

Tip Sheet: Conducting Meaningful Stakeholder Engagement throughout the Project Cycle

ESS10 objectives

- To establish a **systematic approach** to stakeholder engagement that will help **Borrowers identify stakeholders and build and maintain a constructive relationship** with project-affected parties.
- To assess the level of stakeholder interest and support for the project and to **enable stakeholders' views to be considered in project design, implementation, and project's overall performance** (including but not limited to social and environmental risks and impacts), making sure that the feedback loop is closed by informing them of the results.
- To promote and provide means for **effective and inclusive engagement with project-affected parties** throughout the project cycle on issues that could affect them.
- To ensure that appropriate project information on environmental and social risks and impacts is disclosed to stakeholders **in a timely, understandable, accessible, and appropriate manner and format**.
- To provide project-affected parties, including the most vulnerable groups and individuals, with **accessible and inclusive means to raise issues and grievances** and allow Borrowers to respond to and manage such grievances.

Project Stage	Borrower Role	Bank Role	Guidance/Tips
Identification	<p>Share with the Bank a preliminary list of stakeholders.</p> <p>Conduct preliminary consultations (eg. key informant interviews) to brainstorm on potential project activities, risks and impacts, potential stakeholders and preferred engagement methods that seem to work well in the country/sector.</p>	<p>Support the Borrower to identify relevant stakeholders based on similar projects, sectoral and country-based information, stakeholder contacts.</p> <p>Inform Borrower about stakeholder engagement requirements under the ESF.</p> <p>Agree with the Borrower on stakeholder engagement actions needed to inform project design and risk assessment.</p>	<p>The project components are often not fleshed out at this stage. However, it is important to start gathering available information as early as possible based on stakeholder information in the country/ sector level based on Borrower's/World Bank teams' existing knowledge.¹</p>
Concept	<p>Identify existing engagement processes based on national</p>	<p>Identify the E&S contacts on the Borrower side responsible for stakeholder engagement.</p>	<p>Meaningful consultations will require being cognizant of several factors, including planning, organization, recording feedback and following up afterwards.</p>

¹ Sources to help map stakeholders at this early stage could be other similar projects in the country, existing Stakeholder Engagement Plans (SEPs), sectoral and country-based stakeholder lists developed by the World Bank or other organizations. Information from any preliminary social impact assessment can inform this list. Media and social media searches may help to verify the list and identify any other project-affected or interested parties. This information should also include key civil society actors relevant to the project, not only governmental agencies.

	<p>requirements and practices that can be used under the project.</p> <p>Map out stakeholders based on the components. (Stakeholder categories are defined in the Stakeholder Engagement Plan (SEP) Template)</p> <p>Provide stakeholders with project information as early as possible in a clear language and format.</p> <p>Conduct preliminary consultations with sample set of stakeholders, including civil society representatives of the key groups identified at this stage as at risk of exclusion and negative impacts, on project design, risks and potential impacts.</p>	<p>Conduct due diligence on existing national and local-level engagement processes to determine whether and to what extent they can be used under the project (even partially)</p> <p>Share with the Borrower the SEP Template and relevant SEP examples from other projects.</p> <p>Agree with the Borrower on stakeholders to engage (both state and non-state actors, and representative of civil society, including those advocating for the groups most at risk)</p> <p>Agree with the Borrower on the purpose and terms of engagement of consultations and focus group discussions, including what practical steps will be taken to close the feedback loop and report to project affected parties.</p>	<p>World Bank staff may participate as observers at the consultations.</p> <p>The responsibility of ESS10 implementation rests with the Project Implementation Unit (PIU) Director.</p>
Appraisal	<p>Prepare and disclose a draft SEP. It may include a new/revised list of stakeholders more thoroughly identified per project component.</p> <p>Prepare budget (even preliminary) for SEP implementation expenses.</p> <p>Make the SEP available through both traditional and social media/technology-based channels suitable in the local context.</p>	<p>Review the draft SEP and ensure that it is disclosed in accessible and user-friendly formats.</p> <p>Share examples of provisions from other relevant SEPs/documents for ensuring inclusion, closing the feedback loop, and monitoring implementation and results.</p> <p>Carry out consultations with groups that are at risk of exclusion and negative impacts.</p>	<p>It is important for the project team to provide stakeholders with access to the following information as early as possible:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The purpose, nature, and scale of the project • The duration of proposed project activities • Proposed stakeholder engagement process. • The time and venue of any proposed public consultations • The process by which consultations will be notified, summarized, and reported. <p>Key methods of engagement include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Participatory planning/decision-making meetings • Public meetings, hearings, workshops • Interviews

	<p>Share information in advance and in accessible formats.</p> <p>Follow up on any comments/feedback on project documents disclosed prior to Appraisal.</p> <p>Review (jointly with the World Bank) the results of consultations and other engagement mechanisms² that may have been used to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • assess implications, if any, on project design and implementation arrangements, • identify potential risks and opportunities in the project based on the expressed needs and priorities by the stakeholders, and • identify follow up actions. 	<p>World Bank E&S staff can bring the stakeholder feedback to the attention of the TTL and the Borrower.</p> <p>Agree with the Borrower on continued and more comprehensive stakeholder engagement process to be carried out throughout the project.</p> <p>Ensure that SEP reflects the results of the feedback received so far from stakeholders.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Surveys • Focus groups • Social media • Virtual consultations <p>Each of the proposed channels of engagement should clearly specify how grievances, queries, positive feedback, concerns and suggestions can be voiced by stakeholders.³</p> <p>Employ traditional channels of communications (TV, newspaper, radio, dedicated phone-lines, and mail) when stakeholders do not have access to online channels or do not use them frequently. Traditional channels can also be highly effective in conveying relevant information to stakeholders and allow them to provide their feedback and suggestions.</p> <p>It is important to identify and build links with associations representing project-affected parties.</p> <p>Consultations need to be organized in a format and language(s) accessible to the target audience. Proactive dissemination (vs. disclosure) could be encouraged.</p>
--	---	---	---

² Stakeholder engagement mechanisms go beyond consultations and grievance mechanisms. They can include participatory planning and participatory decision-making approaches.

³ While conducting consultations, the Borrower should take attendance, explain objectives of the discussion (summarize project information), review and agree on the agenda, listen (opportunity to identify project benefits and potential adverse impacts), manage expectations and time (sufficient for people to express their views), maintain a written record of consultations, explain next steps and report back how suggestions were addressed (or not). The Borrower will also provide (preliminary) feedback on issues/comments raised, clearly discuss the suggestions made by stakeholders that cannot be accepted. At the end of the discussion, the Borrower will summarize points made and how follow-up actions and feedback will be provided. The Borrower should also remind participants of the Stakeholder Engagement Plan, contacts for questions and available Grievance Mechanisms (GMs). The consultations should be conducted in close proximity to those who are directly affected; in a location perceived as safe. In projects with a large footprint, the consultations can be at different locations to allow all affected persons to attend. If held in a distant location, the Borrower may need to provide transport to and from the location. Special arrangements may be required for different groups, for instance women (who may need childcare support to be able to attend the meetings), the elderly, persons with disabilities (who may require communications and other types of support during engagement), etc.

<p>Negotiation</p>	<p>Determine whether stakeholder engagement process will need adjustments.</p> <p>Discuss with the World Bank the stakeholder engagement commitments under the Environmental and Social Commitment Plan (ESCP).</p>	<p>Discuss with the Borrower whether the stakeholder engagement process will need adjustments based on the latest project design/components.</p> <p>Discuss with the Borrower /revise if needed the stakeholder engagement commitments under the ESCP.</p>	<p>Stakeholder Engagement commitments and opportunities are covered across the ESSs. See Annex to see how Stakeholder Engagement is featured under other standards.</p>
<p>Implementation</p>	<p>Implement the engagement activities agreed in the SEP and beyond. Implement mechanisms to update risk management actions as needed based on feedbacks received as part of consultations.</p> <p>Establish an appropriate environmental and social management system</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A dedicated project manager • A functioning and accessible GM (see GM Checklist for details) • Periodic consultations • Mechanism to review risk management actions periodically, and as needed, based on feedbacks received <p>Keep stakeholders informed regularly on project activities that concern them and respond to any other questions or concerns raised by them.</p>	<p>Monitor the ESCP actions under ESS10.</p> <p>Seek periodic progress on the stakeholder engagement and grievance management process for the project.</p> <p>Indicate progress in Aide Memoires, Implementation Status and Results Reports (ISR) and in periodic exchanges between missions.</p> <p>Inform World Bank Management of any issues of concern that meaningful stakeholder engagement is not being achieved.</p> <p>Support the capacity development of Project Implementation Unit (PIU) on stakeholder engagement principles and practices.</p> <p>Ensure project beneficiaries understand the channels and process for expressing grievances.</p>	<p>Focus groups are useful to obtain the views of different categories of stakeholders.</p> <p>Consider hiring facilitators, where possible, especially in low trust environments. The facilitator should be considered neutral on the topic, have a good reputation among stakeholders, be able to engage the audience, and encourage participation.</p> <p>Diversify means of communication and consider the use of social media and online channels. Where possible and appropriate, dedicated online platforms and chatgroups can be created, based on the type and category of stakeholders.</p> <p>Where direct engagement with project-affected people or beneficiaries is necessary, e.g., to prepare and implement Resettlement Action Plans or Indigenous Peoples Plans, identify channels for direct communication with each affected household via a context specific combination of email messages, mail, online platforms, dedicated phone lines with knowledgeable operators. Ensure culturally appropriate channels of communication are used and tailored to specific target groups (i.e., local languages, verbal, written form, etc.), including the use of facilitators on the ground.</p> <p>Consider the possibility of the project relying on participatory or third-party monitoring (TPM), especially for conflict affected, disbursed sub-projects or high-risk project contexts.⁴</p>

⁴ Participatory or third-party monitoring (TPM) may be needed to assess the status and performance of a project, its compliance status, or emerging issues and to make recommendations for improvement, where relevant. Participatory monitoring refers to the active participation of project beneficiaries, project-affected people, communities, and other primary stakeholders in monitoring the project progress or monitoring the mitigation of key risks and impacts. TPM is defined as monitoring by parties that are external to

	<p>Keep a record of key issues raised and the follow up actions needed.</p> <p>Consider setting up a structured process of participatory planning and monitoring, where local stakeholders contribute to the implementation and monitoring of the risk mitigation actions.</p>		
--	--	--	--

the project or program's direct beneficiary chain or management structure to assess whether intended outputs, outcomes, and impacts have been achieved by the project. TPM is mainly used to provide an independent perspective on project or government performance. It can be conducted by civil society, think tanks, academic institutions, media, or private firms.

ANNEXES⁵:

Table 1: STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT PROCESS IN A NUTSHELL	
WHAT	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Design alternatives • Impacts (positive and negative, intangible, legacy) • Design changes • Mitigation measures • Implementation arrangements
WHO	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Project-affected parties (project beneficiaries as well as directly adversely affected parties) • Other interested parties <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Interest groups • NGOs/CSOs (local and international) • Local governments • Media • Private sector/business • Regional governments • Vulnerable/structurally excluded groups being at risk of being left out of project benefits, including organizations advocating for their rights.
WHEN	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • When project perimeters and components are generally identified - to be validated with project affected parties • When risks and impacts are broadly defined - to be further fleshed out with inputs from stakeholders • Sufficiently before project Appraisal to be able to influence project design and ESF instruments • Throughout project implementation aligned with key project timelines (before contracts are issued, before, during and after construction, mid-year project checks-in, aligned with Monitoring and Evaluation process and project reporting • When design changes lead to new impacts
WHERE	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Close to stakeholders • Transportation provided if far or for vulnerable groups • Safe place and manner (could be virtual, sex segregated, with qualified expertise in engaging vulnerable groups (i.e. children, girls, organizations advocating for women's, GBV survivors', LGBTQI, rights, etc.) • Multiple locations for large projects • All directly affected stakeholders should have an opportunity to attend
HOW	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Public hearings, meetings, workshops • Interviews • Culturally appropriate, enabling, focus groups discussions • Surveys • Virtual consultations • Social media
WHY	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Help to identify opportunities and risks • Required by World Bank's Environmental and Social Framework (ESF)/Borrower regulations. • Improve project design / implementation • Increase public support, project ownership and sustainability
FOLLOW UP	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Document and disseminate results to stakeholders • Follow up actions

⁵ Adapted from *Consultations in Investment Lending Guidance Note*; World Bank 2010

- | | |
|--|---|
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Track and document progress and results. Eg., How has stakeholder engagement improved project design and implementation? How has stakeholder engagement made the project more inclusive and targeted to the needs of vulnerable groups? |
|--|---|

Box 1: What Makes Stakeholder Engagement Meaningful?

- Clearly communicate the channels/contact information that stakeholders can use throughout the project for questions, suggestions, and grievances.
- Provide relevant information on projects activities, its potential risk and risk management approaches, beneficiaries' and stakeholders' rights, etc. to stakeholders in a form and language they can understand.
- Document the overall process, the various engagement events, and feedback received.
- Rely on expertise/third party facilitators as needed to ensure that individuals and groups most vulnerable to exclusion and harm can safely and meaningfully participate and have their voice heard.
- Systematically integrate the preferences and views of project affected parties in project design and implementation decisions.
- Circle back to the participants to inform them of decisions taken and key developments.
- Respond to comments and suggestions received in a timely manner per agreed response timelines.
- Consider when it is best to use third party facilitators and anonymous channels to promote trust, encourage open feedback to reduce the risk of retaliation.

The ESF emphasizes the need and opportunities for stakeholder engagement across all ESSs

ESS1

Environmental and Social Impact Assessment may include assessment of country systems for stakeholder engagement, national consultations requirements, etc.

ESS2

Labor management procedures should include a separate grievance redress mechanism for all project workers.

ESS4

Community health & safety measures should be developed/carried out in consultation w/ communities
Security/Emergency response plans may be developed in consultation with local communities.

ESS5

Resettlement Plan/Framework have robust information disclosure and consultation requirements with affected persons.

ESS6

Action Plan for Sustainable Forest Management should be developed w/ meaningful participation of project affected parties, including Indigenous Peoples.

ESS7

Targeted Social Assessment must be informed by meaningful consultations, assessment of the Borrower's capacity to engage with beneficiaries belonging to distinct social and cultural groups
IP Plan/Framework must be developed in consultation with affected persons and include culturally appropriate GRM. It may also include mechanisms for community monitoring.

ESS8

Consultations must be carried w/ stakeholders to identify cultural heritage, assess projects risks/impacts, explore avoidance/mitigation options, determine how stakeholders may (continue to) access cultural heritage

ESS9

FI's Environmental and Social Management System should include grievance redress and stakeholder engagement.