Foundations for Trust: Multistakeholder governance for the data economy
Data governance provides means to enforce the social contract

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>National</th>
<th>Laws and regulations</th>
<th>Economic policies</th>
<th>Institutions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure policies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Universal broadband coverage</td>
<td>Safeguards</td>
<td>Antitrust</td>
<td>Government entities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domestic data infrastructure</td>
<td>Enablers</td>
<td>Trade</td>
<td>Other stakeholders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Taxation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National</td>
<td></td>
<td>Economic policies</td>
<td>Institutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure policies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Universal broadband coverage</td>
<td>Safeguards</td>
<td>Antitrust</td>
<td>Government entities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domestic data infrastructure</td>
<td>Enablers</td>
<td>Trade</td>
<td>Other stakeholders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Taxation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cybersecurity conventions</td>
<td>International</td>
<td>International</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interoperability standards</td>
<td>tax treaties</td>
<td>organisation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regional collaboration</td>
<td>Global trade agreements</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Cross-border cooperation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Data management and data governance are both needed to support the evolving social contract.

Source: WDR 2021 team.

Note: The data management life cycle at right appears in figure 1.2 in chapter 1.
Multistakeholder data governance is critical to supporting pillars of the social contract

- **VALUE**: The full value of data materializes when systems enable the use and reuse of data for different purposes.
- **TRUST**: A trust environment is created when the rights and interests that all stakeholders have in data are safeguarded.
- **EQUITY**: All share equitably in the benefits of data when investments and regulations create a level playing field.
Example: Senegal AgriData platform

Trusted multi-stakeholder partnerships create data value

How trusted data sharing in Senegal’s agriculture sector improved policy-making

- Senegalese think tank IPAR partnered with the NSO to identify data gaps and common needs
  - First challenge was to break down data siloes and create a trust foundation
  - Partners built a data platform with data sources from public and private sectors
  - Platform used for agriculture and food security decision-making at national, local and household levels
  - Collaboration and communication are needed to ensure usage and sustainability
Stakeholders play different roles in shaping how data is governed. There is no “one size fits all” model.

- Co-regulation and consultative rulemaking ensure stakeholder input is captured by regulators
- Civil society organizations and private sector can publish guidance to help enforce rules. E.g., model data sharing agreements
- Standard setting organizations and industry associations help set standards for data use. E.g., ISO, W3C
- Academics and CSOs evaluate and anticipate risks through research and advocacy
- NGOs like citizen advice bureaus can help individuals enforce their rights
Example: data governance of smart cities

**Fostering trust and control through “bottom up” data governance**

**How “digital democracy” initiatives help foster transparency and engagement**

- Under the EU's DECODE initiative, Barcelona was one of the first cities to leverage IoT data for decision-making and service delivery
  - Explores building data-centric digital economy while retaining user control over personal data
  - BCN City Council partnership with the city's “Decidim” platform to publish sensor data for transparency
- Ghent's “city of People” initiative allows citizens to create profiles on “Mijn Ghent” platform to access e-services.

Source: dogs.decidim.org
Deliberative approaches enable informed recommendations

Process builds literacy and fosters trust

- Ada Lovelace Institute convened Citizens’ Biometric Councils in UK to:
  - Enable public debate about legal and ethical safeguards needed for trustworthy use of biometrics /FRTs
  - Inform views and recommendations beyond simple opinion polls
  - Amplify minority voices for input into recommendations through workshop design
  - Provide unique inputs based on role and expertise of diverse stakeholders
  - Recommendations based on 60 hours of deliberative workshops
Barriers to effective implementation of multistakeholder processes affect their legitimacy

- Lessons learned from Internet Governance experience
- Lack of transparency and openness of proceedings
- Prohibitive cost or lack of capacity affect meaningful participation
- Failure to incorporate stakeholder input into the decision-making process can backfire
- Elite capture and a preference for multilateral forums can limit impact
- Challenges disproportionately affect LMICs and underrepresented groups
Key messages

1. MS governance is an *approach* to achieve a robust social contract for data based on trust, value and equity
2. This is achieved through open, transparent, inclusive and participatory processes
3. The legitimacy of the process requires *meaningful* participation from all stakeholders
4. No “one size fits all approach”: process should be purpose-driven and adapted to context
5. Bottom-up approaches can help realign power asymmetries in the use of data
6. Barriers to effective implementation include underrepresentation of LMICs and marginalized groups due to inclusion, cost and capacity issues.
7. Mitigating these challenges requires funding, capacity building, multiple platforms and international cooperation
Thank you

Download the report and explore Data Stories at https://wdr2021.worldbank.org/

Use #WDR2021 to follow us online for communication events