

**SUMMARY: LAUNCH OF THE TANZANIA CITIZEN ENGAGEMENT PLATFORM (TCEP)
FRIDAY, MAY 28, 2021: 10AM – 12.30PM**

Background: On Friday May 28, the World Bank launched the Tanzania Citizen Engagement Platform (TCEP) whose aim is to enhance World Bank-Government-CSO engagement and country development effectiveness in regard to the World Bank portfolio by bringing together government, civil society groups, development partners and citizens to discuss critical development issues within the parameters of the Tanzania Country Partnership Framework (CPF). Presentations were made by World Bank staff focusing on the special topic of the 15th Tanzania Economic Update and on the WBG-financed portfolio, followed by three discussants from Civil Society. At least 40 civil society representatives connected to the event which was hosted via Zoom.

World Bank Speakers/Presenters

- **Preeti Arora**, Acting Country Director
- **Emmanuel Mungunasi**, Senior Economist
- **Immaculata Yanga**, Operations Analyst

GOT Representation

- **Speaker: Mr. Adolf H. Ndunguru**, Deputy Permanent Secretary – Ministry of Finance and Planning, representing Mr. Emmanuel Mpawe Tutuba, the Permanent Secretary to Treasury.
- **Dr. Zainab Abdi Chaula**, Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Communication, and Information Technology
- **Mr. Patrick Pima** – Assistant Commissioner for Aid Coordination, Ministry of Finance and Planning.
- **Mr. Athumani Msabila** – Senior Financial Management Officer, Ministry of Finance and Planning.
- **Mr. Peter Masolwa** – Economist, Ministry of Finance and Planning.
- **Mr. Mohamed Khamis and Farid Muhamed**, Resource mobilization Officers from department of External Finance, Ministry of Finance Zanzibar.
- **Eng Ngulika** – Act. Director of Transport Infrastructure, Ministry of Works and Transport.
- **Mr. Ladislaus Mwamanga**, Executive Director – Tanzania Social Action Fund (TASAF).

Discussants

- **Aidan Eyakuze**, Executive Director, Twaweza East Africa
- **Rebeca Gyumi**, Executive Director, Msichana Initiative
- **Andrew Temu**, Agricultural Economist, Sokoine University

Moderator: Gilead Teri, Senior Private Sector Specialist

CSO Participants: Civil society sectors from which participants were drawn included: Policy advocacy, agriculture, women and girls' empowerment, health, education, PWDs, and independent activists.

PRESENTATION HIGHLIGHTS

Emmanuel Mungunasi, Senior Economist, made the first presentation titled: ‘Raising the Bar: What will it take for Tanzania to become a successful middle-income country?’ With his point of departure as Tanzania’s achievement of Lower-Middle Income Status in July 2020, and given the country’s desire to attain middle-income status in line with its TDV2025, he framed Tanzania’s next-level-of-development goals around three strategic pillars:

- (a) Sustaining growth over the medium term
- (b) Improving the inclusiveness of growth to reduce poverty
- (c) Strengthening upward economic mobility and economic security

He then discussed the five priority areas for achieving Tanzania’s development goals. These areas include: (i) productive investment; (ii) human capital development; (iii) agricultural transformation; (iv) digital technology; and (v) public sector capacity-building, which includes the capacity to leverage partnerships with the private sector.

Immaculata Yanga, Operations Analyst, then laid out the Country Partnership Framework, situating World Bank-financed portfolio in Tanzania within this – including the distribution of active operations per sector, as well as the investment pipeline and analytical works. She also provided a snapshot on how disbursements for operations work.

DISCUSSANTS:

1. **AIDAN EYAKUZE:** *How Tanzania can capitalize on the achievements of the recent past and move to the next level of development? What are the roles for Government, private sector and CSOs to achieve the country development objectives as stated in Tanzania Development Vision 2025?*

Addressing the question posed to him, Aidan noted the key was to focus on what he referred to as “the foundational fundamentals”. He emphasized the importance of data transparency as a key element for the public and CSOs to monitor the country’s progress. He noted the delay by the National Bureau of Statistics in reporting quarter two and quarter three data, noting that other countries provided this kind of data on time. Thus, he questioned the reliability of TEU fiscal balance calculations, noting that the VAT refunds and other arrears comprising 3-4 percent of GDP are not factored into the deficit calculation. He also pointed out that while the TEU observed a 3 percent contraction of tax revenue, the public was being told that more revenues were being collected. Agreeing that the growth experienced was not inclusive, he also highlighted signs of expanding inequality. **On the point of participation, he noted the divergence or tension between the priorities that citizens** have identified and those that the government insists on, and the sequencing of those priorities. Using data, **Aidan** explained that the government is prioritizing (a) hardware – i.e. physical infrastructure that unleashes and supports economic activity; (b) software – i.e. laws, rules of the game, their application and enforcement; and (c) wetware – i.e. people, public services, quality of life of individuals and families.

On the other hand, the citizens prioritize: (i) wetware (ii) hardware (iii) software. Using the Twaweza’s *Sauti za Wananchi* survey data, he showed the evolution of citizen’s priorities. In 2015, three of the top four citizen priorities were about public services – health, water, education. In 2018, three of the top four priorities were about economy, jobs, and food security. He explained that infrastructure (hardware) has remained in top five, but with fewer citizens’ votes in 2018 and even less in 2020.

In his conclusion, Aidan stressed: (i) Transparency: “It’s about our poverty – and how to permanently reduce or eliminate it.” Data transparency is important for this. (ii) Participation: Citizens prioritize wetware over hardware and software; but the government has prioritized the hardware (and collecting taxes to build it). (iii) Accountability: the misalignment between citizens’ and government priorities perhaps is not a bad thing in as far as it can be addressed through robust, evidence-based public discourse which is foundational to achieving a good, well governed high-income country with peace and stability and a well-educated population.

2. **REBECA GYUMI:** *What policies should be implemented in order to accelerate job creation and poverty reduction? What role can human capital play in this regard? What policies should be implemented to improve the quality of human capital, including for women and youth?*

Responding to the question, Rebeca started by enumerating statistics from 2014-2020 to illustrate the transfer numbers of one group of cohorts starting at standard seven level through to higher/tertiary level to demonstrate how girls in the same timeline (generation) are being left behind: in 2014, about 808,000 girls completed standard seven; in 2018, only 425,000 of those girls completed lower secondary; and of these, only 121,251 were selected to join higher level and tertiary education. Out of these, only 84,212, completed this level of education in 2020. She then posed the question: what had happened to the nearly 725,000 students who completed standard seven? She noted that Tanzanian vocational centers, at the highest capacity, are able to enroll only about 150,000-270,100 students.

Rebeca recommended three policy actions. First is to invest in implementing the 2014 Education policy where basic education will be up to lower secondary education and not primary education. Tanzania’s low secondary school enrollment rate is a major obstacle to income growth and economic security among poor households. Tanzania’s net secondary enrollment is the lowest in the world, and its lower secondary school completion rate is the fourth lowest in the world. At 27 percent, net secondary enrollment is less than half the LMIC average of 74 percent and a full 10 percentage points below the LIC average.

Secondly, Rebeca advocated for investment in productive sectors like agribusiness with focus on market-oriented crops that could accelerate job creation. She noted that agriculture remains the country’s largest employer, especially among poor households. She argued that skilling and upskilling of the workforce could contribute to a structural transformation and result in employment growth in the industrial and services sectors.

Rebeca then emphasized the importance of investment in human capital that considers the unique challenges that Tanzanian women and girls face. She called for expanding educational opportunities for girls as currently girls make up only 38 percent of upper secondary students due to a combination of early marriage, low perceived returns, and unaffordability. She called for the revision of policies that hinder girls’ access to education including the re-entry policy and expressed her desire for the SEQUIP project to be the framework through which to address this discrepancy and ensure pregnant girls are integrated into the formal system. She highlighted Zanzibar’s example on how to effectively implement the policy.

Furthermore, Rebecca recommended the untaxing of sanitary products in Tanzania saying it was not proper for the government to tax periods, further proposing the provision of free sanitary pads. Thirdly, she proposed the adoption of policies addressing sexual reproductive health for young women and girls. She also recommended the implementation of progressive policies and laws that protect adolescent girls and young women from early marriage.

Rebeca concluded by calling for the financing of gender responsive programs, saying there is a dire need to have a gender-responsive budget that mainstreams gender perspectives in the national budget and financing gender equality. She proposed the upping of the 30 percent constitutional quota to 50-50 percent, further adding that appointments by the higher-level leadership should be looked upon with a gender eye, and same in the lower-level communities, so as to have many women play part in decision making.

3. **PROF ANDREW TEMU**, Agricultural Economics Professor: *What are the major impediments to agricultural productivity growth and improvement of rural livelihoods? What policy actions are needed in the short and medium term?"*

Discussing the question, Prof Temu stressed that any intervention in agriculture needs to go beyond merely increasing harvests to thinking about productivity in terms of growth of rural enterprises – increasing yields but also managing the postharvest, creating quality employment and standards of living. He stressed that policies and strategies should be articulated in design and target the growth of rural enterprises. Prof Temu said good interventions should have six elements; (i) be well-diagnosed (ii) have neatly defined targets (iii) aim at raising rural wellbeing (iv) be clear and logical (v) build in sustainability parameters in the interventions and (vi) have complimentary investments. He noted that presentations on World Bank-financed portfolio showed that projects and programs are crosscutting. He emphasized the importance of agriculture being based on local research, and the need to articulate the vision of policies.

Prof Temu argued there is a need to redesign current organizational level policies to serve micro, small, medium, and large-scale private sector-led commercial enterprises in fostering technological transfer in local innovation and mandate research organizations to include resilience to natural disasters. He said there is a need to increase public funding for innovative research. He emphasized the need to improve and modernize management of human and financial resources in research centers and raise their commercial acumen – pointing out that this is an element that can be picked up by several country programs of the World Bank. He said policies to protect agricultural lands, property rights and enhance scales of production units should also be introduced.

Prof Temu emphasized the need to improve the regulatory framework – pointing out that there are some weaknesses in the regulations and policies which promote block farming and contract farming. He recommended that decentralization is key in successfully implementing national policies – especially given the large population of the country. He stressed that local government authorities are influential in terms of how interventions in agriculture will work and enhancing public service delivery, transparency, accountability, and accelerating growth.

KEY HIGHLIGHTS

- A. **Involvement of Faith Based Organizations (FBOs) in the development process: A representative of FBOs commended the World Bank's interest in engaging with FBOs. He said FBOs are concerned with economic inclusiveness in Tanzania** and view agriculture as the main sector that can employ most of the national workforce, solve the youth unemployment problem, and also increase the income of the households and women. He noted that FBOs have very close ties with the citizens but are normally not very well informed by the World Bank, stressing the need for the Bank working together with FBOs. He emphasized the importance of religious institutions in active development roles. He advocated for the improvement of policy predictability in the country to attract domestic and foreign investors; promoting rule of law,

democratic governance; respecting human rights; developing the private sector and institutions; and investing in skills development. A Government of Tanzania representative noted that the government recognizes FBOs as very important partners who should be part and parcel of the running of the development agenda. He said if they were accidentally left behind in some of the aspects, efforts will be made to rectify this and ensure their participation. The official also acknowledged Aidan's concerns in his presentation on tax issues, reforms, and others, and that they are working on these.

- B. **Growth, LMIC status and data: A World Bank participant commented on the points raised by discussants on the dissonance between the message on growth, attaining lower middle-income status, and what's happening on the poverty side**, noting that the government shares this view. Looking forward on the five-year development plan, he said the Bank welcomes emphasis on growth but also quality of growth, emphasizing that is where the agenda should focus. Responding to two technical points raised by Aidan, **the WB participant** said there is a delay in official data coming out from the NBS. On the VAT refunds and arrears not being factored into the deficit calculation, he said the issue is always emphasized in TEUs as well. He added that these issues are also featured in other studies such as the debt sustainability analysis conducted jointly with the IMF.
- C. **Citizen engagement vis-à-vis TCEP objectives: A participant noted he had expected that the discussion would be about how to enable greater, broader, deeper citizen engagement right down to the grassroots level, but found the session was more of a policy discussion**. Referring to Aidan's analysis of the gap between citizens' and government priorities, he argued that citizen engagement in setting their own development priorities is important because once they are involved they become active in ensuring their priorities are fulfilled and some district councils have been very active in encouraging this. However, from the discussion, he didn't hear much about how citizens themselves were going to be engaged in these macro-economic policies and how they are implemented or how citizens are going to be involved in discussing them and how this engagement would be put into practice for their own benefits. **Another participant** echoed the previous speaker's sentiment and said she had hoped that during the launch of the platform discussions would have centered around how citizen are engaged to create a space where thoughts, ideas, and priorities will be shaped, identified and discussed.
- D. **Women's empowerment: The need to articulate clearly what an inclusive economy entails was raised, with a call to the World Bank as an entity needs to do more to translate into practice what an inclusive economy means**. The participant said stakeholders who are operating in a feminist space specifically on integrating the macro, micro and meso feminist analysis, are calling not only for an "inclusive economy" but a *gender-just economy*. She pointed out that the presentations by the World Bank made no recognition of women's labor being central to what the World Bank does and should be doing.

WORLD BANK / GOT REACTIONS

- i. **The Acting World Bank Country Director provided clarity on the concerns raised by saying the forum is envisaged as a platform to encourage engagement with stakeholders in government and civil society around the entire World Bank portfolio**, highlighting that invited participants are considered as representing the citizens through their sector activities. She assured participants that the Bank does in fact promote citizen engagement through other project and sector-level stakeholder engagement mechanisms that are already in place and that the TCEP platform

does not replace but rather complements those. She added that when the Bank is preparing projects, teams normally go out and follow consultations between government and the different stakeholders aimed to include ground level inputs, and the Bank works with the government to reflect these inputs when putting together programs of support. On the point on women's empowerment, she emphasized that gender parity is one of the World Bank's objectives and every time the Bank prepares a project, gender aspects are carefully considered, and the Bank does not partake in anything that has the potential of excluding women on its program. The Bank always pays particular attention to how it can set aside some activity from the financing to make sure that the benefits are going directly to women.

A World Bank participant also clarified that the Bank undertakes social assessments for projects and analyses are done to identify who are the key stakeholders in a particular project; who are individuals who are potentially excluded, and the process is always done with a gender lens. She said at the project level, stakeholder engagement is a fundamental part of how the Bank works, and the new Environmental and Social Framework has an entire pillar devoted to stakeholder engagement – and stakeholder engagement plans are built into the DNA of all projects. She clarified that stakeholder engagement is done at the project level to understand and ensure that local perspectives and realities are included in projects. She also added that a gender assessment for Tanzania is also underway.

- ii. **A GOT representative stressed that to the government, women are not left behind, and they are right at the center of the development agenda and the agenda is planned with women in mind.** Responding to Aidan's argument on the tension between citizens' and government priorities, he stressed that the Government's priorities are normally driven by long-term development plans hence they do not easily change as often as those of citizens. He said emerging issues are also addressed as development plans are developed through regular citizen and stakeholder engagements. **On sustaining Tanzania's middle-income status,** the Economic Update has made relevant recommendations on what should be addressed. He emphasized the need to engage the private sector and sustainably mobilize government's revenue collection capacity. He said the government appreciates the issues raised in the TEU as critical inputs in driving the agenda.

FOLLOW-UP: Participants were informed that minutes from this event would be shared with them as well as presentations by the World Bank and those of the discussants.