksen Panel i harim olgeta smolholda i komplem long hevi bilong ol dispela long winmani mak bilong ol. Ol i tok olsem bikpela hevi bilong ol dispela takis na didaksen i wok kaikaim bikpela hap winmani bilong ol, na i nogat klia wok long kaunim bilong ol dispela didaksen. Sampela i komplem olsem maski ol i peim takis long OPIC, ol i save kisim liklik tru long ol ekstensen sevis. Wapela smolholda i tok olsem olgeta winmani bilong em, ol i rausim long wapela dinau bilong haus em i kisim moa long 20 yia i go pinis, na em i save olsem em i pinisim olgeta dinau bilong em pinis. Olgeta rekot bilong benk i bin bagarap long paia sampela yia i go pinis, tasol ol didaksen i wok long go het yet, maski em i pinisim olgeta dinau bilong em pinis. Taim Panel i toktok long dispela wantaim OPIC, em i kisim toksave olsem ol bai stretim dispela. Dispela em i wapela bikpela kes tru, tasol em i kamap pinis. We i nogat klia pasin long didaksen, na ol i no stretim hevi long en.
262. Sosol Asesmen i luksave olsem — *i gat rot olsem ol bikpela ret bilong bekim dinau (inap long 50% long winmani bilong wanwan mun) i save mekim planti i les long bekim ol dinau, taim ol bekim mani i save go het yet taim prais bilong welpam i go daun, na i gat planti askim long kesmani (olsem skul fi o kastomari wok).*²⁹⁵ Em i klia olsem ol smolholda i pilim strongpela daunim long sindaun bilong ol, na dispela i no strongim sindaun bilong ol. Tru tumas, WBG rivi long ol welpam bisnis bilong em, i tok tu olsem — *ol smolholda i no save klia tumas long ol toktok long ol kontrak, na dispela i save kirapim hevi long bihain. Ol Kontrak i mas klia na givim stretpela luksave long olgeta isiu long sait bilong givim graun na kisim na bekim dinau.*²⁹⁶
263. Bihainim dispela tingting, askim bilong narapela levi o takis gen bilong Rot Mentenens Tras Fan i kamap wapela bikpela tokpait bilong ol smolholda. Dispela isiu bai gat glasim long Septa 6.

c. Ol Arapela Rot: Ol arapela rot long kisim winmani

264. Planim welpam i nidim bikpela taim na risos bilong ol smolholda. Bikpela kostim bilong planim welpam long tupela hekta, sapos yu rausim kotim bilong leba o wok, em K3165, oslem dinau long mil kampani. Taim ol i planim ol sidling, welpam i ken karim inap 25 yia, tasol ol smolholda i mas wetim tripela yia pastaim long ol i ken stat rausim frut, we long dispela taim, ol i nidim ol arapela rot long kisim winmani. Taim em i sanap pinis, graun i no inap gutpela long ol arapela kes krop o long yusim ol arapela wok long en. Narakain long ol arapela kes-krop, yu ken havestim o kisim frut bilong welpam olgeta tupela wik,

²⁹⁵ Sosol Asesmen Ripot (Janueri 2007), p. 53, ¶ 3.9. ²⁹⁶ Wol Benk Grup Fremwok na IFC Strateji bilong Wok insait long Welpam Sekta, p. 24. ²⁹⁷ Projek Apresal Pepa, p. 85.

na givim gutpela rot bilong kisim winmani, maski ol prais i save bihainim sindaun bilong ol wol prais.

265. Sosol Asesmen i soim olsem planti welpam smolholda long Oro long groim ol arapela kes-krop (25% kofi na 32% kakao).²⁹⁸ Em i tok klia olsem —*Ol VOP smolholda i lukim planti kain kes-krop olsem wanpela rot bilong sanapim banis agensim senis bilong ol komoditi prais, na bai ol i senisim leba na invesmen bilong ol i go insait long kain kain kes krop bihainim ol prais na winmani long hatwok bilong ol.* // ²⁹⁹ Taim ol arapela kes-krop i wok kamap, i nogat sapot infrastraksa olsem dinau, ekstensen sevis, o koleksen sistem, olsem long sait bilong welpam.

1. Wanpela 2001 stadi long welpam sekta long Papua Niugini³⁰⁰ i painim aut olsem — *bikpela senis long wok mak namel long wanwan ol smolholda em bikos i gat sampela arapela hevi long wok-graun sekyuriti i go long ol pasin pren namel long ol hauslain. Taim sampela ol smolholda i givim bikpela hatwok long yusim ol teknoloji na groim kaikai mak bilong ol, ol arapela i invest moa long ol arapela krop o arapela rot bilong kisim winmani. Long ol bikpela plantesen kampani, wok welpam em i wanpela long planti ol arapela agrikalsa na non-agrikalsa rot bilong kisim winmani.* // ³⁰¹
2. Ol lain i raitim 2001 stadi i lukluk tu olsem long Papua Niugini smolholda, —*i gat luksave olsem ol smolholda i gat ol bikpela wok i stap moa long bikpela bilong haves* // em i wanpela nupela wok pasin na pinis bilong bekim isiu bilong nogat inap wokmak na mak bilong haves i kam long ol smolholda.³⁰²

268. Ausait long ol ekspot kes-krop, olgeta smolholda Panel i askim i wok gaden, we bihainim Sosol Asesmen —*em i wanpela bikpela hap bilong laip sindaun bilong planti ol LSS na VOP smolholda, moa yet ol meri... Longpela taim sindaun bilong ol smolholda sekta i sindaun long bikpela hap kaikai na winmani sekyuriti i kam bihainim rot long kisim graun bilong wok gaden.* // ³⁰³

²⁹⁸ Sosol Asesmen Ripot (Janueri 2007), p.44. ²⁹⁹ Ibid. ³⁰⁰ Koczberski, G., Curry, G. and Gibson, K. (2001). Improving Productivity of the Smallholder Oil Palm Sector in Papua New Guinea: a socio-economic study of the Hoskins and Popondetta schemes. Research Unit for the Study of Societies in Change, Curtin University of Technology, Perth, Western Australia. ³⁰¹ Vermeulen and Goad (2008), p. 25. ³⁰² Ibid., p.33, Table 6. ³⁰³ Social Assessment Report (January 2007), pp. xiii-xiv.



Piksa 13: Panel tim i raun lukim wampela kaikai gaden long Oro provins

269. Sosol Asesemen i tok strongim moa olsem — *wok gaden bilong kaikai em i wampela bikipela luksave long laip bilong ol smolholda, moa yet long ol meri, na planti ol smolholda hauslain i save sindaun moa long wok gaden long inapim nid bilong ol olgeta de. Planti LSS na VOP smolholda i save groim inap kaikai long inapim ol kaikai nid bilong ol, na gaden kaikai prodaksen bilong salim long ol lokol maket i save givim ol LSS meri wampela bikipela rot bilong kisim winmani.*³⁰⁴ Ol kaikai gaden em namba wan hap bilong kaikai sekyuriti, moa yet long ol LSS blok we ol hauslain i save sindaun moa long ol gaden, moa long ol VOP produsa. Ol kaikai gaden i givim bikipela banis agensim senis long prais bilong welpam.³⁰⁵
270. Ol hap tok i kam long stadi bilong Bashkow long Orokaiva kalsa long Sapta 2, i tok olsem — *namba wan bikipela samting long em i stap strong yet em rot long kisim ol tumbuna graun bilong gaden i save givim kaikai we Orokaiva i save yusim long sindaun, na yusim long strongim sanap bilong ol long taim bilong ol bikipela kaikai na senis pasin wantaim ol arapela.*³⁰⁶ Bikos Sosol Asesmen i no tokpaitim sosol na kalsarel luksave bilong ol kaikai gaden long Orokaiva, SADP i mas lukluk moa long graun bilong wok gaden bilong ol VOP Orokaiva na i no bilong ol setela asples grup husat i sindaun long ol Len Setolmen Skim (LSS). Sapta 5 i tokpaitim we dispela i kamap insait long disain bilong ol infiling fom long SADP.
271. Olgeta ol smolholda Panel tim i bungim long fil visit bilong en i tokaut olsem ol gaden bilong ol, we i stap longwe tru long ples ol i sindaun, we ol i mas ron sampela awa long kamap long en. Panel i tok tu olsem long planti smolholda, moa yet ol meri, gaden em i namba wan wok bilong ol long kisim kaikai na winmani, na winmani bilong welpam bai kamap namba tu rot bilong ol. Sampela saveman long Papua Niugini

³⁰⁴ Sosol Asesmen Ripot (Janueri 2007), p. 42.

³⁰⁵ Anderson (2006) i tok tu olsem — *...kastomari graun em i bikipela sabsistens veliu, na tu ol arapela kes-krop rot i gat strong. Dispela i stap long ol praktikel sevei, we planti tai mi no long mani. Koczberski et al. i save olsem samting olsem 80% bilong kaikai long Kavui na Popondetta LLS fama i kam long ol gaden kaikai, na planti meri (100% on LSS blok na 52% long ol VOP blok) i save salim maket kaikai olgeta taim, na planti i save sindaun long maket olsem namba wan rot bilong kisim winmani (Koczberski, Curry & Gibson 2001: 50 & 57-58).* ||

³⁰⁶ Bashkow, I. (2006). The Meaning of Whitemen: Race and Modernity in the Orokaiva Cultural World, p. 236.

i toktok long pasin bilong painim kaikai|| long sampela smolholda long welpam prodaksen, em ol bai haves tai mi gat nid long kisim moa winmani, olsem ol skul fi ol i mas peim.



Piksa 14: Panel tim i raun lukim wampela kaikai gaden long Oro provins

272. Sosol Asesmen i tok olsem i mobeta long —...kamapim bilong ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani i mas stap||³⁰⁷ na —...promotim bilong ol arapela winmani rot i noken stap long ol blok i wok kisim planim bek, tasol long wampela bikpela hap bilong ol jeneral ekstensen wok bilong OPIC.||³⁰⁸ Asesmen i tok olsem sot long save na luksave long welpam indastri long strong bilong ol arapela wok gaden long laip sindaun bilong ol smolhoilda na i lukim ol dispela wok olsem ol namba tu wok.³⁰⁹ Asesmen i painim salens bilong bungim na bildim sindaun long dispela ol polisi we i save strongim bris namel long smolholda sekta na bikpela rijenal ekonomi.³¹⁰
273. Panel i luksave tu olsem isiu bilong skelim graun bilong kaikai gaden i kamap insait long Projek bihainim Infil Planim Sab-menual na Infol Plenting Apruval Fom. Ol dispela i save larim infil planim wok long kamap long ol haus gaden tasol, sapos (i) apliken i gat narapela wankain blok na i gutpela bilong ol kaikai gaden, o (ii) sapos apliken i gat kaikai gaden we i wok inapim kaikai na nid bilong olgeta hauslain.³¹¹

³⁰⁷

Anderson (2006) askim ol smolholda long strongim tingting bilong ol long stap insait long ol arapela kes krop sistem bihainim glasim bilong em long tupela pailot stadi, wampela long Madang na narapela klostu long Popondetta, we em i painim olsem —bikpela winmani mak long tupela grup i no go long ol welpam fama, tasol ol lain long Madang husat i save groim na salim tripela o foapela kes-krop, em tupela domestik krop (olsem pinat, buai na wanwan frut o kumu), we i givim bikpela winmani taim ol growa i salim kaikai bilong ol (long maket o sait bilong rot); na wampela o tupela saplimentari ekspot krop (olsem kakao na vanilla), we i opim ol maket bilong ol. Tupela bilong dispela grup i mekim 14,000 na 16,000 kina olgeta yia. Bikpela mak winmani bilong welpam i bin hap long dispela. Taim welpam em i namba wan kes winmani rot bilong ol lain long Popondetta eria, i gat arere mak bilong ol winmani ol liklik fama i kisim long welpam.||

³⁰⁸

Sosol Asesmen Ripot (Janueri 2007), p. 63. ³⁰⁹ Ibid., p. 45. ³¹⁰ Ibid.. ³¹¹ OPIC SADP Wel Pam Infilling Apruval Fom, Ol Askim namba 7.3a na 7.3 b.

274. Menesmen i tokluksave long ol rot wok stretim aninit long SADP bai halivim long brukim ol rot winmani taim mobeta rot i stap long karim ol arapela krop na prodak na i no welpam tasol. Menesmen i luksave tu olsem sampela ol komyuniti developmen wok i kamap aninit long Komponen 2 i ken strongim ol projek long ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani.³¹² Moabeta rot bai givim planti gutpela samting long komyuniti, na apim mak bilong winmani o li kisim bikos i gat mobeta trenspot long karim ol arapela kes-krop (wantaim tu ol kaikai krop) bilong salim, antap long strongim trenspot bilong ol welpam FFB.
275. I no klia yet sapos ol wok aninit long Komponen 2 bilong Projek bai opim moa rot bilong kisim winmani, maski mobeta komyuniti infrastraksa i wok long kamap long sampela eria. Komponen 2 em, wanpela hap liklik pailot, olsem na bai nogat inap senis long planti ol smolholda.³¹³ Tasol, nogat wanpela samting long dispela tupela samting (mobeta rot o komyuniti developmen projek aninit long Komponen 2) i save lukluk long opim rot bilong kisim winmani namel long ol smolholda. Dispela rot bilong stretim moa rot bilong kisim winmani em i gutpela long wanpela Projek i laik —...*apim na strongim agrikalsa wok na gutpela wokpasin long smolholda welpam prodaksen insait long tripela bikpela NES long kantri*|| na wanpela developmen astingting long —...*apim, bihainim gutpela rot, level bilong wok insait long ol wanwan komyuniti na lokol developmen rot bilong ol long apim welpam winmani na stap bilong ol asples pipel.*||³¹⁴

3. Ol Rot bilong Sevim Mani

276. Strong bilong wantok sistem, we ol Papua Niugini i save senis long ol sosol na ekonomik wok wantaim husat i save long wankain tokples, olsem i stap long Sapta 2. long tok klia long ol hevi ol smolholda i gat long sevim mani, ol i —...*painim tripela banis long wok seving. Namba wan, sosol presa long skelim mani long famili em i bikpela tru. Long pasin tumbuna, luksave long komyuniti na biknem bilong wanwan manmeri na grup em i pas wantaim skelim bilong winmani bihainim ol sosol na famili netwok. Sindaun, biknem na luksave i no bin pas wantaim wok bilong bungim winmani bilong kaikai o bilong wok bisnis bilong wanwan, tasol long skelim dispela winmani bihainim ol sosol netwok o grup projek we i ken strongim sindaun bilong husat i givim, na ol arapela grup memba. Ol dispela astingting i stap strong namel long ol LSS na moa yet long ol VOP growa, bikos planti long ol i gat ol kastomari wok long taim bilong kisim pe long welpam, long larim ol pipel long givim hap o olgeta pe long grup wok. Na tu, i gat bikpela kalsarel wok, na ol blok holda long skelim wanpela bikpela hap long winmani bilong ol namel long hauslain, na ol blokholda i save gat ol lain famili i bihainim ol i go long taunt aim ol i go long kesim ol pe sek bilong ol, o rausim mani long benk, sapos pe bilong ol i go stret long benk akaun. Tru tumas, long wanpela blokholda long tok nogat long askim bilong ol lain famili long welpam pemen bilong en em long noken pulim nem nogut long em yet.*||³¹⁵

³¹² Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 17, ¶ 48. ³¹³ Update Component 2, likely to be restructured. ³¹⁴ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 8, ¶ 26-27. ³¹⁵ Sosol Asesmen Ripot, p. 51, ¶ 3.9.

277. Panel tim i bungim sampela ol meri smolholda long WNB husat i opim ol benk akaun, wantaim tok orait bilong ol man bilong ol, long sevim mani, long bildim haus, na long salim ol pikinini i go skul yunivesiti. Tasol bikpela mak bilong ol smolholda, moa ol meri, i komplem long ol i no inap long sevim mani, taim welpam winmani i save lus long dring bia, pilai laki, na pasin pamuk (lukim narapela seksen i kam), o long skelim winmani i go long ol arapela lain famili husat i save kam na stap planti krismas. Planti taim, wanem samting ol i nidim long skul bilong pikinini na ol bas fe, na mani bilong haus, i go aut long winmani i kam long Mama Lus Frut Skim.
278. Sosol Asesmen i tok strongim olsem, —...*bikos i nogat gutpela rot long sevim mani long banisim sampela hap winman i long wok kastom na senis ekonomi na ol arapela askim long winmani we i lukim ol growa olsem wanpela bikpela banis long ol yet i sevim mani. Bikos i nogat gutpela rot long sevim mani, em i bikpela samting i stap long as long i nogat wok i go het long planti welpam blok...*³¹⁶||

4. Ol Birua bilong Kes Winmani

279. Wanpela narapela han isiu em birua bilong kes winmani. Sosol Asesmen i mekim sampela rekomendesen long lukluk long planti ol hevi long komyuniti i kamap insait long wok asesmen. PIM i tok paitim ol dispela olsem sampela ol —...*eksen na rot bilong halivim long kamapim gutpela bilong SADP na abrusim ol birua long busgraun na komyuniti*^{317 318} *long ol wok bilong SADP*||(lukim Tebol 2.1 insait long PIM).
280. Ol birua bilong welpam prodaksen i no bin kisim planti luksave bipo, tasol ol i bin kamap ples klia long pinis bilong Oro Smolholda Projek long 2001. Dispela klem i stap nau i go moa long tokmakim ol hevi na as bilong ol. Hia mipela i lukluk long ol birua bilong kamap bilong bikpela winmani mak insait long wanpela komyuniti wantaim strongpela luksave long wok bilong komyuniti long skelim winmani; na laik bilong ol manmeri long kisim kwik mani na pinisim kwik bikos i nogat narapela rot long sevim mani, o givim long wanpela sistem bilong senisim samting insait long wanpela bikpela famili (we i save laikim planti kain kain samting).
281. Ol dispela wok kamap i no wankain long olgeta welpam growa. Long 2001, Vigus i tok olsem —*ol gutpela komyuniti wok kamap bilong smolholda skim i stap long as long planti blok i no kamap pastaim, na nogat winmani i stap, wok na moa yet, konstraksen na mentenens bilong ol rot.*³¹⁹|| Vigus i tok tu, olsem sampela birua bilong graun setelmen skim we i pulim sampela ol wairaman bilong Oro long 1990s, wanpela taim we i gat planti meknais long politiks long kantri. Vigus i luksave tu olsem ol gutpela komyuniti wok kamap em i mobeta long loa na oda sindaun, insait long ol rurel eria, na long planim bilong

³¹⁶ Social Assessment Report (January 2007), p. 52. ³¹⁷ Project Implementation Manual (August 2007), Main Document, p. 10, ¶ 2.2. ³¹⁸ Ibid., p. 11. ³¹⁹ Vigus, T.D. (2001) Environment impact review of current project and recommendations for considerations in any future development. Study of Oro Oil Palm Development Project (Ln. 3485-PNG), p. 29.

ol smolholda blok. Dispela em bikos ol nupela blok ona i kirapim ol arapela wok bisnis na i lusim pasin bikhet. Panel tim i harim wanpela stori long bipo —raskol|| husat i lusim paitgan na pasin stil bihain long em i planim wanpela welpam blok long 2001 na em i kisim winmani. Tasol long 2001 yet, ADS (Papua Niugini) i ripot olsem —*Ol birua bilong welpam i karamapim ol apim long dring bia insait long ol projek eria wantaim ol komyuniti hevi long taim bilong kisim pemen bilong salim FFB. Ol poka masin i go insait long sampela welpam provins husat i gat planti ol hevi bilong pilai laki i kamap bihainim welpam developmen na kam.*||³²¹

282. Moa yet, long tupela fil raun i go long Wes Nu Briten na Oro, ol Panel memba i harim planti komplek, long moa meri, long ol komyuniti hevi i kam wantaim ol kes winmani bilong welpam. Ol hevi, ol i tok i save kamap moa long taim bilong kisim ol welpam sekmani, na dispela em pilai laki, dring bia, pasin pamuk na pait long haus o domestik vailens. Ol dispela hevi i no wanwan hevi tasol. Ol i kamap laip sindaun insait long planti eria i save groim welpam. Ol i tokaut street long ol miting long ples. Ol meri i pilim olsem ol i save karim ol hevi long ol dispela birua na pasin pait, na ol i mas holim strong famili, painim kaikai, na sevim inap mani bilong lukautim helt na skul bilong famili na pikinini.
283. Ol Sosol Asesmen pepa bilong planti ol sosioekonomik hevi i bungim ol smolholda; sampela i sut stret long welpam prodaksen, na sampela, nogat. Asesmen i tokmakim tu ol birua bilong stap bilong HIV/AIDS: —*Bihainim ol namba long 1997-2003, Sels (2004) i ken toksave olsem moa long 17% long welpam manemri long WNB i ken HIV positiv long 2017 (wankain long level bilong Saut Afrika tude) wantaim bikpela bagarap long strong bilong ol wokman (p.53),*// tokmakim poveti o pasin turangu na bikpela birua rot olsem ol samting i kamap.³²²
284. Long bungim tok, planti long ol komyuniti birua ol Rikwesta i tokmakim na i stap insait long Sosol Asesmen, na i kisim luksave bilong Panel, em ol bikpela asua, maski em i no kamap long SADP stret o lon welpam yet, tasol i kam wantaim makro ekonomik senis long sabsistens o wok gaden, i go long kes-krop. Em i hap bilong rot ol asples komyuniti i bungim long senis bihainim kamap bilong kes-krop na kamap bilong kesmani, na traim long holim strong ol tumbuna pasin bilong ol, na go insait long wanpela maket ekonomi.

E. Bungim Tok long ol Luksave bilong Panel long ol Birua

285. Em nau, long sait bilong bikpela sut tok bilong ol Rikwesta olsem groim welpam i no daunim pasin turangu o strongim sindaun bilong ol smolholda, Panel i luksave olsem long sait bilong winmani, groim welpam i apim mak bilong winmani ol i kisim.

³²⁰ Ibid., p. 29. ³²¹ ADS (PNG). (May 2001). Study of the smallholder oil palm sector, Achievements and potential for future development. Oro Smallholder Development Project. p. 27. ³²² Sosol Asesmen Ripot (Janueri 2007), p. 53, ¶ 3.10.

Tasol, Panel i luksave olsem straksa bilong indastri, i pasim strong bilong ol smolholda na mausmanmeri i pasim ol smolholda long kisim inap skel bilong ol veliu indastri i kamapim. Panel i wanbel tu wantaim ol Rikwesta na Menesmen olsem bikipela moa winmani mak i no save kamapim mobeta sindaun insait long laip sindaun bilong ol smolholda long planti as, na moa yet long pasin tumbuna na kalsa bilong ol smolholda yet, i nogat inap rot bilong kisim winmani, na nogat rot i stap long sevim mani insait long ol Projek eria.

F. Ol Benk Polisi na Prosidia bilong bihainim

1. Dispela seksen i givim sotpela stori long ol polisi na prosidia we i sut stret long sosio-ekonomik hevi ol Rikwesta i klemim. Dispela em Indijines Pipels Polisi (OP/BP 4.10); Poveti Ridaksen (OP 1.00); Invesmen Lending (OP 10.00); OMS 2.20 long Projek Apresal na Ekonomik Iveluesen bilong ol Invesmen Operesen (OP/BP 10.04).
2. Glasim wok bihainim wantaim wanwan long ol dispela polisi antap bai kisim moa glasim long ol seksen daunbilo, wantaim Indijines Pipels Polisi olsem bikipela mama fremwok bilong wok glasim.

1. Indijines Pipels Polisi (OP/BP 4.10)

288. Olsem i tok pinis long Sapta 2, SADP i kirapim Indijines Pipels Polisi OP/BP 4.10 bikos planti long ol pipel insait long Projek eria i gat luksave olsem ol asples. Polisi i tok ol projek Benk i givim mani halivim long en na i sut long ol asples pipel —*em ol i disainim ai ol Asples Pipel i kisim ol sosol na ekonomik benefit we i bihainim stret pasin kalsa na luksave long meri na ol lain tumbuna tu.*³²³ Moa yet, ol kain projek i mas —*gat ol rot bilong (a) abrusim ol birua long ol Asples Pipel komyuniti; o (b) taim i nogat rot long abrusim, long daunim strong bilong en, slekim em o givim kompensesen long ol birua.*³²⁴ Olsem, na OP/BP 4.10 i askim olsem SADP disain i mas givim ol sosol na ekonomik benefit, abrusim ol birua, na daunim o slekim o givim kompensesen long ol dispela birua.

2. Poveti Ridaksen (OP 1.00)

289. Dispela polisi i givim wanpela bikipela fremwok bilong ol Benk wok, na i tok olsem “Misin bilong Benk em long daunim poveti o pasin turangu. Poveti o pasin turangu i save karamapim ol arapela rot (na ol banis), i nogat maus na makim, na i ken bungim planti birua. Sapot bilong Benk long rausim pasin turangu long ol wok, i bihainim wok bilong en, long opim moa rot, strongim save, na strongim banis. Wantaim dispela bikipela fremwok, wanpela bikipela wok em long promotim ol bikipela groa long daunbilo i go antap, bikos em i gat nem long rausim pasin turangu.”³²⁵

³²³ OP 4.10, ¶ 1. ³²⁴ Ibid. ³²⁵ OP

1.00, ¶ 1.

3. Projek Apresal (OMS 2.20)

290. OMS 2.20 i luksave olsem ol komyuniti sindaun em i namel long sikipela hap bilong wanpela projek disain long kisim wok skelim. Long paitim tok long ol komyuniti sait, OMS 2.20 i tok olsem —*disain bilong projek i sindaun long strongpela luksave long komyuniti ron na sindaun bilong ol wok prodaksen: (a) we ol benefisari bai inap kisim, yusim na bosim wok bilong ol risos i stap long eria; (b) we straksa bilong haus na famili sistem i stap insait long eria i ken senisim strong bilong developmen na ol banis bilong en, inap wokman na pasin bilong papagraun luksave...*³²⁶ OMS 2.20 tasol i tok tu olsem —*long planti projek, wanpela bikpela hap bilong fainensal apresal em skelim strong ol fainal benefisari i gat na pulim ol i go insait long karimaut projek na operesen. I mas i gat glasim long strong bilong ol fainal benefisari long peim guds na sevis...*³²⁷ || na —*Insait long planti agrikalsa projek, ol fam baset i save redi long glasim winamani bilong pulim ol fama long go insait long wok faming na strong bilong ol long inapim dinau bekim bilong fam kredit.*³²⁸ ||
291. OMS 2.20 i luksave tu olsem apresal i nidim wanpela rivi bilong —*...ol maketing rot na ol prais bilong kisim; na skelim ol kostim na winmani long sekim strong bilong bisnis, we em i ken wanpela fama, wanpela praivet bisnismen, o wanpela praivet o pablik bisnis, bihainim wanem kain projek yet...*³²⁹ OM 2.20 i tok moa olsem —*...ol rot bilong maketing i stap bilong strongim gutpela ron bilong projek i ken karamapim (a) trenspot, prosesim na pekim na salim bilong projek autput; [na] (b) maket infomesen sistem bilong ol saplai, diman o askim na prais bai ol baia na sela i ken mekim mobeta disisen...*³³⁰ //

4. Ekonomik Iveluesen bilong ol Invesmen Wok (OP 10.04)

1. Dispela polisi em long mekim olgeta projek Benk i givim mani long en long promotim ol developmen astingting bilong borowa kantri.
Bilong olgeta invesmen projek, Benk i mas karimaut wanpela ekonomik wok glasim long sekim sapos projek i kamapim moa net benefit bilong ekonomi moa long ol arapela rot bilong yusim ol risos em i save yusim. Skelim tiingting long ol arapela rot em i wanpela bikpela wok askim. Ekonomik iveluesen bilong ol projek i save karamapim fainensal, teknikal, sosiolojikal na envairomen luksave.
2. Ol Projek i mas kisim glasim long siat bilong ekonomik, fainensal, institusenal, na envairomen birua. Namba wan as long dispela wok glasim, em long painim skop bilong strongim projek disain, apim mak bilong veliu bilong projek, na daunim sans long birua na wok daunim.

³²⁶ OMS 2.20 – Project Appraisal, January 1984, ¶. 58. ³²⁷ OMS 2.20 – Project Appraisal, January 1984, ¶. 43. ³²⁸ Ibid. ³²⁹ Ibid., ¶. 53. ³³⁰ Ibid., ¶. 54.

G. Glasim bilong Panel long Komplaiens o bihainim ol Benk Polisi

294. Dispela seksen i karamapim glasim bilong Panel long wok bihainim Menesmen i mekim wantaim ol dispela Benk Polisi. Em i glasim klem bilong ol Rikwesta olsem welpam faming i no save daunim poveti o pasin turangu na wanpeal strongim long sindaun bilong ol. Namba wan hap em glasim bilong Panel long makro level, na namba tu hap i glasim ekonomik skelim bilong Projek, na glasim bilong ol winmani i go long ol smolholda, na laspela hap em i glasim long ol rot bilong strongim laip sindaun bilong ol smolholda, moa yet ol seavings na arapela rot bilong kisim winmani. Dispela seksen i pinis wantaim ol laspela tok-luksave bilong ol dispela samting.

1. Poveti Ridaksen

295. SADP i lukluk long daunim poveti, bihainim —(a) *ol rot wokstrongim*; (b) *apim winmai bilong haus bilong ol smolholda i groim welpam (long ol welpam blok i stap pinis) bihainim moa wok na daunim bilong ol maketing kostim*; (c) *apim winmani mak bilong ol smolholda i planim ol nupela welpam long wok infiling*; (iv) *strongim ol kain kain sekta wok i lukluk long strongim smolholda welfe (olsem ol MLFS)*; na (v) *strongim rot i go long ol bikipela sosol na ekonomik infrastraksa aninit long Komponen 2 bilong Projek.*³³¹
296. Bekim bilong Menesmen i strong olsem Projek bai no inap pasim ol ekonomi laik na em bai strongim ol winmani, apim wokmak bilong ol smolholda, na daunim ol kostim bilong trenspot na makting. Bikipela disain bilong Projek em long strongim wok kes-krop namel long ol rurel smolholda na trenspot netwok bilong ol rurel fama. Ol dispela em ol bikipela hap bilong ol bipo na nau Papua Niugini Kantri Halivim Strateji.³³² olsem na em i bihainim tu polisi bilong Benk (OP/BP 1.00) long Daunim Poveti o pasin turangu.
297. Panel i tokluksave olsem Projek em ol i disainim bilong apim winmani bilong ol smolholda welpam produsa husat i laik wok insait long Projek. Na taim em i mekim olsem, Projek i bihainim rot bilong daunim poveti bihainim Papua Niugini Kantri Asistens Strateji bilong daunim poveti. Moa yet, asbilip bilong Projek long strongim trenspot wantaim wok stretim bilong rot netwok i bihainim tok-strongim bilong mobeta trenspot olsem rot bilong daunim poveti na strongim laip sindaun. **Panel i painim olsem Projek i lukluk long apim winmani mak bilong ol smolholda na olsem, em i bihainim Benk Polisi long Poveti Ridaksen OP 1.00.**
298. Taim ol i disainim SADP long apim winmani mak i go long ol smolholda bihainim disain na karimaut bilong ol Projek komponen – sapos Projek i save strongim ol smolholda bai ol i kisim – *ol sosol na ekonomik benefit we i stret na gutpela na i luksave tu long ol meri na ol lain tumbuna long bihain*// (olsem i stap long askim insait long OP 4.10) – em i narapela isiu na bai kisim moa glasim insait long ol dispela seksen i kam.

³³¹ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 57. ³³² Ibid., p. 6, ¶ 21.

2. Ekonomik Wok Skelim na Glasim Strong bilong Mekim Mani

299. OP i tok olsem Menesmen i mas inapim longpela taim sindaun bilong ol projek: —*bilong kisim gutpela tok-wanbel olsem ol benefit bilong projek i kamap na bai stap strong long laip bilong projek, Benk bai skelim strong na laik o luksave bilong projek long stretim ol ekonomik, fainensal, institusenal, na busgraun hevi.*³³³
300. I gat bikpela hap evidens i stap long disain wok bilong Projek olsem ol ekonomik, fainensal na institusenal hevi long ol kainkain Projek sait, namel long Oro na WNB, em i narakain tru. Ol dispela bikpela narakain i nogat inap glasim long ol, insait long projek disain, o i no kisim wok stretim long taim bilong karimaut wok. Dispela isiu bai kisim moa glasim long narapela seksen bai kam.
301. Taim welpam i wok apim winmani mak bilong ol smolholda, Panel i luksave tu olsem hap winmani ol i kisim i no bin inap bikos FFB praising sistem na ol didaksen o bekim dinau i wok long givim moa hevi long winmani bilong ol smolholda. (Annex 9 bilong PAD i soim ekonomik na fainensal glasim bilong Projek.) Saveman bilong Panel i luksave long ol dispela samting long wok glasim bilong ol:
302. **Fainensal Intenal Ret ov Riten (FIRR).** Long Annex 9 bilong PAD, nupela planim bilong welpam (em ol i kolim —infilling)) em i gutpela moa bilong ol smolholda. FIRR bilong Hoskins, Bialla na Oro, em samting olsem 27%, 24% na 22% yet. Ol dispela bes kes bilong ol FIRR em i antap tru, na i soim bikpela strong bilong welpam na ol kos na bikpela karim bilong ol.
303. **Ol Welpam Winmani.** Bihainim PAD, taim em i sanap, —*ol smolholda welpam net winmani (leba tasol nogat) averes (moa long tripela skim) K1,800/2 hekta (\$643) long yia 4 i go inap 10, na K5,000 (\$1,785) long yia 11 i go inap 23 bilong prodaksen.*³³⁴ Dispela i makim —*K90/de (USD \$32/de) wok (pastaim long givim dinau) we i narakain long K5.5 (USD \$1.96/de) minimum wes.*³³⁵ Olsem ol FIRR antap i tok, Bialla na Oro net-welpam-winmani em i liklik moa long skim long Hoskins. Karim bilong Oro i daunbilo moa long Bialla (Tebol 3). Averes mak bilong ol namba, olsem PAD i mekim, i no soim klia ol narakain mak bilong ol winmani long wanwan skim. Oro i ron bihain long Hoskins inap long 255 na Bialla, inap long 10% long yia 4 i go inap 10, na bihain, long 16% na 9%, wanwan, long yia 11 i go inap 23 (Tebol 2).

Tebol 3: Averes Enual Net Winmani long wanwan Skim³³⁶

Skim	Averes: Yia 4-10	Na long Oro: Yia 4-10 (%)	Averes: Yr11-23	Na long Oro: Yia 11-23 (%)
Hoskins	K2,045	+25%	K5,341	+16%
Bialla	K1,802	+10%	K5,023	+9%
Oro	K1,633		K4,595	

³³³ OP 10.04, ¶ 5. ³³⁴ Projek Apresal Dokumen, p. 79. ³³⁵ Ibid. ³³⁶ Projek Apresal Dokumen, p. 85, Annex 9, Tebol 2.

304. Maski ol bikpela narakain ekonomik i stap (olsem FFB prodaksen, hamas kilomita ekseks rot, na skel bilong ol smolholda prodaksen)³³⁷ namel long ol skim, as bilong ol dispela narakain sindaun i no longwe. Sampela ol dispela em ol tumbuna na kalsarel samting, nogat inap toktok long smolholda na mil, ol kros bilong wok, na —stap-longwe|| bilong kampani long ol smolholda olsem long Hoskins, na planti yia kros-pait long ol prais mak. Moa yet, ol rot bilong strongim wok-kamap bilong ol fam na wokbung pasin long Oro provins i no klia.
305. Averages wok profail insait long PAD (i no long mak bilong wanwan skim), ol wok profail bilong Viles Welpam na ol LSS blok em ol i ripotim bilong Hoskins, Oro, na Bialla, na soim bikpela moa wok mak long Hoskins.³³⁸ Ol wok-mak skelim bilong PAD (long tupela hekta) em i daunbilo moa long tupela hekta modul long ADS 2001.³³⁹ Moa yet, OPIC glasim bilong Kredit Komponen na Fainensal Wokglasim, ol i bin mekim bilong SADP, i gat wanpela wok profail (Annex Tebol 1) we i kaunim olsem ol wok askim bilong wan hekta welpam insait long yia 4 i go inap 23, taim wok kisim frut i go het, we i abrusim mak bilong ol skelim bilong PAD long tupela hekta welpam.³⁴⁰ Ol dispela arapela kaunim skelim i tromoi askim gen long strong bilong ol manimak long wok olgeta de olsem i stap insait long PAD.
306. **Bekim Dinaw.** Insait long PAD, wanpela kes-flo analisis o wok-glasim —*i soim olsem wanpela dinaw manimak long K1,900 long 8% intares, wantaim wanpela malolo taim inap long 3-pela yia, bai kisim inap long 7-pela yia long ol bekim olgeta mun long inapim olgeta dispela dinaw, long 30% bilong dinaw mani olgeta mun i go long growa bilong FFB ol i salim long mil.*³⁴¹ PAD i luksave olsem bihainim kes-flo wok-glasim, — wok bilong bekim dinaw i stap gut insait long mak bilong ol smolholda na i larim inap kes-flo bihain long mani i go long inapim dinaw, long lukautim sindaun bilong ol, na ol arapela pleswok ol i gat.³⁴²
307. Bikpela kredit o dinaw hap na kes-flo wok-glasim we OPIC i mekim i soim baim bilong nupela planim (—infilling||) em i moa long etpela yia, na i no sevenpela yia olsem PAD i tok.³⁴³ PAD i tok em i makim stret —projek|| sindaun bihainim wanpela averes modul bilong dispela tripela skim. Tasol, FFB karim mak ol i yusim insait long wok-glasim, em bilong Hoskins tasol,³⁴⁴ na long taim bilong stretim dinaw, em inap long 13% moa long ol karim ol i kisim long arapela tupela skim. Yusim ol karim bilong Bialla/Oro na ol prais bilong Oro, dinaw bilong 2 hekta bilong nupela welpam em i save kisim gut sevis long Oro insait long 11-pela yia – 4-pela yia moa long taim PAD i tok makim – we i sanap long modul bilong OPIC. Moa yet, ol FFB prais insait long OPIC modul, Tebol 11 (— ol prais ol i peim long ol fama ||) em i narakain long ol dispela ol i yusim insait long PAD Annex 9, Tebol 2, olsem na ol winmani mak i no wankain, we i paulim tingting moa yet. Long Oro

³³⁷ Ibid., p. 21, Tebol A1.1 ³³⁸ ADS (May 2001), Annex 6, Tebol 2 na 3. ³³⁹ PAD, p. 84-85, Tebol 1 na 2. ³⁴⁰ Cuddihy, W. *Credit Component and Financial Analysis*, Revised Final, 30 December 2006. Prepared for OPIC/PHRD. Annex Tebol 1, pes 19. ³⁴¹ PAD, p. 79

³⁴² Ibid. ³⁴³ OPIC/Cuddihy, William (2006). SADP Kredit Komponen na Fainensal Analsis. Desemba. Ol FFB karim ol i yusim insait long tu-hekta modul bilong ol nupela blik em long Hoskins tasol, na ol dispela i abrusim mak bilong tupela arapela ples, inap long 13% long taim bilong bekim dinaw. ³⁴⁴ Lukim Tebol 11 bilong OPIC /Cuddihy (2006) wantaim PAD, Annex 9, Tebol 2.

yet, welpam em i no sip long mekim bikos em i kisim foapela yia moa long inapim olgeta dinau.

308. **Oi FFB Karim** PAD i soim mak bilong en tude, na i nogat projek smolholda o estet karim profail, em bilong Hoskins tasol, na i no long Bialla o long Oro. Dispela sot i kamapim ol askim long astingting tru long ol namba bilong karim long Bialla na Oro, na sapos ol dispela i no antap tumas long mak tru i stap.

309. Implimentesen Komplisen Ripot³⁴⁵ bilong Oro Smolholda Projek (1992-2001) i makim hevi bilong ova-skelim ol karim insait long bipo projek:

—Long ol **nupela blok**, glasim bilong karim long wanwan blok bihainim yia bilong planim, i soim olsem, long averes mak, ol i go antap inap long 50% daunbilo moa long mak ol i ting em bai kamap long en insait long ol namba wan yia bilong projek, wantaim liklik defisit (inap long 12%) long ol yia bihain. Apresal i tok olsem ol karim bai kirap long 5 tan long namba tri yia, na groa i go long 12, 16, 18 na 19 tan long wanwan hekta long ol yia i kam bihain. bikipela karim mak i bihainim ol pasin i stap long ol bipo Popondetta skim long namel long 1980s pastaim long bikipela pundaun long prais bilong welpam long pinis bilong 1980s... Long las 10-pela yia karim long olgeta yia i sindaun namel long 9.5 na 13 tan long wanwan hekta ol i planim, o namel long 11 na 14.5 tan long wanwan hekta frut ol i kisim, wantaim ol namba bilong laspela sikspela yia i antap moa long ol yia pastaim taim ol bikipela birua bilong rausim ol wairaman kempen i bin stap. Dispela i narakain wantaim skelim bilong 15 tan.//³⁴⁶

310. PAD i toktok long —ol smolholda insait long ol skim eria i stap nau, na i wok long produsim daunbilo moa long mak em i ken wok long en,|| tasol i no givim arere-mak bilong en.³⁴⁷ Wanpela toktok i kam long New Britain Palm Oil Development Limited (NBPOL) i soim olsem: —...*taim ol estet bilong NBPOL i kamapim samting olsem 26 tan long wanwan hekta na ol smolholda i stap yet i wok mekim 19 tan long wan hekta (em long Wes Nu Briten), ol nupela (em long Oro we NBPOL i kisim nupela graun) i karim faivpela tan long wan hekta. Ol Smolholda i sot tru long teknikal sapot.*||³⁴⁸ (tok strongim, mipela yet i putim).

311. Agrakalsa wok strong bilong ol smolholda welpam i nogat askim long en, bikos em i save stap antap oltaim long Papua Niugini, na sampela taim, em i save inapim stret. Tasol em i no wanpela gutpela rot bilong skelim ol beslain samting bilong wanpela projek, moa yet taim ol bipo ekspiriens i soim olsem em i no save inapim dispela, moa yet long Oro, inap ol rot i kisim wok stretim, na mobeta ekstensen sevis i stap. Moa glasim bihainim pesentes bilong karim mak bai gutpela.

312. Bihainim ol dispela wok-glasim antap, ol saveman bilong Panel i tokluksave olsem glasim i stap insait long Annex 9 bilong PAD em i wankain wantaim kain glasim em i givim we i olsem bilong

³⁴⁵ World Bank, 2002. *Implementation Completion Report on a Loan in the Amount of US\$27 million to the Government of Papua New Guinea for the Oro Smallholder Oil Palm Development Project* ³⁴⁶ Implementation Completion Report, p. 8 ³⁴⁷ PAD p. 8, ¶24.

³⁴⁸ *Improving the Livelihoods of Palm Oil Smallholders: The Role of the Private Sector*. Prepared by FSG Social Impact Advisors (commissioned by World Bank Group, 2010). p. 12.

ol smolholda welpam projek Wol Benk i givim mani long sanapim, na tu olsem kain fainensing modol analisis ol i mekim long ol arapela Papua Niugini projek Wol Benk i halivim wantaim mani. Modeling long Annex 9, em i bihainim averes o namel mak long olgeta tripela skim, wantaim ol senis bilong ol skim-spesifik fam get FFB prais na ol karim mak. Wanwan modol bilong wanwan skim i no stap. Wanwan ol modol bilong givim na kisim bekim bilong dinau i no stap. Wokmak insait long ol tu-hekta smolholda modol long PAD em i daunbilo moa long ol skelim bilong Wol Benk fainensing, olsem, ADS 2001 (FFB praising stadi) na insait long OPIC stadi bilong kredit komponen na fainensal wok-glasim bilong SADP.

313. Bikpela mak Fainensal Intenal Rets ov Riten (FIRRs) i makim bikpela mak wok na daunbilo kostim wok-skelim. Tasol ol dispela mak i antap tumas, moa yet long Oro, bikos ol i nogat namba na stori stret long sapotim ol skelim bilong karim-mak bilong ol FFB welpam. Olsem na, sapos ol karim bilong FFB long SADP bilong Oro (na Bialla) i antap tumas, FIRR ol i skelim, liklik mak winmani na ol namba bilong kisim bek dinau, em i antap tumas tu. Bihainim evidens i kam long bipo wok bilong Oro, na moa yet, nogat inap namba na sapot bilong ol skelim long ol welpam FFB karim mak, i ken i gat luksave olsem PAD i save abrusim mak long ol FFB karim-mak na ol fainensal tokluksave bilong bes kes long Oro.
314. Bihainim ol wok-glasim antap, i gat bikpela ekonomik, fainensal na insitusenal samting i narakain insait long ol wanwan Projek eria, olsem long Oro na WNB. **Em i luksave bilong Panel olsem Projek disain i mas luksave long bekim ol narakain sindaun namel long ol Projek eria, bai ol smolholda i ken kisim inap ekonomik, sosol, na kalsarel benefit o gutpela, bilong Projek. Panel i painim olsem dispela i no bihainim OMS 2.20 na OP/BP 4.10.**
315. Long sait bilong wok ol praivet kampani i save mekim insait long SADP, PAD i tok olsem — *ol welpam miling kampani (a) i save givim miling mak bilong ol FFB i kam long ol estet na long ol smolholda autgrowa; (b) kolektim FFB long sait bilong rot insait long ol smolholda saplai eria olgeta potnait, yusim ol kar bilong ol yet (c) saplaim ol prodaksen samting olsem sidling (bilong planim na planim bek), fetilaisa na ol tuls; na (d) peim ol growa long mekim ol dilivari olgeta potnait o mun, na gat akauntim sistem i larim ol didaksen long wanwan FFB pemen i go long growa long inapim ol bekim bihainim developmen o prodaksen input dinau long wanem opis i givim dinau long ol.*³⁴⁹ Maski bikpela hap wok bilong ol kampani, tasol, PAD i givim nogat namba bilong glasim sapos gutpela wok mani (o sapos i no gutpela) bilong ol kampani, long wanem ol wok olsem miling, trenspot, sidling prodaksen, input saplai, kredit/det menesmen, planim bek wok, na insait long ol bikpela mani kontribusen i go long OPIC na PNGOPRA.
316. Na tu i nogat glasim bilong ol winmani i go long ol smolholda, ol estet na miling kampani, long ol wokbung i bin kamap bipo, o aninit long Projek. Olsem na i nogat glasim long — strong bilong peim|| bilong olgeta kostim bilong rot mentenens, olsem, taim em i mas go aut long olgeta bikpela stekholda. Dispela i save autim ol hevi long FFB prais fomula, kostim bilong prodaksen, trenspot, wok, na veliu edet mak long wanwan

³⁴⁹ PAD, p. 20, ¶ 8.

wokmak bilong veliu sen (ol smolholda, ol estet, ol CPO mil – na fomet o rot bilong bungim ol dispela namba i go long IP bilong go long Papua Niugini) na tu strong bilong mekim wok na CPO/PKO rausim wel mak long ol domestik mil. PAD i wok long toktok long wokbung namel long ol smolholda, OPIC, na ol miling kampani, tasol i mauspas long koporet gavanens, bipo wokmak bilong ol kampani, wok bilong ol long ol smolholda det na sevis, winmani strong, na strong bilong ol i go long bihain taim.

317. Kampani sindaun long Wes Nu Briten long ol yia i go pinis i strong moa long sindaun long Oro, we kampani onasip i senis sampela taim long ol yia i go pinis.³⁵⁰ Long Oro, sindaun bilong smolholda dinau na kipim ol rekot na wok akaunting, — *i no gutpela*,//em ol Rikwesta i tok.³⁵¹ Dispela em i wanpela moa as long senisim disain bilong Projek long Oro.

318. Panel i kisim toksave olsem OPIC na Benk i nogat stori long ol mani i go bek long ol kampani estet na mil. **Luksave i satp long hamas yia Benk i sapotim wok bilong welpam sekta long Papua Niugini, insait long wokbung wantaim ol welpam kampani, na bikpela wok bilong kampani long karimaut Projek na wok ol i save givim long winmani bilong ol smolholda, Panel i painim olsem Menesmen i no karimaut ol wok sekim long strong bilong ol kampani na manimak ol i gat long mekim gut wok. Panel i painim olsem dispela i no bihainim OMS 2.20 na OP/BP 10.04.**

319. Bihainim dispela tingting, Panel i luksave olsem tems ov refrens bilong FFB Praising Stadi i tok olsem stadi — *bai strongim wok bilong praising fomula, wantaim tingting bilong sanapim wanpela klia na stretpela praising fomula o rot bilong makim prais bai wanwan welpam miling kampani i mas bihainim.*³⁵² Em nau, wanpela konsalten ol i makim, bai glasim gen infomesen ol smolholda na kampani wantaim i gat long ol kostim bilong prodaksen, na kamap wantaim wanpela rekomendesen. Panel i tok welkam long dispela wok long kamapim wanpela klia na stretpela fomula, bihainim riviui bilong wok prodaksen stori na namba ol i kisim long ol smolholda na kampani wantaim. Tasol Panel i luksave tu olsem FFB stadi i no ron moa inap ol ligel hevi namel long Indipenden Konsuma na Kompetisen Komisnin (ICCC) na OPIC i stret.³⁵³

3. Strongim Sindaun: Seavings na Ol Arapela Winmani Rot

a. Seavings

320. Stap bilong *wantok sistem* o pasin bilong senisim ol komyuniti na ekonomik wok kalsa wantaim ol wan-tokples bilong yu, i stap long Sapta 2.³⁵⁴ Olsem wanela komyuniti, we

³⁵⁰ Komonwel Developmen Koporesen (CDC), namba wan divelopa bilong Higaturu Oil Palms Pty. Ltd., i bin papa bilong Pasifik Rim Plantesens Limitet (PacRim) insait long wokbung wantaim Gavman. Moa long en, Cargill-Temasek (Cargill insait long Join Vensa wantaim Sovren Welt Fan bilong Singapore Gavman) na nau Nu Briten Welpam Grup i stap holim wok bilong kampani onasip.³⁵¹ Scott, M. Panel miting wantaim OPIC. Septemba 2, 2010.³⁵² Tems ov Refrens, FFB Prais Fomula Riviui na Odit (2010), p. 3. Aide Mémoire, Implimentesen Sapot Misin, Epril 15-19 2011.³⁵⁴ Long tok klia long ol hevi ol smolholda i gat long sevim mani, ol —...i makim tripela banis long seavings. Namba wan, sosol hevi long oltaim halivim famili na ol hauslain em i bikpela tru. Long pasin tumbuna, komyuniti luksavve na ol nem bilong ol wanwan manmeri na grup i pas wantaim tilim bilong winmani bihainim komyuniti na

kesmani, kaikai, na ol arapela stua kago na kaikai em ol i save serim, na we i nogat tumbuna rot long sevim mani, ating em i wanpela we ol pipel i bekim kamap kwik bilong kesmani na ol i yusim kwik.

321. Panel i luksave olsem ol Projek pepa i go bek long 2002³⁵⁵ i makim klia olsem wok bilong kamap wantaim ol sistem long promotim sevim namel long ol smolholda em i hap bilong Projek na ol institusen na rot bilong wok i mas stap long kamapim dispela. 2003 Aidentifikesen Misin i tok olsem — *longpela taim rot bilong ol smolholda i mekim mani bilong ol yet long developim ol blok i go moa na bai pas wantaim strong bilong ol long sevim mani. Ol salens long kamapim wanpela pasin bilong sevim mani namel long ol smolholda, bihainim ol komyuniti askim long PNG, em i bikpela moa, na institusenal envairomen o ples bilong wok nau i no save strongim dispela luksave.*³⁵⁶
322. Moa yet, long Projek Konsep Dokumen (PCD) Rivi Miting i kamap long mun Jun long 2003, wanpela pia riviua i tok olsem i gat nid long — *banisim*// welpam winmani long ol samting ol man i save yusim long en, we i gat planti nogut samting long komyuniti. Dispela —prisosol asesmen// na i luksave tu long nogat sevim na wokbisnis save i gat — *sampela komyuniti woksenis*// na i askim long kamapim wanpela sevim rot olsem hap bilong Projek.³⁵⁷ Dispela ripot i tok olsem dispela (olsem, developmen bilong wanpela sevim rot) bai stap olsem hap bilong tems ov refrens bilong Sosol Asesmen.
323. Sosol Asesmen i tokstrong olsem —...*nogat gutpela sevim rot long banisim wanpela hap bilong ol kes winmani long askim bilong tumbuna senis pasin na ol arapela askim long winmani em ol growa i lukim olsem wanpela bikpela banis long strong bilong ol long bungim sevim. Nogat gutpela sevim rot em i wanpela bikpela samting long tok klia long gutpela wok kamap long planti ol welpam blok...*³⁵⁸
324. Bihain long painim wanpela strongpela rot bilong sevim mani, olsem wanpela isiu i pas wantaim strong na save bilong Projek long strongim sindaun bilong ol smolholda na halivim long kamapim senis bilong winmani - paradoks||, Sosol Asesmen i rekomen olsem wanpela rot, wankain olsem Bialla Growas Fan i ken kamap. Dispeal Fan i wok taim

kinship networks. Status, prestige and respect were not associated with accumulating wealth for personal consumption or personal investment purposes, but in redistributing this wealth through social networks or group projects that had the effect of enhancing the status of the giver and associated group members. These values and thinking remain very strong amongst LSS and VOP growers, especially amongst the latter where customary events are often timed to coincide with oil palm pay-days to allow people to contribute part or all of their pay to the group activity. Also, there is a cultural obligation on blockholders to redistribute a significant proportion of their income amongst the extended family group, and blockholders are often accompanied by relatives to town when they go to cash their pay cheques or withdraw cash from the bank if their pay is paid directly in to a bank account. Indeed, for a blockholder to resist the demands of the extended family on his oil palm payment is to risk social censure and damage to his reputation.|| Social Assessment Report (January 2007), p. 51.

³⁵⁵ Aide Memoire, Identification Mission, Proposed Smallholder Agricultural Development Project, November 2002, p. 3.

³⁵⁶ Ibid., March-April 2003, p. 4, ¶17. ³⁵⁷ COWI. (June 2003). Smallholder Agricultural Development Project (SADP) Identification Mission: Assessment of Social Issues, Safeguard Policies, Identified Stakeholders and TOR for Social Assessment, p. 13. ³⁵⁸ Social Assessment (January 2007), p. 52.

Sanapim wanpela takis long prodaksen we ol i save rausim long wanpela fiks ret long wanwan tan bilong FFB long pe bilong ol growa. Bihain, ol growa i senisim ol kontribusen bilong en i go long Fan long sampela ol kago. Dispela i larim winmani i kam long welpam long senis i go kamap wanpela samting i ken mekim wok bilong strongim laip sindaun bilong ol.

325. PIM i toktok tu long seivings na i tok makim karimaut bilong —... *longpela taim rot bilong daunim mani hevi olsem bekim dinau bilong ol smolholda i laik mekim wok planim bek, na tu, rot bilong sasim wanpela takis bilong wol planim bek na ol nupela rot bilong seivings.*||³⁵⁹ Em i tok makim tu Bialla Growas Fan i stap nau olsem wanpela piksa bilong bihainim.³⁶⁰
326. Panel i luksave olsem Menesmen i wok long skelim tingting long sanapim wanpela seivings rot long taim bilong disainim SADP, tasol i luksave olsem i nogat gutpela sans long kamap gut bikos i nogat inap save na wok mak long eria. Moa yet, Menesmen i kisim luksave mak olsem Papua Niugini SDP Maikro Fainens bai go het long givim dnau na mekim wok seivings insait long ol Projek eria. (moa long wok ol i mekim insait long dinau rot bilong wok infiling). Menesmen i tok moa olsem lokol wok gavanens o lukautim na stap insait bihainim askim i gat moa luksave long taim bilong redim Projek. Long ol dispela as, Menesmen i no mekim wanpela seivings rot olsem wanpela Projek komponen o wok.
327. Panel i luksave long wok traim Menesmeni mekim long painim we bilong sanapim wanpela seivings rot. Tasol bikos kamap bilong wanpela gutpela seivings rot em i wanpela bikpela rekomendesen i kam long Sosol Asesmen, na tu, ol namba wan Projek wok redi, na bikos em i sut stret long strongim laip sindaun bilong ol smolholda, long lukluk bilong Panel, Menesmen i mas go het long givim moa luksave long promotim strong bilong painim gutpela rot bilong sevim mani.

b. Moa Rot bilong kisim Winmani

328. Panel i luksave olsem astingting long redim Sosol Asesmen, em antap long glasim ol gutpela na nogut bilong Projek i ken kamap na birua nogut em i ken givim long ol Asples Pipel, em — *long glasim ol arapela wok projek we ol birua nogut i ken bikpela.*||³⁶¹
329. Sosol Asesmen i makim astingting bilong givim wanpela autlain bilong SADP na painim ol nupela tingting long we em i ken kamap strong moa. Bikos SADP, na disain bilong en, em i ples bilong kirapim wok, we i nogat glasim long ol arapela kain projek wok.
330. Sosol Asesmen i bin rekomendim olsem Projek i kamapim ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani. — *ol arapela wok antap long welpam em sampela taim ol i save lukim olsem samting i save pulim taim na hatwok bilong ol smolholda long wok welpam. I mobeta olsem luksave bilong ekstensen sevis na ol smolholda developmen polisi i no pasim ai long ol arapela rot bilong bungim na bildim ol winmani rot bihainim ol polisi i save strongim ol bris namel long smolholda sekta na bikpela rijenal*

³⁵⁹ PIM Ogus 2007, Bikpela pepa, p. 13, Tebol 2.1. ³⁶⁰ Ibid., p. 13. ³⁶¹ OP 4.10, ¶ 9.

ekonomi.||³⁶² Ol samting ol i mekim rekomendesen long em i mas kamap i karamapim wok skils trening bilong ol yut i nogat wok o trening, olsem dispela ol arapela ogenaísesen i givim, tasol i kisim stia long OPIC.

331. Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok olsem —*SADP bai sapotim moa wok opim long ol invesmen long strongim ol rurel rot na aninit long Komponen 2 bilong Projek (Lokol Gavanens na Komyuniti Patisipesen).*||³⁶³ Menesmen i luksave long opim rot bilong kisim winmani olsem wanpela bikpela hap bilong ol laip sindaun rot bilong ol smolholda long bihainim. Projek luksave, em long tingsave olsem opim bilong ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani, bai lukim ol spinof bisnis long strongim ol rot na bildim sampela (i gat mak bilong en) komyuniti infrastraksa. Mobeta rot bai kontribut long planti ol komyuniti benefit, olsem tu wanpela apim long mak bilong ol rot bilong kisim winmani bikos i gat mobeta trenspot bilong karim ol arapela kes-krop bilong ekspotim o bilong salim long ol lokol maket, na tu, long mobeta trenspot bilong ol welpam FFB. Em i hat moa long lukim bris namel long ol wok i kamap aninit long Komponen 2 – we bai, inap long arere mak bilong en – na moa rot bilong kisim winmani. Moa yet, Panel i luksave olsem insait long ol mun i kam, Menesmen bai kliarim tingting long — holim i stap|| Komponen 2 o long senisim straksa bilong en.³⁶⁴ Maski long dispela, Panel i tok olsem i nogat samting insait long dispela tupela wok (mobeta rot na ol developmen projek Komponen 2 i kirapim) i tok stret long ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani namel long ol smolholda, o i givim moa win samting aninit long Projek, moa long lukluk long groim welpam.³⁶⁵

332. Olsem luksave i stap bipo, seving na opim moa rot bilong kisim winmani em ol bikpela rot bilong abrusim ol birua nogut long ol asples komyuniti – bihainim rekomendesen insait long Sosol Asesmen. OP/BP 4.10 i laikim olsem — *ol projek Benk i givim mani long en i gat ol rot bilong (a) abrusim ol birua long ol Asples Pipel komyuniti; o (b) taim i nogat rot bilong abrusim, sotim , daunim o givim kompensen long ol kamap bilong ol birua.*||³⁶⁶ **Bikos Projek i no karamapim ol rot i stap olsem rekomendesen insait long Sosol Asesmen bilong abrusim na daunim ol birua nogut long ol asples smolholda i groim welpam, Panel i painim olsem Menesmen i no bihainim OP/BP 4.10.**

H. Ol Laspela Tok luksave

333. Taim prodaksen bilong welpam i kamapim moa winmani bilong smolholda, Projek, olsem ol i disainim, i no inapim olgeta askim bilong Indijines Pipels Polisi bilong Benk

³⁶² Sosol Asesmen Ripot (Jan 2007), p. xiv. ³⁶³ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 17, ¶ 48. ³⁶⁴ Aide Memoire, Implimentesen Sapot Misin, Epril 15-19, 2011. p. 6, ¶ 30. ³⁶⁵ Long fil raun bilong en, Panel tim i painim tupela piksa – wanpela long OPIC na narapela long mil kampani (NBPOL) – we ol smolholda i kisim halivim wantaim moa rot bilong kisim winmani, na i nogat narpela ol risos. Long wanpela, wanpela OPIC ekstensen opisa i wok halivim long stretim ol kakau na kofi produsa koporetiv bilong ol welpam smolholda husat i wok long groim ol arapela kes-krop, na strongim maket luksave bilong ol. Narapela kes em NBPOL menesmen husat i tok pait wantaim wanpela kampani long Yurop i save mekim soklet (we mil i wok welpam bilong mil) long baim kakau long ol welpam smolholda husat i wok long groim kakau tu. ³⁶⁶ OP 4.10, ¶ 1.

we ol i —*disainim bai ol Asples Pipel i kisim ol sosol na ekonomik benefit we i bihainim stret kalsa, luksave long ol meri na tumbuna long bihain taim tu.*³⁶⁷

334. Sot bilong wok glasim insait long Sosol Asesmen bilong ol kasomari lo na institusen, na konsaltesen i kama, i min olsem i nogat inap luksave long bikpela laip sindaun samting insait long disain na wok karimaut bilong Projek, na moa yet, em i no luksave long bikpela bilong opim moa rot bilong kisim winmani na wok seving. Long luksave bilong Panel, rot bilong bihainim stret Indijines Pipels Polisi i nidim strongim long ol astingting bilong en, olsem, kamapim ol komyuniti na ekonomik benefit; fri, gutpela konsaltesen i go pas; na abrusim ol birua nogut o daunim mak, slekim o givim kompensesen long ol hevi sapos i nogat rot long abrusim. Tru tumas, dispela em i mekim wok bilong disainim, supavaisim na karimaut sapot long Projek wanpela bikpela salens tru.
335. Panel i tingim olsem sapos Menesmen i givim moa luksave long narakain namel long ol provins na i givim ol kainkain bekim, Projek disain na karimaut i ken kamapim mobeta kaikai bilong ol smolholda.
336. Panel i luksave olsem wanpela bikpela glasim bilong ol prodaksen kostim (bihainim kampani namba na stori) i kamapim wanpela moa gutpela na strongpela disain bilong RMTF, na ken stap long bikpela wok i go het bilong FFB Praising stadi.
337. Panel i luksave tu long ol salens Menesmen i gat bikos em i nogat rot long groim bisnis olsem i stap insait long ol Misin Ripot bilong Menesmen. Ripot bai go bek long dispela insait long Sapta 6. Wanpela gutpela senis long envairomen bilong SADP, em i nupela menesmen bilong mil kampani long Oro provins. Taim Panel i toktok long sot bilong Projek disain wok wantaim wok Menesmen i mekim long glasim ol namba bilong mil kampani i mas stap long stretim ol isiu bilong ol smolholda winmani, strongpela bilip bilong kampani long ol RSPO astingting i gutpela.

³⁶⁷ OP 4.10, ¶ 1.

Sapta 5: Hevi long Busgraun

A. Tok I Go Pas

338. Dispela Sapta i lukluk long ol klem olsem i gat hevi long busgraun. Ol Rikwesta i tok olsem Projek bai kamapim sampela ol bikpela bagarap long busgraun bikos i nogat inap envairomen asesmen, na ol birua i kamap long wok —*infilling*, // graun i lus, posin i go insait long ol hanwara, na rausim ol bikpela lain diwai. Insait long olgeta Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, sampela ol hevi long busgraun i kamap klia. Dispela em:
- 1) ol sot insait long Envairomen Asesmen (moa yet nogat inap rot long kisim stori);³⁶⁸
 - 2) ol hait o nogut mining long tok —*infilling*; //³⁶⁹
 - 3) ol birua na senis i bihainim kliarim bilong graun, olsem graun i lus, rausim bilong topsoil, na graun i pulap insait long wara;³⁷⁰
 - 4) nogat inap glasim long pipia bilong mil³⁷¹ na ol birua kemikal na baiolojikal posinim bilong ol hanwara (long ol agro-kemikal o marasin);³⁷²
 - 5) sot long ol rot slekim insait long Envairomen Menesmen Plen (EMP) long sait bilong lukautim ol bikpela konsavesen veliu fores o lain diwai;³⁷³ na
 - 6) nogat inap konsaltesen wantaim ol klemen na ol lain i kisim wok senis long Projek na nogat klia tokaut long ol infomesen.
1. Wanwan long ol dispela isiu, ausait long pasin konsaltesen na disklosa o tokaut, we i kisim pinis glasim long Sapta 3, em i gat toktok bilong em yet daunbilo. Ol dispela isiu i gat ol samting i wankain, moa yet long rot ol i kisim stretim na luksave insait long EMP, Projek Implimentesen Manuel (PIM), na PAD, na bikpela wok bihainim wantaim ol Benk banis polisi.
 2. Maski ol Rikwesta i wari long birua planim welpam i ken givim long Oro provins, nogat nupela welpam blok i kamap bihain long 2001. Olsem na ol birua ol i tok long en i lukluk i go bek long ol as bilong ol i kamap bipo, aninit long ol bipo projek Wol Benk i bin givim mani long kirapim.³⁷⁴

B. Ol Klem bilong ol Rikwesta

341. Ol Rikwesta i tok olsem Projek bai kamapim sampela birua long busgraun bikos envairomen asesmen o wok glasim i no inap. Ol birua em nogat inap tok klia na tokaut, na nogat inap wok konsaltesen, na ol birua bilong —*infilling*, // we o karamapim graun lus, posin i go insait long ol hanwara, na rausim ol diwai. Ol Rikwesta i tok olsem dinau rot aninit long

³⁶⁸ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 9. ³⁶⁹ Ibid., pp. 2-3. ³⁷⁰ Ibid., p. 4. ³⁷¹ Ibid., pp. 4, 9. ³⁷² Ibid., p. 4. ³⁷³ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 10. ³⁷⁴ Oro Smolholda Welpam Dvelopmen Projek, 1992-2001.

namba wan komponen o wok plen bilong Projek – we i givim dinau long ol smolholda i laik planim welpam bihainim ol eksen rot we i nogat welpam i sanap – em trutru, em i wanpela *ekspensen projek*,³⁷⁵ moa long wanpela *infilling*,³⁷⁶ we ol i bilip dispela em i wanpela kain *hait toktok*.³⁷⁷

342. Ol Rikwesta i klem olsem Projek —*bai pulim ol welpam i go long ol blok we i gat ol lain diwai i stap long en yet, graun we i bin gat diwai bipo na ples kunai, we maski ol i stap insait long ol welpam blok, i save givim ol ekonomik na sosol sevises bilong ol lokol komyuniti na graun bilong mekim gaden kaikai.*|| Ol Rikwesta i go moa long strongim luksave olsem ol asples komyuniti —*...i save sindaun long ol dispela lain diwai na ples kunai, na i stap aninit long stia bilong tumbuna loan a pasin, bilong groim kaikai na kisim kes winmani, na tu bilong ol tumbuna wok na lotu pasin.*||³⁷⁵ Ol i pulim lukluk i go long bikipela sindaun insait long ol praimeri renfores o lain diwai moa long ol welpam plantesen.³⁷⁶ Insait long tokpaitim ol birua bilong Projek, ol Rikwesta i tok olsem ol lain diwai na kunai ples we i ken senis i go long welpam aninit long Projek i save givim —*ekolojikal*|| na —*sosio-ekonomik na kalsarel wok.*||³⁷⁷
343. Ol Rikwesta i tok olsem —*ol envairomen asesmen i kamap i sot tru na i abrusim ol bikipela hevi,*|| olsem hevi long moa pipia mak i kam long ol mil na i go insait long ol wara, pis na pipel.³⁷⁸ Ol i bilip tu olsem Envairomen Asesmen i gat ol — *bikipela asua,*|| bikos em i no yusim ol strongpela rot bilong kisim infomesen, na i nogat root long skelim tritim o kilim strong bilong ol efluen o pipia bilong mil, na i no save givim ol rot bilong slekim hevi Projek i givim long ol bikipela veliu fores o lain diwai.³⁷⁹
344. Insait long ovaviu o bikipela lukluk long ol birua bbilong welpam, ol Rikwesta i luksave olsem —*...groim wel pa mi nidim kliarim bilong olgeta hap graun we i ken kamapim graun lus, pinisim topsoil, na graun i go pulap long wara.*||³⁸⁰ Maski ol i luksave olsem Envairomen Asesmen i save skelim hevi long graun na wara antap long graun, ol Rikwesta i tok em i no inap.³⁸¹
345. Ol Rikwesta i tok tu olsem —*...welpam developmen i save go painim kemikal na baiolojikal posinim insait long ol hanwara. Insait long planti plantesen na smolholda plot, ol i save yusim planti fetilaisa long strongim gris long graun na karim bilong ol diwai. Ol krangi yusim bilong ol agrikalsa kemikal o marasin, na ron bilong dispela ol marasin long taim bilong bikipela ren i ken kamapim posinim bilong wara tebol na ol riva sistem, na kamapim algi na bagarapim netseral groa bilong busgraun na wara.*||³⁸²
346. Ol Rikwesta i pret olsem Projek bai bagarapim ol bikipela veliu fores taim OPIC i sanapim ol internal welpam planim taget, na bikos long wanpela —*sait sensitiviti sevei,*|| bilong stiaim ol OPIC opisa long klasifaim ol fores graun i gutpela long planim welpam.³⁸³ Ol Rikwesta i bilip olsem diforestesen bai kamap bikos — *ol OPIC opisa i nogat inap*

³⁷⁵ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 4. ³⁷⁶ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 4. ³⁷⁷ Ibid. ³⁷⁸ Ibid., p. 9. ³⁷⁹ Ibid. ³⁸⁰ Ibid., p. 4. ³⁸¹ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 9. ³⁸² Ibid., p. 4. ³⁸³ Ibid., p. 10.

*save long klasifaim gut ol fores, // bihainim sait sevei makim na bikos i gat wanpela insentiv o luksave straksa i stap we i save givim riwot o i save luksave bihainim moa planim bilong welpam.*³⁸⁴ Ol Rikwesta i tok long sampela ol rot bilong banis agensim diforestesen o rausim ol diwai, na karimaut wanpela hai-veliu fores inventori o kaunim pastaim long ol nupela wok planim i go het.

C. Bekim bilong Menesmen

347. Bekim bilong Menesmen i luksave olsem — ol toktok bilong infil planim i stap insait long olgeta Projek pepa long sait bilong planim welpam bihainim ol akses rot insait long tripela bikpela NES long Papua Niugini. Em i klia long olgeta Projek pepa olsem SADP bai sapotim groa insait long welpam eria inap long 9,000 hekta long ol smolholda VOP blok.||³⁸⁵ Bekim i tok tu olsem — *...infiling em i wanpela nupela tingting. Ol tok klia bilong wok infiling i save kam wantaim ol mep, long pepa o long graun, long soim rot infiling bai kamap na we em bai strongim wok na yusim bilong trenspot na rot infrastraksa.*³⁸⁶ //
348. Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok klia olsem infiling i no min olsem ol smolholda i mas groim welpam: — *Wok planim infiling aninit long SADP em i bihainim laik na sapos ol VOP smolholda i go insait long wok infiling, em i samting bilong ol, na blok bilong ol i mas inapim ol sosol na envairomen wok skelim bilong infil planim*³⁸⁷ || na — *i gat tok klia olsem infil planim em i laik bilong wanwan, na bai go het long laik bilong ol kastomari papagraun yet, na i no inap kamap long graun i gat krosipait long en.*³⁸⁸ //
349. Menesmen i wanbel olsem — *...i nogat inap tok-klia insait long EA long sait bilong ol efluen o pipia bilong mil*³⁸⁹ || na — *antap long was long miling kampani ISO14001 na RSPO setifikesen, wanpela bikpela wok glasim long hevi ol pipia bilong mil i ken kamapim long wok bilong Projek, bai kamap.*³⁹⁰ Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok klia olsem — *ISO14001 em i wanpela intanesenel stendat bilong envairomen menesmen an wanpela fremwok bilong daunim lekmak bilong kampani long busgraun* || na RSPO— *...em i wanpela global kolisen bilong indastri, ol NGO, ol fainensal institusen, ol envairomen na konsavesen grup, ol ritela na konsuma prodak kampani i kam bung wantaim long 2004 na i kam long kamapim wanpela klia we i go het bilong prodaksen na yusim bilong sastenabol welpam.*³⁹¹ Moa long en, maski EA na EMP na Envairomen na Sosol Menesmen Fremwok (ESMF) i painim ol bikpela hevi long busgraun Projek i givim, na i gat ol rot bilong slekim ol dispela hevi mak, Menesmen — *...i tok wanbel olsem i mas gat bikpela moa*

³⁸⁴ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 10. ³⁸⁵ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 9, ¶ 29. ³⁸⁶ Ibid., pp. 25-26, ¶ 79. ³⁸⁷ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p.1 9, ¶ 54. ³⁸⁸ Ibid., p. 26, ¶ 79. ³⁸⁹ Ibid., p. 36, ¶ 117. ³⁹⁰ Ibid. ³⁹¹ Ibid., p. 7, ¶ 23.

glasim bilong ol hevi i bihainim apim long mak bilong prodaksen long ol welpam mil na ol pipia i mas kisim luksave tu aninit long ol askim bilong OP/BP 4.01.||³⁹²

350. Long sait bilong ol Hai Konsavesen Velu Fores (HCVF), Menesmen i bilip —...*disain bilong Projek i karamapim ol stretpela rot bilong daunim mak bilong ol hevi long ol ples ol i katim rausim ol bikpela konsavesen velu diwai.*||³⁹³ Moa yet, Menesmen i tok olsem — *nogat bikpela senis o daunim bilong ol bikpela lain diwai eria o ol bikpela busgraun ples i stap aninit long Projek.*||³⁹⁴ Menesmen i tok olsem wok glasim na sekim i stap pinis insait long Komponen 1 na Komponen 2, na wok forest na wailaip meping bai pasim ol birua long ol lain diwai o ol lain diwai i groa bek gen. Na tu, ol OPIC ekstensen opisa i gat trening long luksave long ol HCVF. Tripela nupela Envairomen Opisa bai kisim wok na kisim moa trening aninit long Projek. Menesmen i bilip olsem bikos i nogat wanpela fores inventori, em i no brukim BP 4.36 (Ol Fores) olsem —...*paragraph 4 bilong BP 4.36 (Forests) i sut long wanpela inventori o wok kaunim i soim ol critical o bikpela fores eria na i no wanpela fores inventori nating.*// Las tru, bikos i nogat wanpela welpam koud ov praktis, Menesmen i givim toksave olsem ol bai bihainim stret PNG logging koud ov praktis na ol nesenel envairomen loa.³⁹⁵

D. Tingting bilong Panel long ol Birua sut tok i stap long Rikwes o Askim

351. Panel i luksave olsem ol Rikwesta i bilip olsem bikos i gat sot long Envairomen Asesmen na ol infiling wok aninit long Projek we i bai opim mak bilong welpam faming na lukim moa graun i klia, graun bilong ol bai bagarap long graun i lus, topsoil i pinis, na graun i pulap long wara. Ol i tok tu olsem ol pipia bilong mill bai bagarapim wara bilong ol, na namba bilong ol pis bai goo daun, na ol diwai na haus gaden bilong ol i nogat banis agensim Projek. Olsem na ol i bilip olsem ol bai lusim — *ol bikpela ikolojikal, sosio-ekonomik na kalsarel wok*// ol fores bilong ol i save givim ol taim ol i —*sindaun long ol dispela lain diwai na ples kunai... bilong wok gaden na kisim kes winmani, na tu long mekim tumbuna wok pasin.*||³⁹⁶
352. Olsem i stap antap, Projek i no kirapim ol wok infiling yet long taim Rikwes bilong Inspeksen i bin kam.³⁹⁷ Olsem na i nogat wanpela birua i kamap we i kam long wok aninit long dispela Projek. Tasol, olsem i tok insait long Panel Resolusen na 1999 Klarifikesen,³⁹⁸ ol birua i stap insait long Rikwes i lukim ol dispela birua i ken kamap long bihain, sapos i gat sot o i nogat bihainim long ol operesenal polisi na prosidia insait long disain, apresal, na karimaut bilong SADP. Panel i bilip olsem luksave bilong ol Rikwesta long birua long busgraun i kamap bikos ol birua ol i kisim bipo long Oro provins wantaim Popondetta Smolholda Welpam Developmen Projek (1976-84) na i no long taim i go pinis, Oro

³⁹² Ibid., p. 36, ¶ 119. ³⁹³ Ibid., p. 36, ¶ 117. ³⁹⁴ Ibid., p. 37, ¶ 124. ³⁹⁵ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 38, ¶125, 126, na 127. ³⁹⁶ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 4. ³⁹⁷ Bihainim ol nupela OPIC Implimentesen Progres Ripot bilong Julai 21, 2011, infil planim bai kirap taim wanpela MOE long POME Menesmen Eksen Plen em olgeta lain i sainim. ³⁹⁸ Inspeksen Panel Resolusen (¶16) na 1999 Klarifikesen (¶ 9b).

³⁹⁹ Smolholda Wel Pam Dvelopmen Projek (1992-2001). Na bikos SADP i no go het long wok infiling yet, we planti ol birua long busgraun i tok bihainim, Panel i lukim klem bilong ol Rikwesta i stap insait long luksave olsem birua we i ken kamap, we i ken kamap sapos i nogat bihainim na luksave long ol polisi na prosidia bilong Benk long taim bilong Projek disain, apresal, na karimaut.

353. Long ol birua nogut bilong groim welpam, ol intanesenel tingting long en long sait bilong busgraun na komyuniti sindaun bilong groim welpam, na intanesenel luksave long ol, na komyuniti sindaun bilong welpam developmen i senis bikpela tru insait long las tenpela yia. Long Papua Niugini, dispela i kamap long bihainim bilong tupela rot long lukautim busgraun ol welpam miling kampani i mekim.

Namba wan akreditesen wantaim ISO14000 menesmen sistem bihainim bilong mobeta wok long soim strongpela luksave long lukautim busgraun. Namba tu em i setifikesen o luksave aninit long RSPO, we i save bihainim wanpela operesenal lukluk long sastenabol welpam prodaksen na dispela i karamapim tu ol stekholda

354. Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok olsem — *Long 2005, olgeta welpam miling kampani long PNG i bin inapim ISO14001 akreditesen. ISO14001 em i wanpela intanesenel stendat bilong envairomental menesmen na wanpela fremwok bilong daunim lekma bilong kampani long busgraun. ISO14001 akreditesen em ol i save gat*⁴⁰⁰ *indipenden odit long en na setifikesen atoriti i save karimaut ol odit bilong sekim bihainim olgeta yia.*||

355. RSPO i bin kamap long 2004 taim i gat bikpela wari long wol long strong na sindaun bilong welpam sekta. Bikpela astingting bilong RSPO em — *bilong promotim groan a yusim bilong sastenabel welpam bihainim gutpela stendat long wol na wok bung moa wantaim olgeta stekholda.*||⁴⁰¹ Wanpela setifikesen skim i bin sanap, na i gat 8-pela Prinsipol na 39 Kraiteria. NBPOL (WNB Hoskins) na Hargy (WNB Biella) wantaim i kisim RSPO setifikesen pinis, na Kula/Higaturu Oil Palm Limited (HOP) i laik kisim setifikesen long 2012.⁴⁰² Papua Niugini em i wanpela memba bilong RSPO, na i sanapim wanpela Nesenel Intepretesen Woking Grup (NIWG) long glasim RSPO Kraiteria long inapim tok klia bilong sastenabol wok welpam long Papua Niugini. Prinsipol 4 bilong ol RSPO Prinsipol i sut long — *Ol growa na mila i yusim ol namba wan wok rot*||⁴⁰⁴ na i stretim tu ol arapela samting olsem strongim gris long graun

³⁹⁹ Lukim Envairomen Impek Rivi long ol Projek na Rekomendesen bilong Skelim long wanem ol developmen i kamap long bihain.

Stadi bilong Oro Smolholda Welpam Dvelopmen Projek (Ln. 3485-PNG) Tom Diwai Vigus (2001), Welpam Industri Koporesen.⁴⁰⁰

Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 7, ¶ 23.⁴⁰¹ RSPO Websait, <http://www.rspo.org/?q=page/9>> Accessed March 31, 2011.

⁴⁰² Rauntebol long Sastenabol Welpam. 2010. — Nu Briten Welpam Ripot 2010,|| RSPO Enuat Komyunikesen ov Progres. <http://www.rspo.org/sites/default/files/17.%20New%20Britain%20Palm%20Oil%20annual%20report%202010.pdf>. Panel i kisim toksave long Septemba 2010 raun bilong Kula/Higaturu Menesmen olsem em i rausim aplikesen bilong kampani bilong RSPO setifikesen bihain long em i tekova bikos original RSPO aplikesen i no karamapim smolholda sekta. Long dispela taim, Panel i kisim

⁴⁰³ toksave olsem HOPL bai aplai gen long ol mun i kam. Welpam Sekta Sindaun na Pasepsen Asesmen, Papua Niugini (Draft Report).

Peter McCrea (2009). Wol Benk na Welpam Industri Koporesen. p. 17.⁴⁰⁴ RSPO Prinsipol na Kraiteria bilong Sastenabol Welpam Prodaksen, Public Release Version, October 17, 2005, p. 12.

na hevi long graun lus. Prinsipol namba 5 i sut long —*Envairomen Risponsabiliti na Konsavesen bilong ol Netseral Risos na Baiodaivesiti*⁴⁰⁵ na i stretim, wantaim ol arapela samting, baiodaivesiti konsavesen. Dispela tupela Prinsipol i mas stap bilong ol tok skelim ol birua bilong SADP long busgraun.

356. Taim ol kampani i wok long bihainim ol RSPO komplaiens stendat, ol i mas wok strong long banisim gut busgraun. Dispela i save kamap long pasin ol i bihainim long groim na prosesim bilong ol kampani estet na kampani smolholda. Ol stendat na wok pasin (we i wok long groa yet) i narakain tru long ol dispela i stap insait long laspela welpam opim wok long namel i go pinis bilong 1990s. Nupela onasip bilong sampela ol dispela kampani, olsem long Kula/Higaturu (HOP), i opim rot long bihainim ol dispela nupela rot bilong lukautim tu busgraun.
357. NIWG i painim olsem ol rot bilong wok i kamap aninit long SADP na OPIC Planim Apruval Fom (we i save skelim ol envairomen isiu tasol i karamapim tu sampela ol laip sindaun hevi) we i bihainim ol askim bilong RSPO.⁴⁰⁶ Refrens long ol RSPO Prinsipol na Kraiteria bilong SADP na traim long gat ol bikpela plening wok bilong bihainim ol stendat bilong RSPO, em i wanpela bikpela wok i go het long lukim wok planim welpam i go het bihainim ol rot bilong daunim ol birua long busgraun.
358. Panel i luksave long wari bilong ol Rikwesta long mak bilong daunim diwai, posin birua long ol pipia bilong mil, na ol arapela birua long busgraun i kamap long ol olupela welpam wok long Papua Niugini.

E. Ol Benk Polisi na Prosidia bilong bihainim

359. Seksen daunbilo i givim klia piksa bilong ol Benk polisi we i sut long ol klem i stap long Rikwes bilong Inspeksen. Panel bai skelim tupela long sekim wok bihainim o komplaiens.

1. Envairomen Asesmen (OP 4.01)

360. Dispela em i Benk polisi long lukluk long ol envairomen isiu, em OP 4.01: Envairomental Asesmen, we i sut long —...*luksave olsem [ol projek] i strong long busgraun mak na i ken stap long taim...*⁴⁰⁷ Em i tok-makim Envairomen Asesmen olsem:

—*EA em i wanpela rot we sait, namel na strong bilong em long wok-glasim i sanap long pasin, bikpela na senis projek i givim long busgraun. EA i save skelim ol birua rot i ken kamap insait long wok em i mekim; [futnot i raus] i save glasim ol arapela kain projek rot; painim ol rot bilong strongim makim bilong projek, ples bilong projek, plenim bilong projek, disain, na wok karimaut taim em i banis agensim, daunim, slekim o givim kompensesen long ol birua long busgraun na strongim ol gutpela wok kamap; na i karamapim tu wok bilong daunim strong bilong ol birua long busgraun.*

⁴⁰⁵ Ol RSPO Prinsipol na Kraiteria bilong Sastenabol Welpam Prodaksen, 2005, p. 21. ⁴⁰⁶ Welpam Sekta Sindaun na Luksave Asesmen, p. 19. ⁴⁰⁷ OP 4.01: Environmen Asesmen, ¶ 1

- long olgeta wok karimaut bilong Projek. Benk i save laikim moa rot bilong banis, moa long wok slekim ol givim kompensesen, sapos i nap.*⁴⁰⁸
361. OP 4.01 i tok olsem —EA i mas luksave long netseral envairomen o busgraun (win, wara na graun); helt na sefti bilong ol man; sosol sindaun na luksave (risetolmen wok i no bihainim laik bilong pipel, ol asples pipel, na ol kalsarel risos); na tu, ol trans-baundri na wol envairomen sait.⁴⁰⁹
362. Polisi long Fores OP 4.36 i tok insait long wanpela long ol bikipela provision bilong en, olsem —Benk i no save givim mani long ol projek, we bai rausim ol bikipela lain fores o diwai o arapela kain ples sindaun bilong ol arapela enimal.⁴¹⁰ Moa long en, BP 4.36 (Forests) i tok olsem —...long taim bilong redim projek, TT [task tim lida] i mas mekim borowa o husat i dinau long givim Benk wanpela asesmen o wok skelim long mak bilong graun bilong menesmen, konsavesen, na sastenabol developmen bilong ol diwai, na wanem ol arapela makim i mas stap long banisim gut ol fores eria. Dispela asesmen i save givim ol namba bilong ol bikipela fores eria, na i kamap long mak we i gutpela long komyuniti na kalsarel pasin bilong fores eria we projek i sindaun long en."⁴¹¹
363. Polisi bilong Benk long Netseral Habitset, OP 4.04, i tok olsem —...konsavesen bilong ol netseral habitet... em i bikipela samting bilong longpela taim wok developmen// na Benk — i sapotim banisim, wok lukautim, na kirapim bek bilong ol netseral habitet na wok bilong ol⁴¹². Polisi i tok tu olsem — long skelim tingting long sapotim wanpela projek i ken givim birua long busgraun, Benk i save skelim strong bilong borowa long karimaut ol stretpela wok konsavesen na daunim mak bilong biirua. Sapos i gat ol institusenal strong hevi, projek i gat ol komponen long developim strong bilong nesenel na lokol institusen bilong mobeta wok plening na menesmen.⁴¹³

F. Glasim bilong Panel long Bihainim ol Benk Polisi

1. Strong bilong Envairomen Asesmen

364. Envairomen Asesmen i luksave olsem SADP i inapim tok makim bilong wanpela Kategori B projek na ol Rikwesta i no agensim dispela. Bihainim OP 4.01, wanpela projek i save kisim klasifikesen oslem Kateogori B —...sapos sans long ol birua nogut i kamap long manmeri o busgraun ples olsem ol ples tais, ol fores, ples kunai, na ol arapela kain bus olsem i no bagarap tumas olsem ol Kategori A projek. Ol dispela birua i save pas long wanwan ples; wanwan long ol i ken senis i go bek olsem em i stap bipo; na planti taim, ol rot bilong slekim birua em ol i ken disainim kwik, moa long ol Kategori A projek.⁴¹⁴ Long OP

⁴⁰⁸ OP 4.01, ¶ 2. ⁴⁰⁹ OP 4.01, ¶ 3. ⁴¹⁰ OP 4.36 – Forests, ¶ 5. ⁴¹¹ BP 4.36 ¶ 4. ⁴¹² OP 4.04 – Natural Habitats, ¶ 1. ⁴¹³ Ibid., ¶ 6. ⁴¹⁴ OP 4.01 – Environmental Assessment, January 1999, ¶ 8.

4.01, — *skop bilong EA long wanpela Kategori B projek i ken senis long wanwan projek, tasol em i liklik moa long luksave bilong Kategori A EA. Olsem Kategori A EA, em i glasim ol birua na gutpela i ken kamap long busgraun na i rekomendim ol root i stap long banis agensim, daunim strong bilong ol, o givim kompensesen bilong ol birua na strongim envairomen o busgraun luksave wok bilong ol.*⁴¹⁵



Piksa 15: Lukluk long wanpela neseri bilong NBPOL Neseri, Hoskins, WNB.

365. Ol Rikwesta i autim wari olsem ol Envairomen Asesmen bilong Projek i bin sot long planti samting. Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok olsem — *EA, EMP na ESMF i save painim ol sans bilong birua bilong Projek na i karamapim ol gutpela rot bilong daunim olgeta dispela ol birua.*⁴¹⁶
366. Long glasim dispela klem, Panel i luksave olsem OPIC i bin komisanim wanpela Envairomen Asesmen (i pinis long 2007) na bihain long en, wanpela Envairomen Menesmen Plen (long 2007 tu). Ol dispela i kamap wantaim wanpela Envairomen na Sosol Menesmen Fremwok (i kamap tu long 2007) we i lukluk long ol isiu i pas long Komponen 2 bilong Projek.⁴¹⁷
367. Panel i luksave tu olsem EA em i wanpela pepa i save soim —wanem|| i mas kamap, taim EMP i save soim — we|| bilong adresim ol envairomental isiu i stap insait long EA. EMP i pinis wantaim sampela ol Envairomen Kontrol Wok na Monitaring Progam (ECMMPs) bilong —...*givim ol klia tok stia long we bilong karimaut ol rot bilong abrusim birua na karimaut ol wok bilong daunim hevi.*⁴¹⁸ Ol dispela i save mekim ol dispela rot i stap insait long EA na ol namba wan sapta bilong EMP i pas moa long wok operesen.
368. Ol ECMMP i makim rot bilong bihainim long kisim ol nupela blok bilong wok planim welpam bihainim sindaun bilong ples we i ken skelim blok yet na ol ples klostu (inap long 100 mita ausait long ol baundri mak bilong blok). Dispela asesmen i laik makim klia

⁴¹⁵ Ibid., ¶ 8(b). ⁴¹⁶ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 51, Annex 1. ⁴¹⁷ Komponen 2 i saspenim pinis (OPIC Progress Report, July 2011), na ol i mas lusim long taim i gat ristraksa long Projek (update this before issuing report). ⁴¹⁸ OPIC (2007) Environmental Menesmen Plen, p. 37.

—...*sapos developmen bilong ol blok i ken givim birua long ol eria we i gat ol bikpela ples bus o konsavesen veliu.*⁴¹⁹||

369. Ol rot i stap insait long ECMMP i bihainim OPIC —*SADP Wel Pam Infiling Planim Apruval Fom.*|| Dispela em i wanpela bikpela menesmen tul ol i disainim bai ol OPIC opisa long makim strong bilong ol nupela welpam blok na long skelim ol bikpela hevi long busgraun (na tu, sampela wok graun na laip sindaun tu). Em i wanpela tul ol Ekstensen Opisa i traim long skelim sapos wok planim i ken go het o nogat, na sapos em i ken, aninit long wanem sindaun. Ol dispela fom (we i bin kamap namba wan taim long PIM long mun Ogus 2007)⁴²⁰ em ol i senisim sampela taim pinis, wantaim laspela vesen ol i raitim long mun Julai 2010.
1. Panel i luksave tu olsem narapela bikpela menesmen tul, we nau i no stap long Projek, em lenskep-level meping. Kain wok meping bai soim klia HCVF na halivim OPIC i mekim ol gutpela moa disisen long sait bilong makim ol infil blok. Meping bai poromanim Infiling Planim Apruval Fom na bai mekim ol OPIC Envairomen na Ekstensen Opisa i klia long HCFV o Wailaip Menesmen Eria we i ken silip poromanim ol blok i stap nating.
 2. Long sait bilong strong bilong ol rot i stap insait long EA we ol Rikwesta i autim, EA yet em i wanpela jenerik pepa na i ken kamapim ol proposal bihainim ol kros, moa long lukluk bek long wanpela hap stori. Dispela em i olsem long sait bilong graun na ol hevi em i ken givim long graun na wara, na moa yet, long ol enimal. EMP i save bihainim wankain luksave. Tasol taim mipela i tok olsem, ol wokmak i strong bikos ol i bihainim stretpela pasin bilong menesim o lukautim gut busgraun.
 3. Panel i no painim ol krangi astingting insait long Envairomen Asesmen, olsem ol Rikwesta i klemim, na i no kisim long ol Rikwesta, ol wanwan piksa stret long as bilong ol hevi. Bihainim provision bilong ol baienual indipenden envairomen na sosol odit i go long PIM, Menesmen i opim em yet long kisim ol tok stia long ol stekholda.⁴²¹ Olsem na, **Panel i painim olsem bungim bilong envairomen menesmen na ol mitigesen tul na strong bilong ol lain i givim infomesen ol i yusim insait long Envairomen Asesmen i bihainim stret OP 4.01.**

2. Infiling agensim Opim wok na ol hevi bilong en

373. Ol Rikwesta i tok olsem —infiling|| em i wanpela kain hait toktok. Ol i luksave olsem —*Ol Klemen na CELCOR i tingim ol samting olsem planim i kamap long sait bilong opim wokmak.*||⁴²² Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok olsem — *nem bilong infil planim em ol i yusim long olgeta Projek pepa long sait bilong planim welpam bihainim ol ekses rot i stap pinis insait long tripela bikpela NES long PNG. Em i klia long olgeta Projek*

⁴¹⁹ Ibid., p. 39. ⁴²⁰ PIM, August 2007, Infill Planting Sub-Manual, pp. 9-20. ⁴²¹ PIM, August 2007, p. 43 ⁴²² Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 3.

pepa olsem SADP bai sapotim opim wokmak insait long ol welpam eria inap long 9,000 hekta long ol smolholda VOP blok.||⁴²³

1. Panel i luksave olsem astingting bilong Projek em long sapotim wanpela opim wok long olgeta graun aninit long welpam bihainim wok infiling long ol rot netwok i stap pinis. **Em i lukluk bilong Panel olsem tok infiling, em Menesmen i no yusim long traim haitim opim wok welpam.**
2. Astingting bilong Projek em long sapotim opim bilong olgeta graun i stap aninit long welpam, tasol dispela bai kamap wantaim wok infiling bihainim rot netwok i stap pinis. Ol OPIC wokmanmeri long Oro provins i givim Inspeksen Panel wantaim stori bilong klostu 1000 aplikesen ol i kisim long ol smolholda (em long 2006-08) bilong sanapim ol nupela welpam blok. Nogat wanpela long ol dispela rikwes i bin gat wok-skelim sapos em i orait long planim welpam, aninit long ol OPIC ekstensen wokman aninit long ol asesmen gaitlain i stap nau, na ol bai no inap long inapim olgeta askim bilong kisim sapot. (Piksa 16 i soim Popondetta Plain i stap nau, we infiling bai kamap bihainim wanpela rot i stap pinis.)
3. Orijinal na nupela PIM Infil Planim Sab-Manual i tok strong olsem:



Piksa 16: Lukluk i go daun long ples kunai klostu long Popondetta

—Diveipmen bilong wanpela infil blok bai kamap sapos em inapim olgeta envairomen na sosol banis askim bilong OPIC, DEC na SADP. Ol dispela i karamapim tu ol sosol na sosioekonomik isiu, silip bilong graun, ol banis askim klostu long rot bilong wara, banis na lukautim bilong ol plaua na enimal, na sanap bilong ol lain diwai o fores long wan wan blok. Praimeri fores o lain diwai i no inap long kisim diveipmen. I go moa, wanpela fores sait i ken kisim luksave bilong smolholda welpam diveipmen sapos em i lia olsem sapos i nogat welpam diveipmen i kamap, bai sindaun bilong ol manmeri bai no inap long kamapim bek ol lain diwai. Maski wanpela hap graun i kisim tok orait pinis bilong welpam infil inapim olgeta envairomen askim, diveipmen long dispela graun aninit long SADP bai no inap kamap sapos dispela diveipmen i kamap long rausim bilong ol haus gaden i go long ol eria i nogat gutpela envairomen banis bilong en.||⁴²⁴

⁴²³ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 9, ¶ 29. ⁴²⁴ PIM, August 2007, Infill Planim Sab-Manual, p. 6.

Na

— *Ol lain insait long Projek husat i gat liklik pawa na nem, olsem ol meri, ol yut, ol wasman na ol papa bilong CPB bai nidim moa luksave bai ol i stap insait long rot bilong mekim ol disisen bilong Projek.* ⁴²⁵//

377. Olsem tok makim i go pinis, makim bilong ol infil blok i gat rot bilong bihainim aninit long SADP — *Welpam Infilling Planim Apruval Fom.* Panel i luksave olsem stretpela aplikesen bilong dispela menesmen tul, wantaim mak na save bilong OPIC, i mas gat moa wok lukautim bai wok bilong makim bai ron stret.
378. Moa yet, Panel i luksave long wari bilong ol Rikwesta olsem infiling i ken — *pulim welpam i go long ol blok we i gat lain diwai i stap pinis, ol fores na ples kunai we, maski ol i stap ausait long ol welpam blok, ol i save givim ekonomik na sosol sevis long ol lokol komyuniti wantaim ol haus gaden graun. Infilling long ol dispela blok bai opim mak bilong olgeta hap graun ol i planim wantaim welpam, na rausim ol bikpela sevis.* ⁴²⁶//
379. Olsem na wari bilong ol Rikwesta i no long busgraun hevi wok infil planim i kamapim, tasol ol hevi em i givim long ol laip sindaun sapos ol infil blok i kamap long ol eria i save — *givim ekonomik na sosol sevis*//. Panel i luksave olsem wanpela draf — *Welpam Planim Apruval Fom*// bilong Jun 2007 i givim wari long ol Rikwesta bikos dispela i opim rot long infil i kamap long — *ples we ol diwai i no inap kam bek* // maski sapos dispela eria i bin gat — *ol kaikai gaden, o ol arapela kes-krop...* ⁴²⁷//. Nupela planim fom bilong Me 2011, i rausim dispela provision o luksave na i no moa larim senisim long ol kaikai gaden graun i go kamap ol infil blok sapos ol dispela gaden em wanpela lain gaden tasol i stap bilong papagraun i aplai long en. ⁴²⁸



Piksa 17: Wanpela infil blok klostu long wanpela rot long Popondetta

⁴²⁵ Ibid. ⁴²⁶ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 2-3. ⁴²⁷ Annex 1 (Infill Planting Form, version 2.1, June 2007) of PIM, Infill Planting Submanual, August 2007 p. 17. ⁴²⁸ Annex 1 (Infill Planting Form, Revised, May 2011), Sections 7.3, p. 14

380. Toktok bilong Menesmen olsem nogat man i fosim ol smolholda long planim welpam, i kisim sapot long ol raun bilong Panel. Sapos olgeta samting i orait (gutpela prais na stretpela skelim bilong winmani namel long ol smolholda na ol mil kampani), bikipela hap ol komyuniti membas i givim tingting bilong ol, na wari ol i gat long Projek. Wapela bikipela toksave i kamaut long ol d7-7ispela miting em i nogat bikipela as long wari long welpam yet, maski olsem i gat ol wari wantaim sampela hap bilong wok welpam.
381. Planim welpam long Wes Nu Briten na Oro provins em i no nupela samting, na planti komyuniti memba i gat sampela save long ol hevi long mov i go long groim ol kes-krop, na moa yet, welpam. Bikos i gat diman o bikipela laik bilong welpam i klia long moa long 1,000 aplikesen OPIC i kisim pinis bilong wok infiling long Oro provins. Panel i ken skelim tingting tasol olsem ol dispela apliken i skelim pinis gutpela na nogut na mekim disisen bilong ol.

3. Graun i lus, Topsoil i pinis na Graun i pulap long wara

82. Ol Rikwesta i luksave olsem —...*groim welpam i nidim graun we i mas klia long olgeta samting, na dispela i gat bikipela birua long graun i lus, topsoil i pinis, na wara i pulap long ol wara.*⁴²⁹ Ol i klem olsem ol Asesmen i no tingim — *ekolojikal, sosio-ekonomik na ol kalsarel wok...* olsem kliarim graun i ken givim bikipela hevi long ol komyuniti long ples.
383. Bekim bilong Menesmen i no pasim ol dispela graun i ken lus, topsoil i pinis, na graun i pulap long wara, tasol i tok olsem — *EA, EMP na ESMF i makim ol bikipela envairomen hevi bilong Projek na i givim ol gutpela rot bilong daunim o slekim ol dispela hevi.*⁴³⁰ Bekim bilong Menesmen i luksave tu olsem — ***Antap long ol dispela sistem, SAMP i sanapim provision bilong wapela indipenden bai-enual envairomen odit.***⁴³¹ (tok strongim i stap yet long orijinal toktok).
1. Panel i makim long kirap bilong dispela sapta, we hairaki o lain bilong EA, EMP (wantaim ol ECMMP), na ol OPIC infiling planim apruval fom i save ron bihainim lain: long wapela stetmen i tok klia long ol birua bilong graun lus na graun i pulap long wara long tok klia long wanem samting i mas kamap long daunim hevi ol i givim, na long yusim wapela menesmen tul long fil.
 2. EA i makim klia ol birua long busgraun i ken givim long graun. Ol dispela hevi em:
 - —*lusim graun long wara na win, na graun i go pulap long maus bilong ol wara;*
 - *bagarapim bilong graun long ol pipia na arapela marasin (wantaim bikipela hap mak bilong liklik das i kam long graun lus hevi).*⁴³²

⁴²⁹ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 4. ⁴³⁰ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 36, ¶ 119. ⁴³¹ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 37, ¶ 122. ⁴³² OPIC (2007) Envairomen Asesmen, p. 52.

386. EA i tok moa olsem — *kliarim graun bilong planim welpam o long silipim rot i save larim graun i stap nating na sapos i nogat samting i groa long en kwik, em i ken lus.*⁴³³ Ol dispela poin i stap klia gen insait long Envairomen Menesmen Plen (EMP), we i tok olsem — *graun i lus long ol hap i nogat bus long en bihainim wok kliarim graun i mas gat karamapim bilong ol hap gras na diwai na bai kirapim kwik bus bilong karamapim gut graun.*⁴³⁴
387. EMP i klia long ol bafa zon mak (i kam long Papua Niugini Fores Atoriti Koud ov Praktis).⁴³⁵ Ol dispela askim i traim long daunim lus bilong topsoil long graun ol i kliarim, i go long wanpela hanwara na ol askim i stap insait long Envairomen Kontrol Mesas na Monitaring Progrem (ECMMP) 2. EMP i luksave tu olsem — *kliarim bilong ol nupela blok bai kamapim bikipela mak pipia bilong bus we bai sting antap long graun long banisim graun long lus na strongim gris i go bek long graun.*⁴³⁶
388. ECMMP 2 i tok-makim ol rot bilong bihainim bilong — *...abrusim o daunim strong bilong ol birua long ol of-sait envairomen impek long kliarim bus na redim graun long ol nupela blok.*⁴³⁷ Em i tok klia olsem — *Nupela blok eria bai ol i kliarim hap hap na daunim sans long graun i lus.*⁴³⁸ Em i nidim olgeta wanwan nupela blok ona long redim wanpela nupela blok kliarens plen we — *...bai givim inap long 10 mita bafa zon o banis bilong busgraun long stap raunim ol baundri bilong blok,*⁴³⁹ na i mas i gat — *karamapim kwik ol hap we graun i lus, wantaim ol sting bus bilong daunim hevi long graun, na birua bilong graun i lus* na — *planim kwik ol bus bilong holim graun i stap strong.*⁴⁴⁰ Piksa 18 i soim wanpela Class 1 wara (olsem, wanpela wara we i nidim wanpela бага zon o banis inap long 50 mita) wantaim wanpela haus gaden long lephan sait, ol i kliarim i go inap long pinis bilong wara, na papa bilong dispela wara i aplai long wanpela infil blok.

⁴³³ Ibid., p. 52. ⁴³⁴ OPIC (2007) Environmental Management Plan, p. 9. ⁴³⁵ Ibid., p. 17. ⁴³⁶ Ibid., p. 25. ⁴³⁷ OPIC (2007) Environmental Management Plan, ECMMP 2, p. 46. ⁴³⁸ Ibid. ⁴³⁹ Ibid. ⁴⁴⁰ Ibid.



Piksa 18: “Klas 1 wara” long Hoskins eria

389. Long bungim tok, ol dispela askim i traim long daunim planim bilong welpam long ol sait bilong maunten i moa long 25°, na daunim mak bilong eria we graun i silip nating; sanapim ol bus bilong holim graun kwik; na sanapim ol bafa zon we ol blok i silip bihainim ol hanwara i stap pinis. Olgeta bung wantaim bai daunim hevi bilong graun lus na go insait long ol wara i stap klostu. Ol i bikpela na strongpela, na i hat long lukim wanem kain wok bai mas kamap. Salens bilong OPIC em bilong lukim olsem ol dispela wok banis i kamap stret long graun. OPIC ekstensen, envairomen, na graun opisa bai gat bikpela wok long mekim long strongim ol dispela rot bilong pasim hevi. Ol i mas gat klia luksave long olgeta agrikalsa, envairomen, na komyuniti hevi. Wok skelim strong bilong ol dispela samting bai kamap insait long bai-enuel envairomen odit.⁴⁴¹
390. Planti planim welpam insait long Wes Nu Briten na Oro i kamap long graun i silip stret, olsem na wanem wara i ron antap long graun long taim bilong bikpela ren, bai ron isi tasol, na bai no inap kamapim graun lus. Ol planim gaitlain bilong OPIC i daunim mak bilong ol nupela planim long ol ples i stap long graun long daunbilo long 25°,⁴⁴² wanpela askim we bai pasim wok planim long ol sait bilong maunten, we hevi bilong graun lus i save kamap moa, bai ol i no inap yusim long planim welpam.
391. Long fil raun bilong Panel i go long Oro provins long Septemba 2010, i bin i gat piksa long ol pinat rop ol i planim long ol bikpela blok welpam, we ol i planim long taim bilong kliarim blok, bai em i pasim graun lus long kamap.

⁴⁴¹ PIM, Procurement Manual, TOR for Environment and Social Auditor, pp. 442-49. ⁴⁴² OPIC (July 2010) SADP Oil Palm Infilling Approval Form, and OPIC -SADP (August 1, 2010) Oil Palm Planting Approval Form – Replant, p. 4.



Piksa 19: Ol pinat rop i groa karamapim graun long daunim hevi bilong graun lus

392. Menesmen i luksave long graun lus hevi i ken kamap na graun i ken pulap insait long ol hanwara long taim bilong sanapim ol nupela welpam blok. EA, EMP, na ECMMP i gat rot bilong daunim ol birua bilong graun-lus, topsoil i pinis, na graun i pulap long wara. Bungim wantaim, na olgeta dispela hevi i ken daunim graun lus hevi na karim bilong graun i go insait long ol wara. Tasol bikos i gat ol bipo pasin i stap wantaim OPIC wokmak, Menesmen i mas givim ol OPIC wokman gutpela trening, sapot, na supavisin long inapim Projek karimaut bihainim disain bilong en. **Panel i painim olsem Projek i gat ol rot bilong daunim graun lus hevi na pinisim bilong topsoil na siltesen o graun i pulap long wara i bihainim stret OP 4.01.**

4. Kemikal na Baiolojikal Posin long ol Hanwara

393. Ol Rikwesta i klem olsem —...welpam developmen i save kamapim kemikal na baiolojikal posin i go insait long ol hanwara. Insait long planti plantesen na smolholda plot, ol i save yusim fetilaisa long strongim gris long graun na karim bilong diwai. Nogut rot long yusim ol agrikalsa kemikal na taim em i ron i go long ol ples we bikpela ren i ken kamapim posin i go insait long wara sistem na algi i save groan a bagarapim sindaun bilong wara na busgraun.||⁴⁴³

394. Ol Rikwesta i tok olsem — *ol envairomen asesmen i kamap i sot long planti samting, na i no lukim ol bikpela birua i ken kamap,*⁴⁴⁴ olsem hevi bilong pipia bilong mil i go insait long ol wara, pis na pipel.

395. OP 4.01 tok olsem —*EA em i wanpela rot we mak bilong wok glasim em i mekim, i bihainim sanap, bikpela na kain ol birua long busgraun long projek. EA i save skelim ol birua i ken kamap long ol eria em i stap long en.*⁴⁴⁵

⁴⁴³ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 4. ⁴⁴⁴ Ibid., p. 9. ⁴⁴⁵ OP 4.01, ¶2



Piksa 20: Lukluk i go long Ambogo Riva long Oro provins we ol i tok ol i kisim bikpela hap pipia bilong ol welpam mil

396. Menesmen i tok olsem —...i nogat inap stori insait long EA long sait bilong ol efluen o pipia bilong ol mil⁴⁴⁶ na — i wanbel olsem i mas i gat moa bikpela wok glasim long ol hevi bilong moa prodaksen long ol welpam mil na ol efluen o pipia mas kamap bihainim askim bilong OP/BP 4.01.⁴⁴⁷ Bekim bilong Menesmen i no lukluk stretim ol kain kain kemikal na baiolojikal posin i ken bagarapim ol wara, moa long tokluksave bilong en long ol mil pipia, tasol i tok olsem —EA, EMP na ESMF i painim ol birua i ken kamap aninit long Projek, na i karamapim ol gutpela na strongpela rot bilong daunim ol dispela hevi.⁴⁴⁸
397. **Kemikal Posin bagarapim.** Ol welpam kampani i save yusim ol kemikal fetilaisa insait long ol estet bilong ol, bihainim strong na taim bilong yusim we i bihainim stia OPRA yet i givim. Ol stia OPRA i givim i sanap long ol risets ol i mekim long strongim groa, na bikos fetilaisa em i bikpela mani, ol i no save abrusim mak taim ol i yusim. (Tebol 4).

Tebol 4: Ol Arere mak bilong ol Fetilaisa Ret bilong 2010

Fertilizer Type	Rounds / year	Rate (kg)/ palm	Total rate (kg) / palm / year
Muriate of Potash (MOP)	2	1.00	2.00
Sulphate of Ammonia (SOA)	1	1.75	1.75
Kieserite	1	1.00	1.00
Sodium Borate	1	0.50	0.5
Ammonium Chloride (A/C)	1	1.00 – 2.50	1.00 – 2.50 (different blocks for diff. rate due to soil leaf analysis-recommendation from OPRA)

I kam long: NBPOL data.

398. Ol bikpela samting we i ken kamapim kemikal polusen o posin sapos em i go insait long ol hanwara o graun wara sistem em bai potassium na naitrojen long o kainkain mak bilong ol. Dispela i ken kamapim ol algi blum o plawa i kamap long bikpela mak moa.

⁴⁴⁶ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 36, ¶ 117. ⁴⁴⁷ Ibid., p. 36, ¶.119. ⁴⁴⁸ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 36, ¶119.

399. Planti ol smolholda i tokim Panel tim taim ol i raun i go lukim ool, olsem ol i no save yusim fetilaisa, na planti taim, ol i no save yusim. Wapela bikipela banis long apim wok-mak bilong ol smolholda blok. Apim long mak bilong smolholda wok bai nidim mobeta wok agrikalsa, moa yet long yusim fetilaisa – wapela klia aswok bilong SADP na ol miling kampani. Ausait long SADP, OPIC i took em yet, olsem em i laik traim strongim ol FFB karim insait long smolholda sekta long namel long 10 na 15 tan long wanwan hekta i go inap long 25 tan long wan hekta olgeta yia, taim em i tisim ol smolholda long we bilong yusim fetilaisa.⁴⁴⁹ Olsem na, sapos ol agronomic pasin i ken strong, mak bilong ol yusim fetilaisa long ol smolholda blok i ken go antap long bihain taim.
400. Insait long ol raun lukluk bilong en, Panel tim i painimaut olsem ol fetilaisa bek, sampela taim ol i save lusim i stap long fil, tasol i nogat evidens i soim olsem dispela pasin i save kamap oltaim. Wanem hap dispela i save kamap, i ken lukim ol fetilaisa i kamapim birua, we i min olsem birua i kamap long han bilong ol asples yet, tasol bai i no inap givim moa hevi long ol ples i stap daun long sait bilong wara.
401. Bikipela ren i save pundaun insait long olgeta eria i save groim welpam, olsem na bai gat taim we bikipela wara i save ron antap long graun long dispela kain taim (maski i gat planti volkeno graun bilong holim wara i stap insait long planti ol Projek eria).⁴⁵⁰ Dispela i ken lukim sampela ron bilong ol kemikal i go insait long ol hanwara, olsem dairek ovalen flo o taim em i ron i go insait long graun pastaim long ol bus, gras na diwai i pulim. Dispela bai no inap kamapim ol bikipela lokol o daunstrim kemikal polusen o posinim, tasol bikos i nogat bikipela fetilaisa yusim (taim ol i skelim long dispela kain ples) na long bikipela daunim long strong bilong fetilaisa long wara, we i save kamap wantaim bikipela mak ren.⁴⁵¹
402. Nogat wapela ol Rikwesta o ol arapela smolholda i toktok wantaim Panel i tokaut sapos i gat taim ol i lukim ol algi blum o yutrofikesen i kamap long ol wara, we i save kamap sapos wara i gat bikipela mak naitrojen na/potasium insait long wara.
403. PAD i ripot olsem —...*wapela bikipela wok stadi i kamap long lukluk long hevi bilong ol welpam wok long kwolati o strong bilong o freswara na wara helt insait long ol projek eria, em wanpeal spesolis freswara ekolojis i painimaut. Ol risal o kaikai bilong dispela wok stadi (i stap insait long ol Projek fail) i soim olsem ol welpam operesen i stap pinis i nogat birua long freswara kwolati insait long dispela tupela provins.*⁴⁵²
404. Ol mil i save oltaim sekim ol wara long kemikal posin, tasol nogat stori i kamap long skelim sapos ol bekgraun kemikal level bilong ol wara i go antap o nogat. Sans long kemikal polusen o posin i kamap long ol wara, wantaim tu hevi bilong yutrofikesen,

⁴⁴⁹ PNGOPRA-2009 Annual Report, p. iv, 1-1. ⁴⁵⁰ Bonell, M., Gilmour, D. A. Cassells, D.S. (1983). —Runoff generation in tropical rainforests of North Queensland, Australia, and the implications for land use management. || In *Hydrology of Humid Tropical Regions of Agriculture and Forestry Practice* (proc. of the Hamburg Symposium, August 1983) I.A.H.S. Publ. No. 140, pp. 287-297.

⁴⁵¹ Bonell, M, Gilmour, DA and Cassells, DS. (1991). —The links between synoptic climatology and the runoff response of rainforest catchments on the wet tropical coast of north-eastern Queensland. || In G. Werren and P. Kershaw (eds), *The Rainforest Legacy* (Vol 2) ; —Flora and fauna of the rainforests. || Australia Government Pub. Serv. pp. 27-62. ⁴⁵² PAD, p. 93, ¶ 8.

i stap insait long EA na long EMP. Planti long ol wok i go het long daunim graun lus hevi na graun i pulap long wara (tok klia bilong en i stap long seksen i go pinis) bai strong long daunim ron bilong ol kemikal i go insait long ol wara. Ol dispela i karamapim wok bilong planim samting bilong karamapim na holim graun, tambu long planim welpam long ol graun i silip aninit long 25°, na yusim ol bafa zon bihainim ol sait bilong ol wara. Ol dispela gaitlain i stap aninit long ol ECMMP na OPIC Infiling Planim Apruval Fom.

405. **Em i tingting bilong Panel olsem Menesmen i luksave long sans bilong kemikal polusen o posinim wantaim welpam developmen, na i mekim olgeta samting insait long disain bilong Projek long mekim bai ol birua long fetilaisa ran-of i stap daunbilo tru. Panel i painim olsem ol dispela wok i bihainim stret OP 4.01.** Menesmen bai mas was olsem OPIC i givim inap trening, sapot, na stia long ol ekstensen wokman bilong en bai ol i save long disain na tuls i stap insait long projek, na yusim ol stret.
406. **Baiolojikal Polusen.** Ol birua bilong ol mil efluen o pipia i no stap insait long Projek analisis o wok glasim, na luksave long dispela i stap insait long Bekim bilong Menesmen. Ol Rikwesta i klem olsem birua i stap yet bikos pipia i wok lusim mil na ron i go insait long ol hanwara, na moa yet long Wara Ambogo na ol hetwara bilong Wara Mamba. Tupela stadi i bin kamap long Oro long sekim ol dispela sut tok. Wanpela bikpela Envairomen Eksaminesen (IEE) long ol birua bilong welpam wok long Popondetta (we i kisim tupela envairomen konsalten long mekim) i bin kirap long mun Februari 2006 em Australian Konsavesen Faundesen bilong CELCOR, na Ahora/Kakandetta Pipels Faundesen. Namba wan bikpela astingting bilong IEE em long — *bungim na skelim ol saintifik evidens bilong sapotim ol klem long kisim kompensesen, bilong ol ples i sindaun bihainim wara daunbilo long ol welpam miling wok.*⁴⁵⁵ Namba tu wok stadi i bin kamap insait long Mamba eria, em Friens of Mamba i karimaut long Novemba 2009, na em i bagarapim Higaturu mil long go het long givim dispela birua yet.⁴⁵⁶
407. Insait long IEE ripot, ol saveman i raitim i tok olsem filwok bilong ol em i namba wan wok ol i mekim, tasol ol i mekim bihainim ol saintifik rot. Ol i kisim ol sempol long Wara Ambogo (tripela sempol, na wanpela long nait) na long Seiha Krik o hanwara (foapela sempol). Bikpela samting ol i painim long Wara Ambogo, em "*i daunbilo mak bilong oksigen long ples ol i sekim – namel mak bilong en i sanap long 81% disolv oksigen*" -- we i soim klia olsem —*pipia POME [Palm Oil Mill Effluent] i wok long ron i go insait long wara long nait.*⁴⁵⁷ Ol sempol ol i kisim long Seiha Krik i soim tu olsem i gat ol fikal kolifom o sampela pekpek i stap long wara long olgeta hap ol i kisim sempol long en, nogut i kamap taim —*bikpela ren i pundaun na karim ol pekpek i kam aut long ol septic tank aninit long graun, o long sefes ranof i go insait long Krik.* // Ol namba tu risal ol i tok ol —*i wari long en*⁴⁵⁸ bikos Seiha Krik wara em ol i save yusim bilong kuk na dring.

⁴⁵³ Envairomen Asesmen (Janueri 2007) p. 56.

⁴⁵⁴ Envairomen Menesmen Plen (Janueri 2007) p. 22.

⁴⁵⁵ Impacts of Oil Palm Activities in the Kokoda and Popondetta Catchments: An Initial Environmental Examination. February/March 2006. S2/1.

⁴⁵⁶ Friends of Mamba/CELCOR 27 November 2009. '*Comments on RSPO Certification of CTP (PNG) Limited Trading as Higaturu Oil Palm Limited in the Oro province PNG*' submitted to BSI Management Systems, Singapore.

⁴⁵⁷ Hevi bilong Welpam. S3/9. ⁴⁵⁸ Hevi bilong Welpam, S3/8.



Picture 21: An effluent pond of Kula/Higaturu Oil Palm at the time of Panel team's Investigation visit

408. IEE ripot i tok olsem —*ol wara rot insait long Popondetta kesmen em ol i save kisim bagarap long pipia bilong welpam na pekpek bilong man, maski level bilong wel na gris insait long Wara Ambogo long poin ol i go aut long en ol i sekim na i no antap (6ppm). Sot long win oksigen i go daun insait long disas plum insait long olgeta foapela de ol i kisim sempol long en na long nait tu.*⁴⁵⁹||
409. IEE ripot i kamap pastaim long sanapim bilong welpam mil long Mamba, klostu long Kokoda. Wara kwolati insait long apa kesmen bilong Kokoda (Ol Wara Madi na Mambare) i bin gutpela tru, ⁴⁶⁰ na i gat tok stia llong wanpela Envairomen Impek Asesmen (EIA) i mas kamap long hap long stap olsem beslain namba bilong ol wok iveluesen long bihain.⁴⁶¹
410. IEE ripot i tok olsem sot long pis insait long wara sistem daunbilo long Popondetta kesemen. IEE ripot i tok olsem dispela sot long pis i kamap – *bikos sampela netseral na samting ol man yet i mekim, olsem sedimentesen..., yusim pestisait o marasin, givim POME long HOPPL mil na ol arapela diwai banis pipia i kam long Ambogo somil.*⁴⁶²|| Ples pipia bilong Popondetta, we i stap long sait bilong riva, i mas ples ol pipia i kam long en — *olsem ol toksik o strongpela hanmak i kam long ol kontena bilong ol domestik, agrikalsarel na industrial kemikal.*⁴⁶³|| Ripot i tok tu olsem —*I mas gat ol ripot long ol wokman i wasim ol spre masin bilong ol insait long ol wara, na yusim ol kemikal long kilim pis na kindam.*⁴⁶⁴|| Ol bikpela pis i save dai i save kamap bihain long bikpela ren i pundaun, moa yet long namel bilong 1980s.
411. Envairomen Menesa bilong Kula/Higaturu Welpam mil i tok wanbel olsem sistem i stap nau i no inap long bikpela ren i pundaun na rot bilong skelim ol pipia i go insait long wara, long stopim

⁴⁵⁹ Impacts of Oil Palm, S3/1. ⁴⁶⁰ Ibid., S3/14. ⁴⁶¹ Ibid., S1/2. ⁴⁶² Ibid., S3/15. ⁴⁶³ Ibid., S4/10. ⁴⁶⁴ Ibid., S4/13.

ritensen pon long brukim ol banis bilong em. Em i tok olsem rausim bilong ol wel na gris i no abrusim tu pats per milian (ppm), maski siks ppm i stap bihain long bikpela ren i pundaun.⁴⁶⁵

412. Menesmen i luksave insait long Bekim bilong en, olsem —*i nogat inapim long ol askim bilong OP 4.01 (Envairomen Asesmen), we em i nogat inap stori insait long EA long samting olsem ol efluen o pipia, na wanpela infomesen tasol i stap na go aut long ol stekholda, em long konsaltesen bilong EA, we tok klia i go aut long toksave long maus tasol.*||⁴⁶⁶ Tasol, em i klia long wanpela pas i kam long Kantri Dairekta bilong Papua Niugini, long de Jun 10, 2004, olsem Benk i klia long bikpela efluen polusen o posinim na em strongim ol stekholda olsem em bai stretim dispela wari long taim bilong Projek wok redi. Dispela leta, we i go long Eksektiv Dairekta bilong CELCOR, tok, —*sapos i gat disisen long go het wantaim dispela projek, aninit long ol Wol Benk polisi, ol wari bilong Ahora/Kakandetta Presa Grup long birua i ken kamap long busgraun, polusen o posinim bbilong wara, na tu, yusim bilong graun, bai kamap long taim bilong projek wok redi.*||⁴⁶⁷ Olsem na taim Menesmen i tok long Bekim bilong en, olsem —*wanpela bikpela glasim bilong hevi bilong moa pipia o efluen i go aut long Projek wok bai mas kamap, antap long monitaring wok ISO14001 na RPSO setifikesen bilong ol miling kampani,*||⁴⁶⁸ dispela wok em bai inapim wanpela tok-promis ol i mekim faivpela yia i go pinis.
413. Wanpela stadi, ol i kolim —*Efluen Stadi,*||⁴⁶⁹ em Menesmen i komisinim long 2010. Inspeksen Panel i kisim draf ripot, long Februari 18 na fainal ripot long Julai 29, 2011. Efluen Stadi i soim olsem sampela ples i bungim ol operesenal hevi, we i senisim wok-kamap bilong ol. Stadi i luksave tu long ol salens i stap long kwolati bilong strongim ol regulesen, na i luksave olsem sampela sait o eria bai kisim gutpela bilong moa wok monitaring.⁴⁷⁰ Bikos i nogat inap tok klia long ol pemit, na i gat sot long ol namba na stori, nab anis long redim gut stadi, stadi no mekim ol bikpela na strongpela tok long bihainim loa pasin bilong olgeta mil, maski em i luksave olsem planti, o klostu olgeta mil i bihainim stret loa.⁴⁷¹ I nogat toktok long rot ol i bihainim long kamap wantaim dispela luksave, bikos i gat planti banis na samting we i no klia insait long stadi.
414. Stadi i tok olsem —*bikpela moa yusim bilong ol flo mita bai inapim disain o operesenal senis long daunim birua bilong ol pond i abrusim mak; na moa kwolati monitaring long ol pond bai givim moa save long baiolojikal sindaun i kamap na painim rot bilong strongim wok bilong pond.*||⁴⁷² Moa long en, stadi i toktok long strong bilong ol namba na stori na i luksave tu olsem ful komplaiens o bihainim stret bilong ol wara kwolati stendat i ken mobeta yet.⁴⁷³ Stadi i lukluk long ol asua namel long

⁴⁶⁵ Ibid., S5/3. ⁴⁶⁶ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 28, ¶ 85. ⁴⁶⁷ World Bank Letter, June 10, 2004, p. 1. ⁴⁶⁸ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. ix.

⁴⁶⁹ Papua Niugini Smolholda Agrikalsarel Developmen Projek_Effluent Study|| July 25, 2011.

Commissioned by the World Bank. J Barrett, Hebee Ltd. ⁴⁷⁰ Effluent Study, p. 25. ⁴⁷¹ Ibid., p. 50. ⁴⁷² Ibid., p. 25. ⁴⁷³ Effluent Study, p. 51.

Ol Wol Benk Grup Envairomen Helt na Sefti Stendat bilong Vestabol Wel Prosesim (2007) na ol nesenel loa i stap, na tu, sampela ol bikpela wok isiu we i mas gat moa glasim, na luksave long ol kain kain mil insait long Projek eria.

415. Ol stadi painimaut i tok olsem —*bikos olgeta mil i setifai pinis o bai klostu kisim setifikesen long ISO 14001 na RSPO astingting na kraiteria, we i gat ol tokpromis bilong mobeta wok stretim i go moa, ol rot bilong mekim, savemak na kontrol i mas stap long tritim POME aninit long wok bilong SADP.*⁴⁷⁴ Tasol, Benk Menesmen, insait long ovaviu long Efluen Stadi na Eksen Plen, i luksave olsem stadi em — *i no karamapim olgeta samting.*⁴⁷⁵ Panel i wanbel wantaim dispela wok glasim na i tok luksave long wok Menesmen i mekim long karimaut — *moa teknikal wok glasim long strong na savemak bilong wanwan mil long tritim pipia wara.*⁴⁷⁶
416. Eksen Plen bilong Efluen Stadi i makim tripela bikpela samting bilong stretim. Ol dispela samting em:
- (1) *Kisim tok-promis long leta i kam long ol projek eria kampani long: (i) sanapim beslain infomesen bilong wanwan projek eria mil, na (ii) karimaut wanpela folo-ap envairomen odit long ol dispela mil. Bihainim ol risal bilong folo-ap odit na luksave long strong bilong ol RSPO savelens odit, na ol arapela folo-ap odit bai mas kisim luksave tu.*
 - (2) *Karimaut wanwan ol samting long ol dispela mil we i kisim luksave long gat ol bikpela sans long birua i kamap long busgraun: (i) Sangara Mil bilong Higaturu/Kula Palm Oil, (ii) Hargy na Navo Mills bilong Hargy Oil Palm Ltd., na (iii) Mosa Mill bilong New Britain Palm Oil (NBPOL);*
 - (3) *Halivim Gavman (DEC) na indastri long kamapim wanpela apdet long Draf PNG Koud ov Praktis bilong Welpam [Prosesing] Indastri, we ol bai yusim long kamapim ol regulesen o loa, long strongim kwolati na skop bilong ol envairomen monitaring wok long was long ol efluen o pipia, givim moa stia long disain na wok bilong welpam pipia wara tritmen sistem long PNG, na givim mobeta tok klia long ol —taget// na — arere// bilong tromoi ol pipia wara ol i tritim pinis i go long ol hanwara o graun.*
417. **Panel i wanbel wantaim tingting bilong Menesmen olsem sot long inap wok glasim long ol hevi i kam long mil efluen o pipia i no bihainim OP 4.01. Panel i luksave tu olsem Agrid Eksenn Plen i stap insait long Efluen Stadi, i lukluk long isiu bilong ol birua nogut i ken kamap long mil efluen na taim ol i wok bihainim, em i ken bringim Projek i bihainim stret OP 4.01. Wantaim ol salens i stap long karimaut ol envairomen regulesen long Papua Niugini, olsem ol i tok long Efluen Stadi, Panel i luksave olsem Menesmen i mas kamapim wanpela stadi long taim yet.**

⁴⁷⁴ Ibid., p. ix. ⁴⁷⁵ Forward to Agreed Action Plan, July 25, 2011. ⁴⁷⁶ PNG Smolhola Agrikalsa Dvelopmen Projek Welpam Mil Efluen Menesmen Agrid Eksen Plen, Julai 25, 2011.

5. Birua bilong rausim ol Hai Konsavesen Velu Fores o lain diwai

1. Ol Rikwesta i bilip olsem Projek bai bringim birua bilong diforestesen o rausim ol bikipela velu fores o lain diwai bikos —*Ol OPIC opisa i nogat inap savemak long klasifaim ol diwai*// sret. Menesmen i tok olsem — *disain bilong Projek i gat ol rot i stap bilong daunim na slekim ol birua bilong rausim ol bikipela velu fores eria.*⁴⁷⁷ Menesmen i tok strong olsem ol pasin i stap nau bai lukim nogat birua nogut i kamap long ol fores o long ol nupela fores eria. Menesmen i luksave olsem ol OPIC ekstensen opisa i kisim trening long luksave long ol diwai, bai kisim moa trening. Menesmen i bilip olsem sot long fores inventri i no asua wantaim BP4.36 (Forests). Las tru, bikos i nogat wanpela welpam koud ov praktis, Menesmen i tok olsem ol i mas bihainim Papua Niugini koud ov praktis na nesenel envairomen loa.⁴⁷⁸
2. Fores kava long Oro provins i gat bikipela senis long ol yia i go pinis, bihainim seniss long agrikalsa na yusim graun pasin. Ol dispela em bungim bilong ol kain kain kes-krop (kopi, kakau, raba, kokonas, na welpam) i go insait long ol agrikalsarel sistem long kain kain taim, olgeta we i ken senisim sindaun bilong ol fores. Opim bilong komosal wok loging long ol yia i go pinis em bikipela samting.
3. Oro provins i gat 1,555,545 hekta renfores, wantaim ol fores i lus pinis, we i makim 69% long olgeta graun bilong en. Long 2002 na i kam, klostu 6% (90,087 ha) bilong renfores kava long Oro we ol i klasifaim olsem ‘degraded’ o i nogat moa. Namel long 1962 na 2002, inap long 14.9% bilong ol olupela fores i lus long Papua Niugini long olgeta wok forestri.⁴⁷⁹ Klostu 6,771 hekta bilong fores i klia bilong welpam na ol raba plantesen long Oro; long Wes Nu Briten, 58,467 hekta bilong fores i bin klia bilong mekim ol plantesen insait long laspela 30 yia, inap long 3.2% bilong 1972 fores kava.⁴⁸⁰
4. Olgeta ol dispela graun i save yusim ol senis i kamap long senisim bikipela velu fores long kain kain ol ‘degraded’ o ‘disturbed forest’, planti we i gat bikipela envairomen, sosol na ekonomik velu yet bilong ol asples komyuniti. Sindaun long Popondetta eria em i gat planti bikipela kunai ples na ol wanwan liklik lain diwai. Planti graun i nogat moa diwai, na i senis i kamap long ol namba wan bikipela-velu fores i stap nau long Oro provins, em i kamap insait long ol yia pastaim long kamap bilong SADP, na nogat proposal aninit long SADP i ken kamapim moa wok diforestesen.
5. Ol dispela luksave bilong Panel i bruk aninit long foapela kategori i bihainim klem bilong ol Rikwesta:
 - OPIC em i wanpela ogenaísesen i save ron bihainim taget, na ol OPIC ekstensen opisa i save kisim wok skelim long strong bilong ol long inapim ol taget bilong ol long planim welpam;

⁴⁷⁷ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 36, ¶ 117. ⁴⁷⁸ Ibid., p. 38, ¶ 125. ⁴⁷⁹ Friends of the Earth Japan. (2011, June). Evaluation of Social and Environmental Risks Accompanying the Procurement of Timber from Papua New Guinea. Global Environment Forum Publication. ⁴⁸⁰ Shearman, P.L., Bryan, J.E., Ash, J., Hunnam, P., Mackey, B., and B. Lokes. (2008). The State of the Forests of Papua New Guinea. Mapping the extent and condition of forest cover and measuring the drivers of forest change during 1972-2002. University of Papua New Guinea, 2008.

- Ol OPIC ekstensen opisa i no gat inap save long yusim sait-sensitiv wok glasim insait long Infil Planim Apruval Fom;
- Benk i no bihainim stret OP 4.36 (Fores) bikos em i no karimaut inventri bilong Hai Konsavesen Veliu Fores; na
- Bungim bilong olgeta dispela ol samting antap bai kamapim fores konsavesen na degradesen. Long dispela, ol rot i stap bilong slekim ol hevi insait long EMP long sait bilong banisim ol Hai Konsavesen Veliu Fores i no inap.

423. Long kirap bilong dispela tok-paitim, em i bikpela samting long tingim olsem i nogat nupela welpam wok-planim long 2001 yet na i kam. Olsem na luksave long ol intenal kalsa na menesmen sistem bilong OPIC, na moa yet long setim ol planim taget o mak, i nidim moa glasim long ol pasin i kamap pastaim long 2001.

424. **OPIC na Ivaluesen bilong ol Ekstensen Opisa** Wanpela rivi bilong ol bipo Smolholda Welpam Developmen Projek (1992-2001) i luksave olsem — *Ol OPIC ekstensen opisa i mas skelim gut wok bilong ol, we i karamapim wanpela enual taget bilong welpam ol i planim bilong wanwan ekstensen opisa, na lukluk bek long en, em i wanpela moa rot long gutpela wok menesmen bilong envairomen, na long wankain taim, traim long balensim banisim gut busgraun, wantaim ol bikpela askim long ol papagraun bilong developmen sponsasip.*⁴⁸¹ Ol askim na bekim bilong Panel i soim klia olsem pastaim long 2001, OPIC long Oro (tasol i no long Wes Nu Briten) i bin strong tru na ol ekstensen opisa i bin gat ol taget bilong welpam long planim. Tasol i gat tok strongim olsem dispela i no wankain moa. Panel tim i lukluk long ol fom OPIC menesmen i yusim bilong ol enual wok pafomens apresal, na ol wokman i kisim evaluesen o skelim luksave i save kisim askim long makim fopela o faivpela bikpela eria olsem — *ol hai praioriti taget, o bikpela ol wok bilong inapim*|| we i ken karamapim ol wok olsem ol fil de o skelim ol blok bilong planim welpam. Dispela wok em i save kamap long planti ol ogenaísesen, na i nogat samting hia long tok olsem OPIC menesmen bai yusim ol planim welpam taget long ol ekstensen opisa. Ol sinia memba bilong OPIC i tok strong olsem ol dispela kain taget i no stap, o i no stap long ol yia i kam inap nau. Folo-ap toktok wantaim wanwan ol ekstens opisa i tok stret olsem i nogat kampani pasin long OPIC we i givim presa long ol opisa long inapim ol planim taget. Olgeta i tok olsem i nogat planim i kamap long planti yia pinis na i nogat moa luksave o gat nid long ol planim taget.

425. Ol taget bilonggg infil planim (lis bilong en i stap long pes 2 bilong PIM Infil Planim Sab-Manual) i mas gat luksave olsem ol taget bilong larim wok baset na projek plenim long kamap. Ol i noken kamap olsem ol taget we ol i mas inapim na dispela bai go aut long wanwan ol ekstensen opisa. Plenim kain Projek olsem SADP i mas kamap gut, na ol i mas gat makim bilong ol eria ol i laik planim welpam long en.

426. **Wokmak bilong ol OPIC Ekstensen Opisa** Ol Rikwesta i wari olsem Projek i ken kamapim hevi long busgraun bikos — *planti OPIC opisa i nogat inap save long klasifaim gut ol fores*

⁴⁸¹ Environmental Impact Review of Current Project and Recommendations for Consideration in any Future Development. Study of Oro Smallholder Oil Palm Development Project (Ln. 3485-PNG) Tom Diwai Vigus (2001), p. 39, Oil Palm Industry Corporation.

*insait long stretpela fores kraiteria bilong praimeri fores, rijenereting na non-rijenereting fores, kraiteria bilong em i stap ples klia insait long Sevei Fom.*⁴⁸²||

427. Wapela riviui bilong ol bipo Oro Smolholda Welpam Dvelopmen Projek (1992-2001) OPIC i komisanim, i makim sampela hap ol fores eria i senis i go long welpam, karamapim moa long hap bilong Lejo Wailaip Menesmen Eria (WMA) em miling kampani i mekim.⁴⁸³ Riviui i tok olsem wapela taim renfores we i wok long groa bek bihain long wok loging, na ol i kliarim bilong mekim VOP planim, na narapela we —*insait long namba wan hap bilong projek long kirap bilong en long 1992, inap AusAID projek i bin kirap long 1995, sampela renfores eria i gat QABB habitet, em ol ples lain i kliarim bilong ol VOP blok.*⁴⁸⁴|| I gat tok strongim, olsem, —... *dispela em i no wapela samting i save kamap oltaim, na i nogat gutpela as long dispela. Em presa i kam long ol papagraun yet...*⁴⁸⁵||
428. Riviui i luksave tu olsem —...*mask ii gat sampela asua i kamap pinis bipo, dispela i wok long go liklik olgeta.*⁴⁸⁶|| Stadi i makim ol taim we ol OPIC ekstensen opisa —...*i no tok oraitim ol VOP aplikesen bikos ol i wari long birua i kamap long busgraun...*⁴⁸⁷||
429. Bilong SADP, OPIC i makim tripela envairomen opisa long Epril 2010 na olgeta tripela i bin bungim Panel tim taim ol i raun i go. Olgeta i kam wantaim bikipela save long wok envairomen menesmen. Ol fil toktok i kamap namle long saveman konsalten bilong Panel long forestry na tupela long ol envairomen opisa (long Hoskins na Oro) wantaim ol ekstensen opisa na wapela lens opisa long Oro. Insait long olgeta kes Panel i askim ol long —*tok stori*|| pinisim bilong Welpam Infiling Planim Apruval Fom insait long wapela

⁴⁸² Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 10. ⁴⁸³ Envairomen Impek Riviui, p. 9. ⁴⁸⁴ Ibid., p. 33. ⁴⁸⁵ Ibid., p. 35. ⁴⁸⁶ Ibid., p. 41. ⁴⁸⁷ Envairomen Impek Riviui, p. 41.

sait na tokpaitim ol isiu long ol hevi. Olgeta i luksave long ol hevi i stap long klasifaim gut graun i gat fores o lain diwai long en, na moa yet taim fores i stap long baundri namel long tupela klasifikesen. Tasol ol i luksave long ol envairomen na sosol hevi. Long wanwan ol kes, ol i soim strong bilong yusim gut Infil Planim Apruval Fom.

430. Panel i luksave long salens bilong bildim savemak bilong olgeta OPIC ekstensen opisa long kamap long wankain luksave wantaim ol envairomen opisa, tasol i no lukim olsem em i hat. SADP i makim ol mani bilong strongim save bilong ol OPIC ekstensen opisa, na Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok olsem —*Ol ekstensen opisa bilong OPIC i kisim trening long luksave long ol praimer i fores eria;*⁴⁸⁸ Tasol Panel i luksave olsem taim i gat planti trening kos i kamap pinis, nogat wampela i karamapim ol envairomen isiu.
431. Bihainim ol toktok bilong en long Papua Niugini, Panel i kam long lukim olsem envairomen awenes o save mak i go antap insait long laspela ten-pela yia name long olgeta stekholda: OPIC, ol miling kampani, ol smolholda, na Wol Benk. Dispela i kamapim askim long ol mipela moa mak bilong wok plening na karimaut long olgeta wok. Olsem, ol envairomen sefgad polisi o banis polisi bilong busgraun bilong Benk nau i gat moa askim long taim bilong 1990. Wankain tasol, ol miling kampani, aninit long ISO 14000 akreditesen na bihainim bilong RSPO, i soim wampela komitmen o luksave long apim ol envairomen na sosol stendat. Na OPIC i wok long strongim luksave bilong en long ol envairomen na sosol isiu, long wokmak em i gat long stretim ol dispela hevi long fil (maski em i nidim moa wok wantaim bikpela moa trening). Ol menesmen sistem aninit long SADP nau ol i disainim long gat moa luksave long ol stendat bilong envairomen na komyuniti, moa long ol bipo projek. Olsem, ECMMP 1 insait long EMPO i tok-makim ol steps bilong bihainim —*...bai nogat ol bikpela busples o fores eria i bagarap long sanapim biling ol nupela welpam blok...*⁴⁸⁹ Moa wok awenes long busgraun na bikpela moa operesenal

⁴⁸⁸ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 39, ¶ 127. ⁴⁸⁹ OPIC (2007) Envairomen Menesmen Plen, ECMMP 1, p. 42.

stendat i min olsem taim i gat bikipela rot yet i stap long senisim institusenal kalsa bilong OPIC na long strongim savemak bilong ol wokmanmeri insait long nupela ples, bikipela piksa bilong en i gutpela. Menesmen bilong OPIC i luksave long ol salens, tasol wok i go het pinis long strongim sindaun moa pastaim long wok infil planim i kirap.

432. Bekim bilong Menesmen i toktok tu long ol bikipela seniss long Projek disain na stretim sampela long ol jeneral envairomen na sosol belwari. Ol dispela i karamapim: —...*givim bilong ol bai-enual envairomen na sosol wok sekim...*⁴⁹⁰ Ol dispela bai halivim long wok monitaring long olgeta envairomen na sosol sindaun bilong Projek na, wantaim gutpela bekim, bai larim ol senis long wok pasin long kamap.
433. **Kaunim bilong ol Hai Konsavesen Velu Fores** Envairomen impek riviū we OPIC i bin mekim long Oro Smolholda Welpam Developmen Projek (1992-2001) i luksave long nid bilong wanpela mep we i soim klia olgeta renfores eria na olgeta Wailaip Menesmen Eria (WMAs) i stap nau. Em i tok olsem — *Dispela mep bai wanpela bikipela stia bilong ol OPIC ekstensen opisa insait long ol toktok bilong ol wantaim ol papagraun.*⁴⁹¹ Long tokpait long dispela kain plening stia, stadi i luksave long hatwok bilong skelim ol kain kain kategori bilong ol fores, na i tok olsem —...*em i no olsem tru tru sindaun na i no gutpela long askim ol OPIC ekstensen opisa long mekim ol disisen long sindaun bilong renfores, sapos ol saveman yet i no inap long luksave long narakain long ol renfores i groa bek, na 'bus', 'sekonderi bus', na olsem*⁴⁹² Olgeta dispela tingting i save strongim bikipela luksave i stap insait long OP 4.36, long gat rot long kisim wanpela inventori o kaunim bilong ol bikipela fores eria na wanpela spesel skel wwe i gutpela long ekoloji o laip sindaun, komyuniti na kalsarel sindaun bilong fores eria insait long ples Projek i stap.⁴⁹³
434. Stadi i ripot long developmen bilong wanpela GIS meping sistem long pinis bilong 1990s we i bin makim klia ol —*no go* na —*caution*⁴⁹⁴ eria long Oro provins. Ol wok painim long raun bilong Inspeksen Panel i soim olsem dispela meping sistem i no go insait yet long ol wok. Tasol, i gat ripot olsem —*Higaturu Oil Palm P/L yusim poinis GIS, na dispela —no go* mep long tok nogat long etpela proposal bilong ol mini-estet.⁴⁹⁵ Dispela —*no go* mep ol i no save yusim oltaim. Na tu, OPIC i no moa gat save long yusim GIS meping sistem.

⁴⁹⁰ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 32, ¶ 103. ⁴⁹¹ Envairomen Impek Riviū, p. 23. ⁴⁹² Ibid. ⁴⁹³ BP 4.36 (Forests), ¶ 4 requires that —*During project preparation, the TT ensures that the borrower provides the Bank with an assessment of the adequacy of land use allocations for the management, conservation, and sustainable development of forests, including any additional allocations needed to protect critical forest areas. This assessment provides an inventory of such critical forest areas, and is undertaken at a spatial scale that is ecologically, socially, and culturally appropriate for the forest area in which the project is located.* ||

⁴⁹⁴ Environmental Impact Review, p. 25. ⁴⁹⁵ Ibid.

435. Bekim bilong Menesmen i soim olsem ol askim bilong OP 4.36 (Forests), long sait bilong givim wanpela inventori o kaunim bilong ol bikpela fores eria, i gat tupela rot: namba wan, em long ol OPIC ekstensen opisa i yusim Welpam Infil Planim Apruval Fom we —...*wanpela sait spesifik inventori bilong ol bikpela fores eria bai kamap bihainim wanpela skrinim rot...*⁴⁹⁶ ; na namba tu, em long redim bilong wanpela Hai Konsavesen Velu Fores (HCVF) mep we ol miling kampani i mekim olsem hap bilong ol RSPO setifikesen. Luksave i stap long namba wan long ol dispela rot we i —...*givim wanpela inventori bilong ol bikpela fores eria, na i kamap bihainim bikpela we i orait long komyuniti na kalsarel sindaun bilong fores eria we projek i sindaun long e,*⁴⁹⁷ olsem i stap aninit long OP/BP 4.36 (Fores). Wanpela inventori long tok klia bilong en, em i wanpela — *bikpela lis.*⁴⁹⁸ Nogat wanpela samting insait long Welpam Infil Planim Apruval Fom bai kamap insait long bungim bilong wanpela bikpela lis i soim olgeta bikpela fores eria. Namba tu rot em long stretim ol askim bilong OP 4.36 (Ol Fores)— we meping bilong ol HCVF miling kampani i mekim – i nogat inap luksave long givim wanpela bikpela lis i soim ol bikpela fores eria, olsem i stap aninit long OP 4.36 (Ol Fores). Tasol dispela i no kamap yet na i no kamap taim Projek wok redi i go het, olsem i stap aninit long OP 4.36 (Ol Fores).
436. Bekim bilong Menesmen i luksave tu olsem —*Welpam Planim Apruval Fom...ol i yusim long 2007 yet na i kam long olgeta ples we OPIC ekstensen opisa i stap.*⁴⁹⁹ Tasol i nogat nupela planim welpam i kamap bihian long 2001, na ol ekstensen opisa long Oro i tokim Panel long taim ol i mekim wok painim, olsem ol i no lukim yet dispela fom. Ol Panel memba i givim ol Envairomen na Ekstensen Opisa ol kopi bai ol i ken mekim kopi na yusim long taim ol i go aut long toktok wantaim ol papagraun long fil. Ol ekstensen opisa long Hoskins projek eria i wok yusim wanpela olupela fom, we em i stap insait long 2007 PIM Infil Planim Sab-Manual, bilong skelim ol infil aplikesen ol i kisim.

⁴⁹⁶ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 39, ¶ 126. ⁴⁹⁷ Ibid., p. 55. ⁴⁹⁸ The Concise Oxford Dictionary (1976) Sixth Edition, Oxford at the Clarendon Press. ⁴⁹⁹ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 39, ¶ 127.

437. **Ol Rot bilong Banisim ol Hai Konsavesen Veliu Fores.** Long skelim sapos ol rot bilong daunim ol birua insait long EMP em inap long banisim gut ol HCVF, i mobeta long sekim we wokples pasin long OPIC i ken bagarapim wok banisim bilong ol HCVF. Olsem long antap, Panel i luksave olsem: (a) we OPIC long Oro long taim i kam painim 2001 em i wanpela ogenaísesen i save wok bihainim taget, dispela i nogat moa; (b) taim ol i apim savemak bilong ol OPIC ekstensen opisa long wanpela gutpela mak em i wanpela bikpela salens, na sapos inap, ol hanmak bilong en i gutpela; na (c) taim wanpela inventori bilong ol bikpela fores eria i no kamap, bikpela luksave na kaunim bilong ol fores eria long mak bilong planim graun em i wanpela gutpela tok-mak olsem ol bikpela fores eria bai no inap senis i go long welpam taim wok planim i go het. Tasol wanpela mep bilong ol hai konsavesen veliu fores, we i soim ol —*no go*|| na —*caution*|| eria, bai wanpela gutpela kamap long poromanim ol menesmen tul i stap pinis, moa long sait bilong halivim ol envairomen opisa long supavaisim gut ol ekstensen opisa.
438. Ol smolholda planim long bihain taim long Wes Nu Briten bai ken kamapim birua long wanem ol hai konsavesen-veliu fores bikos i gat wanwan tasol i stap nau insait long eria we bai stap bilong planim. Tasol lukaut i mas stap wantaim graun i stap insait o klostu long ol WMA, bikos i gat ripot long sampela papagraun i laik senisim graun bilong ol insait long ol WMA i go long welpam.
439. Planti long ol graun i gutpela long wok plantim long Popondetta eria bilong Oro i gat *kunai* long en, na planim bai no inap long bagarapim ol bikpela lain diwai. Tasol ol smolholda long Kokoda eria bai givim pres long sampela ol eria we ol diwai i wok long groa bek gen. Dispela bai wanpela salens bilong ol OPIC ekstensen opisa long mekim wanpela gutpela skelim long ol fores kategori taim ol i bekim ol askim insait long Infil Planim Apruval Fom na skelim tingting sapos ol bai givim tok orait o nogat long wok planim.
440. OP 4.04 long ol Netseral Habitset o busgraun i luksave olsem —*sapos i gat rot bilong ol hevi i kamap long wok savemak, projek wantaim ol komponen bilong en i save strongim savemak bilong ol nesenell na lokol institusen bilong gutpela envairomen plening na menesmen. Ol rot bilong*⁵⁰⁰ *daunim birua bilong Projek em ol i ken yusim bilong strongim fil wok bilong ol nesenel na lokol institusen.*||⁵⁰¹ Menesmen i luksave olsem i gat ol sot long savemak bilong ol OPIC ekstensen wokman long mekim ol wok bilong wok welpam bihainim olgeta stia bilong envairomen na sosol stendat. **Panel i painim olsem wok bilong Projek long disainim na bildim savemak bilong ol OPIC ekstensen opisa i bihainim stret ol askim bilong OP 4.04 long ol Netseral Habitset, o busgraun ples.**
441. Menesmen i luksave tu long bikpela wok bilong banisim gut ol bikpela fores eria, na kamapim ol wok root insait long PIM long yusim long sait level long pasim wok planim welpam long wane mol fores eria ausait long — *ol fores i bagarap pinis o i no inap groa bek.*||⁵⁰¹ Projek bai lukim kamap bilong senisim o daunim ol bikpela fores eria o wankain bikbus ples.

⁵⁰⁰ OP 4.04 – Natural Habitats (June 2001), ¶ 6. ⁵⁰¹ SADP Welpam Infilling Apruval Fom (Julai 2010), p. 5.

442. Em i tingting bilong Panel olsem Menesmen i no bin bihainim olgeta askim bilong OP/BP 4.36 long mekim ol Borowa i givim Benk wanpela asesmen long strong bilong givim graun bilong menesmen, konsavesen, na sastenabol developmen bilong ol fores we i karamapim wanpela wok inventori o kaunim bilong ol bikpela fores eria. Tasol, Menesmen i karamapim tu ol wok insait long Projek long pasim senisim bilong wok lukautim o daunim bilong ol bikpela fores eria oo ol arapela bikbus ples; Panel i painim Menesmen i bihainim astingting bilong OP/BP 4.36 long dispela sait.

G. Ol Las Tok Luksave

443. Long bungim tok, long sait bilong ol klem long ol busgraun birua i kamap long Rikwes, Panel i kamap wantaim ol dispela tingsave:

- (a) long sait bilong klem i sut long sot bilong Envairomen Asesmen, Panel i no painim em i abrusim askim bilong OP 4.01 wantaim sut tok olsem i nogat inap namba na stori i kamapim dispela Envairomen Asesmen.
- (b) long sait bilong isiu bilong wok infiling na ekspensen o opim i go bikpela, Panel i tok dispela took infiling, em Menesmen i no yusim long traim haitim wok opim mak.
- (c) long sait bilong klem olsem Projek i ken kamapim graun kliarim na graun-lus hevi, na graun i go pulap insait long ol hanwara, em Panel i no painim wanpela asua wantaim OP 4.01.
- (d) long sait bilong klem i sut long polusen o posinim i ken kamap insait long ol hanwara, long ol agrikalsa kemikal o marasin, Panel i painim olsem Projek i bihainim OP 4.01. Tingting bilong Panel em Menesmen i luksave long strong bilong kemikal posin long wok welpam developmen na i mekim olgeta samting long disainim Projek long daunim wanem kain birua i kamap long fetilaisa ran-of. Na long klem olsem Projek i ken kamapim baiolojik polusen o posinim, Panel i painim olsem Projek i no bihainim stret OP 4.01 long sait bilong mil efluen o pipia bilong mil. Panel i luksave olsem Menesmen i luksave long dispela sot insait long Menesmen Bekim na em i komisinim wanpela Efluen Stadi. Panel i bilip olsem Agrid Eksen Plen i stap insait long Efluen Stadi i stretim olgeta birua nogut bilong mil efluen na, taim ol i karimaut, em i ken bringim Projek i bihainim stret OP 4.01.
- (e) long sait bilong klem olsem Projek i ken opim rot bilong diforestesen o daunim ol hai-veliu fores, tingting bilong Panel long dispela em Menesmen i no bihainim olgeta askim bilong OP/BP 4.36 (Ol Fores). Long taim bilong redim Projek, Menesmen i no tokim Borowa long givim Benk wanpela wok skelim long strong bilong gaun bilong lukautim, banisim, na sastenabol developmen bilong ol fores. Moa yet, wok skelim i no givim wanpela inventori bilong ol bikpela fores eria. Panel i painim olsem disain bilong Projek bilong bildim savemak bilong ol OPIC ekstensen wokman i bihainim stret ol askim bilong OP 4.04 (Ol Netseral Habitset).

444. Em i tingting bilong Panel olsem taim Menesmen i bihainim stret OP/BP 4.01, i gat as long ol wari bilong ol Rikwesta long birua i kamap long ol fores na busgraun,

histori. Olsem na i mas i gat ol rot i stap long abrusim ol birua, na dispela ol samting i mas kamap kwik. Na bikos OPIC i gat ol wokmak banis i stap (i gat glasim long narapela sapta i kam), Menesmen i go het yet long was gut, bihainim ol stia insait long efluen stadi. Bihainim dispela tingting, Panel i luksave olsem i gat bikpela moa luksave long ol mil kampani long bihainim ol RSPO stendat, em i gutpela luksave bilong bihain taim. In this context, the Panel notes that the greater commitment of mill companies to RSPO standards bodes well for the future.

Sapta 6: Institusenal Sastenabiliti

A. Tok I Go Pas

445. Dispela Sapta i lukluk long ol klem bilong ol Rikwesta long longpela taim stap bilong SADP. Ol Rikwesta i tok olsem ol i —...wari long stap long taim bilong tupela hap bilong dispela projek, em rot mentenens fan na ol wok bilong ol OPIC ekstensen opisa. Projek i save sindaun long dispela tupela samting, tasol tupela wantaim i no wok strong, na bai no inap stap longpela taim bihain long projek i pinis.||⁵⁰² Namba wan klem i sut long stap long taim bilong Rot Mentenens Tras Fan (RMTF), na sapos i gat bikipela komyuniti sapot bilong narapela takis bai kamap aninit long RMTF. Namba tu klem i sut long stap long taim bilong OPIC olsem wampela institusen, na ol hap bilong wok pasin bilong en, na kwolati bilong ol ekstensen sevis bilong en, na savemak bilong ol OPIC ekstensen opisa long mekim gut wok bilong ol.

B. Ol Klem bilong ol Rikwesta

1. Rot Mentenens Tras Fan

446. Ol Rikwesta i luksave long bikipela bilong wampela strongpela netwok bilong ol rot long eria we i gat gutpela wok mentenens na lukautim. Ol i tok long birua ol bagarap long rot i givim na tok olsem nogat gutpela rot —...i save daunim stendat bilong helt kea na edukesen i bilong ol smolholda, na apim kos o manimak bilong ol trenspot takis...||⁵⁰³ Insait long ol tokaut i go long Panel tim long ol raun bilong em, planti smolholda i komplek olsem ol Fres Frut Bans (FFB) i save sindaun planti de na nogat man i save go kisim. Bikos ol kampani trak i mas raunim ol rot bagarap long kamap long ol ples bilong kolektim ol welpam frut, ol FFB i lusim hevi bilong ol, na veliu bilong ol i go daun.

447. Ol Rikwesta i luksave tu olsem —Aninit long SADP, Wol Benk i tok long pinisim dispela yusa fi pe sistem, wantaim ol smolholda i givim mani long strongim ol infrastraksa i go long wampela Rot Mentenens Tras Fan (RMTF) long mekim rot netwok i lukautim em yet.||⁵⁰⁴ Taim em i luksave long ol asbilip bilong dispela astingting, ol i autim wari olsem —...rot mentenens bai no inap stap longpela taim||⁵⁰⁵ na dispela — taim em i mekim ol smolholda i sindaun moa long ol mil na mak bilong ol takis i wok long go antap, ol smolholda bai karim moa hevi, na bai ol i no inap long rausim ol yet long pasin turangu.||⁵⁰⁶

448. Ol i tok moa olsem —Bihainim SADP PAD, pes 35, RMTF bai kisim mani halivim olsem: 25% bilong fan bai kam long Provinsal Gavman, 25% bai kam long Nesenel Gavman, 25% i kam long ol welpam kampani, na laspela 25% bai kam long ol growa.||⁵⁰⁷ Ol i go moa long tok olsem —Long dispela i kamap gut, olgeta patisipen i mas givim ol manimak kontribusen bilong ol. I gat bikipela sans long birua i stap olsem Provinsal

⁵⁰² Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 7. ⁵⁰³ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 7. ⁵⁰⁴ Ibid. ⁵⁰⁵ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 8. ⁵⁰⁶ Ibid., p. 6. ⁵⁰⁷ Ibid., p. 8.

*gavman bai no inap long mekim kontribusen bilong ol i go long fan olgeta taim.*⁵⁰⁸ Dispela luksave i stap long kirap bilong projek insait long disain bilong en, na i stap tu insait long Projek Infomesen Dokumen (PID) olsem wanpela long ol namba wan bikpela salens i bin stap insait long ol bipo projek: — *Provinsal Gavman i no inap long givim ol mani bilong wok mentenens bilong ol ekases rot netwok.*⁵⁰⁹

449. Ol Rikwesta i luksave olsem —*Ol klemen i gat war olsem indastri bai no inap long givim mani bilong ol kwik.*⁵¹⁰ Na las tru, ol Rikwesta i tok olsem —*Dispela mentenens rot, sapos i nogat kontribusen i kam long provinsal, nesenel o ol welpam kampani, bai no inap stap longpela taim na ol rot bai bagarap yet. SADP i gat bikpela rot bilong birua na no inap stap longtaim.*⁵¹¹

450. Ol Rikwesta i tok tu olsem nogat man i kisim tingting bilong ol long rot takis. Ol i raitim olsem



Picture 22: Company Truck collecting FFB along Popondetta-Kokoda National Highway

—*moa yet, ol klemen i nogat rot long givim tingting bilong ol long ol apim long takis mak we ol bai peim aninit long SADP, o givim tingting long rot skelim we bai lukim ol i peim dispela nupela takis mak taim ol opim ol nupela welpam blok. Sapos ol klemen i bin gat rot long givim tingting, ol bai inap givim ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani na bai inap long paitim tok long wanpela nupela rot yusa fi' fi'.*⁵¹²

451. Olsem na ol Rikwesta i bilip ol i kisim bagarap long ol rot i bagarap, o i nogat ekases rot, long kain kain we. Kwolati bilong laip sindaun bilong ol i bagarap bikos rot i no gutpela, na i pasim ol long kisim gutpela kwolati helt na edukesen sevis. Moa yet, ol Rikwesta i pilim olsem ol rot i bagarapim ol long mani sait, bikos ol i save peim wanpela bikpela moa Trensport Levi taim ol Kampani kar i bungim moa hevi na wok mentenens, na bikos wanpela RMTF takis bai ol i rausim long ol, na i nogat narapela tok klia olsem ol arapela stekholda insait long projek (em Kampani na Gavman) bai peim manimak bilong ol.

⁵⁰⁸ PAD risk assessment, p. 62. ⁵⁰⁹ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 8; PID, p.6. ⁵¹⁰ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 8. ⁵¹¹ Ibid. ⁵¹² Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 6.

2. Ol Ekstensen Wok bilong OPIC

452. Ol Rikwesta i wari tu long —...*sot bilong OPIC long givim ol gutpela ekstensen sevis*||⁵¹³ bai daunim strong bilong Projek long stap longpela taim. Ol i tok olsem —...*skel bilong ol opisa long ol growa em i stap yet antap long 1:300, we i soim klia olsem projek bai no inap stap longpela taim na ol growa bai stap wantaim hevi bilong groim welpam na ol bai nogat sapot. Bikos ol arapela bikpela hap bilong projek, olsem apim wokmak bilong ol growa, HIV/AIDS wok awenes na pasin bilong strongim wok long graun bai bagarap bikos olgeta dispela wok i save poromanim wok bilong ol ekstensen opisa, na bai ol i no inap long inapim ol taget bilong ol.*||⁵¹⁴
453. Ol i luksave tu olsem —*Wanpela apim long prodaksen wokmak i min olsem ... bai mas gat apim long ol smolholda o namba bilong ol hekta welpam. Nau yet ol OPIC opisa em 1:300 growa, na Projek bai apim namba bilong ol growa, na bringim namba i go antap moa long 1:400. Menesmen straksa na ol risos bilong OPIC i stap nau, mipela i no ting OPIC i ken inapim gut dispela projek, inap em i stretim olgeta wok hevi na ol ejensi hevi i stret.*||⁵¹⁵

C. Bekim bilong Menesmen

1. Rot Mentenens Tras Fan

454. Bekim bilong Menesmen i soim olsem — *Rot mentenens em i bikpela salens moa bikos long tropikal na bikpela ren insait long ol welpam groim eria.*|| na —...*nogat bilong wanpela strongpela rot bilong imejensi na oltaim wok mentenens bilong rot netwok ol smolholda welpam growa i yusim i stap long as bilong sindaun i stap nau ...maski sapos ol progreim makim bilong ol mentenens mani i go insait long ol provinsal baset, i no min olsem dispela kain wok mentenens bai kamap tru tru.*||⁵¹⁶
455. Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok strong olsem —...*gutpela rot rikonstraksen na mentenens i sindaun long ol strongpela na klia rot bilong givim kontrak, na kontrak menesmen...em SADP i gat wanpela Rot Enjiniaring Yunit insait long disain bilong en, na tu, long strongim na opim wokmak bilong OPID (em i infrastraksa dipatmen bilong OPIC). Ol dispela wok bai rausim olgeta birua bilong wokmak i pundaun insait long eria bilong rot rikonstraksen.*||⁵¹⁷
456. Bekim bilong Menesmen i go moa long tok olsem — *long taim bilong wok-redi, namba wan wok glasim bilong fainensal fisabiliti o strong bilong ol RMTF i bin kamap. Dispela i karamapim tu wanpela wok-glasim bilong ol rot bilong skelim mani na ol mani rot...na laspela disain stadi bilong ol RMTF bai kamap olsem hap bilong wok karimaut bilong Projek.*||⁵¹⁸ Bekim bilong Menesmen i givim ripot long ol painim bilong wanpela Kwolati Asurens Grup (QAG) Kwolati Enhensmen Riviui (QER)

⁵¹³ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 8. ⁵¹⁴ Ibid., p. 9. ⁵¹⁵ Leta i kam long CELCOR i go long Mis Eimi Watanabe, Inspeksen Panel, on Februari 19, 2010. ⁵¹⁶ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 34, ¶. 110. ⁵¹⁷ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 34, ¶. 112. ⁵¹⁸ Ibid., p. 34, ¶. 111.

we i kamap long 2008, we i painim olsem —...*rot bilong wok redim...bai strong moa sapos i bin gat bikipela wok redi bilong ol rot bilong mekim wok insait long ol RMTF.*||⁵¹⁹

457. Menesmen i luksave olsem sid kapitel inap long K3.1 milian⁵²⁰ bilong kamapim bilong tripela provinsal RMTF bai go olsem wanpela grent i kam long Papua Niugini Sastenabol Developmen Progreem, wanpela ko-fainensa bilong Projek, sapos em i wanbel wantaim disain.
458. Bekim bilong Menesmen i luksave olsem — *Projek em ol i tok wanpela 'high risk' wok long taim apresal i kamap. Ol i tok Projek em i bikipela tumas bikos em i laik stretim hevi bilong nogat inap gutpela ekseks rot bilong wok agrikalsa – we i hevi bilong welpam sekta, na tu olgeta rurel eria long PNG – we ol i laik kamapim wanpela nupela yusa peim mani rot bilong kamapim gutpela wok mentenens.*||⁵²²
459. Bekim bilong Menesmen i go moa long tok olsem — *PAD Kritikal Risks wok skelim (Seksan C, paragraf 5) i retim bikipela birua sans olsem —substantial o bikipela tru. // Kritikal Risks metriks bilong PAD i makim tripela birua rot we i sut stret long dispela Bekim. Ol dispela birua rot i sut long rot rikonstraksen na wok mentenens we bai kamap aninit long SADP em:(a) olsem ol Provinsal Gavman bai no inap long givim manimak bilong rot mentenens; (b)olsem i ken i gat ol hul long RMTF bikos long disain bilong ron bilong mani; na (c) olsem i ken gat bikipela sot long namba bilong ol lokol kontrakta wantaim wokmak na save bilong mekim wok insait long ol Projek eria.Ol birua rot long sait bilong RMTF fainens wok, em bai stret aninit long disain bilong ol RMTF, we bai kamap long 2010, na ol rotwok karimaut rot bai kisim luksave na mak bilong lokol kontrak i mekim wok stret.*||⁵²³
460. Bekim bilong Menesmeni tok strong olsem — *Stap longpela taim em i wanpela bikipela astingting bilong SADP*||⁵²⁴ na i go moa long tok olsem —*tok paitim wantaim ol mausman bilong ol growa asosiesen long taim bilong wok redi, i soim olsem em bai hat long olgeta i wanbel long rot takis sapos ol rot i no stret pastaim.*||⁵²⁵
461. Long stretim fomula bilong kontribusen bilong ol kain kain stekholda i go long levi o takis, Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok olsem —*taim sampela took bilong ol Projek pepa i ken givim piksa olsem ol RMTF em ol i disainim na pinis, dispela em i no tok em i mas givim, bikos disain bilong ol RMTF i save pinis long wanpela bikipela disain stadi long taim bilong karimaut wok.*||⁵²⁶
462. Long bekim klem bilong ol Rikwesta olsem RMTF takis i nogat bikipela komyuniti sapot, na i no kisim tokklia long en, Menesmen i bekim olsem — *Sanapim bilong ol RMTF na kamap bilong wanpela moa takis bilong rot mentenens*

⁵¹⁹ Ibid., p. 12, ¶. 35. ⁵²⁰ PAD, p. 36, ¶. 31. ⁵²¹ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 30, footnote 57. ⁵²² Ibid., p. 11, ¶. 32. ⁵²³ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 11, ¶. 33. ⁵²⁴ Ibid., p. 34, ¶. 109. ⁵²⁵ Ibid., p. 29, ¶. 95. ⁵²⁶ Ibid., p. 30, ¶. 96.

em ol i tok paitim namel long ol Benk na ol mausmanmeri bilong ol growas asosiesen insait long olgeta triopela Projek eria, stat long Novemba 2001 na long olgeta wok redi bilong Projek, apresal na longpela rot bilong inapim olgeta strong bilong Projek.

Ol menesa bilong OPIC i bin wokbung wantaim ol growa asosiesen long rot mentenens levi na i wok kisim bekim long ol growa long ol kainkain mak bilong ol levi o takis. Konsaltesen wantaim ol growas asosiesen long luksave olsem ol em wanpela maus bilong ol growas na wanpela bris namel long ol growas na ol arapela lain. Moa long en, insait long tingting bilong rot mentenens levi, ol em ol lain husat bai karim hevi.||⁵²⁷

463. Na maski —Menesmen i wanbel olsem i ken moa bikpela konsaltesen i kamap namle long growa komyuniti long rot mentenens levi long taim bilong wok redi,|| em i —luksave oolsem moa konsaltesen i stap olsem hap bilong RMTF disain stadi.||⁵²⁸

464. Bihainim ol wari i kamap insait long Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, Menesmen i wanbel olsem — ol input o tingting bai go long OPIC long inapim olsem disain bilong ol RMTF i kamap wantaim bikpela wok konsaltesen bihainim astingting bilong em i ken stap longpela taim bihain.||⁵²⁹

2. Ol Ekstensen Wok bilong OPIC

1. Bekim bilong Menesmen i go moa na tok olsem slek institusenal savemak bilong Papua Niugini luksave i stap, na olsem, \$—...sampela ol kondisen bilong wok strong long stretim dispela ol hevi em i kamap hap bilong Projek.||⁵³⁰ Namel long ol rot we developmen bilong ol Smolholda Welpam Infil Planim Sab-Manual, Rot Rikonstraksen Sab-Manual, na sanapim na makim ol wokman bilong OPIC Projek Opis.⁵³¹
2. Menesmen i luksave tu olsem — PAD, tasol, i asua long painim ol birua rot bilong isi kirap bilong wok bisnis na taim i mas stap long sanapim projek menesmen mak bilong OPIC.||⁵³²

D. Tingting bilong Panel long ol Birua sut tok i stap long Rikwes o Askim

1. Rot Mentenens Tras Fan

467. **Rot Rikonstraksen wok i no go het.** Projek Implimentesen Manual (PIM) Roding Sab-Manual,⁵³³ i tok olsem i gat 2,770 kilomita bilong ol ekseks rot insait long tripela welpam

⁵²⁷ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 29, ¶ 94. ⁵²⁸ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 31, ¶ 97. ⁵²⁹ Ibid., p. 40, ¶ 130. ⁵³⁰ Ibid., p. 11, ¶ 32. PAD (p. 14) i tok olsem —Ol wanwan sindaun long strongpela wok bai karamapim: (a) karimaut bilong Subsidiari Agrimen namel long GoPNG na OPIC; (b) karimaut bilong ol Ko-fainensing Agrimen namel long GoPNG, PNGSDP na OPIC; (c) sanapim bilong PSC wantaim membasip i orait long IDA; (d) bihainim bilong (i) PIM, wantaim EMP na RPF bilong GoPNG na OPIC; na (ii) Smolholda Welpam Infil Sab-Manual na Rot Rikonstraksen Sab-Manual bilong PNGSDP; na (e) sanapim na givim wokman bilong OPIC Projek Opis.||

⁵³¹ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 11, ¶ 32. ⁵³² Ibid., p. 11, ¶ 34.

skim long Oro, Hoskins, na Bialla. Astingting bilong rot sab-komponen bilong Projek em bilong apgredim na stretim bek 550 kilomita (o 20%) bilong ol ekseks rot na kamapim na karimaut wanpela mentenens sistem long karamapim olgeta smolholda ekseks rot netwok na long gat wanpela longpela taim rot bilong givim mani long en. Dispela 550 kilomita wantaim wanpela hap105 kilomita rot we ol i no inap long pinisim aninit long 2002 AusAID PNG Insentiv Fan projek.⁵³⁴

Enjiniaring Yunit bilong OPIC, Welpam Infrastraksa Dvelopmen (OPID) yunit, i go pas long lukautim rot netwok. PIM i tok, ol operesen kostim bilong OPID bai kisim mani long ol kontribusen i kam long nesenel divelopmen baset, na bihain, bai ol takis ol smolholda i peim na ol kontribusen i kam long ol miling kampani.

468. Tebol daunbilo i kam long PIM na i bungim tok long olgeta wok stretim bek na silipim bilong ol rot.

Tebol 5: Rot Rikonstraksen Skediul

Skim	2008 km	2009 km	2010 km	2011 km	2012 km	Total km
Hoskins Major						
Reconstruction Minor	15 15	20 20	20 20	20 20 1	15 15 1	90 90
Reconstruction Bridges				bridge	bridge	
Bialla Major						
Reconstruction Minor	19 6	26 9	28 9 1	0 0 1	0 0	73 24
Reconstruction Bridges			bridge	bridge		
Oro Major						
Reconstruction Minor	30 10 50	32 12 35	32 12 20 1	28 9 0 1	0 0 0	122 43 105
Reconstruction Minor			bridge	bridge		
PNGSDP Bridges						
Total Major						
Reconstruction Minor						
Reconstruction Bridges			80 61 2	48 29 3	15 15 1	285 262 6
Total Reconstruction	64 81 145	78 76 154	bridges 141	bridges 77	bridge 30	bridges 547

I kam long: Projek Implimentesen Manual, Roding Sab-Manual, Tebol 6.1.

469. Mid-Tem Riviul bilong Menesmen i ripot olsem i nogat wok i go het long rot rikonstraksen long Oktoba 2010 na i ting skelim olsem wan-ted bilong 550 kilomita bai inap long pinis taim Projek i pinis long Desemba 2010 sapos OPIC i no strongim wokmak bilong en.⁵³⁵ Epril 2011 Implimentesen Sapot Misin i makim —*sot long kauntapat fanding*// olsem wanpela arapela bikpela banis long rot rikonstraksen program, na bihain taim bilong RMTF.⁵³⁶

⁵³³ Project Implementation Manual Roding Sub-Manual for the Smallholder Agriculture Development Project, August 2007. ⁵³⁴ PAD, p. 36, ¶ 32. ⁵³⁵ Papua New Guinea Smallholder Agriculture Development Project (IDA Credit NO. 4374-PNG) Mid-Term Review: September 20 -October 7, 2010 Final Aide-Memoire Mid-Term Review, p. 5, ¶ 23. ⁵³⁶ Ibid., Fifth Implementation Support Mission: April 15– 19, 2011, Final Aide-Memoire, ¶ 6.

470. **Bagarap bilong ol Rot na Nid bilong Wok Mentenens oltaim.** Insait long ol toktok wantaim ol ples manmeri long Wes Nu Briten na Oro provins, nogut sindaun bilong ol rot em i namba wan bikpela birua i nidim wok stretim.

Bikpela luksave i bin olsem:

- a. Ol smolholda i wok peim pinis sampela takis, wantaim wanpela trenspot takis tu. Olsem na wanpela moa levi bilong rot mentenens bai wanpela bikpela mani hevi tru;
 - b. Ol smolholda i luksave olsem ol i mas halivim rot mentenens tasol ol i laik bai ol kontribusen bai mas skelim gut wantaim ol olsem sampela ol rot bilong kisim mani bilong stretim rot;
 - c. Ol smolholda i laik lukim sampela klia sain olsem ol rot i wok long stret pastaim long ol i skelim tingting long wanem kain takis; na
 - d. Provinsal gavman i no inap long sindaun long ol long givim mani, olsem na longpela taim sindaun bilong RMTF i no klia.
471. Panel tim i bin raun i go long planti hap long WNB na Oro provins, na ol i lukim rot i bagarap long ai bilong ol yet. Maski em i taim bilong drai, planti hap bbilong ol bikpela na liklik eksek rot i bagarap olgeta, na i hat long draiv, maski ol i ron long ol 4x4 kar. Ol piksa 21 na 22 i soim ol hevi i stap long brukim nesenel haiwe namel long Popondetta na Kokoda insait long Oro provins long taim bilong drai. Ol bris em wara i wasim brukim long taim Saiklon Guba i kamap, na nau yet, i nogat wok stretim long ol, olsem na ol kar i mas draiv brukim ol wara inap long tripela fut i go daun. Panel i harim stori olsem sampela ol rot wok na bris wok bilong kamap long 1992-2001 Oro Smolholda Welpam Developmen Projek i no bin kamap. Dispela em maski ol smolholda i planim welpam bihainim askim bilong Projek, wantaim askim bilong ol gutpela ples bilong kolektim FFB bai kamap.⁵³⁷ Long wanpela stori, Panel tim i lukim ol plesmanmeri i brukim Wara Mambare klostu long Butue viles long wanpela raba tiub;



Piksa 23: Panel tim i brukim wanpela wara long Popondetta-Kokoda Nesenel Haiwe

⁵³⁷

Implementation Completion Report, Oro Smallholder Oil Palm Development Project, states that the original objective of the Project was to construct 450 kilometers of access roads. This target was revised to 350 kilometers at the loan extension stage (p. 3), The —Borrowers Comments|| section of the ICR states that an assessment carried out in 2000 estimated that —an additional 181km of roads were needed to service 870 blocks not on existing or planned roads|| (p. 28).

Panel i harim olsem ol plesmanmeri husat i save karim ol FFB antap long ol dispela raba tiub. Bihain long ol i karim long wilbaro sampela de pastaim long ol i kamap long wara. Strongim rot netwok insait long Projek eria bai mas kamap kwik sapos ol i laik lukim apim long wokmak bilong ol smolholda, na laip sindaun bilong pipel i ken kamap gut gen.



Piksa 24: Wara brukim rot long Kokoda Nesenel Haiwei



Piksa 25: Man i yusim taia raba tiub long brukim Wara Mambare

472. **Kamapim na kaunim mak bilong RMTF.** PAD i luksave olsem Sosol Asesmen —...*i autim ol hevi bilong ...ol provinsal rot i bagarap em i bikpela hevi tru long ol komyuniti...SA i tok olsem rikonstraksen na sastenabel mentenens bilong ol provinsal ekses rot netwok bihainim welpam infiling wok bilong projek i ken karim gutpela kaikai bilong ol meri na yut na inap, wantaim ol komponen 2 wok, givim gutpela sindaun long komyuniti .*⁵³⁸||

PAD, Annex 4, i tok olsem — **proposal** em bilong 25% bilong ol mani ol i nidim bilong wok mentenens olgeta yia we i mask am long ol smolholda welpam growa, 25% i kam long ol welpam miling kampani na 50% i kam long ol provinsal gavman...⁵³⁹||[tok strongim mipela i givim] Wapela futnot insait long PAD i tok olsem —Maski jeneral ogenaísesen na wok bilong RMTF i kamap na i redi insait long PIM, SADP i opim rot long wapela konsaltesen long kirap bilong projek bilong sanapim ol loa rot bihainim bilong RMTF na long ol rot i mas stap bilong inapim akauntabiliti na transparensi o klia wok pasin. RMTF bai ron long Julai 2008, long inapim wok karimaut bilong ol mentenens progrem na mani bilong em i stap long dispela taim.⁵⁴⁰|| Tebol bilong ol Bikpela Birua rot na Kontrovesel Hap insait long PAD i tok tu olsem disain bilong RMTF —...bai karimaut long taim bilong projek wok karimaut i go het ...⁵⁴¹||

474. Roding Sab-Manual bilong PIM i tok stret olsem olgeta wok mentenens bai kisim mani halivim long wapela RMTF, wapela long dispela skim, we bai kisim sapot bilong ol end-yusa bilong netwok. Sab-Manual i tok olsem — 25 pesen bilong olgeta mani bilong wok mentenens olgeta yia, bai kam long smolholda welpam growa levi, 25 pesen bay kam long ol welpam miling kampani, na 50 pesen bai kam long ol provinsal gavman **na/o GoPNG** [tok strongim em mipela i putim].|| Wapela futnot i tok klia moa long dispela narapela provisoin: — em i tru olsem wapela o tupela provinsal gavman wantaim bai o inap inapim ol wok bilong ol i go long RMTF. Long dispela mak, sapos wapela long ol provinsal gavman i no inapim manimak bilong en i go long RMTF, GoPNG bai inapim ol dispela kostim. Em bai bikpela samting long Jeneral Sekreteri (OPIC) long was gut long dispela sindaun na mekim ol sabmisen i go long DNPM bilong kisim mani aninit long nesenel developmen baset olgeta yia.⁵⁴²|| Sab-Manual i luksave tu olsem — Sid Kapitel, i kam long wapela PNGSDP grent, bai givim wapela mani banis long pundaun bilong ol mentenens progrem.⁵⁴³||

475. PAD i tok, RMTF kontribusen i sanap long manimak bilong mekim rot mentenens wok olgeta yia bai bruk bihainim ol FFB i go long ol mil bikos ol rot i gutpela (olsem, ol mentenens kos bai — samting olsem K5.5 milion long Hoskins, K2.9 milion long Bialla, na K4.1 milion long Oro. Ol dispela mak i soim olsem ol kontribusen i kam long ol smolholda long ret bilong K4 per ton of FFB delivered in Hoskins and Bialla, and K5.5 long wan tan bilong FFB i go long Oro long ol namba wan yia bilong projek.⁵⁴⁴|| PAD i soim ol fainens modol na smolholda kesflo modol long tok strongim proposal bilong ol smolholda, we maski ol i no laik, bai no inap karim hevi — birua nating long net kes winmani i kam long ol FFB delivari// bihain long ol 25% kontribusen bilong ol. Long ol arapela hap insait long PAD, ol narapela kain manimak long wan wan kina i stap oslem wapela RMTF levi takis. Annex 9 i tok olsem —Ol smolholda bai peim wan

⁵³⁸ Project Appraisal Document (November 19, 2007) p. 93, ¶ 6. ⁵³⁹ Ibid., Annex 4, p. 35, ¶ 28. ⁵⁴⁰ Ibid., ¶ 28, footnote 39. ⁵⁴¹ Ibid., Table 5, p. 13. ⁵⁴² PIM Roding Submanual, p. 10, footnote 6. ⁵⁴³ Ibid., p. 11. ⁵⁴⁴ PAD, p. 35, ¶ 29.

*kwota bilong levi na ol priliminari namba kaunim i soim olsem ol Hoskins na Bialla smolholda bai peim wanpela levi inap long K5/tan FFB na ol Oro smolholda bai mas peim K6/tan FFB.*⁵⁴⁵

476. Tupela grup wantaim strongpela laik long lukim ol rot i kamap gut, em ol miling kampani na ol smolholda. Panel tim i luksave olsem ol miling kampani long Wes Nu Briten na Oro em ol lain tasol i wok karimaut wok mentenens nau. Ol i gat laik bilong ol yet long mekim dispela wok bbilong karim FFB i go long ol mil. Olsem na i no gutpela luksave olsem ol bai tok nogat long — *kontributim mani bilong ol long taim stret*⁵⁴⁶ i go long wanpela RMTF olsem ol Rikwesta i askim. Miling wok bilong ol bai pinis sapos ol i no stretim ol rot. Tru tumas, Menesmen i save olsem stat long 2006 yet olsem RMTF — *skelim kostim wantaim ol mil i no wanpela hevi, tasol ol provinsal gavman bai no inap long givim sea bilong en na i mas i gat ol arapela rot i mas kisim luksave*⁵⁴⁷



Piksa 26: Ol Kampani trak i stretim sampela Seksen bilong Kokoda Nesenel Haiwe

477. Tru tumas, insait long wanpela pas i go long Panel, Popondetta Welpam Growas Asosiesen (POPGA) i raitim — *mipela i save olsem olgeta lain i mas wok bung wantaim long stretim ol rot. Rot em i bikpela samting long mipela, na ol nupela growa aninit long SADP. Sapos i nogat rot, mipela no inap karim ol frut bilong mipela i go long maket na mipela i no mekim mani. Mipela i nidim root bai mipela i ken go long taun bilong mekim soping na long go long haus sik na skul bilong ol pikinini bilong mipela. Gavman i no save lukautim ol rot bilong mipela. OPIC na Higaturu Welpam tasol i traim long lukautim ol rot. Wantaim SADP, mipela i klia olsem ol growwa i mas peim sampela mani long rot mentenens, tasol sapos mipela i mekim olsem, Gavman na Higaturu bai mas baim tu.*⁵⁴⁸
478. **Kontribusen bilong Smolholda na Kampani.** Panel i luksave tu olsem em i no inap long tok klia, long ol Projek pepa,⁵⁴⁹ tasol rot Menesmen i bihainim long kamap wantaim

⁵⁴⁵ Ibid., Annex 9, Economic and Financial Analysis, p. 78, ¶ 11. ⁵⁴⁶ Request for Inspection, p. 8. ⁵⁴⁷ Cuddihy, William. Credit

Component and Financial Analysis REVISED FINAL, Report for OPIC/PHRD, December 30, 2006. ⁵⁴⁸ Letter to Inspection Panel by Popondetta Oil Palm Growers Association (POPGA), February 9, 2010, p. 1. ⁵⁴⁹ Papua New Guinea Proposed Smallholder Agriculture Project Access Roads Program in Target Oil Palm Areas, Institutional Aspects, Working Paper 1; Papua New Guinea Proposed Smallholder Agriculture Project Access Roads

smolholda kontribusen inap long 25%, o wan kwota bilong ol enual RMTF operating kostim. Wampela refrens long wampela kain wok kaunim i stap insait long wampela 2006 Teknikal Not we i tok, insait long tingting bilong mentenens kostim bilong wampela yia, em — *karimaut bilong dispela kalkulesen em sapos ol growa ii nap long peim wan kwota bilong ol mentenens kostim, mil i peim wan kwota, na provins, wan hap, ol growa bai peim wampela takis inap long K4.16, K 4.27 na K5.60 long wan tan i bin kamap long ol namba wan yia bilong projek, na K3.2, K 3.6 na K4.9 long wan tan FFB i kamap long ol yia bihain, long Hoskins, Bialla na Oro.*⁵⁵⁰ Dispela i soim olsem i gat wampela bikpela fomula o wok kaunim bilong brukim ol mentenens kostim bilong wanwan yia namel long ol fopela stekholda (ol smolholda, kampani, na provinsal gavman wantaim sapot bilong nesenel gavman), we i skelim wan kwota long bikpela manimak i go long wanwan stekholda.⁵⁵¹

479. Moa long en, Panel i no inap painim wampela hanmak insait long pepa wok i stap long en bai Menesmen i luksave long ol smolhola kostim bilong prodaksen long wanwan FFB tan long sekim strong bilong ol smolholda — long peim|| pastaim long ool i peim wan kwota bilong levi, wankain olsem ol arapela tripela stekholda. Ol Projek pepa i no save glasim ol winmani bilong welpam i go long ol smolholda, ol estet, na ol miling kampani, long histori bilong en, o aninit long Projek. Olsem na i nogat glasim long — strong bilong peim|| bilong ol kostim bilonggg rot mentenens taim em bai bruk namel long olgeta bikpela stekholda. Menesmen i mas givim kain stori na namba long veliu sen wok glasim tasol Panel i kisim toksave olsem Menesmen i nogat ol dispela namba na stori bikos em i haït samting ol kampani i save banisim gut.
1. Wankain tasol, Panel i luksave olsem Menesmen i no skelim strong bilong ol smolholda na estet sekta. Dispela i autim ol isiu bilong FFB praising fomula, kostim bilong prodaksen, trenspot, wok, ol veliu eded mak long wan wan hap bilong veliu sen (ol smolholda, estet, na ol CPO mil), wantaim tu strong bilong wok prosesim na CPO/PKO wel ekstresen ret long ol domestik mil. PAD i wok tok strongim pasin pren bilong ol smolholda na OPIC na ol miling kampani tasol em i mauspas long koporet gavanens, bipo wokmak bilong ol kampani, wok bilong ol insait long ol smolholda dinau na sevis, strong bilong winmani, na bihain taim strong bilong ol. Menesmen i no lukim ol namba na stori bilong dispela, olsem na em ii no inap long tok klia long sea bilong RMTF levi bilong ol smolholda.
2. Moa yet, i nogat klia luksave insait long ol projek pepa we i tok olsem mak bilong gutpela rot mentenens aninit long RMTF we bai daunim trenspot takkis inap long 35 kina long wanwan FFB bilong ol Oro smolholda.

Program in Target Oil Palm Areas, Technical Aspects, Working Paper 2; and SADP Access Road Maintenance Technical Note, May 2006.⁵⁵⁰ SADP Access Road Maintenance Technical Note, May 2006, ¶ 33.⁵⁵¹ The SADP Credit Component and Financial Analysis (Revised Final, December 2006) states in relation to the road maintenance levy: —*A levy of K4/ton FFB is equivalent to a price reduction of the same amount. The effect of the imposition of such a levy, using historical prices, is relatively minor since K4/ton FFB is equivalent to a price fall of only 4% at a low price of K100/ton FFB. ... Cost-sharing with the mills does not seem to be a problem but provincial government is unlikely to be able to provide a reliable share and alternative arrangements need to be considered*|| pp. 16-17.

482. Panel i luksave olsem: (i) i mobeta long klia long mak bilong ol smolholda na estet kampani long peim takis long wanwan skim pastaim long tok paitim ol sea bilong ol long peim long ol rot na mentenens kos; na (ii) Sapos Menesmen i bin karimaut (a) ol wok kaunim bilong wanpela kostim bilong prodaksen long wanwan FFB tan wantaim (b) strong bilong winmani bilong ol smolholda na ol estet kampani na rivium ol dispela agensim ol enual rot mentenens kostim, em bai kamap long wanpela klia moa rot bilong serim ol RMTF kontribusen. Wankain olsem, wanpela wok glasim i mas kamap long strong bilong wanwan provinsal gavman long peim 50% sea bilong ol rot mentenens kos olgeta yia, olsem ol i stap daunbilo.
483. **Kontribusen bilong Provinsal Gavman.** Moa yet, Menesmen i tok klia insait long PAD, olsem —*longpela taim stap bilong ol tras fan i bihainim ol kontribusen i kam long ol Provinsal Gavman we i gat nem nogut long sapotim ol provinsal rot infrastraksa; dispela birua rot bai mas stretim wantaim wanpela narapela wok long nesenel gavman sapos ol provinsal gavman i no inap long peim ol enual komitmen i go long rot mentenens fan na ol makim bilong ol takis risit.*⁵⁵² Panel i luksave olsem Menesmen i no karimaut ol wok sekim strong long skelim sapos ol gavman i peim ol takis winmani ol i kisim long ol ekspot grent long bipo, na i no glasim sapos ol provinsal gavman bai strong long aplaim ol dispela takis pemen i go long ol RMTF kontribusen long bihain.
484. Klostu olgeta lain manmeri Panel i bungim i wari long strong bilong Oro provinsal gavman long givim mani long wanpela RMTF – moa yet bihain long Projek i pinis -- bikos Gavman bilong Papua Niugini i no inap long sapotim ol dispela kostim moa. Planti i pilim olsem WNB provinsal gavman inap long mekim ol dispela peimen, tasol Oro provinsal gavman i no inap. Planti ol manmeri tokaut olsem ol i pilim olsem ol kauntapat mani, nogut bai Gavman bilong Papua Niugini i ken givim i go long provinsal gavman long laip bilong Projek, tasol i no bihain long Projek i pinis. Insait long miting bilong Panel wantaim Provinsal Administreta long Oro, em i tokim Panel olsem ol i nogat risos long peim i go long RMTF maski ol i laik peim. PAD i luksave olsem nogut ol provinsal gavman i no inap givim manimak stret bilong rot mentenens, we PAD i tok em i wanpela long tripela bikpela birua rot i go long painim —*bikpela birua*// luksave bilong Projek.⁵⁵³
485. Olsem na Panel i luksave olsem taim rot bilong kolektim wanpela end-yusa fi i klia long stat yet bilong ol smolholda (olsem long wanpela levi ol i sasim long FFB tan na kisim long fam get), wankain tok strongim long wanpela gutpela sistem i no go long arapela tupela bikpela stekholda (em estet o miling kampani na ol provinsal gavman). Ol rot mentenens kontribusen na rot bilong koleksen bilong ol nupela non-smolholda produsa, olsem ol nupela mini-estet, i no klia. Ol Rikwesta i autim dispela isiu taim ol i tok — *ol Growa, i narakain, bikos ol i mas kontribut long OPIC levi na bai mas kontribut tu long rot mentenens levi sapos ol i laikim mobeta rot.*⁵⁵⁴

⁵⁵² PAD, p. 55, ¶ 11. ⁵⁵³ PAD, p. 55, ¶ 11. ⁵⁵⁴ Rikwes bilong Inspeksen, p. 8.

486. **Smolholda Konsaltesen na Fri, Gutpela tok orait i go pas.** Long sait bilong ol smolholda, Menesmen i save olsem —*wanpela lukluk nogut long wanem kain levi i kam long wanpela bikipela namba ol growa bai kamap yet*// tasol dispela i nogat banis bilong — *gutpela winmani mak long ol arapela FFB i kamap*// taim ol sindaun bilong rot i kamap strong gen. Long raun bilong en, Panel tim i lukim strongpela belhat ol smolholda i gat long ool kampani long kain kain takis ol i save rausim long ol pe bilong ol. Long lukluk bilong ol, dispela em kampani i no mekim long ples klia. Olsem na taim Panel tim i toksave olsem nogut bai gat moa didaksen bilong go long RMTF, bekim i bin nogut tru.
487. Bilip bilong Menesmen olsem dispela belnogut i gat banis bilong en, olsem ol gutpela winmani mak sapos ol i givim moa FFB long kampani, i no stretim hevi olsem Menesmen i no bin plen long hevi Projek i givim taim i em i no kirap kwik, na belnogut em i givim long ol smolholda wantaim ol rot levi na ol RMTF.
488. Panel i wanbel wantaim luksave bilong Menesmen olsem — *i gat rot i stap bilong bikipela moa konsaltesen wantaim growa komyuniti long rot mentenens levi long taim bilong wok redi*||, na olsem, Menesmen i plen long givim moa stia long OPIC bai —...*disain bilong ol RMTF i kamap bihainim wok konsaltesen wantaim bikipela luksave long strongim wok i go longpela taim bihain.*||⁵⁵⁵
489. **Karimaut RMTF.** RMTF em i bikipela hap bilong Projek disain. Sapos em i nogat, planti long ol bikipela wok kamap bilong Projek bai no inap stap i go longpela taim. Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok olsem ol bikipela hap bilong ol RMTF olsem gavanens, fainensal menesmen na ol operesenal rot, na level bilong ol smolholda rot levi, em ol i no disainim gut yet, i nidim moa tok paitim na i mas kisim tok orait lng olgeta stekholda.⁵⁵⁶
490. Projek i bin kisim tok orait moa long tripela yia i go pinis, na ol tems ov refrens bilong disain bilong wanpela RMTF ol i bin etvataisim long Ogus, 2010. Moa long en, sapos autlain bilong wanpela tras fan i no inap kamap klia pastaim long pinis bilong 2012; bai i gat moa pasim bilong projek inap Tras Fan (o arapela rot) i kirapim wok. Olsem na ol RMTF bai no inap kirapim wok pastaim long 2013, em i longwe yet long Julai 2008 olsem i stap insait long PAD.⁵⁵⁷
491. QAG Kwolati Enhensmen Riviui bilong 2008 i tok olsem Projek wok redi rot —...*bai kamap gut moa long wanpela bikipela wok redi bilong ol wok operesen bilong RMTF.*||⁵⁵⁸ Panel i wanbel na askim tingting bilong larim planti ol bikipela institusenal na fainensal hap long disain bilong dispela bikipela wok insait long taim bilong karimaut wok, we em yet bai bungim planti wok pasim.

⁵⁵⁵ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 40, ¶. 130. ⁵⁵⁶ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 30, ¶96. ⁵⁵⁷ PAD, 35, Footnote 39 and p. 36, ¶30. ⁵⁵⁸ Bekim bilong Menesmen, p. 12, ¶35.

2. Ol Ekstensen Wok bilong OPIC

492. Planti smolholda i tokim ol Panel memba olsem ol OPIC ekstensen opisa i no save sindaun wantaim ol long toktok gut long ol welpam ekstensen hevi, na ol bai laikim kain sas olsem. Planti smolholda i tok olsem ol i no inap lukim ol benefit ol i ken kisim long ol OPIC levi ol i save peim. Ol Sinia OPIC wokmanmeri i givim luksave long Panel olsem planti long ol ekstensen wokman bilong ol i nogat inap trening. Tasol ol i tok tu olsem dispela i ken kamap mobeta sapos OPIC Bod i redi long sapotim ol senis.
493. Strongpela wok bilong OPIC em i stap long gutpela kamap bilong SADP bikos em i so pas long menesmen, kodinesen, na wok mak bilong olgeta hap bilong Projek. Panel i bilip olsem Menesmen i bin, na nau yet , i klia long ol wok bilong en. PAD i tok olsem — *Projek karimaut long PNG i save tokaut olsem i gat sot long operesenal level insait long planti ol pablik sekta institusen, sot long wokmak bilong gavman long givim ol operesenal kostim moa long winmani insait long ol dispela intitusen, na sot bilong gavman long givim skelmani bilong en olsem kauntapat fanding.*⁵⁵⁹ PAD i tok tu olsem — *OPIC ekstensen sistem i no strong inap long apim wok mak, bikos em i sot long yusim menesmen infomesen sistem bilong en na long glasim na stretim ol growa pasin long strongim ol rot bilong moa wok mak.*⁵⁶⁰ Tru tumas, Projek bai apim mak bilong wokmak i stap long ol ekstensen opisa wantaim 9,000 hekta moa bilong ol smolholda welpam blok, we bai karamapim 4,500 moa smolholda.
494. Panel i luksave tu olsem Menesmen i klia long sot bilong OPIC long wokmak bilong en. Dispela em i as bilong Komponen 3, we i lukluk long strongim OPIC bihainim ol kain kain institusenal developmen rot, i go insait long Projek. Wantaim dispela tingting, Mid-Tem Projek Riviui bilong Oktoba 2012 i tok makim —*nogat inap wok karimaut*|| we slek wok menesmen i kirapim —*ol bikpela projek wok olsem rot rikonstraksen, infil planim, na komyuniti developmen*|| i no go het.⁵⁶¹ Moa long en, ol i tokluksave olsem dispela wok pasim, Menesmen i toksave long Gavman olsem askim bilong en long tupela moa yia pulim bilong projek bai kisim glasim sapos OPIC i ripotim gutpela wok i go het long ol rot bilong kisim samting, na menesim projek pastaim long Janueri 15, 2011.
495. OPIC i ripotim —*gutpela wok i go het*|| insait long Janueri 2011 Implimentesen Progres ripot bilong en. Ripot i tok olsem long foapela kondisen i no pinis yet long taim Projek i kisim tok orait, wampela tasol i no pinis yet, maski ol bikpela Projek komponen (olsem sanapim bilong RMTF na Projek wokmanmeri i stap yet) na wok i pas longpela taim pinis. Long 47 Projek posisen insait long OPIC, 9-pela em ol inapim pinis, na 38 i stap yet long inapim.⁵⁶³ RMTF konsaltensi, wantaim moa luksave long —*edukesen, konsaltesen na paitim tok*,|| em bai pinis long 2011.⁵⁶⁴

⁵⁵⁹ PAD, p. 6, ¶ 18. ⁵⁶⁰ Ibid., p. 7, ¶ 18. ⁵⁶¹ Menesmen Leta bilong Mid-Tem Riviui, Oktoba 18, 2010, p. 1. ⁵⁶² OPIC Implimentesen Progres Ripot, Janueri 21, 2011, p. 5. ⁵⁶³ Ibid., Tebol 3, p. 12. ⁵⁶⁴ Ibid., p. 10.

496. Projek Midtem Rivi i tok tu olsem — *SADP i bin kisim tok orait long Desemba, 2007 na em i kirapim wok long Janueri 2009. Bihain long longpela taim wok i no kirap, Projek stat-ap i ron isi tru. Em i kisim klostu wanpela yia long sanapim projek menesmen straksa bilong OPIC. Projek Kodineta na Prokiumen Spesolis i bin kirapim wok long Oktoba na Novemba 2009, tasol OPIC i wok long kisim yet ol konsalten bilong ol arapela bikpela posisen, olsem Rot Enjiniring Yunit, Menesmen Ejensi bilong Komponen 2 long Lokol Gavanens na Komyuniti Patisipesen, Ekstensen Spesolis na Beslain/M&E Konsalten. Insait long yia i go pinis, wok pasim long kisim ol samting i givim bikpela birua long projek i no go het. Olsem em i sanap nau, SADP bai no inap long inapim olgeta Developmen Astingting bilong en pastaim long pasim taim bilong en long Desemba 31, 2012.*⁵⁶⁵||

497. Panel i luksave olsem insait long yia i go pinis, slek projek menesmen na longpela taim bilong kisim samting i daunim wok karimaut bilong Projek. Tru tumas, — *bikpela, na longpela rot bilong sanapim ol OPIC projek menesmen wokmak*// em Menesmen i bin autim longpela taim pinis, olsem namba wan as long Projek i no kirap kwik⁵⁶⁶ na long Me 2007 SADP i kisim luksave long OPCS olsem wanpela —*hai risk projek*|| bikos long —*bikpela bilong projek*.⁵⁶⁷|| Bihain, foapela yia bihain long Projek i kisim tok orait, na tupela yia bihain long Projek i kamap, ol bikpela Porjek wok i no kirap yet.

498. Projek i sindaun long wanpela RMTF mani program we bai stap longpela taim bilong lukautim ol rot bihain long Projek i pinis. Dispela bai lukim FFB koleksen i kamap long taim. Sapos dispela komponen i no pinis, hevi bilong rot i bagarap bai daunim yet ol smolholda wok kamap na daunim OPIC levi ol i sasim long wanwan FFB tan. Panel i luksave tu wantaim wari, toktok insait long Janueri 2011 OPIC Implimentesen Progres Ripot olsem infil plantim long Oro bai no inap long kirap wanpela o tupela yia, bikos mil kampani (Kula/Higaturu) i autim —*bikpela wari*|| long sait bilong wanem nupela planim long Oro na tok i mobeta long planim bek, na infil planim maski. Mil kampani, OPIC i ripot, i gat wankain luksave bikos — *ol i pilim olsem ol smolholda wok planim bek em i bikpela moa wok, na ol risos tu bai pinis sapos wok infil planim i go het*||.⁵⁶⁸

499. Mil Kampani i bin tok wanbel long stap insait long infiling wok hap, olsem Menesmen i toksave insait long Aide Memoire bilong nupela Implimentesen Sapot Misin,⁵⁶⁹ tasol em i go kamap long tupela luksave: wanpeal, em mil kampani long Oro i wari long strong bilong OPIC long karimaut ol ekstensen sevis bilong nupela planim na i laik lukluk moa long planim bek insait long ol blok i stap pinis, na namba tu, olsem sanapim bilong RMTF

⁵⁶⁵ Papua New Guinea Smallholder Agriculture Development Project (IDA Credit No. 4374-PNG) Mid-Term Review: September 20-October 7, 2010 Final Aide-Memoire, Mid-Term Review, p. 1. ⁵⁶⁶ September/October 2009 World Bank Review Mission, Final Aide-Memoire, p. 1. ⁵⁶⁷ World Bank, Papua New Guinea: Smallholder Agriculture Development Project (P079140), EAPCO Quality Assurance Review, November 26, 2007 ⁵⁶⁸ Smallholder Agriculture Development Project, Project ID-P079140, IDA Credit No. 4374-PNG, Implementation Progress Report, Status as of January 21, 2011, OPIC, p.6. ⁵⁶⁹ Papua New Guinea Smallholder Agriculture Development Project (IDA Credit No. 4374-PNG), Fifth Implementation Support Mission: April 15-19, 2011, Final Aide-Memoire, ¶ 5.

bai bagarap long Oro sapos ol winmani mak long nupela infil planim --- we ol smolholda i bin skin kirap long peim RMTF levi – i no kamap. Olsem na maski PAD i luksave olsem sapot bilong ol mil kampani i mas stap bilong wok nupela planim, na ol smolholda wokmak strongim wok,⁵⁷⁰ Panel i luksave olsem Menesmen i no tingim o mekim plen, bilong kamap bilong narapela rot planim we ol mil kampani i laik mekim long laip bilong Projek, na wanem ol senis dispela bai kamapim long Projek.

E. Ol Polisi na Prosidia bilong Benk long bihainim

500. Insait long dispela seksen, mipela i bungim tok long ol polisi na prosidia long strongim long taim sindaun bilong RMTF na ol OPIC ekstensen wok. Ol polisi bilong dispela em: OMS 2.20 long Projek Apresal, na Indijines Pipels Polisi (OP/BP 4.10).

1. Projek Apresal (OMS 2.20)

501. OMS 2.20 i tok olsem astingting bilong wok apresal em —*bilong glasim na skelim mak bilong ol ekonomik na sosol astingting we projek i mas inapim, long sekim sapos dispela projek bai inapim gut ol dispela astingting, na long rekomendim ol kondisen i mas stap long lukim kamap na inapim bilong olgeta astingting bilong projek.*⁵⁷¹ Ol mani sait i stap namel long sikspela hap bilong projek disain bilong kisim apresal o wok skelim. Long tokpaitim dispela ol mani wok, polisi i tok olsem —*Fainensal apresal i mas oltaim gat wanpela rivi bilong mani plen bilong projek na strong bilong ol akaunting na oditing wok-rot bilong en.*⁵⁷² OMS 2.20 i luksave tu olsem — *insait long planti projek, wanpela bikplea hap bilong fainensal apresal em long skelim hevi long ol mani benefisari na ol win samting bilong ol i stap insait long karimaut projek na wok. Wanpela glasim i mas kamap long strong bilong ol fainal benefisari long baim ol kago na sevis...*⁵⁷³ na —*insait long planti ol agrikalsarel projek, ol fam baset i redi long glasim laik bilong fama long stap insait long projek, na strong bilong ol long inapim bekim bilong ol fam dinau.*⁵⁷⁴

2. Indijines Pipels Polisi (OP/BP 4.10)

502. Olsem long tok klia long Sapta 2, SADP i kirapim Indijines Pipels Polisi OP/BP 4.10, bikos long biikpela hap bilong ol manmeri insait long Projek eria em ol asples, bihainim polisi na luksave bilong Benk. Dispela polis ii askim ol projek Benk i givim mani long kirapim, we i senisim sindaun bilong ol asples pipel —*em bilong strongim ol Asples Pipel long kisim ol sosol na ekonomik benefit we i bihainim gut kalsa na luksave long man na meri, wantaim ol tumbuna i kam bihain.*⁵⁷⁵ Moa yet, polisi i askim bai ol dispela projek i mas gat —*wanpela rot bilong fri, klia konsaltesen i go pas, wantaim ol Asples Pipel long wanwan stes o wok-mak bilong*

⁵⁷⁰ PAD, p.10, ¶ 29. ⁵⁷¹ OMS 2.20 – Project Appraisal, January 1984, ¶ 7. ⁵⁷² Ibid., ¶ 38. ⁵⁷³ Ibid., ¶ 43. ⁵⁷⁴ OMS 2.20 – Project Appraisal, January 1984, ¶ 43. ⁵⁷⁵ OP 4.10, ¶ 1.

projek, na moa yet long taim bilong wok redi, long inapim olgeta lukluk bilong ol na kisim bikpela komyuniti sapot bilong projek.⁵⁷⁶ Polisi i luksave tu olsem borowa i mas —givim[...] ol Asples Pipel komyuniti inap infomesen na stori long Projek (wantaim wanpela wok-skelim long ol birua i ken kamap wantaim projek long laipo bilong ol Asples Pipel komyuniti) bihainim wanpela gutpela kalsarel pasin long wanwan wok kamap bilong projek wok redi na karimaut.⁵⁷⁷

F. Glasim bilong Panel long Bihainim ol Benk Polisi

1. Rot Mentenens Tras Fan

503. Panel i luksave long Menesmen i traim long sanapim wanpela gutpela wok mani bilong rot mentenens. Kain rot mani olsem i mas stretim wanpela bikpela isiu we sapos em i no stap, smolholda welpam indastri bai no inap sindaun longpela taim, na Menesmen i givim luksave long kisim dispela salens insait long hatpela ples long wok. Menesmen i klia tu long ol sot long gat inap mani kontribusen bilong wanpela rot mentenens fan we ol provinsal gavman, na no laik bilong ol smolholda long peim moa rot takis. Gavanens long Papua Niugini em i gat bikpela luksave olsem i gat nid long strongim, na RMTF em i gutpela long bikpela developmen luksave. Olsem na wanem kain wok traim bilong kamapim wanpela nupela rot bilong gat mani bilong mentenens bilong ol bikpela infrastraksa olsem rot, i mas kisim luksave, maski em i gat planti birua.
504. Panel i luksave olsem ol smolholda i wari long tripela bikpela samting long RMTF: (i) olsem smolholda kontribusen bilong 25% em i wanpela moa mani hevi; (ii) olsem dispela pesentes i kamap taim i nogat konsaltesen o toktok wantaim ol smolholda, na ol i bilip olsem ol i no kaunim na skelim stret; na (iii) olsem ol arapela stekholda, moa yet ol provinsal gavman, bai no inap long givim kontribusen bilong ol i go long RMTF levi.
505. **Projek Disain.** Panel i luksave olsem Implimentesen Komplisen Ripot (ICR) bilong projek pastaim long SADP (em Oro Smolholda Welpam Developmen Projek (1992-2001), i tok olsem — *Taim ol i sanapim, mentenens bilong ool ekseks rot netwok bai orait bikos em bai mekim wok bilong en long inapim ekonomik welpam prodaksen..... Tasol, institusenal wok stretim bilong dispela kain wok mentenens i no kisim spesol luksave. Lukluk i go bek, moa luksave i bin inap go long dispela hap bilong projek...Mentenens em i wok bilong provinsal gavman, tasol provins i nogat inap man ii stap na i no skelim wanpela bikpela manimak long go long rot mentenens long ol ekseks rot*⁵⁷⁸. Insait long ol — Skul em i kisim || seksen, ICR i tok olsem — *Bikos ol ekseks rot i save larim koleksen bilong ol fres frut bans long go het gut, institusenal na mani rot bilong strongim konstraksen na mentenens i mas kisim moa luksave .. Bikos long bikpela hap manimak bilong konstraksen na mentenens, bai longwe bilong rot long wanwan smolholda blok i kisim sevis, i mas go daun. Dispela bai lukim strongim bilong welpam developmen bihainim ol ekseks rot...Givim bilong*

⁵⁷⁶ OP 4.10, ¶ 6(c). ⁵⁷⁷ Ibid., ¶ 10(c). ⁵⁷⁸ Implementation Completion Report, Oro Smallholder Oil Palm Development Project, p. 11-12.

*ekses rot mentenens em i mas stap olsem konstraksen bilong netwok. Wok redi ripot long Oro projek i tok klia olsem toksave bai stap insait long sentral gavman baset bilong dispela. Dispela i no bin kamap.*⁵⁷⁹

506. Panel i pasim tingting olsem Menesmen i bin, na nau yet, i klia long bikpela wok bilong ol rot na rot mentenens wok bilong strongim stap bilong Projek na long holim wokmak bilong ol smolholda; 70% bilong ol SADP mani em i go long rot wok bilong en. Gutpela wokmak bilong ol smolholda i save strong moa taim i gat gutpela rot. Dispela em i namba wan bikpela aswok bilong en, we sapos i nogat, bai Projek i no inap kamap gut. Ol —Lessons Learned|| not antap i soim klia nid bilong givim moa luksave long ol institusenal na mani rot bilong inapim kamap na mentenens bilong ol rot bai Projek i ken kamap gut. Moa yet, Benk i bin klia long sot bilong mani long provinsal level na nogat gutpela kamap bilong man ii kam long nesenel gavman baset.

1. Maski PAD i luksave long sampela ol skul em i kisim, disain bilong SADP i asua long karamapim tu ol institusenal na mani rot bilong ol RMTF, na ol i lusim bilong stretim long taim bilong karimaut projek. QAG rivi i luksave ong dispela na Bekim bilong Menesmen tu i givim luksave long en.
2. Panel i luksave olsem strong bilong RMTF i pas klostu, na i save bihainim, longpela taim bilong wok i go het, na dispela i save daunim bilip bilong ol stekholda bilong en (ol smolholda). Panel i luksave olsem Menesmen i traim long halivim gavman long kirapim rot bilong disainim ol RMTF na i bilip olsem dispela disain bai lukim gutpela kamap bilong ol kontribusen i kam long olgeta stekholda bilong RMTF.

509. **Panel i painim olsem Menesmen i asua long bihainim OMS 2.20 taim em i larim disain bilong dispela bikpela wok bilong Projek, we i mas stap long inapim olgeta astingting bilong Projek, i go long taim bilong karimaut Projek.**

510. **Kalkulesen o wok kaunim bilong RMTF.** Taim i luk olsem PAD i tok olsem pesentes kontribusen mak i go long RMTF i pas olgeta, Panel i bilip gutpela ridim bilong PAD i soim olsem pesentes kontribusen i kamap olsem wanpela proposal o askim na astingting na straksa bilong wanpela rot bilong kisim mani bilong rot mentenens wok i no klia yet. Dispela em i bin astingting long taim bilong Projek disain. Tasol sapos yu ridim, yu ken kisim narapela tingting sapos yu ridim PIM Roding Sab-Manual, we i givim pesentes kontribusen fomula olsem ol i makim na i pas olgeta pinis.⁵⁸⁰ Tru tumas, Figa 3 insait long Sab-Manual (— ol Fanding Rot bilong wanwan Rot Mentenens Tras Fan||) i strongim dispela tingsave taim em i droim ol pesentes bilong wanwan makim. Ol Rikwesta, olsem, i gat as long tingim olsem rot levi kontribusen mak bilong 25%, em ol i makim pinis.

511. **Panel i painim olsem askim bilong Menesmen long 25% kontribusen i kam long ol smolholda i kamap tasol, na i nogat luksave long strong bilong ol smolholda long peim dispela manimak, na moa yet, i nogat konsaltesen i kamap wantaim ol smolholda long dispela manimak.** Painim namba wan gutpela

⁵⁷⁹ Implementation Completion Report, Oro Smallholder Oil Palm Development Project, p. 23. ⁵⁸⁰ PIM Roding Sub-Manual, p. 11.

sea bilong RMTF levi ol bilong ol smolholda i mas sanap long wanpela wok glasim long ol namba na konsaltesen.

2. Ol Ekstensen Wok bilong OPIC

512. **Ol Ekstensen Wok bilong OPIC.** Panel i wanbel wantaim luksave Menesmen i givim olsem em i —*asua long painim ol birua rot bilong pasim wok kamap na taim bilong sanapim projek menesmen wokmak bilong OPIC.*⁵⁸¹||
513. Panel i luksave tu olsem Menesmen i klia long ol sot bilong OPIC olsem wanpela ogenaísesen na savemak bilong ol ekstensen opisa bilong en. Ol dispela sot i ken kisim stretim long tupela rot: (a) ol rot i kamap nau long bildim wok na savemak bilong OPIC yet na ol ekstensen opisa bilong en, na (b) ol OPIC prosideral sistem, olsem i stap klia insait long PIM ECMMP na ol arapela wok menesmen tuls, i givim ol klia tok makim na stia long mekim gut wok ekstensen, na daunim ol birua rot long busgraun na komiyuniti.
514. Moa yet, Panel i klia olsem Menesmen i bin traim long stretim hevi long wokmak bilong OPIC, taim em i kamapim wanpela moa institusenal developmen komponen (em Komponen 3) insait long Projek na i askim long sanapim bilong OPIC Projek Opis na OPIC Rot Enjiniering Yunit olsem ol rot bilong tilim mani.
515. **Panel i luksave olsem, insait long mak bilong ol wokman straksa bilong Menesmen long sapotim dispela Projek, Menesmen i bihainim olgeta askim bilong OP 13.05 long Projek Supavisin, paragraph 2b, we i tok, “Painim ol hevi taim ol i kamap long taim bilong wok karimaut na tok klia long borowa long ol rot bilong stretim ol.”**
516. Taim Benk i senis long wok supavisin i go long —*implimentesen sapot,*|| tasol, em i bikpela moa wok long Menesmen long strongim wok na savemak bilong en long painim ol hevi kwik na stretim ol. Dispela em i tru we i gat ol bikpela sot long savemak insait long bikpela ejensi bilong karimaut wok, na insait long wanpela hatpela progreem envairomen, o, long kipim ol Projek — *i isi long save long en, na i klia,*|| bihainim rekomendesen bilong 2008 QAG Riviu.

G. Ol Las Tokluksave

517. Panel i luksave long Menesmen i traim long bungim hevi bilong rot mentenens, we em i bikpela samting long holim strong bilong welpam prodaksen insait long ol Projek eria na long inapim olgeta astingting bilong Projek. Tasol Panel i wari olsem ol birua rot i stap wantaim ol pasin bilong i no bihainim stret wok, wantaim longpela taim bilong disainim dispela bikpela hap bilong Projek karimaut, na asua long skelim gut strong bilong ol smolholda long peim takis i go long RMTF, na sot long mak bilong ol wok konsaltesen, wantaim ol bikpela salens bilong Projek wok ples, i givim bikpela moa hevi na birua long ol smolholda.

⁵⁸¹ PIM Roothing Sub-Manual, p. 11, ¶ 34.

Sapta 7: Ol Sistemik Isiu

518. Dispela sapta i paitim tok long ol sistemik isiu i sut long Benk i bihainim ol operesenal polisi na prosidia o rot bilong mekim wok, insait long luksave bilong wok painim i go insait long dispela Projek. Moa yet, i gat tripela bikpela sistem isiu Panel i painimaut long wok painim bilong en. Ol em: yusim bihainim Indijines Pipels Polisi long ol Projek we ol asples pipel em ol namba wan benefisari, yusim dispela Polisi long taim bilong karimaut wok, na daunim ol birua rot i stap wantaim sot long mak bilong ol institusen long mekim wok. Moa long dispela, bihainim tok orait i kam long Eksektiv Bod bilong Wol Benk Grup Fremwok na IFC Strateji bilong Wok insait long Welpam Sekta, dispela sapta i karamapim sampela luksave Panel i gat long ol skul em i kisim long dispela wokpainim we i ken givim stia long bihainim dispela Fremwok.

A. Bihainim Indijines Pipels Polisi long ol Projek we ol Indijines o Asples Pipel em ol lain i Kisim samting

522. Long karimaut dispela wok painim, Panel i kisim stia long projek taitol, Smolholda Agrikalsarel Developmen Projek, na bilip olsem ol smolholda i stap olsem ol memba bilong ol asples komyuniti. Olsem na lukluk i bin go long agrikalsarel developmen bilong ol smolholda, na wok painim long ool birua na wok bihainim i bin luksave long polisi fremwok Wol Benk polisi long ol Indijines Pipels (OP 4.10) i givim.
523. Panel i luksave olsem Menesmen i no redim wanpela Indijines Pipels Plen (IPP) bilong Projek bikos Projek bai givim ol gutpela samting long ol asples komyuniti. Insait long wanpela kes Panel i glasim, Panama Len Administresen Projek, Menesmen i makim wankain skelim bihainim luksave olsem olgeta bikpela projek wok bai stretim ol hevi ol asples pipel i gat long yusim graun. Long Panama wok painim na long dispela wok painim, Panel i painim i olsem i nogat bihainim bilong OP 4.10, na long tupela wantaim, namba wan bikpela wari i stap long ol konsaltesen i kamap wantaim ol asples komyuniti.
524. Panel i tok moa olsem OP 4.10 i no luksave long asua long mekim wanpela IPP aninit long ol dispela kain sindaun antap: —*Taim ol Indijines o Asples Pipel em ol bikpela namba lain husat bai kisim stret halivim long projek, ol hap wok rot bilong wanpela IPP i mas stap insait long bikpela projek disain, na bai nogat nid long wanpela arapela IPP. Long kain sindaun olsem, Projek Apresal Dokumen (PAD)i gat wanpela bungim tok long we projek i bihainim stret polisi, moa yet wantaim ol IPP askim.*⁵⁸² Taim stia long redim wanpela IPP em i sut stret long Polisi, em i nogat strong long wanem samting i stap sapos i nogat IPP.
525. Ol astingting bilong Polisi em long lukim ol projek —*i gat ol rot bilong (a) abrusim ol rot birua i ken kamap long ol Indijines Pipel komyuniti, o (b) taim i no inap long abrusim, long daunim mak, slekim strong, o givim kompensesen bilong ol birua. Ol projek Benk i givim mani long kirapim em ol i disainim bai ol Indijines Pipel i kisim ol sosol na ekonomik benefit we i bihainim stret kalsa, luksave long man na meri wantaim, na i tingim tu ol tumbuna bilong bihain.*⁵⁸³

⁵⁸² OP 4.10, ¶12. ⁵⁸³ Ibid., ¶1.

Panel i wari olsem ol wokman i nogat wankain luksave long namba tu hap bilong ol dispela astingting (olsem _ol sosol na ekonomik benefit) insait long ol projek we _ol birua nogut i no klia na i gat nid long kamapim wanpela IPP. Bihainim Polisi, wanpela IPP i mas makim klia — *ol rot we borowa i ken lukim olsem ol (a) Indijines Pipels husat sindaun bilong ol i senis long Projek, i kisim inap sosol na ekonomik benefit; na (b) taim ol birua nogut i kamap long ol Indijines Pipels i stap ples klia, na inap abrusim ol dispela birua nogut, daunim mak o slekim strong bilong ol, o givim kompensesen long en.*⁵⁸⁴ Bikpela luksave i stap long _karim hevi na _ol dispela birua nogut i ken pulim luksave i go longwe long we bilong givim ol benefit i go long ol pipel. Wanpela bikpela wari long dispela em konsaltesen wok; maski em i gutpela na inapim ol stendat bilong —*fri, gutpela konsaltesen i go pas, // sapos —bikpela komyuniti sapot //* long ol asples komyuniti i stap, na sapos ol wok konsaltesen i luksave gut long ol —*benefit //*.

526. Wok painim bilong Panel i painimaut olsem ol konsaltesen i sot long mak bilong en, arere bilong en, na we em i go long luksave long ol kastomari rot bilong mekim disisen. Dispela wok i mas i gat mobeta stori bilong en, na moa yet, i mas soim ol samting ol i painim, na ol rekomendesen bilong Sosol Asesmen we i ken senisim sindaun bilong ol asples komyuniti, olsem sanapim bilong wanpela seving rot na ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani. Bikos i nogat IPP, wantaim tupela bikpela astingting bilong en, em i kamapim asua long wok bihainim polisi.
527. Ol bipo wok painim bilong Panel i soim klia, asua long bihainim Polisi bilong Benk long ol Indijines o Asples Pipel. Na gen, wanpela bikpela isiu em sot long wok konsaltesen wantaim ol asples komyuniti, na moa yet, asua long i no luksave long ol lokol straksa bilong makim maus (olsem, Honduras Land Administresen Projek na ol DRC fores operesen). Painim bilong asua long wok bihainim insait long ol dispela i go ausait long wok konsaltesen tasol, na i karamapim gut pasin bilong asua long redim ol Indijines Pipels Developmen Plen.
528. Olsem na, em i gutpela long kamapim ol klia gaitlain bilong yusim OP 4.10 long ol projek we i gat wanpela IPP i sanap em yet, i no gutpela. Luksave i stap long gutpela bilong ol benefit aninit long projek na komyuniti sapot bilong projek olsem wanpela bikpela wok.

B. Bihainim Indijines Pipels Polisi long taim bilong Karimaut wok

529. OP 4.10 i askim olsem konsaltesen i kamap wantaim ol komyuniti i mas kamap i no long taim bilong projek disain tasol, tasol long olgeta wok kamap bilong projek, na wokbung bilong ol wokman i gat trening i mas stap. Insait long rivi bilong ol Projek pepa, Panel i painim olsem Menesmen i bin luksave long ol askim bilong OP 4.10 long taim bilong plenim yet (olsem Sosol Asesmen na Benefisaris Asesmen), tasol ol luksave long dispela polisi i bin pinis isi isi taim Projek i mov i go long disain wok bilong en na i go insait long karimaut wok na supavisin.

⁵⁸⁴ OP 4.10, ¶12.

530. Insait long Panama Len Administresen Projek wok painim, Panel i mekim wankain luksave: olsem, — *stretpela karimaut bilong IP polisi bilong Benk i no hangamap long strongpela na klia as long wok redi bilong Projek, tasol i bihainim skelim bilong ol risos bilong supavisin, moa yet long kisim ol sevis bilong ol wokmanmeri na ol konsalten wantaim spesol trening long ol asples pipel isiu na wok developmen.*⁵⁸⁵ Panel i skelim olsem dispela tingsave i sut long SADP tu. Ol risos bilong supavisin bilong IP polisi i kamap bikpela moa wantaim nupela luksave bilong Benk long wok karimaut sapot. Panel i amamas long lukim pas i kam long Menesmen (long Mas 8, 2011)⁵⁸⁶ we i toksave long narapela misin olsem wanpela wok ‘implimentesen sapot’ moa long wok ‘supavisin’ misin, bihainim koporet rifom wok i go het nau.
531. Olsem na Panel i luksave olsem ol projek long Papua Niugini i givim wanpela nupela salens long Benk, we populesen em i pulap moa long ol asples pipel bilong moa long et-handret hauslain na pisin; dispela i kirapim OP 4.10 bilong olgeta projek. Ol Projek eria, olsem bilong SADP, i gat planti kain kain pasin, na moa luksave i mas go long Indijines Pipels Polisi long taim wok karimaut i mas go het. Dispela bai nidim moa klia stia bilong ol wokman long mekim OP 4.10 i wok strong long Papua Niugini.

C. Skelim ol Birua bilong ol Opis i nogat Strong long Mekim Wok

532. Panel i tok-makim o bikpela wok banis long karimaut Projek, we i kamapim belhevi namel long planti ol smolholda. As bilong ol dispela wok pasim em planti, tasol Projek i bungim tupela samting Menesmen i mas luksave long en. Namba wan, Menesmen i skelim ol birua rot wantaim dispela kauntapat wokmak bilong bikpela luksave bilong projek disain o nogat? Na namba tu, Menesmen i bin bungim olgeta risos bihainim ol birua long supavaism Projek o nogat?
533. Kwolati Enhensmen Riviui bilong ol Pasifik Ailans i glasim SADP disain long Jun 2008 pastaim long lonsim bilong Projek na i pinisim wanpela bikpela piksa bilong inapim wokmak na bikpela bilong projek. Long dispela mak, Riviui i skelim olsem SADP — *i lukluk moa, na i kirap long klia wok-mak (na wanpela longpela taim wokbung namel long Benk na Welpam Invesmen Koporesen, em ejensi i karimaut projek), taim em i kamapim ol nupela samting (wantaim wanpela rot tras fan) na ol wok traim (wanpela CDD progrem bilong ol komyniti i stap ausait long projek eria).*⁵⁸⁷ Tasol, olsem wanpela bikpela bungim tokluksave, Riviui i makim — *nid bilong lukim bikpela bilong projek i napim stret lokol savemak olsem bikpela skul i kam long IEG na QAG long ol yia i go pinis. Ol projek insait long Pasifik Rijen i mas isi, na klia.*⁵⁸⁸ Agensim dispela tingting, OPCS i bin makim SADP long Me 2007 olsem wanpela — *hai risk projek o projek i gat planti birua*⁵⁸⁹|| bikos long — *bikpela bilong porojek.*⁵⁸⁹||

⁵⁸⁵ Investigation Report, Panama: Land Administration Project (Loan No. 7045-PAN), September 16, 2010, ¶348. ⁵⁸⁶ Management Letter, Papua New Guinea: Smallholder Agriculture Development Project (Credit No. 4374-PNG) – Implementation Support Mission. ⁵⁸⁷ Pacific Islands Quality Enhancement Review, Volume 1, June 2, 2008, Quality Assurance Group, p.12. ⁵⁸⁸ Ibid. ⁵⁸⁹ World Bank, Papua New Guinea: Smallholder Agriculture Development Project (P079140), EAPCO Quality Assurance Review, November 26, 2007.

534. Panel i luksave long bikpela ol sot long ol kauntapat wok. Menesmen i luksave long dispela tu insait long disain bilong Komponen 3 we i lukluk moa long strongim wok savemak bilong OPIC. Tasol Projek i wok long pundaun long ol wok-pasim yet. Bihainim Jun 2011 Implimentesen Stetus na Risals Ripot (ISR), — *we menesmen bilong projek na nogat strong na inap save long kisim samting, em ol bikpela as i pasim wok karimaut kwik.*⁵⁹⁰ Ol bikpela wok bilong projek (Rot Mentenens Tras Fan, na infiling long ol smolholda blok) i hangamap long save na wokmak bilong OPIC, we i sindaun long rikrutmen bilong ol gutpela wokmanmeri na sanapim bilong intenal institusenal straksa. Sot long tupela wantaim insait long ol namba wan yia bilong Projek i lukim wok-pasim na longpela taim bilong mekim wok.
535. Bikos sampela ol bikpela disain wok bilong projek i no kamap, na i suruk i go long taim bilong karimaut wok, dispela i pulim taim gen long ol fil-level wok. Panel i amamas long lukim sampela ol wok-pasim i raus insait long laspela yia, dispela wanpela ISR i toktok tu long ol wok pasim long rot rikonstraksen: — *OPIC i nogat inap kauntapat mani yet bilong stretim ol Popondetta na Bialla pekes. OPIC i wok long askim bihainim Dipatmen bilong Tresari na Dipatmen bilong Nesenel Plening na Monitaring (DNPM) long hevi bilong kauntapat fanding. Sapos dispela kauntapat fanding i no stret kwik, em bai pasim kamap bilong ol arapela wok.*⁵⁹¹
536. Insait long namba foa yia bilong Projek, ol nupela na ol traim wok (em RMTF na komyniti developmen), em ol i no disainim yet, o karimaut, na i gat nid nau long ol i mas — *isi long save na klia*⁵⁹² i mobeta long SADP i stap long 2008. Panel i bilip olsem bikpela QER rekomendesen bilong Pasifik Ailans i aplai long SADP, na — *bikpela skul long strongim mak bilong givim dinau, em: Kipim Isi long mekim! I gat klia wokpasin namel long bikpela bilong projek, na ol hevi bilong karimaut. Ol isi, klia projek, maski long bikpela bilong ol, i save inapim olgeta wok bilong ol, na i gat evidens i stap olsem ol i gat strongpela stratejik imek sapos ol i disainim gut bihainim ol gutpela etvaisori wok.*⁵⁹³
537. — *Kipim simpol na klia*//i no minim olsem ol i nogat birua long wok. Tru tumas, Panel i givim luksave long Menesmen long traim sanapim wanpela pemanen o longpela taim progreem bilong rot mentenens, we i mas sta bilong holim wok groim welpam. Tasol wanpela bikpela isiu bilong skelim ol birua aninit long Projek em long pasim ol dispela hevi bai ol i noken pundaun long ol lain turangu long karim. Dispela em i wanpela bikpela wari insait long Rikwes. Panel i ting olsem RMTF, bihainim namba wan tingting bilong en, hevi bilong manimak na birua rot i pundaun moa long ol smolholda, na i nogat klia luksave long mani i mas kam long tupela arapela rot bilong halivim mani – em ol provinsal gavman na ol mil kampani – maski em i klia ol kampani i nidim gutpela rot mentenens wok tu.
538. Wantaim pasim bilong wok karimaut, gavman na Menesmen bilong Benk i wok tingting long senisim straksa bilong Projek, na i lukluk tu long kanselim o rausim Komponen 2. Dispela

⁵⁹⁰ Implementation Status and Results Report, June 2011, p. 2. ⁵⁹¹ Ibid, p. 2. ⁵⁹² Pacific Islands Quality Enhancement Review, Volume 1, June 2, 2008, Quality Assurance Group, para 33, bullet point 5. ⁵⁹³ Pacific Islands Quality Enhancement Review, Volume 1, June 2, 2008, Quality Assurance Group, para 34.

Komponen i karamapim, bihainim Projek Implimentesen Manual (PIM), we bai lonsim wanpela nupela hap ol wok we wanpela ausait ejensi bai karimaut aninit long kontrak.

1. Wanpela wankain isiu, we i singaut long ol wok-senis long taim bilong karimaut wok, em i bikpela ol narakain long sait bilong histori bilong welpam sekta insait long projek eria. Dispela i stap klia insait long ol stia bilong welpam sekta i stap insait long projek eria. Dispela i stap klia long ol kain kain level smolholda wok, we i kamap long disisen bilong dispela wanpela mil kampani long sapotim wok infiling long wanpela provins, tasol long givim daunbilo luksave long ol arapela na i givim moa luksave long wok planim bek. PIM bilong SADP i no luksave long ol narakain sindaun long ol fil sindaun long tupela provins. Olsem, na em i kamap klia moa long ol wok karimaut bilong Projek long yusim narapela rot luksave long mekim wok i go het long inapim ol Projek aswok.
2. Maski Panel i ai-op long savemak bilong ol wanwan wokmanmeri husat i kisim wok wantaim Projek, i gat bikpela nid i stap long bekim ol salens i wok long kamap long taim bilong karimaut projek insait long kain bikpela wok na ples salens olsem long Papua Niugini.

D. Ol Samting bilong Tingim long Bihainim WBG Fremwok long Wok insait long Welpam Sekta

541. Dispela Rikwes bilong Inspeksen i kam bihain long mun Novemba 2009 Wol Benk Grup tambu long ol nupela welpam projek. Bikos lonsim bilong SADP i kamap pinis, em i no stap insait long dispela wok-tambu. Wankain tasol, wanpela WBG Fremwok bilong Wok insait long Welpam Sekta⁵⁹⁴ i bin kisim tok orait long Eksektiv Bod long Mas 2011.
542. Fremwok i pinisim tok olsem: —*Taim gutpela kamap bilong krop long wok, mekim winmani na senisim sindaun bilong ol lain turangu em i bikpela tru, welpam i kisim bikpela tok daunim olsem wanpela namba wan birua bilong rausim ol diwai na givim moa ges nogut long sampela kantri. Em i kisim planti sut tok long i no givim wankain luksave na benefit namel long ol lokol komyuniti na asples pipel. Dispela i tok olsem i gat ol samting i mas lus long groim welpam, tasol i no olsem long olgeta hap. Net envairomen na sosol wok senis bilong welpam i bihainim ples we em i kamap. Ol hevi i save kamap taim ol strongpela ekonomik wok bilong opim mak bilong groim welpam i sanap antap long wanpela gavanens fremwok we i nogat inap strong bilong stiaim kamap bilong ol nupela welpam plantesen we ol envairomen na sosol hevi i stap daunbilo.*⁵⁹⁵||
519. Ol dispela samting i lukluk long tripela isiu we dispela wok painim i ken givim halivim long folo-ap o bihainim Fremwok. Ol dispela isiu em long strong bilong mekim wok na supavisin, ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani, na ol mak bilong straksa i no wankain.

⁵⁹⁴ World Bank and IFC, *The World Bank Group Framework and IFC Strategy for Engagement in The Palm Oil Sector*, March 31, 2011 ⁵⁹⁵ Ibid, p. 4.

543. **Mak bilong Mekim wok na Supavaisim.** Em i klia olsem bipo, we i gat bikpela envairomen na komyuniti wok nogut long ol strongpela ekonomik wok i sanap long gavanens fremwok i nogat strong. Tasol aninit long dispela Projek, long sait bilong diforestesen o rausim ol lain diwai, Panel i luksave olsem ol Projek disain na instramen i gat ol rot i stap bilong abrusim birua long busgraun. Long polusen o posinim busgraun, Panel i luksave olsem Menesmen i lukim nid bilong strongim wok tritmen long ol pipia bilong mil, we i wok long go het nau. Moa yet, ol mil kampani nau i mekim wok na soim bilip bilong ol long strongim ol stendat bilong banisim busgraun na komyuniti, wantaim tu, ol rait bilong ol asples pipel.

544. Wanpela bikpela skul i kamaut long dispela wok painim, em mak bilong ol borowa institusen na wokmak bilong Benk long karimaut inap wok halivim long inapim Projek karimaut olsem ol i disainim na i wok pasim ol hevi long busgraun na komyuniti. WGB Fremwok i no sut long ol dispela samting insait long presentesen bilong en long nid bilong strongpela moa wok eli asesmen (p.33) o insait long nupela Gud Praktis Not bilong ol Wokman.⁵⁹⁶

545. Moa yet, wok painim i makim tupela bikpela isiu i stap insait long Fremwok, tasol i kisim skul long SADP, na i nidim moa wok strongim. Dispela tupela samting em:

- bikpela bilong ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani, na ol kainkain sindaun; na
- nid bilong stretim ol narakain sindaun insait long sekta.

546. **Moa rot bilong kisim Winmani.** Fremwok i makim namel long ol arapela hevi bilong komyuniti — *narakain wok long sindaun long ol kes-krop na lusim wok atonomi ol i kisim long ol tumbuna pasin bilong wok gaden*|| na i makim — *pasim ol lokol pipel long ol benefit i kam long ol kainkain rot bilong kisim gutpela sindaun*|| olsem wanpela long ol birua bilong opim welpam long ol smolholda,⁵⁹⁷ listim bilong ol Arapela Rot Stretim bilong Mobeta Senis long Welpam Developmen (seksen 3.5), em long strongim smolholda wok na ol gutpela i kam long welpam indastri. Olsem dispela Ripot i tok, long planti ol smolholda long Papua Niugini, welpam em i wanpela rot, namel long ol arapela kain rot bilong painim gutpela sindaun, na i sut long nid bilong strongim ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani.

547. **Nogat Wankain Straksa luksave.** Fremwok i luksave olsem — *straksa bilong pasin poroman namel long ol smolholda na ol plantesen kampani na/o mil i save baim ol frut, em i wanpela wok makim bilong ol smolholda kondisen.*||⁵⁹⁸ Bikos ol i stap insait long wanpela monopsonik (wanpela tasol) sindaun, ol smolholda i no save gat strong long makim prais. Fremwok i wok olsem namel long — ol Rot bilong Strongim Senis bilong Welpam Developmen|| nid bilong strongim mak bilong ol smolholda mausman na smolholda koporetiv long tok pait. Dispela

⁵⁹⁶ World Bank, WBG Oil Palm Framework and IFC Strategy for Engagement in the Palm Oil Sector, March 31, 201, Annex VII: Applying World Bank Safeguards and IFC Performance Standards: A Good Practice Note for WBG Staff ⁵⁹⁷ The World Bank Group Framework and IFC Strategy for Engagement in The Palm Oil Sector , p.20. ⁵⁹⁸ Ibid, p.22.

wok painim i tok stret olsem bikos i nogat stia tingting long polisi bilong makim ol prais na skelim ol winmani takis long ol smolholda, wantaim tu sotpela mak bilong bilip long ol mausman bilong ol, em ol stretpela wari Projek i no inap long stretim olgeta.

ANNEX 1

Tebol i soim ol Samting ol i painimaut

ISIU	BEKIM BILONG MENESMEN	OL SAMTING PANEL I PAINIMAUT
Infomesen Disklosa, Konsaltesen, na Bikpela Komyuniti Sapot		
Sosioekonomik na Kalsarel Fekt Fainding a. Rivi u wok-glasim long ol Ligel na Institusenal Fremwok i karamapim ol Inidijines (Asples) Pipel	Insait long Bekim bilong en, Menesmen i tok olsem Borowa i lain i dinau i karimaut wanpela bikpela Sosol Asesmen na wanpela Benefisaris Asesmen. Menesmen i tok olsem Sosol Asesmen i tok klia long ol sosio-ekonomik na politikal luksave bilong ol Projek eria na i gat tu wanpela wok –skelim long ol institusen insait long wanwan ol dispela eria, na tu ol lokol komyuniti ogenaísesen, ol NGO, ol komyuniti nap les grup, ol LLG, ol welpam growa asosiesen, na ol indastri opis.	Panel i painimaut olsem wok-glasim bilong ligel na institusenal fremwok bilong kastomari lo, lidasip, rot bilong mekim disisen, na rot bilong stretim kros na hevi, na ol kain kain bilong ol (sapos i gat) namel long ol kain kain ples grup, i sot long ol askim bilong Annex A bilong OP 4.10, na olsem, em i no bihainim Polisi bilong Benk.
b. Bungim ol Beslain Infomesen	Insait long Bekim bilong en, Menesmen i tok olsem Sosol Asesmen o wok-skelim i karamapim ol beslain stori na namba long wanpela haus na wara wok-kaunim.	Panel i no painim inap evidens na infomesen insait long Sosol o Benefisaris Asesmen long sapotim tingsave long hauslain pasin bilong ol indijines o asples grup. Em i tingting bilong Panel olsem em i mobeta i gat moa luksave long wanem ol komyuniti i save sindaun moa long ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani (olsem, ol keskrop, ol gaden bilong haus na lokol maket, wok painim pis, na painim abus), na tu, ol mep i soim klia wanem ol ples i stap, na wanem ol grup wan-tokples grup i stap long en. Panel i ting olsem moa wok-glasim long ol pasin bilong ol kain kain tokples grup insait long Projek eria long tok klia moa long Projek (olsem wok-graun na givim long pikinini, rot kastom bilong mekim ol disisen, na pasin

		bilang wok gaden) i mas stap insait long ol Sosol na Benefisaris Asesmen pastaim long luksave i kamap long ol dispela grup olsem ol i ‘wankain’ tasol. Bikos i nogat bikpela beslain infomesen, dispela em i asua bilang ol dispela asesmen, we Panel i painim olsem em i no bihainim OP 4.10.
c. Luksave long ol Projek Stekholda na Tok klia long wanpela rot bilong Konsaltesen wantaim ol Asples Pipel	Bekim bilang Menesmen i tok olsem wanpela Benefisaris Patisipesen Fremwok i kamap bihainim Sosol Asesmen na i makim ol rot ool benefisari komyuniti i ken kisim wok insait long Projek. Ol bikpela hap bilang dispela Fremwok i stap insait long disain bilang Projek. Menesmen i tok tu, olsem em i stap insait long Sosol Asesmen na Benefisaris Asesmen, bikpela mak tok-paitim i kamap wantaim ol welpam smolholda hauslain, ol non-welpam komyuniti i kam aninit long Projek, ol Lokol Gavman Institusenn, ol CBO, (wantaim ol meri na yut grup), ol NGO, ol sios grup, na welpam ogenaísesen (olsem ol welpam growas asosiesen). Menesmen i tok olsem wok-bung insait long ol konsaltesen em i bin laik bilang wanwan yet, na rot konsaltesen i kamap, i bihainim pasin bilang ples. Olgeta fokas grup toktok wantaim ol welpam smolholda na ol non-welpam groim hauslain i bin go het long Tok Pisin. Menesmen i tok olsem askim i go aut long olgeta grup smolholda long kam stap insait long wok konsaltesen. Dispela askim i kam long ol OPIC ekstensen opisa. Ol Fokas grup miting wantaim tupela LLG, we i kamapim hap bilang institusenal asesmen, i bin	Sosol Asesmen i makim ol kain kain stekholda kategori long kisim lukssave, maski i no stap long wanwan ol asples komyuniti. Panel i painim olsem Sosol na Benefisaris Asesmen i tok klia long wanpela rot bilong konsaltesen bilang kamap long wanwan stes o wokmak bilang projek, olsem i stap insait long OP 4.10. Tasol. Panel i painim olsem Konsaltesen Fremwok i no bihainim pasin bilang ples, na i gat sot long rivi u o glasim bilang ol ligel na institusenal fremwok na wok bilang bungim beslain infomesen long ol asples komyuniti, na olsem, em i no bihainim stret OP/BP 4.10.

	stap insait long Sosol Asesmen, em i kamap wantaim halivim bilong OPIC na ol LLG mausmanmeri. (dispela infomesen i bihainim toktok wantaim ol konsalten i mekim Sosol Asesmen wok).	
d. Asesmen o Wok-Skelim bilong ol Senis Projek i bringim long ol Asples Pipel	Long Bekim bilong en, Menesmen i tok olsem Borowa i karimaut wanpela bikpela Sosol Asesmen na wanpela Benefisaris Asesmen.	Panel i painim olsem Sosol Asesmen i painim ol birua na gutpela bbilong SADP i bihainim stret OP/BP 4.10. Tasol, em i tingting bilong Panel, olsem sapos ligel na institusenal fremwok i bin gat gutpela wok glasim, wantaim karimaut na givim ol gutpela beslain infomesen na karimaut wanpela gutpela rot bilong konsaltesen, painim bilong ol birua rot na gutpela bilong projek bai mobeta.
e. Painim ol Rot bilong Abrusim ol Birua na Givim luksave long ol Asples Pipel i kisim ol Benefit i Gutpela long Ples na Sindaun bilong ol	Menesmen i tok olsem Sosol Asesmen i givim stori long ol wari na ol sosio-ekonomik isiu. I gat wari long haus-slip na wara saplai. Ol hevi bilong Graun i bin bikpela tu long Popondetta we i gat bikpela stori long ol kropsait long graun. Benefisaris Asesmen i bungim tok long olgeta benefit bai kam, na ol birua nogut olsem ol risponden o lain i bekim i givim long taim bilong ol wok konsaltesen. Benefisaris Asesmen i givim tu ol rekomendesen bilong strongim ol benefit o gutpela ol i kisim, na daunim ol birua rot.	Panel i painim olsem Sosol Asesmen i luksave long sampela rot bilong abrusim, daunim strong na slekim ol birua, na long lukim ol asples pipel i kisim ol benefit aninit long Projek we i gutpela long laip na sindaun bilong ol long ples. Tasol ol konsaltesen wantaim ol stekholda long gutpela na stretpela bilong dispela Projek disain i no kamap bihainim polisi bilong Benk.
Fri na Gutpela Konsaltesen i Go Pastaim a. Raitim na stori bilong Wok Konsaltesen	Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok olsem Sosol Asesmen na Benefisaris Asesmen i raitim stret ol samting ol konsaltesen i painimaut. Menesmen i luksave olsem, i nogat inap stori long wok konsaltesen insait long Sosol Asesmen na Sosol Asesmen Ripot i no paitim tok long wanem infomesen i bin go aut gut long ol lain bilong bekim long wok konsaltesen, rot dispela infomesen i go aut, o rot ol i bihainim long makim ol ples na lain bilong stap insait long wok konsaltesen.	Maski Benefisaris Asesmen i tok makim wanpela fremwok, we i stap tu olsem wanpela annex insait long Projek Implimentesen Manuel (PIM) we i lukluk long bikpela bilong konsaltesen i karamapim ol smolholda long wanwan stes bilong projek redim na karimaut, Panel i no painim evidens olsem kain fremwok olsem i bin stap klia long kamap long wanwan stes o hap bilong Projek wok redi na karimaut. Olsem, bihainim PAD, Projek i bin laik mekim wok welpam infiling na planim bek, tasol i bin gat senis long wok i go long sapotim wok infiling tasol.

	Moa yet, Menesmen i luksave olsem ol askim bilong OP4.01 i no bin kisim inap bekim, we wanpela infomesen tasol i go aut long ol stekholda long taim bilong konsaltesen, long EA, em i bin stap long toktok tasol.	Panel i no painim wanpela rekot long konsaltesen long sait bilong Projek i rausim wok planim bek olsem wanpela komponen, maski i bin gat laik i stap namel long ol grup i bin givim tingting long namba wan kirap bilong Projek, long planim bek welpam. Panel i painim olsem i nogat konsaltesen wantaim ol smolholda long senis insait long Projek disain luksave long infiling na planim bek i go long infiling tasol, i no bihainim OP 4.10.
b. Konsaltesen wantaim ol Kastomari Lida	Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok olsem olgeta komyuniti i stap insait long wok konsaltesen i no gutpela, olsem na Gavman bilong PNG i laik toktok moa wantaim ol komyuniti memba na ol ogenaísesen mausman long ol bikpela mak komyuniti intares o laik. Bikpela namba bilong ol wok konsaltesen i kamap insait long Projek eria, o distrik we Projek wok i wok kamap long en.	Panel i no painim evidens insait long ol Projek pepa olsem ol konsaltesen, taim ol i kamap, i bin traime kisim tingting o bekim bilong ol klen lida, moa long ol lain i stap insait long ol lidasip grup bilong wok gavman (moa yet ol Lokol Level Grup).
c. Serim Infomesen bihainim Gutpela Rot na Tokples	Menesmen i luksave olsem wanpela toksave tasol i go aut long ol stekholda long taim bilong Envairomen Asesmen em long maus tasol. Ol konsaltesen wantaim ol smolholda i bin kamap long Tok Pisin na nogat Projek pepa i bin tanim i go long Tok Pisin. Tasol, ol Tok Inglis pepa i bin go aut long PNG long mun Februari, 2007.	Panel i painim olsem nogat pepa long sait bilong Envairomen Asesmen i soim klia sapos olgeta toksave i go aut gut pastaim long konsaltesen, bihainim rot na tokples we i klia na i go aut long olgeta grup i kisim konsaltesen, bihainim askim bilong OP 4.01. Moa yet, taim EA na ol arapela pepa-wok i bin go aut long pablik long Pot Mosbi na Wasington long Februari 22, 2007, na taim fomal toksave i go long pablik long tokaut olsem ol pepa i go aut pinis, we OPIC i bin salim toksave i go aut long ol niuspepa long dispela de yet, ol pepa i bin stap long tok Inglis tasol, na i no long wanpela tokples i klia na i orait long ol grup i kisim konsaltesen. Dispela i no bihainim fri, klia na gutpela konsaltesen i go pastaim, na askim long en insait long OP/BP 4.10.

		Panel i painim bikpela sot long wok konsaltesen. Moa yet, olsem Menesmen i asua long givim infomesen pastaim long konsaltesen i kamap long wanpela gutpela rot, piksa, na tokples. Dispela i no bihainim OP 4.10 na OP 4.01.
Evidens bilong Bikpela Komyuniti Sapot	Menesmen i ting fri, gutpela konsaltesen i go pas i bin kamap insait long ol wok redi bilong Projek na bikpela komyuniti sapot bilong Projek i stap insait long ol Projek eria. Menesmen i tok olsem Borowa i bin karimaut wanpela bikpela Sosol Asesmen na wanpela Benefisaris Asesmen. Olsem i stap insait long ol dispela ripot, planti wok konsaltesen i bin stap bilong toksave long ol asesmen, na long kisim bekim long ol bikpela stekholda long ol kain kain Projek disain na wok. Bihainim wanpela rivi long ol dispela pepa, na ol konsaltesen Benk i mekim long taim bilong painim na wok redi hap bilong dispela Projek, Benk i luksave olsem Borowa i no kisim bikpela komyuniti sapot. Menesmen i tok olsem luksave bilong polisi long <i>“fri na gutpela konsaltesen i go pastaim”</i> na <i>“bikpela komyuniti sapot”</i> i no bilong kisim bikpela tok orait, o long i mas i stap bai projek i kamap, bilong kisim tok orait i kam long <u>olgeta</u> wanwan manmeri o grup.	Panel i no bin inap long painim, insait long ol projek pepa, na tu ol Sosol na Benefisaris Asesment, ol toksave long rot i painim bikpela komyuniti sapot. Panel i painim olsem dispela em i no bihainim OP 4.10.
Poveti o Turangu Sindaun na Ol Birua long Laip na Sindaun		
Daunim Poveti o Pasin Turangu	Ol i disainim Projek long halivim wok daunim poveti o pasin turanguu insait long tripela Projek eria bihainim ol kain kain rot olsem: (a) wok stretim long rot; (b) apim mak bilong manimak i go long wan wan haus bilong ol	Panel i painim olsem Projek i sut long apim winmani mak bilong ol Smolholda na olsem, em i bihainim stret Polisi bilong Benk long Daunim Poveti o Pasin Turangu OP 1.00.

smolholda i groim welpam (long ol welpam blok i stap pinis) bihainim mobeta wok mak na daunim kostim bilong salim; (c) apim winmani mak bilong ol smolholda i planim nupela welpam long wok infiling; (iv) strongim ol sekta wok i lukluk long strongim sindaun bilong ol smolholda (olsem ol MLFS); na (v) strongim mobeta rot long kisim ol bikpela sosol na ekonomik infrastraksa aninit long Komponen Namba 2 bilong Projek.

Ekonomik Wok-Skelim na Glasim bilong Strong long mekim Winmani

Wanpela strongpela ekonomik na fainensal wok-glasim bilong Projek i bin kamap olsem hap bilong wok redi. Bikpela ERR bilong Projek i bin inap olsem 16.7 pesen. Moa yet, wok-glasim i soim olsem ol FRR bilong ol smolholda i mekim wok-infiling i sanap namel long 22 pesen na 27 pesen, bihainim bikpela bilong Projek eria, we i makim moa namba bilong winmani mak moa long ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani.

Strongim Sindaun: Sevings na ol Arapela Rot bilong Kisim Winmani

Menesmen i bilip strong olsem Projek i no pasim ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani.

Ol namba na stori i stap pinis olsem sindaun bilong ol welpam smolholda insait long tripela SADP Projek eria i op moa, na kain kain ol wok i save strongim winmani i go long ol haus bilong ol welpam smolholda. SADP bai sapotim moa opim wok bihainim ol invesmen rot long strongim ol rurel rot na aninit long Komponen 2 bilong Projek

Em i bilip bilong Panel olsem Projek disain yet i mas mekim inap luksave long bekim ol narakain namel long ol Projek eria, bai ol smolholda i ken kisim guutpela ekonomik, sosol na kalsarel benefit long Projek. Panel i painim olsem dispela i no bihainim OMS 2.20 na OP/BP 4.10.

Bihainim planti yia wok Benk i sapotim insait long welpam seka long Papua Niugini, insait long wokbung wantaim ol welpam kampani, na bikpela wok bilong ol kampani long karimaut Projek na bikpela senis long mak bilong winmani bilong ol smolholda, Panel i painim olsem Menesmen i no bin karimaut stretpela wok skelim strong bilong ol kampani long wok-opis na mani sindaun. Panel i painim olsem dispela i no bihainim OMS 2.20 na OP/BP 10.04.

Sevings na ol arapela rot bilong kisim winmani em ol rot i stap bilong abrusim ol birua i go long ol asples komyuniti, olsem i stap insait long Sosol Asesmen.

Bikos Projek i no karamapim ol rot i stap insait long Sosol Asesmen we i sut long abrusim na daunim strong bilong ol birua long ol asples smolholda i groim welpam, Panel i painim olsem Menesmen i no bihainim OP/BP 4.10.

(Lokol Gavanens na Komyuniti Patisipesen).

Menesmen i tok olsem ol welpam smolholda i mobeta long planti ol arapela kain fama, bikos ol miling kampani i save saplaim ol smolholda wantaim ol fam input olsem ol sidling, fetilaisa na tuls long dinau. Projek i no save fosim ol smolholda husat i laik kisim ol dinau bilong ol arapela agrikalsa wok long go insait long groim welpam. Wok infil planim aninit long SADP em i save bihainim laik tasol, na sapos nogat, ol VOP smolholda i ken go insait long wok infiling o nogat. Em i laik bilong ol yet. Sapos ol blok inapim olgeta kain sosol na envairomen wok skrinim bilong infil planim. Ol Smolholda yet i gat save long welpam, na moa yet, winmani na hatwok bilong welpam, bikos em i stap long ples bilong ol planti yia pinis. Long skelim sapos ol i groim welpam o nogat, ol Smolholda i mas gat rot bilong kisim ol lokol risos we i ken strongim laik bilong ol.

Maski pasin bilong intakroping o planim ol arapela kes-krop namel long ol welpam i no strong long ol welpam blok long PNG, monokroping i no save pasim rot bilong opim moa rot bilong kisim winmani bilong ol hauslain. Insait long ol VOP eria, ol namba na stori i soim olsem ating tu-teds bilong ol haus i save groim ol arapela kes-krop olsem kopi, kakau, kopra na vanilla, bihainim sindaun bilong graun yet. Ol LSS smolholda, husat i nogat bikipela graun, i save go insait long ol arapela liklik bisni na painim wok ausait long fam.

Ol Hevi long Busgraun na Wara

Strong bilong Envairomen

Menesmen i tok olsem EA, EMP na

Panel i no painim wanpela nogut tingting

Asesmen	ESMF i makim klia ol birua i ken kamap long Projek na i gat tu ol gutpela na strongpela rot bilong daunim strong bilong ol. EA i givim namba na stori long bikpela mak bilong ol efluen o pipia bilong mil na dispela mak bilong efluen i save kisim tritmen na i go aut. Insait long EA, wanpela jasmen i kamap olsem ISO14001 setifikesen i givim strong long gutpela tingting bilong miling kampani long ol envairomen menesmen wok na kontrol em i gat. Bihainim Rikwes o Askim, em nau, Menesmen i wanbel olsem wanpela moa bikpela na strongpela wok-glasim long ol birua bilong moa prodaksen long ol welpam mil na ol pipia bilong en i mas kamap.	insait long Envairomen Asesmen, olsem ol Rikwesta i tok, na em i no kisim ol bikpela piksa tru long ol Rikwesta long kain rot olsem i kamap. Aninit long wanpela provision bilong baienual indipenden envairomen na sosol odit i go insait long PIM, Menesmen i opim em yet long ol gutpela tok-strongim i kam long ol stekholda. Panel i painimaut olsem bungim bilong ol envairomen menesmen na wok slekim tul na strong bilong ol save ol i yusim insait long Envairomen Asesmen i bihainim OP 4.01.
“Infilling” agensim “Opim Wokmak” na ol birua bilong en	Menesmen i tok insait long bekim bilong en, olsem ol toktok bilong infil planim em ol i yusim insait long olgeta Projek pepa i sut long planim welpam bihainim ol ekkses rot insait long tripela bikpela NES long PNG. Em i klia long olgeta Projek pepa, olsem SADP bai sapotim opim wokmak insait long welpam eria inap long 9,000 hekta long ol smolholda VOP blok. Wanpela infil blok em i olsem tupela hekta long bikpela bilong en. Toktok long wok infiling em ol i yusim bilong tok klia olsem bai nogat moa opim wok bilong welpam eria antap long dispela i stap pinis aninit long ol ekkses rot i stap nau insait long tripela NES eria. Infilling i save givim bikpela prodaksen strong taim em i strongim yusim bilong infrastraksa i stap pinis, na apim karim bilong FFB insait long ol welpam skim eria. Infilling i save bekim askim bilong ol smolholda long inapim bungim bilong wok prodaksen insait long wanpela welpam skim eria i stap pinis, na dispela i ken	Em i luksave bilong Panel olsem tok infiling, em Menesmen i no yusim long haitim opim wok bilong groim moa welpam. Panel i luksave olsem wari bilong ol Rikwesta i no long hevi i ken kamap long busgraun tasol long infil planim, tasol em i sut long hevi i ken kamap long sindaun sapos ol infil blok i kamap long ol eria we i save <i>“givim ol ekonomik na sosol sevis”</i>. Nupela Infil Planim Apruval Fom bilong Me 2011, em, i no larim senisim bilong ol kaikai gaden i go long ol infil blok sapos ol dispela gaden em ol wanpela gaden tasol apliken i gat.

	abrusim ol hevi i stap wantaim wok bilong divelopim ol nupela skim eria bilong welpam prodaksen.	
Graun i Lus, Topsoil i pinis na Siltesen o graun i pulap long wara	Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok olsem EA, EMP na ESMF i painim ol bikipela hevi long busgraun na wara bilong Projek na i gat ol rot i stap bilong daunim ol hevi bilong ol dispela.	Panel i painimaut olsem Projek i gat ol rot bilong daunim strong bilong graun i lus, topsoil i pinis, na siltesen o graun i pulap long wara, na i bihainim stret OP 4.01.
Kemikal na Baiolojikal Posinim bilong ol Wara	Menesmen i wanbel olsem i nogat inap klia stori insait long EA long ol dispela pipia bilong mil. Moa yet long was long miling kampani ISO 14001 na RPSO setifikesen, wanpela bikipela glasim long strong bilong moa pipia i kamaut bihainim ol Projek wok bilong kamap. Bihainim dispela Rikwes, em nau, Menesmen i wanbel olsem wanpela bikipela moa wok-glasim long ol birua long apim bilong prodaksen mak na ol efluen o pipia bilong main i mas kamap.	Em i tingting bilong Panel olsem Menesmen i luksave long birua bilong kemikal polusen o posinim i stap wantaim welpam divelopmen na i mekim olgeta samting insait long disain bilong Projek, long pasim wanem kain birua nogut i kamap taim fetilaisa i save ron bihainim rot bilong wara, bai em i noken kamap. Panel i painim olsem ol dispela wok i bihainim OP 4.01. Panel i wanbel wantaim luksave bilong Menesmen olsem i nogat inap glasim bilong ol hevi i kamap long ol mil efluen, na em i no bihainim OP 4.01. Panel i luksave olsem Agrid Eksen Plen i stap insait long Efluen Stadi i sut long ol kain birua bilong mil efluen na, taim ol i karimaut, i ken bringim Projek i kam aninit na bihainim stret OP 4.01. Bikos i gat ol salens i stap bilong karimaut ol envairomen loa long Papua Niugini, olsem i stap insait long Efluen Stadi, Panel i luksave olsem Menesmen asua long em i no mekim dispela wok-skelim pastaim yet.
Birua bilong Diforestesen o Rausim ol Hai Konsavesen Velu Fores o lain diwai	Nogat bikipela senisim o daunim bilong ol bikipela fores eria o bikipela ples bus i stap long plen aninit long Projek, na insait long lukluk bilong Menesmen, Projek i karamapim inap root (bihainim OP/BP 4.36) bilong daunim na skelim gut ol birua bilong ol diforestesen eria bilong ol hai konsavesen velu eria. Projek i bungim tu ol rot bilong abrusim ol birua long ol bikipela bus bihainim ol askim bilong OP/BP 4.04.	Panel i painimaut olsem lukluk bilong Projek long disain bilong en long strongim mak bilong ol OPIC ekstensen wokman i bihainim ol askim bilong OP 4.04 long ol Netseral Habitot. Em i luksave bilong Panel olsem Menesmen i no bin inapim gut olgeta askim long OP/BP 4.36 long lukim Borowa i givim Benk wanpela asesmen o wok skelim long strong bilong makim graun bilong menesmen, konsavesen, na sastenabel divelopmen bilong ol

Inap provision i stap insait long Projek bilong lukim strongim bilong wokmak bilong OPIC long karimaut gut EMP, we ol i disainim bilong lukim SADP i bihainim stret olgeta askim bilong envairomen na konsavesen lo long PNG na wantaim ol envairomen banis bilong Benk.

fores we i karamapim wanpela wok kaunim bilong ol bikpela fores eria. Maski long dispela, Menesmen i givim tu ol rot insait long Projek bilong pasim senisim o daunim bilong ol bikpela fores eria o ol bikpela lain bus; Panel i painim olsem Menesmen i bihainim stret astingting bbilong OP/BP 4.36 long dispela sait.

Institusenal Sastenabiliti

Rot Mentenens Tras Fan (RMTF)

Sastenabiliti em i wanpela bikpela wok insait long SADP olsem i stap insait long Projek disain. RMTF bilong kamap aninit long Projek bai strongim stap longpela taim bilong ol invesmen long rot rikonstraksen insait long ol Projek eria. SADP em i hap bilong wanpela QAG lainim rivi long 2008. Bikpela bilong en, skelim bilong kwolati long entri i bin gutpela. Rivi i bin luksave tu, olsem, sampela ol hap bilong Projek disain bai gutpela moa long gutpela pinis bilong wok redi, we i toktok moa long ol RMTF, QAG i luksave tu long taim bilong redim i bin spid tumas bikos windua bilong mekim wok long kirapim bek wok dinau long PNG.

Menesmen i wanbel olsem i bin inap i gat bikpela moa konsaltesen long rot mentenens levi insait long growa komyuniti long taim bilong wok-redi. Tasol, Menesmen i luksave olsem i gat moa wok konsaltesen bai kamap long disain stadi bilong RMTF.

Panel i painimaut olsem Menesmen i no bihainim stret OMS 2.20 taim em i lusim disain bilong dispela bikpela hap bilong Projek, we i mas stap bilong inapim olgeta Projek astingting, i go long karimaut bilong Projek.

Panel i painimaut olsem tok-makim bilong Menesmen long 25% kontribusen bilong ol smolholda long go long RMTF i bin kamap taim ol i no skelim gut strong bilong ol smolholda long peim, na moa yet, i no kisim tingting bilong ol smolholda yet long en.

Ol OPIC Ekstensen Wok

Menesmen i bilip olsem i bin gat inap luksave long daunim pasin turangu na stap longpela taim bilong Projek disain.

Menesmen i bilip tu olsem i gat inap wok skelim insait long Projek supavisin.

Panel i luksave olsem, insait long arere mak bilong wokman straksa bilong Menesmen long sapotim dispela Projek, Menesmen i bihainim olgeta askim bilong OP 13.05 long Projek Supavisin, paragraph 2b, em, *“Painim ol hevi kwik long taim bilong wok karimaut na tok klia long borowa long ol rot bilong stretim.”*

Menesmen i tok PAD i luksave olsem strong mak bilong OPIC long wok ekstensen i mas strong moa na i makim mani aninit long Projek bilong strongim savemak bilong en.

Projek disain i stretim tu bikpela bilong strongim kwolati, strong na stap long taim bilong wok risets na ekstensen sevis i go long ol smolholda welpam sekta.

Bekim bilong Menesmen i tok tu olsem i gat laik long apim mak insait long smolholda prodaksen wantaim mobeta rot, mobeta ekstensen sevis, moa infiling na prut bilong welpam aninit long SADP, wantaim bikpela progrem bilong ol smolholda wellpam planim bek we ol welpam miling kampani i mekim, bai kamapim bikpela mak moa long FFB prodaksen na long ol asosietet OPIC levi o takis inap long K4 long olgeta FFB. Dispela bai strongim stap long taim bilong OPIC sevis sistem.

Tasol, taim Benk i senis long wok supavisin i go long “implimentesen sapot”, em i kamap moa bikpela long Menesmen long apim mak bilong em yet long painim kwik ol hevi wantaim luksave bilong stretim ol kwik, moa yet long taim we i gat bikpela sot long wokmak na save bilong ejensi i mekim dispela wok.

ANNEX 2: SADP TIMELINE

2002	<i>Novemba. 18 -29, 2002</i>	<i>Wok Painim misin</i>
2003	Mas. 4 – Apr. 4, 2003	Bikpela Aidentifikesen misin
	Jun 25, 2003	Konsep nout riviui miting
	Julai 17, 2003	PID na ISDS i go long InfoStua
2006	<i>Epril. 25 – May 26, 2006</i>	<i>Wokredi misin</i>
	Oktoba. 23 – Nov. 16, 2006	Pri-apresal misin
2007	Janueri. 28 – Feb. 28, 2007	Apresal misin
	Februari. 22, 2007	Disisen miting, tok orait long ol tokpaitim
	<i>Februari. 23, 2007</i>	<i>Kirapim Wok Apresal</i>
	Mas. 1, 2007	Givim PID Apdet i go long Infostua
	Epril. 30, 2007	Kirapim Tok Paitim
	Me 16, 2007	ISDS Apdet i go long Infostua
	Me 17, 2007	Envairomen asesmen i kamap long InfoStua
	Oktoba. 10, 2007	Pinisim ol tokpaitim
	<i>Desemba. 18, 2007</i>	<i>Tok orait bilong Bod long givim dinau</i>
2008	Julai 9, 2008	Sainim bilong Fainensing Agrimen na Projek Agrimen
2009	<i>Janueri. 28, 2009</i>	<i>Strongmak bilong Projek</i>
	Mas 5 -19, 2009	Lonsim Projek misin
	Septemba. 17 – Oktoba. 7, 2009	Supavisin misin
	<i>Desemba. 17, 2009</i>	<i>Inspeksen Panel i Rejistaim Askim bilong Inspeksen</i>
2010	Mas 15 -31, 2010	Wok Karimaut Sapot Misin
	<i>Mas 25, 2010</i>	<i>Bod ov Eksektiv Dairektas i tok oraitim wok painimaut</i>
	Septemba. 20 – Oct. 7, 2010	Mid-tem Riviui Misin
2011	Epril. 15 – 19, 2011	Wok Karimaut Sapot Misin

Annex 3
Sanapim ol Wol Benk Banis na IFC Pafomens Stendat:
Wanpela Gutpela Wok Pasin Nout bilong ol WBG Wokmanmeri^a

Long 2011 Wol Benk Grup (WBG) i pinisim wanpela rivi bilong welpam sekta na ol skul bilong WBG invesmen insait long welpam. Wok rivi i bin kamap bihainim ol wari bilong ol stekholda long sait bilong nogut busgraun na komyuniti hevi bilong sekta wantaim luksave bilong bikpela opim insait long sekta sans bilong wok developmen, moa yet bilong ol rural turangu lain.

Ol stekholda i autim ol wari long sait bilong gutpela wok pasin, wok graun, lusim ol bikpela lain diwai na bus, bungim olgeta smolholda, na narakain long ol wokmak; tasol long luksave long strong bilong sekta long strongim ol ekonomi, strongim kaikai sekyuriti na kamapim moa wok. Taim i gat ol luksave long ol prikondisen o samting bilong oraitim wok gen, i bin narakain, i bin gat klia luksave olsem WBG i mas mekim gutpela wok bilong promotim stap longpela taim insait long sekta.

Long dispela as, na bekim ol rikwes o askim i kam long ol kauntapat, WBG i lukim olsem wanpela gutpela kwolifait kirap bek insait long sekta bai inapim Grup bilong sapotim groim bilong welpam we i gutpela, we i givim guutpela long ol lain turangu, na i no daunim strong bilong busgraun na wara.

Dispela nout i givim stia tok long ol wokman long yusim ol sosol na envairomen banis i stap pinis, na ol stendat bilong wok insait long welpam sekta. Tingting em bilong kamapim gutpela rot bilong mekim disisen na strongim gutpela pasin.

Lukluk long Wok: Olgeta projek bai mas bihainim ol dispela: (i) wanpela Joint WB-IFC eli asesmen long painim ol rot na salens i stap insait long sekta (Kantri Situesen Analisis); (ii) painim ol rot bilong wokbung bilong WB-IFC; na (iii) bilong ol IFC projek, yusim bihainim Risk Skrining na Asesmen Tul.

Ol polisi bilong bihainim: Olsem insait long olgeta Wol Benk wok, envairomen, sosol na ligel banis polisi

na konsaltesen rot i stap, o we wanpela IFC projek i wok kirap, IFC pafomens stendat i mas stap. Ol dispela kraitiria o wok skelim mak i stap bilong halivim ol wokman long yusim ol polisi i stap bilong ol welpam projek.

Olgeta projek bai bihainim ol nesenel polisi, lo na regulesen wok stia. Na we i gutpela, strongim wokmak bilong strongim akauntabiliti o stretpela wok pasin bai bikpela wok.

Kraitiria Namba 1. I gat ol klia ekonomik benefit bilong ol lain turangu rurel manmeri: WB bai givim namba wan luksave long ol projek we i givim bikpela gutpela mak long ol smolholda, na long kirapim bek ol plantesen i no strong moa (na ol plantesen bilong o arapela diwai krop we i laik senis i go long welpam) we i gutpela long ol smolholda na ol nupela smolholda eria; IFC bai sapotim ol plantesen na kampani insait long saplai rot we i gutpela long ol rural komyuniti taimem i givim lukave long ol projek we i save strongim ol smolholda, na we i yusim ol graun i nogat moa strong long en.

Senis Mak: moa winmani long wok welpam, salim o prosesim, ol smolholda ogenaisesen bai kisim strong.

Ol Was Mak: opim moa wok; apim winmani mak; apim veliu bilong en; apim mak bilong wok; givim gutpela long ol lokol komyuniti; evidens i stap long strongom ol smolholda.

Kraitiria Namba 2. Ol Smolholda na welpam kampani i luksave long ol rait bilong yusim graun bilong wok welpam na WB i sapotim raitim na stretim wok rot i stap.

Senis Mak: moa klia rait bilong yusim graun i save strongim sindaun bilong ol invesmen, rot bilong kisim mani sevis na moa strong bilong sindaun.

Ol Was Mak: taitol long graun o rait bilong yusim, we ol i raitim klia long pepa; ol invesmen i stap strong; moa rot bilong kisim mani sevis; bihainim stret ol abitresen wok.

Kraitiria Namba 3. Senis bilong welpam developmen long netseral o bikpela ol busgraun ples i gat arere bilong en. Sapos i gat rot, ol i traim ol arapela rot na abrusim ol birua, na i gat rot i stap bilong daunim strong bilong ol hevi. Moa luksave bai go lonog kirapim bek ol olupela plantesen long strongim wok mak bilong ol. Sapos projek i sapotim sanapim bilong ol nupela plantesen we i kirap long ol graun i bagarap pinis. Ol welpam plantesen we i lukim senis o daunim bilong bikpela hai kabon stok o hai konsavesen veliu bus, bai nogat.

Wasmak bilong en: ol mep i soim ol bus, na sevei, na wokmak bilong ol.

Kraitiria Namba 4. Moa yet, we i gat bikpela hap mak welpam i go aut long kantri olsem ekspot, ol sistem bilong painim bihainim na setifikesen i stap pinis: we sapos ol i no stap, i gat sapot i stap bilong developim o kamapim ol gutpela sistem bilong akauntabiliti, na bilong WB, invesmen em i stap tasol long ol smolholda progreem.

Senis Mak: Ol sistem i stap (o i wok kamap) na i gat indipenden wasman bilong en.

^aDispela Annex i kam long *The World Bank Group Framework and IFC Strategy for Engagement in the Palm Oil Sector, March 31, 2011*, p. 66., i stap long:

http://intresources.worldbank.org/INTARD/Resources/PalmOil_strategy_eng.pdf

Annex 4

Ol Baiografi o Stori

Ol Memba bilong Panel

Mista Roberto Lenton (Ajentina) i kisim makim long Panel long mun Septemba 2007 na i kamap siaman long Novemba 2009. Em i bin kisim wanpela digri pepa long sivil enjiniaring long Yunivesiti bilong Buenos Aires na wanpela Ph.D. long Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT). Wanpela spesolis saveman long ol wara risos na sastenabol developmen wantaim moa long 30 krismas intanesenel save long dispela fil, em i stap olsem siaman bilong Wara Saplai na Sanitesen Kolaboretiv Kaunsil na memba bilong bod ov dairektas bilong WaterAid America, na i holim dispela wok inap Julai 2009 olsem siaman bilong teknikal komiti long Global Water Partnership. Mista Lenton em i wanpela long tupela man i raitim *Applied Water Resources Systems* na em i bin ko-edita bilong —Integrated Water Resources Management in Practice,|| na man i go pas long raitim *Health, Dignity and Development: What Will it Take?*, em laspela ripot bilong Yunaitet Nesens Milenium Projek Tas Fos long Wara na Sanitesen, we em i bin siaman long en. Pastaim, Mista Lenton i bin dairekta bilong Sastenabel Eneji na Envairomen Divisen bilong Yunaitet Nesens Developmen Progam long Nu Yok, dairekta jeneral bilong Intanesenel Wara Menesmen Institut long Sri Lanka, na program opisa insait long Rural Poveti na Risoses program bilong Ford Faundesen long Nu Delhi na Nu Yok. Em i bin wok olsem adjunct profesa long School of International and Public Affairs long Columbia Yunivesiti na asisten profesa long sivil na envairomen enjiniaring long MIT.

Mista Alf Jerve (Norwe) i bin kisim makim long Panel long Novemba 2008. Mista Jerve i bringim kam long Panel klostu long tripela ten wok insait long fil bilong developmen. Wanpela sosol antropolojis, em i bin wok insait long planti kain kain wok developmen, olsem wwanpela bikpela fil risets wok long Afrika na Esia. Namel long ol wok bilong en, em wanpela tripela yia stap long Tanzania wantaim Norwe Ejensi bilong Developmen Koporesen, olsem kodineta bilong wanpela rural developmen program. Long 1993 i go 1995, em i bin go pas long risetolmen na riabilitesen wantaim ol projek long Bangladesh long wanpela wok wantaim Wol Benk. Long 1995, em i kamap Asisten Dairekta, na i wok olsem Dairekta long 2005 na 2006, long Christian Michelsen Institute long Norwe, wanpela intanesenel luksave developmen risets institusen, we em i bin givim taim na save bilong en long karimaut wok risets na glasim ol kain kain polisi na program isiu i pas long ol pipel long ol developing kantri.

Long olgeta yia wok bilong en, Mista Jerve i bin go pas na stap insait long planti ol indipenden iveluesen i kamap long wok bilong ol baileteral na multileteral developmen ejensi, na wok olsem wanpela memba bilong Roster of Experts bilong Esian Developmen Benk Inspeksen Wok bilong en.

Em i pinisim magister digri bilong en long sosol antropoloji long Yunivesiti bilong Bergen, na Baselas digri bilong em i stap long eria bilong envairomen saiens na baioloji. Ol pablikesen o samting em i raitim i lukluk long rural developmen, disentralaisesen, na poveti ridaksen na moa yet, ol isiu bilong onasip long developmen eid koporesen.

Mis. Eimi Watanabe (Japan) i bin kisim makim long Inspeksen Panel long Novemba 1, 2009. Insait long olgeta yia wok bilong en, Mis Watanabe i soim strongpela bilip long bihainim olgeta stretpela wok pasin bilong ol developmen program, na strongpela wok mak bilong wokbung wantaim ol sivil sosaiti ogenaísesen, ol gavman, na ol arapela developmen ogenaísesen. Em i gat trening olsem wanpela sosiolojis, na em i bin stap inasit long bikpela ol wok eria, long projek na polisi level wantaim, na i karamapim poveti ridaksen, gavanens, jenda, pikinini helt na nutrisin, kapesiti

divelopmen, envairomen, na intanesenel maigresen. Mis Watanabe i kisim wanpela M.Sc. na Ph.D. long London School of Economics na em i kisim wanpela B.A. long sosioloji long the International Christian University long Tokyo. Long 1998 i go inap 2001, em i wok olsem asisten sekreteri jeneral na dairekta bilong Yunaitet Nesens Developmen Progreem (UNDP) Buro bilong Developmen Polisi. Pastaim long en, em i bin UN residen kodineta na UNDP residen mausmeri long Bangladesh, na UNICEF Mausmeri long India. I no long taim i go pinis, em i bin wok olsem wanpela memba bilong Stratejik na Odit Advaisari Komite bilong Yunaitet Nesens Opis bilong Projek Sevises. Mis Watanabe i bringim moa long 30 yia woksave long fil bilong developmen.

Ol Saveman Konsalten

Bruce Carrad (brucecarrad@gmail.com) em i wanpela ekonomis na agribisnis spesolis husat i stap long Papua Niugini long 1978 i go inap 1986, na i no long taim i go pinis, long namel long 2008 i go inap Desemba 2009. Namel long ol dispela taim, em i bin Dairekta bilong Iveluesen Seksen long AusAID; Dairekta, Agrikalsarel Developmen Sevises (wanpela Saut Is Esia konsaltensi na bisnis menesmen bisnis i spesolais long ol agrikalsa komoditi, wantaim tu, welpam); na i holim kain kain wok olsem wanpela wokman long Esian Developmen Benk long 1994 i go long pinisim wok taim bilong em long 2007, wantaim tripela yia stap long Beijing, Saina. Mista Carrad em i bin wanpela memba bilong wanpela ekspet panel biloong wanpela CAO komplaiens odit bilong dinau projek bilong IFC i go long Wilmar International, wanpela long ol bikipela welpam bisnis na prosesa. Nau em i stap long Hanoi, Vietnam na i wok long strongim sindaun bilong ol lain turangu na asples komyuniti insait long Noten Hailans rijen.

Donald Allan Gilmour (don.gil@bigpond.com) i holim wanpela PhD bilong James Cook University bilong Not Kwinslen na wanpela MSc bilong Australia Nesenel Yunivesiti. Em i wok nau olsem wanpela praivet konsalten, na i gat bikipela wok save long ol developmen kantri, moa long Esia na Afrika. Em i bin Go pas man bilong Fores Konsavesen Program bilong IUCN, em International Union for the Conservation of Nature, i stap long Switzerland long 1990s; em i stap 8-pela yia wok long forestri edukesen na fores haidroloji risets insait long wet tropics bilong noten Australia. Em i bin wanpela long ol namba wan man i kirapim, Vais Siaman na Siaman bilong Bod ov Trastis bilong Center for People and Forests (RECOFTC) long Bangkok. Em i wanpela memba bilong sampela ol IUCN saintifik komisin (long ikosistem menesmen, envairomen ekonomiks na sosol polisi na ol ples tambu). Em i wanpela memba bilong ol editorial advaisori bod bilong tupela saintifik jenal o buk. Dokta Gilmour i raitim o halivim long raitim sampela ol buk na monograf long komyuniti forestry, fores riabilitesen na fores haidroloji, na em i raitim na halivim long raitim moa long 150 arapela skul pablikesen i karamapim bikipela hap bilong polisi na ol praktikel samting bilong forestri na graun menesmen.

Lesley Potter (lesley.potter@anu.edu.au) em i wanpela Humen Jiografa, na wanpela spesolis long smolholda agrikalsa. Wok bilong em i karamapim foapela ten yia wok insait long ol developing kantri, moa yet Indonesia, Malesia na Guyana. Em i bin karimaut bikipela wok akademik risets na i bin stap insait long givim stia bilong planti ol intanesenel developmen ejensi. Em i gat save long akademik wok tisa na trening long Guyana, Singapore, Nu Silan na Australia. Ol akademik wok em i holim i no long taim i go pinis, em long Yunivesiti ov Adelaide na

Australian National University, we em i wok wantaim Risos Menesmen insait long Esia Pasifik Program bilong Crawford School of Economics and Government. Lesley i pablisim planti wok long forestry na forestry long Saut Is Esia (wantaim colonial na post colonial fores polisi, birua bilong ol gavman polisi long ol liklik fama, long intenal maigresen na lenskep senis), na long komoditi prodaksen, long smolholda welpam, raba na kopi long Indonesia. I no long taim i go pinis, em i bin mekim wanpela bikpela wok glasim long ol rot bilong ol smolholda insait long welpam prodaksen bilong CIFOR, em Senta bilong Intanesenel Forestri Risets, wantaim filwok em i mekim long Cameroon, Costa Rica, Colombia na Ecuador.

Paul Michael Taylor (halmahera@gmail.com) i holim wanpela Ph.D. long Antropoloji long Yale University, 1980. Mista Taylor em i wanpela kalsarel antropolojis i save stap long Arlington, Virginia. Em i mekim wok taim em i bin malolo long wok bilong em olsem wanpela risets antropolojis na Dairekta bilong Esian Kalsarel Histori Program (Dipatmen bilong Antropoloji), Smithsonian Institution. Em i bin raitim sevenpela buk na sampela ol arapela skul pablikesen long etnografi, etnobioloji, na ol tokples bilong Esia na Pasifik; em i bin lukautim 18-pela museum eksibisen, na i bin wok olsem Dairekta bilong Etnografik Film Developmen bilong 12-pela etnografik film. Em i kisim sampela ol intanesenel grent na awot, em i sindaun long Bod ov Dairektas bilong Asosiesen bilong Esian Stadiss, na nau i sindaun long Advaisari Bod bilong US-Indonesia Sosaiti. Risets bilong em long ol rural sosol na ekolojikal isiu i bin karamapim moa long tripela yia long wanela rurel ples o traibal komyuniti bilong Saut Is Esia (na tu westen Niugini). Dokta Taylor i wok tu olsem wanpela konsalten bilong sosol na risetolmen isius bilong ol bipo Inspeksen Panel wok painimaut long Saina, Paraguay/Argentina, Cambodia, na Demokratik Ripablik bilong Congo.

Dispela pepa em ol i tanim long Tok Inglis i go long Tok Pisin. Sapos i gat sampela toktok i no stret namel long tupela tokples, em bai pepa long Tok Inglis i sanap trupela makim olgeta toktok long pepa.