TRADING IN EXTINCTION
THE DARK SIDE OF HONG KONG’S WILDLIFE TRADE

#ExtinctionTrade

ADM Capital Foundation
DEMONSTRATE
that wildlife related crimes in the city are, in many cases, organised and serious in nature

MAKE THE CASE:
that like many jurisdictions, Hong Kong urgently needs an enhanced enforcement strategy beyond the current regulatory regime

that what happens in Hong Kong matters..
1. GOVERNMENT DATA

Notices of Seizures
Govt. Press Releases
Departmental Annual Reports
Direct communications
Court records

2. OVERSEAS SEIZURES
BEYOND SEIZURES

3. IN-COURT OBSERVATION

4. INVESTIGATIVE AND ACADEMIC RESEARCH
Wildlife Products Seizure (WiPS) Database

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DATA PARAMETERS</th>
<th>WILDLIFE PRODUCT CATEGORIES IN WiPS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. C&amp;ED reference number; assigned by Government</td>
<td>Taxonomic Categories</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Seizure location</td>
<td>1. Elephant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Seizure date</td>
<td>2. Pangolin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Species identified; to lowest taxonomic name specified</td>
<td>4. Other mammals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Mode of transport (land, sea or air) plus any further details, i.e. private truck, on person</td>
<td>5. Sharks and Rays</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Detection method, e.g. customs officers, x-ray, intelligence analysis</td>
<td>6. Other aquatic species</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Labelling: related generally to whether/how items appeared on manifests</td>
<td>7. Reptiles and amphibians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Country of consignment (last known)*</td>
<td>8. Birds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Country of destination†</td>
<td>10. Other Plants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Quantity of product seized; most commonly in kilograms (kg) and metric tonnes (MT), though recorded numerically when seized species were alive or where alternative metrics were used (heads for live animals, pieces for dead animals)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Nature of seizure, such as mixed with other wildlife products and/or consumer goods</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Value based on government estimates in HK$ and US$ (conversion rate at US$1 to HK$7.8)‡ †</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Prosecution outcome, comprising fine (HK$) and prison time</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Data source/reference</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

379 seizures

#ExtinctionTrade
HONG KONG’S PRESENCE IN THE GLOBAL WILDLIFE TRADE

At least two-thirds of the world’s countries are trading endangered wildlife species with Hong Kong:
- 45 countries trading illegally
- 130 countries trading legally
GLOBAL CONTEXT

PANGOLINS

#ExtinctionTrade
They are traded overwhelmingly for their scales for use in Traditional Chinese Medicines.

Britta Jaschinski
© PHOTOGRAPHERS AGAINST WILDLIFE CRIME™
HIGH VOLUME SEIZURES

Equivalent to a seizure every 21 hours

Volume of Wildlife Seized by C&ED

Value of Wildlife Seized by C&ED

#ExtinctionTrade
HONG KONG SEIZURES

2013-2017

(A) C&ED Summary Statistics

TOTAL 2,011 SEIZURES

65% 8% 6% 21%

(B) WiPS Database

TOTAL 399 ENCOUNTERS

39% 40% 6% 15%

Note: Encounters equates to seizures by product

2018

(c) C&ED Summary Statistics

TOTAL 745 SEIZURES

77% 7% 7% 9% 2% 11% 15%

Note: Encounters equates to seizures by product
SERIOUS
HIGH VALUE

1,600% increase in value of seizures made under Protection of Endangered Species Ordinance (Cap. 586) from 2008 to 2017.
SERIOUS HIGH VALUE

56 seizures worth in excess of HK$1 million
23 seizures worth in excess of HK$5 million

HK$560 million
(2/3 of 379 seizures)
SERIOUS
ECOLOGICALLY IMPACTFUL

59 threatened species seized in Hong Kong (2013-2017)

30 species of turtles & tortoises in 39 seizures

Number of Turtles & Tortoises Seized, by Species
SERIOUS 
ECOLOGICALLY IMPACTFUL

59 threatened species seized in Hong Kong (2013-2017)

- 51 rhinos, 23 seizures
- 3,140 elephants, 423 seizures
- 10,000 to 64,500 pangolins, 122 seizures

#ExtinctionTrade
2019

Increasing frequency of large seizures

January  
- **8.3MT of pangolin scales and 1,000 tusks**
  - In container from Nigeria to Vietnam
  - Declared to contain 'frozen beef'
  - Estimated value of **HK$62 million**

February  
- **24 rhino horns (40kgs)**
  - Two passengers arrested en route to Vietnam

March  
- **1,529 live turtles and tortoises**
  - Found at Manilla Airport in four unclaimed suitcases
  - The cases arrived from Hong Kong

April  
- **82.5kg of rhino horn**
  - In transshipment cargo at HKIA
  - Estimated value of **HK$16.5 million**
  - This marks the largest rhino horn seizure seen in Hong Kong to date

#ExtinctionTrade
Species sourced from across vast regions

- Ivory from populations >500km from one another found in Hong Kong

- Pangolins have been “harvested from wide geographical areas of Southeast Asia”
ORGANISED NETWORKS & CAPACITY

Largest single volume:
- 1,008MT of rosewood in Hold of ocean-going vessel

Largest seizures made at ports:
- 59 Sea cargo containers
- 7 river cargo containers

Highest number of seizures made at the airport:
- 182 Air passengers apprehended
VOLUMES OF TRADE

HONG KONG – A GLOBAL TRADE HUB 2017

CONTAINER TERMINAL
5th largest in the world
20.8 million containers

AIRPORT
8th busiest passenger airport
73 million passengers
>5 million tonnes air cargo and air mail

RIVER CARGO
>104,000 MT of cargo

BORDER FOOT TRAFFIC
222 million foot passengers

VEHICLE BORDER CROSSINGS
16 million crossings

SEIZURES INEVITABLY UNDERESTIMATED

#ExtinctionTrade
37% of all pangolin seized between 2013-2016 concealed by waste plastics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Month</th>
<th>Weight</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>July 2016</td>
<td>2,120kg</td>
<td>Pangolin scales concealed in containers of ‘Terephthalate polyethylene’ consigned from Ghana.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>July 2016</td>
<td>7,326kg</td>
<td>Pangolin scales concealed in containers of ‘Recycled plastic particles’ consigned from Nigeria.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June 2016</td>
<td>4,020kg</td>
<td>Pangolin scales concealed in containers of ‘Sliced plastics’ consigned from Cameroon.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May 2014</td>
<td>1,000kg</td>
<td>Pangolin scales concealed in a container of ‘Plastic PET’ consigned from South Africa.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May 2013</td>
<td>161kg</td>
<td>Pangolin scales concealed in a container of ‘Polyethylene balls’ on a river trade vessel.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

January 2018
1.8MT from Nigeria “plastic materials”

May 2018
0.6MT from Indonesia “plastic scrap”

July 2018
7.1MT from Nigeria “plastic materials”
Numerous trafficking networks with clear links to Hong Kong

Multiple parallel and linked crimes
- Conspiracy
- Smuggling
- Money laundering
- Falsification of documents

Zhao Wei Transnational Criminal Organisation
- Human trafficking
- Child prostitution
- Drug trafficking
- Wildlife trafficking

Cape Flat Gangs & Chinese Buyers
IMPORT/RE-EXPORT
POSSESSION OFFENCES
THEFT

Cap 60: Import and Export Ordinance
Cap 169: Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Ordinance
Cap 210: Theft Ordinance
Cap 586: Protection of Endangered Species of Animals and Plants Ordinance

Inchoate Offences (Cap 200: Crimes Ordinance, Cap 461 Criminal Justice Ordinance)
CRIMINALS IN COURT

Outcomes of Prosecutions, Where Known

- Prosecuted: 38%
- Not prosecuted: 16%
- Under investigation: 2%
- Unknown: 44%

379 SEIZURES

Modes of Smuggling in 165 Cases

- Air Cargo: 1%
- Air Passengers: 1%
- Cross-border vehicles: 6%
- Individuals: 3%
- Parcels: 2%
- Retailers: 2%
- River trading vessel: 5%
- Sea Cargo: 78%
- Vessels and Private vehicles: 1%
- Unknown: 1%

Note: Under investigation as noted from press releases, current status unknown.

#ExtinctionTrade
## CRIMINALS IN COURT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PRODUCT</th>
<th>DATE</th>
<th>OFFENDER</th>
<th>CASE</th>
<th>PRODUCT VALUE</th>
<th>PENALTY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ivory</td>
<td>June 2014</td>
<td>16 Vietnamese nationals between the ages of 20 and 54 travelling through HKIA from Angola, en route to Cambodia</td>
<td>Concealing in their luggage a total of 790kg of ivory tusks and semi-processed ivory products</td>
<td>HK$7,900,000</td>
<td>6 months imprisonment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suspected Red Sandalwood</td>
<td>July 2015</td>
<td>Customs officers seized a 20-ft container said to contain “glass flower pots” from India</td>
<td>10.6MT of Red sandalwood logs was seized</td>
<td>HK$6,600,000</td>
<td>HK$4,000 in fines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pangolin</td>
<td>December 2015</td>
<td>Marine police arrested 8 mainland Chinese sailors intercepting their mainland-bound boat in local waters</td>
<td>50 boxes (1,029kg) of pangolin meat was seized</td>
<td>HK$2,000,000</td>
<td>2 months imprisonment for two of the offenders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ivory</td>
<td>May 2016</td>
<td>50-year-old man</td>
<td>Attempted smuggling 99kg of ivory, 7kg of helmeted hornbill beak 1.75 kg of agarwood into the Mainland at Shenzhen Bay Control Point</td>
<td>HK$1,050,000</td>
<td>2 months imprisonment and HK$5,000 in fines</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#ExtinctionTrade
# ExtinctionTrade

## PROSECUTIONS

### PRE- & POST- PENALTY AMENDMENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RHINO</th>
<th>Pre-Amendment 2013 – 30 Apr 2018</th>
<th>Post-Amendment 01 May 2018 – 17 Mar 2019</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Maximum Penalty Observed</strong></td>
<td>D1: 2 months D2: 6 weeks (12.1kg cut Rhino horn)</td>
<td>9 months (2.94kg cut Rhino horn)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Minimum Penalty Observed</strong></td>
<td>HK$27,000 (7.8kg cut Rhino horn valued at HK$1.6 million by Govt)</td>
<td>8 months imprisonment (3.1kg cut Rhino horn)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LACK OF DETTERENCE

99 CASES

Total pecuniary penalties (HK$5.2 million) <18%

Total estimated value of the products HK$30 MILLION

#EXTINCTIONTRADE
NEXT STEPS

Offences under the Endangered Species Protection should be incorporated under the Organised & Serious Crime Ordinance (OSCO)

White paper
Gathering evidence – pangolin papers
Court room monitoring
Awareness raising (connecting to Africa) – event
Local petition
More evidence is needed....

Developing a TCM strategy
NEXT STEPS
CHALLENGES IMPLEMENTING CITES

SPECIES IDENTIFICATION

CITES vs non-CITES listed
Large volumes (e.g. sharks)

Visual vs DNA
(e.g. sharks)

HK inspection protocols
When to seize

Juveniles - research

#ExtinctionTrade
NEXT STEPS

What is needed to tackle wildlife crime?
Wildlife Crime Convention?
TRADING IN EXTINCTION
THE DARK SIDE OF HONG KONG’S WILDLIFE TRADE
#ExtinctionTrade
## PROSECUTIONS

### PRE- & POST- PENALTY AMENDMENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>IVORY</th>
<th>Pre-Amendment 2013 – 30 Apr 2018</th>
<th>Post-Amendment 01 May 2018 – 17 Mar 2019</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Maximum Penalty Observed</td>
<td>8 months (47.36kg raw Ivory tusks &amp; beads)</td>
<td>4 months (0.41kg Ivory &amp; 5.9kg Rhino horn)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum Penalty Observed</td>
<td>160 hours community service (4.5kg worked Ivory)</td>
<td>HK$5,000 and 2 months imprisonment suspended for 18 months (0.01kg ivory)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>